

MINUTES

**HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION
WEDNESDAY
OCTOBER 21, 2020**

**CITY HALL
211 WEST ASPEN AVENUE
5:00 P.M.**

1. Call to Order

NOTICE OF OPTION TO RECESS INTO EXECUTIVE SESSION

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the Heritage Preservation Commission and to the general public that, at this regular meeting, the Heritage Preservation Commission may vote to go into executive session, which will not be open to the public, for legal advice and discussion with the City's attorneys for legal advice on any item listed on the following agenda, pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(3).

Call to order at 5:01pm

2. Roll Call

NOTE: One or more Commission Members may be in attendance telephonically or by other technological means.

DAVID HAYWARD, Chairperson
JERRY MCLAUGHLIN, Vice-Chairperson
HARRIS ABERNATHY
EMILY DALE

JILL HOUGH
CAITLIN KELLY
CHARLES WEBBER

CITY STAFF PRESENT:

Sara Dechter, Comprehensive and Neighborhood Planning Manager
Mark Reavis, Heritage Preservation Office/Neighborhood Planne

3. Public Comment

At this time, any member of the public may address the Commission on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled before the Commission on that day. Due to Open Meeting Laws, the Commission cannot discuss or act on items presented during this portion of the agenda. To address the Commission on an item that is on the agenda, please wait for the Chair to call for Public Comment at the time the item is heard.

No public comments

4. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Approve the Minutes of the Heritage Preservation Commission meeting of September 17, 2020

Moved by Harris Abernathy, **seconded by** Jill Hough

Vote: 6 - 0 - Unanimously

5. PUBLIC HEARING

A. Whispering Winds/ Route 66 - Land Mark Overlay Zoning Map Amendment

Address: 922 E. Route 66

Assessor's Parcel Number: 104-05-005

Property Owner: WW66. LLC,6164, Abineau Canyon Dr,Flagstaff AZ

Applicant: Jose R. Alvarado, Director of Sales, Ascend Capital Management
City Staff: Mark Reavis, HPO

Conduct Public Hearing to meet the Neighborhood Meeting requirement for a Landmark Overlay Zoning Map Amendment for the purpose of restoring the historic Route 66 sign at 922 E Route 66 (Whispering Winds Motel).
 Receive public comment and review the updated sign application.

None recommended

The HPC has reviewed and approved the application for a historic sign & facade grant as a \$10,000 matching grant for the full restoration of the Whispering Winds Motel Sign. The HPO has reviewed a submission by a sign company that accurately reestablishes the missing upper components of the historic sign that remains. The applicant will confirm that the project will comply with that HPO review with the sign contractor that is selected.

Public Hearing was paused between 5:08pm and 5:34pm because audio was not streaming. Meeting continued with detailed minutes at 5:34pm.

No public comment on this item.

Mark Reavis, HPO, provided a summary that this Landmark Overlay proposal is for the historic sign only. The Zoning Code requires that restoration of a historic sign that is larger than what would currently be permitted be done under a Landmark Overlay.

David Hayward expressed that it is good to see more historic hotels restored instead of torn down.

6. GENERAL BUSINESS

A. **Southside Historic Context Document - Consultant Report Review & Discussion.**

Heritage Preservation Commission (HPC) is to listen to the Consultant Presentation (Lynn Neil) and ask initial questions regarding the document. At this time the HPC is not asked to accept the document, but to become familiar with the Context Document. Please provide any relevant input and questions you may have and forward those to the Heritage Preservation Officer. The HPC will be asked to accept the document at the next regularly scheduled meeting after the Commission has a change to review the submitted document. Any corrections or additions will be included in a Staff Report at the next HPC meeting.

Lynn Neal presents findings of draft report.

What started out as an Update of an outdated historic context morphed into a full-blown update of the Southside properties inventory, including scrutinizing all the "back of lot" buildings on the parcels. These property types originated as rental houses, garages, sheds, etc., and most often function today as rental properties.

Lynn is still triple checking the numbers of the variously categorized properties, but as of today, here are the figures.

Total Properties Inventoried = ~358 (This is compared to 200 properties included in the 2010 Registration Form. About 300 Southside properties were evaluated during the 1992/1993 study, and several of these properties excluded from what was identified as the Southside Historic District in 2010 have been re-evaluated and included in the current Registration Form.)

Total Contributing = ~315, Total Non-contributing = 17 (1 outside the District on NAU property), Previously Listed to the NRHP elsewhere = 9, Demolished = 17

The added 158 properties is a 44% increase over those included in the 2010 Registration Form. Eighty-eight percent (n = ~315) of the total properties are Contributing, 2.5% are Previously Listed, leaving only 9.5% as Non-contributing and Demolished. This means that an estimates 88 % of the evaluated properties are likely contributing.

