

MINUTES

1. **CALL TO ORDER**

Mayor Daggett called the meeting of the Flagstaff City Council held May 2, 2023, to order at 3:06 p.m.

NOTICE OF OPTION TO RECESS INTO EXECUTIVE SESSION

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the City Council and to the general public that, at this regular meeting, the City Council may vote to go into executive session, which will not be open to the public, for legal advice and discussion with the City's attorneys for legal advice on any item listed on the following agenda, pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(3).

2. **Roll Call**

NOTE: One or more Councilmembers may be in attendance telephonically or by other technological means.

PRESENT:

ABSENT:

MAYOR DAGGETT
VICE MAYOR ASLAN
COUNCILMEMBER HARRIS
COUNCILMEMBER HOUSE
COUNCILMEMBER MATTHEWS
COUNCILMEMBER MCCARTHY (arrived at 4:47 p.m.)
COUNCILMEMBER SWEET

Others present: City Manager Greg Clifton; City Attorney Sterling Solomon.

3. **PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE, MISSION STATEMENT, AND LAND ACKNOWLEDGEMENT**

The Council and audience recited the pledge of allegiance, Councilmember House read the Mission Statement of the City of Flagstaff, and Councilmember Harris read the Land Acknowledgement.

MISSION STATEMENT

The mission of the City of Flagstaff is to protect and enhance the quality of life for all.

LAND ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The Flagstaff City Council humbly acknowledges the ancestral homelands of this area's

Indigenous nations and original stewards. These lands, still inhabited by Native descendants, border mountains sacred to Indigenous peoples. We honor them, their legacies, their traditions, and their continued contributions. We celebrate their past, present, and future generations who will forever know this place as home.

4. **APPROVAL OF MINUTES FROM PREVIOUS MEETINGS**

- A. **Consideration and Approval of Minutes:** City Council Special Work Session of March 22, 2022, Regular Meeting of April 5, 2022, Regular Meeting of March 21, 2023, Special Meeting (Executive Session) of April 11, 2023, Special Meeting (Executive Session) of April 14, 2023, and Special Meeting (Executive Session) of April 25, 2023.

Moved by Councilmember Lori Matthews, **seconded by** Councilmember Miranda Sweet to approve the minutes of the City Council Special Work Session of March 22, 2022, Regular Meeting of April 5, 2022, Regular Meeting of March 21, 2023, Special Meeting (Executive Session) of April 11, 2023, Special Meeting (Executive Session) of April 14, 2023, and Special Meeting (Executive Session) of April 25, 2023.

Vote: 6 - 0 - Unanimously

5. **PUBLIC PARTICIPATION**

Public Participation enables the public to address the Council about an item that is not on the agenda. Comments relating to items that are on the agenda will be taken at the time that the item is discussed. If you wish to address the Council at tonight's meeting, please complete a comment card and submit it to the recording clerk as soon as possible. Your name will be called when it is your turn to speak. You may address the Council up to three times throughout the meeting, including comments made during Public Participation. Please limit your remarks to three minutes per item to allow everyone an opportunity to speak. At the discretion of the Chair, ten or more persons present at the meeting and wishing to speak may appoint a representative who may have no more than fifteen minutes to speak.

Spencer Moran addressed Council requesting that crosswalks be repainted.

Jared Russell addressed Council about potholes that need to be repaired throughout the city.

Zyaja Mchaney addressed Council about traffic congestion and the possibility of charging drivers to drive on roads during peak times.

Zakai Martin addressed Council about potholes that need to be repaired throughout the city.

Dapper Dre addressed Council about road and bike safety. Cars should no longer be prioritized over bikes and pedestrians and attention needs to be given to make crosswalks safe for everyone.

Janet Wessels addressed Council about the upcoming Taco Bout Fun Run to support the Hope Pregnancy Center.

Tom Pearson addressed Council about the Carbon Neutrality Plan and the cost of implementation of the plan compared to the impact it can make, increased power demand, and the lack of alternative power. He urged the Council to maintain energy diversity.

Stephen Puhr addressed Council about the \$56 million project for the USGS lease.

Kylie Fligg addressed Council about potholes and vehicle collisions.

Written comments concerning pickleball were submitted by the following:

- Paul Haro
- Beverly Pishkur

6. PROCLAMATIONS AND RECOGNITIONS

A. Proclamation: Asian American and Native Hawaiian/Pacific Islander Heritage Month

Councilmember House read and presented the proclamation to the Commission on Diversity Awareness.

B. Proclamation: Bike Month

Councilmember Sweet read and presented the proclamation to the Flagstaff Biking Organization.

C. Proclamation: Municipal Clerk Week

Mayor Daggett read and presented the proclamation to the City Clerk Team.

7. COUNCIL LIAISON REPORTS

Councilmember House reported that she attended the Commission on Diversity Awareness Commission meeting where they discussed celebratory flags and enhancing engagement with Flagstaff's diverse community.

