

Meeting Minutes

City Council Work Session

September 22, 2022 | 4:30 p.m.
Council Chambers Conference Room
88 E. Chicago St., Chandler, AZ



Call to Order

The meeting was called to order by Mayor Kevin Hartke at 4:30 p.m.

Roll Call

Council Attendance

Mayor Kevin Hartke
Vice Mayor Terry Roe
Councilmember OD Harris
*Councilmember Mark Stewart
Councilmember René Lopez
Councilmember Christine Ellis
Councilmember Matt Orlando

Appointee Attendance

Josh Wright, City Manager
Kelly Schwab, City Attorney
Dana DeLong, City Clerk

*Councilmember Stewart attended telephonically.

Staff in Attendance

Tadd Wille, Assistant City Manager
Ryan Peters, Strategic Initiatives Director
Micah Miranda, Economic Development Director
Rae Lynn Nielsen, Human Resources Director
Niki Tapia, DEI Program Manager
John Knudson, Public Works & Utilities Director
Stephanie Romero, Public Information Officer
Matthew Burdick, Communications & Public Affairs Director
John Sefton, Community Services Director
Tawn Kao, Assistant City Attorney
Melissa Quillard, Mayor & Council Communications Manager
Regina Romeo, Consultant with CPS HR Consulting

Discussion

1. Presentation and Discussion on DEI Assessment Results.

MAYOR HARTKE called for a staff presentation.

JOSHUA WRIGHT, City Manager, introduced the discussion item and said this has been a year in the making and tonight the results would be shared.

NIKI TAPIA, DEI Program Manager, presented the following presentation.

- Chandler DEI Assessment Final Report September 22, 2022
- Timeline of Events
 - Mayor proclamation, diversity survey with Human Relations Commission & presentation of results to Council
 - July – December 2020
 - Strategic Framework – commitment to diversity, equity, and inclusivity through an update to Chandler’s brand statement
 - May 2021
 - City Council approves contract with CPS HR for DEI Assessment
 - October 2021
 - City-wide DEI Assessment (focus groups, survey and evaluations)
 - December 2021 – June 2022
 - CPS HR Assessment Final Report to HRC and City Council
 - September 2022

REGINA ROMEO, CPS HR Consultant, continued the presentation.

- CPS HR: Our DEI Team
 - Paula North, DEI Assessment Specialist
 - Jeff Hoyer, Senior Leader, Org. Strategy
 - Calvin Bonds, DEI Facilitator, Consultant
 - Regina Romeo, DEI Program Leader
 - Jacques Whitfield, DEI Training Leader
- CPS HR: Philosophy/Guiding Framework
- CPS HR ACTION PLAN
 - Project Kick-off & Council DEI Conversations:
 - Project Kick-off with City Manager’s Office
 - Conduct 7 key interviews – Council & CM
 - Develop a collective definition and define success elements of the DEI assessment
 - External:

- Application for Interest, participants selected to maximize diversity/representation
- Identifying DEI concerns as a large community group
- Subsequent focused discussion groups to identify current concerns and recommended actions
- Internal:
 - Survey assessment for City employees to establish baseline feedback on DEI Internal and community efforts
 - Employee Focus Groups to obtain additional information, promote discussion on DEI feedback
- Communication, Presentation, and Post-Project
 - Presentation to the Human Relations Commission and then to the City Council
 - DEI project progress tracking strategy moving forward

MS. TAPIA continued the presentation.

- Current DEI Division Programs
 - Diversity Mini-Grants
 - Diversity Memberships
 - DEI Division Produced Events
 - DEI Partner Events
 - Marketing & Promotion
 - FOC – Chandler Support
- DEI FY2021-22 Accomplishments
 - Unveiled Chandler Contigo a month-long series of events held during National Hispanic Heritage Month
 - Hosted the first City-sponsored LGBTQ+ event with Chandler Pride
 - Produced “Conversations with Chandler’s Historic Black Families” video series documenting the first Black families in Chandler for Black History Month
 - Held the inaugural Asian American Community Conference to engage the Asian community
 - Produced, sponsored, or participated in 50 community events with an approx. total attendance of 41,800

COUNCILMEMBER HARRIS asked how many people are in the DEI department.

