

Meeting Minutes

DESIGN REVIEW COMMITTEE

REGULAR MEETING

August 18, 2021 | 4:00 p.m.
Council Chambers Conference Room
88 E. Chicago St., Chandler, AZ



Call to Order

The meeting was called to order by Chairman Heumann at 4:00 p.m.

Roll Call

Commission Attendance

Chairman Rick Heumann
Vice Chairman David Rose
Commissioner George Kimble
Commissioner Erick Morgan

Staff Attendance

David de la Torre, Planning Manager
Lauren Schumann, Senior City Planner
Harley Mehlhorn, Junior Planner
Thomas Allen, Assistant City Attorney
Julie San Miguel, Clerk

Absent

Commissioner Matt Eberle – Excused

Discussion

1. PLH21-0041 Treeland by Tri Pointe Homes

Request Preliminary Development Plan (PDP) for housing product for a 86-lot subdivision, located at the Southeast corner of Chandler Heights Road and 124th Street

LAUREN SCHUMANN, SENIOR CITY PLANNER gave a brief presentation and stated the proposed project, Treeland by Tri Pointe Homes, is a housing product for a single-family subdivision, located east of the southeast corner of McQueen and Chandler Heights roads. She further stated the property is approximately 25 acres and was rezoned in May of 2020 from AG-1 to single family PAD. She explained the proposed contains 86 lots with a variety of sizes ranging from 7200 square feet to 9100 square feet. She further explained in April, Staff met with the Applicant and their team to discuss the housing product and they were made aware of concerns with the roof lines and front elevations being similar. She stated the Applicant was informed the City requires a diverse

product of housing, which includes an assortment of rooflines, facades, and architectural themes. She presented before and after images and advised not many changes were made. She pointed out, the Applicant revised one of the plans to have a different roof and added a fourth Farmhouse theme. She mentioned Staff was concerned with the changes that were not made and thought it would behoove them to come to Design Review Committee. She explained Staffs' concerns with the different architectural features include; Spanish theme has no distinguished characteristics; the archway over the front door and clay tiles are used on all four theme elevations; two of the elevations use a Spanish tile, while the other two use the same shutter; there is no distinct characteristics on the front elevations; all have front door in the middle with the garage on one side and window on the other; no distinguishing characteristics to the Desert theme; the Farmhouse elevation can only fit on the 14 south lots and cannot be used on other 72 lots. She explained the recommendations of staff is to provide more diversity to the front facades and suggested following; the front door be relocated on at least one plan; more distinctive and unique features for the Spanish, Desert, and Southwestern themes; and the Farmhouse theme should be added to plans one, two and three, to create further diversity in the housing product; four sided architecture; the placement of the stone be considered as it appears to be applied without reason; provide decorative garage doors for all of the elevations; and coach lighting be added on either side of the garage door. As she presented the elevations, she encouraged everyone to share their comments at this time.

CHAIRMAN HEUMANN asked the Applicant how big are the homes.

STEPHEN BURRIS, TRI POINTE HOMES responded most of the homes are forty-five feet wide with a few larger homes that will be fifty-five feet wide.

CHAIRMAN HEUMANN asked if the proposed homes were two-thousand square feet total.

STEPHEN BURRIS, TRI POINTE HOMES stated the homes will be two-thousand square feet to approximately two-thousand nine-hundred square feet.

LAUREN SCHUMANN, SENIOR CITY PLANNER presented the Spanish elevations and pointed out the archway and shutters. She stated the shutter is carried to all four sides, but the arch is not used elsewhere on the other elevations. She mentioned the clay tiles underneath the gable is on all four sides and suggested the option of using tiles from the other Spanish elevations. She stated the intent is to figure out ways to make the Spanish theme more distinct for all four plans

DAVID DE LA TORRE, PLANNING MANAGER pointed out the arch can be done on the posts on the rear patio.

LAUREN SCHUMANN, SENIOR CITY PLANNER presented plan one of the Southwest theme and pointed out, one of the main features is having a flat parapet, but the Applicant only uses it above the front door. She mentioned the stone is used as a planter and on the columns of the back patio,

but it's not seen elsewhere. She suggested a decorative garage door to enhance the product and coach lighting on either side of the garage and at the front door.

BRENNAN RAY, BURCH AND CRACCHIOLO advised one of the challenges about having coach lighting on the other side of the garage is the placement of the front patio and layout of the home.

DAVID DE LA TORRE, PLANNING MANAGER pointed out another housing development by the Applicant with front doors on the side and stated if there was an option for the front door to be on the side, it would present the opportunity for coach lighting to be on both sides of the garage.

STEPHEN BURRIS, TRI POINTE HOMES advised we do have products where entry is more outward than center, but we do not have that for this particular community, because it would fundamentally change a lot of the floorplan and the layout of the homes. He further advised it is not something that can be added for a particular elevation because it would change everything, and we would prefer not to make such a change.

CHAIRMAN HEUMANN interjected and asked to let staff to finish the presentation before having discussion.