Vice Mayor Aslan reported that the Tourism Commission met and discussed first Friday Artwalk, Artx Festival, and received an update from Lowell Observatory about attractions in Flagstaff. He also reported that the Colorado Plateau Water Advisory Council met to discuss a strategic retreat and how to represent the community. He participated in a ride-a-long with City Engineer Paul Mood; it was a great opportunity to see and discuss the upcoming capital projects. Lastly, he reported that he will be traveling to Albuquerque to discuss Flagstaff's dark sky lighting successes with the International Astronautical Association.

8. APPOINTMENTS

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the City Council and to the general public that the City Council may vote to go into executive session, which will not be open to the public, for the purpose of discussing or considering employment, assignment, appointment, promotion, demotion, dismissal, salaries, disciplining or resignation of a public officer, appointee, or employee of any public body...., pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(1).

A. Consideration of Appointments: Open Spaces Commission.

Moved by Councilmember Miranda Sweet, **seconded by** Councilmember Khara House to appoint Nat White to a term expiring April 2026.

Vote: 6 - 0 - Unanimously

Moved by Councilmember Lori Matthews, **seconded by** Councilmember Deborah Harris to appoint Jacqueline Thomas to a term expiring April 2026.

Vote: 6 - 0 - Unanimously

Moved by Mayor Becky Daggett, **seconded by** Councilmember Miranda Sweet to appoint Bruce Fox to a term expiring April 2026.

Vote: 6 - 0 - Unanimously

- B. Consideration of Appointments:** Northern Arizona Intergovernmental Public Transportation Authority (NAIPTA) Transit Advisory Committee (TAC) Citizen Representative Alternate.

Moved by Mayor Becky Daggett, **seconded by** Councilmember Khara House to appoint Carlton Johnson to a term expiring May 2026.

Vote: 6 - 0 - Unanimously

9. CONSENT ITEMS

All matters under Consent Agenda are considered by the City Council to be routine and will be enacted by one motion approving the recommendations listed on the agenda. Unless otherwise indicated, expenditures approved by Council are budgeted items.

Moved by Councilmember Deborah Harris, **seconded by** Councilmember Miranda Sweet to approve the Consent Agenda as presented.

Vote: 6 - 0 - Unanimously

- A. Consideration of Appointment and Reappointment:** On-Call Magistrates for the Flagstaff Municipal Court.

Approve the appointment of Hector Figueroa and the reappointment of Michael Araujo and Howard Grodman as On-Call Magistrates to the Flagstaff Municipal Court.

- B. Consideration and Approval of Contract:** Approve the Construction Contract with Hylan-West, Inc. for the Soliere Water Transmission Main ("Project") in the amount of \$2,986,530.11 (which is the sum of the bid amount of \$2,900,913.00 and a Contract Allowance of \$85,617.11).

1. Approve the Construction Contract with Hylan-West, Inc. ("Contractor") in the amount of \$2,986,530.11 (which is the sum of the Contractor's bid amount of \$2,900,913.00 and a Contract Allowance of \$85,617.11) and a contract time of 180 calendar days;
2. Approve a Contract Allowance of \$85,617.11, which is 5% of the Engineer's Estimate;
3. Approve Change Order Authority to the City Manager in the amount of \$290,091.30 (10% of the contract amount, less allowances); and
4. Authorize the City Manager to execute the necessary documents.

- C. Consideration and Approval of Contract:** Approve a Contract for Materials and Services with Vulcan Materials Company in an amount not to exceed \$118,000 for hot mix asphalt for the Street Section.

1. Approve a Contract for Materials and Services with Vulcan Materials Company in an amount not to exceed \$118,000 for hot mix asphalt for the Street Section; and
2. Authorize the City Manager to execute the necessary documents.

10. ROUTINE ITEMS

- A. Consideration and Approval of Contract:** Approval of First Amendment for GMP 2 for Construction Phase I Maintenance Repair Services with Hunter Contracting Co. for a Guaranteed Maximum Price (GMP) in the amount of \$3,220,380.87 for the Inner Basin Waterline Restoration Project.

Capital Improvements Project Manager David Pedersen provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

INNER BASIN WATERLINE RESTORATION PROJECT
PROJECT STAKEHOLDERS
EXCITING NEWS
GUARANTEED MAXIMUM PRICE
CONTRACT & PROJECT TIMELINE
PROJECT SITES – GOOD, BAD, UGLY
POINT I

Moved by Councilmember Khara House, **seconded by** Councilmember Lori Matthews to approve the First Amendment 1 for GMP 2 for Construction Phase I Maintenance Repair Services with Hunter Contracting Co. for a GMP of \$3,220,380.87 and a contract duration of 130-calendar days for a total Agreement amount of \$3,410,074.87 and authorize the City Manager to execute the necessary documents.

