

MINUTES

1. Call to Order

Mayor Daggett called the meeting of the Flagstaff City Council held June 13, 2023, to order at 3:01 p.m.

NOTICE OF OPTION TO RECESS INTO EXECUTIVE SESSION

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the City Council and to the general public that, at this work session, the City Council may vote to go into executive session, which will not be open to the public, for legal advice and discussion with the City's attorneys for legal advice on any item listed on the following agenda, pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(3).

2. Roll Call

NOTE: One or more Councilmembers may be in attendance telephonically or by other technological means.

PRESENT:

MAYOR DAGGETT
VICE MAYOR ASLAN
COUNCILMEMBER HARRIS
COUNCILMEMBER HOUSE
COUNCILMEMBER MATTHEWS
COUNCILMEMBER MCCARTHY
COUNCILMEMBER SWEET

ABSENT:

Others present: City Manager Greg Clifton; Deputy City Attorney Kevin Finsel

3. Pledge of Allegiance, Mission Statement, and Land Acknowledgment

The Council and audience recited the pledge of allegiance, Councilmember McCarthy read the Mission Statement of the City of Flagstaff, and Vice Mayor Aslan read the Land Acknowledgment.

MISSION STATEMENT

The mission of the City of Flagstaff is to protect and enhance the quality of life for all.

LAND ACKNOWLEDGMENT

The Flagstaff City Council humbly acknowledges the ancestral homelands of this area's Indigenous nations and original stewards. These lands, still inhabited by Native descendants, border mountains sacred to Indigenous peoples. We honor them, their legacies, their traditions, and their continued contributions. We celebrate their past, present, and future generations who will forever know this place as home.

4. Public Participation

Public Participation enables the public to address the council about items that are not on the prepared agenda. Public Participation appears on the agenda twice, at the beginning and at the end of the work session. You may speak at one or the other, but not both. Anyone wishing to comment at the meeting is asked to fill out a speaker card and submit it to the recording clerk. When the item comes up on the agenda, your name will be called. You may address the Council up to three times throughout the meeting, including comments made during Public Participation. Please limit your remarks to three minutes per item to allow everyone to have an opportunity to speak. At the discretion of the Chair, ten or more persons present at the meeting and wishing to speak may appoint a representative who may have no more than fifteen minutes to speak.

Nate Spangler, a FALA high school student, addressed Council regarding climate change and global warming. He stated that the recent decision to approve the specific plan for Northern Arizona Healthcare (NAH) shows that the Council has lost its commitment to action regarding climate change. He asked the Council to reconsider the decision and to protect the future of the youth by pushing towards the 2030 Net Zero goal.

Ynara Halbert, an upcoming junior in high school, also addressed Council about the carbon neutrality plan and how the NAH specific plan approval does not support the carbon neutrality plan.

John Edmonds addressed the Council regarding the pickleball decision and moving forward with the decision to build the courts. He shared a story of building a pickleball court at his home in Phoenix and stated that pickleball will continue to be played at Bushmaster even without the new courts. He stated that the Council will not regret building pickleball courts and that the courts would improve the park.

Nadine Hart, a member of the FHA Board, addressed the Council and spoke about the Section 8 housing vouchers and her issues with finding housing in Flagstaff. She stated that her home in Rio Homes was sold, and that Flagstaff needs to offer an incentive for property owners who do long-term rentals and tax property owners who do short-term rentals. She stated that a law must be added to ensure that Section 8 vouchers are considered as income.

Michael Ley addressed Council about the collection of data for pickleball. He stated that he and other members of the pickleball association conducted a survey on wait times for pickleball courts. He addressed the accusation of pickleball players not sharing courts well and the noise issues. He stated that the Council needs empirical data on the pickleball courts.

Steve Pulos also addressed Council about pickleball courts and stated that the intended spot would make an impressive pickleball court. He addressed Councilmember McCarthy and stated that he should recuse himself because he cannot be objective or fair, as demonstrated by his questions to the petitioner of the reconsideration of the pickleball courts at the last meeting.

Councilmember McCarthy stated that the idea that he needs to recuse himself is ridiculous and explained why he was concerned about noise at the location.

