

PLANNING AND DEVELOPMENT SERVICES REPORT
DIRECT TO ORDINANCE ZONING MAP AMENDMENT

PUBLIC HEARING
PZ-18-00205-03

DATE: July 1, 2020
MEETING DATE: July 08, 2020
REPORT BY: Patrick St. Clair

REQUEST:

Direct to Ordinance Zoning Map Amendment, by SRA 360, of approximately 13.65 acres located at 1002 N Fourth Street from the Medium Density Residential (MR) zone to the Highway Commercial (HC) zone. The development site is located within the Resource Protection Overlay (RPO).

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends the Planning and Zoning Commission, in accordance with the findings presented in this report, forward the Direct to Ordinance Zoning Map Amendment request to the City Council with a recommendation for approval subject to conditions indicated in the “Recommendations” section at the end of this report.

PRESENT LAND USE:

The subject property is approximately 13.65 acres of undeveloped land. The parcel is currently owned by Flagstaff @ 4th, LLC.

PROPOSED LAND USE:

The applicant proposes a horizontal mixed-use development composed of a single story 6,000 SF detached commercial retail building, (4) 62,680 SF, 4-story apartment buildings mixing studio, one and two-bedroom units (224 units total), a 4,756 SF clubhouse and leasing office with pool and grilling area. Also proposed are on-site parking, community circulation trails and civic spaces. The principle site entrance is proposed on N Fourth Street with a limited right in-right out drive located on Butler Avenue.

NEIGHBORHOOD DEVELOPMENT:

Please see the attached area context map.

North: Sinagua Middle School, zoned Public Facility (PF)
East: Sinagua Middle School, zoned Public Facility (PF)
South: Butler Avenue frontage, beyond to south- Vacant land; AZ state owned parcel zoned Suburban Commercial (SC) and Research and Development (RD).
West: North Fourth Street frontage, beyond - Pinehurst at Flagstaff Apartment complex - multi-family residential - zoned Highway Commercial (HC)

I. Project Introduction

A. Proposed Rezoning and Development Plan

The applicant, SRA360, requests rezoning of parcel APN 106-08-005J from Medium Density Residential (MR) to Highway Commercial (HC). The Highway Commercial zone is characterized by the development of commercial uses in addition to residential uses to provide diversity in housing choices. The requested rezoning would allow the development of a proposed horizontal mixed-use project consisting of commercial retail and multi-family residential uses on the parcel. The commercial portion of the project is required to be constructed either prior to, or simultaneous with, the residential component of the development and may not at any time be separated from the existing parcel. The commercial building is proposed as a 6,000 SF single story structure situated in the southwest corner of the property as near as feasible to the intersection of N Fourth Street and Butler Avenue. In an effort to provide more easily convertible and physically attractive tenant spaces for lease, the commercial building is planned to have a maximum of (4) 1,500 SF commercial suites that will be completed to a “vanilla shell” finish per the agreed requirements of the associated project Development

July 1, 2020

Agreement. Among other things, the commercial shell building shall contain, full concrete floors, complete suite demising walls, installed HVAC units, interior and exterior lighting, electrical outlets and plumbed restrooms.

The residential component of the project consists of 224 multi-family residential units within (4) four-story apartment buildings and a 4,756 SF clubhouse with pool and common area amenities. The (4) four-story residential buildings each contain (16) two-bedroom, (31) one-bedroom, and (9) studio units. The unit mix includes the following:

UNIT DESCRIPTION	NO. OF UNITS PER BLDG.	NO. OF UNITS TOTAL
Studio	9	36
1 Bed/1 Bath	31	124
2 Bed/2 Bath	16	64
TOTAL	56	224

The proposed development includes vehicular, motorcycle and bicycle parking spaces. The development also includes 10% Affordable Housing units as part of the associated project Development Agreement.

The HC zone permits a maximum building height of 60 feet. The proposed four-story residential structures will stand 55 feet to the highest point of roof for the buildings.

B. Mixed Use Standards

Section 10-40.60.260 of the Zoning Code outlines standards for Mixed-Use developments. The Regional Plan promotes the concept of a more compact development pattern for the City by mapping and describing activity centers in urban, suburban, and rural area types, and encouraging mixed-use development. Mixed use is intended to encourage reinvestment of under-utilized parcels and infill development of vacant parcels with a compatible and balanced mix of residential, commercial, and institutional uses within close proximity to each other, rather than the separation of uses. Mixed use is also encouraged in new developments in Greenfield locations. Mixed-use developments foster pedestrian-oriented residential and commercial development by providing more housing options, reducing traffic congestion, providing a stronger economy in commercial areas, and encouraging pedestrian trips. Mixed use also has the potential to provide increased opportunities for affordable housing. In order to accomplish these goals, higher intensities of land use are permitted for mixed-use structures than for the individual uses permitted in a zone.

A mixed-use development combines residential and nonresidential uses, or different types of nonresidential uses, on the same site with the residential units either located above the nonresidential uses (vertical mixed use) or allowed at ground level behind street-fronting nonresidential uses (horizontal mixed use) under the limited circumstances specified by this section. The proposed project proposed a horizontal mixed use of commercial retail and residential. This meets the requirement that a mixed-use development shall incorporate a minimum of two uses.

The proposed commercial retail space meets the minimum depth of 60 feet required of pedestrian-oriented commercial space in mixed-use developments within suburban activity centers. The requirement that outdoor lighting for commercial uses shall be appropriately shielded to limit impacts on the residential units will be confirmed with the Outdoor Lighting Permit application at the time of Building Permit. A mixed-use development proposing a commercial component shall operate between the hours from 6:00 a.m. to 10:00 p.m. to ensure that the commercial uses will not negatively impact the residential uses within the development, or any adjacent residential uses. The project also proposes that the commercial and public areas of the site will have lighting on timers that will turn off during the latest overnight hours.

