

May 2, 2025

Erie County Legislature 92 Franklin Street, 4th Floor Buffalo, New York 14202

RE: Bridge NY Project Agreements with NYSDOT and Contracts for Engineering Design Services For 7 Bridge Replacement Projects

Dear Honorable Members:

We are forwarding for your approval a proposed resolution authorizing the County of Erie to participate in the Bridge NY program. The County Executive needs to execute seven Agreements with the New York State Department of Transportation to pay the Federal and non-Federal share of the cost of design phases I-VI and right of way incidentals for these projects.

In addition, the Department of Public Works requests permission to award a contract for each of these seven projects to the design engineering firm selected via request for proposals for each project.

Should your Honorable Body require further information, I encourage you to contact the Department of Public Works, Office of the Commissioner. Thank you for your consideration on this matter.

Sincerely yours,

Mark C. Poloncarz, Esq. Erie County Executive

MCP: jtd

MEMORANDUM

To: Honorable Members of the Erie County Legislature

From: Department of Public Works

Re: Bridge NY Project Agreements with NYSDOT and Contracts for Engineering Design

Services For 7 Bridge Replacement Projects

Date: May 2, 2025

SUMMARY

The County of Erie has received awards for seven bridge replacement projects as a part of the Bridge NY Program. Adoption of this resolution authorizes the County Executive to enter into an Agreement with the New York State Dept. of Transportation (NYSDOT) for the Design Phases I through VI and right of way incidentals for each of these projects. The Department of Public Works also requests contracts be awarded to the design engineering consultant selected for each of these projects. The seven projects and engineering firms are listed below and each was competitively selected following the Federal Aid process:

Project	Engineering Firm	Town
PIN 5765.31 - Glenwood E. Concord Road over	Mott MacDonald	Concord
Graff Brook		
PIN 5765.32 – Glenwood E. Concord Road over	Mott MacDonald	Concord
Sprague Brook		
PIN 5765.33 – Versailles Plank Road over Big	Popli Design Group	Evans
Sister Creek		
PIN 5765.34 – Concord Road over Spooner Creek	Greenman Pedersen, Inc.	Concord
PIN 5765.35 – Bagdad Road over Clear Creek	CHA Solutions	Collins
PIN 5765.36 – Ketchum Road over North Branch	DiDonato Associates	North
Clear Creek		Collins
PIN 5765.37 – Meahl Road over Branch Murder	Watts Architects &	Newstead
Creek	Engineers	

FISCAL IMPLICATIONS

The state local agreement for the Engineering and Right-of-Way Incidentals for each of these projects funds the projects with a 95% Federal share and a 5% local share, Erie County funds. The funding for each of these projects is as follows:

Project Number		Federal Share	County Share	WBS Element
PIN 5765.31		\$444,600	\$23,400	B.25006
PIN 5765.32		\$484,500	\$25,500	B.25006
PIN 5765.33		\$475,000	\$25,000	B.25006
PIN 5765.34		\$394,250	\$20,750	B.25006
PIN 5765.35		\$484,500	\$25,500	B.25006
PIN 5765.36		\$566,200	\$29,800	B.25006
PIN 5765.37		\$498,750	\$26,250	B.25006
	Total	\$3,347,800	\$176,200	B.25006

The contracts awarded to the consulting engineers will not exceed the funding provided by each agreement with NYSDOT.

REASONS FOR RECOMMENDATION

The Erie County Department of Public Works wants to initiate the design phase of these Bridge NY Projects by entering into the Agreements for Design Phases I - VI and right of way incidentals with the New York State Department of Transportation. In addition, the division requests the awarding of contracts to the selected engineering consultants, thus beginning design of the projects promptly and adhering to the time restrictions of the Bridge NY program. These Projects benefit from Federal Aid reimbursement through the Bridge NY program at a rate of 95 percent.

BACKGROUND INFORMATION

These projects were approved by the New York State Department of Transportation in their current Capital Program to be funded with Federal Aid funds. There is a time restriction on the award of these federal monies in which Erie County must complete these designs, including any right of way acquisitions within 24 months of award hence the desire to immediately award design contracts to engineering firms.

CONSEQUENCES OF NEGATIVE ACTION

If these Agreements are not approved, the bridges will continue to deteriorate and pose problems for the traveling public. Failure to execute these Agreements will jeopardize receipt of the Project awards and possibly the loss of eligibility for future Bridge NY Program participation.

STEPS FOLLOWING APPROVAL

County Executive will sign the agreements with NYSDOT. Contracts with engineering firms will be executed. The funding for the first 100% instance of these contracts will be allocated by the budget department.

