

**CITY OF FLAGSTAFF HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION
STAFF REPORT – Special Meeting**

Cultural Resource Study Framework – Phase 1 w/mitigation

Address: 3620 N Schultz Pass Rd

DATE: July 13th, 2020

MEETING DATE: July 20th, 2020

REPORT BY: Mark Reavis, AICP, NCARB

BACKGROUND

Due to the need to take emergency measures to mitigate the severe risk of flooding following the 2022 Pipeline Fire, and, upon recommendation of City Manager as a permissible exercise of City governmental functions to protect public safety, approve flood control project with the Heritage Preservation Officer meeting with the Heritage Preservation Commission to review the frame work for the completion of a Cultural Resource Study (CRS) to meet the intent and processes required for a “Certificate of Appropriateness” to allow for the emergency action to take place. The Phase 1 CRS is to include mitigation in the form of interpretive signage as a condition that upon completion of the flood control project and within a period of one year after review by the HPC that interpretive signage is to be researched, written, produced, and funded by the City of Flagstaff and installed in proximity of the impacted site, in a prominent publicly accessible location intended to return the lost value of the resource back to the public. Flagstaff’s Heritage Preservation Officer will take the lead on the production of the interpretive signage with final review by the HPC for compliance.

PREVIOUS HPC DECISIONS

This property was reviewed by the HPC for inclusion as a local Historic Overlay Zone and was approved as such by the City Council.

REQUEST BY APPLICANT

In response to the emergency flood prevention action to be taken on Schultz Creek approve the following framework in appendices “A” for a Phase 1 Cultural Resource Study (CRS) with a mitigation product to be completed by the Heritage Preservation Officer (HPO) and the City of Flagstaff in order to proceed with an expedited emergency flood control construction project within a designated Landmark Overlay Zone owned by the City of Flagstaff:

Appendices “A”

Appendix “A”

Cultural Resource Study and mitigation product.

For a 20-acre parcel located at 3620 N Schultz Pass Rd, APN 300-47-004.

- Note that the project will remove all features of Flagstaff’s first water reservoir with the CRS to include site visit observations and photos taken 7/12/2022 and additional monitoring and recordation prior and during construction.
- CRS shall contain currently available historic information regarding both the Beal Wagon

Road and Flagstaff's first water reservoir.

- CRS to investigate additional historic information regarding water retention and use in the City of Flagstaff.
- Note that the NE corner of the parcel has a segment of the National Register listed Beal Wagon Road recommending avoidance of the resource.
- Provide the Phase 1 CRS with a required mitigation product of an interpretive plaque installation noting Flagstaff's water history past and present with a focus on the city's first reservoir and adjacent travel route resources, with the installation to be fully funded, written, designed, and installed within one year of the approval date by the Heritage Preservation Commission.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Approve Phase 1 Cultural Resource Study framework with mitigation.

OPTIONS FOR COMMISSION DECISION-MAKING:

- 1) The Commission could approve the Phase 1 Cultural Resource Study framework with mitigation as submitted -or-
 - 2) The Commission could request in addition to the Staff recommendations additional modifications and requirements to the Cultural Resource Study framework and include them as conditions of approval – or –
 - 3) Deny and request resubmittal.
-

HPO Recommended Motion:

Approve the HPO recommendation in response to the emergency flood prevention action to be taken on Schultz Creek approving the following framework in appendices "A" for a Phase 1 Cultural Resource Study (CRS) with a mitigation product to be completed by the Heritage Preservation Officer (HPO) and the City of Flagstaff in order to proceed with an expedited emergency flood control construction project within a designated Landmark Overlay Zone owned by the City of Flagstaff:

Findings and Discussion

INTENT

Flagstaff Municipal Code, Division 10-30.30 Heritage Preservation intends that preservation of the City's heritage is in the interest of the health, economic prosperity, education, cultural enrichment, and general welfare of the public. That Cultural resources shall be considered when demolition is proposed. Professionalism is required in the preparation of cultural resource studies when new development is proposed that destroys the historic resource that is considered as an adverse effect which is a major impact to the heritage resource.

Required Findings for:

- The HPC is being asked to review a city action that will have a significant impact to a Landmark Overlay.
- Per 10-30.30.030 the HPO can't approve the action and it goes to HPC.
- The area proposed for the runoff retention basins is designated as a Landmark Overlay per the requirements of 10-30.30.040 – the resources are significant historically, have met minimum requirements of integrity and are designated as such. *(The 2017 document to HPC has recommended to the City Council to add the overlay. The document has minimum information that would not meet the requirements of a Cultural Resource Survey).*
- Development within an Overlay Zone requires a Cultural Resource Study which at a minimum would be a Phase 1 CRS with substantial mitigation proposed, could be Phase 2 with much more work involved as covered in 10-30.30.050. *(There was an indication that a cultural resource study was initiated but not completed for lack of funds).*
- 10-30.30.060 covers the process for “Development of a landmark property & property within a historic overlay zone. The only result that allows the project to move forward is to allow for a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) determination achieved with the later production of a Phase 1 Cultural Resource Study with mitigation meeting the intent of the Heritage Preservation Ordinance.