The increase in properties was achieved through an expansion of the District boundaries (largely to the SSE, E, and a bit to the NW), a re-evaluation of properties originally evaluated in 1992 and/or in 2009/2010, and including new properties not previously evaluated. The expansion of the period of significance date range end date from 1947 to 1968 brought in more 1950s-60s housing, commercial properties, churches, and the Murdoch Center.

Proposed boundaries are expanded to the south and take into account the area east of the Souths Beaver School and some expansion to the east as well. Properties that were evaluated previously are being re-evaluated because the context is recommending expansion of the period of significance to 1968 to include the Civil Rights era. Now all the churches in the Southside and the Murdoch Center can now be included.

Questions & Comments:

Emily Dale—She has data on 518 S Agassiz that she will provide to Lynn Neal

Sara Dechter—indicated that the City has a grant from SHPO to research the additional properties. Mark will take the new Registration Form, create the individual Building Inventory Forms for submittal to SHPO to get the Registration Form reviewed and approved.

Jill Hough—The only thing she found to be missing was the properties Map. (Lynn responded that it is forthcoming, along with a further updated Registration Form with the completed properties listing.)

David Hayward—will provide his comments via email.

Jill Hough and Emily Dale will both volunteer time to work on the evaluation and offer assistance.

Sara Dechter—indicated that the Southside Context will be re-agendized with maps and updates next month so that comments can be reviewed and discussed.

B. Discussion: Downtown, Southside, Route 66 & Neon

No HPC action at this time. Discussion only.

Mark Reavis is requesting this discussion to get feedback on the use of neon on businesses South of the current Route 66.

David Hayward noted that he believes we end up with attractive signs whether neon or not in the central sign district

Jill Hough suggested we should look for historic photographs to see if there was neon south of route 66 historically

Sara Dechter adds that the area discussed is in the Flagstaff Central Sign District but not in the Downtown Overlay. The Overlay is the source of the language related to neon and Route 66.

Sara Dechter points out that neon is allowed but it is not something that was seen historically on South San Francisco based on photographs she has seen. they may have been introduced in the late 1950s south of Route 66.

Mark Reavis would like to continue direction of bringing all neon in the Downtown Overlay to the Commission and bring all neon in the Central Sign District to the Commission.

C. **Heritage Preservation Commission Education and Work Session Needs**

The purpose of this discussion is for the Heritage Preservation Commission to outline specific educational opportunities to be presented by the Heritage Preservation Officer or the City Clerk at future meetings. Please provide at least educational subject for the HPO to prepare.

Mark Reavis suggested documenting the historic use of neon in the community, the next month could be Secretary of the Interior Guidelines as examples of educational topics.

David Hayward – it would be much appreciated because much of the commission is self taught. He would like a presentation on each of the historic districts and their requirements. TO, DO, Central Sign Districts

Jill Hough – they would all like to be able to understand what you can and cannot do in different zones and what a property might find helpful.

Charlie Webber – would like more in depth discussions on how the Zoning Code and the HP guidelines work together and how we can use them together. Include Dan Symer in that presentation to offer context It's been difficult

Jill – Charlie Weber and Emily Dale and Jill Hough are all versed in historic preservation and can also have presentations from commissions.

Mark could use more understanding of archeology. He has joined the AZSITE Committee for the State.

Charlie Weber could provide a presentation on archeology – David Hayward would like to understand more about what the Commission should know when we are reviewing a case for development what we need to know about archeological resources. Give the Commission a better idea of how resources are identified and what are the methods used so the Commission can evaluate if a CRS is adequate.

Sara Dechter asked if there are any items that the Commission would like the clerk's office to present. David would like a clarifying memo from the clerk with guidance about what should a commissioner do if they are contacted by someone about a project that is under HPC review.

7. **REPORTS**

A. **Pre-Application Meetings (PAMs)**

Permit Number(s): PZ-20-00169

Address: 306 E. Franklin Ave,

Type of Approval: PAM - Inquiry about appropriate addition to 1952 structure from single-family to duplex.

Permit Number(s): PZ-20-000172

Address: 302 W Oak,

Type of Approval: PAM- :Inquiry about demolition of historic 71 year old mortuary (retains significance) for construction of a condo project. At minimum CR letter report.

Permit Number(s): PZ-20-000171

Address: 4619 S Lake Mary Rd

Type of Approval: PAM- :Lake Mary RV Park inquiry would combine several parcels to provide a commercial campground with RV's and Park models to rent. Requested a Cultural Resource study by an archeologist be submitted with Concept Plan submittal.

