

**PLANNING AND DEVELOPMENT SERVICES REPORT**  
**DIRECT TO ORDINANCE ZONING MAP AMENDMENT**

**PUBLIC HEARING**

**PZ-19-00081**

**DATE:**

**May 7, 2019**

**MEETING DATE:**

**May 22, 2019**

**REPORT BY:**

**Elaine Averitt, AICP**

**\* All strikeout information is in regards to the previous application. All items in bold underline reflect the proposed changes.**

**REQUEST:**

Direct to Ordinance Zoning Map Amendment of approximately 14.51 acres located at 825 and 829 E. Butler Avenue from the Light Industrial (LI) and Heavy Industrial (HI) zones to 2.24 acres of Highway Commercial (HC) zone and 12.27 acres of High Density Residential (HR) zone.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION:**

Staff recommends the Planning and Zoning Commission, in accordance with the findings presented in this report, forward the Direct to Ordinance Zoning Map Amendment request to the City Council with a recommendation for approval subject to conditions of approval.

**PRESENT LAND USE:**

The subject property is comprised of two parcels of land adjacent to each other with a north-south property line bisecting the two parcels. Both parcels are currently owned by Wendt Business Park, LLC, and serve as space for a large warehouse, two secondary storage buildings, several material stock piles, and associated parking.

**PROPOSED LAND USE:**

A development consisting of a minimum of 19,000 square feet of commercial space in two buildings and ~~238-333~~ dwelling units with ~~854-764~~ bedrooms in two multi-family residential buildings **and six townhome-style apartment buildings.**

**NEIGHBORHOOD DEVELOPMENT:**

North: (Across Butler Ave.) Santa Fe Railway vacant industrial property, Greyhound Bus Station; Light Industrial (LI) Zone  
East: Rio de Flag Business Park; Light Industrial (LI-O) Zone  
South: Coconino County Juvenile Court, County Detention Facility, Open Space; Heavy Industrial (HI) and Public Facilities (PF) Zone  
West: Aspen Place at the Sawmill mixed use development; Highway Commercial (HC) and High Density Residential (HR) Zone

**REQUIRED FINDINGS**

**Staff Review**

An application for a Direct to Ordinance Zoning Map Amendment shall be submitted to the Planning Director and shall be reviewed and a recommendation prepared. The Planning Director's recommendation shall be transmitted to the Planning and Zoning Commission in the form of a staff report prior to a scheduled public hearing. The recommendation shall include: an evaluation of the consistency and conformance of the proposed amendment with the goals and policies of the General Plan and any applicable specific plans; the grounds for the recommendation based on the standards and purposes of the zones set forth in Section 10-40.20 (Establishment of Zones) of the Zoning Code (page 40.20-1); and, whether the amendment should be granted, granted with conditions to mitigate anticipated impacts caused by the proposed development, or denied.

## Findings for Reviewing Proposed Zoning Map Amendments

Direct to Ordinance Zoning Map Amendments shall be evaluated based on the following findings: the proposed amendment is consistent with and conforms to the goals and policies of the General Plan and any applicable specific plans; the proposed amendment will not be detrimental to the public interest, health, safety, convenience, or welfare of the City of Flagstaff (the "City"), and will add to the public good as described in the General Plan; and, the affected site is physically suitable in terms of design, location, shape, size, operating characteristics, and the provision of public and emergency vehicle access, public services, and utilities to ensure that the requested zone designation and the proposed or anticipated uses and/or development will not endanger, jeopardize, or otherwise constitute a hazard to the property or improvements in the vicinity in which the property is located. If the application is not consistent with the General Plan, and any other applicable specific plan, the applicable plan must be amended in compliance with the procedures established in Chapter 11-10 of the City Code (Title 11: General Plans and Subdivisions) prior to considering the proposed amendment.

## Introduction/Background

The subject site is located between the Rio de Flag Business Park to the east and Aspen Place at the Sawmill subdivision to the west. The existing Rio de Flag Business Park buildings were constructed in the late 1990s through the early 2000s. One of the first buildings to be constructed at Aspen Place at the Sawmill ("Aspen Place") was the Whole Foods building (originally New Frontiers) which was completed in 2007. The Aspen Place developer was required to realign Lone Tree Rd. and construct three new traffic signals at Franklin/Lone Tree, Butler/Lone Tree and Butler/Sawmill as part of the subdivision improvements.

The most recent use of the subject site was as an industrial rental property formerly known as Jeld-Wen of Arizona. According to the Historic Resource Study letter report conducted by Cornerstone Environmental in April 2018, the existing three buildings were constructed in the mid-1970s. The site has an approximate elevation of 6,860 feet and the local topography is generally flat with a gentle slope to the southeast toward Rio de Flag. There are Ponderosa pines in the northeast and southeast corners of the east parcel.

