

## MINUTES

### 1. CALL TO ORDER

Mayor Evans called the meeting of the Flagstaff City Council held December 17, 2019, to order at 4:30 p.m.

#### NOTICE OF OPTION TO RECESS INTO EXECUTIVE SESSION

*Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the City Council and to the general public that, at this regular meeting, the City Council may vote to go into executive session, which will not be open to the public, for legal advice and discussion with the City's attorneys for legal advice on any item listed on the following agenda, pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(3).*

### 2. ROLL CALL

*NOTE: One or more Councilmembers may be in attendance telephonically or by other technological means.*

PRESENT:

ABSENT:

MAYOR EVANS  
VICE MAYOR SHIMONI  
COUNCILMEMBER ASLAN  
COUNCILMEMBER MCCARTHY  
COUNCILMEMBER ODEGAARD  
COUNCILMEMBER SALAS  
COUNCILMEMBER WHELAN

Others present: City Manager Greg Clifton; City Attorney Sterling Solomon.

### 3. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE AND MISSION STATEMENT

The Council and audience recited the pledge of allegiance and Vice Mayor Shimoni read the Mission Statement of the City of Flagstaff.

#### MISSION STATEMENT

*The mission of the City of Flagstaff is to protect and enhance the quality of life for all.*

#### 4. **APPROVAL OF MINUTES FROM PREVIOUS MEETINGS**

- A. **Consideration and Approval of Minutes:** City Council Budget Retreat of January 16, 2019; Special Work Session of January 22, 2019; and Work Session of December 10, 2019.

Councilmember McCarthy noted a small correction on the minutes of December 10, 2019.

**Moved by** Councilmember Charlie Odegaard, **seconded by** Vice Mayor Adam Shimoni to approve the minutes of the City Council Budget Retreat of January 16, 2019; Special Work Session of January 22, 2019; and Work Session of December 10, 2019 as amended.

**Vote:** 7 - 0 - Unanimously

#### 5. **PUBLIC PARTICIPATION**

*Public Participation enables the public to address the Council about an item that is not on the agenda. Comments relating to items that are on the agenda will be taken at the time that the item is discussed. If you wish to address the Council at tonight's meeting, please complete a comment card and submit it to the recording clerk as soon as possible. Your name will be called when it is your turn to speak. You may address the Council up to three times throughout the meeting, including comments made during Public Participation. Please limit your remarks to three minutes per item to allow everyone an opportunity to speak. At the discretion of the Chair, ten or more persons present at the meeting and wishing to speak may appoint a representative who may have no more than fifteen minutes to speak.*

Tom Martin addressed Council requesting that the Coconino Estates project be modified so there is only a sidewalk installed on one side of the street instead of both side.

The following individuals addressed Council requesting that the Coconino Estates project be left as it is with sidewalks on both sides of the road:

- Tim Gales
- Robert Crozier
- David Sanders
- Dominick Maggio
- Sam McCray
- Kate Gales

#### 6. **PROCLAMATIONS AND RECOGNITIONS**

- A. **Recognition:** Heart of Gold Award Recipients

City Attorney Sterling Solomon recognized City Prosecutor Brent Harris and Prosecution Administrative Specialist Allison Negret for being awarded the Heart of Gold Award for the work they do to support Victim Witness services.

- B. **Recognition:** Water Services Director Brad Hill

This item was presented at the 6:00 p.m. portion of the meeting under Carry Over Items agenda section.

## 7. LIQUOR LICENSE PUBLIC HEARINGS

- A. **Consideration and Action on Liquor License Application:** Ariel Chanko, "Grand Canyon Beverage Distributor," 4600 E. Nestle Purina Avenue, Series 04 (wholesaler), New License.

Mayor Evans opened the public hearing.

Police Sergeant Collin Seay briefly reviewed the application.

There being no public comment, Mayor Evans closed the public hearing.

**Moved by** Vice Mayor Adam Shimoni, **seconded by** Councilmember Charlie Odegaard to forward the application to the State with a recommendation for approval.

