

## MINUTES

### 1. CALL TO ORDER

Mayor Deasy called the meeting of the Flagstaff City Council held January 19, 2021, to order at 3:02 p.m.

#### NOTICE OF OPTION TO RECESS INTO EXECUTIVE SESSION

*Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the City Council and to the general public that, at this regular meeting, the City Council may vote to go into executive session, which will not be open to the public, for legal advice and discussion with the City's attorneys for legal advice on any item listed on the following agenda, pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(3).*

### 2. ROLL CALL

*NOTE: One or more Councilmembers may be in attendance telephonically or by other technological means.*

PRESENT:

ABSENT:

MAYOR EVANS (virtually)  
VICE MAYOR SHIMONI (virtually)  
COUNCILMEMBER ASLAN (virtually)  
COUNCILMEMBER MCCARTHY (virtually)  
COUNCILMEMBER ODEGAARD (virtually)  
COUNCILMEMBER SALAS (virtually)  
COUNCILMEMBER WHELAN (virtually)

Others present: City Manager Greg Clifton; City Attorney Sterling Solomon.

### 3. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE AND MISSION STATEMENT

The Council and audience recited the pledge of allegiance and Councilmember Aslan read the Mission Statement of the City of Flagstaff.

#### MISSION STATEMENT

*The mission of the City of Flagstaff is to protect and enhance the quality of life for all.*

#### 4. **APPROVAL OF MINUTES FROM PREVIOUS MEETINGS**

- A. **Consideration and Approval of Minutes:** City Council Combined Special Meeting/Budget Retreat of February 7, 2019, Budget Retreat of April 23, 2019, Budget Retreat of April 24, 2019, Work Session of May 28, 2019, Regular Meeting of June 4, 2019, Work Session of June 11, 2019, Regular Meeting of June 18, 2019, and Work Session of September 10, 2019.

**Moved by** Councilmember Jim McCarthy, **seconded by** Councilmember Adam Shimoni to approve the minutes of the City Council Combined Special Meeting/Budget Retreat of February 7, 2019, Budget Retreat of April 23, 2019, Budget Retreat of April 24, 2019, Work Session of May 28, 2019, Regular Meeting of June 4, 2019, Work Session of June 11, 2019, Regular Meeting of June 18, 2019, and Work Session of September 10, 2019.

**Vote:** 7 - 0 - Unanimously

#### 5. **PUBLIC PARTICIPATION**

*Public Participation enables the public to address the Council about an item that is not on the agenda. Comments relating to items that are on the agenda will be taken at the time that the item is discussed. If you wish to address the Council at tonight's meeting, please complete a comment card and submit it to the recording clerk as soon as possible. Your name will be called when it is your turn to speak. You may address the Council up to three times throughout the meeting, including comments made during Public Participation. Please limit your remarks to three minutes per item to allow everyone an opportunity to speak. At the discretion of the Chair, ten or more persons present at the meeting and wishing to speak may appoint a representative who may have no more than fifteen minutes to speak.*

None

#### 6. **PROCLAMATIONS AND RECOGNITIONS**

- A. **Human Trafficking Awareness Month**

Mayor Deasy read the Human Trafficking Awareness Month proclamation.

#### 7. **APPOINTMENTS**

*Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the City Council and to the general public that the City Council may vote to go into executive session, which will not be open to the public, for the purpose of discussing or considering employment, assignment, appointment, promotion, demotion, dismissal, salaries, disciplining or resignation of a public officer, appointee, or employee of any public body...., pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(1).*

- A. **Consideration of Appointments:** Commission on Diversity Awareness.

Deputy City Clerk Stacy Fobar indicated to the Council that there was an error in the staff report for the Commission on Diversity Awareness; the report references an appointment for September 2024 and it should be September 2021.

**Moved by** Councilmember Adam Shimoni, **seconded by** Councilmember Jim McCarthy to appoint Mandy Martinez Gebler to a term expiring September 2023.

**Vote:** 7 - 0 - Unanimously

**Moved by** Councilmember Austin Aslan, **seconded by** Councilmember Adam Shimoni to appoint Marcela Pino to a term expiring September 2021.

**Vote:** 7 - 0 - Unanimously

**Moved by** Councilmember Jim McCarthy, **seconded by** Councilmember Adam Shimoni to appoint Mounia Mnouer to a term expiring September 2023.