## Site Plan Approval

On September 21, 2018, the Inter-Department Staff (IDS) approved a site plan, a copy of which is attached to this report, for the proposed development subject to successfully obtaining a Direct to Ordinance Zoning Map Amendment (rezoning). Should the rezoning be denied, the site plan as submitted will no longer be approved. **For purposes of the resubmitted Zoning Map Amendment application, the Inter-Department Staff reviewed a revised Site Plan on May 9, 2019, and conditionally accepted the application as complete. An official Site Plan modification application will need to be reviewed and approved following approval of this request.**

## Proposed Rezoning and Development Plan

The applicant, McGrath Real Estate Partners, is requesting rezoning approval to permit a development consisting of a minimum of 19,000 square feet of commercial space in conjunction with a **238 333**-unit with **854 764**-bedrooms multi-family project. Following rezoning approval, the two existing parcels will be combined into one and split according to the approved Site Plan with an east-west property line bisecting the two parcels. The proposed north parcel located at the southeast corner of Butler Ave. and Sawmill Rd. will be 2.24 acres and will be zoned Highway Commercial (HC). The proposed south parcel will be 12.27 acres and will be zoned High Density Residential (HR).

The commercial parcel will consist of retail, service and/or office uses. Site access will be from a **right-in/right-out only** driveway on Butler Ave. and a driveway on Sawmill Rd. The commercial portion of this rezoning is conceptual in nature but must meet several requirements as outlined in the Development Agreement in order to comply with the Urban Activity Center as defined in

the Regional Plan. This includes a minimum of 19,000 square feet of commercial space and a minimum building height of 32 feet, in order to have the appearance of a two-story building. If there are drive-through related uses, the Development Agreement limits the number and placement of any drive-through lanes. The commercial buildings are currently proposed as single story. The current concept plan for this parcel includes two buildings which total 22,300 square feet and cover approximately 23 percent of the parcel (0.23 FAR). The Highway Commercial zone allows a Floor Area Ratio (FAR) of 3.0. Development on the commercial parcel will be required to complete Site Plan review and approval prior to submitting for civil plan or building plan review. The Site Plan review will ensure that all architectural standards, pedestrian connectivity, civic space, landscaping, outdoor lighting and other components are in compliance with the Flagstaff Zoning Code. It is anticipated that the commercial parcel pads will develop after the residential parcel. However, all infrastructure will be completed by McGrath Real Estate Partners with the residential parcel.

The two five-story multi-family buildings will include ~~238-333~~ units, ranging from efficiency and studio to four-bedroom units. The efficiency unit is similar to the studio unit but smaller and more affordable. In addition, at the south end of the property, six 2-story townhome-style apartments have been added to the project. These 2-bedroom units are included in the new unit mix below. The unit mix includes the following:

<u>UNIT DESCRIPTION</u>	<u>NO. OF UNITS</u>
<u>Studio</u>	<u>7</u>
<u>1 Bedroom</u>	<u>10</u>
<u>2 Bedroom</u>	<u>16</u>
<u>3 Bedroom</u>	<u>15</u>
<u>4 Bedroom</u>	<u>190</u>
<u>Total</u>	<u>238</u>

<u>UNIT DESCRIPTION</u>	<u>NO. OF UNITS</u>
<u>Efficiency (Added type)</u>	<u>60</u>
<u>Studio</u>	<u>28</u>
<u>1 Bedroom</u>	<u>28</u>
<u>2 Bedroom</u>	<u>77</u>
<u>3 Bedroom</u>	<u>66</u>
<u>4 Bedroom</u>	<u>74</u>
<u>Total</u>	<u>333</u>

The residential project will include an integral clubhouse and leasing facility as well as a fitness center. A 2,000 square foot flex building has been added to the residential site to support community events. Site access will be provided from two driveways on Sawmill Rd. Approximately ~~431-401~~ surface parking spaces and 318 structured parking spaces, including 16 ADA accessible parking stalls, will be provided along with secure, indoor bike parking areas and exterior bike racks. The two buildings face one another and border an east/west Main Street which is aligned with Kensington Dr. to the west. A pedestrian bridge over the Main Street connects the two buildings at the third floor level. Each building layout defines outdoor courtyards that will be used as tenant recreation areas. The HR zone permits a maximum building height of 60 feet, or 65 feet for areas of pitched roofs (greater than 6:12). The highest ridgeline of the buildings will be 65 feet with a few tower elements that approach 67 feet which are permitted by section 10-50.30.030 of the Zoning Code. Open space and civic space are addressed later in this report.

The minimum density requirement in the HR zone is 10 units per acre and the maximum density allowed is 29 units per acre (outside the Resource Protection Overlay). The proposed residential gross density for this project is approximately ~~19-27~~ units per acre based on the overall residential site of 12.27 acres.

### Transportation Improvements

The applicant's engineer (SWI) contracted Lee Engineering, LLC, to prepare the APRC Multi-Family Housing and Retail Traffic Impact Analysis (TIA), dated September 2018. As described in the TIA, in general the entire parcel will be serviced through three full access driveways, each of which currently exist. The Butler Avenue driveway will be a right-in/right-out only driveway with the revised proposal. The Butler Avenue access will be relocated slightly to the east to align with a Greyhound bus station driveway on the opposite side of the street and will include a right-turn deceleration lane. The north Sawmill driveway is located opposite an existing driveway serving the Whole Foods store and the south Sawmill driveway is to be relocated to align with Kensington Drive. The south driveway will serve only the residential parking while the other driveways will serve both the residential and retail land uses.

The paved parking area will accommodate approximately 99 retail spaces and ~~749-719~~ residential spaces, 318 of which are to be structured spaces located on the east side of the property. Staff notes that for ~~238-333~~ dwelling units, a minimum of ~~606-665~~ parking spaces are required with a maximum of ~~636-698~~ (5% above the minimum allowed). Spaces within parking structures; however, are exempted from the maximum. In this case, the parking structure allows the development to have ~~113-21~~ additional residential parking spaces. The residential buildings include 256 secure indoor, grade-level bike parking spaces. Bike parking will also be available on both the commercial and residential site for the general public.