**Vote:** 7 - 0 - Unanimously

## 8. CONSENT ITEMS

*All matters under Consent Agenda are considered by the City Council to be routine and will be enacted by one motion approving the recommendations listed on the agenda. Unless otherwise indicated, expenditures approved by Council are budgeted items.*

Councilmember McCarthy requested that Item 8B be pulled and Councilmember Whelan requested that Item 8E be pulled.

**Moved by** Councilmember Jim McCarthy, **seconded by** Vice Mayor Adam Shimoni to approve Consent Items 8A, 8C, and 8D as submitted.

**Vote:** 7 - 0 - Unanimously

- A. **Consideration and Approval of Contract:** Airport Security Upgrades at the Flagstaff Airport.

1. Approve a Cooperative Purchase Contract for the purchase and installation of security equipment at the Flagstaff Airport from Enterprise Security, Inc. (2020-53), under Maricopa County Contract (190240) in an amount not to exceed \$95,000.
2. Authorize the City Manager to execute the necessary documents.

- B. **Consideration and Approval:** 2020 Intergovernmental Priorities.

Councilmember McCarthy stated that the last item of the federal priorities should be removed unless funding has been provided to effectively manage the land. Councilmember Salas stated that she would like to see the item remain. Council requested that staff revisit the item and come back to Council with additional information.

Vice Mayor Shimoni stated that he would like to see 5G implementation be added to the federal and state priorities. Mayor Evans noted that it may be better to focus on advocating for local control so local jurisdictions can better manage issues such as 5G implementation within their cities. Keeping the topics broad allows for more specific matters to be addressed as they arise.

Councilmember McCarthy requested that the first bullet of the state priorities be modified to add "(i.e. lodging in residential zones)." A majority of Council was supportive of the change.

Mayor Evans requested an addition to call out the issue of local control and home rule. She also suggested that it be added to the specific areas of focus for the 2020 session. A majority of Council was supportive of the addition.

Councilmember Whelan requested stronger language for gun awareness and safety.

**Moved by** Councilmember Jim McCarthy, **seconded by** Vice Mayor Adam Shimoni to approve the state and federal agenda as amended with the exception of the item dealing with federal lands and the additional gun safety statement.

**Vote:** 7 - 0 - Unanimously

- C. Consideration and Approval of Contract:** Approve the purchase of an 800 HPR High-Pressure Sewer Cleaner and a JAJ-600WH Workhorse Easement Machine through a cooperative purchase contract between Sourcewell and Sewer Equipment of America and its Arizona Distributor Arizona Wastewater Industries in the amount of \$373,092 plus fees.
1. Approve the purchase of an 800 HPR High Pressure Sewer Cleaner and a JAJ-600WH Workhorse Easement Machine through a cooperative purchase contract with Sewer Equipment of America through their Arizona Distributor Arizona Wastewater Industries through the Sourcewell cooperative purchase Contract No. 122017-SCA for \$373,092 plus any additional fees; and
  2. Authorize the City Manager to execute the necessary documents.
- D. Consideration and Approval of Cooperative Purchase Contract:** Capital Pump & Equipment LLC for the purchase of two 4" pumps for the Water Reclamation facilities and other Water Services sections through a cooperative purchase contract.
1. Approve the cooperative purchase contract with Capital Pump & Equipment LLC for the purchase of two 4" pumps in the amount of \$67,207.20; and
  2. Authorize the City Manager to execute the necessary documents.
- E. Consideration and Approval of Contract:** Consideration of a Contract for Compensation Study Services.

Interim Human Resources Director Allison Eckert and Human Resources Analyst Randall Moehr provided a brief overview of the study.

Councilmember Whelan asked if the company had been vetted as part of the procurement process to which Ms. Eckert responded yes.

Councilmember Odegaard stated that something similar had been done not too long ago and asked how this study is different. Deputy City Manager Shannon Anderson stated that a compensation study was done in 2008 and the recommendation is to do it every ten years because best practices tend to change. One of the drivers to doing this now is that minimum wage has changed, and it will continue to change and it is important that the city's wages are competitive.

