

## MINUTES

### 1. Call to Order

Mayor Daggett called the Work Session held May 9, 2023, to order at 3:04 p.m.

#### **NOTICE OF OPTION TO RECESS INTO EXECUTIVE SESSION**

*Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the City Council and to the general public that, at this work session, the City Council may vote to go into executive session, which will not be open to the public, for legal advice and discussion with the City's attorneys for legal advice on any item listed on the following agenda, pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(3).*

### 2. Roll Call

*NOTE: One or more Councilmembers may be in attendance telephonically or by other technological means.*

PRESENT:

ABSENT:

MAYOR DAGGETT  
VICE MAYOR ASLAN  
COUNCILMEMBER HARRIS  
COUNCILMEMBER HOUSE  
COUNCILMEMBER MATTHEWS  
COUNCILMEMBER MCCARTHY  
COUNCILMEMBER SWEET

Others present: City Manager Greg Clifton; City Attorney Sterling Solomon.

### 3. Pledge of Allegiance, Mission Statement, and Land Acknowledgement

The Council and audience recited the pledge of allegiance, Councilmember Matthews read the mission statement and Councilmember McCarthy read the Land Acknowledgement.

#### **MISSION STATEMENT**

*The mission of the City of Flagstaff is to protect and enhance the quality of life for all.*

#### **LAND ACKNOWLEDGEMENT**

*The Flagstaff City Council humbly acknowledges the ancestral homelands of this area's Indigenous nations and original stewards. These lands, still inhabited by Native descendants,*

*border mountains sacred to Indigenous peoples. We honor them, their legacies, their traditions, and their continued contributions. We celebrate their past, present, and future generations who will forever know this place as home.*

#### **4. Public Participation**

*Public Participation enables the public to address the council about items that are not on the prepared agenda. Public Participation appears on the agenda twice, at the beginning and at the end of the work session. You may speak at one or the other, but not both. Anyone wishing to comment at the meeting is asked to fill out a speaker card and submit it to the recording clerk. When the item comes up on the agenda, your name will be called. You may address the Council up to three times throughout the meeting, including comments made during Public Participation. Please limit your remarks to three minutes per item to allow everyone to have an opportunity to speak. At the discretion of the Chair, ten or more persons present at the meeting and wishing to speak may appoint a representative who may have no more than fifteen minutes to speak.*

Michael Pappas addressed Council with concerns and complaints about Mountain Line operations.

Michele James, on behalf of Friends of Flagstaff's Future, addressed Council with concerns about the NAH proposal. There will be detrimental effects of moving the hospital outside of the city core. NAH can retrofit and renovate the existing facility while also continuing its vision.

Sandra Lubarsky addressed Council about the NAH proposal. There is no opinion from outside experts with knowledge of these types of projects. It is important to understand the impacts of a medical retail facility on the outskirts of town.

Dapper Dre addressed Council about bike safety and road design. We spend hundreds of millions of dollars on projects and safety should be built into the road and intersection designs. The city continues to design to the convenience of cars and speeding them up, the focus needs to change to prioritizing bicycles and pedestrians.

Bryan Bates addressed Council about the repurposing of NAH's legacy campus and taking the time needed to look for hidden opportunities that could save time and frustration.

Stefan Sommer, on behalf of the Northern Arizona Climate Alliance, addressed Council with concerns about the NAH proposal. The concerns focused on the carbon footprint of the development, the climate impacts, and suggestions to mitigate the impacts.

Adam Shimoni addressed Council with concerns about the traffic impact analysis done for NAH. He indicated that he believes that the modeling is problematic and it is too car-centric.

Written comments in opposition to the relocation of the hospital were received by the following:

- Terry and Reva Clay
- Lynn Sweitzer
- Sabra Daly
- Danielle and Carlos Ramos
- Jesse and Candra Faulkner

A written comment in opposition to pickleball courts at Bushmaster Park was submitted by Cindy Haro.

