

## MINUTES

### 1. **CALL TO ORDER**

Mayor Deasy called the meeting of the Flagstaff City Council held November 1, 2022, to order at 3:02 p.m.

#### **NOTICE OF OPTION TO RECESS INTO EXECUTIVE SESSION**

*Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the City Council and to the general public that, at this regular meeting, the City Council may vote to go into executive session, which will not be open to the public, for legal advice and discussion with the City's attorneys for legal advice on any item listed on the following agenda, pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(3).*

### 2. **ROLL CALL**

*NOTE: One or more Councilmembers may be in attendance telephonically or by other technological means.*

PRESENT:

ABSENT:

MAYOR DEASY  
VICE MAYOR SWEET  
COUNCILMEMBER ASLAN (virtually)  
COUNCILMEMBER HOUSE  
COUNCILMEMBER MCCARTHY  
COUNCILMEMBER SALAS  
COUNCILMEMBER SHIMONI (virtually)

Others present: City Manager Greg Clifton; City Attorney Sterling Solomon.

### 3. **PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE, MISSION STATEMENT, AND LAND ACKNOWLEDGEMENT**

The Council and audience recited the pledge of allegiance, Councilmember McCarthy read the Mission Statement of the City of Flagstaff, and Mayor Deasy read the Land Acknowledgement.

#### **MISSION STATEMENT**

*The mission of the City of Flagstaff is to protect and enhance the quality of life for all.*

## LAND ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

*The Flagstaff City Council humbly acknowledges the ancestral homelands of this area's Indigenous nations and original stewards. These lands, still inhabited by Native descendants, border mountains sacred to Indigenous peoples. We honor them, their legacies, their traditions, and their continued contributions. We celebrate their past, present, and future generations who will forever know this place as home.*

### 4. APPROVAL OF MINUTES FROM PREVIOUS MEETINGS

- A. **Consideration and Approval of Minutes:** City Council Regular Meeting of September 21, 2021, Special Work Session/Town Hall of September 24, 2021, Combined Special Meeting/Work Session of September 28, 2021, Regular Meeting of October 5, 2021, Special Meeting (Executive Session) of September 13, 2022, Special Meeting (Executive Session) of September 20, 2022, and Special Meeting (Executive Session) of September 27, 2022.

**Moved by** Councilmember Jim McCarthy, **seconded by** Mayor Paul Deasy to approve the minutes of the City Council Regular Meeting of September 21, 2021, Special Work Session/Town Hall of September 24, 2021, Combined Special Meeting/Work Session of September 28, 2021, Regular Meeting of October 5, 2021, Special Meeting (Executive Session) of September 13, 2022, Special Meeting (Executive Session) of September 20, 2022, and Special Meeting (Executive Session) of September 27, 2022.

**Vote:** 7 - 0 - Unanimously

### 5. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

*Public Participation enables the public to address the Council about an item that is not on the agenda. Comments relating to items that are on the agenda will be taken at the time that the item is discussed. If you wish to address the Council at tonight's meeting, please complete a comment card and submit it to the recording clerk as soon as possible. Your name will be called when it is your turn to speak. You may address the Council up to three times throughout the meeting, including comments made during Public Participation. Please limit your remarks to three minutes per item to allow everyone an opportunity to speak. At the discretion of the Chair, ten or more persons present at the meeting and wishing to speak may appoint a representative who may have no more than fifteen minutes to speak.*

Stephen Puhr addressed Council about accepting Option 2 to fix the buffer. He believed that funding was available, and the city should do what the county did and take a loan from another line item and repay it over five years.

Terry Madeksza and Recreation Supervisor Haley Reynolds invited the City Council to kick off the holiday season with the Winter Wonderland event scheduled for December 3, 2022. There would be many events downtown throughout the month of December.

### 6. PROCLAMATIONS AND RECOGNITIONS

- A. **Proclamation:** Nation's Finest 50th Anniversary

Mayor Deasy read and presented the proclamation.

**B. Proclamation: Alzheimer's and Caregiver Month**

Mayor Deasy read and presented the proclamation.

**C. Proclamation: Native American Heritage Month**

Mayor Deasy read and presented the proclamation.

**7. COUNCIL LIAISON REPORTS**

Councilmember House reported that the Open Space Commission would meet later in the month. The Housing Commission met and reviewed Housing policies and the beginning stages of implementing the 10-Year Housing Plan. They are looking forward to diving further into the plans for implementation.

Councilmember Shimoni reported that Mountain Line was embarking on a number of big discussions about how transit is recognized and prioritized as part of the "Big Shift" in climate action plans. He also met with Northern Arizona Healthcare and Habitat for Humanity regarding a partnership between the two entities. The Indigenous Commission and Transportation Commission would meet later in the week.

Vice Mayor Sweet reported that she attended the Mountain Line Technical Advisory Committee meeting where they discussed their 5-year Master Plan. They also discussed plans for a question on the 2024 November ballot. She also attended the Beautification and Public Art Commission Budget Retreat where they discussed a number of potential projects for the community.

Mayor Deasy reported that the Commission on Inclusion and Adaptive Living met and discussed sidewalk accessibility; the commission would bring recommendations forward to the City Council soon.

Councilmember McCarthy reported that he recently met with the Army Corp of Engineers to discuss the Rio de Flag Flood Control project; progress is being made and the project continues to move forward.