**Moved by** Councilmember Charlie Odegaard, **seconded by** Councilmember Jamie Whelan to approve the Contract for Professional Services between the City of Flagstaff and Evergreen Solutions, LLC, in an amount not to exceed \$78,000; and authorize the City Manager to execute the necessary documents.

**Vote:** 7 - 0 - Unanimously

**9. ROUTINE ITEMS**

- A. Consideration and Approval of Contract:** Category 5 Master Cost Recovery Agreement between USDA, Forest Service, Coconino National Forest and the City of Flagstaff.

Real Estate Manager Charity Lee stated that the contract is an amendment to the original agreement that reflects the costs for additional projects that were added.

Councilmember Whelan asked if there are provisions related to the time it takes to get a permit from the Forest Service. Ms. Lee explained that the hope is that this agreement will expedite future projects and make the process more streamlined and efficient.

**Moved by** Councilmember Charlie Odegaard, **seconded by** Councilmember Jim McCarthy to approve the Master Cost Recovery Agreement Between U.S. Department of Agriculture (USDA), Forest Service, Coconino National Forest, and City of Flagstaff.

**Vote:** 7 - 0 - Unanimously

- B. Consideration and Adoption of Resolution No. 2019-57:** A resolution of the Flagstaff City Council approving an Intergovernmental Agreement between Coconino Community College (CCC) and the City of Flagstaff East Library for the lease of the East Library.

**Moved by** Councilmember Jim McCarthy, **seconded by** Councilmember Jamie Whelan to read Resolution No. 2019-57 by title only.

**Vote:** 7 - 0 - Unanimously

*A RESOLUTION OF THE FLAGSTAFF CITY COUNCIL, APPROVING AN INTERGOVERNMENTAL AGREEMENT BETWEEN THE COCONINO COUNTY COMMUNITY COLLEGE DISTRICT AND THE CITY OF FLAGSTAFF FOR THE LEASE OF 3000 NORTH FOURTH STREET FOR OPERATION OF THE EAST FLAGSTAFF COMMUNITY LIBRARY*

**Moved by** Councilmember Jim McCarthy, **seconded by** Councilmember Regina Salas to adopt Resolution No. 2019-57.

**Vote:** 7 - 0 - Unanimously

- C. Consideration and Adoption of Resolution No. 2019-61:** A resolution of the Flagstaff City Council authorizing the settlement of the claims alleged by Theatrikos, Inc. in its Notice of Claim dated August 23, 2019.

Al White and Chris Verrill addressed Council in support of the settlement.

**Moved by** Councilmember Austin Aslan, **seconded by** Vice Mayor Adam Shimoni to read Resolution No. 2019-61 by title only.

**Vote:** 7 - 0 - Unanimously

*A RESOLUTION OF THE FLAGSTAFF CITY COUNCIL AUTHORIZING THE SETTLEMENT OF THE CLAIMS ALLEGED BY THEATRIKOS, INC. IN ITS NOTICE OF CLAIM DATED AUGUST 23, 2019*

**Moved by** Councilmember Jamie Whelan, **seconded by** Councilmember Austin Aslan to adopt Resolution No. 2019-61.

**Vote:** 7 - 0 - Unanimously

- D. Consideration and Adoption of Ordinance No. 2019-38:** An ordinance of the City Council of the City of Flagstaff, authorizing the transfer of a parcel of real property and a temporary construction easement to the State of Arizona, Department of Transportation ("ADOT"), for the Route 66 Bridge Replacement Project, in exchange for substantially equal value; providing for delegation of authority, severability, repeal of conflicting ordinances, and establishing an effective date

Ms. Lee provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

TRANSFER OF REAL PROPERTY AND...  
 PURPOSE  
 IGA/JPA ADOT RT 66 BRIDGE REPLACEMENT PROJECT  
 RT 66 BRIDGE REPLACEMENT PROJECT  
 ADOT SEEKS TO ACQUIRE  
 ARIEL VIEW MAP  
 PROFILE VIEW OF THE PROJECT  
 PURCHASE OFFER  
 SOLIERE WATER TRANSMISSION MAIN PROJECT  
 CITY SEEKS TO ACQUIRE  
 ARIEL VIEW MAP  
 COUNCIL GOALS  
 QUESTIONS

**Moved by** Councilmember Regina Salas, **seconded by** Vice Mayor Adam Shimoni to read Ordinance No. 2019-38 by title only for the first time.

