

PLANNING AND DEVELOPMENT SERVICES REPORT
LANDMARK OVERLAY ZONING MAP AMENDMENT

PUBLIC HEARING
PZ-19-00126

DATE: August 16, 2019
MEETING DATE: August 28, 2019
REPORT BY: Sara Dechter

REQUEST:

Landmark Overlay Zoning Map Amendment, submitted by San Francisco de Asis parish and the Planning Director, of approximately 0.62 acres located at 244 S. Kendrick Street to add Landmarks Overlay (LO) Zone to the existing zoning classification of High Density Residential (HR) Zone.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends the Planning and Zoning Commission, in accordance with the findings presented in this report, forward the Landmark Overlay Zoning Map Amendment request to the City Council with a recommendation for approval.

PRESENT LAND USE:

The subject property is approximately a portion of 103-07-021B comprised of 0.62 acres. The parcels are currently owned by the San Francisco de Asis Catholic Parish. The legal description of the area proposed for the Zoning Map Amendment is "A portion of 103-07-021B, Lots 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7 and 8 of Block 119 Normal School Addition." The property is currently used as a place of worship, meeting place, private paid parking lot, and a short-term retreat location for the Catholic parish.

PROPOSED LAND USE:

No modifications are proposed at this time. The parish is currently looking for a long-term tenant for the former convent, and this application anticipates a future adaptive reuse for this building.

NEIGHBORHOOD DEVELOPMENT:

See the attached area context map.

North: Commercial business, zoned Commercial Services (CS)
East: Single Family and accessory dwelling units, zoned High Density Residential (HR)
South: Butler Avenue and the High Country Conference Center
West: Commercial businesses, zoned Community Services (CS) and Highway Commercial (HC)

I. Project Introduction

A. Background

In the spring of 1926, Our Lady of Guadalupe church served as a church for primarily Spanish-speaking Roman Catholics of Flagstaff. Reverend Edward Albouy was appointed pastor of Flagstaff. He found out that the parish was in debt and sent out to make a solvent. By 1926 he had succeeded in doing so and had also set aside some funding to build a new church for the Spanish-speaking parishioners. The sentiments of white parishioners had an early influence on the decision to build the new church. Mrs. Philomena Babbitt donated a piece of land on which the church was built on to help reduce prejudice against Mexican parishioners who had to walk to the church from out of town. When they arrived to Mass they typically had dirt and dust on them from commuting which was the reasoning for building Our Lady of Guadalupe in the South of town so these families would not be members of Nativity of the Blessed Virgin Mary the first Catholic Church established in Flagstaff.

In the fall of 1926 construction of the main building was almost completed when effects of the local recession started to be felt by the community. This led to many of the Mexican families collecting money and putting in their time and labor to finish the project. By the fall of 1926 the church was nearly finished and on the day of the feast of Guadalupe, the church was dedicated to Our Lady of Guadalupe. The Spanish name was chosen in dedication to the Mexican parishioners. On December 5, 1926 the church was officially dedicated, the blessing of the ball took place. The following

Sunday, December 12 at 9:15a.m., the first mass was held and Our Lady of Guadalupe Church was established.

This property has been continually recognized as a historic and central place that preserves the community's rooted beliefs, customs, and practices. Our Lady of Guadalupe Catholic Church was declared a shrine of the Diocese of Phoenix in 1972. The property was listed on the National Register of Historic Places in 1986. In the 2015 La Plaza Vieja Neighborhood Specific Plan recognized the importance of preserving this place of worship for their neighborhood and the Hispanic community throughout Flagstaff and Northern Arizona. Throughout the process of preparing the Southside Community Plan, the church has been repeatedly mentioned as a high priority historic property and cultural gathering place for the community. Due to the buildings condition, there is a need to restore the property in order to maintain its Landmark status in the future. The owner is not ready to outline that concept currently because the future tenant and use are yet undetermined.

B. Proposed Rezoning and Restoration Plan

The proposed rezoning would add the Landmark Overlay to the existing zoning for a portion of APN 103-07-021B. This would make future development on the property subject to the Design Standards and Guidelines of the Landmark Design Review Overlay District and subject to approval by the Historic Preservation Commission.

Because of the integrity of the former convent and the owner's desire to adaptively reuse the building, staff recommends that the rezoning include a requirement for a restoration plan for the former convent be prepared and approved by the Heritage Preservation Commission within 3 years of adoption of the Landmark Overlay.

On July 17, 2019, the Heritage Preservation Commission recommended approval of the rezoning request. This recommendation along with a recommendation from the Planning and Zoning Commission, will be presented to the City Council for use in their review and consideration of the rezoning request

II. Staff Review

A Landmark Property is "an individual property, object, structure, site, sign, or landscape feature may be designated as a landmark property within the Landmark Overlay zone if it is significant per the Zoning Code 10-30.30.040.

A conceptual or site plan for the property when considering a Landmark Overlay is simply the existing buildings and layout of the site. Therefore, site plan review standards do not typically apply in these cases.

Significance and Integrity of the Landmark

Our Lady of Guadalupe Catholic Church has been on the National Register of Historic Places since 1986. This establishes its significance. The National Register listing also includes the rectory which is currently used by the Hope Pregnancy Crisis Center. The owner would like to retain the right to do a substantial addition to this building, and therefore, elected not to include it in the Landmark Overlay designation. Landmark Overlays are a voluntary action for the property owner and the Zoning Code specifically states that "Property owner consent is required for designation of a landmark property" (10-30.30.040(C)2).