**5. Review of Draft Agenda for the May 16, 2023 City Council Meeting**

None

**6. Proclamation: Provider Appreciation Day**

Mayor Daggett read and presented the Provider Appreciation Day proclamation.

**7. Proclamation: Mental Health Awareness Week**

Councilmember House read and presented the Mental Health Awareness Week proclamation.

**8. Proclamation: National Economic Development Week**

Councilmember Sweet read and presented the National Economic Development Week proclamation.

**9. Proclamation: National Travel and Tourism Week**

Councilmember Matthews read and presented the National Travel and Tourism Week proclamation.

**10. National Travel and Tourism Week Update**

Convention and Visitor's Bureau Director Trace Ward provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

NATIONAL TRAVEL & TOURISM WEEK  
THE VISITOR ECONOMY IS ESSENTIAL  
VIDEO  
FLAGSTAFF APPROACH TO NATIONAL TRAVEL AND ECO TOURISM WEEK

Council and staff briefly discussed the I-17 clean-up event.

Councilmember Sweet thanked the tourism team for the work they do for the business community and for keeping Flagstaff top of mind.

**11. Economic Development Week 2023**

Business Retention and Expansion Manager John Saltonstall and Business Attraction Manager Jack Fitchett provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT WEEK 2023  
ACTIVITIES THROUGHOUT FLAGSTAFF  
PARTNERS

Moonshot@NACET Executive Director Diana White addressed Council covering the following points:

- Strategies for more community engagement.
- New Director of Events and Community Engagement position.
- Success stories from the last few months.

- Three companies received over \$7000 in ARPA funding.
- In person workshops have started back up again.
- Pitch events.
- Occupancy is over 70%.
- \$5.6 million in funding.
- \$6.4 million in revenue.
- 437 jobs created or retained.
- Economic development is a community effort.

Economic Collaborative of Northern Arizona President and CEO Gail Jackson addressed Council covering the following points:

- In Winslow, there are 1,200 acres of industrial land where they are looking to be innovative by creating the first-of-its-kind inland port. This will provide millions of square feet for warehousing and manufacturing, many jobs, access to rail and major interstates, and the revitalization of an underutilized airport. It will also bring new housing developments.
- In Camp Verde, they are celebrating the announcement of a new manufacturer and framing service company. It will be 110,000 square feet and create over 180 jobs. They anticipate full operations in the spring of 2024.
- The NAH relocation will be transformational for the region and the health of the economy.
- They are working on a strategic plan for the region that will tie all municipalities together.
- They are conducting a labor analysis and identifying workforce needs.
- There is a workforce housing analysis being done with the intent to develop tangible goals for the region.
- They continue to find and bring high-wage, low-impact jobs to Northern Arizona to keep the quality of life high.

Councilmember Matthews stated that it is exciting to hear about the new industry and economic vitality that is stimulating Northern Arizona. She appreciates the collaborative efforts throughout Flagstaff to bring and keep businesses here.

Councilmember McCarthy stated that he continues to be amazed at the great work Economic Vitality has been doing.

Vice Mayor Aslan stated that he helped facilitate a conversation between BlockLite and NAH about the use of carbon-capturing cinderblocks. There are exciting possibilities there, and he is proud of the team and their efforts to advance businesses such as these. Mr. Saltonstall stated that there are some exciting things coming from BlockLite, and it is always great when materials can be sourced locally.

Mayor Daggett voiced her appreciation to the team for their hard work in building strong partnerships and relationships throughout the region. Councilmember House agreed and added that she likes the live neighborly engagement.

## 12. **Mountain Line Update to City Council**

Mountain Line CEO and General Manager Heather Dalmolin provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

MOUNTAIN LINE TODAY AND BEYOND  
FY2023 PERFORMANCE  
BUDGET REVIEW  
COMPENSATION RECOMMENDATIONS  
BENEFIT RECOMMENDATIONS

FY2024 OPERATING BUDGET  
BUDGET RESULTS  
5 YEAR FINANCIAL OUTLOOK

Councilmember Matthews asked how many trips are done per day collectively across all routes. Ms. Dalmolin stated that it is about 500 trips per day.