**Vote:** 7 - 0 - Unanimously

**B. Consideration of Appointments: Tourism Commission.**

**Moved by** Councilmember Jim McCarthy, **seconded by** Councilmember Adam Shimoni to appoint Ellen Jimenez to a term expiring January 2024.

**Vote:** 7 - 0 - Unanimously

**8. LIQUOR LICENSE PUBLIC HEARINGS**

Mayor Deasy opened the public hearing

Police Chief Musselman introduced the applications.

There being no public comment Mayor Deasy closed the public hearing.

**Moved by** Councilmember Regina Salas, **seconded by** Councilmember Miranda Sweet to forward the applications to the State with a recommendation of approval.

**Vote:** 7 - 0 - Unanimously

**A. Consideration and Action on Liquor License Application: John Robert Bates, "Mountain Top Tap Room," 10 E. Route 66, Series 07 (beer and wine bar), Owner Transfer**

**B. Consideration and Action on Liquor License Application: Jared Repinski, "Famous Pizza & Beer," 104 E. Route 66, Series 07 (beer and wine bar), New Application**

**9. CONSENT ITEMS**

*All matters under Consent Agenda are considered by the City Council to be routine and will be enacted by one motion approving the recommendations listed on the agenda. Unless otherwise indicated, expenditures approved by Council are budgeted items.*

Councilmember Shimoni asked to pull Item 9A and Councilmember McCarthy asked to pull Item 9C.

**Moved by** Councilmember Jim McCarthy, **seconded by** Councilmember Miranda Sweet to approve the Consent Agenda Item 9B as presented.

**Vote:** 7 - 0 - Unanimously

- A. **Consideration and Approval of Contract:** Approve a cooperative purchase contract with Passport Labs, Inc. for parking enforcement software services utilizing a National Cooperative Purchasing Alliance (NCPA) contract.

Councilmember Shimoni asked if the data collected in the app is shared. He also asked about the credit card fees. Community Investment Director Dave McIntire stated that the information collected in the app is not sold and it is not shared with their partner agencies outside of what is only needed to make the app function. With regard to credit card fees, the contract does not have an impact on credit card fees. The City does pay credit card fees to the specific cards but it is outside of this contract.

Councilmember Salas asked what the anticipated cost savings will be with the new pricing. Interim Parking Manager Gail Brockman stated that there is an anticipated 15-20% savings.

**Moved by** Councilmember Jim McCarthy, **seconded by** Councilmember Miranda Sweet to approve a cooperative purchase contract with Passport Labs Inc. for parking software and services, in an amount not-to-exceed \$140,329.92 over a four year contract period, with annual payments including a 5% annual price increase anticipated as follows:

- Year 1 \$32,558
- Year 2 \$34,186
- Year 3 \$35,895
- Year 4 \$37,690

**Vote:** 7 - 0 - Unanimously

- B. **Consideration and Approval of Final Plat** Miramonte Beaver, LLC requests Final Plat approval for Butler Avenue Condominiums—a condominium subdivision consisting of 32 residential units and one ground floor restaurant space at 207 S. Beaver St. on 0.54 acres in the T5 Main Street Transect Zone.

**STAFF RECOMMENDED ACTION:**

Staff recommends the City Council approve the Final Plat and authorize the Mayor to sign the plat and City Subdivider Agreement when notified by Staff that the documents are ready for recording.

- C. **Consideration and Approval of Contract:** APS Level 2 Electric Vehicle Charging Agreement # 156299, Agreement # 156300 and Agreement # 155835

Councilmember Salas asked how the project is funded and if there is a potential to recover the costs. Climate and Energy Coordinator Ramon Alatorre explained that the chargers do allow for the flexibility to charge a fee in the future should that be the desire of Council. At the moment charging is being provided for free.

Councilmember McCarthy expressed concerns about not charging a fee and suggested a reduced rate for using the stations.

Councilmember Shimoni indicated that he would be interested in looking at the possibility of charging a fee in the future.

Mr. Clifton offered that he has been an advocate for having the stations be available free of charge because it is introductory, and it is hoped that people will become acquainted with

and use the stations. Many jurisdictions are using the same approach and the benefit to these stations is that a fee based service could be implemented in the future.

