



COUNTY OF ERIE

MARK C. POLONCARZ

COUNTY EXECUTIVE

May 2, 2025

Erie County Legislature
92 Franklin Street, 4th Floor
Buffalo, New York 14202

RE: Bridge NY Project Agreements with NYSDOT and Contracts for Engineering Design Services For 7 Bridge Replacement Projects

Dear Honorable Members:

We are forwarding for your approval a proposed resolution authorizing the County of Erie to participate in the Bridge NY program. The County Executive needs to execute seven Agreements with the New York State Department of Transportation to pay the Federal and non-Federal share of the cost of design phases I-VI and right of way incidentals for these projects.

In addition, the Department of Public Works requests permission to award a contract for each of these seven projects to the design engineering firm selected via request for proposals for each project.

Should your Honorable Body require further information, I encourage you to contact the Department of Public Works, Office of the Commissioner. Thank you for your consideration on this matter.

Sincerely yours,

A handwritten signature in blue ink, reading "Mark C. Poloncarz".

Mark C. Poloncarz, Esq.
Erie County Executive

MCP: jtd

MEMORANDUM

To: Honorable Members of the Erie County Legislature
From: Department of Public Works
Re: Bridge NY Project Agreements with NYSDOT and Contracts for Engineering Design Services For 7 Bridge Replacement Projects
Date: May 2, 2025

SUMMARY

The County of Erie has received awards for seven bridge replacement projects as a part of the Bridge NY Program. Adoption of this resolution authorizes the County Executive to enter into an Agreement with the New York State Dept. of Transportation (NYSDOT) for the Design Phases I through VI and right of way incidentals for each of these projects. The Department of Public Works also requests contracts be awarded to the design engineering consultant selected for each of these projects. The seven projects and engineering firms are listed below and each was competitively selected following the Federal Aid process:

Project	Engineering Firm	Town
PIN 5765.31 - Glenwood E. Concord Road over Graff Brook	Mott MacDonald	Concord
PIN 5765.32 - Glenwood E. Concord Road over Sprague Brook	Mott MacDonald	Concord
PIN 5765.33 - Versailles Plank Road over Big Sister Creek	Popli Design Group	Evans
PIN 5765.34 - Concord Road over Spooner Creek	Greenman Pedersen, Inc.	Concord
PIN 5765.35 - Bagdad Road over Clear Creek	CHA Solutions	Collins
PIN 5765.36 - Ketchum Road over North Branch Clear Creek	DiDonato Associates	North Collins
PIN 5765.37 - Meahl Road over Branch Murder Creek	Watts Architects & Engineers	Newstead

FISCAL IMPLICATIONS

The state local agreement for the Engineering and Right-of-Way Incidentals for each of these projects funds the projects with a 95% Federal share and a 5% local share, Erie County funds. The funding for each of these projects is as follows:

Project Number	Federal Share	County Share	WBS Element
PIN 5765.31	\$444,600	\$23,400	B.25006
PIN 5765.32	\$484,500	\$25,500	B.25006
PIN 5765.33	\$475,000	\$25,000	B.25006
PIN 5765.34	\$394,250	\$20,750	B.25006
PIN 5765.35	\$484,500	\$25,500	B.25006
PIN 5765.36	\$566,200	\$29,800	B.25006
PIN 5765.37	\$498,750	\$26,250	B.25006
Total	\$3,347,800	\$176,200	B.25006

The contracts awarded to the consulting engineers will not exceed the funding provided by each agreement with NYSDOT.

REASONS FOR RECOMMENDATION

The Erie County Department of Public Works wants to initiate the design phase of these Bridge NY Projects by entering into the Agreements for Design Phases I - VI and right of way incidentals with the New York State Department of Transportation. In addition, the division requests the awarding of contracts to the selected engineering consultants, thus beginning design of the projects promptly and adhering to the time restrictions of the Bridge NY program. These Projects benefit from Federal Aid reimbursement through the Bridge NY program at a rate of 95 percent.

BACKGROUND INFORMATION

These projects were approved by the New York State Department of Transportation in their current Capital Program to be funded with Federal Aid funds. There is a time restriction on the award of these federal monies in which Erie County must complete these designs, including any right of way acquisitions within 24 months of award hence the desire to immediately award design contracts to engineering firms.