COMPTROLLER'S OFFICE REVIEW

The proposed legislation has been reviewed by the Office of the Comptroller and is related to an authorized capital project for which there are sufficient appropriations for the action proposed.

This is a each advance yourt the 2:25 Bul sale.

Timothy C. Callan Deputy Comptroller Comptroller's Office

B.25006 - Fed Aid Bridge Replacement - BridgeNY - Design A RESOLUTION SUBMITTED BY: DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC WORKS

Bridge NY Project Agreements with NYSDOT and Contracts for Engineering Design RE: Services For 7 Bridge Replacement Projects

WHEREAS, the County of Erie has received the award of seven bridge replacement projects through the Bridge NY Program; and

WHEREAS these projects are as follows; PIN 5765.31 - Glenwood E. Concord Road over Graff Brook in the Town of Concord, PIN 5765.32 - Glenwood E. Concord Road over Sprague Brook in the Town of Concord, PIN 5765.33 - Versailles Plank Road over Big Sister Creek in the Town of Evans, PIN 5765.34 - Concord Road over Spooner Creek in the Town of Concord, PIN 5765.35 - Bagdad Road over Clear Creek in the Town of Collins, PIN 5765.36 -Ketchum Road over North Branch Clear Creek in the Town of North Collins, and PIN 5765.37 -Meahl Road over Branch Murder Creek in the Town of Newstead; and

WHEREAS, these projects are eligible for funding under Title 23, U.S. Code, as amended, 23CFR as amended PUB.L. 117-58 also known as the "Bipartisan Infrastructure Law" (BIL) that calls for the apportionment of the costs such program to be borne at the ratio of 95% Federal funds and 5% non-federal funds; and

WHEREAS, agreements need to be executed with New York Dept. of Transportation for these projects enabling the disbursement of the funding from Bridge NY; and

WHEREAS, the County of Erie desires to advance the Projects by making a commitment to 100% of the costs of the projects for Design Engineering (Scoping & Design I-VI) and Right of Way Incidentals phases for all seven of the Projects; and

WHEREAS, in advancing these projects the Department of Public Works desires to award design contracts to each of the engineering consultants selected for the projects through the Federal Aid request for proposal process; and

WHEREAS, the funding for these projects is available in BA 123, Fund 420, SAP project B.25006, Federal Aid Bridge Replacement - BridgeNY - Design, the cost of these projects being bore by the County are \$3,347,800 in a Federal Aid reimbursable share and \$176,200 in nonfederal share for a total of \$3,524,000 for these projects.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT

RESOLVED, that the Erie County Legislature hereby approves projects PIN 5765.31 - Glenwood E. Concord Road over Graff Brook in the Town of Concord, PIN 5765.32 - Glenwood E. Concord Road over Sprague Brook in the Town of Concord, PIN 5765.33 - Versailles Plank Road over Big Sister Creek in the Town of Evans, PIN 5765.34 - Concord Road over Spooner Creek in the Town of Concord, PIN 5765.35 - Bagdad Road over Clear Creek in the Town of Collins, PIN 5765.36 - Ketchum Road over North Branch Clear Creek in the Town of North Collins, and PIN 5765.37 - Meahl Road over Branch Murder Creek in the Town of Newstead awarded to the County of Erie through the Bridge NY Program; and be it further

RESOLVED, that authorization is hereby given to County Executive to enter into and execute the state and local agreements with the New York State Department of Transportation for these projects; and be it further

RESOLVED, that the County Legislature of the County of Erie hereby authorizes the County of Erie to pay in the first instance 100% of the Federal and non-Federal shares of the cost of the design engineering (Design I-VI) and right-of-way incidentals, phases of all seven projects; and be it further

RESOLVED, that authorization is hereby given to the County Executive to execute agreements with the following engineering firms selected using the Federal Aid RFP process for the projects as listed:

Project	Engineering Firm	Contract (not to
		exceed)
PIN 5765.31	Mott MacDonald	\$468,000
PIN 5765.32	Mott MacDonald	\$510,000
PIN 5765.33	Popli Design Group	\$500,000
PIN 5765.34	Greenman Pedersen, Inc.	\$415,000
PIN 5765.35	CHA Solutions	\$510,000
PIN 5765.36	DiDonato Associates	\$596,000
PIN 5765.37	Watts Architects & Engineers	\$525,000

and be it further

RESOLVED, that funding for these projects is available in BA 123, Fund 420, SAP project B.25006, Federal Aid Bridge Replacement - BridgeNY - Design, the cost of these projects being bore by the County are \$3,347,800 in a Federal Aid reimbursable share and \$176,200 in non-federal share for a total of \$3,524,000 for these projects.