Councilmember McCarthy suggested the Council revisit the item in a year for consideration of a fee. Mayor Deasy indicated that a future discussion about fees would be good and having more data available about use and cost would be helpful in the discussion. Councilmembers Salas and Aslan agreed.

**Moved by** Councilmember Jim McCarthy, **seconded by** Councilmember Austin Aslan to approve APS Level 2 Electric Vehicle Charging Pilot Agreement # 156299, Agreement # 156300, and Agreement # 155835.

**Vote:** 7 - 0 - Unanimously

## 10. REGULAR AGENDA

- A. Consideration and Adoption of Resolution No. 2021-05:** A resolution of the Flagstaff City Council in support of efforts to lobby the new Biden Administration to reinstate Bears Ears National Monument to its original dimensions.

Councilmember Shimoni suggested that the City collaborate with the tribal partners in the region on the resolution. Mr. Clifton offered that many similar resolutions and statements have been issued on the matter and while staff is willing to accommodate the request it would take some time to coordinate all the signatories on the document. Mr. Solomon added that in terms of a resolution it is more advisable that the City sign its own resolution rather than couple with other jurisdictions; it is the cleanest approach for all agencies.

Mayor Deasy indicated that he would like to proceed with the resolution as it is but perhaps pursue joint letters in support with neighboring tribes.

Councilmember Aslan expressed support for adopting the resolution and suggested that doing so will show solidarity with the City's tribal neighbors.

**Moved by** Councilmember Austin Aslan, **seconded by** Vice Mayor Becky Daggett to read Resolution No. 2021-05 by title only.

**Vote:** 7 - 0 - Unanimously

*A RESOLUTION OF THE FLAGSTAFF CITY COUNCIL, IN SUPPORT OF EFFORTS TO LOBBY THE NEW BIDEN ADMINISTRATION TO REINSTATE BEARS EARS NATIONAL MONUMENT TO ITS ORIGINAL DIMENSIONS*

**Moved by** Councilmember Jim McCarthy, **seconded by** Mayor Paul Deasy to adopt Resolution No. 2021-05.

**Vote:** 7 - 0 - Unanimously

- B. Consideration and Approval:** State and Federal Legislative Priorities

Mr. Clifton introduced the item stating that the state and federal priorities are broad policy terms as to the objectives of the City. The priorities document will give staff and the

lobbyists guidance on how and what to advocate on behalf of the City when matters arise.

Management Analyst Sarah Langley reviewed the Draft 2021 Federal Priorities.

Council requested that the word permanent be added to the ban on uranium mining under the Grand Canyon and Colorado Plateau protection priority.

Council also requested that a Water Infrastructure category be created. The following language was added; "Advocate for water infrastructure funding."

Robert Vane addressed Council with a couple of suggestions for addition in the priorities. With regard to the federal priorities he suggested that water infrastructure be added into the federal infrastructure priority and to also add a clause to the forest health priority to seek funding for biomass efforts. With regard to state priorities he suggested adding an ask to the Arizona Corporation Commission priority to establish a biomass rate for western Arizona.

Council asked staff about information regarding biomass.

Economic Vitality Director Heidi Hansen noted that the City is a member of Arizona Forward and biomass is one of the major projects they are pursuing. Sustainability Manager Nicole Antonopoulos added that biomass is a strategy in the 2018 Climate Action and Adaptation Plan. Fire Chief Mark Gaillard noted that there has not been any major dialogue on the issue at the Council level, but the City has taken stances at various times in support of biomass efforts.

Council indicated that they would like to have a more in-depth discussion at a future Council meeting concerning biomass. Mr. Clifton stated that it is a topic that can be slated for a future agenda.

Ms. Langley then reviewed the Draft 2021 State Priorities and reviewed the priorities.

Council requested the addition of an Affordable Housing priority. The following language was added; "Support legislation and seek funding in support of affordable housing."

Council requested the addition of a Tourism priority. The following language was added; "Urge the State to continue to fund tourism and the Arizona Office of Tourism to support northern Arizona as a four-season destination.

**Moved by** Vice Mayor Becky Daggett, **seconded by** Councilmember Miranda Sweet to approve the 2021 State and Federal Legislative Priorities as amended.

