



BEAUTIFICATION AND PUBLIC ART COMMISSION
APPROVED MINUTES

May 9, 2022 – 4:00 p.m.

City of Flagstaff – Microsoft Teams Remote Meeting

In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need assistance to participate in this meeting, please contact Creag Znetko, (928) 213-2906 (or 774-5281 TDD). Notification at least 48 hours in advance will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements.

City Staff: Eliza Kretzmann – Staff Liaison, Jana Weldon – Project Administrator, Creag Znetko – Recording Secretary, VISTA AmeriCorps Member MacKenzie Chase

- A. **The Public is Invited to Attend this Remote Meeting:** Please join us via Microsoft Teams by clicking on the following link, which brings you to the live meeting: [Click here to join the meeting](#)

Please turn your camera off and mute your microphone except when speaking. If you need an invitation to the meeting, email cznetko@flagstaffaz.gov prior to 3:00 p.m. on the Monday of the meeting.

Provide Public Comment Prior to the Meeting: Email eliza.kretzmann@flagstaffaz.gov with your public comment prior to 3:00 p.m. with PUBLIC COMMENT in the subject on the Monday of the meeting and it will be read during the public comment section or during the item to which your comment pertains.

- A. **CALL TO ORDER** Chair McCord called the meeting to order at 4:02 p.m.

B. ROLL CALL:

Carla McCord, Chair, *present*
Sandra Lubarsky, Vice-Chair, *present*
J Michael Cruz, *present*

Anthony Garcia, *present*
Matt McGrath, *excused*
Tina Zecher, *present*

C. UPCOMING EVENTS:

1. Please look at flagstaff365.com for upcoming events in music, culture, art, and sciences. Chair McCord reminded all to see the Flagstaff 365 for upcoming events in Flagstaff. Commissioner Cruz stated the Flagstaff Symphony is their 3rd annual golf tournament on June 4th.

D. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

The Arizona Open Meeting Law prohibits the Commission from discussing or acting on an item which is not listed on the prepared agenda. Commissioners may, however, respond to criticism made by those addressing the Commission, ask staff to review a matter, or ask that a matter be placed on a future agenda. Public comment should be sent to eliza.kretzmann@flagstaffaz.gov, prior to 3:00 p.m. on the day of the meeting with PUBLIC COMMENT in the email subject or during the designated public participation section.

E. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

1. April Minutes.
MOTION: Vice Chair Lubarsky moved to approve as submitted; Commissioner Cruz seconded the motion; the motion passed unanimously.

F. ANNOUNCEMENTS

1. Eliza's last day at the City of Flagstaff is June 10; however, she will be at the June 13 BPAC meeting. She is moving to New Mexico to be closer to elderly family members.

Staff announced that she is moving back to New Mexico and stated her last day will be June 10, 2022. Staff is working with her leaders on securing a contract that will allow her to still be involved with the program until a replacement is hired. The position will be posted in the next few weeks.

2. **Seeking nominations for BPAC Chair:** At the May 3 Council meeting Councilmembers appointed two new Commissioners (Chris Verrill and Claire Johnson) to the Commission. A huge thank you to Chair McCord for her service!

But given this departure, we will now need to seek a new Chair. Please send Jana Weldon emailed nominations for Chair (we welcome you to nominate yourself or another Commissioner). A vote will be held in June for the new Chair.

It was announced that Chair McCord was not reappointed to the commission and a new Chair will need to be elected next month. Staff and Chair McCord asked the commission to think about whom they would consider nominating. Staff, Vice Mayor Sweet and the commission also thanked Chair McCord for her leadership.

G. ACTION ITEMS

1. **Final Approval of Beautification in Action Grants (with prior Provisional Approval):**

- i. **Pollinator Mural and Free Outdoor Library:** Moran Henn, Executive Director, Willow Bend: Willow Bend will present, as per BPAC request, finalized design options for the butterfly mural and a revised budget for final approval of their fall 2021 application for a \$4300 BIA grant.

Moran Henn presented to the commission with an update for the application that will help enhance the children's garden and outdoor classroom. They advertised a call for artist to design a concept for the mural and gave an update on how the funding would be allocated.

Commissioner Cruz: Likes all three concepts, likes the spray paint.

Commissioner Garcia: Thank you for bringing this back to us and listening to the will of the commission. Likes all three concepts as well.

Commissioner Zecher: Likes the last concept the best.

Chair McCord: Really good problem to have to choose from all the concepts. Likes all of them.

The commission communicated that they are ok with 2 of the 3 concepts (excluding the spray painted one), and provided Willow Bend the flexibility to choose either of those 2 artists.