Vote: 6 - 0 - Unanimously

11. REGULAR AGENDA

- A. Consideration and Adoption of Ordinance No. 2023-05:** An Ordinance of the City Council of the City of Flagstaff, amending Flagstaff City Code, Title 14 Human Relations, Chapter 14-02 Civil Rights, Section 14-02-001-0006 Complaint Procedures, to allow a verified charge to be filed within one hundred and eighty (180) calendar days after the alleged violation occurred; providing for repeal of conflicting ordinances, severability, authority for clerical corrections, and establishing an effective date.

Management Analyst Chris Rhode addressed Council stating that the ordinance would amend the statute of limitations for civil rights complaints from 90 days to 180 days to be in line with state and federal rules and processes. Complaints are often very emotionally charged, and it is sometimes difficult to get to a point where a complainant would like to report an incident.

Moved by Councilmember Lori Matthews, **seconded by** Councilmember Miranda Sweet to read Ordinance No. 2023-05 by title only for the first time.

Vote: 6 - 0 - Unanimously

AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF FLAGSTAFF, AMENDING FLAGSTAFF CITY CODE, TITLE 14 HUMAN RELATIONS, CHAPTER 14-02 CIVIL RIGHTS, SECTION 14-02-001-0006 COMPLAINT PROCEDURES, TO ALLOW A VERIFIED CHARGE TO BE FILED WITHIN ONE HUNDRED AND EIGHTY (180) CALENDAR DAYS AFTER THE ALLEGED VIOLATION OCCURRED; PROVIDING FOR REPEAL OF CONFLICTING ORDINANCES, SEVERABILITY, AUTHORITY FOR CLERICAL CORRECTIONS, AND ESTABLISHING AN EFFECTIVE DATE

- B. Consideration and Adoption of Resolution No. 2023-19:** A resolution approving the City of Flagstaff's 2023 Annual Action Plan and authorizing its submission to the U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD)

Housing and Grants Administrator Kristine Pavlik provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT BLOCK GRANT PROGRAM YEAR 2023 ANNUAL ACTION PLAN
2023 FUNDING RECOMMENDATIONS

Moved by Councilmember Miranda Sweet, **seconded by** Councilmember Khara House to read Resolution No. 2023-19 by title only.

Vote: 6 - 0 - Unanimously

A RESOLUTION OF THE FLAGSTAFF CITY COUNCIL APPROVING THE CITY OF FLAGSTAFF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT BLOCK GRANT 2023 ANNUAL ACTION PLAN AND AUTHORIZING ITS SUBMISSION TO THE UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF HOUSING AND URBAN DEVELOPMENT

Moved by Councilmember Miranda Sweet, **seconded by** Councilmember Khara House to adopt Resolution No. 2023-19.

Vote: 6 - 0 - Unanimously

- C. Consideration and Adoption of Resolution No. 2023-22:** A resolution approving Binding Waivers of Enforcement for twelve parcels of land located in the City of Flagstaff.

Senior Assistant City Attorney Christina Rubalcava provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

PROP 207 CLAIMS BINDING WAIVERS OF ENFORCEMENT
ORDINANCE 2020-28
PROP 207 CLAIMS
OVERVIEW OF PROP 207

Moved by Councilmember Khara House, **seconded by** Councilmember Miranda Sweet to read Resolution No. 2023-22 by title only.

Vote: 6 - 0 - Unanimously

A RESOLUTION OF THE FLAGSTAFF CITY COUNCIL APPROVING BINDING WAIVERS OF ENFORCEMENT FOR TWELVE PARCELS OF LAND WITHIN THE CORPORATE LIMITS OF THE CITY OF FLAGSTAFF

Moved by Councilmember Khara House, **seconded by** Councilmember Miranda Sweet to adopt Resolution No. 2023-22.

Vote: 6 - 0 - Unanimously

- D. Consideration and Adoption of Resolution No. 2023-17:** A resolution of the Flagstaff City Council, approving the First Amendment to the Transit Service Intergovernmental Agreement by and between the City of Flagstaff and the Northern Arizona Intergovernmental Public Transportation Authority

Capital Improvements Senior Project Manager David Pedersen addressed Council stating that the amendment establishes the joint development and construction of bus lanes on the new portion of Beulah Boulevard as part of the Beulah/University Realignment Project. It also specifies the roles and responsibilities of both the City of Flagstaff and NAIPTA through the construction of the Project. He also mentioned the construction of the CDL course that will benefit both parties.

Moved by Councilmember Miranda Sweet, **seconded by** Vice Mayor Austin Aslan to read Resolution No. 2023-17 by title only.

Vote: 6 - 0 - Unanimously

A RESOLUTION OF THE FLAGSTAFF CITY COUNCIL, APPROVING THE FIRST AMENDMENT TO TRANSIT SERVICE INTERGOVERNMENTAL AGREEMENT BY AND BETWEEN THE CITY OF FLAGSTAFF AND THE NORTHERN ARIZONA INTERGOVERNMENTAL PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY

Moved by Councilmember Miranda Sweet, **seconded by** Councilmember Deborah Harris to adopt Resolution No. 2023-17.