RESOLVED, that the Director of Budget and Management is hereby authorized to adjust the Project budget for all increases or reductions in Federal and/or Non-Federal revenue that are made available for this Project; and be it further

RESOLVED, that in the event the amount required to pay in the first instance 100% of the Federal and non-Federal shares of the costs of the projects in the agreement, the County of Erie shall convene its Legislature as soon as possible to appropriate said excess amount immediately upon the notification by the New York State Department of Transportation thereof; and be it further

RESOLVED, that authorization is hereby given to the County Executive to enter into and execute all necessary Agreements, certifications or reimbursement requests for Federal Aid and/or non-federal Aid on behalf of the County of Erie, with the New York State Department of Transportation in connection with the advancement or approval of the Project identified in the State/Local Agreements; and providing for the administration of the Project and the Municipality's first instance funding of Project costs and permanent funding of the local share of Federal Aid- and State Aid-eligible Project costs and all Project costs within appropriations therefore that are not so eligible; and be it further

RESOLVED, that the County of Erie hereby agrees that construction of the Project shall begin no later than twenty-four (24) months after award and the construction phase of the Project shall be completed within thirty (30) months; and be it further

RESOLVED, that authorization is hereby given for the Division of Budget and Management to make any technical adjustments necessary to effectuate this resolution; and be it further

RESOLVED, that a certified copy of this resolution be filed with the New York State Commissioner of Transportation, by attaching it to any necessary Agreement in connection with the Project; and be it further

RESOLVED, that the Clerk of the Legislature forward ten (10) certified copies of this Resolution to the Department of Public Works, Office of the Commissioner, to be forwarded to the New York State Department of Transportation; and one (1) copy each to the County Executive's Office, Comptroller's Office, Division of Budget and Management.

TO:

TIMOTHY C. CALLAN, COMPTROLLER'S OFFICE PROPOSED RESOLUTIONS REQUIRING RULE 55

RE:

CONTRACT APPROVAL CHECKLIST

CONFIRMATION OF AVAILABILITY OF FUNDS IN CAPITAL PROJECTS

New York State Department of Transportation Mott MacDonald (2 contracts) Popli Design Group Greenman Pedersen, Inc. CHA Solutions DiDonato Associates Watts Architects & Engineers
\$978,000 - Mott MacDonald (2 contracts) \$500,000 - Popli Design Group \$415,000 - Greenman Pedersen, Inc. \$510,000 - CHA Solutions \$596,000 - DiDonato Associates \$525,000 - Watts Architects & Engineers Total \$3,524,000
B.25006 Fed Aid Bridge Replacement - BridgeNY - Design
PIN 5765.31 – Glenwood E. Concord over Graff PIN 5765.32 – Glenwood E. Concord over Sprague Brook PIN 5765.33 – Versailles Plank Rd over Big Sister Creek PIN 5765.34 – Concord Rd over Spooner Creek PIN 5765.35 – Bagdad Road over Clear Creek PIN 5765.36 – Ketchum Road over N. Br. Clear Creek PIN 5765.37 – Meahl Rd over Trib. Cayuga Crk
Funding questions: William E. Geary, Jr. at 8301 Letter pickup: Christy Weber at 8301
OMPLETE ITEMS 6 AND 7
\$5,000,000 OU Tuge 4/18/25

[55 compt_10]



ERIE COUNTY DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC WORKS - HIGHWAYS RFP # PIN 5765.31 & 5765.32 - Glenwood East Concord Rd Bridges PROPOSAL REVIEW COMMITTEE RATINGS - SUMMARY