The site plan includes a new six-foot wide sidewalk along Butler Avenue and new five-foot wide sidewalk along Sawmill Road frontages to accommodate pedestrian trips, while existing bike lanes and four near-by transit stops will accommodate other alternative travel mode demands. The FUTS trail connection through the south end of the property provides additional pedestrian and bike connectivity.

More information on anticipated traffic impacts and required mitigation can be found under the Public Systems Impact Analysis section in this report. A description of the anticipated impact due to the current revised proposal is also in that section.

### General Plan/Flagstaff Regional Plan (FRP 2030)

The Regional Plan's (The "Plan") Future Growth Illustration on Maps 21 and 22 (same map; one is regional scale and one city scale) and the text of the Plan provide supplemental information for the interpretation of goals and policies. In case of any conflict between the Future Growth Illustration and the Plan's goals and policies, the goals and policies will prevail. The Future Growth Illustration has two types of land use designations: "Area Types" describe the place-making context of Urban, Suburban, Rural, or Employment, and "Place Types" such as activity centers, corridors, and neighborhoods provide the framework for the density, intensities, and mix of uses within the area types. The subject property falls within an Urban Activity Center and Butler Avenue is designated as a Great Street.

Urban activity centers are typically located at the intersection of two main thoroughfares. Urban activity centers include mixed-use, mix of housing types, mixed price range, walkable, transit-oriented design; can include regional commercial or neighborhood commercial. Urban Activity Centers call for a density range of greater than 8 units per acre for mixed-use projects, or greater than 13 units per acre for residential only projects.

### Applicable General Plan Goals and Policies

Staff has identified Regional Plan Goals and Policies that could be applied to support or not support the proposed Zoning Map Amendment. These goals and policies are located in an attachment to this report and within the applicant's narrative. The following is a discussion of how the project meets or conflicts with goals and policies in each chapter.

### **Environmental Planning & Conservation (Air Quality, Climate Change and Adaptation, Dark Skies, Ecosystem Health, Environmentally Sensitive Lands, Natural Quiet, Soils, and Wildlife)**

There were no significant natural resources from the Regional Plan Map 7 identified on this site. In addition, the site was used for light and heavy industrial uses and has very few remaining native trees and plants. The most significant resource on the

site is the steep slope that descends into Sinclair Wash. This slope is being preserved and the site plan will create a public access point from Sawmill Rd. to the back of the property, where the City will eventually build a FUTS trail that connects to the existing trail and interpretive facilities directly south of the project site.

The proposed project meets all dark sky standards for Lighting Zone 2.

The proposed site will increase the density and intensity of uses in a Regional Urban Activity Center with convenient access to Downtown and NAU by walking, bicycling and transit. This along with energy efficiency features of the new buildings, such as easy access to recycling and trash chutes, will decrease the per capita climate change impacts of the residents.

**Water Resources (Water Sources, Water Demand, Stormwater and Watershed Management, and Water Quality)**

As shown on Map 21, the Property is located within the Urban Growth Boundary. A Water and Sewer Impact Analysis and Drainage Analysis was completed for the project. The conclusions and requirements of these analyses are addressed in the Public Systems Impact Analysis section of this report. Both of these analyses adequately address the goals and policies of this chapter. The project is implementing the City's Low Impact Development (LID) requirements for stormwater which will bring this site into compliance. The project will not be using reclaimed water or capturing on site water for human uses.

**Community Character (Scenic Resources and Natural Setting, Heritage Preservation, Community Design, and Arts, Sciences and Education)**

Butler Avenue is classified as a Great Street in the Regional Plan. The commercial parcel at the front of this site is intended to continue the pattern of buildings from the adjacent Aspen Place development. Loading docks will be fully screened and the corner of Sawmill and Butler will be the primary focus of the site's urban design. The large residential buildings are deliberately set back from Butler Avenue to continue the development pattern of the Village at Aspen Place. Urban design is key for the success of urban activity centers. Walkable-scale developments can achieve many community goals, from increased public transit use to economic development opportunities. Concentrated development, however, must be designed and built with respect for Flagstaff's character. The property owner has created a functional pedestrian-oriented Main Street that lines up with the road and pedestrian network on the west side of Sawmill Road. The parking garage at the terminus of this Main Street has also been identified as a location for public art and the street can be converted into civic space for time-limited events that will activate the development and create a more dynamic activity center.

**Growth Areas & Land Use (Reinvestment, Greenfield, Urban Area, Suburban Area, Rural Area, Employment Area, Special Planning Area, and Activity Centers)**

The preferred land use scenario used for the Regional Plan includes less single-family development and more mixed-use development in the name of sustainability. "Suburban development means more vehicle miles traveled, greater emissions, and greater water demand. More urban-type development results in fewer vehicle miles traveled, fewer emissions and less water demand." The Plan promotes concentrated development in or near the city core and in Activity Centers. As stated previously, the subject property is located within a Regional Urban Activity Center. The McGrath project is considered an infill, redevelopment site.