MS. TAPIA answered that there were four people in the DEI department.

MS. TAPIA continued the presentation.

- External Community
- Communication with Residents
 - City website that includes:

- Overview of project and scope of work
- Timeline of project
- All documents relating to the project
- FAQs
- Public Participation
 - External panel application
 - Online public comment form

COUNCILMEMBER ORLANDO asked what kind of comments were received in the online public comment form.

MS. TAPIA answered that they have received 18 comments, five were opposed to DEI, two in support of NDO, four in support of DEI programs.

MS. ROMEO continued the presentation.

- External Community Panel | February – June
 - Online application open for external panel submissions
 - CPS HR created an online application form used to select the most diverse representation of individuals using organization and personal demographics
 - 25 diverse leaders selected by CPS HR to participate
 - In-person kick-off meeting
 - Five themed breakout subcommittee meetings
 - Each group met twice
 - Final at-large virtual wrap-up meeting and report
- External Panel Members
 - Abiuth Maronga, Teecanva
 - Andrea Morales Barton, CUSD Teacher
 - Christopher McMullan, Neighborhood WorXs
 - Crystal Blackwell, Crystal Clear Results
 - Daniel Hall, PayPal
 - Debra L. Schinke, Chandler Republican Women
 - Denise Phillips, Self employed
 - Eduarda Schroder, Chandler Pride
 - Erika Castro, SRP
 - Heather LeeMaster Anguiano, CUSD
 - Jeff Williams, Salvation Army
 - Jennifer Sanchez, Intel
 - Joanna Cetaj, The Puzzle Piece, LLC
 - Jyoti Pathak, TD SYNEX
 - Kathryn Mazon, DEI Consultant
 - Keasha Beach, Base AZ
 - Linda A. Kalaf, Retired HR/D&I Professional

- Nigah Mughal, Maricopa County
- Rabbi Michael Beyo, EVJCC
- Rick Heumann, Chandler Chamber
- Ryan Gear, The Well Church
- Shawn Mitchell, Chander4Change
- Steve Sanders, Omicron Engineering, PLC
- Trinity Donovan, AZCEND
- William H. Crawford III, Ed.D., Northern Arizona University & DW Consulting Group
- Breakout Groups
 - Understanding youth population service needs
 - Improving opportunities for all voices to be heard/Community voice coming in
 - Reaching out and identifying resources for LGBTQIA+
 - Building community partnerships
 - Improving external communication so City voice gets out to all groups
 - * After the first breakout subcommittee meetings were held, City staff worked interdepartmentally to provide updates on what the City currently offers in each themed area. This information was given to each breakout group prior to their second meeting.

MAYOR HARTKE asked what the acronym LGBTQIA+ stood for.

MS. ROMEO answered that it stands for Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender, Queer, Intersex, and Asexual, the plus stands for Two-Spirit and additional identities.

MS. ROMEO continued the presentation.

- Input Received
 - Youth services/Connection
 - Ned for stronger voice representation for Chandler youth
 - Ned for larger interaction with diversity practices, including equitable opportunities for all youth groups throughout the City
 - Communication Considering Marginalized Groups
 - Maximize various methods of communication of DEI messages
 - Build trust through effective listening and taking tangible actions
 - All groups must be heard, represented, and included (e.g., refugees, people experiencing homelessness, seniors, neurodivergent, etc.)

MAYOR HARTKE said the Mayor's Youth Commission also represents this group, what is the comparison between what was recommended and this preexisting group.

MS. ROMEO answered that within the larger external group, people began networking within the group. There were many people who provide specific services aware of programming, but there was not a connection already established. The awareness may not be there for services that

already exist. There will be people who need services who may not access the promotion of these services.

VICE MAYOR ROE asked how consideration for seniors compares with other groups deserving of accommodation.

MS. ROMEO said that it is about representing the underserved groups. For example, stores with early open hours to accommodate senior shoppers will allow specific needs to be served. It is important that we provide any service to include a group, not to the point of excluding others. All different parts of the community are being served.

