



Minutes **DRAFT**

City of Flagstaff

HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION

4:00 PM – Wednesday, July 17, 2019

Flagstaff City Hall, **Council Chambers**, 211 W. Aspen Avenue



In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need assistance to participate in this meeting, please contact Deborah Cargill 928-213-2906 (or 774-5281 TDD). Notification at least 48 hours in advance will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements.

CALL TO ORDER Chairman Hayward called the meeting to order at 4:01 PM

COMMISSION MEMBERS: David Hayward, Chair, *Present*
Jonathan Day, Vice Chair, *Present*
Charlie Webber, *Present*
Jerry McLaughlin, *Present*
Emily Dale, *Present*
Jill Hough, *Present*
Caitlin Kelly, *Absent*

CITY STAFF: Sara Dechter, Staff Co-Liaison, *Present*
Becky Cardiff, Recording Secretary

I. PRELIMINARY GENERAL BUSINESS

1. PUBLIC COMMENT

a. *(At this time, any member of the public may address the Commission on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled before the Commission on that day. Due to Open Meeting Laws, the Commission cannot discuss or act on items presented during this portion of the agenda. To address the Commission on an item that is on the agenda, please wait for the Chair to call for Public Comment at the time the item is heard.)*

None

2. ANNOUNCEMENTS

a. *(Reconsiderations, Changes to the Agenda, and other Preliminary Announcements)*

None

3. APPROVAL of MINUTES.

- a. Regular Meeting of June 19, 2019.

MOTION: Commissioner Webber moved to approve the minutes with the amendment to change Commissioner Webber to "present". Commissioner Dale seconded the motion; the motion passed unanimously.

II. New Business:

1. Cultural Resource Study – 124 W Benton Avenue

Address: 124 W Benton Avenue
Assessor's Parcel Number: 103-07-001
Property Owner: Michele Johnson
Applicant: Erin O'Loughlin, PWMA Authentic Architecture
City Staff: Sara Dechter, Interim HPO
REQUESTED ACTION: Approval of Letter Report

The property has been heavily modified by renovations which were carried out 13-14 years ago by a previous property owner. The building no longer has the architectural integrity associated with the Basque Vernacular style. The current property owner would like to create a second story addition that will remove the building form that is associated with this style and is one of the few remaining historical elements.

RECOMMENDED ACTION: Staff recommends approval of the Letter Report and removal of 124 W Benton Ave. from the list of contributing structures in the Southside National Register Historic District

Discussion was held on the modifications that were made to the structure.

MOTION: Commissioner McLaughlin moved to approve the letter report and removal of 124 W Benton Ave from the list of contributing structures in the Southside National Register Historic District. Commissioner Webber seconded the Motion. Motion passed unanimously

2. Cultural Resource Study – The L Motel

Address: 121 S Milton Road
Assessor's Parcel Number: 100-37-001, 100-37-019
Property Owner: Shevan Family Trust DTD, James M and Cheryl R Sheven
Applicant: Lynn Neal
City Staff: Sara Dechter, Interim HPO
REQUESTED ACTION: Approval of Phase I Cultural Resource Study

Due to a lack of significance and loss of integrity, the report recommends that the value of further research has been exhausted by the Phase I report and a Phase 2 report is not warranted. |

RECOMMENDED ACTION: Staff recommends approval of the Phase I Report.

Lynn Neal gave a description of The L Motel property and answered questions from Commissioners

MOTION: Commissioner Hough moved to approve the Phase I report. Commissioner McLaughlin seconded the Motion. Motion passed unanimously

3. Grant Application – Façade Rehabilitation

Address: 108 E Route 66
Assessor's Parcel Number: 101-21-009
Property Owner: Flagstaff Historic Properties, Inc. Maury Herman
Applicant: Anne Soper, UPDESIGN Studio
City Staff: Sara Dechter, Interim HPO
REQUESTED ACTION: Approval of Grant Application

The Heritage Preservation Commission approved façade improvements with conditions to restore the transom to glass that better resembles the historic photos and to off center the entrance to be more in keeping with the historic conditions. The applicant is seeking grant funding for demolishing the existing storefront, restoring masonry and vestibule features, and installing a new storefront and windows, which were salvaged from an adjacent building.

