

# 25-09-DEV-01 - Creation of Affordable Housing Plan for Cochise County

## Scoring Summary

### Active Submissions

|                          | Total     | Experience and Qualifications of Firm | A - Past Performance and Reference Listing | A-1 -    |
|--------------------------|-----------|---------------------------------------|--|----------|
| Supplier                 | / 100 pts | / 60 pts                              | / 40 pts                                   | / 40 pts |
| Elliott D. Pollack & Co. | 91        | 57.25                                 | 33.75                                      | 33.75    |
| Points Consulting LLC    | 77        | 47.25                                 | 29.75                                      | 29.75    |

# 25-09-DEV-01 - Creation of Affordable Housing Plan for Cochise County

Elliott D. Pollack & Co.

## Scoring Summary

### Evaluation Group 1 - Main Evaluation

|                    | Total           | Experience and Qualifications of Firm | A - Past Performance and Reference Listing Listing | A-1 -        |
|--------------------|-----------------|---------------------------------------|--|--------------|
| Reviewer           | / 100 pts       | / 60 pts                              | / 40 pts   | / 40 pts     |
| Evaluator 1        | 100             | 60                                    | 40   | 40           |
| Evaluator 2        | 90              | 55                                    | 35   | 35           |
| Evaluator 3        | 90              | 55                                    | 35   | 35           |
| Evaluator 4        | 84              | 59                                    | 25   | 25           |
|                    | <b>Average:</b> | <b>57.25</b>                          | <b>Average:</b>                                    | <b>33.75</b> |
|                    |                 | ↓                                     |  | ↓            |
| <b>Calculated:</b> | <b>91</b>       | <b>57.25</b>                          | <b>33.75</b>                                       | <b>33.75</b> |

## Scoring Comments

### Experience and Qualifications of Firm - Reviewer Scores

| Reviewer    | Score | Reason                             | Comments  |
|-------------|-------|------------------------------------|---|
| Evaluator 1 | 60    | Meets or exceeds my expectations   | This firm is superbly qualified with stellar experience.  |
| Evaluator 2 | 55    | Well-supported claim(s)            | The firm has exceptional qualifications and extensive similar project experience.   |
| Evaluator 3 | 55    | Strongly fits desired attribute(s) | Qualified team. Heavy analysis and interpretation of existing data for Cochise County.  |
| Evaluator 4 | 59    | Strongly fits desired attribute(s) | The team has vast experience with housing and housing studies, both in the private and government sectors. Their combined experience is not limited to metropolitan areas, but rural as well. I like that their proposal mentions addressing housing barriers and gaps. |

### A-1 - - Reviewer Scores

| Reviewer    | Score | Reason                           | Comments   |
|-------------|-------|----------------------------------|--|
| Evaluator 1 | 40    | Meets or exceeds my expectations | This firm has worked extensively on housing studies and plans within AZ and throughout the county.   |
| Evaluator 2 | 35    | Well-supported claim(s)          | The firm has identified extensive similar projects in the subject field.   |
| Evaluator 3 | 35    | Meets or exceeds my expectations | Most experience is with apartment studies. Worked with one County on the comprehensive plan.   |
| Evaluator 4 | 25    | Mostly complete response         | The references I tried were either difficult to reach or the POC was no longer with the organization. I was not able to speak with any of the references I reached out to. |

# 25-09-DEV-01 - Creation of Affordable Housing Plan for Cochise County

## Points Consulting LLC

### Scoring Summary

#### Evaluation Group 1 - Main Evaluation

| Reviewer           | Total<br>/ 100 pts | Experience and Qualifications<br>of Firm<br>/ 60 pts | A - Past Performance and<br>Reference Listing Listing<br>/ 40 pts | A-1 -<br>/ 40 pts |
|--------------------|--------------------|--|---|-------------------|
| Evaluator 1        | 45                 | 30   | 15  | 15                |
| Evaluator 2        | 88                 | 54   | 34  | 34                |
| Evaluator 3        | 80                 | 50   | 30  | 30                |
| Evaluator 4        | 95                 | 55   | 40  | 40                |
|                    | <b>Average:</b>    | <b>47.25</b>   | <b>Average:</b>   | <b>29.75</b>      |
|                    |                    | ↓  |   | ↓                 |
| <b>Calculated:</b> | <b>77</b>          | <b>47.25</b>   | <b>29.75</b>  | <b>29.75</b>      |

### Scoring Comments

#### Experience and Qualifications of Firm - Reviewer Scores

| Reviewer    | Score | Reason                             | Comments   |
|-------------|-------|------------------------------------|--|
| Evaluator 1 | 30    | Partially fits desired attributes  | This firm has deep economic analysis experience but less planning experience. The education and training of the team is in economics rather than specifically in housing or affordable housing planning. |
| Evaluator 2 | 54    | High level of detail in response   | The firm has identified their impressive combined qualifications to complete the housing plan.   |
| Evaluator 3 | 50    | Other                              | The president of the firm has numerous years of experience with multiple studies to include housing needs assessments and affordability plans. Data driven analysis                                      |
| Evaluator 4 | 55    | Strongly fits desired attribute(s) | Although the company has good experience, many of the team members are not seasoned yet. With that said, the proposal was put together well and I appreciate the timeline included with it.              |

#### A-1 - - Reviewer Scores

| Reviewer    | Score | Reason                             | Comments  |
|-------------|-------|------------------------------------|---|
| Evaluator 1 | 15    | Partially fits desired attributes  | This firm recently began working on the City of Bisbee's Affordable Housing Plan but this is the only housing study/plan that the firm has worked on in Arizona. This firm project team has not done similar work in Arizona on other projects.   |
| Evaluator 2 | 34    | High level of detail in response   | The firm has identified several current and past projects that demonstrates similar work success.   |
| Evaluator 3 | 30    | Other                              | Experience with developing housing studies in a range of different communities through out the U.S.   |
| Evaluator 4 | 40    | Strongly fits desired attribute(s) | I reached out to the City of Bisbee. They indicated that they would not only hire this company again, but they are bringing perspectives to Bisbee that would not have been considered. They have regular meetings with the City and are on time with the timeline they submitted in the proposal. They are very happy with them so far. Their one recommendation would be to negotiate either monthly or quarterly payment options with them if they are awarded the contract. |