CONSEQUENCES OF NEGATIVE ACTION

If these Agreements are not approved, the bridges will continue to deteriorate and pose problems for the traveling public. Failure to execute these Agreements will jeopardize receipt of the Project awards and possibly the loss of eligibility for future Bridge NY Program participation.

STEPS FOLLOWING APPROVAL

County Executive will sign the agreements with NYSDOT. Contracts with engineering firms will be executed. The funding for the first 100% instance of these contracts will be allocated by the budget department.

COMPTROLLER'S OFFICE REVIEW

The proposed legislation has been reviewed by the Office of the Comptroller and is related to an authorized capital project for which there are sufficient appropriations for the action proposed.

This is a cash advance against the 2.25 Bond Sale.

Tim CCA 4/5/25

Timothy C. Callan
Deputy Comptroller
Comptroller's Office

B.25006 - Fed Aid Bridge Replacement – BridgeNY - Design

A RESOLUTION SUBMITTED BY: DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC WORKS

RE: Bridge NY Project Agreements with NYSDOT and Contracts for Engineering Design Services For 7 Bridge Replacement Projects

WHEREAS, the County of Erie has received the award of seven bridge replacement projects through the Bridge NY Program; and

WHEREAS these projects are as follows; PIN 5765.31 - Glenwood E. Concord Road over Graff Brook in the Town of Concord, PIN 5765.32 – Glenwood E. Concord Road over Sprague Brook in the Town of Concord, PIN 5765.33 – Versailles Plank Road over Big Sister Creek in the Town of Evans, PIN 5765.34 – Concord Road over Spooner Creek in the Town of Concord, PIN 5765.35 – Bagdad Road over Clear Creek in the Town of Collins, PIN 5765.36 – Ketchum Road over North Branch Clear Creek in the Town of North Collins, and PIN 5765.37 – Meahl Road over Branch Murder Creek in the Town of Newstead; and

WHEREAS, these projects are eligible for funding under Title 23, U.S. Code, as amended, 23CFR as amended PUB.L. 117-58 also known as the “Bipartisan Infrastructure Law” (BIL) that calls for the apportionment of the costs such program to be borne at the ratio of 95% Federal funds and 5% non-federal funds; and

WHEREAS, agreements need to be executed with New York Dept. of Transportation for these projects enabling the disbursement of the funding from Bridge NY; and

WHEREAS, the County of Erie desires to advance the Projects by making a commitment to 100% of the costs of the projects for Design Engineering (Scoping & Design I-VI) and Right of Way Incidentals phases for all seven of the Projects; and

WHEREAS, in advancing these projects the Department of Public Works desires to award design contracts to each of the engineering consultants selected for the projects through the Federal Aid request for proposal process; and

WHEREAS, the funding for these projects is available in BA 123, Fund 420, SAP project B.25006, Federal Aid Bridge Replacement - BridgeNY - Design, the cost of these projects being bore by the County are \$3,347,800 in a Federal Aid reimbursable share and \$176,200 in non-federal share for a total of \$3,524,000 for these projects.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT

RESOLVED, that the Erie County Legislature hereby approves projects PIN 5765.31 - Glenwood E. Concord Road over Graff Brook in the Town of Concord, PIN 5765.32 – Glenwood E. Concord Road over Sprague Brook in the Town of Concord, PIN 5765.33 – Versailles Plank Road over Big Sister Creek in the Town of Evans, PIN 5765.34 – Concord Road over Spooner Creek in the Town of Concord, PIN 5765.35 – Bagdad Road over Clear Creek in the Town of Collins, PIN 5765.36 – Ketchum Road over North Branch Clear Creek in the Town of North Collins, and PIN 5765.37 – Meahl Road over Branch Murder Creek in the Town of Newstead awarded to the County of Erie through the Bridge NY Program; and be it further

RESOLVED, that authorization is hereby given to County Executive to enter into and execute the state and local agreements with the New York State Department of Transportation for these projects; and be it further

RESOLVED, that the County Legislature of the County of Erie hereby authorizes the County of Erie to pay in the first instance 100% of the Federal and non-Federal shares of the cost of the design engineering (Design I-VI) and right-of-way incidentals, phases of all seven projects; and be it further

RESOLVED, that authorization is hereby given to the County Executive to execute agreements with the following engineering firms selected using the Federal Aid RFP process for the projects as listed:

Project	Engineering Firm	Contract (not to exceed)
PIN 5765.31	Mott MacDonald	\$468,000
PIN 5765.32	Mott MacDonald	\$510,000
PIN 5765.33	Popli Design Group	\$500,000
PIN 5765.34	Greenman Pedersen, Inc.	\$415,000
PIN 5765.35	CHA Solutions	\$510,000
PIN 5765.36	DiDonato Associates	\$596,000
PIN 5765.37	Watts Architects & Engineers	\$525,000

and be it further

RESOLVED, that funding for these projects is available in BA 123, Fund 420, SAP project B.25006, Federal Aid Bridge Replacement - BridgeNY - Design, the cost of these projects being bore by the County are \$3,347,800 in a Federal Aid reimbursable share and \$176,200 in non-federal share for a total of \$3,524,000 for these projects.

RESOLVED, that the Director of Budget and Management is hereby authorized to adjust the Project budget for all increases or reductions in Federal and/or Non-Federal revenue that are made available for this Project; and be it further

RESOLVED, that in the event the amount required to pay in the first instance 100% of the Federal and non-Federal shares of the costs of the projects in the agreement, the County of Erie shall convene its Legislature as soon as possible to appropriate said excess amount immediately upon the notification by the New York State Department of Transportation thereof; and be it further

RESOLVED, that authorization is hereby given to the County Executive to enter into and execute all necessary Agreements, certifications or reimbursement requests for Federal Aid and/or non-federal Aid on behalf of the County of Erie, with the New York State Department of Transportation in connection with the advancement or approval of the Project identified in the State/Local Agreements; and providing for the administration of the Project and the Municipality's first instance funding of Project costs and permanent funding of the local share of Federal Aid- and State Aid-eligible Project costs and all Project costs within appropriations therefore that are not so eligible; and be it further

RESOLVED, that the County of Erie hereby agrees that construction of the Project shall begin no later than twenty-four (24) months after award and the construction phase of the Project shall be completed within thirty (30) months; and be it further

RESOLVED, that authorization is hereby given for the Division of Budget and Management to make any technical adjustments necessary to effectuate this resolution; and be it further

RESOLVED, that a certified copy of this resolution be filed with the New York State Commissioner of Transportation, by attaching it to any necessary Agreement in connection with the Project; and be it further

RESOLVED, that the Clerk of the Legislature forward ten (10) certified copies of this Resolution to the Department of Public Works, Office of the Commissioner, to be forwarded to the New York State Department of Transportation; and one (1) copy each to the County Executive's Office, Comptroller's Office, Division of Budget and Management.

TO: TIMOTHY C. CALLAN, COMPTROLLER'S OFFICE
RE: PROPOSED RESOLUTIONS REQUIRING RULE 55
CONTRACT APPROVAL CHECKLIST

CONFIRMATION OF AVAILABILITY OF FUNDS IN CAPITAL PROJECTS

REQUESTING DEPARTMENT

COMPLETE ITEMS 1 THROUGH 5

- | | | |
|-------|--------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 1. | CONTRACTOR'S NAME | New York State Department of Transportation
Mott MacDonald (2 contracts)
Popli Design Group
Greenman Pedersen, Inc.
CHA Solutions
DiDonato Associates
Watts Architects & Engineers |
| <hr/> | | |
| 2. | AMOUNT OF CONTRACT | \$978,000 - Mott MacDonald (2 contracts)
\$500,000 - Popli Design Group
\$415,000 - Greenman Pedersen, Inc.
\$510,000 - CHA Solutions
\$596,000 - DiDonato Associates
\$525,000 - Watts Architects & Engineers
Total \$3,524,000 |
| <hr/> | | |
| 3. | PROJECT NUMBER | B.25006 |
| <hr/> | | |
| 4. | PROJECT TITLE | PIN 5765.31 – Glenwood E. Concord over Graff
PIN 5765.32 – Glenwood E. Concord over Sprague Brook
PIN 5765.33 – Versailles Plank Rd over Big Sister Creek
PIN 5765.34 – Concord Rd over Spooner Creek
PIN 5765.35 – Bagdad Road over Clear Creek
PIN 5765.36 – Ketchum Road over N. Br. Clear Creek
PIN 5765.37 – Meahl Rd over Trib. Cayuga Crk |
| <hr/> | | |
| 5. | DEPARTMENT CONTACT | Funding questions: William E. Geary, Jr. at 8301
Letter pickup: Christy Weber at 8301 |
| <hr/> | | |