The code requires that a mixed-use development shall be designed to achieve the following objectives:

1. The design shall provide for internal compatibility between the residential and nonresidential uses on the site. Pedestrian activity of the residents will be encouraged by providing interconnected access to the site's amenities (clubhouse, pocket park, pocket plaza, and commercial space) through a series of accessible sidewalks and developed on-site trails that weave through existing mature trees and forms a strong, yet natural, connection between the major functions and nodes of the project
2. Potential glare, noise, odors, traffic and other potential nuisance conditions for residents shall be minimized to allow a compatible mix of residential and nonresidential uses on the same site. The residential buildings are located away from either street frontages taking advantage of treed slopes and higher elevation to shield them from traffic, glare and noise. Commercial parking on-site is separate from residential parking and structures and civic spaces are located away from the residential structures respecting their more private character.
3. The design shall take into consideration existing and potential future uses on adjacent properties and shall include specific design features to minimize potential impacts. The site design includes all its required circulation and parking on-site. The commercial component to the site has the potential to create both economic stimulus and promote the development as a suburban activity center for the area. The proposal includes civic spaces for residents and surrounding neighborhoods. The site plan has taken into account future public improvements to street frontage along N Fourth Street and Butler Ave and for the N Fourth Street and Butler Avenue intersection planned by the city's Capital Improvements program and known as the "Butler Widening" project.
4. The design shall ensure that the residential units are of a residential character, and that appropriate privacy between residential units and other uses on the site is provided. The residential buildings are moved back, placed in the upper portion of the site, screened by trees and existing resource slopes. This places the residential buildings off the busy streets and leaves space for the multi-use features to be located where they are most needed and most accessible, by the highest volume of intended users. Clustered around the clubhouse, the residential structures are intended to provide safe and affordable homes and amenities to residents that blend natural & sustainable materials within the native terrain amid a landscape that complements the existing surrounding neighborhoods.
5. Site planning and building design shall provide for convenient pedestrian access from streets, courtyards, plazas, and walkways. Sidewalks and parkway will be added to both parcel street frontages along with a new bus stop on N Fourth Street as part of the "Butler Widening" project. Pedestrian access from these sidewalks and access from the Switzer Wash and Fourth Street Trails across the intersection will be provided as part of the N Fourth Street and Butler Avenue intersection improvements. This access all leads to a series of inter-connected site circulation sidewalks and trails leading to a pocket park, small amphitheater in a pocket plaza, the commercial building and further through the site to the residential buildings.
6. Site planning and building design shall be compatible with and enhance the adjacent and surrounding residential neighborhood in terms of building design, color, exterior materials, landscaping, lighting, roof styles, scale, and signage. Each of the building types on site, residential, commercial, and administrative, are all constructed of similar materials, in a common palette, sharing details & design elements, but each with a character unique to their own site and use. Stone veneer, wood-look siding, gabled metal roofs, and exposed wood members are all combined to exhibit an overall, unifying "theme", appropriate and responsive to the well-established traditional and historic context of Flagstaff. A suburban-scaled commercial building and civic spaces will provided residents and surrounding neighborhoods with a source of convenience and activity, adding amenities that cater to the existing neighborhood infrastructure, while placing the taller residential buildings in the less forested and gently sloped northeastern portion of the

property where residents can engage the natural beauty of the site and its surroundings. At each of the site's two entry points, a monumental sign will be located, to mark the project's presence off the major thoroughfares of N Fourth Street and of Butler Avenue and to draw the community within. A Permanent Sign Permit application will be reviewed for compliance at the time of Building Permit submittal.

There is no density limitation established for residential uses in mixed-use developments. Instead, applicable building height, parking, landscaping, etc., standards will apply to provide a control on the bulk and mass of the development and the number of residential units permitted.

Refuse and recycling areas for the collection and storage of refuse and recyclable materials shall be located on the site in locations that are convenient for both the residential and nonresidential uses. Waste will be collected and retained on-site within enclosures designed of materials integrated with the design aesthetic of the site. A single enclosure will be dedicated to collecting waste at the commercial building with space for additional rolling recycling containers for the commercial suites. Four double bin trash enclosures located nearby the residential buildings will be sized to accommodate both trash and recycling equally within each.

Mixed-use development shall be designed to provide residential uses with common or private open space, which may be in the form of roof gardens, individual balconies, or other means as approved by the Director. As shown in the building floor plans, each residential unit is provided a private exterior patio or deck. Other common open space on site for residents include the clubhouse, pool and grilling area, and along the eastern parcel line is a dog park.

II. Staff Site Plan Review

On December 23, 2019, the Inter-Department Staff (IDS) approved an application for Site Plan Review of the proposed development subject to successfully obtaining a Direct to Ordinance Zoning Map Amendment (rezoning). A copy of the application is attached to this report.

A. Zoning – City of Flagstaff Zoning Code

If this Direct to Ordinance Zoning Map Amendment request is approved, approximately 13.65 acres will be rezoned to the Highway Commercial (HC) zone. Development of the site will be conditioned to the approved site plan and a final Development Agreement. Any substantial change to the approved site plan would require a new rezoning request and further review and approvals by the Planning and Zoning Commission and City Council. The Site Plan provided includes preliminary grading plans, preliminary utility plan, resource protection plans, architectural site and amenity plans, residential and commercial building floor plans and elevations, exterior lighting plan, and preliminary landscaping plan.

i. Site Planning Standards

In accordance with Section 10-30.60.030 of the Zoning Code a site analysis was completed in conjunction with the concept plan for this project that examines the topography of the site, solar orientation, existing/native vegetation types, view corridors, climate, subsurface conditions, drainage swales and stream corridor, and the built environment and land use context. Located at 1002 N Fourth Street, the northeast corner of the intersection of N Fourth Street and Butler Avenue, the site slopes generally upward and away from the lower southwest corner of the parcel nearest the intersection to the higher northeast corner of the parcel. Potential views on the sloped site are southeast toward the Mogollon Rim and from the northeastern corner of the site north toward the San Francisco Peaks. The horizontal-mixed use development places the commercial building as close as feasible to the intersection of N Fourth Street and Butler Avenue to address building forward site design requirements. Due to the existence of the 100-year flood plain crossing at this corner of the site, the building cannot be located directly at the frontage, so pedestrian and bicycle connections are included from public sidewalks to the commercial building and adjacent civic spaces. Vehicular access to the site from N Fourth Street and Butler Avenue lead initially to the commercial/civic parking area and then on to residential parking areas.

Making use of the sloping site topography, the residential buildings are placed on the northeastern portion of the parcel, pulled back away from the intersection and commercial/civic areas of the site. This design utilizes the existing treed slopes as open natural separation between a high activity commercial center and the residential area of the site. Yet, a fully accessible sidewalk along with foot and bicycle trails across the site serve to activate that open space as an essential connection between the two land uses.