RECOMMENDED ACTION: Approval of grant application

Ms. Dechter introduced the grant application

Anne Soper, applicant architect, answered questions from Commissioners about any changes from what was previously approved by the Commission

MOTION: Commissioner Day moved to approve the grant application with the condition that the line item to install glass block be removed and the money can be applied to another line item to be administratively approved by the HPO. Commissioner Dale seconded the motion. Motion passed unanimously

III. Old Business:

1. **Landmark Overlay Zone – Our Lady of Guadalupe Catholic Church**

Address: 224 S Kendrick Street
Assessor's Parcel Number: 103-07-021B
Property Owner: Bishop of the Roman Catholic Church of the Diocese of Phoenix
Applicant: Fr. Will Schmid
City Staff: Sara Dechter, Interim HPO
REQUESTED ACTION: Recommend property for Landmark Overlay

The Heritage Preservation Commission recommended approval of a Landmark Overlay for the Our Lady of Guadalupe Catholic Church in February 2017. Since then the parish has considered decided to pursue the overlay on the church and former convent and not to include the former rectory located at the corner of Butler and Kendrick. The overlay would protect the Lots 1 through 8 of the original Normal School Addition plat.

RECOMMENDED ACTION: Staff recommends (1) opening a public hearing to allow for the public to provide comments to the commission, and (2) Forwarding a recommendation for the Landmark Overlay on the area recommended to the Planning and Zoning Commission and City Council.

Mary Vasquez-Powell and Laura Bustamonte Myers represented the applicant and provided supplemental materials on the value of the church for the Hispanic and Catholic communities in Flagstaff

Lynn Neal asked if the rectory was on the National Register listing for the property. Sara Dechter, interim HPO, responded that it is, and that Landmark Overlays are voluntary actions by the property owner.

Lena Wallen, resident, spoke in support of applying the Landmark Overlay district

MOTION: Commissioner Webber moved to recommend to Planning and Zoning Commission and City Council for approval of the landmark overlay. Commissioner Hough seconded the motion. Motion passed unanimously

III. **Work Session**

1. Certified Local Government Historic Preservation Fund Pass-Through Grant, Federal Fiscal Year 2019

Staff would like feedback on the possible projects that could be funded through this grant. Staff will solicit 2 to 3 commission members to write on the grant proposal over the next 4 weeks.

Ms. Dechter gave a brief description of the proposed projects that could be funded through the grant.

Discussion was held on the proposed projects.

The Commission preferred a historic context for Sunnyside. Jill Hough and Jonathan Day agreed to work with the interim HPO on the application over the next few weeks. Emily Dale will review for final editing.

2. Arizona State Historic Preservation Plan Update 2019

The State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) is consulting with Certified Local Governments in preparation of an update to the Arizona State Historic Preservation Plan. The SPA is requesting

- Comments on the form and content of the draft
- Recommendations on what the importance cultural resource issues facing Arizona are and most importantly, in Flagstaff,
- Information about Flagstaff's heritage preservation programs that can be include in the description of historic preservation partners in Arizona

The HPC will discuss the materials transmitted from the SHPO and provide input to the Historic Preservation Officer. Staff will present a draft response to the Commission at the August HPC meeting for Commission endorsement.

Discussion was held on the preservation plan update

IV. **REPORTS:**

1. Review of Administrative Approvals:

- i. PZ-19-00132 - 1817 N WEST ST, Flagstaff, AZ, 86004 - CRS Letter Report, Approved 7/11/19, Finding: The property is not significant under federal, State or local criteria. Letter report documentation is adequate to proceed with application for a demolition permit.

Discussion was held on the administrative approval

V. **ANNOUNCEMENTS**

(Informal Announcements, Future Agenda Items, and Next Meeting Date)

- a. Future Agenda Item - Council Communication update

New handbook is being worked on by the City Clerk and a member of Council is assigned to each commission

- b. Upcoming SHPO visit to Train Station Platform
Ms. Dechter gave an update on the SHPO visit to Flagstaff
- c. Next Regularly Scheduled Meeting: August 21, 2019

VI. ADJOURNMENT

Adjourned at 5:35 p.m.