COMPTROLLER'S OFFICE

COMPLETE ITEMS 6 AND 7

6. AVAILABILITY OF FUNDS

\$ 5,000,000.00

7. PERFORMED BY



Date Sent to Comptroller's Office:

4/18/25

[55 compt_10]



ERIE COUNTY DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC WORKS - HIGHWAYS
RFP # PIN 5765.31 & 5765.32 - Glenwood East Concord Rd Bridges
PROPOSAL REVIEW COMMITTEE RATINGS - SUMMARY

Proposer	Evaluation Criteria																		Weighted Average Qualifications Score (1 - 10)	Qualifications Ranking						
	Understanding of Work to be Done			Experience & Qualifications of Proposed Staff			Experience of Firm/Team with Fed Aid Projects			Present Workload & Financial Responsibility			Logistics and Familiarity with Project Area			Percentage of DBE Participation										
	Weight = 25%			Weight = 25%			Weight = 20%			Weight = 15%			Weight = 10%			Weight = 5%										
	Committee Member Raw Score (1 - 10)			Committee Member Raw Score (1 - 10)			Committee Member Raw Score (1 - 10)			Committee Member Raw Score (1 - 10)			Committee Member Raw Score (1 - 10)			Committee Member Raw Score (1 - 10)										
	#1	#2	#3	Avg. Score	#1	#2	#3	Avg. Score	#1	#2	#3	Avg. Score	#1	#2	#3	Avg. Score	#1	#2			#3	Avg. Score				
Bergmann Architects	7	7	8	7.33	9	7.5	8	8.17	9	10	9	9.33	8	5.5	9	7.50	9	8.5	9	8.83	9	9	9	9.00	8.20	5
McDonald Associates	8	8	8.5	8.17	9	9.5	9	9.17	9	10	9	9.33	4	3	7	4.67	9	9	9	9.00	9	9.5	9	9.17	8.26	4
CMA Consulting, Inc.	8	8	8	8.00	9	8.5	9	8.83	9	10	9	9.33	5	5	7	5.67	9	9	9	9.00	9	9.5	9	9.17	8.28	3
Urdeman Anthony	9	7.5	8.00	8.00	9	8	8	8.33	9	10	8.5	9.17	9	5	9	7.67	9	7.5	7	7.83	9	9	9	9.00	8.30	2
Finher Associates	9	8	7	8.00	8	7.5	7	7.50	9	10	8	9.00	8	5	9	7.33	7	4	5	5.33	9	9	9	9.00	7.76	9
Greenman Pederson, Inc.	8	7.5	7.5	7.67	9	9	9	9.00	9	10	9	9.33	6	3	7	5.33	9	7.5	9	8.50	9	8	8.5	8.50	8.11	6
LaBella	6	6	7	6.33	9	8.5	8	8.50	9	10	9	9.33	9	6.5	9	8.17	8	5.5	7	6.83	8	10	9	9.00	7.93	8
Mott MacDonald	8	7.5	8	7.83	9	8	9	8.67	9	10	9	9.33	8	5.5	9	7.50	9	7	9	8.33	9	9	9	9.00	8.40	1
Popple Design Group	7	8	7.5	7.50	9	8	8	8.33	9	10	9	9.33	8	4.5	9	7.27	7	6	7	6.67	9	9	10	9.33	8.03	7

It is my opinion in recommending Mott MacDonald the Erie County Department of Public Works has complied with all applicable provisions of Section 19.08 of the Erie County Administrative Code. Scoring sheets and other materials related to this matter are available for review at the Department of Public Works office during regular business hours.

William E. Leahy, Jr., Commissioner
 Erie County Department of Public Works

Lida M. Chimera
 Deputy County Executive



ERIE COUNTY DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC WORKS - HIGHWAYS
RFP # PIN 5765.33 - Versailles Plank Rd Bridge (BIN 3327390)
PROPOSAL REVIEW COMMITTEE RATINGS - SUMMARY