The commercial and residential structures themselves are set parallel with site topography. This minimizes foundation walls by reducing large grade changes. Retaining walls on site have been minimized in number and are to be built of split face CMU so they shall blend with the natural features of the site. The proposed on-site drives and parking areas meet required Engineering and Fire Department slopes and cross grades. On-site vegetated swales will be used along the proposed access drives to direct water away from the roadways and buildings and to maintain a natural feeling to the site. The proposal also includes a potential cross-access easement along the eastern parcel line with the neighboring school to provide a secondary emergency access to the development. This access is not a requirement from the Fire Department.

ii. Resource Protection

There is a Resource Protection Overlay zone on the subject site. The prime resource to protect under the Resource Protection Overlay zone is rural and urban floodplain. The property owner has agreed, per the approved Site Plan documents, to deed to the city the on-site portion of the flood plain. This dedication will remove hinderances to maintenance of the floodplain at that location at the requests of the Stormwater division.

There are steep slopes running east to west across the site that must be protected. The Zoning Code requires 70% of the 17-24.99% slope area to be protected. The proposed development protects 70% of these slope resources. Slopes 25-34.99% are required to be saved at an 80% rate and the proposed development protects 86% of these slopes. Slopes greater than 35% are not allowed to be disturbed and the proposal complies with this requirement.

The Zoning Code requires 30% of the tree resources on a commercially zoned site to be saved. If the rezoning to the requested Highway Commercial (HC) zone is approved, the proposal complies with the tree resource protection requirements of that zone. The Resource Protection Plans show a tree resource protection rate of 35%.

iii. Civic Space

Section 10-30.60.060.B.1.b of the Zoning Code requires developments with 50 or more dwelling units to provide a minimum of 5% of the site as Civic Space. This space must be accessible to the general public. A total of 29,730 square feet of civic space is required for this project. The site plan identifies a total of 37,670 square feet of civic space within the development (6.3% of the site area). Divided into two adjacent locations on the west of the site, the civic spaces proposed are a pocket park with a walking path and benches, and a pocket plaza constructed as an amphitheater set within the naturally sloping landscape. Together these civic spaces encourage passive and active recreational and entertainment use of the site along the western edge of the parcel. This places the civic spaces near the commercial building and the most active portion of the site, adjacent to N Fourth Street. The remainder of the parcel that is undeveloped is intended to be left in a natural state, excepting pedestrian and bicycle connections across the parcel.

iv. Pedestrian and Bicycle Circulation Systems

The applicant will be contributing funds for the parcel frontage improvements along both N Fourth Street and Butler Avenue. The city will construct the improvements as a part of the "Butler Widening" project through the Capital Improvements program. Fourth Street roadway improvements will take the existing 5 lane cross section from approximately Sparrow Avenue down to the Butler Avenue intersection. The new cross section will include 4 travel lanes, 2 bike lanes, a 6' sidewalk on the East side and a 10' FUTS on the

West side, roadway lighting, medians where cross street access allows and bus pullouts. For Butler Avenue the improvements will start at the South near the intersection of Sinagua Heights and continue to Little America. The improvements on Butler include 4 travel lanes, medians where they fit, bike lanes (protected bike lanes are being discussed) an improved and raised intersection at Fourth Street that will include crosswalks (primarily for stormwater conveyance under the roadway and to alleviate Fourth Street slopes), a new roundabout controlled intersection at Herold Ranch Road, roadway lighting, bus pullouts and continuous and full length 6' sidewalks on both sides of the road. This street frontage will be accessed by pedestrian connections from the site to the public sidewalks, FUTS and bus stops intended as part of the Capital Improvement project.

On site and connected to the above-mentioned public improvements planned as part of the "Butler Widening" project, the applicant has proposed accessible sidewalks and other more natural trails connecting the buildings, civic spaces and parking areas to each other. The commercial and residential buildings will provide exterior public bicycle racks, but in addition, each residential building will also provide secured and enclosed bicycle racks for residents. The applicant has worked with the requests of the adjacent school staff to create a pedestrian connection between the school parcel and the proposed development in order to provide convenient connection between the school and athletic fields and the proposed development for future students or staff and their families.

v. Compatibility and Architectural Design Standards

Compatibility does not mean "the same as" but rather it refers to how well a new development is sensitive to the character of existing development. The Zoning Code breaks down compatibility into three categories: Patterns of Development, Scale, and Continuity.

Patterns of Development include streetscapes, site relationships, signage, and landscape features. Due to the nature of the topography at the corner of N Fourth Street and Butler Ave and owing to the existence of a floodway across this corner of the site, the applicant has placed the commercial building as close to the existing N Fourth Street and Butler Ave frontages as feasible. From the commercial building, the development continues northeast up the hillside with the residential buildings oriented such that they sit within the existing topography, providing the least intrusive placement possible considering the limited low slope terrain on site. Signage is described to emulate the architectural aesthetics of the structures.

Scale refers to similar or harmonious proportions, overall height and width, the visual intensity of the development, and the building massing. The development places the proposed structures on the flattest portions of the site and orients the structures such that they minimize their impact on the hillside topography while using existing mature ponderosa pine tree resources to shield the residential structures from view of other surrounding development. The residential structures and clubhouse propose pitched roofs, cantilevered projections, exposed wood bracketry and symmetrical elevations akin to traditional surrounding suburban construction and architectural composition. The commercial building presents asymmetrical elevations, and varying height parapet and pitched roofs to distinguish suite entries that also compliments its setting. These differences and similarities between commercial and residential appearance indicate consideration within the design concept for the development that is proportionate in size and character to the site, surrounding neighborhoods, the greater community and regional plan Activity Center distinction.