**Vote:** 7 - 0 - Unanimously

*AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF FLAGSTAFF, AUTHORIZING THE TRANSFER OF A PARCEL OF REAL PROPERTY AND A TEMPORARY CONSTRUCTION EASEMENT TO THE STATE OF ARIZONA, DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION, FOR THE ROUTE 66 BRIDGE REPLACEMENT PROJECT, IN EXCHANGE FOR SUBSTANTIALLY EQUAL VALUE; PROVIDING FOR DELEGATION OF AUTHORITY, SEVERABILITY, REPEAL OF CONFLICTING ORDINANCES, AND ESTABLISHING AN EFFECTIVE DATE*

**Moved by** Councilmember Regina Salas, **seconded by** Vice Mayor Adam Shimoni to read Ordinance No. 2019-38 by title only for the final time.

**Vote:** 7 - 0 - Unanimously

*AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF FLAGSTAFF, AUTHORIZING THE TRANSFER OF A PARCEL OF REAL PROPERTY AND A TEMPORARY CONSTRUCTION EASEMENT TO THE STATE OF ARIZONA, DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION, FOR THE ROUTE 66 BRIDGE REPLACEMENT PROJECT, IN EXCHANGE FOR SUBSTANTIALLY EQUAL VALUE; PROVIDING FOR DELEGATION OF AUTHORITY, SEVERABILITY, REPEAL OF CONFLICTING ORDINANCES, AND ESTABLISHING AN EFFECTIVE DATE*

**Moved by** Councilmember Jim McCarthy, **seconded by** Councilmember Regina Salas to adopt Ordinance No. 2019-38.

**Vote:** 7 - 0 - Unanimously

### **RECESS**

The 4:30 p.m. portion of the December 17, 2019, Regular Council Meeting recessed at 5:47 p.m.

### **6:00 P.M. MEETING**

### **RECONVENE**

Mayor Evans reconvened the Regular Meeting of December 17, 2019, at 6:00 p.m.

### **NOTICE OF OPTION TO RECESS INTO EXECUTIVE SESSION**

*Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the City Council and to the general public that, at this regular meeting, the City Council may vote to go into executive session, which will not be open to the public, for legal advice and discussion with the City's attorneys for legal advice on any item listed on the following agenda, pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(3 ).*

### **10. ROLL CALL**

*NOTE: One or more Councilmembers may be in attendance telephonically or by other technological means.*

PRESENT:

ABSENT:

MAYOR EVANS  
VICE MAYOR SHIMONI (arrived at 6:02 p.m.)  
COUNCILMEMBER ASLAN  
COUNCILMEMBER MCCARTHY  
COUNCILMEMBER ODEGAARD  
COUNCILMEMBER SALAS  
COUNCILMEMBER WHELAN

Others present: City Manager Greg Clifton; City Attorney Sterling Solomon.

### **11. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

The Council and audience recited the pledge of allegiance.

### **12. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION**

Dara Marks-Marino and David McCain addressed Council to express their dissatisfaction with the Council's vote to not reappoint David Petersen to the Sustainability Commission.

Sustainability Manager Nicole Antonopoulos introduced Sustainability Specialist Emily Shaffer and Climate Engagement Coordinator Jillian Goulet who provided a PowerPoint Presentation that covered the following:

FLAGSTAFF SUSTAINABILITY LEADERS  
COURSE BACKGROUND AND STRUCTURE  
COURSE CONTENT  
EQUITY CONSIDERATIONS  
THANK YOU

13. **CARRY OVER ITEMS FROM THE 4:30 P.M. AGENDA**

B. **Recognition:** Water Services Director Brad Hill

Deputy City Manager Shane Dille recognized Water Services Director Brad Hill and his accomplishments over his years of service. Mr. Hill officially retired on December 2, 2019 but will remain on board through SmartWorks to assist with the recruitment for his position.