The proposed development includes a mixture of residential and commercial uses and is designed to incorporate walking, biking and public art in a manner that creates a complete and connected place. Breaking up the larger building and creating a street network that meets the connectivity requirements of a 600 x 300 urban block is an important evolution for new urban activity centers. The main concern with the conceptual site plan for the commercial parcel is that it includes 2 or more drive-through lanes. While drive-throughs are not explicitly prohibited by the Regional Plan in urban areas, the emphasis on pedestrian over automobile oriented design does not suggest they are a preferred site feature. In all of Downtown Flagstaff there are only 4 properties with drive-through lanes. As the commercial portion of this property is a conceptual plan, it is unclear how many drive-throughs are to be constructed. The development agreement will allow some flexibility in the final Site Plan design; however, it will restrict the number and placement of drive-throughs to comply with the intent of the Urban Activity Center.

The proposed uses of the site may not include employment opportunities as is preferred within an Activity Center, because the commercial parcel does not yet have an approved Site Plan. One possible use for the location is a bank, which may provide employment to the surrounding community. “Existing Activity Centers have great potential for increase activities, densities and mixed-use with focused reinvestment by both the public and private sectors.” Currently, this Activity Center is developing into a hybrid of suburban uses along the Butler corridor and an urban mixed use neighborhood south of Piccadilly. The proposed project includes the density, intensity, and mix of uses necessary to activate civic spaces and pedestrian environment. The project meets the connectivity characteristics identified for an urban activity center including block size and access to transit and FUTS.

**Transportation (Mobility and Access, Safe and Efficient Multimodal Transportation, Environmental Considerations, Quality Design, Pedestrian Infrastructure, Bicycle Infrastructure, Transit, Automobile, Passenger Rail and Rail Freight, Air Travel, and Public Support for Transportation)**

The McGrath project would increase the density and intensity of residences and commercial activities in a highly connected multi-modal part of the City. The increased FUTS and street connectivity and access to transit provide strong support for walking, biking and transit as competitive mode choices for residents at this site.

The proximity of the site to Lone Tree Rd. also allows the developer to contribute to the future intersection improvements at Sawmill Rd. and Lone Tree Rd., which will be completed as part of the Lone Tree Rd. improvements that are moving forward under the recently approved transportation taxes.

**Cost of Development**

This chapter primarily addresses new development paying its fair share of public facilities, services, and infrastructure. Impact analyses helps to determine the specific proportional share for each development. A review of the impact analyses for this project and the mitigation required is discussed in the Public Systems Impact Analysis section of this report. The Regional Plan narrative identifies the share of public improvements that the development will contribute. At this time, there are no impact analysis procedures for public safety (police and fire) related services.

**Neighborhoods, Housing, and Urban Conservation**

NAU students make up approximately 25% of the City’s population. The student population’s increasing demand for housing impacts the cost and availability of housing in the region, which results in a higher demand for multi-family housing. This demand has also impacted the affordability of housing City wide. Part of the strategies identified in the High Occupancy Housing Plan was to concentrate opportunities for student housing in Regional Activity Centers, especially those close to campus, while minimizing the impacts of new development on existing neighborhoods. The hope is that creating more housing for students where their demand is highest would eventually free up and lower the cost of housing elsewhere in the City. In order to help address affordability further, the developer of this proposed project will also be contributing to affordable housing by setting aside 10% of the units for income qualified individuals and providing ~~\$100,000~~\$500,000 to the Affordable Housing trust in order to help provide affordable housing through other projects. These contributions will help those in the community struggling to afford to move or stay a part of Flagstaff.

The project does not, however, provide a mix of housing types on-site. The revised project provides a greater mix of housing types on site by substantially modifying the mix of unit types and adding six 2-story townhome style apartment units separate from the 5-story apartment buildings. For example, 60 efficiency units have been added to the unit types and the percentage of 4 bedroom/4 bath units has changed from 80 percent of the total units down to 22 percent. All units will be apartments that are part of the same complex; and most will be 4 bedroom units, which are often occupied by students. The proposed commercial and residential housing project does make use of an existing underutilized site as encouraged by the Regional Plan.

**Economic Development (Responsive Government, Education and Workforce Training, Business Retention, Expansion and**

### **Entrepreneurship, Business Attraction, Tourism, Community Character and Redevelopment and Infill)**

The McGrath development is a prime example of redevelopment of an underutilized property designed to accomplish regional transportation improvements within a designated Activity Center.

### **Recreation**

Development projects are encouraged to integrate active and passive recreation sites into their design. The McGrath project provides access to sites for both types of recreation. Private and public open space areas have been incorporated into the project boundaries and connections to open space and the nearby County park were considered in the design of the site. Ample civic space is provided to enhance the public and commercial component of this mixed-use development.

Plans for the site do show a pool amenity, which is not a preferred amenity for urban places in Flagstaff.

### **Policy Analysis**

This list below identifies several key points and community benefits supporting (+) or not supporting (-) the proposed amendment:

- + The property is considered redevelopment, is within the Urban Growth Boundary, and can be efficiently and effectively provided with facilities and services by the City;
- + The project will meet the connectivity characteristics desired for an urban activity center and connect to the FUTS system in the future.
- + Adding high density residential to an Activity Center that is identified in the High Occupancy Housing Plan as an appropriate location for denser development.
- + The project continues the pattern of development for the adjacent properties in the activity center.
- + The project is centrally located with convenient access to many required resources, including transit;
- + The project opted into many of the High Occupancy Housing Plan findings and desired goals and policies, even though it is not required to consider these policies due to the overall site density.
- + The project will include a 10% contribution of units to affordable housing and a ~~\$100,000~~ \$500,000 contribution to the trust.
- + The multipurpose "Main Street" is an innovative and activated design feature that will create flexible civic space and opportunities for public art.
- + The project is anticipated to include employment type uses within this Activity center.
- + The project provides a mix of housing types, multi-family unit types and price points.