Continuity encompasses patterns of development and scale, but also site development, building forms, texture, materials, details, and colors. As further discussed in the Community Character review under the Regional Plan, the building exteriors are in a style compatible with the Flagstaff area, and they harken to and enhance the appearance of suburban development in the community. The commercial and residential buildings all express four-sided architecture and exterior colors and finishes will complement the natural surroundings utilizing traditional architectural materials such as lapped siding, stone veneer, and metal roofing. The residential and

commercial buildings use many of the same finishes to clad forms appropriate to their different uses. This develops individual identity between site uses but expresses similar patterns of development across the site. The preservation of native pines in and around the buildings adds to the quintessential natural Flagstaff look.

vi. Landscaping

Landscaping plans are not required in conjunction with a Direct to Ordinance Zoning Map Amendment. The applicant provided a conceptual landscaping plan, showing all landscape areas and tree locations. The conceptual plan generally meets the requirements of parking lot landscaping, street buffer landscaping, building foundation, peripheral buffer landscaping and native seeding or retention of native state for unused areas of the site found within Section 10-50.60 of the Zoning Code. A final Landscape Plan will be reviewed for compliance and approval at the time of Civil Set Permit submittal.

vii. Outdoor Lighting

Outdoor lighting plans are not required in conjunction with a Direct to Ordinance Zoning Map Amendment. The developer provided a conceptual outdoor lighting plan. The subject property is located within Lighting Zone III and is allowed a total of 100,000 lumens per acre. A final Outdoor Lighting Permit application will be reviewed for compliance at the time of Building Permit submittal.

viii. Parking

As a mixed-use project, the development is required to meet the parking requirements of each proposed land use, specifically, commercial retail and market rate multifamily housing. The applicant has elected to not utilize any parking reductions relating to the Affordable Housing component of the proposal. Based on the proposed uses, the project is required to provide a total of 395 parking spaces as seen in the calculations below.

Required Parking Calculations:

Commercial parking spaces (1 per 300 SF): 6,000 SF /300 SF =	20 spaces
Residential parking spaces - Multi-family: 2 bedrm units: 2.0 spaces x 64 units =	128 spaces
1 bedrm units: 1.5 spaces x 124 units =	186 spaces
Studio units: 1.25 spaces x 36 units =	45 spaces
<u>Guest spaces: 0.25 spaces x 64 units =</u>	<u>16 spaces</u>
Total Required	395 spaces

The development will be located within a quarter mile of a bus stop included as part of the Capital Improvements intersection “Butler Widening” project. Due to this proximity, the applicant has been allowed a 10% reduction in the number of required parking spaces per code section 10-50.80.060.A. The Zoning Code also allows a reduction in standard parking spaces by providing bicycle spaces. Code section 10-50.80.060.F states that a reduction of one required motor vehicle parking space for each four bicycle parking spaces provided is allowed to a maximum of five percent of the required motor vehicle parking spaces. Section 10-50.80.060.E of the zoning code also allows the number of parking spaces required for a new development may be reduced up to five percent if existing native trees such as ponderosa pine trees are located within parking areas and these trees are required to be preserved. Adequate measures must be taken during construction to ensure that these trees are protected from construction activity. The three proposed reductions equate to an overall 20% reduction in on-site parking requirements.

Parking Reductions:

Transit (10% reduction)	-39.5 spaces
Bicycle Parking (5% reduction)	-19.75 spaces
<u>Tree Resource (5% reduction)</u>	<u>-19.75 spaces</u>
Total Reduction 20%	-79 spaces

After computing the allowed reductions, the project is to provide 316 on-site parking spaces.

Total Parking Required After Reduction: 316 spaces

The Zoning Code also permits a reduction in the number of standard parking spaces with the inclusion of motorcycle parking. Code section 10-50.80.060.G states that a reduction of one parking space for multifamily residential and nonresidential uses may be allowed if one motorcycle parking space for every 25 required motor vehicle spaces is provided, subject to the following standards: 1) Each motorcycle space shall be easily accessible and have adequate space for a standard-size motorcycle, i.e., a minimum dimension of four feet by nine feet, and 2) Motorcycle parking areas shall be clearly identified with appropriate striping. The proposed development may provide up to 16 motorcycle parking based on the calculation shown below. In addition, the applicant provides two additional spaces near the commercial portion of the development. These two additional parking spaces may not be counted towards the required number of parking spaces.

Motorcycle parking spaces: $395 \text{ required standard spaces} / 25 = 16 \text{ motorcycle spaces}$ -

Based on the proposed uses and reductions, the project provides a total of 329 parking spaces as seen in the calculations below.

Provided Parking:

Commercial parking spaces: 23 standard spaces and 2 motorcycle spaces
(16 spaces min. required)

Residential parking spaces: 288 standard spaces and 16 motorcycle spaces = 304 total spaces
(300 spaces min. required)

In addition to vehicle parking, the zoning code requires bicycle parking per code section 10-50.80.050, which states that two bicycle parking spaces, or five percent of required off-street parking spaces, whichever is greater, are required for all uses other than single-family residential uses.

Required Bicycle Parking:

Commercial:	$20 \text{ standard spaces} \times 0.05 = 1 < 2$	2 bicycle spaces, 6 bicycle spaces proposed
Residential:	$375 \text{ standard spaces} \times 0.05 = 18.75$	19 bicycle spaces, 24 bicycle spaces proposed

In addition to the required outdoor bicycle parking, the applicant is proposing to include secure indoor bicycle storage racks available to residents at each apartment building. Each apartment building will supply (20) of such bicycle storage lockers, each with a (2) bicycle capacity. Therefore, each building will provide a total of (40) indoor spaces for a total of 160 additional bicycle spaces for resident use.

ix. Historic/Cultural Resources

A Cultural Resource Letter Report was completed for the subject property on March 25, 2019. The report states that no archaeological or historic resources were observed on the property and that there are no expected impacts to historic properties or significant cultural resources from the proposed undertaking. The recommendations of the report are that there are no expected impacts to historic properties or significant cultural resources from the proposed undertaking and that the proposed project proceed with no further cultural resource work. The report was reviewed and approved by staff under Heritage Preservation case number PZ-19-00071 on April 17, 2019.

B. Public Systems Impact Analysis

i. **Traffic/Right-of-Way Impact**

A Traffic Impact Analysis was performed for this project and completed October 29, 2019. The study area included the intersections of N Fourth St at Sparrow, Soliere, and Huntington/Industrial. The analysis determined that the proposed development will have a relatively low impact on the adjacent facilities. The analysis shows that the resultant increase in the peak hour volumes, will not degrade the levels-of-service beyond the background level in 2020 opening year. There will be a minor increase in intersection delays as a result of the additional volumes as illustrated in the analysis. The analysis also looked at the both access driveways and determined that a northbound right turn auxiliary lane is required at the access driveway on N Fourth Street; the recommended storage length is 100' plus applicable deceleration taper. Additionally, construction of a southbound left turn lane on N. Fourth Street at the access driveway is required. Due to the proximity of the other driveways in the area, this turn lane will be "2-way center left turn" type. A significant portion of the required pavement already exists so minimal widening is required.

