

## MINUTES

### 1. Call to Order

Mayor Evans called the Work Session of the Flagstaff City Council held April 30, 2019, to order at 6:00 p.m.

#### **NOTICE OF OPTION TO RECESS INTO EXECUTIVE SESSION**

*Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the City Council and to the general public that, at this work session, the City Council may vote to go into executive session, which will not be open to the public, for legal advice and discussion with the City's attorneys for legal advice on any item listed on the following agenda, pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(3).*

### 2. Pledge of Allegiance and Mission Statement

The Council and audience recited the pledge of allegiance and Councilmember Aslan read the Mission Statement of the City of Flagstaff.

#### **MISSION STATEMENT**

*The mission of the City of Flagstaff is to protect and enhance the quality of life for all.*

### 3. **ROLL CALL**

*NOTE: One or more Councilmembers may be in attendance telephonically or by other technological means.*

PRESENT:

ABSENT:

MAYOR EVANS  
VICE MAYOR SHIMONI  
COUNCILMEMBER ASLAN  
COUNCILMEMBER MCCARTHY  
COUNCILMEMBER ODEGAARD  
COUNCILMEMBER SALAS  
COUNCILMEMBER WHELAN

Others present: City Manager Barbara Goodrich; City Attorney Sterling Solomon

#### **4. Public Participation**

*Public Participation enables the public to address the council about items that are not on the prepared agenda. Public Participation appears on the agenda twice, at the beginning and at the end of the work session. You may speak at one or the other, but not both. Anyone wishing to comment at the meeting is asked to fill out a speaker card and submit it to the recording clerk. When the item comes up on the agenda, your name will be called. You may address the Council up to three times throughout the meeting, including comments made during Public Participation. Please limit your remarks to three minutes per item to allow everyone to have an opportunity to speak. At the discretion of the Chair, ten or more persons present at the meeting and wishing to speak may appoint a representative who may have no more than fifteen minutes to speak.*

Dennis Lavin addressed Council with concerns about the City's unfunded pension liability.

Community Investment and Redevelopment Manager David McIntire introduced Tyler Lineer, the winner of the City's first Innovate Waste Challenge, which was a partnership between Economic Development and Sustainability.

Marketing and Media Relations Manager Lorri Pappas addressed Council stating that the week of May 5, 2019 is National Tourism Week and invited Council to participate in the various activities being offered.

#### **5. Review of Draft Agenda for the May 7, 2019 City Council Meeting**

*Citizens wishing to speak on agenda items not specifically called out by the City Council may submit a speaker card for their items of interest to the recording clerk.*

Councilmember Odegaard requested the NAIPTA PowerPoint presentation for item 14A be sent to Council in advance of the meeting.

#### **6. Recognition in memory of past Tourism Commission Chairperson, Debbi Grogan**

The City Council, Convention and Visitors Bureau employees, and members of the Tourism Commission gathered at the dais and provided a recognition to past Tourism Commission Chairperson Debbi Grogan. Convention and Visitors Bureau Director Trace Ward presented Ms. Grogan's family with a plaque dedicating a conference room at the Milligan House in her honor.

#### **7. Council Business Listening Tour - Tourism Sector**

Mr. Ward addressed the Council stating that this quarter's Council Business Listening Tour is focusing on the tourism sector. He introduced Bonnie Bouschet with the Flagstaff Mall, Uli Hauck from Eagle Rider, Linda Apple from Single Speed Café, and Daniel Adams from Lowell Observatory.

Ms. Bouschet provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

FLAGSTAFF MALL  
CHALLENGES  
COMMUNITY PARTNER  
MALL EVENTS  
PRODUCT DEMONSTRATIONS/SAMPLING, DISPLAYS, TOURS  
REDEVELOPMENT 2019/20

PLANET FITNESS – COMING SOON!  
STARBUCKS – COMING SOON!  
PHASE 2 – ENTERTAINMENT 2020  
LET’S KEEP OUR TAX DOLLARS LOCAL!

Vice Mayor Shimoni asked if there has been any discussion about utilizing the mall parking lot more strategically. Ms. Bouschet indicated that they have been reaching out to community partners to make them aware of the opportunities available for the use of their lots.

The Council thanked Ms. Bouschet for her presentation and expressed excitement for the plans at the mall.

Mr. Hauck provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

EAGLERIDER FLAGSTAFF  
INTRODUCTION  
COMPANY  
OWNER  
WHAT WE DO  
ESTABLISHED  
TEAM  
CHALLENGE  
SUCCESS  
LET’S IGNITE YOUR EXPERIENCE

Vice Mayor Shimoni asked how many clients a week are renting vehicles. Mr. Hauck indicated that it is around 300 with a majority coming from Europe, with France, Germany and Spain being the top three.

