

MINUTES

1. Call to Order

Mayor Deasy called the Special Meeting of the Flagstaff City Council held September 28, 2021, to order at 3:04 p.m.

NOTICE OF OPTION TO RECESS INTO EXECUTIVE SESSION

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the City Council and to the general public that, at this work session, the City Council may vote to go into executive session, which will not be open to the public, for legal advice and discussion with the City's attorneys for legal advice on any item listed on the following agenda, pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(3).

2. **ROLL CALL**

NOTE: One or more Councilmembers may be in attendance telephonically or by other technological means.

PRESENT:

ABSENT:

MAYOR DEASY
VICE MAYOR DAGGETT
COUNCILMEMBER ASLAN (virtually)
COUNCILMEMBER MCCARTHY
COUNCILMEMBER SALAS
COUNCILMEMBER SHIMONI
COUNCILMEMBER SWEET

Others present: City Manager Greg Clifton; City Attorney Sterling Solomon.

3. Pledge of Allegiance and Mission Statement

The Council and audience recited the pledge of allegiance and Vice Mayor Daggett read the Mission Statement of the City of Flagstaff.

MISSION STATEMENT

The mission of the City of Flagstaff is to protect and enhance the quality of life for all.

4. **Recognition:** Flagstaff Olympic Athletes

The Mayor and Council approached the podium and recognized Luis Grijalva, Aliphine Tuliemuk, Rachel Schneider, Molly Seidel, and Kaitlin Verfeurth. Mayor Deasy read and presented a recognition to each athlete.

5. **Appeal of the Denial by the Planning Commission of PZ-19-00204-03:** Appeal of the denial of a Conditional Use Permit request from Miramonte Presidio LLC to establish a Planned Residential Development (PRD) on Tract M within the Presidio in the Pines master planned development. The PRD consists of 39 multi-family residential units on 2.77 acres located at 2940 S Woody Mountain Road within the Highway Commercial (HC) zone.

Planning Development Manager Tiffany Antol provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

PZ-19-00204-03 PRESIDIO TRACT M PLANNED RESIDENTIAL DEVELOPMENT
 CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT
 PRESIDIO TRACT M
 BACKGROUND
 PROPOSED SITE PLAN
 ON-SITE PARKING
 PROPOSED ELEVATIONS
 EXISTING ARCHITECTURE
 WHAT IS A CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT?
 FINDINGS
 ACCESS, TRAFFIC, AND CIRCULATION
 ADEQUACY OF SITE
 RESOURCE PROTECTION PLAN
 NOISE, LIGHT, VISUAL, AND OTHER POLLUTANTS
 STYLE AND SITING OF STRUCTURE AND RELATIONSHIP TO SURROUNDING
 NEIGHBORHOOD
 LANDSCAPING AND SCREENING
 LANDSCAPE PLAN
 IMPACT ON PUBLIC UTILITIES
 SIGNAGE AND OUTDOOR LIGHTING
 DEDICATION AND DEVELOPMENT OF STREETS
 IMPACT ON RESOURCES
 PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PLAN
 RECOMMENDATION

Land Acquisition and Development Manager for Miramonte Homes Charity Lee provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

TONIGHT'S PRESENTATION
 OVERVIEW MAPS
 NEIGHBORHOOD QUESTIONS/CONCERNS
 ASSESSOR MAP
 ORIGINAL PRESIDIO IN THE PINE SUBDIVISION PLANNED FOR 788 UNITS
 TRACT A – ORIGINAL PLAN
 TRACT A – TODAY
 TRACT B – ORIGINAL PLAN
 TRACT B – TODAY

IS TRACT M PART OF THE HOA?
HISTORY OF TRACT M
TRACT M ZONING
SITE PLAN FOR DEVELOPMENT
IS PARKING SUFFICIENT?
HOW WILL THE PROPERTY ADDRESS DRAINAGE?
IS TRAFFIC TOO DENSE?
WILL CONDOS BE COMPATIBLE WITH EXISTING DEVELOPMENT?
RENDERINGS
HERS INDEX SCORES
GRANTING THE CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT

Councilmember Salas asked how short-term rentals would be addressed. Ms. Lee explained that they would be restricted through the deed restrictions and nothing less than 30-day rentals would be permitted.