Councilmember Salas reported that Discover Flagstaff and the Economic Vitality team had a successful Annual Stakeholders and Partners meeting. She also reported that the Arizona Department of Transportation would be hosting an electric vehicle outreach meeting in an effort to share information and take public comment. On November 18, 2022, she will be speaking at the State Transportation Board meeting to encourage them to partner in funding for Highway 180 flood mitigation and culvert projects. She also reported that she attended the Rural Transportation Advisory Committee Board meeting where they discussed a \$300 million proposal from 11 metropolitan planning organizations to the state legislature. If successful, it would provide \$15.6 million in funding to the Flagstaff Metropolitan Planning Organization.

**8. APPOINTMENTS**

*Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the City Council and to the general public that the City Council may vote to go into executive session, which will not be open to the public, for the purpose of discussing or considering employment, assignment, appointment, promotion, demotion, dismissal, salaries, disciplining or resignation of a public*

*officer, appointee, or employee of any public body...., pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(1).*

**A. Consideration of Appointments:** Transportation Commission.

**Moved by** Councilmember Adam Shimoni, **seconded by** Mayor Paul Deasy to appoint Matthew Eckhoff to a term expiring July 2025.

**Vote:** 7 - 0 - Unanimously

**Moved by** Mayor Paul Deasy, **seconded by** Vice Mayor Miranda Sweet to appoint Kate Morely as a NAIPTA Representative to a term expiring November 2025.

**Vote:** 7 - 0 - Unanimously

**Moved by** Councilmember Jim McCarthy, **seconded by** Mayor Paul Deasy to appoint Erika Mazza to a term expiring July 2023.

**Vote:** 7 - 0 - Unanimously

**Moved by** Councilmember Khara House, **seconded by** Mayor Paul Deasy to appoint Justin Dinardi as an FUSD Representative to a term expiring November 2025.

**Vote:** 7 - 0 - Unanimously

**B. Consideration of Appointments:** Commission on Diversity Awareness.

**Moved by** Councilmember Adam Shimoni, **seconded by** Councilmember Khara House to appoint Carolyn Kidd to a term expiring September 2025.

**Vote:** 7 - 0 - Unanimously

**Moved by** Councilmember Austin Aslan, **seconded by** Mayor Paul Deasy to appoint Sara Jarvis to a term expiring September 2025.

**Vote:** 7 - 0 - Unanimously

**Moved by** Councilmember Jim McCarthy, **seconded by** Mayor Paul Deasy to appoint Bethany Camp to a term expiring September 2025.

**Vote:** 7 - 0 - Unanimously

**Moved by** Councilmember Regina Salas, **seconded by** Mayor Paul Deasy to appoint Kaiden Akersmontana to a term expiring September 2023.

**Vote:** 7 - 0 - Unanimously

**9. LIQUOR LICENSE PUBLIC HEARINGS**

**A. Consideration and Action on Liquor License Application:** Andrea Dahlman Lekowitz "GoPuff," 2001 E. Huntington Drive, Suite 1, Series 10 (beer and wine store), New License.

Mayor Deasy opened the public hearing.

Police Sergeant Kevin Sapp introduced the application noting nothing of concern.

Councilmember McCarthy noted that the address listed on the application was incorrect. He

also stated that physical stores are required to post a pregnancy warning and he suggested that the delivery service provide a similar notice with their deliveries.

There being no public comment, Mayor Deasy closed the public hearing.

**Moved by** Mayor Paul Deasy, **seconded by** Councilmember Jim McCarthy to forward the application to the state with a recommendation for approval.

**Moved by** Councilmember Jim McCarthy, **seconded by** Councilmember Khara House to amend the motion to recommend to the liquor board that a pregnancy warning be given upon delivery of items.

**Vote:** 7 - 0 - Unanimously

**ORIGINAL MOTION:**

**Vote:** 7 - 0 - Unanimously

**10. CONSENT ITEMS**

*All matters under Consent Agenda are considered by the City Council to be routine and will be enacted by one motion approving the recommendations listed on the agenda. Unless otherwise indicated, expenditures approved by Council are budgeted items.*

Mayor Deasy stated that staff had pulled Item 10F from the agenda and that it would come back to the Council at a later date.

Item 10B was pulled for public comment.

**Moved by** Mayor Paul Deasy, **seconded by** Vice Mayor Miranda Sweet to approve the Consent Items 10A, C, D, E, G, and H as presented.

**Vote:** 7 - 0 - Unanimously

**A. Consideration and Approval of Letter of Intent: City of Peace**

Approve the letter of intent.

**B. Consideration and Approval of Letter of Support: Save Oak Flats**

Baase Pike and Paul Haro spoke in support of the letter of support.

Councilmember Shimoni thanked the Council and Mr. Haro for bringing the matter forward for consideration.

**Moved by** Mayor Paul Deasy, **seconded by** Councilmember Adam Shimoni to approve the Letter of Support for Save Oak Flats.