Natasha Thompson addressed Council and stated that she lives in Chandler and comes to Flagstaff to escape the heat. She mentioned that there were pickleball courts created at her HOA in Chandler and that there are no noise complaints. She spoke in support of creating pickleball courts at Bushmaster Park.

Irv Callahan addressed Council and expressed his disappointment in the Council's reconsideration of their decision to build pickleball courts. He spoke about how the courts will now be delayed and will cost more. He addressed some of the issues that the community members living around the park raised and stated that pickleball players in town have worked diligently with staff and the commissions to create the existing plan. He concluded by stating that Flagstaff needs pickleball courts.

Randy Schilling addressed Council and stated that he has been playing pickleball for years and that it is a great community. He urged the Council to move forward with creating new courts at Bushmaster Park.

James Crawford addressed Council and expressed his disappointment in the decision to reconsider the approval of pickleball courts at Bushmaster Park. He stated that there are a lot of untrue rumors circulating about pickleball, that the City is lagging behind other cities in providing this recreational activity, and that the pickleball association has collaborated with the Parks and Recreation Department on the creation of the courts.

Jennifer Kottra addressed Council about the planning of the Parks and Recreation Department and the commission being stalled. She encouraged the Council to reach out to staff to access the data. She also spoke about the cost benefits of keeping the project at Bushmaster Park. She asked if the noise of pickleball is being exaggerated for an agenda.

Eileen Taggart addressed Council in favor of creating the pickleball courts but urged working with both sides to find a solution. She expressed her hope to keep pickleball free and accessible to all. She asked if there are any conditions that the other side would agree to for the pickleball courts.

Written comments were received via email from Joy Stephens, Barry Bertani, and Rachael Simukonda.

5. Review of Draft Agenda for the June 20, 2023 City Council Meeting

Citizens wishing to speak on agenda items not specifically called out by the City Council may submit a speaker card for their items of interest to the recording clerk.

None.

6. Proclamation: Juneteenth

Councilmember House read the proclamation on behalf of the City and Ms. Jean Toner, Commission on Diversity Awareness Chairperson, accepted the proclamation on behalf of the commission.

Ms. Toner thanked Mayor, Vice Mayor, and Council for reading the proclamation and shared a few words about Juneteenth. She stated that she hopes the City will make Juneteenth an official city holiday, which will be a recommendation from the commission.

7. **Proclamation:** Waste & Recycling Workers Week

Mayor Daggett stated that the staff showed immense resilience in handling the abrupt change in the recycling services and shared her gratitude to the team. She then read the proclamation.

Public Works Section Director Evan Tyrell thanked Council for the recognition.

8. **Lone Tree Overpass Integrated Art Elements**

Beautification, Arts, and Sciences Program Manager Jana Weldon presented to the Mayor, Vice Mayor, and Council on the potential integration of art elements into the Lone Tree Overpass project. She discussed the "three pillars of the public design process": artist selection, community input, funding and budget, and then focused on the integrated art elements.

Mayor Daggett thanked Ms. Weldon for the effort that went into collecting community feedback and for finding an artist.

Councilmember Sweet expressed her excitement about the project. She likened it to an art installation that could attract the community. She also extended her gratitude.

Councilmember McCarthy shared his enthusiasm for the project and appreciated the funding through the BBB tax. He suggested an edit to the bike wheel graphic within the integrated art elements, proposing that it should not feature gears along with the bike tire.

Councilmember House commended the thoughtfulness behind the project and found the engagement to be meaningful.

Councilmember Matthews echoed the sentiments that were expressed. She conveyed her excitement about the future of art in Flagstaff with this cohesive vision.

Vice Mayor Aslan remarked that the presentation was another success. He expressed his high anticipation for the project, highlighting its readiness for a post-car era. He believed the project would become an attraction.