MOTION: Chair McCord moved to approve the BIA Grant. Vice Chair Lubarsky seconded the motion; the motion passed unanimously.

- ii. **Ms. Cleo's House:** Dr. Ricardo Guthrie: Dr. Guthrie will provide the additional information requested from BPAC on the 'Ms. Cleo's House' application received in March 2022. Additional information includes a revised budget, information on how the potential expansion may affect the project, and how the project relates to the

proposed new landscaping/park activities for final approval of their application for a \$4500 BIA grant.

Dr. Ricardo Guthrie presented to the commission with an update to the application that the commission had asked for. This update includes an explanation for how this piece will relate to the Murdoch Center yard improvements, the connection to the mural project and a statement clarifying the expansion and potential mural removal with the expansion. Dr. Guthrie also updated the commission with a revised budget that includes a breakdown of how the funding would be allocated.

The commission thanked Dr. Guthrie for his willingness to present the revisions and clarify the questions asked prior.

Commissioner Zecher: I would like to ask about the previous funding that was allocated to research. Is it now going to the artist?

Dr. Guthrie: Yes, some to the artist and some for materials.

Commissioner Zecher: The research will still be done, just not funded as much with this grant?

Dr. Guthrie: That is correct, that fee will now be under administrative support for \$200.

MOTION: Commissioner Garcia moved to approve the BIA Grant. Vice Chair Lubarsky seconded the motion; the motion passed unanimously

Suggested Action: Hear the presentations on application updates and revisions, ask questions, and recommend projects for final approval.

2. **Downtown Connection Center, Art Concepts:** Jana L. Weldon, Beautification, Arts & Sciences Project Administrator

- i. **Art Glass:** Ms. Weldon will provide project and process background and make a presentation on the Art Glass concept for the new Downtown Connection Center Building.

Staff presented to the commission some background information pertaining to the Downtown Connection Center. The presentation included budget numbers, the selection panel, a photo contest and community survey, and inspirations the artist drew from for the concept. Staff convened key stakeholders and came up with different concept designs for the space. The basic overall five projects have not changed since last year.

1. Glass at building entry
2. Rotating art crosswalks by local artists
3. Rotating art in bus shelters
4. Historic interpretive panels on Phoenix Bridge
5. Southside Grove sculpture

The Heritage Preservation Commission will be funding the panels on the Phoenix bridge.

The budget for this will be around \$137k. This will be art glass imagery overlaid that represents the three elements found in the Mountain Line logo. There have been multiple public input opportunities for this project. Any significant changes will be brought back in front of BPAC for consideration.

Chair McCord recused herself from the discussion as her employer is the contractor that will be building this project. Vice Chair Lubarsky assumed the responsibility of chairing the discussion and motion.

Commissioner Zecher: Loves the idea and supports the design.

Commissioner Cruz: Likes the project as well.

Commissioner Garcia: Kudos to staff for keeping this on track as we went through adding different commissioners. Likes that this is coming to fruition.

Vice Chair Lubarsky: Thank you to staff for the guidance on this project. This will be a really neat project once completed.

MOTION: Commissioner Cruz moved to approve. Commissioner Zecher seconded the motion; the motion passed unanimously.

- ii. **Southside Grove Sculpture:** Ms. Weldon will provide project and process background and make a presentation on the Southside Gove Sculpture concept for the Downtown Connection Center entry courtyard or civic space (location to be determined).

Suggested Action: Listen to presentations, ask questions, and discuss; approve for Recommendation to City Council of Haddad-Drugan's Art Glass concept for the Downtown Connection Center; approve for Recommendation to City Council of Haddad-Drugan's Southside Grove Sculpture concept for the Downtown Connection Center.

Staff gave the information for the second part of the presentation for the Downtown Connection Center projects. The budget for the Southside Grove Sculpture will be approximately \$280K, this is without structural engineering, so it is truly a guesstimate. We are still within budget for these two projects but are conscious of the rising costs of materials.

This is the first presentation of the concept that is more than a pencil drawing. Staff informed the commission that this will be an immersive sculpture experience that would be positioned in alignment with the equinox and the solstices. There will be a timetable marking events in the community. There are different locations being considered for the placement of the sculpture. Community input was received and ruminated as well. As mentioned before, any significant changes will be brought back to BPAC.

Vice Chair Lubarsky: Is part of the discussion that you would like the commission to weigh in on the placement of the sculpture?

Staff: The placement will most likely not be determined by this staff. There are a lot of factors including the Rio project and where Mountain Line would like to see it. If there is a particular placement that would negate your support, I would need to know that to take to the other stakeholders.