Councilmember Shimoni asked if there were any community spaces included in the project such as gardens or dog parks. Ms. Lee stated that no additional amenities were provided in order to protect the tree resources but there is access to surrounding open space.

The following individuals addressed Council in opposition of the granting of the Conditional Use Permit:

- Summer Johnson
- Robert Davis
- Whitney Biggerstaff
- Cal Hamren
- Cynthia Daiker
- Brandon Johnson

The following comments were received:

- The City Council needs to uphold the decision of the Planning and Zoning Commission.
- We bought a home in Presidio because we were told by numerous realtors and builders that Tract M would be used as either public greenspace for the neighborhood, or possibly a church.
- The parking in the area is already stressed, this will add more vehicles to the streets further complicating the issue.
- The water drainage infrastructure was not designed to support 39 condominiums.
- Adding the condos will change the family feel of the neighborhood.
- Most of the condos will probably be bought by investors, who will rent them to college students or temporary residents which does not address the housing problem.
- We are a wonderful community and want things to stay designed as is.
- There is a safety issue with putting the 39 units at the entrance of the community.
- This will eliminate a benefit to the community in exchange for condos.
- The site should keep the original intent of a church building.
- The entire subdivision is opposed to putting condos in this location.
- The permitted parking spaces are inadequate and there is no parking for guests.
- There is no benefit because the condos will not be affordable housing and will be out of reach for many who are seeking housing.
- The original owner of the parcel was Francis McCallister, a longtime Flagstaff resident; her wish was to see this parcel used for a church.
- The commission voted against the project; why have a commission if you overturn their decisions?
- There are 1300 units going in at Timber Sky across the street. Miramonte needs to

come back with townhouses or two-story homes, something compatible with the neighborhood.

The following individuals submitted written comments in opposition of the granting of the Conditional Use Permit:

- Drew Wartenburg
- Allan Gerston
- John and Catherine Sickafoose
- Phoebe Wood
- Summer Johnson
- Brandon Johnson
- Karin Morgan
- Annette Lauritsen
- Robert Davis
- Kevin and Kate Collins
- Betsy Decker
- Ryan Carpenter
- Michelle Kuzdas
- Thomas and Shelley Alvin
- Debbie Nankivell
- LeAnn Taylor
- Thomas and Nancy Hayden
- Lisa Winborne
- Anthony Gardiner
- Bruce Higgins
- David Farrell
- Marvin Rozell
- Jay Zeilenga
- William and Kathleen Lusk
- Erik Mrdak
- Allen George

The Presidio in the Pines Homeowners Association submitted written comments requesting a stipulation to the Conditional Use Permit.

Christy Zeller submitted written comments in support of the granting of the Conditional Use Permit.

Council discussed concerns about limited EV parking, low number of affordable units, limited bicycle infrastructure, and the HOA structure. They also discussed concerns related to traffic in the area. Councilmember McCarthy noted that the Transportation Commission will be discussing the traffic concerns of the surrounding area at an upcoming meeting and recommendations are being formulated to bring to Council.

Councilmember Salas stated that she will be supporting the Conditional Use Permit because it meets the findings required by the Zoning Code to approve a Conditional Use Permit.

Moved by Councilmember Adam Shimoni, **seconded by** Councilmember Jim McCarthy to approve the CUP requested from Miramonte LLC PULL with the conditions as presented in the Planning and Zoning packet.

Vote: 6 - 1

NAY: Mayor Paul Deasy

6. Adjournment

The Special Meeting of the Flagstaff City Council held September 28, 2021, adjourned at 5:03 p.m.

WORK SESSION

1. Call to Order

Mayor Deasy called the Work Session of the Flagstaff City Council held September 28, 2021, to order at 5:03 p.m.

NOTICE OF OPTION TO RECESS INTO EXECUTIVE SESSION

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the City Council and to the general public that, at this work session, the City Council may vote to go into executive session, which will not be open to the public, for legal advice and discussion with the City's attorneys for legal advice on any item listed on the following agenda, pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(3).

2. Public Participation

Public Participation enables the public to address the council about items that are not on the prepared agenda. Public Participation appears on the agenda twice, at the beginning and at the end of the work session. You may speak at one or the other, but not both. Anyone wishing to comment at the meeting is asked to fill out a speaker card and submit it to the recording clerk. When the item comes up on the agenda, your name will be called. You may address the Council up to three times throughout the meeting, including comments made during Public Participation. Please limit your remarks to three minutes per item to allow everyone to have an opportunity to speak. At the discretion of the Chair, ten or more persons present at the meeting and wishing to speak may appoint a representative who may have no more than fifteen minutes to speak.