9. **Part 1- Streets and Parks Snow Operations Discussion**

Public Works Streets Section Director Sam Beckett, Parks, Recreation, Open Space, and Events Director Rebecca Sayers, and Recreation, Open Space, and Events Assistant Director Amy Hagin delivered a presentation to the Mayor, Vice Mayor, and Council regarding City Snow Operations for City streets. Mr. Beckett led the discussion on streets snow removal. The presentation covered the following topics:

- Presentation Objectives
- Streets Snowplow Fleet
- Streets Staffing: Mr. Beckett mentioned that throughout most of the snow season, Streets had 22 staff members instead of 32.
- Snow Shifts – Equipment & Staffing: Mr. Beckett stated that winter staffing averaged nine snowplows and three motor graders. He highlighted that overall staffing was a challenge.
- Snow Response Policy

- Streets – Snow Plowing Priorities: Mr. Beckett shared that the snow operations routes covered more area than recommended by a 2018 study. He also noted that snow operations are designed for right turns, aiming to keep snowplow drivers on route consistently.
- Parks Snow Equipment & Staffing: Ms. Hagin discussed Parks Snow Equipment and staffing, mentioning a 30 to 45 percent vacancy rate during winter.
- Parks Snow Shift Staffing
- Parks Responsibilities
- Streets Responsibilities
- Day Time Snow Deviations
- Post Event
- Financial Impacts
- Streets Strategic Vision and Goals

Councilmember McCarthy expressed the need for more resources for snow removal. He cited the 36-hour plowing window for snow events exceeding 12 inches as problematic and emphasized the significant issue of snow berms. He inquired about the possibility of the City acquiring a device to reduce ice berm buildup. Mr. Beckett explained that the City did not possess such a device and that research was ongoing. He mentioned CAT Empire as the sole vendor, with certain limitations regarding its use including communities that have an average of six inches or less and do not have a lot of moisture buildup in the snow. Mr. Beckett stated that the tool is not recommended in the community. Mr. Beckett stated that staff had reached out to other communities and cannot find any that have the same conditions as Flagstaff and use the tool. He added that it would take longer for staff to plow the streets and that the tool would not be recommended on storms over six inches. Councilmember McCarthy proposed that the tool could be tested, considering the effort residents invest in removing snow berms.

Mayor Daggett revealed her investigation into the tool mentioned by Councilmember McCarthy. She reported mixed outcomes from communities that tried them. She acknowledged the berm issue and questioned the Streets department's current vacancies. Mr. Beckett stated that they are staffed at 22 out of 32 positions and that they had more vacancies during the winter. She asked if the possession of a CDL is a roadblock in recruiting staff. Mr. Beckett clarified staffing levels and mentioned challenges related to Commercial Driver's Licenses (CDLs) and their competitive demand in the job market.

Mayor Daggett inquired if any new positions were added. Mr. Beckett stated that they were able to fund two street light technicians through the SLEDS (dark-sky LED installation) funding for four years and they are working on securing funding for those positions for the future because of the change in HURF funding. Mr. Beckett credited Public Works Supervisor Steven Hill with the changing of the lights.

Mayor Daggett also inquired about parking enforcement during the winter hours. Mr. Beckett stated that their partnership with the Police Department has been terrific, and they were able to really help in the downtown areas that year. He added that the daytime snow operations are the real challenge and many streets need to be skipped due to traffic on the roads during daytime operations. Mayor Daggett asked if staff is utilizing ParkFlag and Mr. Beckett explained that ParkFlag works in downtown and the Southside areas but they do not have any enforcement outside of those areas.

Councilmember Harris raised concerns about parking and enforcement, especially in regard to streets being blocked during an emergency situation. Mr. Beckett detailed coordination with first responders, dispatch communication, and towing processes for car removal and enforcement. Councilmember Harris asked if there is a contract with towing agencies to

remove parked cars. Mr. Beckett stated that there are hundreds of vehicles every snow incident and enforcement is through the Police Department which calls the towing company. He added that the Streets department can call the police to initiate the towing process.

Councilmember Harris asked what the City does with landlords when there is not enough parking at their property and if there is any penalty for having their tenants park illegally in the street. Mr. Beckett agreed to follow up on issues involving landlords and tenant parking violations.

Councilmember Sweet shared her experience from winter ride-alongs and mentioned the street sweeper status. Mr. Beckett confirmed that only one out of five sweepers was operational, with efforts to repair them ongoing. He anticipated the delivery of a demo street sweeper in June and the budgeting of a new one for the upcoming fiscal year.