LAUREN SCHUMANN, SENIOR CITY PLANNER presented the Desert themed elevation and pointed out the color band is only used on the front and does not translate to the sides or rear. She mentioned brick is only used on the back patio and in other cases it is used as a wrap all the way to the back gate. She presented the roof plans and stated the Applicant changed one of the roof plans to have the gable from side to side versus front to back. She then presented plan two and displayed the three themes side by side and pointed out the concerns of Staff. She presented plan three and mentioned there is a side entry garage option and suggested one of the plans only be side entry to create diversity. She explained due to the width of the properties, it would fit and allows for cars to maneuver out safely without having to do a three-point turn. She presented concerns for plan three designs and suggested the following: the arch to be carried throughout the design, either as a framing of a window or on the patio; the use of clay tiles; decorative garage doors; coached lighting on side of the garage; intentional stone placement that carries throughout the design; color banding on all four sides; and brick to be used throughout the design. She presented plan four designs and stated these are the larger housing product and can fit more diversity and break up the front plane. She presented the courtyard for the housing product and pointed out the need for more distinguish design for the Spanish and Southwest themes. She also pointed out the stone is just applied to the front door and not used elsewhere. She mentioned on the Desert theme, the brick is applied very heavy and the color band is not used on the other sides. She presented the Farmhouse theme and suggested that this theme be added to plans one, two, and three, as currently there are only 14 Lots where this theme is an option. She pointed out the Farmhouse design carries a good mix of material with the board, batten, stone, stucco, full pop outs, and carrying the design to all four sides. She presented the color pallet and stated although the color can change, there needs to be diversity in the housing product.

CHAIRMAN HEUMANN stated this is the reason PDPs should not be separated from PADs, because situations like this happen, where someone does not come through with something, then we are limited in terms of product. He presented concerns regarding the limited amount of land left in the City and the importance of quality. He is concerned that the project is garage heavy, lacks diversity, and the streetscape needs a lot of work. He pointed out the garage is on the left side on all the plans and they all look very cookie cutter. He explained we can go through some of these elevations and talk about elements, but I heard a comment from the Applicant, that they already have that product in other places, and this is what is planned for Chandler. He encouraged the Applicant to think about what works for Chandler, because quality really is important to this City and the Commission. He would like to see wall planes broken up, diversity, the garages not all on one side, and wraparound four-sided architecture. He stated it is up to the Applicant to come through and pointed out that he has never heard this many concerns from Staff in years.

COMMISSIONER KIMBLE asked if the housing product are all one story.

CHAIRMAN HEUMANN responded yes, they are all single story.

VICE CHAIRMAN ROSE would like to echo the same sentiments as Chairman Heumann and pointed out it is uncommon to see all garages on the same side. He mentioned if there was a smaller version of the Farmhouse theme, that would really pop versus the Spanish and Southwestern which are similar. He stated these are nice homes for Chandler with a great location and it is beneficial to get feedback as the Applicant can surely make the accommodations.

COMMISSIONER MORGAN pointed out the Farmhouse theme appears to have the quality we are looking for and advised it is a good design to standardize the design quality towards.

CHAIRMAN HEUMANN asked why all the garages are on the left side.

STEPHEN BURRIS, TRI POINTE HOMES responded we hear everyone's sentiments about the quality of the product and I want to be clear, we are not trying to bring down the quality. He stated we have done many successful projects with the City before, so we feel like we have a pretty good understanding. He advised the garage can be placed either on the left or right depending on the site situation. He presented statements regarding how the images were arranged on the render and advised most of the homes are at forty-feet wide, with a twenty-foot garage, so the garages are constraint as to where they go. He stated they could reverse the render and it would look like the garages on the right, which is something that is completely buildable on the site and be something that we would most likely see out there.

CHAIRMAN HEUMANN asked what are the side yard setbacks.

STEPHEN BURRIS, TRI POINTE HOMES responded five and ten feet.

CHAIRMAN HEUMANN asked if they had no room to change the product because the setbacks are five and ten feet.

BRENNAN RAY, BURCH AND CRACCHIOLO pointed out Tri Pointe Homes has built several great communities in Chandler, and he has had the opportunity to work with them on a bunch. He advised that there are many semi-custom options that are not shown in this package and asked Tri Pointe Homes if a homeowner can choose the garage on the left or right. He further asked if the choice is built within their programming besides constraints on certain lots. He asked given the way the community is that the garage may be required to be the right or left.

STEPHEN BURRIS, TRI POINTE HOMES responded that is correct.

CHAIRMAN HEUMANN advised typically there are stipulations that no two front elevations are the same next to each other and asked if the packages can be preposition, so ten people on the same street do not end up with left garages for some reason. He asked if the Applicant could position the homes in such a way where you can do certain things on certain lots. He mentioned Maracay who was bought out by Tri Pointe Homes has built a lot of great stuff in Chandler and they have options you can choose, but at the same time some elevations need to be upgraded to force the issue.