Mayor and Council expressed their well wishes to Mr. Hill and gratitude for all the work and expertise he provided to the City of Flagstaff.

14. **REGULAR AGENDA**

A. **Consideration and Adoption of Ordinance No. 2019-39:** An ordinance amending Section 1-07-001-0005, *Salaries*, of the Flagstaff City Code and establishing an effective date. (*An ordinance potentially changing City Council salaries.*)

Ms. Anderson stated that the proposed changes would include the bi-weekly payment of Council versus monthly. Bi-weekly payments are the current practice and the code needed to reflect that. They also changed the requirement to review Council salaries every four years to when requested by Council. Lastly, they also modified the list of people who will make up the Council Salary Review Committee.

**Moved by** Councilmember Jim McCarthy, **seconded by** Vice Mayor Adam Shimoni to read Ordinance No. 2019-39 by title only for the first time.

**Vote:** 7 - 0 - Unanimously

*AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF FLAGSTAFF, AMENDING SECTION 1-07-001-0005, SALARIES, OF THE FLAGSTAFF CITY CODE, AND ESTABLISHING AN EFFECTIVE DATE*

B. **Consideration and Adoption of Resolution No. 2019-62:** A resolution adopting the City Council 2020 Commemorative Flag Designations

Mr. Solomon reviewed the recent action of Council to designate commemorative flags. He displayed the requests for the 2020 flag designations.

Mark Haughwout addressed Council in opposition of the resolution stating that he believes it to be an infringement on free speech and encouraged the Council to eliminate the use of the pole all together.

Jennifer Lefere addressed Council asking that the Woman Suffrage flag be flown in August.

Council briefly discussed the submitted flags for consideration.

**Moved by** Vice Mayor Adam Shimoni, **seconded by** Councilmember Austin Aslan to read Resolution No. 2019-62 by title only.

**Vote:** 5 - 2

NAY: Councilmember Charlie Odegaard  
Councilmember Jim McCarthy

*A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF FLAGSTAFF (PURSUANT TO THE CITY COUNCIL POLICY ON THE DISPLAY OF FLAGS) DESIGNATING ALL COMMEMORATIVE FLAGS THAT WILL BE DISPLAYED THROUGHOUT THE YEAR 2020 ON THE TEMPORARY POLE IN FRONT OF CITY HALL*

**Moved by** Vice Mayor Adam Shimoni, **seconded by** Councilmember Jamie Whelan to adopt Resolution No. 2019-62.

**Vote:** 5 - 2

NAY: Councilmember Charlie Odegaard  
Councilmember Jim McCarthy

## 15. **DISCUSSION ITEMS**

### A. **Discussion:** Pending Minimum Wage Impact Study

Mr. Clifton addressed Council stating that there has been discussion of late and he requested that the item be placed on an agenda for Council discussion. He stated that the study has three central objectives, first is to provide information on future and existing minimum wage, provide best practice recommendations for local businesses, non-profits and other entities, and to provide best practice recommendations to support a more robust and diverse economy. A full RFP was solicited to identify a competent vendor. The scope of work was created and vetted by the City Managers Office, the Office of Labor Standards, Economic Vitality, and some Councilmembers. Staff was anticipating the submittal to be more than \$50,000, however the agreement was negotiated to \$48,000.

The RFP was advertised on Planet Bids, in the Arizona Republic, and there were three firms that staff reached out to individually. Two firms participated in the pre-proposal meeting and the city received one response to the RFP. There were five bid evaluators and it was determined that Rounds Consulting was responsible and responsive to the RFP. The selection process was done in accordance with the procurement code.

Rounds Consulting has done work with the Arizona Department of Housing, Economic Opportunity, NACOG, the City of Mesa, the League of Arizona Cities and Towns, and Maricopa County. They have also been contracted for an Economic Development Analysis as well as an analysis of various populations on city sales taxes and their performance has been satisfactory or better. The current study is well underway; Rounds Consulting is currently conducting a statistical analysis and has conducted a variety of interviews with Flagstaff employers. Preliminary findings are scheduled to be submitted on December 20, 2019 and staff is scheduled to present those findings to Council on January 7, 2019.