Neutral – While the site does not achieve vertical mixed use, it does continue the pattern of the existing activity center.

- The project does not include residential or office uses over the commercial buildings fronting the Butler Avenue corridor, but does create a two story façade to create the impression of increase massing along the Great Street;
- ~~The project may not include employment type uses within this Activity Center;~~ and,
- ~~The project does not provide a mix of housing types.~~
- The presence of drive-through lanes on the commercial site is not a preferred element in an urban activity center.

### **High Occupancy Housing Specific Plan**

The High Occupancy Housing (HOH) Specific Plan was adopted in February 2018, after the Concept Plan review and before the Site Plan submittal on this case. Although this proposed ~~1927~~-unit per acre (~~70-62~~ bedrooms per acre) residential development does not meet the threshold of an HOH project (30 to 50 units per acre OR 75 to 125 bedrooms per acre), staff worked with the applicant to integrate some of the strategies into the proposed development. For example, the first Concept Plan proposed one large building wrapped around one central open space area, and with a low level of pedestrian connectivity throughout the site. The applicant agreed to break the large building into two smaller buildings resulting in smaller footprints. A Main Street was

created between the two buildings and additional auto and pedestrian connectivity added throughout the development. The applicant has also agreed to add recycling chutes in addition to garbage chutes for better waste management as suggested in the HOH plan. The HOH Plan states that student housing belongs in Regional Urban Activity Centers. While this is not solely a student housing project, it is anticipated that a large number of residents will be students due to the close proximity to NAU.

### **Zoning – City of Flagstaff Zoning Code**

If this Direct to Ordinance Zoning Map Amendment request is approved, approximately 2.24 acres will be rezoned to the Highway Commercial zone and approximately 12.27 acres will be rezoned to the High Density Residential zone. Development of the site will be conditioned to the approved site plan and a final development agreement. Any substantial change to the approved site plan would require a new rezoning request and further review and approvals by the Planning & Zoning Commission and City Council. The Site Plan provided includes the overall site layout; open space and civic space areas and calculations; parking areas and calculations; preliminary landscaping; architectural renderings and floor plans; colors and material specifications; and 3D views of the proposed development.

### ***Site Planning Standards***

In accordance with Section 10-30.60.030 of the Zoning Code (Page 30.60-2), a site analysis was completed in conjunction with the concept plan for this project that considers the topography of the site, solar orientation, existing/native vegetation types, view corridors, climate, subsurface conditions, drainage swales and stream corridor, and the built environment and land use context. The findings of the site analysis were used for the layout of the commercial and residential development, open space and civic space areas on site. The single-story commercial buildings are located on the southeast corner of Butler Ave. and Sawmill Rd. The northernmost 5-story multi-family residential building is set back over 300 feet from the Butler Ave. corridor, generally aligning with the existing 5-story Village at Aspen Place mixed-use building to the west. Natural open spaces on the south end of the parcel, undevelopable due to steep slope, are retained as open space. Public civic spaces are provided to connect commercial buildings to both the streets and to parking areas. The residential project includes large private and public spaces created between the two residential buildings. The surrounding land use context includes a variety of uses and structures including single-story to 5-story mixed uses at Aspen Place, single and 2-story buildings in the business park, and open space to the south of the property.

### ***Resource Protection***

There is no Resource Protection Overlay zone on the subject site. As described in the open space section below, there are 2.3 acres of open space designated on the residential site plan. The Development Agreement requires that these open space areas will be required to preserve healthy Ponderosa pines even though the property does not have a Resource Protection Overlay zone

### ***Open Space & Civic Space***

The HR zone requires 15 percent of gross lot area as common open space (Table 10-40-30.030.A). A minimum of 80,167 square feet of open space is required for the residential project. The conceptual landscape plan (Sheet L-1.02) identifies 101,615 square feet (2.3 acres) of open space which is 19.0 % of the site area. The project designates a 1.92-acre natural open space area on the southern portion of the site. This steeply sloping land is adjacent to the Sinclair Wash open space where the Sinclair Wash Trail continues southeast to meet the Arizona Trail. There is also a smaller open space area that will be left undeveloped near the northeast part of the site. Both of these areas will be required to preserve healthy Ponderosa pines even though the property does not have a Resource Protection Overlay zone. Consistent with the City's future FUTS plans, a 10-foot wide FUTS trail connection will be constructed from where the public sidewalk aligns with Kensington Dr., along the southwest parking area of the site, then turning east along the top of the open space area, ending at the east property line. The City will construct the remainder of the trail, to connect to the existing trail at an undesignated time in the future.