BRENNAN RAY, BURCH AND CRACCHIOLO advised utility location and placement factors into the layout.

STEPHEN BURRIS, TRI POINTE HOMES advised it is achievable, but we will need to go back and look at it.

CHAIRMAN HEUMANN advised when you go back, have a streetscape available so the Commission can get a feel for what you are talking about. He further advised it is important to work with Staff and hopes the Applicant understands how important quality is.

STEPHEN BURRIS, TRI POINTE HOMES stated only a few items have been bought up and the toughest one is regarding alternative entry location on plan one. He further stated the other concerns are workable, however, the alternate entry is very difficult to resolve and if there is latitude in that particular item that would be appreciated and helpful. He asked to review the exhibits with multiple elevations as he would like to talk about the roof forms and the comments given on those.

CHAIRMAN HEUMANN advised what is suggested today is that you to go back and rework, therefore, if you are concerned the entry cannot work, you have other alternatives. He further advised there are other things the Applicant can do that will satisfy Staff, Commission, and Council regarding quality and when there are constrains, the Applicant needs to come up with something else that will be great and work. He explained, staff is giving the Applicant suggestions, but there

are other things that can work, and Staff is not saying you are only allow to do this, they are just giving suggestions.

BRENNAN RAY, BURCH AND CRACCHIOLO advised the message he is getting from the discussion is that it is okay to ride that horse but find a better way to define it and make sure it is not the same shade of brown and used the example the Southwestern and Desert themes.

LAUREN SCHUMANN, SENIOR CITY PLANNER responded they are trying to figure out how to create a unique identity for the four themes and presented concerns regarding the Southwest and Desert themes being too similar.

CHAIRMAN HEUMANN presented statements regarding the importance of wrapping the design around the buildings to create four-sided architecture. He presented further statements regarding the importance of four-sided architecture for the streetscape and perception of drivers.

BRENNAN RAY, BURCH AND CRACCHIOLO asked when you say wrap, are you talking about in front of the fence.

CHAIRMAN HEUMANN clarified yes to the fence line, he further explained you are not going to take a brick line that is running along the bottom and run it to the backyard, that does not make any sense. He further explained we no longer allow projects coming in with blank wall, but I think you guys have done a decent job.

STEPHEN BURRIS, TRI POINTE HOMES explained the endeavor for our team, specifically with this architectural style was using stucco color blocking with lighter cream color on the windows and it wraps on the exterior side all the way back to the fence. He further explained it does the same at the garage and there is a bit more color and more of a palette. He stated the two primary roofs are a garble and hip roof and what the Applicant liked about this, is it brings the architecture down a little bit in terms of scale. He further stated the roofs are running, front to back, so the gables prominently are on the side and with a sense of community and architecture, the roof is kind of going back away from you a little bit. He advised the roofs can be rotated 90 degrees or the gable in the front, however, it is going to make it much more in your face and from the perspective of Tri Pointe Homes, we wanted to be cognizant of that. He further advised if the Commission and Staff believes that would be welcoming, we could entertain something like that.

LAUREN SCHUMANN, SENIOR CITY PLANNER responded at our first meeting, they were all the same roof with the gable running from front to back and the presented elevation is from the Applicant's last submittal.

STEPHEN BURRIS, TRI POINTE HOMES advised we did introduce a few new ones, so it is not the same cookie cutter look that is being referenced. He further advised there is a bit more diversity in the new submittals.

DAVID DE LA TORRE, PLANNING MANAGER stated instead of flipping the entire roof you can keep it the way it is and add another gable, for example over the garage. He further stated it does not have to be flipped in its entirety to create diversity. He explained the initial comment was they were all similar and we wanted diversity and with that this one was added, but we need to continue along that path and continue to add diversity.

STEPHEN BURRIS, TRI POINTE HOMES stated, we can gladly do that. He pointed out the product is narrow and the garages are a substantial amount of the front façade, therefore the intent is to deemphasize the garage and overemphasize the entryways. He explained they accomplish this by way of massing with stone or whatever material used. He further explained more structure can be added above the garages, but we are fearful that would bring attention to that portion of the home, which again, we felt was more important to deemphasize.

CHAIRMAN HEUMANN explained the Applicant needs to work on the design with Staff, so when it goes before the Commission things are worked out and can move forward. He mentioned this is the start of the conversation, but maybe this has been going on for a while, otherwise it would not have come to Design Review Committee. He stated if there were concerns between Staff and the Applicant, the Applicant will need to do their homework and work on some things.

Vice Chair Rose clarified this discussion is for architecture design only and presented statements regarding the gate and paving of the street.

LAUREN SCHUMANN, SENIOR CITY PLANNER responded Orchard Heights, which is to the west did their half of the street, therefore when Treeland comes in, they will do the other half street.

CHAIRMAN HEUMANN thanked everyone for their time today.

Adjourn

The meeting was adjourned at 4:37 p.m.


Kevin Mayo, Secretary


Rick Heumann, Chairman