Vice Chair Lubarsky: Not in agreement with some of the elements with some of the design. The trees might resemble a cell tower. Likes the rings on the timetable. Will there be a guide to understanding the piece and how to use the timetable?

Staff: There was lot of discussion about having markings in the pavement to help explain some of the references. We can make a plaque as big and as explanatory as we like. Or a QR code that would link to a website with explanations too. These are all possible.

Commissioner Zecher: Likes the timeline piece, would not change anything on that. Still on the fence about the metal trees, knowing live trees would be extra maintenance. Maybe we could soften the design, so they look more like trees.

Commissioner Cruz: Likes the entire concept as is. Likes the consistency and would be more powerful if they all looked the same. Flagstaff has been represented well.

Commissioner Garcia: Loves the project. This is a strong art piece that can stand on its own, but we know we can't please everyone and there will be negative feedback. This is strong with Flagstaff flavor. Appreciates the project.

Vice Chair Lubarsky: How many people can you fit around the timetable?

Staff: This has been under discussion as we don't know how big the radius will be. We anticipate being two people deep all around. At least 6-8 could stand in a circle around it.

Staff: We are engaging in the work with the architect and the landscape architect, so if the commission is completely against this, I need to know so we can start all over again. We can do a provisional approval and bring it back.

MOTION: Commissioner Zecher moved to approve provisionally with revisions in the future. Commissioner Garcia seconded the motion; the motion passed unanimously.

H. DISCUSSION ITEMS

1. **Library Entry Bid Update:** Eliza Kretzmann, Beautification, Arts and Sciences Manager.

We received only one bid for the library entry project, and the cost came back higher than anticipated, reflecting the current reality of skyrocketing construction costs. We are working with the contractor to reduce costs while retaining the scope that BPAC voted to include. Even with negotiations, however, the costs may be \$130K (or more) than anticipated. Staff has permission from the City budget team to utilize up to \$300K of 'future project' Beautification line-item funding, if needed, to finish this high priority project.

Suggested Action: Listen to presentation, provide questions and feedback if desired.

Staff updated the commission on the cost and bids for the library entry project. The construction bid came in higher than we anticipated, even with the increased cost estimates. We will be increasing the line item to cover these costs. The library is adding funding as well and will be covering the cost of some of the ADA compliance infrastructure. Staff is in negotiations with the contractor to see what kind of cost savings are available, the contractor has already agreed to cut \$50k.

Chair McCord: These costs are in line with the escalation we are seeing right now. I would like the commission to be aware of these as we move forward with other projects. Hopefully we can get this done sooner before costs increase more.

Vice Chair Lubarsky: Is there a cap on increases that may be needed? At what point do we say this is enough?

Chair McCord: Speaking from a construction standpoint, the contract would guarantee the maximum amount. Unless staff is negotiating different terms.

Vice Chair Lubarsky: Where are we in getting to that point?

Staff: We are very close to setting the bracket on this so moving forward with the contract and hopefully avoiding any more significant increases. That being said, we are keeping everything on the table while we negotiate.

Staff will proceed with negotiations.

There was discussion only.

- I. **TO/FROM ITEMS:** These are for informational purposes only and the Commission may not discuss these items. The Commission may, however, request these as a future Discussion or Action item.
1. City Staff To/From and Updates: MacKenzie Chase, Eliza Kretzmann, Jana Weldon
 - a. The 'Call for Artists' for the Southside Historic Community Garden closed, local artist Sonja London Hall was selected for this project (and thank you to Vice Chair Lubarsky and Commissioner Cruz for serving on the selection panel).
Local artist Sonja London-Hall has been selected for the Historic Southside Community Garden. There will be a meeting on June 2nd to allow the artist to meet with the community.
 - b. American for the Arts Conference is in Washington D.C. May 18-20.
Staff will be attending the American for the Arts Conference and will be taking copious notes.
 2. Chair To/From and Updates: Carla McCord NONE
 3. City Council Liaison Updates NONE
 4. Additional To/From Items from the Commission? Flagstaff Foundry is a variety show that will be held on May 20th at 7:30 p.m. Existing List: Presentation on why Creative Flagstaff decided not to pursue partnership with ArtWins.
 5. Requests for future agenda items? Please provide vote from additional 2 Commissioners to add to the list for future meetings. NONE

J. **TIME/DATE FOR UPCOMING MEETINGS**

1. BPAC Meeting: Monday, June 13, 4 p.m., Microsoft Teams Meeting

K. **ADJOURNMENT** Chair McCord adjourned the meeting 6:13 p.m.