**Vote:** 7 - 0 - Unanimously

A break was held from 5:08 p.m. through 5:20 p.m.

**C. Consideration and Approval:** Letter in Opposition of HB 2248 and SB 1175

Ms. Langley reviewed the two bills and explained that the intent of the bills is to remove the authority of the Arizona Corporation Commission (ACC) to pass renewable energy standards and to make energy rules that would lead to 100% clean energy. HB 2248 did not get a committee assignment and SB 1175 is scheduled for Senate Committee hearing

tomorrow. Mr. Madeksza, the City's State Lobbyist, will be testifying at that hearing. A letter has been drafted for Council to consider and if approved it can be sent out as needed.

Council thanked staff for bringing the matter to the Council so quickly and voiced their support of the letter.

**Moved by** Councilmember Austin Aslan, **seconded by** Mayor Paul Deasy to authorize the City Manager to send letter in opposition of HB 2248 and SB 1175.

**Vote:** 7 - 0 - Unanimously

## 11. DISCUSSION ITEMS

### A. Discussion and Direction: 2021/2022 Election Overview and Timeline Review

City Clerk Stacy Saltzburg provided a PowerPoint Presentation that covered the following:

2021/2022 ELECTION OVERVIEW  
ELECTION DATES  
TYPES OF ELECTIONS  
UPCOMING ELECTION DATES  
FINANCIAL CONSIDERATIONS  
WHAT IS A CITY CHARTER?  
POSSIBLE AMENDMENTS  
CHARTER ELECTION  
POSSIBLE TIMELINE  
COUNCIL DIRECTION

The Council was not supportive of holding a special election for charter changes. Instead, they would like to consider adding questions to each general election.

A majority of Council was supportive of developing and convening a City Manager Committee to review and provide recommendations on potential charter amendments.

A few suggestions for charter change consideration were noted:

- Providing for a mechanism to verify signatures on a candidate petition.
- Lowering the number of signatures required for candidates to qualify for the ballot.
- Creating a way to outlaw dirty money which are the independent expenditures from third parties that don't flow through the candidate's campaign.
- Term limits for Mayor and Councilmembers.
- Four-year term for Mayor.

With regard to the verification of signatures on candidate petitions, Ms. Saltzburg explained that there is very limited authority for verification of candidate petitions, and it may be better advocated for at the State level.

Mayor Deasy indicated that there may be a way to address the independent expenditures through ordinance. Mr. Solomon indicated that more research would need to be done. Council was supportive of having Mr. Solomon research and provide more information on options.

## 12. **COUNCIL LIAISON REPORTS**

Councilmember McCarthy reported that he attended the State Transportation Board meeting. He noted that it was interesting to hear that although gas tax revenues are down, diesel tax and general sales tax are up.

Councilmember Salas reported that she attended the Parks and Recreation Commission where Mark Cox was appointed as the new Chairperson and Ryan Martin as Vice Chairperson. The Commission had an update from staff on the long-term vision for the open space system. They will be reviewing the Parks and Recreation Master Plan along with the Parks and Recreation Strategic Plan to consider possible updates or revisions.

Councilmember Salas also reported that she attended the Tourism Commission's annual strategic sales and strategy meeting and heard about the work being done by all the different programs within Discover Flagstaff.

Lastly, Councilmember Salas reported that she attended the Airport Commission meeting. It was reported that things are looking well and slowly but surely coming back.

Councilmember Shimoni reported that he and the Mayor, along with City leadership, attended the Alliance meeting with CCC, NAU, Mountain Line, the County, and FUSD to discuss various COVID matters. He also reported that he attended the EAC meeting where staff was discussing employee compensation. He indicated that the matter will be coming to Council in the near future.

Lastly, Councilmember Shimoni reported that he attended the CJCC meeting which went well.

Councilmember Sweet reported that she met with the Beautification and Public Art Commission where they discussed finding creative ways to gather community input regarding the Flagstaff Regional Plan. She also reported that she has upcoming meetings with Mountain Line, the Convention and Visitors Bureau, and NACOG.

Mayor Deasy reported that he attended the Alliance Meeting and looks forward to continued participation in those meetings. He also attended the Audit Committee meeting and was quite impressed with the experience and skills of the members. He is looking forward to learning more about the process.

