

**PROCEEDINGS OF THE COCHISE COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS
SPECIAL MEETING HELD ON
FRIDAY, NOVEMBER 18, 2022**

A special meeting of the Cochise County Board of Supervisors was held on Friday, November 18, 2022 at 4:00 p.m. in the Board of Supervisors' Hearing Room, 1415 Melody Lane, Building G, Bisbee, Arizona.

Present: Ann English, Chairman; Peggy Judd, Vice-Chairman, telephonic; Tom Crosby, Supervisor

Staff Present: Richard G. Karwaczka, County Administrator
Sharon Gilman, Deputy County Administrator
Brian McIntyre, County Attorney
Christine Roberts, Chief Civil Deputy County Attorney
Tim Mattix, Clerk of the Board

Attendees: Jacqui Clay, School Superintendent
Lisa Marra, Elections Director

Chairman English called the meeting to order at 4:00 p.m.

ANY ITEM ON THIS AGENDA IS OPEN FOR DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION

THE ORDER OR DELETION OF ANY ITEM ON THIS AGENDA IS SUBJECT TO MODIFICATION AT THE MEETING

ACTION

Board of Supervisors

1. Accept the elections results certified and submitted by the Cochise County Elections Department as the official canvass for the General Election held on November 8, 2022.

Supervisor Crosby made a motion to accept the election results certified and submitted by the Cochise County Elections Department as the official canvass for the General Election held on November 8, 2022. Vice-Chairman Judd seconded the motion.

Ms. Marra reviewed the purpose of the canvass, which is to determine accuracy in results and that the election was conducted within the guidelines in the Arizona Revised Statutes. She reviewed various highlights and statistics from the election: election program testing; Logic & Accuracy Testing (L&A Test); number of registered voters; turnout percentages; early voters by mail and in-person; emergency voting; and, the number of voters who voted on Election Day. 550 voters in the Willcox and

Douglas Active Management Area (AMA) elections were mailed an incorrect ballot style due to human error in the County Recorder's Office; these voters were sent the correct ballot. 413 voters returned the corrected ballot; 56 did not, and their ballots were adjudicated by the early boards to ensure the voters were not disenfranchised on the races they were legally allowed to vote. She reviewed the hand count process, which had equal representation by both political parties and found no discrepancies.

Ms. Marra summarized the candidates and ballot measures, and reviewed the training conducted for all poll and board workers. The Secretary of State will conduct the statewide canvass on December 5, 2022; one automatic recount is expected to occur in mid-December.

The Board thanked Ms. Marra and held their comments until the end.

Chairman English read the following names of individuals who requested their names to be read in opposition to the item: Kevin O'Brien; June O'Brien; Ella Roberts; and, Jenny Walston.

Chairman English read the following names of individuals who requested their names to be read in favor of the item: Douglas Whitney; Deborah Anbinder; Helen Snyder; Alice Wakefield; Diane Davidson; Marjorie Murphey; Henry Camacho; Carolyn Nordstrom; Robert Rodrigues; Barbara Alice Miller; Peter M Waser; Chris Dietz; Christine Rhodes; and, Ronnie.

Randall Limbach was called upon but ceded his time to Daniel Wood.

Radford Hyde discussed reasons for his opposition to accepting the election results.

Jeanne Benda Whitney discussed reasons for her support of accepting the election results.

Kara Harris was called upon but ceded her time to Daniel Wood.

Elisabeth Tyndall discussed reasons for her support of accepting the election results.

Sidonia Lisa Glenn was called upon but did not speak.

Jeff Sturges discussed reasons for his support of accepting the election results.

Jennifer Angell was called upon but did not speak.

Shari Arnold was called upon but did not speak.

Chelle Holloman discussed reasons for her opposition to accepting the election results.

Allison Morse discussed reasons for her support of accepting the election results.

Alex Gulotta discussed reasons for his support of accepting the election results.

Leslie Himes was called upon but ceded her time to Brian Steiner.

Oscar Cancio was called upon but did not speak.

Marco Villalobos was called upon but did not speak.

Erik Villa was called upon but did not speak.

Brian Steiner discussed reasons for his opposition to accepting the election results and detailed reasons for his concern with the certification of voting machines.

Gisela Aaron was called upon but ceded her time to Paul Rice.

Paul Rice discussed reasons for his opposition to accepting the election results and detailed reasons for his concern with the certification of voting machines.

Daniel Wood discussed reasons for his concern with Mr. McIntyre and his opposition to accepting the election results and ceded remaining time to Paul Rice.

Rodolfo Valencia was called upon but did not speak.

Gisela Aaron was called upon but ceded her time to Paul Rice.

Renata Dany discussed reasons for her opposition to accept the election results.

Robert McCormick was called upon but ceded his time to Paul Rice.

Kathryn Wilson was called upon but ceded her time to Paul Rice.

James Robert Wilson was called upon but ceded his time to Paul Rice.

John Moss was called upon but ceded his time to Paul Rice.

Jean Giuffrida was called upon but ceded her time to Paul Rice.

Henry Conroy discussed reasons for his opposition to accepting the election results.

Paul Rice continued to detail reasons for his concern with the certification of voting machines.

Jill Lynn Vanden Heuvel was called upon but ceded her time to Brian Steiner.