**Vote:** 7 - 0 - Unanimously

- C. Consideration and Approval of Contract:** Cooperative Purchase Contract with Clark Equipment Company for one (1) Bobcat Toolcat in the amount of \$71,896.48 from Clark Equipment Company, utilizing Sourcewell cooperative purchase contract #040319-CEC.
1. Approve the Cooperative Purchase Contract for one (1) Bobcat Toolcat in the amount of \$71,896.48 from Clark Equipment Company, utilizing Sourcewell cooperative purchase contract # 040319-CEC; and
  2. Authorize the City Manager to execute the necessary documents.
- D. Consideration and Approval of Final Plat:** RP4V, LLC and RP40, LLC request approval of the Final Condominium Plat for Rio Homes Unit 4 Multi-Family (PZ-19-00019-09), a 40-unit multi-family residential condominium subdivision. The 3.71-acre site is located at 1221 E. Emma Drive in the MR, Medium Density Residential Zone, and has a Resource Protection Overlay (RPO).
- Approve the Final Plat and authorize the Mayor to sign the Final Plat when notified by staff that all documents are ready for signature and recordation.
- E. Consideration and Approval of Final Plat:** RP4V, LLC and RP40, LLC request approval of the Final Plat for Rio Homes Unit 4 Multi-Family, a 6-unit multi-family residential townhome subdivision (PZ-19-00019-08). The 5.1-acre site is located at 1221 East Emma Drive in the MR, Medium Density Residential Zone, and has a Resource Protection Overlay (RPO).
- Approve the Final Plat and authorize the Mayor to sign the Final Plat when notified by staff that all documents are ready for signature and recordation.
- F. ~~Consideration and Approval of Contract:~~ ~~Cooperative Purchase Contract with 72 Hour, LLC d/b/a National Auto Fleet Group for the purchase of One (1) New/Unused 2023 Ford Expedition in the amount of \$61,326.18 through a Sourcewell cooperative contract.~~**
- ~~1. Approve a Cooperative Purchase Contract with 72 Hour, LLC d/b/a National Auto Fleet Group for the purchase of One (1) New/Unused 2023 Ford Expedition in the amount of \$61,326.18 through a Sourcewell cooperative contract.~~
  - ~~2. Authorize the City Manager to execute all necessary documents.~~
- ITEM PULLED FROM THE AGENDA
- G. Consideration and Approval of Contract:** Approve Amendment One of the Professional Services Contract with Arizona Water Buffalo, LLC with additional compensation not to exceed \$57,465 for a total contract amount of \$107,415 for Water Services Consulting Services.
1. Approve Amendment One of the Professional Services Contract with Arizona Water Buffalo, LLC with additional compensation not to exceed \$57,465 for a total contract amount of \$107,415 for Water Services Consulting Services; and
  2. Authorize the City Manager to execute the necessary documents.
- H. Consideration and Approval of Contract:** Cooperative Purchase Contract with Empire Southwest, LLC for a Caterpillar 906 articulated loader in the amount of \$133,698 on a National Intergovernmental Purchasing Alliance cooperative purchase agreement with the City of Tucson.
1. Approve the Cooperative Purchase Contract with Empire Southwest, LLC for a Caterpillar 906 articulated loader in the amount of \$133,698; and
  2. Direct the City Manager to execute the necessary documents.

**11. PUBLIC HEARING ITEMS**

- A. Consideration and Adoption of Ordinance No. 2022-28:** An Ordinance of the City Council of the City of Flagstaff, Coconino County, Arizona, amending the Flagstaff City Code, Title 10, Flagstaff Zoning Code, Section 10-90.40.030 Rural Floodplain Map, to change the map designation of approximately 7.76 acres of real property from Rural Floodplain to Urban Floodplain on eight parcels of land (APNs 101-01-020A, 101-01-020B, 101-28-005G, 101-28-005H, 101-28-005K, 101-28-013A, 101-28-013B, and 101-28-013D) located generally between W Forest Avenue and N San Francisco Street; providing for severability and establishing an effective date.

Mayor Deasy opened the public hearing.

Zoning Code Manager Tiffany Antol provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

AMENDMENT TO ZONING CODE SECTION 10-90.40.030 RURAL FLOODPLAIN MAP  
RURAL FLOODPLAIN MAP AMENDMENT  
PROPERTY OWNER INITIATED REQUEST  
RESOURCE PROTECTION OVERLAY  
URBAN FLOODPLAIN  
RURAL FLOODPLAIN  
CURRENT RURAL FLOODPLAIN MAP  
CURRENT FEMA FLOODPLAIN MAP  
PROPOSED RURAL FLOODPLAIN MAP  
FINDINGS FOR ZONING CODE TEXT AMENDMENTS  
FINDING #1  
FINDING #2  
FINDING #3  
RECOMMENDATION

Councilmember Shimoni asked if the city would be able to engage in flood mitigation if the amendment was not approved. Ms. Antol stated that when a property is within the Rural Floodplain designation, it limits what the city could do within that area if additional mitigation or restoration were necessary.

Councilmember Shimoni asked how the property was zoned. Ms. Antol stated that the parcel was zoned High Density Residential.

Councilmember McCarthy asked if the change was made if it would be easier for it to be channelized with concrete bottoms and sides, to which Ms. Antol responded yes.

Councilmember House asked what a denial of the change would do in terms of development. Ms. Antol stated that there is a portion of the property that is outside of the Rural Floodplain and that would allow for development of the site. The site is impacted by the Rural Floodplain as well as slope from Switzer Canyon and that limits the footprint for development. High-Density Residential has a building height of 60 feet, which would encourage a property owner to build up taller to accommodate the minimum density requirement.

The following individuals addressed Council about the amendment:

- Katherine Simmons
- Cristine Kolody
- Steven Holloway

- Claire Leall
- Barbara Phillips

The following comments were received:

- The concern is not with the change in floodplain designation but rather what will happen to the property after the change is made.
- The area must be maintained and kept as part of the natural environment.
- The goal should be to preserve as much open and green space as possible so there would be less development impact.
- The area is the city's only island habitat between Switzer and Turquoise.
- The area should be preserved to maintain the ecosystem.
- There should be consideration for an extended greenbelt in the area.
- Community space is challenging with the minimum density requirements.
- The density is a minimum of 20 units per acre and the concept is for 34 units over three acres.
- Despite the impacts, the wash maintains much of the natural and riparian elements.
- This is about preserving open space.
- There is concern that the area could see flooding similar to the Pipeline and Museum fires in the future.