Vote: 6 - 0 - Unanimously

12. PUBLIC HEARING ITEMS

A. Northern Arizona Healthcare Public Hearings

Mayor Daggett opened the public hearing on items 12Ai and 12Aii.

Zoning Code Manager Tiffany Antol provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

NAH HEALTH VILLAGE PHASE I SPECIFIC PLAN AND CONCEPT ZONING MAP
 AMENDMENT
 IT TAKES A TEAM
 NAH HEALTH VILLAGE
 NAH HEALTH VILLAGE PROPERTY CONTEXT MAP
 NAH HEALTH VILLAGE SPECIFIC PLAN
 PURPOSE OF SPECIFIC PLAN
 PLANNING FRAMEWORK
 ZONING CODE MODIFICATIONS
 SITE PLANNING DESIGN STANDARDS
 ARCHITECTURAL DESIGN STANDARDS
 BICYCLE PARKING
 PUBLIC FACILITY ZONE SPECIFIC STANDARDS
 HIGHWAY COMMERCIAL ZONE DEVELOPMENT STANDARDS
 CONCEPT IMAGES
 VIEWSHED IMAGES
 COMMUNITY SERVICES IMPACT ANALYSIS – POLICE
 COMMUNITY SERVICES IMPACT ANALYSIS – FIRE

COMMUNITY SERVICES IMPACT ANALYSIS – SCHOOLS
COMMUNITY SERVICES IMPACT ANALYSIS – ECONOMIC IMPACTS
COMMUNITY SERVICES IMPACT ANALYSIS – PARKS
NAH PHASE 1 CONCEPT ZONE PLAN
CONCEPTUAL LAND USE AREA PROGRAM
RESOURCE PROTECTION
OPEN SPACE & CIVIC SPACE
LANDSCAPING & OUTDOOR LIGHTING
PARKING CALCULATIONS
PED & BIKE CIRCULATION SYSTEM

Transportation Engineer Steph Santana continued the presentation.

FULL-BUILDOUT PRE-SCOPING/TIA
PHASE TIA REQUEST
REGIONAL PLAN ROADWAY NETWORK

Ms. Antol continued.

WATER SEWER IMPACT ANALYSIS (WSIA)
STORMWATER ANALYSIS
WHAT IS STAFF'S ROLE IN THIS REVIEW
REGIONAL PLAN CONFORMANCE
FINDING #1

Senior Assistant City Attorney Christina Rubalcava continued the presentation.

CARBON NEUTRALITY GOALS & POLICIES

Ms. Antol concluded the presentation.

FINDING #2
FINDING #3
DRAFT DEVELOPMENT AGREEMENT CONTENTS
CITIZEN PARTICIPATION PLAN
SPECIFIC PLAN RECOMMENDATION
CONCEPT ZONING MAP AMENDMENT RECOMMENDATION

Vice Mayor Aslan asked about the lighting standards and conforming to the Zone 2 standards. Ms. Antol explained that the lighting code standards changed while things were in the works. There are certain areas where white light is permitted such as the ambulance entrance. It appears that everything will be able to work within the requirements of the lighting code.

Vice Mayor Aslan asked about the options for recreation facilities. Ms. Antol stated that NAH has committed to incorporating an active recreation amenity and is working with the Parks, Recreation, Open Space, and Events team. The commitment is to own, operate, and maintain an amenity.

Councilmember McCarthy noted concern with phrases within the Development Agreement (DA) such as "it is recommended" rather than "it is required," he requested that those be resolved before it is brought to Council for approval. He asked about the Traffic Impact Analysis (TIA) and if events at Fort Tuthill were included in the analysis. His concern is with the offramps being crowded during events making access to the hospital difficult.

Ms. Santana stated that events were not included in the 2027 Phase 1 TIA. She indicated that ADOT is having NAH build a bypass lane off the offramp to ensure proper access at all times.

Mayor Daggett stated that the draft DA mentions public access to the open space; she asked if there is an easement for that access. Ms. Antol stated that there is an easement that will be included with the final DA; they are still working through some of the specific details, but the easement will live in perpetuity with the land.

Mayor Daggett asked the pros and cons to not grading the Purple Sage underpass right now but to provide funding for grading at a later time. Traffic Engineer Jeff Bauman stated that the roadway is not required for mitigation for Phase 1 of the project but is anticipated to be required for future phases. It is less expensive at the moment to not build the grade, but it will be more expensive to do it in the future. Ms. Santana added that traffic control and access to the hospital will be things that have to be considered if the grading is done at a future time.

Mayor Daggett asked if there are concerns about water, flooding, or maintenance at the underpass. Water Services Engineer Gary Miller stated that the area needs to be able to drain and if they are constructing drainage at the higher grade, there will be additional costs to bring that drainage down to a lower grade when the time comes. In terms of flooding and maintenance concerns, he is not aware of any currently, but there would be an assessment as part of the civil plan review.