In lieu of constructing the required frontage improvements (curb, gutter, sidewalk, and additional pavement) along the development frontages N Fourth Street and Butler Avenue, the developer is required to pay the estimated cost of these improvements to the City. The cost of these improvements and timing of payments are addressed on the project's Development Agreement. The estimate cost shall also include the cost of the right turn lane. The City will use the funds for the "Butler Widening" project that will widen Butler from Sinagua Heights to Little America and Fourth St. across the entire frontage of this development. This project is scheduled for design phase in Spring 2021 with construction funding allocated in FY 22 – 25.

The TIA was further used to determine a proportional share cost from this development for constructing a permanent traffic signal at N Fourth Street and Butler Avenue as the existing signal is only a temporary signal. The cost of the improvements, including the project's proportional share of the proposed stop light and timing of payments at N Fourth Street and Butler Avenue is established within the Development Agreement for the project.

ii. **Water and Wastewater Impact**

A Water and Sewer Impact Analysis (WSIA) was completed by the City on November 30, 2018. The proposed development is located within the City of Flagstaff urban growth boundary and can be served by City water and sewer utilities. Currently there is no infrastructure in the ground on-site to support this development, so all on-site sewer and water systems will have to be designed and built. No off-site water or sewer improvements will be required. However, the target parcel is required to pay a proportional share of the John Wesley Powell Improvement District Waterline Concept Estimate, per Engineering program Capital Improvements memorandum dated May 24, 2016, and addressed in the project Development Agreement. It is the developer's responsibility to design and construct all on-site and connecting water infrastructure per the City of Flagstaff Engineering Standards.

Water

There is an existing 12" water line in a public utility easement along the Fourth Street frontage, an existing 18" water line in a public utility easement along Butler Ave frontage and an 8" water line within a public utility easement on the adjacent eastward parcel. The developer plans to loop new 8" water lines across the site in a shared public utility easement with sewer lines below parking areas and site driveways from each residential structure, the club house and the commercial structure to these existing water lines. Extending waterlines in the right-of-way shall be done according to City of Flagstaff Standards.

Wastewater

There is an existing 8" sewer line within the Fourth Street Right of Way along the western edge of the parcel. The developer plans to extend new 8" sewer lines across the site in a shared public utility easement with

water lines below parking areas and site driveways. The commercial structure will connect to the existing 8” sewer line further south on Fourth St, avoiding encroachment on the FEMA floodplain. Tapping the sewer line in the easement and constructing the sewer in the right-of-way shall be done according to City of Flagstaff Standards.

iii. **Stormwater Analysis**

The project’s overarching drainage concept is to provide peak flow stormwater discharge mitigation (detention), partial stormwater runoff volume mitigation (LID ROCV) and improvement to the water quality of site discharges (LID) and onsite stormwater conveyance improvements. Development of the site will meet the peak flow mitigation, total volume mitigation and water quality requirements using surface water storage systems classified as extended detention basins (EDB), which consist of a detention and a retention storage capacity as well as filtration components. As part of the rezoning request a Drainage Impact Analysis (DIA) is required. The approved DIA was prepared by Larson Engineering, Inc. and is dated September 17, 2019. The intent is to determine any potential adverse downstream drainage impacts and to identify mitigation options. The project is providing on-site volume mitigation required by the DIA to remove any volumetric increases in stormwater runoff from the site. The total volume of stormwater runoff discharged from the site will be mitigated by the retention volume provided within the aforementioned EDB’s. Water quality improvements consisting of sediment capture components will be incorporated with the use of Low Impact Development (LID) Integrated Management Practices (IMPs) including sediment traps at inlets to any surface storage systems, and filtration system located within the EBDs. The project will provide the attenuation required to reduce the post development peak runoff to the pre-development rates for the 10-year and 100-year storms.

Per these requirements the developer will mitigate the potential for downstream impacts. Based on the proposed site mitigation measures, the project will not have any additional impacts to the downstream drainage conditions.

III. **Direct to Ordinance Zoning Map Amendment**

An application for a Direct to Ordinance Zoning Map Amendment shall be submitted to the Planning Director and shall be reviewed and a recommendation prepared. The Planning Director’s recommendation shall be transmitted to the Planning and Zoning Commission in the form of a staff report prior to a scheduled public hearing. The recommendation shall include: an evaluation of the consistency and conformance of the proposed amendment with the goals and policies of the General Plan and any applicable specific plans; the grounds for the recommendation based on the standards and purposes of the zones set forth in Section 10-40.20 (Establishment of Zones) of the Zoning Code; and, whether the amendment should be granted, granted with conditions to mitigate anticipated impacts caused by the proposed development, or denied.

Direct to Ordinance Zoning Map Amendments shall be evaluated based on the following findings:

A. **Finding #1:**

The proposed amendment must be found to be consistent with and in conformance with the goals and policies of the General Plan and any applicable specific plans. If the application is not consistent with the General Plan, and any other applicable specific plan, the applicable plan must be amended in compliance with the procedures established in Chapter 11-10 of the City Code (Title 11: General Plans and Subdivisions) prior to considering the proposed amendment.

i. **General Plan/Flagstaff Regional Plan (FRP 2030) Process and Analysis Summary**

When staff performs a Regional Plan (the “Plan”) analysis, staff reviews all maps, text, and goals and policies to determine which are the most relevant in relation to the proposed application. The Plan’s Future Growth Illustration on Maps 21 and 22 (same map; one is regional scale and one city scale) and the text of the Plan

provide supplemental information for the interpretation of goals and policies. In the case of any conflict between the Future Growth Illustration and the Plan's goals and policies, the goals and policies will prevail. The Future Growth Illustration has two types of land use designations: "Area Types" describe the place-making context of Urban, Suburban, Rural, or Employment, and "Place Types" such as activity centers, corridors, and neighborhoods which provide the framework for the density, intensities, and mix of uses within the area types.