Council thanked Mr. Hauck for his presentation and the efforts his business makes to keeping Route 66 alive.

Linda Apple with Single Speed Café addressed Council offering that they have been in business for just over two years. They have 14 employees plus herself. Single Speed Café handcrafts all of their drinks and are known for their excellent coffee and homemade food. Their mission is for every person who walks out the door leaves a little happier than when they arrived. To facilitate a culture of community, they participate in as many community events as possible. Some of the challenges they have with operating their business in Flagstaff is reaching the local market; being new and the rising cost of business requires them to bring in more customers. She offered that she is excited to work with the City to continue promoting Flagstaff as a vibrant place to discover and increase visitation.

Vice Mayor Shimoni offered that he enjoys the space at Single Speed Café and commented on the friendliness of the employees. He noted that their social media presence is great and encouraged them to continue utilizing that platform.

Councilmember Odegaard thanked Ms. Apple for her commitment to sustainability and utilizing reusable dishes both in the café and also in their catering.

Councilmember Whelan expressed appreciation for their service minded philosophy of running the business and offered that the space is great for meeting with people.

Councilmember Salas indicated that Single Speed Café is an excellent example of an independent business. She also thanked Ms. Apple for her mindfulness in being green and

sustainable.

Mayor Evans shared that she is impressed with the café and added that she meets people there all the time for meetings and visiting. She recommended that Ms. Apple connect with Ms. Madeksza with the Downtown Business Alliance to discuss possible connections between downtown and the southside.

Dr. Danielle Adams, Deputy Director for Marketing and Communications for Lowell Observatory, addressed Council and offered a PowerPoint that covered the following:

LOWELL OBSERVATORY  
ESTABLISHED: MAY 28, 1894  
MISSION: ASTRONOMICAL RESEARCH  
ANDERSON MESA  
HAPPY JACK  
MARS HILL  
MISSION: PUBLIC EDUCATION  
VIDEO  
OUR CHALLENGE: CAPACITY  
GIOVALE OPEN DECK OBSERVATORY  
SUCCESS  
LUNAR LEGACY PROGRAM

Councilmember Odegaard expressed birthday wishes to Lowell Observatory and indicated that he is looking forward to the upcoming tour.

Councilmember Whelan offered gratitude to Lowell Observatory for their enthusiasm and community participation in Flagstaff.

Councilmember McCarthy thanked Lowell Observatory for their contributions to the Lunar Legacy events.

Councilmember Salas thanked Lowell Observatory for being a partner with the City and for working with the City on dark sky standards. She expressed excitement for the upcoming lights out and star gazing events.

Mayor Evans thanked Lowell Observatory for their contribution to the City's Dark Sky Specialist position and for partnering with the City to develop the dark sky standards and protect the dark skies that are so important to Flagstaff.

## **8. Water Conservation Strategic Plan Update**

Water Services Program Manager Tamara Lawless provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

WATER CONSERVATION STRATEGIC PLAN UPDATE  
STRATEGIC PLAN PROCESS  
OUTREACH OVERVIEW – CONSERVATION MEASURE SELECTION  
CURRENT ACTIONS (MEASURES)  
NEW ACTIONS (MEASURES)  
NEXT STEP: COST BENEFIT ANALYSIS & SCENARIO BUILDING

Councilmember Aslan noted that California recently made some changes that if someone wants to sell a home certain upgrades must be done in order to get it on the market. He

indicated that he would like to see some research on their program and other similar efforts. It is a way to integrate upgrades and retrofits into a house that his changing ownership.

Ms. Lawless offered that one of the benefits to using the chosen consultant is that they are based out of California and have some insight into some of the things on the forefront.

Councilmember Whelan expressed a desire to have a water conservation specialist at the table when developers come into Flagstaff to have input into the various negotiating points.

Councilmember McCarthy asked about the consideration of reclaimed water as future drinking water. Ms. Lawless explained that there were some additional funds allocated to ensure that reclaimed water was evaluated as an asset. The consultant will be doing a reclaimed water analysis that will include the future uses of reclaimed water.

Councilmember Aslan extended his support of Councilmember Whelan's suggestion to include a water conservation representative in discussions with developers and landscapers to promote water conservation efforts.