Councilmember Sweet asked if there is a specific timeline on the solar installation. Ms. Antol stated that the current commitment is 2030 knowing that the hospital is anticipated for opening in 2027.

Josh Tinkle, Steve Eiss, Colleen Maring, Nolan Rome, John Niziolek, and Christopher Lininger on behalf of Northern Arizona Healthcare provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

NORTHERN ARIZONA HEALTHCARE HEALTH AND WELLNESS VILLAGE
NAH AS A NON-PROFIT
MAKING HEALTH CARE AVAILABLE TO ALL
FLAGSTAFF IS THE REGIONAL HUB OF NORTHERN ARIZONA
1200 N. BEAVER ISN'T SUITED FOR THE 21ST CENTURY
OBSTACLES TO EXPANDING AT 1200 N. BEAVER
ACCESSIBLE TO FLAGSTAFF'S FUTURE GROWTH
IMPROVING THE EMERGENCY DEPARTMENT EXPERIENCE
BUILDING HEIGHT
FLAGSTAFF CLIMATE ACTION & ADAPTATION PLAN
WHITE HOUSE CLIMATE PLEDGE
SUSTAINABILITY COMMITMENT TO SOLAR
SUSTAINABILITY SITE DEVELOPMENT & WATER EFFICIENCY
SUSTAINABILITY ENERGY REDUCTION
LEED RATING POTENTIAL
SUSTAINABILITY NEED FOR NATURAL GAS
SUSTAINABILITY EMBODIED CARBON REDUCTIONS
SUSTAINABILITY PATH TO CARBON NEUTRALITY
TRAVEL IMPACT ANALYSIS INPUTS
WE CARE ABOUT TRANSPORTATION ACCESS AND EQUITY
BEING GOOD NEIGHBORS
GRADING DOWN FOR POTENTIAL UNDERPASS
VISION PLANNING FOR 1200 N. BEAVER CAMPUS

ECONOMIC BENEFITS FOR FLAGSTAFF
NAH DEVELOPMENT AGREEMENT COMMITMENTS
DEVELOPMENT FEE COMPARISON
ENGAGING THE COMMUNITY SINCE 2021
RESPONDING TO PUBLIC COMMENT
OUR FORMAL ASK OF CITY COUNCIL

Councilmember Matthews asked how it was determined that the underpass was needed. Ms. Antol stated that it all starts with the Regional Plan maps. The underpass is part of the overall transportation system that considers increased density in this part of the city. Roadwork connectivity is one of the more difficult components; the Regional Plan calls for connectivity and creating the most connected network possible.

Councilmember House asked what the anticipated impact is to the 6,000 patients that were diverted over the last year. Mr. Eiss stated that from an occupancy standpoint, it would negate that completely. Additionally, they could bring an additional 44 beds to the market without impact on the footprint within a year. The design was to not put in any more than what is needed and then to continually monitor and utilize triggers for when things need to grow. Observation beds are increasing as well.

Vice Mayor Aslan asked about the commitment to dark skies. Mr. Eiss stated that they are committed to 2700 Kelvin. They have met with the Observatory and had the plan approved by them.

Vice Mayor Aslan stated that 20 electric charging stations are not encouraging with 2,000 spaces; he would like to see more. He also expressed concern about access issues with grading at a later time. Mr. Eiss stated that there will be multiple points of access to the hospital during any construction. They are not arguing the planning that shows the need for the road but they want to do it at the right time.

Vice Mayor Aslan asked about the plans for repurposing the legacy campus. Mr. Eiss stated that they are committed to the redevelopment of the existing campus. They envision a multi-use facility with some form of infill housing. They are looking to continue partnerships with NAU and CCC so parts could be used as nursing training centers. There is a lot of opportunity to do something really neat with infill development for the city.

Vice Mayor Aslan stated that he would have liked to see them further along in the plans for redevelopment. Mr. Eiss offered that their focus has been on step one of the process, and it is irresponsible to guess what the community will need in 2030. They are committed to doing the right thing at the right time.

Councilmember Sweet offered that she appreciates the commitment to meeting with the county monthly throughout the process. She stated that the building envelope seems close to the trail system and asked if there are any plans to move the trail or mitigate the impacts of the building envelope. Guillermo Cortes with SWI stated that they are actually giving back another fourteen feet because they are not using the ingress/egress access. The building envelope will actually be further away from Soldier Trail.

Councilmember Sweet asked about the events that go late at Fort Tuthill, including concerts with loud music. Mr. Eiss noted no concerns and stated that it is something that was incorporated into the design. They will not be making any noise complaints, and they also believe that they may be able to help with overflow parking. They are happy to participate and cooperate with the county to that end.

