

MINUTES

1. CALL TO ORDER

Vice Mayor Aslan called the meeting of the Flagstaff City Council held October 17, 2023, to order at 3:06 p.m.

NOTICE OF OPTION TO RECESS INTO EXECUTIVE SESSION

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the City Council and to the general public that, at this regular meeting, the City Council may vote to go into executive session, which will not be open to the public, for discussion and consultation with the City's attorneys for legal advice on any item listed on the following agenda, pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(3).

2. ROLL CALL

NOTE: One or more Councilmembers may be in attendance through other technological means.

PRESENT:

ABSENT:

MAYOR DAGGETT (arrived at 3:48 p.m.)
VICE MAYOR ASLAN (virtually)
COUNCILMEMBER HARRIS (arrived at 3:35 p.m.)
COUNCILMEMBER HOUSE
COUNCILMEMBER MATTHEWS (virtually)
COUNCILMEMBER MCCARTHY (virtually)
COUNCILMEMBER SWEET

Others present: City Manager Greg Clifton; City Attorney Sterling Solomon.

3. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE, MISSION STATEMENT, AND LAND ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The Council and audience recited the pledge of allegiance, Councilmember House read the Mission Statement of the City of Flagstaff, and Councilmember Matthews read the Land Acknowledgement.

MISSION STATEMENT

The mission of the City of Flagstaff is to protect and enhance the quality of life for all.

LAND ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The Flagstaff City Council humbly acknowledges the ancestral homelands of this area's Indigenous nations and original stewards. These lands, still inhabited by Native descendants, border mountains sacred to Indigenous peoples. We honor them, their legacies, their traditions, and their continued contributions. We celebrate their past, present, and future generations who will forever know this place as home.

4. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

Public Participation enables the public to address the Council about an item that is not on the agenda. Comments relating to items that are on the agenda will be taken at the time that the item is discussed. If you wish to address the Council at tonight's meeting, please complete a comment card and submit it to the recording clerk as soon as possible. Your name will be called when it is your turn to speak. You may address the Council up to three times throughout the meeting, including comments made during Public Participation. Please limit your remarks to three minutes per item to allow everyone an opportunity to speak. At the discretion of the Chair, ten or more persons present at the meeting and wishing to speak may appoint a representative who may have no more than fifteen minutes to speak.

Regina Salas, Vice President of Flagstaff Sister Cities, addressed Council and invited them to attend the Sister Cities Annual Conference. She also requested that the Council underwrite the event to cover overhead costs.

Jonathan Diouisio addressed Council about non-profit organizations and their lack of planning to solve problems.

5. COUNCIL LIAISON REPORTS

Councilmember House thanked Mayor Daggett for the recent signing of the recommitment to the city's sister city, Navajoa. She expressed support for contributing to the Sister Cities Annual Conference. She also noted that she, along with Mayor Daggett, would be attending the conference.

6. APPOINTMENTS

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the City Council and to the general public that the City Council may vote to go into executive session, which will not be open to the public, for the purpose of discussing or considering employment, assignment, appointment, promotion, demotion, dismissal, salaries, disciplining or resignation of a public officer, appointee, or employee of any public body....., pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(1).

A. Consideration of Appointments: Library Board

One appointment was postponed to the November 7, 2023 Council meeting.

Moved by Councilmember Khara House, **seconded by** Councilmember Jim McCarthy to appoint Lisa Ganey to a term expiring November 2026.

Vote: 5 - 0 - Unanimously

B. Consideration of Appointments: Parks and Recreation Commission.

Moved by Councilmember Khara House, **seconded by** Councilmember Lori Matthews to appoint Sandy Heath to a term expiring August 2024.

Vote: 5 - 0 - Unanimously

C. Consideration of Appointments: Housing Commission

Moved by Councilmember Lori Matthews, **seconded by** Councilmember Jim McCarthy to appoint Kevin Dobbe to a term expiring September 2026.