Written comments in opposition of the ordinance were submitted by the following:

- Jackie Thomas
- Barbara and Dennis Kurth
- Cristine Kolody
- Allison Jones
- Peggy Sheldon-Scurlock
- Cindie McArthur
- Marlene Edgley

Councilmember House stated that development could happen in either scenario; she would like to see mitigation planning happen and that concerns from the hospice center are brought to the table as considerations of the planning process for development.

Councilmember McCarthy stated that he had walked the area and while there had been some changes, the area was substantially natural and untouched by development. The YMCA was able to build and the only impact they had was to put a bridge across. The hospice center was able to build. In his opinion the area is natural, and he would not support the amendment.

Councilmember Shimoni stated that he believed the request to be worthwhile and he would hope that the developer will not allow short-term rentals and work toward workforce housing.

Mayor Deasy stated that the issue was about the definition, not about development agreements or amenities, it was whether the area met the definition of Urban Floodplain which staff had determined that it did. He was concerned about post-wildfire flooding, and it is equally important to consider the future of the area should something happen, and the city is unable to access the area for mitigation efforts.

Councilmember Salas stated that the amendment was about definition, it was not development specific, and it could not stop development of the area. A developer could build whatever the zoning code allowed in either floodplain designation.

Councilmember McCarthy stated that there has been no channelization in the area and it was his opinion that it is substantially in a natural state and it should be kept as is.

Councilmember Aslan agreed and stated that he would be voting no for the same reason. He also believed that different people could come to different conclusions in good faith, but he was concerned that the request was being considered at the behest of a developer, and that sent the wrong message to the community. More units should not be put in floodways.

There being no further comment, Mayor Deasy closed the public hearing.

**Moved by** Councilmember Regina Salas, **seconded by** Vice Mayor Miranda Sweet to read Ordinance No. 2022-28 by title only for the first time.

**Vote:** 5 - 2

NAY: Councilmember Austin Aslan  
Councilmember Jim McCarthy

*AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF FLAGSTAFF, COCONINO COUNTY, ARIZONA, AMENDING THE FLAGSTAFF CITY CODE, TITLE 10, FLAGSTAFF ZONING CODE, SECTION 10-90.40.030 RURAL FLOODPLAIN MAP, TO CHANGE THE MAP DESIGNATION OF APPROXIMATELY 7.76 ACRES OF REAL PROPERTY FROM RURAL FLOODPLAIN TO URBAN FLOODPLAIN ON EIGHT PARCELS OF LAND (APNS 101-01-020A, 101-01-020B, 101-28-005G, 101-28-005H, 101-28-005K, 101-28-013A, 101-28-013B, AND 101-28-013D) LOCATED GENERALLY BETWEEN W FOREST AVENUE AND N SAN FRANCISCO STREET; PROVIDING FOR SEVERABILITY, AND ESTABLISHING AN EFFECTIVE DATE*

- B. Consideration and Adoption of Resolution No. 2022-51 and Ordinance No. 2022-27:** A Resolution of the City Council of the City of Flagstaff, Coconino County, Arizona, declaring as a public record that certain document filed with the City Clerk entitled "PZ-19-00248 Updates to Zoning Code - Outdoor Lighting Standards" and an Ordinance of the City Council of the City of Flagstaff Coconino County, Arizona, amending the Flagstaff City Code, Title 10, Flagstaff Zoning Code, to modify the existing Outdoor Lighting Standards.

Mayor Deasy opened the public hearing.

Zoning Code Manager Tiffany Antol provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

AMENDMENT TO ZONING CODE DIVISION 10-50.070 OUTDOOR LIGHTING STANDARDS  
OUTDOOR LIGHTING STANDARDS  
CITY'S PROPOSED ZONING CODE TEXT AMENDMENT  
FINDINGS FOR ZONING CODE TEXT AMENDMENT  
STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Councilmember McCarthy asked if the Planning and Zoning Commission recommendation was unanimous, to which Ms. Antol answered yes.

There being no public comment, Mayor Deasy closed the public hearing.

**Moved by** Mayor Paul Deasy, **seconded by** Councilmember Austin Aslan to read Resolution No. 2022-51 by title only.

**Vote:** 7 - 0 - Unanimously

*A RESOLUTION OF THE FLAGSTAFF CITY COUNCIL DECLARING AS A PUBLIC RECORD THAT CERTAIN DOCUMENT FILED WITH THE CITY CLERK AND ENTITLED "PZ-19-00248 OUTDOOR LIGHTING STANDARDS"*

**Moved by** Mayor Paul Deasy, **seconded by** Councilmember Jim McCarthy to read Ordinance No. 2022-27 by title only for the first time.

**Vote:** 7 - 0 - Unanimously

*AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF FLAGSTAFF, AMENDING THE FLAGSTAFF CITY CODE, TITLE 10, FLAGSTAFF ZONING CODE, BY ADOPTING BY REFERENCE THAT CERTAIN DOCUMENT ENTITLED "PZ-19-00248 UPDATES TO ZONING CODE–OUTDOOR LIGHTING STANDARDS"; PROVIDING FOR PENALTIES, REPEAL OF CONFLICTING ORDINANCES, SEVERABILITY, AND ESTABLISHING AN EFFECTIVE DATE*

A break was held from 4:49 p.m. through 5:18 p.m.