Councilmember Matthews stated that there have been a lot of comments about the board of directors being a volunteer group. She asked if the hospital were to sell to another hospital if the board members or staff would receive any bonus to move forward. Mr. Eiss explained that there are no financial ties and that they are salaried employees with no percentage stake in the company, the same is true for the board.

Councilmember Harris asked about the plans for the NICU unit with the new hospital. Chief Nursing Officer, Tyffany Laurano stated that currently the NICU is an open space with no walls to define each patient space. There is no privacy for patients and their families. In the new facility, the rooms will all be private and families can have a better time spent with their children. The existing NICU has 16 beds, the new hospital will expand that to 20 beds with additional rooms for twins and triplets. Family integration is important and being able to keep families together in these situations is vital.

A break was held from 7:12 p.m. through 7:35 p.m.

The following individuals spoke in favor of the rezone and specific plan:

- Louann Mace
- Molly Munger
- Donald Rodrigue
- Jill Shook
- Rich Bowen
- Mike Loven
- Judy Androndwitz
- Alex Castillo
- Nick Pearce
- Sean Slossen
- Anthony Gobe
- Chris DeWitt
- Dawn Yengich
- Doug Lowden
- Tyffany Laurano
- Cat Duffy
- Pasquaw Bernadi
- Amy Stapleton
- Kyle Monje
- Larry Kushner
- Darrell Dodge
- Nicholas Baltazar
- Gered Ryan
- Pat Ellsworth
- Kate Sommer-Elliott
- Guillermo Cortes
- Stacey Salyer
- Joe Galli
- Rebecca Pyrz
- Tim Kinney
- Ken Berkhoff
- Maraka Oltroggee
- Gail Jackson

The following comments were received:

- The 50-year-old facility has reached its capacity and has been modified to keep pace

- with the growing community and it is no longer meeting the needs.
- Flagstaff needs and deserves a better hospital.
 - A facility is needed that allows families to be a part of the healing process.
 - They are struggling with current technology infrastructure and there is limited capacity to expand technology.
 - The community needs to come together to expand the community's needs.
 - People do not want to be deferred to Phoenix due to a lack of space or technology.
 - Healthcare and its delivery are ever-changing, and we cannot be in catch-up mode, we need to invest in the future now.
 - Support the new campus.
 - NAH has changed into a regional referral center.
 - The new hospital will provide high-quality care with the state-of-the-art technology necessary for the best care.
 - Renovation is no longer practical; we need an optimized facility for patient care.
 - A new facility will allow for new technologies and adapt to future needs.
 - The current hospital is undersized, inefficient, and at the end of its life.
 - Healthcare is personal and every patient wants to know that they are being cared for by professionals who are leading the way with the most advanced research technology.
 - The focus should be on wellness and treatment rather than on trying to fix antiquated facilities.
 - A new hospital with access to the latest technology will help bring students to the area to educate and serve in rural communities.
 - Healthcare in Flagstaff has done nothing but improve over time and a new campus is the next step.
 - Let us be local in our support of the expansion.
 - What happens in Flagstaff affects the entire Northern Arizona region.
 - Costly inefficiencies and facilities cannot be updated for current or future state-of-the-art medical facilities.
 - To deny or delay perpetuates operational inefficiencies.
 - More than half of the patients receiving care at Flagstaff Medical Center (FMC) are from outside of the Flagstaff area.
 - The demand for healthcare services is outpacing FMC's ability to provide care because they do not have the space to accommodate patient volumes.
 - It is a cost burden to families when their loved ones have to be deferred outside of Flagstaff.
 - The new location will improve access to the majority of the community.
 - Excited to see this project become a beacon in our community that provides the best quality healthcare to all.
 - No one should have to go to a hospital and wonder if they will be able to receive the care they need.
 - So many are deferred to Phoenix because FMC lacks the resources and tools to support the needs of the patient.
 - The new location will allow for significant expansion to pediatric facilities that are desperately needed.
 - A new facility with the latest technology will help recruit high-quality providers.
 - The health of the city and the health of the citizens is absolutely better with this new wellness village.
 - Practicing in an outdated facility delays care.
 - More space is needed for modern medical equipment.
 - If we want to recruit quality providers we need a campus that can accommodate new service lines and the needs of the community.
 - Investment in health and infrastructure is a commitment to the wellness and sustainability of the community.
 - The proposed hospital will be safer and more conducive to healing.