10. Bicycle and Pedestrian (Multi-Modal) Snow Operations

Parks, Recreation, Open Space, and Events Assistant Director Amy Hagin delivered a presentation to the Mayor, Vice Mayor, and Council on the PROSE and Multi-Modal snow operations. The presentation included the following slides:

- Overview of presentation
- The Shift
- Future Growth with the Community

Councilmember McCarthy inquired about the plowing of gravel or aggregate paths. Ms. Hagin clarified that those paths are not plowed.

- Undefined expectations

Mayor Daggett highlighted the need to establish and clearly communicate defined expectations for snow removal to the public.

- Courtesy Berm Relocation Program: Ms. Hagin noted an increase in the program. She mentioned the necessity of resource allocation for the program in light of anticipated growth.

Councilmember McCarthy asked Ms. Hagin about the tool used to remove snow berms. Ms. Hagin explained that it is similar to a bobcat with attachable tools, capable of traveling around 22 MPH. While a blade is sometimes used, shovels are also employed. However, snow throwers are not suitable for the program, but they are used on the Flagstaff Urban Trail System (FUTS).

Mayor Daggett expressed admiration for the Geographic Information System (GIS) program employed in snow removal management. She proposed the idea of an app for residents to report problem areas. She also recommended strengthening a volunteer program and noted efforts by the Sustainability Division to enhance the Snow Angel program.

- FUTS – Multi-Modal Trails and Sidewalks

Councilmember McCarthy inquired about the level of usage the FUTS trails receive during the winter. Ms. Hagin replied that data from trail counters at a small number of trails indicated approximately 300 daily usages at Buffalo Park. Councilmember Sweet shared her experience of observing snowshoeing and cross-country skiing on the FUTS trails during a ride-along in Ponderosa Trails.

- Impacts and Resources
- Peer Review and Best Practices

Councilmember Sweet expressed keen interest in having real-time updates available for people using the trails for travel. Ms. Hagin mentioned that a portal was created to track the courtesy berm program effectively. She indicated staff's willingness to develop a program for real-time snow removal updates.

Councilmember Matthews concurred with Councilmember Sweet's perspective on recreational access to FUTS trails. She expressed a desire for a real-time map showing the locations of plow trucks. Mr. Beckett noted the introduction of technology in the Streets department and collaboration with Fleet for that purpose. He aimed to implement a live dashboard and confirmed ongoing efforts. Councilmember Matthews revealed her collaboration with Coconino Community College to establish a program for CDL licenses, potentially offering them for free based on financial need.

Vice Mayor Aslan questioned the idea of a public interface. He acknowledged its potential value but considered it somewhat ambitious. He recommended pilot testing first, as a full-scale implementation might lead to initial frustrations. He emphasized the importance of supporting the program if it is developed. He advised caution, believing the program might become more complex than initially anticipated.

Councilmember Matthews emphasized the necessity of prioritizing staff and equipment to meet snow removal requirements. Mayor Daggett inquired about the role of emergency management in snow operations. Public Works Director Scott Overton mentioned his involvement in the Incident Management Team, particularly for larger snow incidents, highlighting the connection between snow operations and emergency management.

- Next Steps

Public Comment:

Sam Meier addressed the Mayor and Council, expressing her desire to be able to navigate during the winter. She noted that the issue is related to equity and inclusion. She emphasized the significant number of berms, which increases the likelihood of accidents.

Adam Shimoni, representing the Flagstaff Biking Organization, highlighted that Flagstaff residents ride bicycles year-round. He stressed the importance of encouraging biking through separated bicycle lanes and maintaining existing bike lanes. He differentiated between biking as a necessity versus recreation on the FUTS trails.

Shawn Cheshire introduced herself and her reliance on her guide dog for mobility. She urged the Council to consider individuals like her when planning snow removal, as her independence relies on accessible pathways.