Anissa Doten addressed Council about flooding at Linda Vista and Grandview. She requested more transparent and frequent communication for those in the flood areas.

Scott Richards addressed Council about flooding in the Grandview area. He asked that the City Council consider further prioritizing flood mitigation on all levels for the museum fire floods. There are concerns about access for emergency service vehicles as well as the silt and dust left from the flooding.

Gail Jackson addressed Council stating that October is Manufacturing Month. There are a number of events scheduled throughout October to celebrate the manufacturing sector.

Kurt Drawz submitted a written comment asking for improved storm drainage to mitigate the flooding from the Museum Fire.

A break was held from 5:11 p.m. through 5:33 p.m.

3. Review of Draft Agenda for the October 5, 2021 City Council Meeting

Citizens wishing to speak on agenda items not specifically called out by the City Council may submit a speaker card for their items of interest to the recording clerk.

None

4. Update and Review of Flagstaff's Draft 10-Year Housing Plan

Housing Director Sarah Darr along with Housing Project Manager Leah Bloom provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

10-YEAR HOUSING PLAN UPDATE
TOPICS OF DISCUSSION
IMPORTANT DATES
AFFORDABLE HOUSING DECLARATION
HOUSING EMERGENCY DECLARATION
COUNCIL DECLARED A HOUSING EMERGENCY IN DECEMBER 2020
10-YEAR HOUSING PLAN
FLAGSTAFF'S INTERCONNECTED CHALLENGES AND SHARED SOLUTIONS
PUBLIC PARTICIPATION AND PROJECT TIMELINE
INFORMAL WORKING GROUPS
INCLUSIVE PUBLIC PARTICIPATION
PUBLIC PARTICIPATION
DRAFT 10-YEAR PLAN
WHAT IS AFFORDABLE HOUSING?
PROGRAM INCOME LIMITS
BASIC HOUSING CONTINUUM
FLAGSTAFF NEEDS ASSESSMENT
LOCAL DATA
WHAT CAN FLAGSTAFF FAMILIES AFFORD?
FLAGSTAFF HOUSING SURVEY
2,949 RESPONSES
HOUSING COST BURDEN RESULTS
BARRIERS TO HOMEOWNERSHIP
RESPONDENTS CONSIDERING LEAVING
SUPPORT OF AFFORDABLE HOUSING DEVELOPMENT
LOCAL HOUSING GAP ANALYSIS
METHOD FOR AFFORDABLE HOUSING NEED
AFFORDABLE/SUBSIDIZED HOUSING NEED
METHOD FOR MARKET-RATE HOUSING NEED
TOTAL HOUSING NEED
SOLUTIONS
CREATE
CONNECT
PRESERVE
PROTECT
GOAL
SINGLE OVERARCHING GOAL
HOUSING GOAL NUMBER
HOUSING SUBSIDIES GOAL NUMBER
ACCOMPLISHED THROUGH 4 POLICY INITIATIVES
TIMELINE AND NEXT STEPS
IMPORTANT DATES

Council expressed appreciation for staff's work in developing the plan. They also thanked all the community members who participated and offered their assistance in the development.

Councilmember Shimoni indicated that he would like to know more about how other states are dealing with issues of inclusionary zoning, how there may be ways to influence market pricing, and a specific plan for each AMI level. Ms. Darr stated that research continues to be done with other states. In terms of plans by AMI, so much is dependent upon funding and if the city continues to remain dependent upon state and federal funding that will limit what can be done. Lastly, influencing the market is challenging because we live in a capitalistic society.

Councilmember Aslan stated that he firmly believes that the city will never build its way to housing affordability; supply and demand are very powerful forces. The overarching goal is to reduce the affordable housing need and acknowledge those who are here and want to stay here. There should be something in the plan that addresses the nuances of the market. We should be building the types of units that lower income folks need and are attracted to moving into.