Councilmember Matthews asked how many riders are coming from NAU. Ms. Dalmolin stated that 50% of the ridership on Route 10 is NAU riders when school is in session.

Councilmember Matthews asked how often the taxi service runs. Ms. Dalmolin stated that they do not restrict the use of the taxi service; people must qualify for the paratransit service, but there is no restriction on when trips can be made or how many trips can be taken, but they receive a value of up to \$300 per month. Users are able to be qualified on a short-term or long-term basis depending upon need.

Councilmember House asked about the anticipated increases with the shift to electrification of the fleet. Ms. Dalmolin stated that when they made the decision to transition to zero emissions, they did a study which found that the change from the current hybrid vehicles to zero-emission electric vehicles would reduce the maintenance costs because there are not the same amount of moving parts to be maintained. The challenge with a zero-emission fleet is the actual cost to charge the vehicles. It is not a direct offset from the savings realized in general maintenance. There will be an increase in the cost to charge the vehicles.

Mountain Line Transit Planner Bizzy Collins continued the presentation.

TRANSIT NEEDS (2022)  
TRANSIT NEEDS (2021)  
TRANSIT NEEDS (2019)  
FLAGSTAFF IN MOTION  
TRANSIT VISION

Councilmember McCarthy asked if there is any data that indicates that a route to the hospital would be used. Ms. Collins stated that the current NAH bus stops are currently in the top 25% of ridership in the system, and they do see robust employee passes being used there and people going to visit those in the hospital.

Councilmember Matthews stated that there are a lot of transfers at the NAH stops, she asked if there were true numbers for ridership to and from the hospital. Ms. Collins stated that based on pass holders it is about 5% of total trips to and from the hospital.

Councilmember Matthews asked how many employee passes are being used. Ms. Collins stated that there are 100 unique users per month making trips.

IMPROVE ACCESS TO THE BUS SYSTEM  
TRANSIT VISION ACCESS FROM DCC IN 15 AND 30 MINUTES  
TRANSIT ACCESS  
TRANSIT-SUPPORTIVE ACTIONS  
BUS RAPID TRANSIT (BRT)  
NEXT STEPS  
5 YEAR FINANCIAL OUTLOOK

Council briefly discussed bus stop shelters, Route 5, and student riders. They thanked Mountain Line for the presentation and discussion.

A break was held from 5:17 p.m. through 5:30 p.m.

13. **Short-term Rentals License Update**

Public Affairs Director Sarah Langley, Management Services Director Rick Tadder, Community Director Dan Folke, Customer Service Manager Jessica Kittleson, and Senior Assistant City Attorney Anja Wendel provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

SHORT TERM RENTAL ORDINANCE  
AGENDA  
SHORT TERM RENTALS DEFINED  
SCHEDULE OF EVENTS  
STRS IN FLAGSTAFF  
BACKGROUND – ZONING AND CITY CODE  
BACKGROUND – A.R.S. 9-500.39  
PUBLIC COMMENTS ON DRAFT ORDINANCE  
DRAFT ORDINANCE  
LICENSE REQUIRED  
LICENSE FEE  
LICENSE APPLICATION  
APPLICATION PROCESS  
LICENSE DENIAL  
NEIGHBOR NOTIFICATION  
EMERGENCY POINT OF CONTACT

Council discussed the use of the emergency hotline to field all calls and be the buffer between the complainant and the owner. Council expressed concern about access to emergency contact information being used to harass people.

ADVERTISEMENTS AND POSTING  
SEX OFFENDER BACKGROUND CHECKS AND LIABILITY INSURANCE  
VERIFIED VIOLATION

Councilmember House asked how it would be a prohibited use to house a sex offender if there is no requirement to screen occupants. Ms. Wendel stated that it would be complaint-driven.