MAYOR HARTKE said in our case, this might be part of budget considerations. This is identifying underserved groups and learning how to serve them.

MS. ROMEO added that there might already be services in place, it is about spreading awareness.

COUNCILMEMBER HARRIS asked how we identify underserved groups.

MS. TAPIA said that most groups looking for this are looking to be partners, looking to make ideas happen. It is about working together to bring the community together through collaboration.

COUNCILMEMBER HARRIS asked if we do everything in our power to uplift them.

MS. TAPIA said whatever we can, we will do for the organizations who do their part as well.

COUNCILMEMBER HARRIS reaffirmed that we do actively include people who want to be included in our process.

MS. TAPIA confirmed.

MS. ROMEO continued the presentation.

- Input Received
 - LGBTQIA+
 - Increase progress through continuing to help LGBTQIA+ flourish and feel welcomed
 - Identify and promote resources and programs
 - Ensure focused efforts to assist LGBTQIA+ youth experiencing homelessness
 - Building Community Partnerships
 - Need for stronger community partnership organizations – helping different organizations with similar functions connect

- Increase awareness of community or City resources available to community organizations
- Focus on stronger collaboration with the City Council

MAYOR HARTKE asked if we have demographic information for LGBTQIA+ youth experiencing homelessness and suicide.

MS. ROMEO said there are national statistics to look at relative to a community of this size. Homelessness can be caused by a lack of resources for LGBTQIA+ children.

MAYOR HARTKE asked what we know specifically about this group in our region.

MS. ROMEO said they would look into providing that information.

COUNCILMEMBER HARRIS asked how we can increase awareness and how do we promote our events more.

MS. TAPIA said we are working on developing ideas on this in the future.

MAYOR HARTKE said he has experienced this type of advertising issue with nonprofits, it is just a matter of doing more and better.

COUNCILMEMBER ELLIS said the LGBTQIA+ youth experiencing homelessness is more prevalent in larger cities. The foster care system feeds into this. Aging out at 18 is difficult and creates barriers to access in the future. We need to get numbers to best help the population as best we can.

MAYOR HARTKE said all cities are noticing this.

COUNCILMEMBER LOPEZ said communication is difficult. It is a balance between doing the research yourself and raising awareness. People are not paying attention in general. We want to make sure to promote our own events as best we can, but there is only so much we can do.

MS. TAPIA said our goal is access and opportunity.

COUNCILMEMBER LOPEZ added that ease of access is essential as well, to accommodate all types of notification and learning.

MS. ROMEO added that the city is doing a good job at this, but what can we do to enhance it.

COUNCILMEMBER LOPEZ asked if people were amicable to these changes.

MS. ROMEO said that people were receptive, and that staff worked together to provide people with requested information.

MS. ROMEO continued the presentation.

- External Results Common Themes (Target Goals)
 - Outreach to all groups – beyond social media; use flyers, in person opportunities.
 - Communicate transparently, maintain group connections to continue progression.
 - Educate proactively, understanding of differences before it becomes problematic.
 - Develop actionable/visible response to identified needs – take feedback seriously.
 - Partner with non-profits, community agencies to connect resources, assist in enhancing their services.
 - Provide official City stance and status of discussion for Non-Discrimination Ordinance.
- Input Received
 - Provide official City stance and status of discussion for Non-Discrimination Ordinance.
 - Construct City plan with input from various internal and external stakeholders.
 - Provide training and education around non-discrimination so practices are part of City culture.
 - Put the following messages out so everyone is informed and aware of NDO status:
 - This is what we are committed to...
 - If need support, here is where resources can be provided...
 - If you want to be more involved here is what you can do...
 - Involve all departments and develop partnerships so residents, businesses, staff, and visitors receive same powerful message of an equitable, welcoming, and diverse City of Chandler.

COUNCILMEMBER LOPEZ said that this reads like an NDO for City employees and services provided.

MS. ROMEO said this discussion was from the external group.

COUNCILMEMBER LOPEZ said some comments sounded like there was a message for the city to make sure our staff and services are nondiscriminatory and that everyone is trained accordingly. Councilmember Lopez asked what the target population of the NDO would be.