Councilmember Whelan asked what fully vetted means and what the exact process was for

selecting the consultant. If there was only one firm that responded it would be difficult to compare anything. Mr. Clifton stated that there is not a comparison when there is only one respondent but there is no deviation from the procurement process that includes the scoring and matrix. The fact that there was only one submittal does not discard the procurement procedures.

Purchasing Director Patrick Brown offered that when a submittal is reviewed, there are certain criteria used to draw out qualifications and experience to determine if they can do the work. Even though only one proposal was received the process remains the same; if the respondent scores high it moves forward, if they do not score high the proposal is rejected.

Councilmember McCarthy stated that the study should be done by a competent firm with no bias and no agenda to promote. Jim Rounds is a senior fellow of the Goldwater Institute and they take an extremely conservative stance. At the very least, there needs to be input from the other side. He expressed concern about the study not including the perspective of the working people or any positive impacts of the minimum wage increase. Considering the current schedule of the study, it is too late to withdraw the contract so there needs to be a report from a pro-worker focused agency or an agency with no position.

Councilmember Aslan asked how the original bid of \$60,000 was reduced to \$48,000. Mr. Clifton stated that Council set a budget for the study at \$50,000 and when the bid came in at \$60,000 staff negotiated to get the cost closer to the budgeted amount. This is a very common practice in procurement. Councilmember Aslan asked if the scope of work changed through the negotiation. Management Analyst Sarah Langley stated that the scope of work changed slightly because some of the data analysis had already been done internally.

Vice Mayor Shimoni asked if there were any concerns expressed by staff during the process with regards to the political ties to the Goldwater Institute. Mr. Clifton stated that there were no concerns noted, the consultant is well known with other agencies in the state, and they had already provided one study for the city and is nearly done with another with satisfactory performance.

Vice Mayor Shimoni stated that while the consultant would be adequate for other issues, he is concerned that the contract never came to Council given the topic.

Mayor Evans stated that staff was acting in accordance to the direction given by Council who set the budget of \$50,000; staff was negotiating to the desire of Council. Staff is not involved in politics, they are out there doing their work in a non-biased way and in this situation they were looking for the best match based on experience.

Councilmember Whelan stated that there should be policy in place that would not allow city staff to be put in this position. Every contract should have a general search associated with it to prevent the type of conflict that is being faced. She indicated that this is the second time a political oversight has caused issues with contracts and matters that have political impact should always come to Council for consideration regardless of contract amount.

The following individuals addressed Council regarding the minimum wage study:

- Sandra Lubarsky
- Marilyn Weissman
- John Conley

The following comments were received:

- Why was the scope of work limited to the impact on businesses and not how it has benefited workers?
- The Chamber of Commerce should be paying for the study if the focus is on impacts and concerns of businesses.
- Business is thriving in the state, there is no need for a study.
- The issue is transparency; the public did not know about the study until a public records request was done.
- Please support working families and do not encourage the roll back of the minimum wage.
- As a business owner interviewed by the consultant, I was told that the mission was to formulate a study with no opinion; the first question asked was what the positive impacts had been.
- I am really excited to see what the report says.
- You should not jump to conclusions; wait to see what the report says.

A written comment card in opposition to the study was submitted by Gwendolyn Waring.

A break was held from 8:05 p.m. through 8:16 p.m.

Mayor Evans stated that there is a lot of negativity and fear surrounding the minimum wage topic. The Council requested a study to understand the impacts of the minimum wage on cost of living, impacts on youth employment, small business operations, the cost of housing, and how other communities and businesses successfully navigated the minimum wage impacts. The Council wanted the good and bad in an effort to help provide information and best practices to the citizens and businesses of Flagstaff.

Mayor Evans suggested that staff could contact the Morrison Institute and ask if they would do a customary review of the document. We could ask them to give their perception on any bias within the document. She would like to see the contract through and have Rounds Consulting present their findings.