Councilmember Matthews asked about registered sex offenders and if they would be required to notify when occupying a short-term rental. Police Chief Dan Musselman stated that sex offenders are required to register within 72 hours of moving to a new residence, he is not sure how that would translate to a short-term rental. He will research and report back to Council.

Mayor Daggett stated that one of the big complaints is sidewalks not being shoveled or trespassing. Those are more code violations rather than serious offenses; she asked if they would be included in the verified violation. Ms. Wendel stated that she believed that they would be.

VERIFIED VIOLATION – MUST BE “FINALLY ADJUDICATED”  
LICENSE SUSPENSION  
PENALTIES FOR VERIFIED VIOLATIONS  
COMPLAINTS AND CODE COMPLIANCE  
PUBLIC OUTREACH PLAN  
STAY UP TO DATE

The following individuals addressed Council regarding short-term rental regulation:

- Beth Knisely
- Tim Trazaska
- Ellie Blair
- Mike Bland
- George (no last name given)
- Jake (no last name given)
- Patrick Mowrer
- Erik (no last name given)

The following comments were received:

- Short-term rental hosts need to be accountable and be good stewards.
- The most frequent violation seen is unattended fires.
- Set a justifiable and equitable fee.
- This is just another expense by the city, and I am not sure if it will land results.
- Short-term rentals are not bad, I have paid over \$30,000 in salaries, and I pay taxes to the city.
- Are the penalties associated with short-term rental fines commensurate to fines for property owners?
- There are vigilantes that try to harass short-term rental operators, there needs to be a buffer in place to prevent this from happening.
- It would be more fair to regulate “Air bnb” and “VRBO” rather than hosts directly.
- There are a lot of privacy concerns with this plan.
- In the past there has been nowhere to go with complaints and concerns; this will help bridge that gap, especially with out-of-state owners.
- Suggest charging a higher fee for hosts who are not residents of Arizona or Flagstaff.

Written comments concerning the regulation of short-term rentals were submitted by:

- Eve Fiorucci
- Mary Norton

Council discussed violations and penalties, ways to educate and address Flagstaff-specific issues, notification requirements, and the posting requirements for inside the unit.

#### 14. **2023 Charter Amendment Discussion**

City Clerk Stacy Saltzburg, Purchasing Director Patrick Brown, Senior Assistant City Attorney Anja Wendel, Senior Deputy City Manager Shannon Anderson, Management Services Director Rick Tadder, Deputy City Clerk Stacy Fobar, City Attorney Sterling Solomon, Interim Deputy City Manager Heidi Hansen, and City Manager Greg Clifton provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