Staff has identified that the subject property is designated as Future Suburban area type and is located within a Regional Suburban Activity Center (S18) place type on the Plan's Future Growth Illustration, Map 22. Characteristics of a Regional Suburban Activity Center include larger, mixed-use projects located at the commercial core of the activity center with access of large residential developments. Within this commercial core regional to community-wide scale commercial retail, restaurants, and residential land uses are expected as part of mixed-use development. Regional scale activity centers should provide connected pedestrian and bicycle infrastructure across the site and to public transit stops. Rural Suburban Activity centers also anticipate a density of 14+ units per acre (the proposal provides 16 units per acre) and public civic spaces that are place-making. Rezoning the parcel to Highway Commercial (HC) and stipulating that rezoning on the proposed Site Plan will introduce just such a mixed-use development into the commercial core of this Regional Activity Center.

ii. **Applicable General Plan Goals and Policies**

As part of its review, staff identified relevant Regional Plan Goals and Policies that could be applied to support or not support the proposed Zoning Map Amendment. These goals and policies are located within the applicant's narrative. The following is a discussion of how the project generally meets or conflicts with goals and policies in each chapter. Staff believes that the proposal is consistent with the goals and policies of the Flagstaff Regional Plan 2030.

a. **Environmental Planning & Conservation (Air Quality, Climate Change and Adaptation, Dark Skies, Ecosystem Health, Environmentally Sensitive Lands, Natural Quiet, Soils, and Wildlife)**

Policy E&C.2.1. encourages the reduction of all energy consumption, especially fossil-fuel generated energy, and all the proposed apartment units will be furnished with high efficiency electric appliances, avoiding the average higher cost of natural gas and reducing emissions from the burning of natural gas for heating. Other energy reduction methods such as low-flush toilets, high efficiency dish & clothes washers, energy efficient lighting and water conserving sink faucets & shower heads will be installed to actively reduce water and energy usage throughout the entire project. Water demand will be further reduced by using landscaping only native to the region, addressing Policy E&C 6.8, without the need for an installed irrigation system to grow, sustain and thrive. Policy E&C.9.2. instructs construction projects to employ strategies to minimize disturbed area, soil compaction, soil erosion, and destruction of vegetation. Re-zoning of this parcel would allow the apartment buildings to be taller and disturb less of the slopes on the site. This higher site efficiency will yield more open space for nature trails, protecting soils, leaving native wildlife habitats and vegetation unaltered and not disturbing more natural areas. The commercial and public areas of the site will have lighting on timers that will turn off during the latest overnight hours in line with Goal E&C.5. to preserve dark skies as an unspoiled natural resource and core element of community character.

b. **Open Space (Natural Resources and Open Space, Open Space Planning, Applying an Open Space Plan)**

Policy OS.1.5 encourages the integration of open space qualities into the built environment. The development includes meandering trails with benches within a pocket park, connecting to a central pathway through the undisturbed forested areas at the center of the parcel, opening towards other existing trails within Flagstaff's developed interconnected system (FUTS). The existing landscape will serve to buffer these natural amenities from the apartment buildings higher up and further back on the parcel addressing aspects of Policy OS.1.4 to use open space to interact with and enjoy nature. This will also screen the taller buildings and make the commercial and public spaces more natural and inviting. Staff has therefore concluded that the rezoning will increase the quality of the open space provided to the general public and commercial customers of the

site. The proposed rezoning to Highway Commercial (HC) zone allows for a mixed-use project design incorporating open spaces intended for use by members of the entire community.

c. Water Resources (Water Sources, Water Demand, Stormwater and Watershed Management, and Water Quality)

Part of the site sits within the 100-year flood plan, which will be deeded to the City for continued improvement and long-term maintenance. Policy WR5.1 seeks such protections for existing natural watercourse corridors. In an effort to meet Goal WR.5 to manage watersheds and stormwater and water quality, environmental protections, The landscape concept for the development aims to support the City's long-term goals to encourage low-impact design principles and responsible development through the use of native and regionally-adapted plant materials, passive water harvesting techniques, preservation of natural vegetation and slope areas, and the engagement of public spaces and nature. The project went through several iterations early in the design process to ensure that the access points and buildings minimized their impacts to the drainages and the steep slopes to address staff comments for protection of the water courses. The final design reflects the incorporation of staff comments on this topic from the Current Planning staff and Stormwater Division. Additionally, to improve the quality and reduce the need for additional water utility demand, all the structure's grading divert water away and into the landscaped areas to create a passive rainwater system.

d. Efficient Use of Energy Goals and Policies

The Regional Plan Policy E.1.4 promotes cost-effective, energy-efficient technologies and design in all new buildings for residential construction. The project proposes using smart and green building practices throughout, high efficiency all electric appliances and equipment to promote cost-effective energy usage. This contributes to the project's commitment to using the most energy efficient practices during the life-cycle of the building. Regarding Policy E1.5 which promotes energy efficient modes of transportation, the project includes proposed resident bicycle storage areas, an electric vehicle charging station and infrastructure for future charging expansion, and provides connection to on and off-site pedestrian, bicycle, and public transit access. Also, the adopted Building Code requires that new commercial and residential structures be designed and constructed as "solar ready", meaning that they include determination of location for and electrical infrastructure to include solar systems at a later date.

e. Community Character (Scenic Resources and Natural Setting, Heritage Preservation, Community Design, and Arts, Sciences and Education)

Pursuing Policy CC1.2 and CC.3 initiatives, the site's proposed arrangement will encourage visits to the public and commercial areas of the site from the surrounding neighborhood residents via bus, bicycle, or by walking through the City's established sidewalk or FUTS pathways. The commercial center is planned to be as close as the drainage pattern on the site allows to the busier intersection of N Fourth Street and Butler Avenue, while the residential buildings are moved back, closer to the adjacent school and athletic fields, removed from the vehicle traffic of the intersection. Remaining spaces are left open and in their mostly natural state. The proposal incorporates Goal CC.4.3 by locating the mixed-use development in the commercial core of the activity center where most needed and most accessible by the highest volume of intended users. In accordance with Policy CC3.2, all buildings will use materials common in appearance to those traditionally used in Flagstaff, at a scale proportional to the buildings themselves and to the context of the surrounding neighborhood. Exposed timber trusses and wood brackets recessed under cross gabled metal seam roofs follow the traditional forms found in the historic homes within Flagstaff. The proposed civic spaces, address Policy CC5.3 encourages integration of public art into development and via the proposed amphitheater, public art and performances would be encouraged and the space activated. The amphitheater adds a placemaking element to the activity center. The closest civic space of similar size and use is more than ½ mile away. This site will therefore expand the availability of civic space to a new area.

f. Growth Areas & Land Use (Reinvestment, Greenfield, Urban Area, Suburban Area, Rural Area, Employment Area, Special Planning Area, and Activity Centers)