## 12. REGULAR AGENDA

- A. Consideration and Approval of Contract:** Approve the Professional Engineering Services Contract with Burgess & Niple, Inc. in the amount of \$716,401.00 for the Butler-Fourth Improvements Project.

Capital Improvements Project Manager Jeremy DeGeyter provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

BUTLER-FOURTH IMPROVEMENTS (BUTLER AVENUE WIDENING) PROFESSIONAL ENGINEERING SERVICES CONTRACT  
PROJECT LOCATION MAP  
BUTLER-FOURTH IMPROVEMENTS  
PROJECT BACKGROUND  
CURRENT PROPOSED CROSS SECTION  
PROJECT CONSIDERATIONS  
PROJECT CHARTERING AND SCOPING  
PROJECT SCHEDULE

Councilmember Shimoni stated that he was looking forward to the public outreach component and that he was in support of the contract. He was hopeful that prior Council conversations about design and traffic calming are incorporated into the plans for the project.

**Moved by** Councilmember Adam Shimoni, **seconded by** Mayor Paul Deasy to approve the Professional Engineering Services Contract with Burgess & Niple, Inc. in the amount of \$716,401.00 for the Butler-Fourth Improvements Project with a contract duration of 300 calendar days and authorize the City Manager to execute the necessary documents.

**Vote:** 7 - 0 - Unanimously

- B. Consideration and Adoption of Ordinance No. 2022-30:** An ordinance amending City Code to align City Code and industrial discharge permits with the language in Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) 40, and Code of Federal Regulations (CFR) 403.

Industrial Pretreatment Supervisor Jolene Montoya provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

PRETREATMENT CODE CHANGES 2022  
 NEED / WHY  
 WHO WILL THIS AFFECT?  
 WHAT ARE THE CHANGES  
 7-02-001-0010: INDUSTRIAL SELF-MONITORING  
 7-02-001-0012: SIGNATORY REQUIREMENTS  
 WHAT HAS HAPPENED?

**Moved by** Mayor Paul Deasy, **seconded by** Councilmember Khara House to read Ordinance No. 2022-30 by title only for the first time.

**Vote:** 7 - 0 - Unanimously

*AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF FLAGSTAFF, AMENDING CITY CODE 7, HEALTH AND SANITATION, CHAPTER 02-001-0010, INDUSTRIAL SELF-MONITORING; AND CHAPTER 02-001-0012, SIGNATORY REQUIREMENTS; PROVIDING FOR SEVERABILITY, AUTHORITY FOR CLERICAL CORRECTIONS, AND ESTABLISHING AN EFFECTIVE DATE*

Mr. Clifton took a moment to recognize Regulatory Compliance Manager Steve Camp who would be retiring. He offered appreciation for Mr. Camp's service and wished him the best in his retirement.

- C. Consideration and Adoption of Resolution No. 2022-50:** A resolution of the Flagstaff City Council adopting the Active Transportation Master Plan

Multi-Modal Planner Martin Ince provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION MASTER PLAN  
 CHAPTERS  
 INTRODUCTION  
 INTENT OF THE ATMP  
 GUIDING PRINCIPLES  
 APPROACH (THE BIG SHIFT)  
 CURRENT CONDITIONS  
 GOALS, POLICIES, AND STRATEGIES  
 OUTCOMES, INDICATORS, AND TARGETS  
 IMPLEMENTATION  
 PLANNING CONSIDERATIONS  
 DESIGN GUIDANCE  
 INFRASTRUCTURE RECOMMENDATIONS  
 PEDESTRIAN AND BICYCLE INFRASTRUCTURE  
 WHO IS THIS FOR

Councilmember McCarthy stated that electric bikes were becoming more common and their speeds are much higher. He asked if the plan addressed some of the incompatibility of bikes on sidewalks, FUTS trails, and paths. Mr. Ince stated that the plan speaks to the opportunity that electric bikes present in improving mobility to people but also to being sensitive to walkers and traditional bikers. It talks about how different spaces are used and how some areas are not always adequate to accommodate everything.

Councilmember Salas asked how the ATMP interfaced with MetroPlan's Stride Forward strategies. Mr. Ince stated that a lot of information had been shared between the city and MetroPlan and that was reflected in the document. Much of the information would also be included in the Regional Plan update as well.

The following individuals addressed Council in support of the ATMP:

- Kate Morely on behalf of Mountain Line
- Susan Hueftle
- Michele James on behalf of Friends of Flagstaff's Future

The following comments were received:

- Mountain Line supports the ATMP.
- The inclusion of transit in the plan is appreciated.
- All transit riders start with biking and walking, and the plan is important to the success of Mountain Line.
- The level of involvement throughout the community was great.
- The ATMP has never been needed more than now in light of the devastating fires and flooding of the summer.
- Most communities are interested in biking if they feel safer and more protected.
- Let Flagstaff be the pinnacle of biking and safety for all of Arizona.
- Council should continue to support the plan and begin implementing the elements immediately.
- Build it and the cyclists will come, educate them and more will come, maintain it and people will stay.
- Friends of Flagstaff's Future supports the plan.
- The ATMP will provide specific goals, details, and priorities.
- The plan supports the "Big Shift" and is critical to transportation planning.

Written comments in support of the ATMP were submitted by the following:

- Samantha Meier
- Estella Hollander
- Debbie McMahon
- Theodore Lewer

Council thanked Mr. Ince and all the commissions and partners who provided input and guidance for the development of the plan. They looked forward to implementing the plan and accomplishing the goals that it set out.

