

# HDR | CLAUNCH & MILLER

Engineering Consultants

December 22, 2008

Mr. Mike Hogan, P.E.  
Director of Utilities  
City of Texas City  
301 6<sup>th</sup> Street North  
Texas City, Texas 77590

RE: Clarifier Repairs and Repainting Project  
City of Texas City  
HDR|C&M Job No. 08-035

Dear Mr. Hogan:

On December 11, 2008, five (5) bids were received on the above referenced project. The following is a summary of our bid evaluation.

1. Bid Tabulation Sheet – Five (5) construction firms participated in the bidding process. Each bid was checked for mathematical errors and/or bid irregularities. A mathematical error was discovered in Layne-Texas bid. N.G. Painting, L.P. has been disqualified since they did not acknowledge receipt of Addendum No. 2. Appropriate corrections to the errors were made and included in the attached bid tabulation. The bids for the project are as follow:

<u>Contractor</u>	<u>Total Base Bid</u>
DMS Painting, Inc.	\$426,000.00
Layne-Texas	\$514,000.00
TMI Coatings	\$625,000.00
Jetco Limited	\$722,800.00
N.G. Painting, L.P. (Disqualified)	\$865,000.00

A copy of the bid tabulation is attached.

2. Telephone Conversations with References – Various references were contacted by telephone and asked to respond to a series of questions. Generally, they were impressed with the work DMS Painting, Inc. had performed and would use them again in the future.

In addition, DMS Painting has performed work for the City's Water Distribution Department, and the work they did was very professional and done on time, as noted by Mr. Les Dodson (City of Texas City).

3. Qualifications – DMS Painting, Inc. provided a Qualification Statement for this project.
4. Financial Statement – DMS Painting, Inc. provided a Financial Statement for the years ending 2006 and 2007.

DMS Painting, Inc. appears to be a responsible firm that is capable of performing the specified work in a satisfactory manner. For these reasons, we recommend that the City of Texas City award the Clarifier Repairs and Repainting Project to DMS Painting, Inc. for the Total Base Bid of Four Hundred and Twenty Six Thousand Dollars and No Cents (\$426,000.00)

If you have any questions, please contact me at (713) 622-9264.

Sincerely,

HDR|Claunch & Miller

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "Efrain A. Him", is written over the printed name below.

Efrain A. Him, P.E.  
Project Manager

Cc: Mr. Tom Kessler, P.E. – City of Texas City  
Mr. Doug Kneupper, P.E. – City of Texas City  
Mr. Madhu Kilambi, P.E. – HDR|Claunch & Miller

EH/ng

ITEM NO.	ITEM DESCRIPTION	UNIT	QUAN	LOW BIDDER		DMS PAINTING		LAYNE-TEXAS		TMI COATINGS		JETCO LIMITED		N.G. PAINTING, L.P.		
				UNIT PRICE	TOTAL AMOUNT	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL AMOUNT	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL AMOUNT	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL AMOUNT	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL AMOUNT	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL AMOUNT	
<b>BASE BID ITEMS</b>																
1	In all Three (3) Clarifiers, cleaning and demolition with replacement of scum beach assembly with new galvanized components, complete in place	L.S.	1	\$45,000.00	\$45,000.00	\$130,500.00	\$130,500.00	\$120,000.00	\$120,000.00	\$141,000.00	\$141,000.00	\$135,000.00	\$135,000.00	\$135,000.00	\$135,000.00	
2	In all Three (3) Clarifiers, cleaning and demolition with replacement of top 3 vertical feet of center well with new 316 stainless steel components, complete in place	L.S.	1	\$109,000.00	\$109,000.00	\$190,500.00	\$190,500.00	\$140,000.00	\$140,000.00	\$268,000.00	\$268,000.00	\$135,000.00	\$135,000.00	\$135,000.00	\$135,000.00	
3	In all Three (3) Clarifiers, cleaning, inspection, sandblast, cleaning and repainting of clarifier structure mechanism exclusive of walkway bridge, motor, gears and electrical system, complete in place	L.S.	1	\$240,000.00	\$240,000.00	\$165,500.00	\$165,500.00	\$333,000.00	\$333,000.00	\$268,800.00	\$268,800.00	\$560,000.00	\$560,000.00	\$560,000.00	\$560,000.00	
4	Labor and material, including welding, for clarifier repairs and replacement of/carbon steel structure mechanism exclusive of walkway bridge, complete in place	LBS	500	\$14.00	\$7,000.00	\$5.00	\$2,500.00	\$14.00	\$7,000.00	\$40.00	\$20,000.00	\$20.00	\$10,000.00	\$20.00	\$10,000.00	
5	Miscellaneous allowance, as directed by the Engineer	L.S.	1	\$25,000.00	\$25,000.00	\$25,000.00	\$25,000.00	\$25,000.00	\$25,000.00	\$25,000.00	\$25,000.00	\$25,000.00	\$25,000.00	\$25,000.00	\$25,000.00	
<b>SUBTOTAL BASE BID ITEMS:</b>					<b>\$426,000.00</b>	<b>\$514,000.00</b>	<b>\$514,000.00</b>	<b>\$625,000.00</b>	<b>\$625,000.00</b>	<b>\$722,800.00</b>	<b>\$722,800.00</b>	<b>\$865,000.00</b>	<b>\$865,000.00</b>	<b>\$865,000.00</b>	<b>\$865,000.00</b>	
<b>TOTAL BID:</b>					<b>\$426,000.00</b>	<b>\$514,000.00</b>	<b>\$514,000.00</b>	<b>\$625,000.00</b>	<b>\$625,000.00</b>	<b>\$722,800.00</b>	<b>\$722,800.00</b>	<b>\$865,000.00</b>	<b>\$865,000.00</b>	<b>\$865,000.00</b>	<b>\$865,000.00</b>	<b>\$865,000.00</b>

**MATHEMATICAL ERRORS CORRECTED BY ENGINEER**

**N.G. PAINTING, L.P. HAS BEEN DISQUALIFIED SINCE THEY DID NOT ACKNOWLEDGE RECEIPT OF ADDENDUM NO. 2.**