Proposer	Evaluation Criteria																		Weighted Average Qualifications Score (1 - 10)	Qualifications Ranking						
	Understanding of Work to be Done		Experience & Qualifications of Proposed Staff			Experience of Firm/Team with Fed Aid Projects			Present Workload & Financial Responsibility			Logistics and Familiarity with Project Area					Percentage of DBE Participation									
	Weight = 25%			Weight = 25%			Weight = 20%			Weight = 15%			Weight = 10%					Weight = 5%								
	Committee Member Raw Score (1 - 10)	Avg. Score		Committee Member Raw Score (1 - 10)	Avg. Score		Committee Member Raw Score (1 - 10)	Avg. Score		Committee Member Raw Score (1 - 10)	Avg. Score		Committee Member Raw Score (1 - 10)	Avg. Score		Committee Member Raw Score (1 - 10)	Avg. Score									
#1	#2	#3	#1	#2	#3	#1	#2	#3	#1	#2	#3	#1	#2	#3	#1	#2	#3									
Barton & Logsdice	8	8	7	7.67	8	9	5	7.33	9	8	9	8.67	7	7	9	7.67	7	8	5	6.67	9	10	9	9.33	7.77	8
Burman Architects Engineers Planners	9	10	9	9.33	8	9	7	8.00	9	9	9	9.00	8	8	8	8.00	9	8	7	8.00	9	10	9	9.33	8.60	1
CCA	8	10	8.5	8.83	9	9	9	9.00	9	9	9	9.00	6	7	7	6.67	8	9	9	8.67	9	10	9	9.33	8.59	3
Donato Associates	8	10	8	8.67	8	8	9	8.33	9	9	9	9.00	7	6	8	7.00	9	9	7	8.33	9	10	9	9.33	8.40	5
Fridman Anthony	8	9	7	8.00	9	8	9	8.67	9	9	9	9.00	8	9	9	8.33	9	8	7	8.00	8	9	8.5	8.50	8.44	4
Heiser Associates	9	8	7.5	8.50	8	8	5	7.00	9	8	9	8.67	8	9	8	8.33	7	9	4	6.67	9	10	9	9.33	7.99	7
Labella Associates	8	8	7.5	7.83	8	7	8	7.67	9	8	9	8.67	8	8	9	8.33	8	8	6	7.33	8	10	9	9.00	8.04	6
Popl Design Group	9	10	8.5	9.17	9	9	8	8.67	9	9	9	9.00	7	8	8	7.67	7	9	7	7.67	9	8	8.5	8.50	8.60	1

It is my opinion in recommending Popl Design Group the Erie County Department of Public Works has complied with all applicable provisions of Section 19.08 of the Erie County Administrative Code Scoring sheets and other materials related to this matter are available for review at the Department of Public Works' office during regular business hours

William E. Geary, Jr., Commissioner
 Erie County Department of Public Works

Lisa M. Chmura
 Deputy County Executive



ERIE COUNTY DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC WORKS - HIGHWAYS
RFP # PIN 5765.34 - Concord Rd Bridge (BIN 3367370)
PROPOSAL REVIEW COMMITTEE RATINGS - SUMMARY

Proposer	Evaluation Criteria																		Weighted Average Qualifications Score (1 - 10)	Qualifications Ranking						
	Understanding of Work to be Done		Experience & Qualifications of Proposed Staff			Experience of Firm/Team with Fed Aid Projects			Present Workload & Financial Responsibility			Logistics and Familiarity with Project Area			Percentage of DBE Participation											
	Weight = 25%			Weight = 25%			Weight = 20%			Weight = 15%			Weight = 10%			Weight = 5%										
	Committee Member Raw Score (1 - 10)		Avg. Score	Committee Member Raw Score (1 - 10)		Avg. Score	Committee Member Raw Score (1 - 10)		Avg. Score	Committee Member Raw Score (1 - 10)		Avg. Score	Committee Member Raw Score (1 - 10)		Avg. Score	Committee Member Raw Score (1 - 10)		Avg. Score								
	#1	#2	#3	#1	#2	#3	#1	#2	#3	#1	#2	#3	#1	#2	#3	#1	#2	#3								
Barton & Logsdon	9	8	8.33	8	9	5	7.33	9	8	9	8.67	7	7	9	7.67	7	8	5	6.67	9	10	9	9.33	7.93	6	
CHA	8	10	7.5	8.50	9	9	9.00	9	9	9	9.00	5	6	7	6.00	8	9	9	8.67	9	10	9	9.33	8.41	2	
D'Onofrio Associates	9	9	8	8.67	8	8	8.33	9	9	9	9.00	7	6	8	7.00	9	9	7	8.33	9	10	9	9.33	8.40	3	
Friedman Anthony	8	8.5	6	7.50	9	8	9	8.67	9	9	9.00	8	8	9	8.33	9	8	7	8.00	8	9	8.5	8.50	8.32	4	
Fisher Associates	7	10	7	8.00	8	8	5	7.00	9	8	9	8.67	8	8	8	8.00	7	9	4	6.67	9	10	9	9.33	7.82	9
Greenman Pedersen, Inc.	9	9	7	8.33	8	9	9	8.67	9	8	9	8.67	7	8	8	7.67	8	9	8	8.33	9	10	9	9.33	8.43	1
Lundella Associates	6	9	6	7.00	8	7	8	7.67	9	8	9	8.67	8	8	9	8.33	8	8	6	7.33	8	10	9	9.00	7.83	8
Poppe Design Group	9	9	7	8.33	8	7.5	8	7.83	9	8	9	8.67	5	7	7	6.33	7	8	6	7.00	9	10	8.5	9.17	7.88	7
North Architects & Engineers	8	9	7	8.00	8	8	7	7.67	9	9	9	8	8	8	8	8.00	8	9	9	8.67	8	9	10	9.00	8.17	5