The proposed parcel is in a Suburban Activity Center, envisioned to be a node of denser, mixed-use activities: housing, commercial buildings, parks, and civic spaces grouped at connected points spaced throughout Flagstaff. Classified as a “Regional scale” activity center, this area is encouraged toward higher-density projects to support and fulfill goals such as LU.1 and LU3.1 to invest in existing neighborhoods and activity centers for purposes of developing complete and connected places. Currently on the project’s corner is an undeveloped forested space, with residential housing, a school, athletic fields and more undeveloped land adjacent to it, none of which actively rounds out the character of a regional scale suburban activity center. The project seeks to develop some of the future activity center elements, while addressing the transition of scale and character with the existing neighborhood context, aligning with Policy LU.6.3 to encourage mixed-use neighborhoods in appropriate locations. The project is located just over (3) miles away from downtown, and less than a mile from other commercial activities developing along historic Route 66, near to Foxglenn Park, and the Flagstaff Aquaplex recreation center; all reachable by public bus, walking or by bicycle along existing sidewalks and FUTS trail. At the request of the school superintendent, there will be a direct connection from the development to Sinagua Middle School for students and staff to use if they live there. This exemplifies the prioritization of walking, biking and driving connectivity emphasized in Policy LU.13.1 with surrounding neighborhoods. It will also create a safer and more direct route to and from the school. The goal of this in-fill project is to provide quality, affordable housing for a variety of residents and their families, set within a connected series of spaces for activity, business growth, employment, entertainment and the enjoyment of nature. The mixed-use project looks to Policies such as LU18.6 and LU18.7 as indicators supporting location of commercial space at the heart of the activity center with increased density. With a mix of housing options, commercial services, accessibility of nearby employment opportunities, developed civic space, and open natural spaces this project seeks to provide a variety of scales and uses. This concept is in-line with Policy LU.18.9 to appropriately plan activity centers to their prospective regional or neighborhood scale. Additionally, the proposed affordable housing units addresses Policy LU.18.4 to provide activity centers with various price points in multi-family housing.

g. Transportation (Mobility and Access, Safe and Efficient Multimodal Transportation, Environmental Considerations, Quality Design, Pedestrian Infrastructure, Bicycle Infrastructure, Transit, Automobile, Passenger Rail and Rail Freight, Air Travel, and Public Support for Transportation)

Existing plans for upgrades to the 4th Street and Butler Avenue intersection are being accommodated in the proposed design for access to and from this project, and through a development agreement, part of the associated costs will come from the project’s developers. The site is located along the permanent transit network for the Flagstaff NAIPTA bus system. The developers are working with the public bus service to add a new bus stop as part of the project site or within 1/4 mile of the development. These contributions are consistent with Goals T3.3 and T.7 regarding development of land uses that enhance and protect the quality of the activity center and enhance alternative transportation means across the city. The project’s location is ideal for bicycle enthusiasts, as it is amid and connected to Flagstaff’s established & interconnected system of paths and walks. In addition to bicycle racks located adjacent to each of the buildings in the development, residents have access to fully enclosed & secure bicycle lockers, (20) located at each apartment building, with a capacity for (2) bicycles each, far exceeding minimum’s required by city codes, an aspect of the project on point with Policy T.6.4. which encourages bikeways and bicycle infrastructure to serve the needs of a full range of bicyclist experience levels. Walkable on-site paths and trails connections to the pocket park, pocket plaza and amphitheater, and commercial building, before connecting to the existing walks along Butler Avenue and N Fourth Streets. The system of trails allows for persons to traverse the entire length of the site, to points close to and convenient to existing FUTS trails to the north and south addressing desires of Goal T.5 to increase pedestrian infrastructure as an element of a safe and livable community. Impacts of the project’s future residents on the existing local traffic patterns have been studied and compiled into a comprehensive and approved Traffic Impact Analysis as requested in Policy T.11.1.

h. Cost of Development

Goal CD.1 seeks among other things, enhancements of existing infrastructure and Policy CD.1.5 requires that development pay for a fair and rough proportional share of public infrastructure. A Development Agreement for the project will establish such proportional shares and infrastructure upgrades assessed to the parcel for utility and traffic infrastructure improvements. See section IV below for further information.

j. Neighborhoods, Housing, and Urban Conservation

In line with policy NH1.3 rezoning the parcel allows for the mixed-use aspects of this development to round out and fill in with the needed activities, services and natural open spaces that define a suburban activity zone for the entire neighborhood. The proposal provides a mix of higher density development to bring increased levels of diverse activity into the neighborhood. A portion of the units will be made available to lower-income residents, consistent with Policy NH3.5 and features such as central elevators in each apartment building address PolicyNH4.3 with a forward-thinking design which will allow for any unit in the residential buildings to be fitted for persons with disabilities. Though frontage improvements will be a part of the City's Capital improvements project, the development has designed (accessible) sidewalk paths connecting each of the buildings and clubhouse throughout the site to other activity areas of the bus stop, city sidewalks, the commercial building, the pocket park and the amphitheater in effort to comply with Policy NH1.3 to interconnect existing and new neighborhoods with complete streets, sidewalks and trails. Following the intentions of Goal NH.1 to foster and maintain healthy and diverse suburban neighborhoods, the project uses modern and durable exterior materials that mimic wood siding and rough-cut stone within traditional forms and details common to Flagstaff and the region.

k. Economic Development

The Project's contribution to the Suburban Activity Center and development of vacant parcel are discussed above. The project helps achieve Goal ED.8: to promote the continued physical and economic viability of the region's commercial districts by focusing investment on existing and new activity centers. The target market for the residential buildings are working individuals and families, within, or seeking to join, the Flagstaff community. The commercial building will pursue tenants appropriate for the surrounding residential neighborhoods.

l. Non-Conformance to Regional Goals and Policies

The proposal does not conform to Goal LU.13 and Policy LU.13.7 from Growth Areas and Land Use chapter 9 to develop employment uses in activity centers. While the development will bring some employment opportunities to the activity center, for the permanent on-site office and maintenance staff and for the commercial properties, the parcel will not be developed as an employment center. The proposal does not include an active rainwater harvesting system as referenced in Goal WR.3 and Policy WR.3.4 opting instead to rely on a landscape design strategy utilizing only drought-resistant native plant species to place a zero demand on the water supply of the site. As well, regarding Energy Goal E.2 and Policy E.2.4, The applicant has elected not to include solar energy production at this time but per the Building Code requirements, all buildings will be constructed and wired to accommodate future solar projects.