Section 10-30.60.060.B.1.b of the Zoning Code (Page 30.60-11) requires developments with 50 or more dwelling units to provide a minimum of five percent of the site as civic space. A total of 0.61 acres of civic space are required for this project. The site plan identifies a total of 0.64 acres of civic space within the residential development. The residential project slightly

exceeds the five percent minimum Civic Space requirement (5.2% of site area). The Main Street is the primary civic space within the residential project. It will be pedestrian oriented with enhanced pavement, seating and landscaping, but also allow vehicular use. The Main Street will be able to be closed off with temporary bollards to allow for the space to be used as a community event plaza. A local art mural is planned to be constructed at the end of Main Street against the parking deck. Additional civic plazas are planned around the clubhouse area on the north building.

### ***Pedestrian and Bicycle Circulation Systems***

The McGrath project creates a network of pedestrian and bicycle connectivity throughout the entire site and beyond the project. Consistent with the City's future FUTS plans, a 10-foot wide FUTS trail connection shall run along the southwest side of the site starting at Kensington Dr., then into the Sinclair Wash area to the south. Several internal walkway connections to this FUTS from the multi-family building are proposed. A network of internal pedestrian circulation is created by concrete walks crisscrossing through the parking lots, encircling the buildings, and connecting building entrances and plaza spaces including the residential Main Street at the heart of the project.

### ***Compatibility and Architectural Design Standards***

Compatibility does not mean "the same as" but rather it refers to how well a new development is sensitive to the character of existing development. The Zoning Code breaks down compatibility into three categories: Patterns of Development, Scale, and Continuity.

Patterns of Development includes streetscapes, site relationships, signage, and landscape features. In order to attain a context sensitive block pattern with ideal connectivity for an urban neighborhood, the site driveways are designed with a 300' x 300' block structure. The project's northern driveway on Sawmill Road is approximately 300' from Butler Avenue. The southern driveway is approximately 300' from the north driveway. The north driveway aligns with the Whole Foods driveway across Sawmill Road and the south driveway aligns with Kensington Drive in Aspen Place. Urban landscaping standards and setbacks have been applied to the commercial portion of this development with buildings moved closer to the street and civic plazas, visible from the streets, leading to store entrances. The residential project has more of a suburban feel, but trees are spaced regularly tying the overall landscaping together. Landscaped parkways are required on Butler and Sawmill between the street and new sidewalks.

Scale refers to similar or harmonious proportions, overall height and width, the visual intensity of the development, and the building massing. The setback of the 5-story residential buildings to the middle of the site is similar to the 4-story and 5-story multi-family residential buildings in Aspen Place at the Sawmill. The proposed buildings have both vertical and horizontal articulation in accordance with the Zoning Code to ensure that traditional proportions can be observed and to avoid unbroken, flat rooflines and building faces. The commercial portion of the project is conceptual in nature but will comply with Urban Activity Center requirements as generally depicted in the conceptual site plan. One building is located at the corner of Butler and Sawmill and the second building is placed along Butler. Minimum height of these buildings is set at 32 feet. Parking is located behind the buildings and drive-through(s) if any, will be behind the buildings.

Continuity encompasses patterns of development and scale, but also site development, building forms, texture, materials, details, and colors. The architectural massing of the residential site has been broken into smaller segments to diminish the overall size of the project and maintain a similar language to the surrounding multi-family projects in the Aspen Place at the Sawmill development. The architectural style for the housing component is a mountain lodge aesthetic, paying homage to the surrounding scenery as well as other architecturally noteworthy buildings. The proposed residential buildings incorporate large gables, heavy timber detailing, and a combination of stone and siding. The retail component is an urban sawmill design which is a modern take on the mountain lodge aesthetic with similar materials and colors. The colors were selected to pull from the natural browns of the trees and grays of the mountains.

**The new flex building and six townhome-style apartments will be reviewed for compliance with architectural design standards when the Application for Site Plan Minor Modification is submitted.**

### ***Landscaping***

Landscaping plans are not required in conjunction with a Direct to Ordinance Zoning Map Amendment. The applicant provided a conceptual landscaping plan, showing all landscape areas and tree locations. The conceptual plan generally meets the requirements of parking lot landscaping, street buffer landscaping, building foundation, public right-of-way landscaping, open space landscaping, and landscape screening standards found within Section 10-50.60 of the Zoning Code (Page 50.60-1). The project will incorporate landscape and irrigation Low Impact Design techniques including surface runoff and roof drains directed into planting beds where possible. State-of-the-art irrigation technology are proposed. A final landscape plan will be reviewed at the time of civil plan submittal.

### ***Outdoor Lighting***

The subject property is located within Lighting Zone II and is allowed a total of 50,000 lumens per acre. The applicant has committed to exceeding the City's outdoor lighting standards when the lighting plan is designed and submitted with the building plans. Outdoor lighting plans are not required in conjunction with a Direct to Ordinance Zoning Map Amendment. A lighting plan will be reviewed for compliance at the time of building permit submittal.

### ***Parking***

Commercial parking is provided in a surface parking lot on the commercial parcel at the corner of Butler Ave. and Sawmill Rd. Parking spaces are located behind or to the side of buildings and will be screened from view of the public streets. The paved parking area will accommodate approximately 99 retail spaces and **749-719** residential spaces, 318 of which are to be structured spaces located on the east side of the property.