It is my opinion in recommending Greenman-Pedersen, Inc. the Erie County Department of Public Works has complied with all applicable provisions of Section 19.08 of the Erie County Administrative Code. Scoring sheets and other materials related to this matter are available for review at the Department of Public Works' office during regular business hours.

William E. Geary, Jr., Comptroller
 Erie County Department of Public Works

Lisa M. Chimera
 Deputy County Executive



ERIE COUNTY DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC WORKS - HIGHWAYS
RFP # PIN 5765.35 - Bagdad Rd Bridge (BIN 3328620)
PROPOSAL REVIEW COMMITTEE RATINGS - SUMMARY

Proposer	Evaluation Criteria																		Weighted Average Qualifications Score (1 - 10)	Qualifications Ranking						
	Understanding of Work to be Done			Experience & Qualifications of Proposed Staff			Experience of Firm/Team with Fed Aid Projects			Present Workload & Financial Responsibility			Logistics and Familiarity with Project Area			Percentage of DBE Participation										
	Weight = 25%			Weight = 25%			Weight = 20%			Weight = 15%			Weight = 10%			Weight = 5%										
	Committee Member Raw Score (1 - 10)		Avg Score	Committee Member Raw Score (1 - 10)		Avg Score	Committee Member Raw Score (1 - 10)		Avg Score	Committee Member Raw Score (1 - 10)		Avg Score	Committee Member Raw Score (1 - 10)		Avg Score	Committee Member Raw Score (1 - 10)		Avg Score								
	#1	#2	#3	#1	#2	#3	#1	#2	#3	#1	#2	#3	#1	#2	#3	#1	#2	#3								
Barton & Loguidice	9	7	7	7.67	8	8	5	7.00	9	9	8.67	7	7	9	7.67	7	8	5	6.67	9	10	9	9.33	7.68	7	
CMA	9	9	8.5	8.83	9	9	9	9.00	9	9	9.00	6	7	8	7.00	8	9	9	8.67	9	10	9	9.33	8.64	1	
DiDonato Associates	9	8.5	8	8.50	8	7	9	8.00	9	9	9.00	7	8	8	7.67	9	9	7	8.33	9	10	9	9.33	8.38	2	
Edman Anthony	8	7.5	7	7.50	9	8	9	8.67	9	9	9.00	8	8	9	8.33	9	8	7	8.00	8	9	8.5	8.50	8.32	3	
Fisher Associates	8	7.5	7.5	7.67	8	8	5	7.00	9	8	9	8.67	8	8	8	8.00	7	9	4	6.67	9	10	9	9.33	7.73	6
Greenman-Pedersen, Inc.	8	9	7	8.00	8	9	9	8.67	9	8	9	8.67	7	8	8	7.67	8	9	7	8.00	9	10	8.5	9.17	8.31	4
Labella Associates	6	7	6	6.33	8	7	8	7.67	9	8	9	8.67	8	8	9	8.33	8	8	6	7.33	8	10	9	9.00	7.67	8
Popal Design Group	9	7	7.5	7.83	9	8.5	8	8.50	9	8	9	8.67	7	8	8	7.67	7	8	6	7.00	9	10	8.5	9.17	8.13	5

It is my opinion in recommending CHA the Erie County Department of Public Works has complied with all applicable provisions of Section 19.08 of the Erie County Administrative Code. Scoring sheets and other materials related to this matter are available for review at the Department of Public Works' office during regular business hours.