## 13. **FUTURE AGENDA ITEM REQUESTS**

*After discussion and upon agreement by three members of the Council, an item will be moved to a regularly-scheduled Council meeting.*

- A. Future Agenda Item Request (F.A.I.R.)** A Citizens' Petition with regard to the Coconino Estates Project requesting that the City "redesign the city street project to allow trees to remain."

The petitioner, Ms. Leslie Pickard, introduced the petition and stated that she would like to see the project redesigned in a way that allows her trees to remain. She also indicated that many people in the neighborhood do not want sidewalks on both sides of the street.

Dr. Rebecca Campbell addressed Council in opposition to the petition. She indicated that the community outreach and the process associated with the project has been done very well. The petition should not outweigh the process that has already taken place.

Councilmember McCarthy indicated that he has spoken with many of the residents in the area and has gotten a variety of responses with regard to the project. Many people would rather have a sidewalk on one side of the street rather than one on each side. He believes that sidewalks on one side only would make more sense, it would save money, and save the trees. He suggested that the residents be surveyed again specifically about sidewalks on both sides of the street and then have a broader discussion about the project.

Mr. Clifton stated that the matter has been surveyed and in front of the City Council previously for a lengthy discussion. That meeting was well attended and included a lot of input from the public. It has been an ongoing discussion for some time and he urged Council to put finality to the matter. He explained that is difficult for staff to move forward when things have to be revisited multiple times.

Vice Mayor Daggett asked about the engineering standards related to the project. City Engineer Rick Barrett stated that engineering standards are for new projects and new subdivisions. Sidewalks are required on both sides of the roadway to provide a safe place for pedestrians and bicyclists to travel. With regard to the width of the sidewalk, the minimum is four feet wide. There are circumstances where a wider sidewalk is required based on the project. In this case, based on the functional classification of Beal and Navajo, a five-foot sidewalk is required.

Councilmember McCarthy suggested that the process was incomplete, and people were not asked if they wanted sidewalks on one or both sides of the street; they were only asked if they wanted sidewalks. Mr. Barrett explained that the public process always talked about two sidewalks which is in accordance with the engineering standards for new projects. Beal and Navajo Drive have high traffic and the design is based on the functional classification of the roads.

Councilmember Shimoni stated that staff worked with an arborist to find a way to save one of the two trees in the design. He acknowledged that the loss of the tree is unfortunate, but the issue is about accessibility and safety. He indicated that he is supportive of continuing forward with the current plan.

Councilmember Salas asked if there were any plans to plant a new tree. Mr. Barrett indicated that there are plans and that he is willing to continue working with Ms. Pickard to allow the City to plant a replacement tree. Councilmember Salas asked if that would be the case for other homes that may be losing trees. Mr. Barrett stated that he is not aware of the exact details and encouraged people with frontage concerns to reach out to staff who will work with them to see what options may be available.

Vice Mayor Daggett indicated that she is not supportive of revisiting the project design at this stage of the process. She is a proponent of sidewalks on both sides of the street and the project should advance as planned. She acknowledged Ms. Pickard's sadness and frustration about losing her tree.

Councilmember Aslan also acknowledged the sadness about losing the tree but indicated that the project needs to continue forward.

Mayor Deasy indicated that he is not supportive of continuing the conversation about the project design but encouraged Ms. Pickard to continue working with staff on options to

replace the tree.

Councilmember McCarthy thanked Council for the consideration and thanked staff for their continuous outreach to the community. He also encouraged Ms. Pickard to continue working with staff to find options that might help mitigate the impact she will experience with the loss of her tree.

There was not Council support to move the item to a future agenda for further discussion.

#### **14. CITY MANAGER REPORT**

##### **A. City Manager Report**

Mr. Clifton provided a brief review of his report.

Councilmember Shimoni expressed gratitude to Deputy Police Chief Walt Miller and congratulated him on his retirement. He also offered thanks for all the officers who were involved in the recent life saving effort. He noted concerns about the increase in fire calls and thanked Mr. Clifton for his involvement with LAUNCH Flagstaff.