Mayor Daggett asked Ms. Cheshire about her top frustrations during winter. Ms. Cheshire mentioned frustrations related not only to snow but also to construction and obstacles hindering safe sidewalk navigation. She emphasized working with Jeff Bauman in Traffic

Engineering to find solutions. The lack of accessible sidewalks posed the most significant frustration, given her reliance on them.

Councilmember Harris acknowledged the excellence of staff while highlighting the need for equitable snow removal, even in neighborhoods where parked cars might pose challenges. She emphasized the importance of promptly removing parked cars and how the issue impacted neighborhoods like Bow and Arrow and Dupont Street.

Councilmember Matthews attributed some issues to parking reduction requirements and called for collaboration between Streets and Code Enforcement to address the problems. She proposed augmenting code enforcement and allocating more budget to snow removal.

Vice Mayor Aslan stressed the significance of getting snow removal right for non-vehicle transportation users. He emphasized the importance of not incentivizing parking. He expressed that the conversation is about the Big Shift and that people need to check expectations on having everything perfect immediately. He added that the City needs to ensure that people can travel without cars.

Councilmember McCarthy raised the issue of snow-impeded roads due to parked cars, suggesting towing a few cars to spread awareness. He also linked this issue to carbon neutrality efforts, encouraging walking, biking, and bus use.

Deputy City Attorney Kevin Fincel mentioned reviewing the traffic code with the Police Department and Senior Assistant City Attorney Marianne Sullivan to facilitate easier towing. Councilmember McCarthy suggested notifying car owners before towing.

Deputy Police Chief Scott Mansfield explained the current Police Department approach of issuing warnings before ticketing, mainly from midnight to 7:00 a.m. He highlighted the challenge of daytime snow operations occurring during legal parking hours. He mentioned public relations announcements and social media campaigns but noted limitations in enforcement, primarily downtown.

Councilmember Harris appreciated Deputy City Attorney Fincel's involvement and reiterated the equity aspect of snow removal.

Vice Mayor Aslan emphasized the equity issue's importance and the potential to induce demand for more parking if additional parking is provided. He underscored the need for enforcement and the availability of multi-modal options. Mayor Daggett praised staff's efforts and recognized the community-wide issue. She stressed the need for collaboration to clear sidewalks and prevent parked cars from hindering snow removal. She highlighted the broader perspective on infrastructure during snow removal.

Mayor Daggett called a 15-minute break at 6:36 p.m. The meeting resumed at 6:52 p.m.

11. Update and Discussion on Building and Property Care Ordinance and associated Code Amendments

Community Development Director Dan Folke addressed the Mayor, Vice Mayor, and Council to discuss direction on changes to the building and property care ordinance, along with associated code amendments. His presentation covered several recommendations from a work group responsible for reviewing property care standards, and the presentation included slides on:

- Outline
- Ordinance and Amendment Project Team
- Why consider property standards now?
- What is a Property Maintenance Ordinance?
- Considerations
- 2022 Survey Results – Issues
- Survey Results – Primary concerns
- Selected Approach
- Division 7-06 Building and Property Care Standards
- 7-06-001-004 Definitions

Councilmember McCarthy suggested that posting a "no trespassing" sign on the property should be optional rather than necessary, as the sign could be disregarded. However, he emphasized that securing the property should be mandatory.

- 7-06-001-0005 Property Care Standards

Mr. Folke discussed the current code's provision stating that abandoned buildings can be secured indefinitely. He raised the question of how long the property should remain secured before it must be repaired, inviting Council discussion.

- 7-06-001-0006 Exemptions
- Title 7 Health & Sanitation – Chapter 7-11 Littering

City Manager Clifton addressed exemptions, mentioning the potential suspension of enforcement for natural disasters at the City's discretion. He referred to a partially burned building on Fourth Street, inquiring about its status under proposed regulations. He asked for clarity on the process for dealing with such a building. Mr. Folke discussed the reasonable time frame for addressing specific circumstances, stating that securing a burned building would take more than 30 days, but leaving it alone for five years is excessive. He explained the exemption considerations, particularly for events like flooding and fires affecting a broader area. He also referred to the nuisances section of the code and its potential use for building removal.