B. Finding #2

To meet the finding the proposed amendment must be determined not to be detrimental to the public interest, health, safety, convenience, or welfare of the City of Flagstaff (the "City"); and will add to the public good as described in the General Plan.

The applicant identifies this project as a horizontal mixed-use development including commercial retail building and multi-family housing. Along with committing to providing 10% Affordable Housing units, the proposal provides intensified density, supports community interaction, conserves site resources and provides commercial opportunity; all in keeping with an indicated Suburban Activity Center. The proposed project facilitates efficient use of the current

July 1, 2020

commercial and transportation corridors and contributes to the stability of an active and growing suburban neighborhood. The required civic space also provides passive and active recreation and entertainment in keeping with the surrounding community. The proposal offers increased density to meet the Regional scale designation of the Activity Center while providing new and appropriately scaled commercial and civic uses to serve the surrounding suburban neighborhoods.

C. Finding #3

To meet the finding the affected site must be determined to be physically suitable in terms of design, location, shape, size, operating characteristics; and the provision of public and emergency vehicle access, public services, and utilities to ensure that the requested zone designation and the proposed or anticipated uses and/or development will not endanger, jeopardize, or otherwise constitute a hazard to the property or improvements in the vicinity in which the property is located.

Staff believes that the proposed application meets this finding. The Inter-Division Staff reviewed the application and concluded that the site was suitable for the proposed development. The IDS team based its conclusion on the review of all applicable codes and requirements as well as impact analysis for the site. Any potential impacts were mitigated by the applicant and cash-in-lieu payments are being made as a proportional contribution to the area's public improvements.

IV. DEVELOPMENT AGREEMENT

A draft development agreement has been prepared and continues to be negotiated throughout the review of this project. The primary purpose of this agreement is to set out roles and responsibilities in regard to the administration of the Affordable Housing units, in-lieu costs for frontage improvements, a proportional share of the new N Fourth Street/ Butler Avenue intersection stop light, proportional fees associated with JW Powell Improvement District secondary water source estimated costs, and clarifying the developer's requirements regarding the degree of interior finish and MP&E completion for the commercial building (vanilla shell, as defined in the agreement).

V. CITIZEN PARTICIPATION

Public hearings before the Planning and Zoning Commission and City Council are conducted in conjunction with requests for Direct to Ordinance Zoning Map Amendments. In accordance with State Statute, notice of the public hearing was provided by placing an ad in the Daily Sun, posting notices on the property, and mailing a notice to all property owners within 1,000 feet (exceeding the minimum of 300 feet) of the site excluding rights-of-way.

The applicant held two neighborhood meetings regarding this case.

The first meeting was held on October 29, 2019 at 5:30 pm. The meeting was held at the Sinagua Middle School Auditorium, located at 3950 East Butler Avenue in Flagstaff. Per the sign-in sheets, eight (8) individuals attended the meeting. A Neighborhood Meeting Report, attached, was prepared in response to the questions, comments and concerns presented. The meeting began with an introduction of the proposed development by the Applicant, with an overview of the development's components and design. In an open question and answer style interaction, the Applicant encouraged attendees' questions or comments regarding of any comments or concerns about the proposed development, which were then discussed with the group. Comment/contact cards were also made available and copies are included with the Neighborhood Meeting Report.

In general, the major themes of questions asked at the neighborhood meetings include the overall height of the proposed residential buildings, the additional traffic that an increase in density would yield, and questions concerning timing of the proposed construction and the city's redevelopment of the existing roadways. In response to the height issue the developer indicated that the proposed structures are no taller than existing trees that will remain in site and therefore would block no more view than the existing landscape. Traffic issues, via the Traffic Impact Study have been addressed regarding potential impacts and increases to traffic from the proposal. The developer has agreed to

July 1, 2020

pay in-lieu fees for the frontage improvements and they will be included as part of the city's infrastructure redevelopment. Fee payments shall be made prior to the issuance of any construction permits. Another topic questioned was the intended target market for the commercial structure and the apartments. The developer replied that at the time of the meeting the commercial space did not have any prospective tenants, and that the apartments are intended for "workforce" housing, such as visiting professors and medical professionals, not student housing as referenced by meeting attendees.

The second meeting was held on December 19, 2019 at 6:00pm. The meeting was held at the Flagstaff Aquaplex, located at 1702 North Fourth Street in Flagstaff. Per the sign-in sheets, two (2) individuals attended the meeting. A Neighborhood Meeting Report, attached, was prepared in response to the questions, comments and concerns presented. The meeting was conducted in the same manner as the first meeting.

Four emails from the public have been received regarding this proposed development as of the writing of this report. They are included as attachments to this report. The emails express concerns over the height of the proposed four-story apartments, the project's impact on traffic in the area, and an increase in density based on the rezoning. Comments note concern that the buildings will affect views from surrounding areas and that surrounding developments have been limited to 3-stories. The emails argue that the development will contribute negatively to perceived heavy traffic in the area and at the intersection.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends the Planning and Zoning Commission, in accordance with the findings presented in this report, forward the Direct to Ordinance Zoning Map Amendment request to the City Council with a recommendation for approval of case PZ-18-00205-03, subject to the following five conditions which will be included into the zoning map amendment ordinance:

1. The subject property must be developed in accordance with the approved Site Plan and the conditions of approval dated December 23, 2019. Modifications (other than minor modifications) to the approved site plan will require an amendment to this Direct to Ordinance Zoning Map Amendment request.
2. All other requirements of the Zoning Code and other City codes, ordinances and regulations, shall be met by the proposed development.
3. All terms, conditions, and restrictions detailed within the "Development Agreement Flagstaff at Fourth, LLC" must be fully satisfied.
4. The Developer's failure to obtain certificate of occupancy for the entirety of the Project within five (5) years of the effective date of the rezoning ordinance shall entitle the City, in its sole discretion, to conduct a public hearing for the purpose of reverting the Highway Commercial (HC) zoning on the Property to its former zoning classification of Medium Density Residential (MR), in accordance with Arizona Revised Statutes § 9-462.01.
5. The project shall meet the steep slope protection standards indicated in Zoning Code table 10-50.90.050A

Attachments:

- Area Context Map
- Application
- Project Narrative and Flagstaff Regional Plan 2030 Analysis
- Approved Site Plans
- Citizen Participation Plan and Meeting Report
- Legal Notice
- Emails from the public