Vote: 5 - 0 - Unanimously

7. LIQUOR LICENSE PUBLIC HEARINGS

Applications under Liquor License Public Hearings may be considered under one public hearing and may be acted upon by one motion unless otherwise requested by Council.

Vice Mayor Aslan opened the public hearing on both items.

Lieutenant Kevin Sapp introduced the two applications and noted no concerns.

Applicant Steven Dunsire addressed Council and explained that there was a private transfer of ownership which facilitated the need for the new liquor license.

There being no public comment, Vice Mayor Aslan closed the public hearing.

Moved by Councilmember Khara House, **seconded by** Councilmember Miranda Sweet to forward the applications to the State with a recommendation for approval.

Vote: 5 - 0 - Unanimously

- A. **Consideration and Action on Liquor License Application:** Steven David Dunsire, "Oregano's Pizza Bistro," 980 Country Club Drive, Series 12 (restaurant), New License.
- B. **Consideration and Action on Liquor License Application:** Steven David Dunsire, "Oregano's Pizza Bistro," 1061 S. Plaza Way, Suite C, Series 12 (restaurant), New License.

8. CONSENT AGENDA

All matters under Consent Agenda are considered by the City Council to be routine. Unless a member of City Council expresses a desire at the meeting to remove an item from the Consent Agenda for discussion, the Consent Agenda will be enacted by one motion approving the recommendations listed on the agenda. Unless otherwise indicated, expenditures approved by Council are budgeted items.

Vice Mayor Aslan requested Item 8G be pulled for discussion.

Councilmember Matthews requested Items 8C and 8F be pulled for discussion.

Moved by Councilmember Khara House, **seconded by** Councilmember Miranda Sweet to approve the Consent Agenda as posted with the exception of 8C, 8F, and 8G.

Vote: 5 - 0 - Unanimously

- A. **Consideration and Ratification of Grant Agreement:** Ratify Grant Agreement between the City of Flagstaff and the U.S. Department of Transportation, Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) for the construction of a Snow Removal Equipment Building (SREB).

Ratify the Grant Agreement with the Federal Aviation Administration for the Airport Snow Removal Equipment Building for grant funds in the amount of \$4,426,783.

- B. **Consideration and Ratification of Contract:** Approve and Ratify the Design Phase Services Contract with PCL Construction, Inc. in the amount of \$499,522, for the design of the Rio De Flag Water Reclamation Facility Solids Improvements Project.

1. Approve and ratify the Design Phase Services Contract with PCL Construction, Inc. in the amount of \$499,522, for the design of the Rio De Flag Water Reclamation Facility Solids Improvements Project; and
2. Approve a contract allowance of \$74,933, which is 15% of the contract amount; and
3. Authorize the City Manager to execute the necessary documents.

- C. **Consideration and Approval of Contract:** Cooperative Purchase Contract with Courtesy Chevrolet for the purchase of five (5) fully electric 2024 Chevrolet 1500 Silverado Crew Cab pickup trucks in the amount of \$428,098.17.

Councilmember Matthews stated that the plan was for the city to replace its fleet with electric vehicles as they age out. She noted the significant price difference between the electric Chevrolet vehicles and the gas-powered Chevrolet vehicles. She noted concern with the price difference and the significant lag time associated with electric vehicles and the inability to replace necessary vehicles.

Mr. Clifton stated that the city had a Fleet Policy that set forth procedures to follow in the case of unavailability or high cost. The policy moved through the priority list from electric vehicles to hybrid, to regular gas vehicles until they could arrive at a solution.

Solid Waste Director Evan Tyrell stated that they evaluated the overall cost savings associated with the use of electric vehicles even at the higher price point. An average electric vehicle would realize approximately \$5,000 in fuel savings each year. There was not a lot of long-term maintenance information available yet but preliminary data showed that the maintenance costs were typically about half.