## **9. Rethink Waste Plan Update**

Sustainability Specialist Dylan Lenzen provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

RETHINK WASTE UPDATE  
OUTLINE  
RETHINK WASTE PLAN FRAMEWORK FOR ACTION  
PHASE 1 – ESTABLISHING THE FOUNDATION  
LONG-TERM GOALS  
WHAT WE'VE ACCOMPLISHED  
HIGHLIGHTS  
DATA AND BASELINE METRICS  
CHALLENGES  
WHAT WE'RE WORKING ON  
REGULATION OF PRIVATE HAULERS  
RECYCLING OUTREACH  
NEED TO REDUCE CONTAMINATION  
OTHER INITIATIVES

Public Works Director Andy Bertelsen shared that the recent inspection initiative was not received well by the community so those efforts were halted until additional information could be provided to the community about the purpose and intent. It is important to make sure that the correct information is being shared and that people understand what is and is not happening during those inspections.

Councilmember Whelan indicated that there has been a lot of work done in the effort to educate the community about recycling and its importance. She encouraged staff to continue utilizing the hanging tags on trash receptacles and continue efforts to make the public aware of the purpose of that program.

Councilmember Aslan offered that the City has a right and an obligation to conduct the inspections and that he is not concerned about the backlash. The smallest amount of education can make a big impact and once trash is placed in a public bin and on the curb, it is no longer a privacy issue. Other communities are getting improved results when these practices are happening.

Councilmember McCarthy expressed concern about people putting regular trash into the recycle containers when the smaller trash cans are rolled out. He stressed the importance of a good education program to make sure people are fully aware of what can and cannot be recycled.

Councilmember Odegaard shared his enthusiasm about the new blue recycling containers. He stated that having consistency with all the recycling dumpsters is very important. He is not interested in inspecting the trash in the cans at this time because the messaging and education needs to be strong and consistent first. It has to be a heavy information campaign about why we are doing this and the goal.

Councilmember Salas asked how many private haulers there are in Flagstaff. Mr. Bertelsen stated that there are a number of private haulers, some big like Waste Management and other smaller outfits. There are a lot of the commercial businesses and multi-family residential properties that have national contracts and the City has to compete for their business. Councilmember Salas stated that she would like to see policy options for regulating private haulers in Flagstaff.

Councilmember Whelan shared that there are some municipalities who are choosing not to recycle because of the cost. Mr. Lenzen offered that it seems like the smaller and rural communities have been hit hardest along with coastal communities and that is where reductions in recycling service are being seen. There are many places that do not have a good return on investment for recycling and rather than passing on the added cost to their citizens they discontinue the service.

Vice Mayor Shimoni encouraged a much stronger messaging campaign and letting people know about what the plan is before it begins. He asked if there had been any consideration of stickers on the cans indicating what is recyclable. Mr. Lenzen said that the new blue residential carts have a sticker that shows what is acceptable and with the dedicated outreach funding stickers may be put on other cans.

Vice Mayor Shimoni asked if staff is working with NAU for the upcoming student move out. Mr. Lenzen stated that they are working with NAU and Goodwill will be collecting donatable materials curbside. This effort will divert waste from the landfill and save money with bulky pick up and illegal dumping.

Councilmember Odegaard expressed interest in exploring regulations on private haulers, messaging is important and the private haulers should mirror the same elements with the proper bin coloring and other things.

Mayor Evans agreed that the messaging is extremely important and educating people about laws needs to be very clear. She also expressed a need to change the messaging about students moving out and suggested a video that discusses the partnership between NAU and Goodwill, what they are collecting, how much revenue that generates, and how those materials are being used.

A break was held from 8:05 p.m. through 8:15 p.m.

## **10. Proposed City Code Revisions - Electric Bikes and Electric Scooters**

Sustainability Manager Nicole Antonopoulos provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

CITY CODE REVISIONS ELECTRIC BIKES AND ELECTRIC SCOOTERS  
DISCUSSION  
WHY PROPOSE REVISIONS?

Multimodal Transportation Planner Martin Ince continued the presentation.

ARIZONA LEGISLATION – ELECTRIC BICYCLES  
CLASS 1 AND 2  
CLASS 3  
ARIZONA LEGISLATION – ELECTRIC SCOOTERS  
EXISTING CITY CODE  
WHERE SHOULD ELECTRIC BIKES AND ELECTRIC SCOOTERS BE ALLOWED IN  
FLAGSTAFF?  
COMMUNITY INPUT  
GENERAL THEMES  
HIGHLIGHTS OF PROPOSED CODE REVISIONS

Ms. Antonopoulos concluded the presentation with next steps.

Vice Mayor Shimoni indicated that he is comfortable moving forward with the recommendations and feels that Class 1 and 2 e-bikes can be permitted on paved and unpaved FUTS trails.