MS. ROMEO said that NDO would be not just City related. She said that no one made it specific to City employees, it would apply to commercial businesses as well.

COUNCILMEMBER ELLIS said the understanding is at large, we are looking at this for the whole City. The common themes are reach, communicate, educate, level up, partner, and provide

education about DEI goals. We have room to grow. It is important to find out what the people of Chandler really are saying. Doing the work is important because we need to get involved beyond paper.

MS. ROMEO said that this is an opportunity for Chandler, to build something new. This is about looking for opportunities for growth so we can all learn something and make connections.

COUNCILMEMBER HARRIS said he is glad we are talking about the NDO. We have a diverse community that should be represented among all people. Having a stance on this is critical, we have a community that includes everybody. We have programs and a great DEI team, and an NDO will send a message that Chandler is a diverse and equitable city. We have taken big steps forward to promote this. This will impact Chandler in a meaningful way and keep businesses thriving. The Chamber has been a great partner in this. Councilmember Harris thanked staff for doing this part of the work.

MS. ROMEO said the disconnect might be, with an ordinance, there is civil penalties or sanctions associated with it. There is a way to connect education and outreach with establishing an ordinance.

MS. ROMEO continued the presentation.

- Internal Community City Employees
- Internal Employee Assessment | April – June
 - DEI Survey for City Employees
 - 726 surveys submitted – approx. 32.9% of City staff.
 - Survey results were analyzed to identify the overall results across all respondents and by demographic group. No significant outliers found in results based on specific demographic (race, gender, age, etc.).
 - Focus groups facilitated by CPS HR
 - Five focus groups including one for Directors/Managers, one for Supervisors, and three for Non-Supervisory staff.
 - Total of 75 participants were selected from 140 interested staff. Individuals were randomly selected by CPS HR based on work and professional demographics.
- Survey Results
- Survey Results
- Survey Results
- Focus Group Recommendations
 - Promote DEI discussions in the workplace
 - Streamline top-down messaging related to DEI initiatives and programs
 - Develop and communicate a clear DEI vision
 - Ensure cultural sensitivity in the workplace
 - Expand opportunities for future leadership (with focus on DEI)

- Evaluate service delivery impacts through a DEI lens
- Expand DEI training
- Promote employment opportunities and leadership development to diverse communities
- Ensure hiring processes are fair, consistent, and non-biased

COUNCILMEMBER ORLANDO asked about the average DEI organizational response trends if the questions about supervisors' response to DEI issues professionally, if those answers were coming from supervisors or employees.

MS. ROMEO responded that the answers come from both employees and supervisors. This is a collective response, but we can break it down further into those groups.

COUNCILMEMBER ORLANDO asked if the differentiation was present.

MS. ROMEO said that the participation overall was not there, but to look at the breakdown in employee vs. supervisor and in tenure for participation in questions. There are other ways to break the participation down. We do not do a comparative analysis to other entities. We craft the survey specifically to each client but conduct surveys year after year. There are different approaches for different clients, so we keep everything contextual.

COUNCILMEMBER ORLANDO said this survey serves as Chandler's baseline.

MS. ROMEO continued the presentation.

- Internal Results Common Themes (Target Goals)
 - Create and communicate a sustainable vision for City's DEI program
 - Find opportunities to improve the recruitment and hiring of diverse candidates
 - Enhance DEI training, leadership development, and cultural awareness
 - Streamline information sharing for DEI initiatives and expand awareness
 - Promote DEI discussions in the workplace
- Roadmap to Reaching Goals
 - Phase I: Establish Targeted DEI Goals
 - Phase II Reassess and Prioritize
 - Phase III: Consider New or Additional Goals

COUNCILMEMBER LOPEZ asked when it says to take feedback, was there an issue there with the City receiving feedback like this?

MS. ROMEO said some of the participants said they felt like they were not being heard, from a few different groups. They would present something to Council and feel like there was no follow up.

COUNCILMEMBER LOPEZ confirmed that this was from diversity awareness perspective rather than a zoning case.