- The new hospital will increase jobs and draw in quality healthcare professionals.
- Single rooms will provide more rest and comfort for patients.
- The new hospital will provide accommodations and space for family members to visit and learn about aftercare.
- It is unusual to have a locally owned and operated facility, this is an opportunity to do something big for Flagstaff.
- The new facility supports the needs of a growing community now and into the future.
- NAH is the community, they are our friends and neighbors who work every day to make sure they can provide the care needed to the community.
- We will never get to full agreement on this project, consider the larger population that NAH serves and do not limit the access to a few dissenting voices.
- It is obvious that NAH needs to expand; the buildings worked in 1973 but do not work in 2023 and there are only so many renovations that can be made.
- The new campus will benefit us in many ways, it will provide great quality healthcare, draw top qualified doctors and other professionals, enable NAH to stay competitive, provide next-generation healthcare amenities, and become a financial investment and economic boom for the region.
- The cost of doing nothing will be the highest cost of all.
- The difference this facility will make for staff and patients will be huge.
- The design will be great, especially for the operating rooms with much more space and better workflow.
- People are being deferred to Phoenix to receive the care that they need.
- I support the designation of passive and active recreation and accessibility by the public to provide better preventive care.
- This new facility is not a deterrent but an attraction to get better providers here and enhance the business community.
- The metrics that were presented exceed LEED and Energy Star certification as well as the city's Carbon Neutrality Plan.

The following individuals submitted written comments in support of the rezone and specific plan:

- Scott Watson
- Josephine Ribelin
- Shannon Watson
- Chris McCoy
- Dr. Tracye A. Moore
- Dr. Adrian Gupton
- Mark and Eve Ford
- Priscilla Mckerracher
- Mary and Andrew Kendall
- Robert Czajkowski

The following individuals spoke in opposition to the rezone and specific plan:

- Geronimo Vasquez, Coconino County Supervisor
- Matt Ryan, Coconino County Supervisor
- Patrice Horstman, Coconino County Supervisor
- Michelle James
- Marilyn Weissman
- Jill Stephenson
- Douglas Maple
- David Monihan
- Sandra Lubarsky
- Debra Block
- Rebecca Browning

- Stefan Sommer
- Sat Best
- Charles Sechrist
- Joshua Hensley
- Nancy Branhan
- Alexander Shenkin

The following comments were received:

- There are a lot of unanswered questions regarding the TIA.
- There should be a comprehensive TIA done on all three phases of the project.
- They say they are supportive of transportation to the area, but there has been no financial commitment to that effort.
- They need to honor the historical use of Fort Tuthill.
- This move will shift the center of gravity for medical care in Flagstaff.
- All community concerns should be addressed before moving forward.
- Purple Sage is a forest service road, and they are trying to design a road that was never intended to be used as an arterial.
- There is concern about the impact the hospital will have on Fort Tuthill Park.
- The county is looking to expand the use of the park facilities and this will have an impact on those plans.
- The county wants to be and should be, part of the conversation to have meaningful collaboration and agreements.
- A needs assessment is needed to determine the needs of the community and the needs should be weighed against the climate emergency and the housing emergency.
- The community does not have the information to determine if the benefits outweigh the costs.
- If Council approves the development, then the carbon emissions from the development should be mitigated and included in the development agreement.
- We cannot know if the relocation is good for the community without an objective analysis of how it will impact our well-being.
- A move will have ramifications to many and those need to be understood.
- Postpone any decision on the rezoning until a community needs assessment is done.
- Is the consolidation to a village better than outpatient or ambulatory facilities?
- The proposal comes with a significant financial impact on the city.
- If approved, what will the carbon footprint be for the initial construction, what will the energy needs be, how much carbon will be released, and will there be enough solar installed to offset the energy needed?
- How will those with no transportation get access to the hospital?
- This project is likely to result in more tax burdens.
- This project will not help meet the Carbon Neutrality Plan goal of carbon neutrality by 2030.
- In 2019 the hospital had 5 stars and to assume the facility is now completely obsolete is not valid.
- Specific needs are not driving the project but rather a desire to build a new facility.
- Without measuring community needs you will build facilities that are not needed.
- We are venturing into the unknown with the village concept.
- There are an enormous amount of alternative possibilities that have not been considered.
- Since 2000 over half of the nurses have left because of housing costs.
- Do not be in a hurry to spend millions of taxpayer dollars before you know what you are getting.
- There is concern about the economic sustainability of the project.
- At such a high cost, will they get halfway down the road and end up not delivering on their promises?

- The 2022 Community Health Assessment report done by NAH had 400 respondents stating that the biggest need is mental health, substance abuse, and other social factors; no mention was made of the need for a new facility.
- Hospitals are modernizing facilities without building an all-new facility; renovation is the most cost-effective approach.
- Flagstaff does not need big-box healthcare.
- FMC belongs to Northern Arizona and this plan is equated to a hostile takeover.
- This does not promote the public interest, it supports sprawl, traffic congestion, and light pollution.
- Natural resources are exploited beyond what would be saved with a new building.
- The Planning and Zoning Commission voted no on the specific plan and the rezone; that needs to be considered.
- The project does not conform to the Regional Plan.
- There is no way to determine if the new development will help the city meet the goal of carbon neutrality by 2030.
- More information is needed on the carbon impacts and the Sustainability Division needs to evaluate that information before a decision can be made.
- There is a cultural issue at FMC and they need to treat their people better.
- What will happen to the businesses that surround the current FMC facilities?
- Do not rush the process, more information is needed.
- Noise analysis is needed to evaluate the impact of increased traffic, ambulance noise, and helicopter noise on the neighboring community.