Chris Jones discussed reasons for her opposition to accepting the election results.

Sarah Mae Pacheco discussed reasons for her support of accepting the election results.

Kathleen Wiora O'Brien discussed reasons for her opposition to accepting the election results.

Philip O'Brien discussed reasons for his opposition to accept the election results and ceded remaining time to Brian Steiner.

Richard Cisar was called upon but did not speak.

Ed Krieger was called upon but ceded his time to Brian Steiner.

Pamela Gravely was called upon but ceded her time to Brian Steiner.

Joseph Patterson discussed reasons for his opposition to accepting the election

results.

Gwynn Patterson discussed reasons for her opposition to accepting the election results.

Hoang Quan discussed reasons for his opposition to accepting the election results.

Huong Quan Nguyen was called upon but ceded her time to Hoang Quan.

Hoang Quan continued to discuss reasons for his opposition to accepting the election results.

Tuong-Ai Nguyen was called upon but ceded his time to Daniel Wood.

Tamara Birch discussed reasons for her support of accepting the election results.

Joe Clifton discussed reasons for his opposition to accepting the election results.

Brian Steiner continued to detail reasons for his concern with the certification of voting machines.

The meeting recessed at 5:51 p.m. The meeting reconvened at 6:01 p.m. All Supervisors were present (Judd telephonically).

Brian Steiner continued to detail reasons for his concern with the certification of voting machines..

Daniel Wood continued to discuss reasons for his opposition to accepting the election results.

Kori Lorick, State Elections Director speaking on behalf of the Secretary of State, responded to concerns regarding the certification of voting machines.

Supervisor Crosby discussed information Mr. Rice requested from the Secretary of State's Office, and asked how it would impact the Board's certification.

Vice-Chairman Judd expressed concerns regarding the accreditation of voting machines, and stated her support of a 100% hand count, which would have backed up the election results. She supports gathering more information regarding accreditation. She recognized those in attendance.

Supervisor Crosby stated that he has no reason to think the County's 2020 election was dishonest. While he does not know, he suspects that voting machines can be hacked. A hand count would have confirmed the results provided by Ms. Marra. The Board attempted everything they could think of to confirm the accuracy of the voting machines. He recognized those in attendance. He stated his opinion that if there is proof that the machines are lawfully accredited, the election results should be accepted. If they have not been lawfully certified, the results cannot be accepted.

Supervisor Crosby made a motion to table accepting the election results until such evidence about the lawful certification and accreditation by a laboratory is presented and confirmed by persons with expertise in that field.

Chairman English stated that she understood Ms. Lorick's previous comments as meaning that today's primary presenters had presented the same information to the

Supreme Court and were turned down. In response to the Board, Ms. Lorick stated that a case filed with the Arizona Supreme Court earlier this year raised questions about the accreditation of the lab. The labs have been properly accredited the entire time and the election equipment is properly certified. Supervisor Crosby stated that the opposing viewpoint was not allowed and requested that both sides be allowed to speak.

Ms. Roberts stated that there is a motion on the floor that has not been seconded; conversation is continuing without there being a second. Chairman English stated that there was not a second and the Board is back to original motion. Discussion ensued regarding the ability of the speakers to respond to the information from Ms. Lorick.

Supervisor Crosby appealed the decision of the Chair to not allow the presenters to present. Chairman English stated that all presenters had the opportunity to present.

Vice-Chairman Judd asked that the motion be repeated. Supervisor Crosby repeated the motion as follows: table accepting the election results until such evidence about lawful certification by an accredited laboratory is presented and confirmed by persons with expertise in that field.

Vice-Chairman Judd stated that there was not a time certain in the motion and an item cannot be tabled without a time certain. In response to Vice-Chairman Judd, Ms. Roberts stated that Monday, November 28, 2022 is the last day to certify the election results.

Supervisor Crosby restated the motion as follows: table accepting the election results until Monday the 28th of November, until such evidence about lawful certification by an accredited laboratory is presented and confirmed by persons with expertise in that field. Vice-Chairman Judd seconded the motion.

Chairman English requested clarification on who will decide that the information is correct. Supervisor Crosby stated that the Board will decide. In response to Chairman English, Supervisor Crosby confirmed that information will be provided directly to the Board. Supervisor Crosby stated that three presenters tonight have quite a bit of information, and confirmed that he will consider them the experts in the field. Chairman English requested that Ms. Lorick provide the requested information to the Clerk of the Board. Supervisor Crosby clarified that it will be made public and Chairman English confirmed.

In response to the Board, Ms. Lorick confirmed her understanding of the request and stated that she also provided information to Vice-Chairman Judd today. Vice-Chairman Judd stated that the information did not address whether SLI Compliance was accredited at the time, and requested to see the letter from the federal government stating that SLI was always in compliance.

Chairman English requested the meeting time be included in the motion.

Supervisor Crosby restated the motion as follows: table accepting the election results until Monday the 28th of November, at 10:00 a.m., until such evidence about lawful certification by an accredited laboratory is presented and confirmed by persons with expertise in that field. Vice-Chairman Judd seconded the motion.

Chairman English called for the vote and it was approved 2-1 (English opposed).

Chairman English adjourned the meeting at 6:31 p.m.

APPROVED:

Ann English, Chairman

ATTEST:

Tim Mattix, Clerk of the Board