The property considered in this rezoning has two buildings a church and a former convent. The church building has very good integrity and is subject to the "preservation" portion of the Secretary of the Interiors Standards and Guidelines for the Treatment of Historic Properties. The former convent has moderate integrity as its form and many original materials are present. There are late period materials that negatively impact the integrity of the building. The owner also wants to make life/safety and energy efficiency upgrades at a future date. The former convent still has adequate integrity to maintain a finding under the Community Development and Association criteria for determining integrity. The former convent needs work in order to achieve the same level of Architectural integrity as the church.

III. Landmark Overlay Zoning Map Amendment Findings

Landmark Overlay Zoning Map Amendments shall be evaluated based on the following findings:

A. Finding #1: Significance and Integrity of the Proposed Landmark

The National Register status and review of integrity by City staff show that the property meets the findings for the Landmark Overlay.

B. Finding #2: Conformance and Consistency with the Regional Plan and applicable Specific Plans

The proposed amendment must be found to be consistent with and in conformance with the goals and policies of the General Plan and any applicable specific plans. If the application is not consistent with the General Plan, and any other applicable specific plan, the applicable plan must be amended in compliance with the procedures established in Chapter 11-10 of the City Code (Title 11: General Plans and Subdivisions) prior to considering the proposed amendment.

i. General Plan/Flagstaff Regional Plan (FRP 2030) Process and Analysis Summary

The adoption of a Landmark Overlay for Our Lady of Guadalupe Catholic Church is consistent with the goals and policies of the Flagstaff Regional Plan 2030 and the La Plaza Vieja Neighborhood Specific Plan.

ii. Applicable General Plan Goals and Policies

As part of its review, staff identified relevant Regional Plan Goals and Policies that could be applied to support or not support the proposed Zoning Map Amendment. The following is a discussion of how the project generally meets or conflicts with goals and policies in each chapter.

a. Efficient Use of Energy Goals and Policies

Policy E.1.4. Promote cost-effective, energy-efficient technologies and design in all new and retrofit buildings for residential, commercial, and industrial projects.

The Regional Plan Policy E.1.4 promotes cost-effective, energy-efficient technologies and design in all new buildings for residential construction. The property owner proposes to restore the convent and will look at the potential energy efficiency improvements and savings that can be made as part of the restoration plan for the convent. National Park Service Preservation Brief 3: Improving Energy Efficiency in Historic Buildings would be used to guide this part of the restoration plan.

b. Community Character (Scenic Resources and Natural Setting, Heritage Preservation, Community Design, and Arts, Sciences and Education)

Policy CC.2.2. Formally recognize heritage resources through designation as local landmarks and historic districts.

Policy CC.2.4. Support restoration and rehabilitation of historic housing, buildings, structures, and neighborhoods.

Policy CC.2.10. Educate the community and developers on the benefits of adaptive reuse and create policies to incentivize the reuse of historic buildings to maintain their integrity.

Policy CC.2.11. Assist businesses and residents who are caretakers of historic resources, maximize the economic value of their property without damaging the integrity of the historic resource.

The Regional Plan's policies related to Historic Preservation supports the preservation and restoration of historic buildings and the formal recognition of landmarks. This proposed Zoning Map amendment supports the San Francisco de Asis Parish as the caretaker of an irreplaceable community asset in both the preservation and restoration of the resource and adaptive reuse to support their organization mission.

- e. Growth Areas & Land Use (Reinvestment, Greenfield, Urban Area, Suburban Area, Rural Area, Employment Area, Special Planning Area, and Activity Centers)

Policy LU.10.3. Value the Historic Neighborhoods established around downtown by maintaining and improving their highly walkable character, transit accessibility, diverse mix of land uses, and historic building form.

Policy LU.11.5. Encourage adaptive re-use of historic structures for a variety of commercial spaces and housing options.

Preservation of the historic buildings, like Our Lady of Guadalupe, that anchor the Southside Historic District supports the character of the community and the use and reuse of the historic structures on the property.

- ii. Applicable Specific Plans

Our Lady of Guadalupe Catholic Church is identified as a priority view from the La Plaza Vieja Neighborhood. The preservation of the building will not prevent larger buildings from being developed along Milton Road but it will retain the object the community wants to view to the best of the City's and property owners ability.

IV. CITIZEN PARTICIPATION

Public hearings before the Planning and Zoning Commission and City Council are conducted in conjunction with requests for Landmark Overlay Zoning Map Amendments. In accordance with State Statute, notice of the public hearing was provided by placing an ad in the Daily Sun, posting notices on the property, and mailing a notice to all property owners within 300 feet of the site excluding rights-of-way.

The developer held a Heritage Preservation meeting in lieu of a neighborhood meeting, which is permitted by the Zoning Code. The meetings was held on July 17, 2019 at City Hall. The second meeting was waived by the Planning Director. Per the sign-in sheets, approximately 15 individuals attended the Heritage Preservation meeting and 2 community members got up and spoke to the Commission. One spoke in support of the amendment and the second had a question about why the rectory was not included in the Landmark Overlay. Questions were answered at the meeting. The Heritage Preservation Commission forwarded the recommendation to adopt a Landmark Overlay to the Planning and Zoning Commission and the City Council unanimously. The record of the meeting can be found at: <https://flagstaffaz.swagit.com/play/07172019-1348>

No written comments had been submitted to the HPO at the time of this report.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends approval of the Landmark Overlay designation with the condition that a restoration plan for the former convent be prepared and approved by the Heritage Preservation Commission within 3 years of adoption of the Landmark Overlay. This condition has been discussed with the owner and they have tentatively agreed to this term as it meets both the City's goal of protecting and historic property and the owners goal of predictability in the restoration of the former convent and to capture the intent and the ability adaptively reuse the building and address energy and life/safety upgrades.

Attachments:

- Application
- Area Context Map

- Legal Notice