Councilmember Odegaard reiterated that the purpose of the study was to identify best practices to help businesses navigate the situation. He expressed a willingness to wait for the final report from Rounds Consulting to allow an opportunity for the Council and community to see what the outcomes are before making a judgement on bias.

Vice Mayor Shimoni stated that he has concerns about the study with the Rounds Consulting firm and that he does not feel comfortable moving forward with them. He indicated that he would like to cancel the contract with Rounds Consulting and find a consultant that makes more sense.

Councilmember McCarthy stated that it makes sense to finish the contract and then have someone else review it and provide an alternate analysis if necessary.

Councilmember Whelan stated that a step should be added in the vetting process for a Google search to identify or flag possible conflicts. When a consultant is hired they are to come in in an unbiased way. She believes that there will be much in the report that can be used and properly vetted.

Councilmember Aslan noted the expense of getting a second opinion on the report and he believes that it is a doubling down on a study that no one will trust. He expressed concern that a second opinion could also be argued as predetermined and ineffectual.

Councilmember Salas stated that Council asked for the study, they allocated a dollar amount, identified the scope of work, and then the procurement process happened. There is always the issue of having some political sensitivity and not seeing the report and assuming there is bias is a contradiction of what research is; a conclusion is being drawn without receiving the data. Let's take the data and use it, analyze it, deconstruct it, and criticize it if necessary but let's have the data first.

A majority of Council expressed support for continuing the contract and study.

**B. Discussion: Coconino County Flood Control District Potential Project Funding Options.**

Stormwater Project Manager Jim Janecek provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

COCONINO COUNTY FLOOD CONTROL DISTRICT EXPENDITURES  
REQUESTED COUNCIL ACTION  
OPTIONS: DIRECT ALLOCATION OR COMPETITIVE GRANT?  
KEY DATES – HISTORY  
CONCERNS  
CONCLUSIONS

Vice Mayor Shimoni asked what the Flood Control District's total budget is compared to the money set aside for direct allocation or competitive grants. Mr. Janecek stated that many of the options were increased property taxes for increased projects in their capital program. He does not have the exact numbers. At the highest, it was 10% of an approximately \$5 million budget. The latest numbers are about \$2.7 million and the City of Flagstaff contributes about 50% of the Flood Control District's revenue.

Deputy City Manager Shane Dille stated that the City's message from the beginning has been to have a fair process on how the money flows to the projects and taking exception to the method of taking the County's identified projects and leaving a residual amount to the cities and towns.

Council voiced their support for moving forward with staff's recommendation to draft a resolution that expresses support for a direct allocation approach of distributing collected Coconino County Flood Control District (CCFCD) tax revenue to municipalities for their flood control projects.

**C. Discussion: Priority Based Budgeting Program Inventory and Costing Update.**

Ms. Langley provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

PRIORITY BASED BUDGETING UPDATE PROGRAM INVENTORY AND COSTING  
PROGRAM INVENTORY  
PROGRAM INVENTORY PROGRESS  
PROGRAM COSTING  
BENEFITS OF PROGRAM COSTING  
PROGRAM COSTING PROGRESS  
PROGRAM COSTING EXAMPLES  
UPCOMING PBB EVENTS

Council briefly discussed how an employee's work hours are allocated when working more than 40 hours per week.

Vice Mayor Shimoni expressed excitement about the new budgeting tool and he looks forward to implementing it in the next budget cycle.

Councilmember Whelan agreed, thanking staff for their work on implementation.

**Moved by** Councilmember Jamie Whelan, **seconded by** Councilmember Jim McCarthy to continue the meeting in accordance with the City Council Rules of Procedure.

**Vote:** 7 - 0 - Unanimously

**16. COUNCIL LIAISON REPORTS**

Councilmember Whelan reported that she attended the Census 2020 office grand opening. She stated that they are hiring a number of employees and she encouraged people to apply.

Councilmember Odegaard reported that he attended the Transportation Commission meeting where they talked about a roadway connection between University Highlands and the community behind that. He also attended the Beautification and Public Art Commission Meeting and an item of note is concerning the Flagstaff Arts Council community meeting that is upcoming; the Arts Council approached the Commission for assistance in funding with the implementation of the results of the meeting.