	L										Eva	Evaluation Criteria	Criter	9				П				П				
A Long Control of the Long	Unde	Understanding of to be Done		Work		Superior sellifica	Experience & Qualifications of Proposed Staff	, ° =	# J.	Experience of Fkm/Team with Fed Aid Projects	nce of with		Prese Re	Present Worldoad & Finandal Responsibility	idoad ial bility		Log	Logistics and liarity with Pr Area	Logistics and Familiarity with Project Area		Perc DBE P.	Percentage of DBE Participation	e of ation	Waighted Average Qualifications	Qualifications	
	Wei	Weight = 25%	25%		Wei	Weight = 25%	25%		Wei	Weight = 20%	×		Welg	Weight = 15%	×		Weight = 10%	10.10	, e	3	Weight = 5%	2.5%		Score	The same of	_
	Comm	Committee Member Rew Score (1 - 10)	ember 10)	July S	Committee S	Committee Member Raw Score (1 - 10)	10)	3 N	Coermil	Committee Member Naw Score (1 - 10)	_	Awe.	Careenist Rave Sox	Committee Member New Score (1 - 10)		New Series	Committee Member New Score (1 - 10)	e (1 - 10	ž ž		w Score	Committee Member Raw Store (1 - 30)	Ş Ş	(01 - 10)		
	5	~	4		Ş	~	2		#	#2		-	1	111	1	_	M. E.	#2 #3	-	3	26	2				-
Bergmann Architects Aunmers	^	~	-	7,33	٠	2.5	•	1.17	9	23	٥	9.33	80	5.5	6	2.50	9	8.5	8.83	6	9	•	9.00	9.30	w	
CHA CONSUMING INC	90	-	5°	817	•	9.8	œ.	9.17	6	23	۵	9.33	4	î	7 4	467	6	6	98	P R	9.8	•	917	92.8	4	_
Mometo Assocutes	80	00		8.00	9.	8.5	6	8.83	9.	9	•	9.33	5	~	7 5	29.5	g.	6	9.00	8	9.8	00	615	8.28	т	_
Indman Anthony	•	22	2.5	9.00	•	•	-	2	٠	잌	2	9.17	•	~	6	292	4	7.5	7 283	6	•	о».	9 00	8.30	7	-
Inher Associates	6		^	8.00	-	7.5	^	98 2	ø	2	-	9.00		v	9	7.33	,		5 5.13	9 11	•	0	9.6	1.76	6	-
Greenman Pederson, Inc.	30	27	22	187	9	on.	6	9.00	9	9	en .	11.6	9	-		633	6	57	9 8 50	9	•	80 5	98.80	6.11	9	
tabella	9	9	^	6.33	•	53	•	9,	•	9	on.	933	6	6.5	6	8.17	8	5.5	7 6.83	•	3	6	80.6	193	60	
Mote MacDonald		2,2	80	7.83	•	40	٥	8.67	64	9	Ø1	6E-6	00	SS	6	7.50	6		6	6 27	•	6	8	8.40	п	
Poph Design Group	^	40	22	7.50	•	•	-	5	•	9	9	116		\$	г Ф	733	^	9	1 6.67	_	*	9 10	1 9 M	8.03	7	
	1									1	1	١	۱													

It is my opinion in recommending Most MacDonald the Erie County Department of Public Works has complied with all applicable provisions of Section 19.08 of the Erie County Administrative Code. Scoring sheets and other materials related to this matter are graduable for review at the Department of Public Works, office during regular business hours.

Deputy County Executive

Erle County Department of Jublic Works



ERIE COUNTY DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC WORKS - HIGHWAYS RFP # PIN 5765.33 - Versaliles Plank Rd Bridge (BIN 3327390) PROPOSAL REVIEW COMMITTEE RATINGS - SUMMARY

											Eva	Evaluation Criteria	Crite	e.											
Progost	Onde	Understanding to be Dor	fing of Done	of Work ne		ixperit	Experience & Qualifications of Proposed Staff	_ 8 ±	A F	Experience of Firm/Team with Fed Aid Projects	with with jects	3	£ £	Present Workload & Financial Responsibility	eldoad clai		amilia G	Logistics and liarity with Pr Area	Logistics and Familiarity with Project Area	5	Per DBE i	Percentage of DBE Participation	e of etlon	Weighted Average Qualifications	Quelifications
	×	Weight = 25%	25%		Wei	Weight = 25%	25%		Wei	Weight = 20%	36		Weig	Weight = 15%	2%		Weig	Weight = 10%	×	-	Neigh	Weight = 5%		Score	Ranking
	3 8	Conmittee Member Rem Stare (1 - 10)		¥ 3	Comens Rew S	Committee Member Rew Score (1 - 10)	101 ·	30 A 3	Corners Page S	Cornellee Marter Ager Score (1 - 10)	_	1 3	Committee School	Committee Member Raw Score (1 - 10)		Seve S	Committe Case Sco	Committee Member Raw Score [1 - 30]	_	S A N	months	Committee Member Nam Score (1 - 10)	Ang.		
	E	~	=		=	ä	:		ä	2	3		7	2	22			23	2	-	1	#2 #3			
Barton & Loguidice	-	-	~	191	-	•	~	233	•	-	•	29.0	~	^	•	191	~		S 6	(99	6	6 01	9.33	1.77	00
Bergman Architects Logisteers Planners	n	2	•	9.33	-	EP.	^	9,00	6	•	٠	8	•	-		8		-	-	8		9 01	9.13	9.50	1
O.O.	•	2	8.8	6.63	0	o.	28	8	•	a	•	8	•			6.67	-	•	•	29 0	6	01	9.31	8.59	~
DiConato Associates	•	91	•	9 67	-	-	•	5	•	•	•	8	_	vo		902		6	-	6.3	6	10 9	9.33	8,40	ısı
Indensin Anthony	-	95	~	8	•	•	-	29 8	6	•	•	8	-	130		22.0			~	90 19		5 8 6	35	144	4
Haher Associates	•	•	22	8 50	•	-	~	2.00	•		٠	/98	-	o.	-	6.53	-	•	-	6 67	•	6 01	633	7.99	7
LaBeria Associadas	•	-	22	7.80	-	^	•	292	6	-		298	-	-		6 33	-		, 9	7.33		10 9	9 00	NO B	49
Popli Design Group	٠	3	2	917	•	•	-	69.0	٠	•		8.6	^	30		29.6	7	•	,	167	•	8 8 5	5 650	8 60	-