**Moved by** Councilmember Adam Shimoni, **seconded by** Councilmember Jim McCarthy to read Resolution No. 2022-50 by title only.

**Vote:** 7 - 0 - Unanimously

*A RESOLUTION OF THE FLAGSTAFF CITY COUNCIL, ADOPTING THE ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION MASTER PLAN*

**Moved by** Councilmember Adam Shimoni, **seconded by** Councilmember Jim McCarthy to adopt Resolution No. 2022-50.

**Vote:** 7 - 0 - Unanimously

- D. Consideration and Adoption of Resolution No. 2022-52:** A Resolution of the Flagstaff City Council, requiring that new construction and major renovation of all city-owned, non-housing section, occupied facilities achieve emissions-neutral operations, and that these same facilities shall be designed to support one or more functions of a “community resilience hub” to support vulnerable community members during disruptive events, and that in the event that a city-owned building or property is being vacated by the city, that the housing section first have the opportunity to evaluate the property and determine the feasibility of re-purposing or developing in a manner that supports increasing the number of available and affordable housing units, and repealing Resolution no. 2014-09.

Climate and Energy Coordinator Ramon Alatorre provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

SUSTAINABLE BUILDING RESOLUTION UPDATE  
 HISTORY  
 MOTIVATION FOR REVISIONS AND UPDATES  
 3 MAIN GOALS OF THE PROPOSED REVISIONS  
 GOALS OF THE PROPOSED REVISIONS  
 UPDATES SINCE MEETING ON 10/18/2022

A written comment in support of the resolution was submitted by Samantha Meier.

Councilmember McCarthy thanked staff for working with him to simplify the language. Councilmember Salas offered similar thanks for incorporating her suggestion to interface with the Adaptive Reuse Policy.

**Moved by** Councilmember Khara House, **seconded by** Mayor Paul Deasy to read Resolution No. 2022-52 by title only.

**Vote:** 7 - 0 - Unanimously

*A RESOLUTION OF THE FLAGSTAFF CITY COUNCIL, REQUIRING THAT NEW CONSTRUCTION AND MAJOR RENOVATION OF ALL CITY-OWNED, NON-HOUSING SECTION, OCCUPIED FACILITIES ACHIEVE EMISSIONS-NEUTRAL OPERATIONS, AND THAT THESE SAME FACILITIES SHALL BE DESIGNED TO SUPPORT ONE OR MORE FUNCTIONS OF A “COMMUNITY RESILIENCE HUB” TO SUPPORT VULNERABLE COMMUNITY MEMBERS DURING DISRUPTIVE EVENTS, AND THAT IN THE EVENT THAT A CITY-OWNED BUILDING OR PROPERTY IS BEING VACATED BY THE CITY, THAT THE HOUSING SECTION FIRST HAVE THE OPPORTUNITY TO EVALUATE THE PROPERTY AND DETERMINE THE FEASIBILITY OF REPURPOSING OR DEVELOPING IN A MANNER THAT SUPPORTS INCREASING THE NUMBER OF AVAILABLE AND AFFORDABLE HOUSING UNITS, AND REPEALING RESOLUTION NO. 2014-09*

**Moved by** Councilmember Khara House, **seconded by** Mayor Paul Deasy to adopt Resolution No. 2022-52.

**Vote:** 7 - 0 - Unanimously

- E. Consideration and Adoption of Ordinance No. 2022-29:** An ordinance of the City Council of the City of Flagstaff, amending section 1-07-001-0005, Salaries, of the Flagstaff City Code, and establishing an effective date.

Senior Deputy City Manager Shannon Anderson provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

COMMISSION ON COUNCIL SALARIES  
BACKGROUND  
INFORMATION CONSIDERED  
COMMUNITY OUTREACH  
SALARY RECOMMENDATIONS  
STIPEND RECOMMENDATIONS  
SUPPORTING STATEMENTS

The following individuals spoke in support of the ordinance:

- Jeffrey McCarroll
- Kyle Nitschke
- Eric Wolverton
- Dr. Coral Evans
- McKenzie Jones
- Anthony Garcia
- Heather Marcy
- Michelle James on behalf of Friends of Flagstaff's Future
- Tyler Denham

The following comments were received:

- The current salaries do not create a place for diversity in the type of people who can run for City Council.
- The current salary is not a livable wage.
- Increasing the wages will allow for a more diverse City Council.
- The city needs a professional Council, and the salary should be commensurate with the expectations and qualifications of the position.
- The current salary is a big reason there is not a full slate of candidates on the ballot.
- Take away the fear of giving yourselves a raise.
- Greater economic diversity is needed on Council.
- It is nearly impossible for someone to have a full-time job and serve on the Council.
- True leadership recognizes the need for and importance of diversity of thought, ideas, culture, work history, and lived experience.
- Public service requires a lot of time and dedication, and the compensation should reflect that.
- Historically, for someone to have the ability to serve in a leadership role they would have to come from privilege or wealth.
- Is it equitable for those who have privilege and wealth to be the only ones in the city to have the privilege and honor to serve as an elected official?
- I worked four jobs during my term on City Council.
- You have the opportunity to shape future Councils for decades.
- I wanted to serve on the City Council but was not able too because I could not support myself on that wage.
- The salary increase will give a whole different demographic an opportunity to have a seat at the table.
- This is a diversity, equity, and inclusion issue.
- The unbiased commission made an evidence-based decision with their

recommendation.

- The Council has a very important job, and they make very difficult decisions, their salary should reflect that importance.
- Friends of Flagstaff's Future fully supports the proposed ordinance to increase the salaries to the full amount recommended by the commission.
- The current low salaries are a significant limitation for many.
- Higher salaries will attract more candidates.
- The recommended salaries are not equal to the area median income.