Councilmember Aslan agreed stating that there has been so much investment in connecting Flagstaff through the FUTS system that e-bikes should be able to be used on them with consideration to safety and speed limits.

Councilmember Odegaard asked if bikes are permitted on sidewalks. Mr. Ince stated that current City Code allows bikes on sidewalks unless posted by signs. Signs are posted in downtown and on San Francisco and Beaver on the southside.

Councilmember Odegaard stated that he prefers the recommendation from the survey results. He expressed concern about those who use the FUTS for walking and hiking being at risk with e-bikes on the trails.

Councilmember Whelan stated that bike lanes need to be improved before more people are thrown into the cycling mix. Bike lanes need to be well marked and in some areas widened. She asked about the liability if someone gets hurt using one of the bikes. Ms. Antonopoulos indicated that the bike share company will be required to have full liability insurance.

Councilmember McCarthy noted that the survey comments seem to be very polarized with some people using the FUTS trails to avoid motorized areas and others saying not to limit them because that is what is used to commute. He does not believe that scooters should be allowed on the FUTS trails. He also believes that there should be a speed limit placed on the FUTS trails because there are many people who walk the trails. He would also like to see a rule that prohibits texting or using a phone while operating e-bikes. He is willing to accept Class 1 and 2 e-bikes on FUTS trails but with reservation.

Mayor Evans stated that she does not think that the survey population of 200 was an accurate representation of the community. She does not believe that any electric bikes should be permitted on FUTS trails. She added that there is a lack of enforcement of bicycle rules and it makes it very dangerous for cars and people.

Councilmember Salas echoed the Mayor's comments and added that there needs to be

stronger enforcement on helmets, reflectors, and lights. She does not believe that bikes or scooters should be permitted on sidewalks. She has concerns with allowing e-bikes and scooters on FUTS trails citing the number of people walking, some with strollers and pets which may create conflicts if these types of bikes are added into the mix.

Vice Mayor Shimoni asked if there are laws in place for biking under the influence. Senior Assistant Attorney Christina Parry stated that staff is presenting to a number of commissions for additional discussion and further research is being conducted on the matter.

A written comment card in support of e-bikes on FUTS trails was submitted by David Spence.

A written comment card in opposition of e-bikes on FUTS trails was submitted by WM. Michael Wilson.

Councilmember Whelan again asked about the legalities associated with the conditions of bike lanes and trails in the city.

**Moved by** Councilmember Jamie Whelan, **seconded by** Mayor Coral Evans to recess into Executive Session for legal advice.

**Vote:** 7 - 0 - Unanimously

The Council recessed into Executive Session at 9:05 p.m. and reconvened into Regular Session at 9:27 p.m.

Council agreed that additional information is needed and asked staff to come back and present at a later meeting.

## 11. **2019 Wildfire Outlook and Preparedness Briefing**

Fire Management Officer Paul Summerfelt introduced Sergeant Coons with the Flagstaff Police Department, Todd Whitney with Coconino County, John Haro with APS, and Duane Tewa with the U.S. Forest Service. Mr. Summerfelt provided a PowerPoint presentation the covered the following:

WILDFIRE PREPAREDNESS BRIEFING  
TOTAL ACRES BURNED  
TOTAL ACRES BURNED 1990'S  
TOTAL ACRES BURNED 2000'S  
FIRE YEAR FACTORS  
WET FALL AND WINTER  
WHAT A DIFFERENCE A YEAR MAKES  
NATIONAL SIGNIFICANT WILDLAND FIRE POTENTIAL OUTLOOK  
OUR STATUS & READINESS POSTURE  
2019 FOCUS AREAS  
COLLABORATION & PARTNERSHIPS  
GREATER FLAGSTAFF AREA FOREST TREATMENT MAP  
WILDLAND FIRE OCCURRENCE  
WILDLAND FIRE SIZE IN TREATED AND UNTREATED AREAS

Sergeant Coons continued the presentation.

LAW ENFORCEMENT FIRE PREVENTION PATROLS  
PATROL EFFORTS

## WOODS WATCH VOLUNTEERS

Vice Mayor Shimoni asked if there are any predictions on increases of people sleeping in woods over previous years. Sergeant Coons stated that the numbers have stayed relatively steady over the years.

Vice Mayor Shimoni asked about the education campaigns and the work with Flagstaff Shelter Services to assist in the efforts. Sergeant Coons stated that officers go out and personally educate individuals about their options other than camping; they sit down and talk with them and provide information about available services available along with information about Flagstaff Shelter Services and the Mission.

Mr. Whitney continued the presentation.