It is my opinion in recommending Popil Design Group the Erie County Department of Public Works has compiled with all applicable provisions of Section 19.08 of the Erie County Administrative Code Scoring sheets and other materials related to this matter are available for review at the Department of Public Works' office during regular business hours.

William E. Geary, Jr., Commissione Ere County Department of Public Works

Deputy County Executive

COMM. 9E-14 Page 9 of 13



ERIE COUNTY DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC WORKS - HIGHWAYS RFP # PIN 5765.34 - Concord Rd Bridge (BIN 3367370) PROPOSAL REVIEW COMMITTEE RATINGS - SUMMARY

	L										Eva	Evaluation Criteria	Crite	ria											
Proposer	Under	Understanding to be Do	standing of to be Done	of Work	- 8 4	Experi Aalifica ropos	Experience & Qualifications of Proposed Staff	_ 5 €		Zperik ZTeen Ald Pr	Experience of Firm/Team with Fed Ald Projects	_ F	7 5	ent Workle Financial esponsibili	Present Workload B. Financial Responsibility		to amilian	Logistics and liarity with Pr Area	Logistics and Familiarity with Project Area	t t	Pen 086 P	Percentage of DBE Participation	e of abion	Weighted Average Qualifications	Qualiffications
	N. S.	Weight a 259	25%		We	Weight = 25%	25%		3	Weight = 20%	X0X		Wei	Weight = 15%	15%	H	Weigh	Weight = 10%	*	f	Weight = 5%	. 5%		Score	Mount
	Correction 5	Committee Member Naw Scare (1 - 10)	10 E	*	S 3	Contenditee Member Naw Score (1 - 10)	- 101	₹ 5	COMPA Res	Committee Member Ann Score (1 - 10)	101	* 5	Comen	Committee Member Naw Score (1 - 10)	_	3 4 5	Committee Member Raw Score (1 - 10)	re liker		3 m	Constructor Member Raw Score (1 - 10)	#Membi	1 3	(1 - 10)	
	4	~	2	i i	=	2	2	1	Ē	2	5		2	2	2	-	2	42	6.9		12	69			
larton & Loguráce	۰	•	-	1.33	Ŀ		~	133	•	-	•	69.	~	~		191	-		ya ys	6 67 9	9 10	•	PF 6	7.93	9
C#A	•	2	2.5	0 SD	•	•	۵	906	۰	•	•	90 0	~	us.	~	8	-	ø		191	9	•	11.0	141	2
Differents Associates	9	6	•	191		-	•	833	9	•	9	906	~	·	-	2 00			2	133	01 6	•	933	8 40	m
Frdman Anthony	•	2	9	7.50	٠	-	9	1.67	۰	•	8	80	-	-	•	8.33	an .	4	•	90.0	•	9 1.5	8	832	4
Inher Associates	^	ĝ	~	8	-	•	~	2 00	*			667		40	49	00.0	~	•	4	299	. 6	10 9	9.33	7.82	6
Greenman Pederson, Inc	·	٠	^	133	-	•	65	487	•	-	•	467	,	-	-	7.67	10	•	10	8.53	6	9	9.33	8.43	-
Lafethe Associates	9	٠	٠	8	•	~	40	191	6	10	•	198	-	=	•	833	**	•	9	133	-	6 91	9.00	7.83	80
Popé Dasign Group	0	91	^	8	-	2.5	•	7.83	•	-	•	69	-	~	-	6.33	_		•	8	9	10 4.5	5 9.17	7.848	7
Wells Architetts & featurers	-	•	7	00	·	•	7	1.67	٠	o.	200	8 67	•		-	8	-	6		.98	\dashv	9 20	9.00	8.17	s

It is my opinion in recommending Greenman-Pedersen, Inc. the Erie County Department of Public Works has compiled with all applicable provisions of Section 19.08 of the Erie County Administrative Code. Scoring sheets and other materials related to this matter an available for review at the Department of Public Works' office during regular business hours.