Written comments in support of the ordinance were submitted by the following:

- Samantha Meier
- Tyler Denham
- Audrey Kruse

Councilmember McCarthy noted that he does not have a vested interest in the matter as he was not eligible to receive the increase. He was supportive of a significant increase but the recommendation to increase the salary by 250% over two years was a bit of a sticker shock. If approved, Flagstaff would be the second highest-paid City Council next to the City of Phoenix. He suggested an increase to \$44,600 for councilmembers and not to do the increase two years later as recommended.

Councilmember Aslan stated that his spouse primarily supports his family and if he was not in that situation, he would not be able to participate as a Councilmember. He voiced support for the recommendation of the commission. Flagstaff has struggled to attract quality candidates and a living wage is an important element of a candidate pool. The reason the increase is so high is because the salary is so far behind.

Councilmember Shimoni indicated that the work of a Councilmember is full-time and non-stop, with very few jobs being similar. It is a privilege to serve and there is an opportunity to correct a wrong. Flagstaff is growing and its citizens demand that the Council is always available. Everyone should have the opportunity to serve, and the current situation does not provide for that. \$63,800 is much better than what exists currently, and he would argue that if the next Council does not want the second increase, they can make that decision. Approving the increases would be an investment in the community.

Vice Mayor Sweet stated that as a small business owner, she has been fortunate to be able to hire a business manager so that she can commit her full time to the City Council. There are many who cannot serve the community and the action will move Flagstaff in the right direction. She believes in diversity, equity, and inclusion, and the vote before them now will ensure that for the community. It is a big job, they do deserve a raise, and she wants all members of the community to feel that they have the opportunity to serve.

Councilmember House stated that when she ran for the appointment to Council she said that she wanted to be a representative for those unseen and unheard. Many cannot afford to make the sacrifice needed to serve in a City Council position and that needed to change. It is a difficult conversation but an important one for the future of the community.

Councilmember Salas offered that she appreciated the perspectives shared. She knew that it would be a tremendous sacrifice to run for office and serve as a Councilmember. She has personally turned down work and clients to fulfill her obligations on the City Council. It has been a struggle for her financially and she was fortunate to be able to lean on family. She would like others to feel that they have the ability to serve the community and to experience all the benefits that public service offers.

Mayor Deasy shared that he had also struggled to make ends meet while serving on City Council. He agreed that Council needs an increase but the question for him was how much was most appropriate. Staff members have received 3% increases which seemed so small when compared to what was being contemplated for the Council. Staff supports the Council, they attend the meetings, prepare materials, and carry out the decisions that are made. He suggested that the voters should determine the salary and that a Charter amendment reflecting that should be included in the Special Election for Charter amendments in the fall of 2023.

Councilmember McCarthy proposed that the salary of the Mayor be as recommended and for Councilmembers, the second year would be an increase to \$50,000 instead of \$63,800.

Mr. Clifton offered that the decision fell entirely to the City Council; it was not a decision that involved administration other than through the assembly of the commission and providing information. The process leading up to the discussion has been objective, inclusive, and representative. Much falls upon local government with high demands and representation. There is no easy lift in the City Council position, and it is one that demands a lot of time.

Councilmember Shimoni asked what had been done for staff in terms of compensation. Mr. Clifton stated that the compensation plan was implemented three years ago, and they are two years into a merit-based compensation regimen. There had been a 2% cost of living adjustment and 3% per annum merit increases have been projected for the next five years. Noted changes have been made in compression adjustments and minimum wage which were implemented six months earlier than required. There have been market-rate adjustments and a new pay structure that provides more equity within the organization.

**Moved by** Councilmember Adam Shimoni, **seconded by** Councilmember Austin Aslan to read Ordinance No. 2022-29 by title only for the first time.

**Vote:** 6 - 1

NAY: Mayor Paul Deasy

*AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF FLAGSTAFF, AMENDING SECTION 1-07-001-0005, SALARIES, OF THE FLAGSTAFF CITY CODE, AND ESTABLISHING AN EFFECTIVE DATE*

A break was called from 8:08 p.m. through 8:23 p.m.

### 13. **DISCUSSION ITEMS**

#### **A. Snow Readiness and Operations Update- PROSE / Public Works**

Assistant Parks and Recreation Director Amy Hagin and Public Works Streets Section Director Sam Beckett provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

SNOW OPERATIONS READINESS REPORT  
PRESENTATION OBJECTIVES  
STORM PREPARATIONS  
STREETS SNOWPLOW FLEET  
STREETS PERSONNEL PREPARATIONS  
STREETS-SNOW OPERATIONS

BUTLER AVE EXPECTED SNOW IMPACTS  
PARKS SECTION – READINESS  
PARKS FLEET AND EQUIPMENT  
SNOW OPERATIONS – PARKS  
SNOW OPERATIONS FOR OUR PARKS SECTION  
PARKS SNOW OPERATIONS DASHBOARD  
POST STORM OPERATIONS  
PUBLIC OPERATIONS ASSISTANCE

Councilmember House expressed appreciation for the work that was being done to keep the streets clear. She was amazed to see all the care and thought that goes into snow operations and taking into consideration the businesses and lives of the community.

Councilmember Shimoni also expressed appreciation. He noted that he did a ride-along and got to see and appreciate the work that was done and the challenges that were faced. He indicated that he would like for everyone to look at snow operations through a lens of equity. More emphasis is needed on sidewalks and bike lanes; more people would choose to walk and bike if it was easier and safer to do so. He encouraged more communication and outreach about operations, clearing sidewalks, and parking.