## **PUBLIC SYSTEMS IMPACT ANALYSIS**

**Traffic/Right-of-Way Impact** **\*See Transportation Engineering staff review comments on the revised proposal at the end of this section.**

The APRC Multi-Family Housing and Retail Transportation Impact Analysis (TIA) included 7 existing intersections and driveways within the influence area:

1. Butler Avenue and Sawmill Road
2. Sawmill Road and Kensington Drive / Site Access D3
3. Sawmill Road and Lone Tree Road
4. Lone Tree Road and Franklin Avenue
5. Butler Avenue and Lone Tree Road / Colorado Street
6. Butler Avenue and Greyhound driveway / Site Access D1
7. Sawmill Road and Whole Foods driveway / Site Access D2

Intersection turning movement counts were collected during the traditional AM and PM peak periods in March 2018 to estimate the operational conditions of the study area intersections. The count data was collected during typical week conditions with NAU students in school and weather conditions were good.

Due to the site's proximity to Northern Arizona University (less than a mile), the City identified a likelihood that this development may accommodate a high percentage of NAU students. As such, the traffic analysis used information gathered from independent data collection near the NAU campus, provided by the City of Flagstaff, which are very close to the ITE off-campus rates based on number of residents. For the commercial portion of the development, the TIA used the following Institute of Transportation Engineers (ITE) Land Use Codes: LUC #934 Fast-Food Restaurant with Drive-Thru Window; and, LUC #814 Variety.

The proposed site is to be developed in a single construction phase, planned for opening in 2020. Based on City of Flagstaff TIA requirements and trip generation estimates matching a Category 1 – Small Development, anticipated to generate less than 500

peak hour directional trips, this TIA required analysis of the opening year conditions for a study area that includes the site access points and adjacent signalized and unsignalized major street intersections as listed above.

The TIA identifies that the only intersection movement showing poor existing operational conditions was the minor-street STOP controlled Lone Tree Road/Sawmill Road intersection. In the PM peak hour, the westbound Sawmill Road to southbound Lone Tree Road operates poorly. To help mitigate the anticipated traffic impacts from this development, the City is requiring the developer to contribute \$200,000 towards the cost of a future traffic signal at Lone Tree Road and Sawmill Road. In addition to the traffic signal contribution, the City's Transportation Engineering Program may require interim striping modification on Lone Tree Road south of Sawmill Road, dependent on Transportation Engineering's final review of the design. In addition, based on City warrants and turn volume estimates, the site's Butler Avenue driveway will require a right-turn deceleration lane. The City's conditions of approval for the acceptance of the TIA are attached to this report.

**Based on the 11% reduction in number of beds (854 to 764 per the narrative they submitted), staff expects traffic generated by the residential portion to decrease by the same percentage. Residential-based trips were 65% of the total new A.M. peak hour vehicle trips and 75% of the total new P.M. peak hour trips per the original Transportation Impact Assessment report. Making the driveway on Butler right-in-right-out-only will shift westbound left turn and northbound left turn traffic from that driveway to the signalized intersection at Sawmill and Butler. In turn, that entering traffic will turn left off of Sawmill into the site. The shifted exiting traffic is expected to turn right from the project onto Sawmill, and then left onto Butler. The number of vehicles subject to shifting from the Butler access to the Sawmill access is low according to the original TIA: less than 50 entering and about 25 exiting. There is sufficient flexibility in the signal timing at the Butler & Sawmill intersection to accommodate the expected traffic shifts. A review of the northern access point on Sawmill shows all but one movement likely to operate with little delay and at Level of Service A or B in the peak period (P.M. peak hour). The exception is the eastbound leg which is predicted to operate at Level of Service D, still within the acceptable range. Eastbound drivers do have a number of alternative routes, so it is likely they will distribute themselves around the site to level out delay among the available access points.**

### **Water and Wastewater Impact**

A Water and Sewer Impact Analysis (WSIA) was completed by the City on May 4, 2018. The proposed development is located within the City of Flagstaff urban growth boundary and has the ability to be served by City water and sewer utilities. Currently there is no infrastructure in the ground on-site to support this development, so all on-site sewer and water systems will have to be designed and built. No off-site water or sewer improvements will be required. It is the developer's responsibility to design and construct all on-site and connecting water infrastructure per the City of Flagstaff Engineering Standards.

**The Water Services Engineering Manager has reviewed the revised development proposal. Based on the bedroom count going down, no new impact analysis will be required. The water and sewer demands are less than before.**

### **Water**

All public water infrastructure exists in the Sawmill Road right-of-way adjacent to this property. There is a 10" water main extended to the property frontage. All appropriate looping and second source requirements can be met. The property lies within the Zone "B" water pressure system limits, and meets the minimum pressure requirements stated in the City of Flagstaff Engineering Standards. Water services will be provided by 3" domestic water service lines that will connect to the proposed 8" loop. The water loop will connect to the existing 10" water main in Sawmill Rd.

### **Wastewater**

To provide sewer services to the project, the developer will have to tap a manhole in the Butler Ave. right-of-way. The developer will provide new on-site sewer services that flow north through the property to the manhole in Butler Avenue. From the Butler Ave. manhole, the sewer service flows north to a main line in the Rio de Flag before it heads south to the Rio de Flag Wastewater Treatment Plant.

## **Stormwater Analysis**

A Drainage Impact Analysis (DIA) is required for any property undergoing a rezone. The intent is to determine any potential adverse downstream drainage impacts and to identify mitigation options. The site was divided into two drainage areas based on whether the area drains north towards Sewer Canyon or south towards Rio de Flag. The DIA determined that both drainage areas ultimately flow into the Rio de Flag. Those two areas were analyzed to calculate and compare volumes for the pre- and post-development conditions. The proposed drainage design will try to mimic the overall existing conditions including placement of the basin boundary between north and south onsite basins.