William E. Gearr, Ir., Comhrydond Ene County Department Of Public Works

Lisa M. Chimera Deputy County Executive



ERIE COUNTY DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC WORKS - HIGHWAYS RFP # PIN 5765.35 - Bagdad Rd Bridge (BIN 3328620) PROPOSAL REVIEW COMMITTEE RATINGS - SUMMARY

								1			Evalu	Evaluation Criteria	Criteri			1							ſ		
1950000	Under	Understanding of Work to be Done	nog of	Work	~ § E	sperie alffica opore	Experience & Qualifications of Proposed Staff	7 -	First A	Experience of n/Team with I Aid Projects	Experience of Firm/Team with Fed Aid Projects		2 A 25	Present Workload & Financial Responsibility	iload &		ullant	Logistics and liarity with Pr Area	Logistics and Familiarity with Project Area		F Part	Percentage of DBE Participation		Weighted Average Qualifications	Quelifications
	Wei	Weight - 2	25%	Г	Wei	Weight = 25%	15%		Weig	Weight = 20%	*	F	Weigh	Weight = 15%	ايرا	5	Weight = 10%	10%		We	Weight = 5%	5%		Score	Kanang
	Comme	Committee Member Naw Score (1 - 10)		¥	Corneral Raw Sa	Committee Member Raw Score (1 - 30)		¥ 3	Countitie Member Raw Score (1 - 10)	bannithe Member Raw Store (3 - 10)	-	3	ommette See	Committee Member Raw Score (1 - 10)	3 5	_	Committee Member Raw Score (1 - 10)	Committee Membar Raw Score (1 - 10)	P V		Committee Member Raw Score (1 - 10)		* S	(01 - 10)	
	=	~	2		2	2	2		9	82	=	_	-	22			2	9		ä	82	6			
Barton & Loguidice	-	~	~	297	-		~	8 ~	6	10		667	F.	6 2	29.2	7	•	~	4.67	th	91	•	9.33	7.68	7
	6	•		8	•	g.	6	9 00	6	•	•	906	ua .	-	200	2	•	an.	29.8	r	3		9.33	8 54	1
Monato Associates	•	2	-	8.50	-	~	•	3		ah.	-	98		-	7.67	6	•	^	£33	•	2	9	9.13	8.38	2
Lideran Anthony	-	2	-	95.2	•	-	•	19.0	•			8	-		ET.		-	^	8	*	60	4.5	05.4	8.32	æ
Falser Associates	•	7.5	2	267		-	'n	8,	•		-	698	-	•	0018	~	9	•	6.67	٠	9	•	8.13	173	9
Greenman Pedersen. Inc.	•	6	~	8	-	•	6	49	Ø)	-	-	29.8	-	•	167	9		^	8	•	g	2	11.6	8 31	4
allella Associates	•	~	۰	633	-	-	-	263	-		•	49 8		•	133	e e	•	9	7.33	-	9	•	98	767	00
Popil Design Group	6	-	2	785	•	2	40	3	•	-		2918	-	-	767	7	-	9	7.80	6	g	 	9.17	8.13	ıs

It is my opinion in recommending CHA the Ene County Department of Public Works has complied with all applicable provisions of Section 19.08 of the Erie County Administrative Code. Scoring sheets and other materials related to this matter are available for review at the Department of Public Works' office during regular business hours.

William E. Geaffy, Jr., Commissioner Erie County Department of Public Works

Deputy County Executive



ERIE COUNTY DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC WORKS - HIGHWAYS RFP # PIN 5765.36 - Ketchum Rd Bridge (BIN 3328350) PROPOSAL REVIEW COMMITTEE RATINGS - SUMMARY