##### PROPOSED CHARTER AMENDMENTS

##### WHAT IS A CITY CHARTER?

##### FLAGSTAFF CITY CHARTER

##### INTERNAL CHARTER REVIEW COMMITTEE

##### NO. 1 – NOMINATION FOR PRIMARY ELECTION

##### NO. 1 – PROPOSED AMENDMENT

##### NO. 2 – PURCHASES AND CONTRACTS FOR CITY IMPROVEMENTS

##### NO. 2 – PROPOSED AMENDMENT

##### NO. 3 – ADMINISTRATIVE DEPARTMENTS AND OFFICES

NO. 3 – PROPOSED AMENDMENT  
NO. 4 – BIDS  
NO. 4 – PROPOSED AMENDMENT  
NO. 5 – LEASES OF CITY PROPERTIES  
NO. 5 – PROPOSED AMENDMENT  
NO. 6 – CONTRACTS  
NO. 6 – PROPOSED AMENDMENT  
NO. 7. – PERSONNEL RULES AND REGULATIONS  
NO. 7 – PROPOSED AMENDMENT  
NO. 8 – WHEN ACTIONS ARE TO BE TAKEN BY ORDINANCE  
NO. 8 – PROPOSED AMENDMENT  
NO. 9 – APPOINTIVE BOARDS AND COMMISSIONS  
NO. 9 – PROPOSED AMENDMENT  
NO. 10 – AM. 2 – VOTE REQUIRED FOR CERTAIN TYPES OF FACILITIES COSTING IN EXCESS OF \$1M  
NO. 10 – PROPOSED AMENDMENT  
NO. 11 – AM. 1 – VOTE REQUIRED FOR CERTAIN TYPES OF BOND ISSUES  
NO. 11 – PROPOSED AMENDMENT  
NO. 12 – ELECTIONS FOR APPROVAL OF FRANCHISES  
NO. 12 – PROPOSED AMENDMENT  
NO. 13 – READING AND PASSAGE OF ORDINANCES AND RESOLUTIONS  
NO. 13 – PROPOSED AMENDMENT  
NO. 14 – FISCAL  
NO. 14 – PROPOSED AMENDMENT  
NO. 15 – SALE OF CITY PROPERTY  
NO. 15 – PROPOSED AMENDMENT  
NO. 16 – ORDINANCES AND RESOLUTIONS  
NO. 16 – PROPOSED AMENDMENT  
NO. 17 – CASH FUND SET UP; TRANSFER OF SUMS FROM CASH BASIS FUND TO OTHER FUNDS  
NO. 17 – PROPOSED AMENDMENT  
NO. 18 – POLICE COURT  
NO. 18 – PROPOSED AMENDMENTS  
NO. 19 – FAILURE TO VOTE  
NO. 19 – PROPOSED AMENDMENT  
NO. 20 – QUALIFICATIONS OF ELECTORS; REGISTRATION  
NO. 20 – PROPOSED AMENDMENT  
NO. 21 – CITY TREASURER  
NO. 21 – PROPOSED AMENDMENT  
NEXT STEPS  
DIRECTION REQUESTED

Following discussion, Council gave direction to move forward with advancing all questions with the exception of Question 21 to the voters in November.

Ms. Saltzburg explained that staff will refine the ballot language and will be back before Council for final approval and to call the election.

## 15. Public Participation

None

**16. Informational Items To/From Mayor, Council, and City Manager; future agenda item requests**

Councilmember Matthews reported that she toured the Wildcat Facility; it was very educational, a great biology lesson, and it was very helpful to understanding operations.

Councilmember Harris reported that she attended the Boys and Girls Club Kentucky Derby last Saturday. It was a great event and a lot of money was raised for kids for scholarships. She also reported that NAU is doing all their convocations on Thursday, May 11, 2023 and she encouraged Council to attend if possible. She also mentioned that it would be really helpful to do some training for boards and commissions; they need to better understand their roles, responsibilities, and duties.

Vice Mayor Aslan stated that he also attended the wastewater treatment plant tour; it was a great tour, and it was fascinating to see the equipment and all the infrastructure that goes into the wastewater treatment process. He also reported that he facilitated a meeting between NAH and Blocklite and is excited to hear more about that when things get firmed up. He requested the following two FAIR items:

A resolution to recognize the Baaj Nwaavjo I'tah Kukveni Grand Canyon National Monument.

A discussion about a pond next to Ponderosa Trails neighborhood between Pulliam and I-17.

Councilmember Sweet offered congratulations to all NAU graduates, and she recognized mothers in honor of Mother's Day on Sunday. She also mentioned that Flagstaff's Habitat for Humanity Starter Home Model was recently featured in a national magazine.

Councilmember House reported that she met with some history classes at NPA to discuss the history of housing in Flagstaff. She was impressed and amazed at how well-informed and how well-versed the students were on the future development of the community. She also attended the mobile Consulate event at Coconino Community College to represent the City Council and welcome community members. She also attended the Boys and Girls Club Kentucky Derby Event. Lastly, she called attention to Mental Health Awareness Week.

Mayor Daggett reported that there is an upcoming community meeting for the Museum and Schultz Fire flooding areas. She also reported that the Stream Stewards team will be doing their clean-up along the Rio de Flag on June 3, 2023.

**17. Adjournment**

The Work Session held May 9, 2023, adjourned at 8:45 p.m.

---

MAYOR

ATTEST:

---

CITY CLERK