Starting to work into more Pre-application meetings to get HPC mentioned more often.

David Hayward – from his experience pre-apps are pre-contract in a development project and being able to give people a heads up as early as possible is helpful. It can make a big difference to people at that point.

Jill Hough – 306 E Franklin Belonged to John J Johnson – 1st pastor of Springhill Baptist church – significance is high. Jill may have more information on the property. The date on the structure may actually be 1950 or even before.

B. Building Permit Review: returned for correction.

Permit Number(s): BP-20-01831-01

Address: 537 S O'Leary St

STAFF RECOMMENDED ACTION:- (gas explosion window damage) - Return for Corrections/HPC application required.

Permit Number(s): BP-20-01922

Address: 918 W Summit Ave

STAFF RECOMMENDED ACTION:- Lumpkin Basement ADU (new from roof truss replacement review) - 1915 home with historic integrity - Return for Corrections/HPC application required.

Permit Number(s): BP-20-01945

Address: 314 N Beaver St.

STAFF RECOMMENDED ACTION:-, Demo of non-historic Unit # 4 ADU and rebuild - Approved with Conditions of documentation of previous determination of non-contributing with documentation submitted.

Permit Number(s): BP-20-01859

Address: 303 N Verde St

STAFF RECOMMENDED ACTION:-, 1918 historic residence proposed deck expansion, submission incomplete - HPC application required.

C. Building Permits - Not requiring HPO review approval for Post WWII production housing.

Permit Number(s) & Address: Fierros BP-20-01877 3350 N Pine Dr. (1 door replaced); Marshal Windows BP-20-01898 3350 N Pine Dr. (9 windows replaced).

Approval Date: 9/11/2020

D. ADOT & Fresquez property demolitions

Permit Number(s): BP-20-02048

Address: 1801 S Milton and adjacent

Type of Approval: Demolition

Approval Date: 09/29/2020

ADOT demolition – there are some historians who are working on their own research into the property before it is demolished

E. Inter-Divison Staff (IDS) - with Heritage Review Requirements.

**Review Dates of IDS - New Conceptual/Updates and Revisions/Admin
Completeness/Substantive Review: 9/10/2020 - 1/24/2020**

Project:SCA Paper Plant

Permit Number(s): PZ-20-00071-01 & 02

Address: 1600 Butler Ave

Type of Review(s): Concept Plan - HPO site visit & consult with HR consultant mandated a Phase 1 Cultural Resource report to be submitted with Site Plan (first review w/concept plan) former SEA Paper - CR reporting undertaken by Cornerstone Consulting.

Project:Toaster Owl Shade Structure

Permit Number(s): PZ-20-00160

Address: 12 S Mike's Pike, - Southside NR District

Type of Review(s):Toasted Owl Sun Shade Structure PZ-20-00160 12 S Mike's Pike (In Southside District, (adjacent to 56 year old structure on site) HPO determination of no adverse effect, complete process with Building Permit review.

Project: Lofts on the Mesa

Permit Number(s): PZ-20-00168

Address:1571 N Pine Cliff,

Type of Review(s)- Cultural Resource (archeological concerns) applicant notified of requirements.

Project: Sky Cottages

Permit Number(s): PZ-20-00153

Address: 2701 S Woody Mountain Rd,

Type of Review(s) Cultural Resources likely associated with McAllister Ranch and potential archeological concerns - requires site survey and Cultural Resource Report - completion of reporting within project reviews.

Project: Ellery Duplex

Permit Number(s): PZ-19-00263-01

Address: 214 E Ellery

Type of Review(s) A proposed duplex is being added to a site with an existing historic duplex in the Southside National Register District, proposed new duplex does not meet Flagstaff design requirements as well as historic compatibility (requires District compatible primary elevation submission).

8. MISCELLANEOUS ITEMS TO/FROM COMMISSION MEMBERS

Re-application of returning and recruitment of new Commissioners

[Brief discussion of terms and recruitment for the Commission](#)

[The Downtown Vision should have a first draft out soon and staff will circulate it to the commission members when it is available.](#)

9. **ADJOURNMENT**

Adjourn at 6:22pm

CERTIFICATE OF POSTING OF NOTICE

The undersigned hereby certifies that a copy of the foregoing notice was duly posted at Flagstaff City Hall on _____, at _____ a.m./p.m. This notice has been posted on the City's website and can be downloaded at www.flagstaff.az.gov.

Dated this _____ day of _____, 2020.

Sara Dechter, Comprehensive Planning Manager