Understanding of Work Chaefficiations of Property		Ц	П	П			П					Eval	Evaluation Criteria	Criteri				П	П	П	H	Н	П			
Weight = 15% Weig	Propose	Unde	stand to be	ling of Done	Work.	28 6	speria alffica opose	tions of	7.5	Film E	perki Tesm id Pro	with Pects		Present and a second	it Wor Finand sponsil	Moad Fal Sility		niffari	Stics ty with Area	Proje		Parc 1986	entage	of tion	Weighted Average Qualifications	Qualifications
Committee Member Aug		N N	ghta	25%		Well	H.	15%		Weig	ht= 2	260		Weigh	t= 15	×	-	Veigh	= 10		2	/eight	= 5%		Score	Kanking
III 12 13 14 15 15 15 15 15 15 15		Rew 3	itee 614 Core (1	. 10j	¥ 3	Corband Paw X	tec Me	-		Cornent Name Sci	tee Mon	-		Dominate Raw Sco	re Morni	-	_	particle rer Scor	Memb e (1 - 10	-		W Score	Membe (1 - 10)	-	(1 - 10)	
And Michigations 8 9 7 10 933 7 10 65 733 7 8 7 8 7 8 7 8 7 10 933 7 10 65 7 13 7 8 9 10 933 6 7 13 7 8 9 10 933 6 9 13 6 7 13 7 8 9 10 933 8 9		=	~	=		ä	~	7		8	2	1	_	-	\vdash		_	-	\vdash	_	ш	Н	Н			
Associated B S S S S S S S S S S S S S S S S S S	Nation & topsider	•	-	~	2 00	•	-	-	497	01		-	9 33	-	-	-	_	-	-	_	-		-	8.67	7.76	10
Absolution B	Bergmain Architects Engineers Planners	•	9.5	5.5	8	**	2	25	8	o.		-	6.6	00	-	-	-	-			-			933	8 32	2
6 8 7 7 9 7 9 7 7 9 7 7 9 7 7 9 7 7 9 7 7 9 7 7 9 7 7 9 7 7 9 7 7 9 7 7 9 7 7 8 7 8 7 8 7 8 7 8 7 8 9	CHA	-	07	^	6.00	6	•	\$	216	60		-	3	5	-	-	-	-	-		_	-	-		8 29	4
8 8 8 7 7 8 8 9 9 9 9 8 8 8 67 9 9 9 10 943 7 8 9 6 6 7 7 8 9 9 9 9 9 9 9 9 9 9 9 9 9 9 9 9 9	Difficulta Associates	-	-	2	20	•	2	2	8.33	00	0.	-	911	_	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-		_	8.32	1
8 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 8 7 8 9 8 9 5 7 1 8 5 6 8 9	Endman Anthony	-	2	2.5	00 %	9		-	\$ 67	•	•	-	n a	~	-	-	_		_		_		_	9 00	08.1	ж
6 8 7 6 9 10 931 6 8 55 840 8 10 931 8 10 75 840 8 10 931 8 10 932 8 10 933 933 933 933 933 933 933 934 8 10 934 8 10 934 8 10 934 933 933 933 933 933 934 <td>Foher Associates</td> <td>•</td> <td>~</td> <td>-</td> <td>267</td> <td>•</td> <td>~</td> <td>2.5</td> <td>9.</td> <td>25</td> <td>80</td> <td>_</td> <td>8</td> <td></td> <td>-</td> <td>-</td> <td>2</td> <td>_</td> <td>_</td> <td>_</td> <td>_</td> <td>-</td> <td></td> <td>90 6</td> <td>7.83</td> <td>6</td>	Foher Associates	•	~	-	267	•	~	2.5	9.	25	80	_	8		-	-	2	_	_	_	_	-		90 6	7.83	6
6 8 6 8 6.5 7 8 50 8 55 7.17 8 10 9.31 6 9.33 6 9.33 6 9.33 6 9.33 9 9 10 9.31 6 8 5.5 6.50 8 9 7 9	Greenman Federam.	•	•	9	7.87	60	9	-	29.8	60	a	-	933	un .	-	_	-	-				-	-	3	816	ø
1 95 6.5 767 9 95 83 900 9 10 931 6 9 5.5 650 6 9 7.5 817 9 10 9 9 9 9 10 931 5 8 2 500 7 9 65 7 9 65 7 9 65 7 9 8 7 9 10 9 <t< td=""><td>Labella Associates</td><td>•</td><td>-</td><td>·</td><td>88</td><td>-</td><td>2</td><td>2</td><td>£33</td><td>94</td><td></td><td>-</td><td>2 6</td><td>10</td><td>-</td><td>-</td><td>_</td><td>_</td><td></td><td>-</td><td>-</td><td></td><td>-</td><td></td><td>791</td><td>80</td></t<>	Labella Associates	•	-	·	88	-	2	2	£33	94		-	2 6	10	-	-	_	_		-	-		-		791	80
8 9 65 783 9 85 8 850 9 9 10 931 5 8 2 500 7 9 65 750 3 10 9 933	Mett MecDonald	^	2	3	767	•	ê	5	8	•	0.	2	15.0		-	-	93		-			-		\$33	\$29	4
	Peph Design Group	-	٠	53	7.83	9	28	-	0, 8	6	61	22	16.6	-	H	-	-			-		-	-	9 33	7.92	7

It is my opinion in recommending DiDonato Associates the Erie County Department of Public Works has compiled with all applicable provisions of Section 19.08 of the Erie County Administrative Code. Scoring sheets and other materials related to this matter are available for review at the Department of Public Works' office during regular budgess hours.