William E. Gearty, Jr., Commissioner
 Erie County Department of Public Works

Lisa M. Chumera
 Deputy County Executive



It is my opinion in recommending DiDonato Associates the Erie County Department of Public Works has complied with all applicable provisions of Section 19.08 of the Erie County Administrative Code. Scoring sheets and other materials related to this matter are available for review at the Department of Public Works' office during regular business hours


William E. Geary, Jr., Commissioner
Erie County Department of Public Works



ERIE COUNTY DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC WORKS - HIGHWAYS
RFP # PIN 5765.37 - Meahl Rd Bridge (BIN 3326530)
PROPOSAL REVIEW COMMITTEE RATINGS - SUMMARY

Proposer	Evaluation Criteria																		Weighted Average Qualifications Score (1 - 10)	Qualifications Ranking						
	Understanding of Work to be Done		Experience & Qualifications of Proposed Staff				Experience of Firm/Team with Fed Aid Projects				Present Workload & Financial Responsibility				Logistics and Familiarity with Project Area						Percentage of DBE Participation					
			Weight = 25%				Weight = 20%				Weight = 15%				Weight = 10%						Weight = 5%					
	Committee Member Raw Score (1 - 10)		Avg. Score		Committee Member Raw Score (1 - 10)		Avg. Score		Committee Member Raw Score (1 - 10)		Avg. Score		Committee Member Raw Score (1 - 10)		Avg. Score		Committee Member Raw Score (1 - 10)				Avg. Score					
	#1	#2	#3	#1	#2	#3	#1	#2	#3	#1	#2	#3	#1	#2	#3	#1	#2	#3			#1	#2	#3			
Barton & Logsdon	9	8	6.5	7.83	8	7	8	7.67	9	9	9	9.00	7	10	6.5	7.83	7	8	6	7.00	9	10	7	8.67	7.98	10
CNA	8	9	8.5	7.83	9	9	9.5	9.17	9	9	10	9.33	5	8	5	5.33	8	10	8	8.67	9	10	9.5	9.50	8.26	4
Diamond Associates	8	8	8	8.00	8	6.5	8.5	8.33	9	9	10	9.33	5	8	3.5	5.50	9	9	9	9.00	9	10	9.5	9.50	8.15	5
Urban Anthony	8	8.5	6.5	7.67	9	9	8	8.67	9	9	10	9.33	7	8	5	6.67	9	8	9	8.67	8	10	9	9.00	8.27	3
Fisher Associates	8	8.5	6.5	7.67	8	8	7.5	7.83	8	9	10	9.33	8	9	5	7.33	7	8.5	6	7.17	9	10	8	9.00	8.01	8
Greenman-Pedersen, INC.	8	9	5.5	7.50	8	9	9	8.67	9	9	10	9.33	5	8	4.5	5.83	8	8.5	8	8.17	9	10	7	8.67	8.03	7
Lalibela Associates	6	8	4.5	6.17	8	8.5	8.5	8.33	9	9	10	9.33	8	10	6.5	8.17	8	8	8.5	8.17	8	10	10	9.33	8.00	9
Mott MacDonald	8	9.5	6	7.83	9	9.5	8.5	9.00	9	9	10	9.33	6	8	5.5	6.50	8	9	8	8.33	9	10	9	9.33	8.35	2
Pogal Design Group	8	9.5	8	8.50	9	8.5	8	8.50	9	9	10	9.33	5	8	2	5.00	7	9	6.5	7.50	9	10	8	9.33	8.08	6
Urban Engineers	4	8	5.5	5.83	8	8.5	9.5	8.67	7	9	10	8.67	9	10	5	8.00	6	8	9.5	7.83	9	10	8.5	9.17	7.80	11
Watts Architects & Engineers	8	8.5	5.5	7.33	9	9	9	9.00	9	9	10	9.33	8	9	7.5	8.17	8	8	9.5	8.50	8	10	9	9.00	8.48	1

It is my opinion in recommending Watts Architects & Engineers the Erie County Department of Public Works has complied with all applicable provisions of Section 19.08 of the Erie County Administrative Code. Scoring sheets and other materials related to this matter are available for review at the Department of Public Works' office during regular business hours.

William E. Geary, Jr., Commissioner
Erie County Department of Public Works

Uja M. Crimera
Deputy County Executive