Councilmember Salas extended her appreciation to the entire team. She mentioned that there was a Winter Recreation map that was developed by Discover Flagstaff to show the public where the dedicated snow play areas are located. It is amazing how so many members of Team Flagstaff pitch in and work to clear snow all over the city.

Vice Mayor Sweet echoed the appreciation and offered that the downtown business community also thanks them for working to keep businesses open and running.

Mayor Deasy asked how many roadway miles the city is responsible for. Mr. Beckett stated that over 700 lane miles are plowed. Mayor Deasy stated that it really puts into perspective the magnitude of the task and the number of staff needed to do that.

## **B. Discussion on Stormwater Credit Manual Revisions**

Stormwater Manager Ed Schenk provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

STORMWATER CREDIT MANUAL REVISIONS  
OVERVIEW  
REVIEW OF 2015 CREDIT MANUAL  
PROPOSED REVISIONS  
ADDITIONAL COMMENTS  
FEEDBACK FROM WATER COMMISSION

Councilmember House asked if there was an assessment of a property when it changed hands to ensure that mitigations were still in place. Mr. Schenk stated that Water Conservation staff can check on the mitigation and incentives.

Councilmember House asked how often the incentive was used and if they anticipated an increase or decrease in utilization. Mr. Schenk stated that they hope to address floodproofing in the future and see more utilization of the incentive opportunity. The goal was to see an increase in use across the board with education.

Mayor Deasy asked the cost for major developments to get the credit. Mr. Schenk

indicated that it costs nothing to apply.

Council expressed support of the revisions.

### **C. Discussion of potential Holiday Display Policy**

Mr. Solomon stated that there had been thought for some time to develop a Holiday Display Policy for the display of items during the holiday season that are inclusive and allow for the celebration of light, hope, joy, and love. There had been interest from the Jewish community to display a menorah at City Hall and that was something that could be done within the policy as drafted. Staff was seeking Council input and direction on the drafted policy.

Rabbi Dovie Shapiro and Rabbi Shneur Wolfman addressed Council in support of the policy. The following comments were offered:

- We have a dream to give the Flagstaff Jewish community an open and welcoming center that they could call their own and be welcoming of all people, no matter their faith, culture, and lifestyle.
- Flagstaff is such a diverse, welcoming, friendly, and inclusive community and that positivity begins from the top, the City of Flagstaff.
- For many years they have requested to put up a menorah outside City Hall during the eight days of Hanukkah, but that request has been rejected.
- The city does a wonderful job putting up decorations throughout Flagstaff during the holiday season, but the festive times do not include the Jewish community and the decorations do not represent inclusivity.
- They would like to feel a little more included in the holiday season.
- The menorah is a representation of light over darkness; it is the universal message of freedom over oppression, and that love will trump over hate.
- Many community members feel like outsiders during the holiday season with no Jewish representation.
- They are hopeful that the Jewish community would be able to display the menorah outside City Hall.

Mr. Solomon stated that if so directed, a resolution could be presented on November 15, 2022 and if approved would be effective immediately.

Mayor Deasy noted his enthusiastic support to bring a policy forward.

Councilmember Shimoni expressed pride that Flagstaff was inclusive of all people. He indicated his support for a policy and was excited to correct something big.

Councilmember House voiced her support and stated that the given the current climate, messages of light, and peace, and justice are so important.

Councilmember Salas indicated her full support for a Holiday Display Policy when the universal message was toward peace, joy, compassion, harmony, light, unity, and diversity.

Vice Mayor Sweet noted her support in moving forward with a policy.

Councilmember McCarthy noted that he did not think it was appropriate for the government to get entangled in religion and should stay out of the business of promoting any given religion.

There was majority support from Council to move forward with a Holiday Display Policy.

**Moved by** Councilmember Adam Shimoni, **seconded by** Councilmember Jim McCarthy to continue the meeting in accordance with the City Council Rules of Procedure.

**Vote:** 7 - 0 - Unanimously

**14. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION**

None

**15. INFORMATIONAL ITEMS TO/FROM MAYOR, COUNCIL, AND STAFF, AND FUTURE AGENDA ITEM REQUESTS**

Vice Mayor Sweet reminded everyone that First Friday Artwalk downtown was that week.

Councilmember Shimoni reported that he attended the Habitat for Humanity open house which was great. He also attended the 50-Year Celebration for CCCY. He met with Darrell Marks' class at Flagstaff High School and had a great discussion with the students. He noted that the 2022 Fire Department Recruit ceremony was later that week and that Mountain Line will be offering free bus serve all day on Election Day.

Mayor Deasy stated that he would be playing mandolin and guitar with his father-in-law during First Friday Artwalk and encouraged people to attend.

**16. ADJOURNMENT**

The Regular Meeting of the Flagstaff City Council held November 1, 2022, adjourned at 9:40 p.m.

\_\_\_\_\_  
MAYOR

ATTEST:

\_\_\_\_\_  
CITY CLERK

**CERTIFICATION**

I, STACY SALTZBURG, do hereby certify that I am the City Clerk of the City of Flagstaff, County of Coconino, State of Arizona, and that the above Minutes are a true and correct summary of the Meeting of the Council of the City of Flagstaff held on November 1, 2022. I further certify that the Meeting was duly called and held and that a quorum was present.

DATED this 19th day of December, 2023.

\_\_\_\_\_  
CITY CLERK