Councilmember Shimoni asked if there are plans to build separated bike lanes on Beulah as part of the new development going in there. Mr. Barrett noted that it is unlikely at this phase of planning and development as there are concerns about how the lanes would connect on either side of the project. That being said, he will bring it up as they move into final design. He stated that there will be high frequency bus lanes as part of the project.

#### **15. COVID-19 UPDATES**

Deputy City Manager Shannon Anderson provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

COVID-19 UPDATE  
AGENDA  
CCHHS: COVID-19 WEEKLY CASES  
CCHHS: COVID-19 DAILY CASES  
CCHHS: HOSPITAL ADMISSIONS  
CCHHS: COVID-19 RELATED DEATHS  
CCHHS: COMMUNITY TRANSMISSION  
ADHS DASHBOARD  
NAH: HOSPITAL CENSUS

Coordinator for Indigenous Initiatives Rose Toehe continued the presentation.

INDIGENOUS NATIONS DATA  
HOPI TRIBE  
NAVAJO NATION

Ms. Anderson concluded the presentation.

RE-ENTRY TEAM UPDATE

Mayor Deasy expressed concern about a number of people in the 1A category that have not been able to get their vaccine and asked if there is a way to give priority registration to

nurses and healthcare professionals. Ms. Anderson stated that the availability of the vaccine has had some impact on the challenges with getting an appointment. The available appointments are based on the number of vaccines that are provided to the County. As the County gets additional supplies the availability of appointments will increase.

Mayor Deasy asked if there could be coordinated efforts with pharmacies to provide the vaccinations to specific groups of people. Ms. Anderson stated that the County is reaching out to agencies such as Walgreens to see if they are willing to vaccinate and then coordinate the groups targeted for vaccinations.

Councilmember Shimoni stated that it is a very challenging time and very devastating for many families. He shared a story about a family who has lost five people to COVID. He is hoping that the vaccine will begin moving us out of this.

Councilmember McCarthy shared that the doctor who helped his wife during a very difficult time recently died of COVID. This doctor was one of the most important people in his wife's life and it is just terrible that the virus has taken so many people.

**16. INFORMATIONAL ITEMS AND REPORTS FROM COUNCIL AND STAFF, FUTURE AGENDA ITEM REQUESTS**

Vice Mayor Daggett stated that COVID has been so devastating to the country and the lives of those it has touched. The Council periodically receives emails from the public expressing their frustration about people not wearing masks. She shares that frustration and asked everyone to do their best to have people take this seriously and do their part to keep people safe.

Councilmember Salas reminded residents and visitors to stay, play, distance, and mask responsibly. She offered appreciation to all members of the police and fire departments for their continued work and dedication to protecting property and lives. She congratulated Deputy Police Chief Walt Miller on his retirement.

Councilmember Salas requested a F.A.I.R. item for Council to discuss a citywide comprehensive cost recovery policy.

Councilmember Shimoni asked about the youth commission and the council salary commission. Mr. Clifton stated that there are things in play with the Youth Commission and it will be coming back to Council in the near future. With regard to the Citizen's Commission on Council Salaries, Ms. Anderson stated that a new ordinance was passed by the prior Council to add additional community members to the committee. It has been extremely difficult to fill those positions and without a full committee the matter is unable to move forward. Staff will continue to do outreach to see if more interest can be generated in the public.

Councilmember Sweet thanked staff, Council, and community participants for a good meeting.

Mayor Deasy stated that when the recreational marijuana item comes forward he will be looking to have a discussion about preventing the large companies from coming and dominating the market in Flagstaff and taking business away from local businesses. He also requested that staff consider some messaging for COVID vaccinations similar to the small act big deal campaign.

17. **ADJOURNMENT**

The Regular Meeting of the Flagstaff City Council held January 19, 2021, adjourned at 8:07 p.m.

\_\_\_\_\_  
MAYOR

ATTEST:

\_\_\_\_\_  
CITY CLERK

**CERTIFICATION**

I, STACY SALTZBURG, do hereby certify that I am the City Clerk of the City of Flagstaff, County of Coconino, State of Arizona, and that the above Minutes are a true and correct summary of the Meeting of the Council of the City of Flagstaff held on January 19, 2021. I further certify that the Meeting was duly called and held and that a quorum was present.

DATED this 16th day of March, 2021.

\_\_\_\_\_  
CITY CLERK