DISCUSSION

Cultural Resource Study and mitigation product for City owned parcel designated as a Landmark Overlay

For a 20-acre parcel located at 3620 N Schultz Pass Rd, APN 300-47-004.

Due to the need to take emergency measures to mitigate the severe risk of flooding following the 2022 Pipeline Fire, and, upon recommendation of City Manager as a permissible exercise of City governmental functions to protect public safety, approve flood control project with the Heritage Preservation Officer meeting with the Heritage Preservation Commission to review the frame work for the completion of a Cultural Resource Study (CRS) to meet the intent and processes required for a “Certificate of Appropriateness” to allow for the emergency action to take place. The Phase 1 CRS is to include mitigation in the form of interpretive signage as a condition that upon completion of the flood control project and within a period of one year after review by the HPC that interpretive signage is to be researched, written, produced, and funded by the City of Flagstaff and installed in proximity of the impacted site, in a prominent publicly accessible location intended to return the lost value of the resource back to the public. Flagstaff's Heritage Preservation Officer will take the lead on the production of the interpretive signage with final review by the HPC for compliance.

The City of Flagstaff is proposing to apply for immediate funding to construct an emergency runoff basin system this year on a 20-acre parcel that is designated as a local historic landmark overlay zone. The parcel is located at 3620 N Schultz Pass Rd, APN 300-47-004. The parcel is often utilized as a primary access point for the Arizona trail which is also the shared alignment of the historically designated Beal Wagon Road

whose history includes the first military road through Flagstaff and is also noted for its use of camels as pack animals during its construction. The Beal Wagon Road is listed in the National Register of Historic Places.

The Two known primary historic resources are the Beal Wagon Road alignment and the site of the Flagstaff's first water reservoir. The Beal Wagon Road is an alignment route listed in the National Register Historic Places and is a shared path with other designation such as the Arizona Trail. Project funding will require compliance with Section 106 of the National Historic Preservation Act and potential consultation with AZ SHPO. Avoidance of the listed resource should be a top priority. The alignment bisects the NE corner of the designated 20-acre parcel owned by the city that has been proposed for the emergency implementation of flood runoff control basins. It is estimated that 80% of the site will be required for the runoff containment basins. The current 60% complete plans indicate that the Beal Wagon Road route should be able to be avoided in the NE corner of the parcel and as such not potentially subject to AZSHPO review and/or Section 106 of the National Historic Preservation Act requirements. Final plans should reflect full avoidance of the Beal Wagon Road route in final construction as well as establishing construction limits that will not impact the route during construction.

The current 20-acre parcel was included in a Landmark Overlay established by city ordinance with the assumption of protecting the parcel for public access to trails as well as the remains of Flagstaff first fully engineered water reservoir. The proposed runoff basins will occupy the same area obliterating any indications of the reservoir's location that is still evident. There is a question of historic integrity of the reservoir location and remains that should be investigated and confirmed for its eligibility. The emergency basin location still meets engineering logic in both locating the new runoff retention basins and with the original locating of the first flagstaff water reservoir. The documentation for the Landmark Overlay's submission documentation is limited with indications that the site contained historic resources and deserved protection. The full evaluation of the reservoir site did not have a cultural resource study prepared or was any recommendation made for listing in the National Register of Historic Places. The site may be eligible for listing in the Nation Register but as noted in a site visit on 7/12/2020 it does appear to lack historic integrity when evaluated under Heritage Preservation Ordinance 10-30.30. As with the Beal Wagon Road its historic significance is with its historic alignment that has minimal physical evidence remaining and similarly the reservoir's location has limited physical remains that are not easily observed at the site while the location and its development history is what is important. The history of the site has a high potential for interpreting that history of both the Beal-road and the story of water retention historically as well as for current emergency needs that will protect properties that include National Register Historic District within Flagstaff.

The emergency action is to temporally forgo the completion of a Phase 1 Cultural Resource Study with its final completion after emergency flood mitigation project has been undertaken. The Phase 1 Cultural Resource Study is to include substantial mitigation to return the lost value of the resource back to the public. HPO recommends on site interpretive plaque mitigation that covers the history of water retention past and present and the history of the Beal Wagon Road and its unique use of camels as pack animals.