MS. ROMEO said yes, an example was that one person said she contacted the city or made public statements but felt like there was no action behind it. There is a common feeling in cities if something is not completed the next day, they feel like nothing is happening. It's about keeping the feedback in context but listening to the community at large.

MS. ROMEO continued the presentation.

- Phase I Target Goals
 - EXTERNAL
 - Outreach to all groups – beyond social media; use flyers, in person opportunities.
 - Communicate transparently, maintain group connections to continue progression.
 - Educate proactively, understanding of differences before it becomes problematic.
 - Develop actionable/visible response to identified needs – take feedback seriously.
 - Partner with non-profits and community agencies to connect resources, assist in enhancing their services.
 - Provide official City stance and status of discussion for Non-Discrimination Ordinance.
 - INTERNAL
 - Create and communicate a sustainable vision for City's DEI Program.
 - Find opportunities to improve recruitment and hiring of diverse candidates.
 - Enhance DEI training, leadership development, and cultural awareness.
 - Streamline information sharing for DEI initiatives and expand awareness.
 - Promote DEI discussions in the workplace.
- Phase II & III TARGET GOALS
 - Phase II: Reassess and Prioritize
 - After one year of working on Phase I:
 - Utilize the Chandler Human Relations Commission to address concerns on both internal and external issues.
 - Assess progress of everything mentioned in phase I (measurable outcomes).
 - Prioritize what needs to be added, maintained, or taken away based on accomplishments.
 - Repeat what was done in a 2.0 version based on appropriate changes.
 - Phase III: Consider New or Additional Goals
 - After one year of working on Phase II:
 - Consider the additional topics outlined on next slide to add and address.

MAYOR HARTKE asked if the phases system is from the external group or just best practices.

MS. ROMEO said this is from a little of both. This is incremental change, and we all understand that. We do not want to get overwhelmed, but a lot of things can be done simultaneously. Getting to a solid plan and implementing it takes time.

MAYOR HARTKE said all parties see this as taking the time to do it right the first time.

MS. ROMEO said it is about being realistic. There are lots of resources to be used in concert. We must move forward, but without abandoning projects and be mindful to commit and execute the plan.

MS. ROMEO continued the presentation.

- Additional Goals to Consider
 - Create mechanisms for the community to track DEI related concerns and metrics to assess progress in resolving them
 - Evaluate current internal interview practices to increase education among all hiring officials to ensure an awareness of unconscious bias in hiring
 - Explicitly recognize all cultures represented in the City of Chandler (non-clumping of ethnic groups)
 - Encourage community groups to find new ways to grow and diversify their membership
 - Introduce a way for people (internal & external) to anonymously raise DEI concerns and participate in a guided conversation when appropriate

COUNCILMEMBER HARRIS asked about the average staff diversity response trends and asked City Manager to look into this. 13.1% Strongly disagrees/disagrees that the organization recognizes diversity, we need to figure out what these concerns are, this is a significant number. We need to do better to address these concerns at an organizational level.

MR. WRIGHT said the overall feedback is positive, with some negative responses. The action plan is to figure out how to address these concerns of employees. As mentioned, this survey is serving as an introductory review of these concerns, which would be revisited as we add new programming internally.

COUNCILMEMBER HARRIS said that it is important to address all concerns equally. We cannot allow our organization members to think they are not being heard, it is important to address this.

MS. TAPIA continued the presentation.

- Next steps for Chandler DEI

- Any Questions?

MS. ROMEO said that her role is to conduct an assessment. There are opportunities to do more work. The people sharing their opinions had not previously been able to do so, sharing this survey allowed those voices to be heard. Internally and externally, there was positive feedback and constructive criticism. Chandler is on the right track, but there is always work to do.

The meeting was adjourned at 6:00 p.m.

Approval Date of Minutes: October 24, 2022

Certification

I hereby certify that the foregoing minutes are a true and correct copy of the minutes of the Work Session of the City Council of Chandler, Arizona, held on the 22nd day of September 2022. I further certify that the meeting was duly called and held and that a quorum was present.

DATED this _____ day of October, 2022.

City Clerk