Deputy City Attorney Kevin Fincel added that there is a separate code for abating dangerous buildings, which would be more appropriate in such cases.

Councilmember Harris sought clarification on the process for nuisance complaints. Mr. Folke explained that the Council or three citizens could initiate the process by raising the issue for agenda discussion.

Councilmember Matthews questioned if the proposed changes would affect NAU's property on Milton Road. Mr. Fincel clarified that the City's property code would not impact NAU's property since it is on state land.

- Next Steps

Councilmember House appreciated the focus on property maintenance and resources, suggesting it should be seen as a care standard rather than an ordinance. She recommended presenting the proposal to select commissions, such as the Housing

Commission.

Vice Mayor Aslan expressed readiness to adopt Mr. Folke's recommendations but inquired about the distinction between compliance and enforcement. He questioned the City's enforcement capabilities and the point of codification without effective enforcement. Mr. Folke discussed the compliance-oriented approach of Code Compliance Manager Reggie Eccleston, emphasizing cooperation with constituents and encouraging compliance before resorting to penalties. Vice Mayor Aslan proposed using Council's powers to enhance enforcement and encouraged the public to report problematic properties.

Councilmember Harris addressed the time frame for compliance and suggested setting up a system to help property owners access resources. Mr. Folke mentioned the availability of groups that can offer assistance and resources, especially in cases of hoarding.

Councilmember McCarthy supported Mr. Eccleston's approach but highlighted the need to move towards enforcement when necessary. He cited specific instances where enforcement is needed, while cautioning against excessive enforcement for minor issues. Deputy City Attorney Kevin Fincel relayed Mr. Eccleston's success with his approach, noting it works around 99% of the time. He recommended letting Mr. Folke's process conclude before legal tweaks to the language. He explained that the nuisance property ordinance dates back to 1936, accounting for some outdated language.

Mayor Daggett suggested involving the Commission on Inclusion and Adaptive Living in the presentation.

Mr. Folke clarified that encouraging change through public engagement aligns with Community Development's approach, beyond just Mr. Eccleston's actions.

12. Public Participation

None.

13. Informational Items To/From Mayor, Council, and City Manager; future agenda item requests

Councilmember Matthews expressed her enthusiasm for attending the Southside Community Association's Juneteenth event and Police Appreciation Day. She mentioned her meetings with Sustainability and APS and highlighted an article she received about forest health and carbon emissions mitigation.

Councilmember Harris provided a brief history lesson on Juneteenth and noted that the celebration has been ongoing for about 60 years. She thanked PROSE for assisting the association in obtaining permits for the streets near South Beaver School. She invited the public to join the Juneteenth event at South Beaver School on Saturday, June 17, 2023, from 10 a.m. to 4 p.m.

Vice Mayor Aslan reported that he was in Albuquerque representing the City of Flagstaff at the American Astronomical Society Conference focusing on Dark Skies.

Councilmember McCarthy asked Housing staff to follow up on the Section 8 public comment made earlier during the meeting.

Councilmember Sweet shared her recent visit to Red Gap Ranch with Water Services Manager Erin Young for a tour. She mentioned the Flagstaff Police Department's

appreciation day at the police station scheduled for June 14, 2023, from 8 a.m. to 10 a.m., during which she plans to make cinnamon apple rolls.

Councilmember House proposed a FAIR item, suggesting the designation of Juneteenth as an official holiday for the City of Flagstaff. She explained that both the Commission on Diversity Awareness and the Indigenous Commission have recommended the holiday.

Mayor Daggett informed the Council about upcoming events: a Downtown Mile public meeting on June 14, 2023, at 5:30 p.m., the Pollinator Fest on Sunday, June 18, 2023, from 10 a.m. to 2 p.m. at the Arboretum, and her participation in a podcast on Systems Change Grant with the Coconino Coalition for Children & Youth. She also mentioned her visit to Fire Station 3 and a meeting with Arizona Treasurer Kimberly Yee as well as discussions with The Guidance Center staff about the services they offer.

14. Adjournment

The Work Session of the Flagstaff City Council held June 13, 2023, adjourned at 7:51 p.m.

MAYOR

ATTEST:

CITY CLERK