Vice Mayor Shimoni reported that he also attended the Census office grand opening; there are 105 days remaining to complete the count.

Councilmember Salas reported that she attended the Parks and Recreation Commission meeting where they discussed the Southside Neighborhood Plan, the Rio de Flag project, the Flagstaff Trails Initiative, and a westside park.

**17. FUTURE AGENDA ITEM REQUESTS**

*After discussion and upon agreement by three members of the Council, an item will be moved to a regularly-scheduled Council meeting.*

- A. Future Agenda Item Request (F.A.I.R.):** A request by Councilmember Odegaard to have a discussion about placing a meaningful designation that Flagstaff is a Purple Heart City from a Proclamation in 2016. A plaque at City Hall and where appropriate of said designation. Signage at the entrance of the City limits and for City public parking spaces where appropriate for "Combat Wounded Veterans"

Councilmember Odegaard withdrew his request for a future discussion but asked that when budget discussions come forward that the Council look at allocating funding for the signage at the city limits and for some parking spaces.

- B. Future Agenda Item Request (F.A.I.R.):** A request by Councilmember Odegaard to have a discussion about reaffirming that the City of Flagstaff is a "Golden Rule City" by the current City Council by pledging Resolution #2008-68 or updating the Resolution to the Council wishes.

Councilmember Odegaard stated that there was a resolution passed in 2008 recognizing the City as being a Golden Rule City; he asked that Council consider reaffirming that resolution.

There were at least three Councilmembers in support of moving forward.

**18. CITY MANAGER REPORT**

**A. City Manager Report**

Mr. Clifton briefly reviewed his report.

**19. INFORMATIONAL ITEMS AND REPORTS FROM COUNCIL AND STAFF, FUTURE AGENDA ITEM REQUESTS**

Councilmember Odegaard reported that members of Council were in Washington DC last week advocating for the Rio de Flag flood control project. They met with Mr. Waxman from OMB who expressed appreciation that the Mayor and Council showed up to personally advocate for their community.

Councilmember Aslan reported that the Washington DC trip was very protective, and things appear to be moving in the right direction. The federal government passed a budget today and that bring the Rio de Flag one step closer to funding. He was impressed with how important it was for city representatives to be there physically and reminding representatives of who Flagstaff is and why we are asking for support.

Councilmember McCarthy stated that there are a series of meetings regarding climate change happening later in the week at the Fourth Street library.

Councilmember Whelan reported that she attended the Flagstaff Medical Center opening of the adult behavioral health unit. She also reported that she attended the 14<sup>th</sup> annual vigil to remember victims of gun violence.

Vice Mayor Shimoni stated that he will be discussing bicycle lanes with staff tomorrow. He wished everyone a happy holiday season and reminded the public about the New Year's Eve events downtown.

Councilmember Salas addressed the public participation topic regarding the Sustainability Commission appointments. She also wished everyone a happy holiday season.

Mayor Evans stated that the lobbying trip to Washington DC was great and it was very clear that the Arizona delegation was all on the same page. She also reported that she went to the state capital to testify on behalf of the City of Flagstaff regarding short-term rentals. She also reported that December 23, 2019 is the second day of Hanukah and there will be a menorah lighting at 5:00 p.m. at City Hall. Lastly, she wished everyone a happy holiday season.

**20. ADJOURNMENT**

The Regular Meeting of the Flagstaff City Council held December 17, 2019, adjourned at 10:16 p.m.

---

MAYOR

ATTEST:

---

CITY CLERK

**CERTIFICATION**

I, STACY SALTZBURG, do hereby certify that I am the City Clerk of the City of Flagstaff, County of Coconino, State of Arizona, and that the above Minutes are a true and correct summary of the Meeting of the Council of the City of Flagstaff held on December 17, 2019. I further certify that the Meeting was duly called and held and that a quorum was present.

DATED this 7th day of September, 2021.

---

CITY CLERK