William E. Geary, Jr., Commissioner Erie County Department of Public Works

Usa M. Chimera Deputy County Executive



ERIE COUNTY DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC WORKS - HIGHWAYS RFP # PIN 5765.37 - Meahl Rd Bridge (BIN 3326530) PROPOSAL REVIEW COMMITTEE RATINGS - SUMMARY

	L										Eval	Evaluation Criteria	Criter	ia										1	
Propose	Understanding to be Do	rstand to be	standing of	of Work	" ð «	Aperik Allfica	Experience & Qualifications of Proposed Staff	. 5 ±	Firm.	inperience of	Experience of Firm/Team with Fed Aid Projects	3	20 %	Present Workload & Financial Responsibility	rkloac cial ibifity		a milia	Logistics and Barity with Pr Area	Logistics and Familiarity with Project Area	ject	25 25	Percentage of BE Participati	Percentage of DBE Partidpation	Weighted Average Qualifications	Qualifications
	Wei	Weight = 25%	25%	T	Wei	Weight = 25%	25%		Weig	Weight a 20%	*6	T	Weig	Weight = 15%	5.X		Weig	Weight = 10%	*	Н	Weigh	Weight = 5%		Score	Kanking
	Comens Raw S	Committee Member Nam Score (1 - 10)	. 10l	7	Commit	Ornendice Member New Score (1 - M)	* 5	7	Commettee Member Nam Scare (1 - 10)	ommettee Membe Rom Score (1 - 10)		¥ 3	Company Plant Sc	Conventite Member Raw Score (1 - 10)		9 3	Personali Law Sco	Consumitee Ahersber Raw Score (1 - 10)		Ang	Saw Soc	Committee Member Raw Score (1 - 10)	CO. Ave.	(1-10)	
	=	8		X	E	211	=	1	=	3	2		=	2	0	_	141	2	=	_	- C-	7	2		
larton & Loguidice	-	-	59	185	-	^	-	7.67	-	•	•	8	-	2	6.5	7.83	^	-	و ا	200	91	o,	7 8.67	7,94	10
*			2	2.83	6	gn.	5.6	9.17	0	0.	9	77	-	2	-	533		2		199	•	01	9.5 9.50	8.26	4
Diconeto Associates	•	-	-	8	•	2	2	2	•	-	9	3	-	10	3.5	3		0	an an	00.6		9	93 8 20	0 6.15	S
Erdman Anthony	-	3	6.5	, 63	•	۰	-	198	•		2	3.5	~	-	~	299				199		o o	906	827	m
Falter Associates	•	2	53	7.67	-	10	7.5	7.83		•	2	2	•		-0	7.33	h	8.5	•	1.17		10	8 900	10.01	66
Greenman-Pederson, inc.	•	•	5.5	3	-	6	gs.	2	•	9	33	9.33	^		4.5	583	10	3	-	613	94	10	7 867	608 7	7
LeBetta Associates	•	*	4.5	613	-	5	25	\$133	•	•	9	9.33		9	5 9	11.0	40	•	53	418	-	2	10 9.55	900	6
Mort Macdoneld	•	\$6	•	7.83	۰	9.6	÷	84	•	•	9	9.33		-	5.5	05.9		•	-	613	0	9	9 9.	9.33 8.35	2
Popil Design Group	-	26	-	3	6	~	•	2	٠	۰	2	10.6	~	-	~	2 00	-	۰	5.9	33	φ.	2		9.33 8.CB	9
Urban Engineers	·	-	\$\$	22.5	40	5 8	9.5	15.0	^	•	90	4.67	gn	Q.	'n	8	9		\$ \$	783	0	o.	6 5 1	917 780	11
Watta Architects & Engineers	•	8.5	5.5	7.33	•	•	•	00 6	-	٠	ę.	EE 6	-	•	2.5	21	-	-	9.6	9		2	6	900 848	1

It is my ophion in recommending Watts Architects & Engineers the Erie County Department of Public Works has compleed with all applicable provisions of Section 19 08 of the Erie County Administrative Code. Scoring sheets and other materials related to this matter are available for review at the Department of Public Works' office during regular business hours.

Ene County Department Subusic Works

Lifa M. Chimera Deputy County Executive