Councilmember McCarthy noted the need to address the barriers that exist for builders to build. He presented the following comments:

- On page 7, under Protect 3, add support legislation that will encourage occupancy of Flagstaff housing by Flagstaff residents rather than for second homes, for instance, lower property taxes on properties occupied by primary residences.
- On page 24, under Second Home discussion, consider mentioning that the trend of people working from home makes it more practical for people to have a home in Flagstaff, even if their primary job location is elsewhere.
- On page 44, the table under Create 2.2, the existing policy is that development should pay its own way so that existing property owners are not required to have higher taxes to subsidize new development. If we start waiving fees and things like that, those costs get paid for by other property tax owners, and that's really counterproductive to the goal of making all housing more affordable.
- Ease the Conditional Use Permit process but it needs to be done rationally and productively so other problems are not created.

Matt Handwerk addressed Council stating that the document misses the mark. Relying on federal government subsidies is not sustainable in the long run. Businesses are going to be burdened with more regulations. Supply and demand is what would help solve all of these issues, not government regulation, not a document that is so wide spread across housing equity inclusion.

Khara House addressed Council in support of the 10-year housing plan and stated if not us then who, if not now then when. Creatively engaging community partners is needed to create safe decent and affordable housing. Housing is health and hope.

The following individuals submitted written comments in support of the 10-Year Housing Plan:

- Ross Altenbaugh
- Tad Moore

A break was held from 7:26 p.m. through 7:38 p.m.

5. **Advancing Resilience in Flagstaff: Preliminary Discussion**

Climate Program Manager Jenny Niemann introduced Kelsey Craft and Noah Humphrey, Master students at NAU, who provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

VULNERABILITY AND RESILIENCE IN FLAGSTAFF
PROJECT GOALS
FLAGSTAFF CLIMATE DOCUMENTS
DEFINITIONS
CLIMATE CHANGE IN FLAGSTAFF
VULNERABILITIES: WHAT IS AT RISK?
VULNERABILITIES: TOURISM AND RECREATION
VULNERABILITIES: WATER SUPPLY, QUALITY, AND INFRASTRUCTURE
VULNERABILITIES: FOREST HEALTH AND WILDLIFE
VULNERABILITIES: LAND USE, INFRASTRUCTURE, AND HOUSING
VULNERABILITIES: PUBLIC HEALTH, SAFETY, AND SERVICES
TYING IT ALL TOGETHER
PLAN OF ACTION

Council expressed appreciation for the presentation and the work the students had done on the project. They indicated excitement to see things move forward for a comprehensive resources guide be developed. Council encouraged engagement with the various commissions for input on their efforts.

6. **Public Participation**

None

7. **Informational Items To/From Mayor, Council, and City Manager; future agenda item requests**

Councilmember McCarthy requested that consideration be given to providing formal notice to the public regarding amendments to Development Agreements that may have some sensitivities associated with it. It would be a judgement call and may not apply to all cases but he would like for it to be considered for future amendments.

Councilmember Sweet stated that there is a lot of activity coming up over the weekend with October Fest, First Friday Artwalk, NAU Parent's Weekend, and other events; she encouraged everyone to be mindful and patient with everyone while trying to navigate around the city.

Councilmember Salas stated that Wednesday is the grand opening of Elevated Shredding. She also reported that the dedication of the Sawmill County Park to former Supervisor Liz Archuleta is on Saturday and the groundbreaking of the Children's Place with Housing Solutions of Arizona is next Tuesday.

Councilmember Shimoni reported that he and Vice Mayor Daggett visited Tynkertopia; it was a great experience and he encouraged everyone to take an opportunity to visit. The Alternate Response Town Hall went well with good discussion. He made note of the following upcoming events, Museum Flood resident meeting at Ponderosa Park, Council Retreat on Thursday to discuss infrastructure, and the Women's March on Saturday.

8. Adjournment

The Work Session of the Flagstaff City Council held September 28, 2021, adjourned at 8:17 p.m.

MAYOR

ATTEST:

CITY CLERK

CERTIFICATION

I, STACY SALTZBURG, do hereby certify that I am the City Clerk of the City of Flagstaff, County of Coconino, State of Arizona, and that the above Minutes are a true and correct summary of the Meeting of the Council of the City of Flagstaff held on September 28, 2021. I further certify that the Meeting was duly called and held and that a quorum was present.

DATED this 1st day of November, 2022.

CITY CLERK