The total area of the north basin will decrease as will runoff volume of the north basin in the post-development condition. As such, no retention of stormwater runoff is required for the north basin. However, since the impervious area within the north basin will increase in the post-development condition, the parking lot west of "Pad A" retail component will be used to collect stormwater runoff from roofs and adjacent parking lots that will be routed to a StormTech chamber system located underneath the parking lot. The chamber system will discharge to the existing storm drain network under Butler Ave. and outlet into Sewer Canyon, which ultimately discharges to Rio de Flag.

The total area of the south basin will increase. As a result of the area increase and additional impervious area within the south basin, there is an increase in runoff volume amounting to approximately 16,600 cubic feet. This additional runoff volume is to be directed to a StormTech chamber system located underneath the parking lot south of the multi-family housing buildings where it will be retained. A low flow bleed off will discharge to a proposed storm drain network on the southwest boundary of the project, which outlets into Rio de Flag.

Both the north and south onsite drainage basin will be designed to have no increase in runoff volume and no increase in peak flows for the 10 and 100 year storm events. In addition, the LID components of the north basin will provide a water quality benefit and an additional reduction in post development volume discharge.

## **DEVELOPMENT AGREEMENT**

A draft development agreement, attached to this report, has been prepared and continues to be negotiated throughout the review of this project. The primary purpose of this agreement is to set out roles and responsibilities in regards to the following (not limited to):

- Development standards (Site Plan and Conceptual Commercial Site Plan) **Unit Mix will be updated**
- Transportation improvements **Butler Ave. driveway will be right-in/right-out only**
- FUTS
- Affordable housing **Number of affordable units and contribution amount will be updated**
- Materials management
- Phasing

## **CITIZEN PARTICIPATION**

Public hearings before the Planning and Zoning Commission and City Council are conducted in conjunction with requests for Direct to Ordinance Zoning Map Amendments. In accordance with State Statute, notice of the public hearing was provided by placing an ad in the Daily Sun, posting notices on the property, and mailing a notice to all property owners within 1,000 feet (exceeding the minimum of 300 feet) of the site excluding rights-of-way.

The applicant held two neighborhood meetings in regards to this case on April 24, 2018 and July 30, 2018. Both meetings were held at the Murdock Center, located at 203 E. Brannen Avenue in Flagstaff. Per the sign-in sheets, sixteen (16) individuals attended the first meeting and thirteen (13) individuals attended the second meeting. A Citizen Participation Report,

attached, was prepared in response to the questions, comments and concerns presented. The meetings included an open house period, followed by presentations from the applicant and a question and answer session with scribes recording questions and comments. Comments on the project included the following topics: traffic impacts, heights and materials of the proposed buildings, who the project will be marketed to, preserving some of the existing trees, types of amenities, FUTS, security plan, and affordability.

One letter from the public has been received as of the writing of the report. This letter, in favor of the project, is included in the Citizen Participation Report. No additional letters have been received as of the date of this report.

The applicant was required to hold a new neighborhood meeting prior to the Planning & Zoning Commission meeting. The meeting was held on May 16, 2019 at the Aquaplex. The results of the meeting are included with the attached Citizen Participation Report.

**RECOMMENDATION:**

Staff believes that the proposed zoning map amendment is in substantial conformance with the Flagstaff Regional Plan 2030 and recommends the Planning & Zoning Commission forward the request to the City Council with a recommendation approving PZ-~~17-00089-03~~ 19-00081, subject to the following four conditions which will be included into the zoning map amendment ordinance:

1. ~~The subject property must be developed in accordance with the approved site plan and the conditions of approval dated September 21, 2018. Modifications (other than minor modifications) to the approved site plan will require an amendment to this Direct to Ordinance Zoning Map Amendment request.~~ The applicant shall submit an Application for Site Plan Minor Modification for review and approval by the Inter-Division Staff prior to submittal of civil engineering or building permits. The subject property must be developed in accordance with the approved Site Plan modification and the related conditions of approval.
2. For the commercial portion of the development, final architectural design and site layout will be reviewed and approved with a separate Site Plan submittal and will be in conformance with the approved Development Agreement and Zoning Map Amendment conditions.
3. All other requirements of the Zoning Code and other City codes, ordinances and regulations, shall be met by the proposed development.
4. All terms, conditions, and restrictions detailed within the "McGrath Development Agreement" must be fully satisfied.
5. In the event that Certificate of Occupancy has not been granted on the improvements on the commercial parcel within six years from the date of this Agreement, after notification by certified mail to the owner and applicant who requested the rezoning, the City shall schedule a public hearing before City Council to take action to extend, remove or determine compliance with the schedule for development or take legislative action to cause the property to revert to its former zoning classification

**Attachments:**

- Application
- Legal Notice
- Zoning District Legal Description
- Vicinity Map
- Zoning Exhibit (existing/proposed)
- WSIA Waiver Letter
- TIA Waiver Letter
- ~~Map of Surrounding Information~~
- ~~Traffic Impact Analysis—Introduction and Summary, dated September 2018~~

PZ-19-00081

May 22, 2019

- Project Narrative - **updated**
- Citizen Participation Report - **updated**
- Draft Development Agreement - **updated**
- **Conditionally** Approved Site Plans