The following individuals submitted written comments in opposition to the rezone and specific plan:

- Gwendolyn Waring
- Joseph Nackard
- William F. Garbarino
- Douglas Mapel
- Lawrence Luke
- Michael Ryan
- Lisa Boals
- Dana Jolly
- Stanley Tax
- Katy Abrams
- Tony Gioia
- Tom Taylor
- Rebecca Kruse
- Sally Nelson
- Carleton Lane
- Sara Lane
- Cynthia Panettieri
- Beverly Hedden
- Karen Battaglia
- Bob and Kristen Rothrock
- Chris Heyer
- Rosemary Keiser
- Leon and Kohava Benatar
- Julie Friess
- Paul Medow
- Barbara and Walter Pickett
- Sandy Moriarty
- Janet and Dave Dubiel
- Lisa Holly

- Terry Adair
- Carolee Bruder
- S. Roeder
- Suzanne Read
- Robert and Holly Johnson
- Marilyn Filippis
- Gay Chanler
- A. Bidwell
- Linda Hogsett
- S. L. Galbreth
- Greg Luckey
- Lori Feine
- Dave Hanke

On behalf of NAH, Ms. Maring offered that a majority of the comments are positive. She stated that the certificate holders remain an advisory group and they meet every other month to discuss projects such as this. NAH does do community health needs assessments every two to three years with the most recent in June 2022. They are conducted by an independent group and can be found on the NAH website. The assessments have indicated that access to healthcare is a top need in the community. Part of the implementation plan was driven by the needs assessment and their partnership with a data consulting firm to identify the travel patterns for health and where community members are going for healthcare.

Vice Mayor Aslan stated that he would like more time to consider the information and comments presented tonight.

Moved by Vice Mayor Austin Aslan, **seconded by** Councilmember Miranda Sweet to postpone the public hearing to May 16, 2023.

Councilmember Harris stated that if there is more information desired then that should be requested now so time is not wasted.

Councilmember House asked if there is an incentive program for vehicle charging stations. Ms. Antol stated that when the energy code standards were adopted the requirement is for hook-up and not for all charging stations to be put into place.

Mayor Daggett stated she would like some additional information related to the grading of Purple Sage.

Vice Mayor Aslan stated that he would like to see more complete charging stations put in. He would also like more discussion about an evaluation plan with regard to community health needs and a carbon footprint assessment to understand where things are now and where they should be in 2030.

Councilmember McCarthy indicated that he is interested in more information on the financial feasibility of NAH to complete the project. Councilmember Matthews stated that she does not believe that it is within the scope of the city to financially analyze their capability.

Mr. Solomon stated that the decision before Council is to consider the findings and if they can be met.

Vote: 6 - 1

NAY: Councilmember Deborah Harris

Moved by Councilmember Jim McCarthy, **seconded by** Councilmember Khara House to forego the remainder of the meeting and adjourn.

Vote: 7 - 0 - Unanimously

- i. **Consideration and Adoption of Resolution No. 2023-20 and Ordinance No. 2023-12:** A Resolution of the City of Flagstaff, Coconino County, Arizona, declaring as a public record that certain document filed with the City Clerk entitled "NAH Health Village Phase 1 Specific Plan" and an Ordinance of the City Council of the City of Flagstaff, Coconino County adopting the NAH Health Village Phase 1 Specific Plan to guide the development of 172.62 acre of real property and to provided specific development requirements for 93.39 acres generally located at 1120 W Purple Sage Trail.
- ii. **Consideration and Adoption of Ordinance No. 2023-11:** An Ordinance of the City Council of Flagstaff, amending the Flagstaff Zoning Map to rezone approximately 98.39 acres of real property from Rural Residential (40.47 acres) and Estate Residential (57.92 acres) to Highway Commercial (63.18 acres) and Public Facilities (35.21 acres) and adding the Resource Protection Overlay to APN 112-10-036, 112-10-037, and 112-05-125 generally located at 1120 W Purple Sage Trail.

13. **PUBLIC PARTICIPATION**

14. **INFORMATIONAL ITEMS TO/FROM MAYOR, COUNCIL, AND STAFF, AND FUTURE AGENDA ITEM REQUESTS**

15. **ADJOURNMENT**

The Regular Meeting of the Flagstaff City Council held May 2, 2023, adjourned at 10:38 p.m.

MAYOR

ATTEST:

CITY CLERK

CERTIFICATION

I, STACY SALTZBURG, do hereby certify that I am the City Clerk of the City of Flagstaff, County of Coconino, State of Arizona, and that the above Minutes are a true and correct summary of the Meeting of the Council of the City of Flagstaff held on May 2, 2023. I further certify that the Meeting was duly called and held and that a quorum was present.

DATED this 28th day of August, 2023.

CITY CLERK