## COCONINO COUNTY EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT CITY/COUNTY EOC COORDINATION WILDFIRE DEFENSE ORDINANCE

Mr. Haro continued the presentation.

## FIRE MITIGATION 2019 FIRE MITIGATION DEVELOPMENT 2019

Mr. Tewa continued the presentation.

## COCONINO NATIONAL FOREST FIRE AND AVIATION MANAGEMENT PROGRAM CHIEF'S LETTER OF INTENT WILDLAND FIRE DISPATCH FIRE PREVENTION STRATEGIES WILDFIRE DETECTION ENGINES AND CREWS (USFS) NATIONAL GROUND RESOURCES NATIONAL AIR RESOURCES

Vice Mayor Shimoni asked if there is any signage at the trailheads with information about prevention and safety. Mr. Tewa stated that as conditions worsen they will be posting information about what people can and cannot do. Vice Mayor Shimoni offered that a video that shares information to the community would be a great way to get the message out.

Councilmember Whelan stated that Coconino County established a Flood Control District and earmarked certain areas and projects as priorities. She asked if there were any thoughts on the priorities. Mr. Whitney explained that it is a Flood Control District matter and that he does not have any information on the priorities. Mr. Tewa echoed that stating that he did not know what input the Forest Service may have provided to that regard. Mr. Summerfelt offered from a City perspective that there was no opportunity to provide input into the plan. The City concerns were presented to the Board and staff will continue to share those concerns at upcoming meetings. It is unknown why the priorities were set as they were.

Deputy City Manager Shane Dille stated that a letter was submitted to the County that specifically addressed the concerns about the process by which projects are evaluated and that a process has not been formalized or made transparent to the communities in Coconino County. The letter was signed by five of the six mayors in Coconino County.

**Moved by** Councilmember Charlie Odegaard, **seconded by** Councilmember Jamie Whelan to continue the meeting in accordance with the City Council Rules of Procedure.

**Vote:** 7 - 0 - Unanimously

**12. Discussion:** Request to reengage the conversation about a Code of Ethics for Council.

Mayor Evans stated that she would like to invite Karen Englis to a future Work Session to have a conversation about what an ethics policy is and why it is important. The Council has this conversation before and the last two times the Council has chosen to not implement an ethics policy. Having an ethics policy would prove wise to us individually and collectively.

A majority of Council is supportive of bringing this discussion to a future meeting.

**13. Public Participation**

None

**14. Informational Items To/From Mayor, Council, and City Manager; future agenda item requests**

Councilmember Whelan requested that the Pride flag be flown on the temporary flag pole for the month of June in coordination with the Commission on Diversity Awareness proclamation.

Councilmember Odegaard requested an Executive Session for legal advice concerning the Coconino County Flood Control District.

Councilmember Odegaard stated that he is looking forward to the Business Listening Tour on Thursday. He thanked Councilmember Salas for attending the Boys and Girls Club ribbon cutting at the Dream Court. He thanked Councilmember McCarthy for attending a dinner concerning LAUNCH and Pre-K schooling with Paul Kulpinski and he thanked Councilmembers Salas and Whelan for attending Palette to Palate. Lastly, he stated that the Overland Expo is happening in May; it was a large event last year and caused some traffic issues on Highway 89. He encouraged additional outreach by the event organizers for better traffic coordination.

Councilmember Salas reported that she had the opportunity to tour the Palo Verde Power Plant with Vice Mayor Shimoni and Councilmember Aslan. She stated that it was a very informative and educational tour. She also reported that she and Vice Mayor Shimoni toured the FWPP helicopter operations; she offered that she is very proud that Flagstaff is leading the effort in flood control, forest restoration, and fire prevention. Lastly, she stated that she and Councilmember Aslan took an aerial tour organized by the Grand Canyon Trust to view the uranium mining sites. It is important to further advocate for the proper closure of the sites.

Mayor Evans reported that she and Councilmember Salas had an opportunity to tour the Streets Department and it was amazing to see that the City only has 33 people looking over 700 lane miles, over 3,000 streetlights, and over 2,000 street signs. Thank you to those who keep us mobile in Flagstaff.

Mayor Evans requested a F.A.I.R. item to look at addressing the issue of new developments coming into town that utilize the retail economic benefit for higher density but not providing the retail component. She would like to look at ways to regulate the use of that incentive so that if there is no retail component brought in within a certain time there are penalties of some sort.

**15. Adjournment**

The Flagstaff City Council Work Session of April 30, 2019, adjourned at 10:47 p.m.

---

MAYOR

ATTEST:

---

CITY CLERK