Councilmember Matthews asked about the payload capacity of the trucks. Fleet Manager Nate Naliborski stated that the vehicles were not intended for heavier payload capacities. The trucks were expected to be in-town vehicles with a need for moderate payloads. They were not intended for heavy use.

Moved by Councilmember Lori Matthews, **seconded by** Vice Mayor Austin Aslan to approve the Cooperative Purchase Contract with Courtesy Chevrolet for the purchase of five (5) fully electric 2024 Chevrolet 1500 Silverado Crew Cab pickup trucks in the amount of \$428,098.17 and authorize the City Manager to execute the necessary documents.

Vote: 5 - 0 - Unanimously

- D. **Consideration and Approval of Contract:** Non-Federal Preliminary Design Reimbursable Agreement Between the US Department of Transportation Federal Aviation Administration and City of Flagstaff, Flagstaff Pulliam Airport

1. Approve the Reimbursable Agreement with the Federal Aviation Administration for the evaluation of possible impacts to FAA equipment (Automated Surface Observation Station and Surface Weather System) by the construction of the Airport Snow Removal Equipment Building in the amount of \$67,152.45; and
2. Authorize the City Manager to execute the necessary documents.

- E. ~~**Consideration and Approval of Contract:** Cooperative Purchase Contract with PFVT Motors, Inc. (DBA Peoria Ford) for the purchase of two Ford Mustang Mach-E Electric Vehicles in the amount of \$106,412.58.~~

1. ~~Approve the Cooperative Purchase Contract with PFVT Motors, Inc. (DBA Peoria Ford) for two Ford Mustang Mach-E Electric Vehicles in the amount of \$106,192.58; and~~
2. ~~Authorize the City Manager to execute the necessary documents.~~

ITEM PULLED FROM AGENDA

- F. **Consideration and Ratification of Contract:** Cooperative Purchase Contract with Don Sanderson Ford, Inc. in the amount of \$80,137.68 for a Ford F-150 Lightning EV Truck.

Councilmember Matthews asked about the payload capacity and if the vehicle was anticipated to do significant hauling or towing. Assistant Parks, Recreation, Open Space, and Events Director Amy Hagin explained that the vehicle was intended for use by the Park Ranger position who would not be towing. There would be times that they may have to haul materials like trash cans or green waste but

nothing significant. The vehicles was ideal for their use because they typically drive 70- 80 miles per day.

Moved by Councilmember Lori Matthews, **seconded by** Councilmember Miranda Sweet to approve and ratify the Cooperative Purchase Contract with Don Sanderson Ford, Inc. in the amount of \$80,137.68 for a Ford F-150 Lightning EV Truck; and authorize the City Manager to execute the necessary documents.

Vote: 5 - 0 - Unanimously

- G. Consideration and Approval of Contract:** Cooperative Purchase Contract with Pride Outfitters, LLC to upfit/outfit emergency equipment on four patrol vehicles in an amount not to exceed \$88,000.

Kelly Cullen, with Niles Radio, addressed Council and spoke in opposition of the contract. He expressed concern regarding discrepancies in the bidding process. He noted that although they were listed as the highest bidder, he believed it was because they were not bidding on the same line items as the other contractor. He felt that comparison between bids was not fair due to the differing line items. He noted the additional costs that would be associated with transporting the vehicles to and from the valley for installation as well as it not subscribing to the city's climate action plan goals. He also stated that there should be considerations locally due to Flagstaff's higher minimum wage and sales tax rates. He requested that the decision be postponed until revised equipment lists and specifications were provided to all bidders, the cost of shuffling vehicles was factored into the purchase, and the higher local wages and sales tax rates were considered in the evaluation process.

Purchasing Manager Patrick Brown addressed Council and stated that Niles Radio did not submit detailed line items as part of their proposal; the other submitters did submit those details. The difference in pricing was about \$13,000. The bid request represented the elements that the Police Department was seeking and when the quotes were received, they determined that the selected vendor met all the criteria they were seeking.

Council raised concern about the challenges local vendors faced with a higher minimum wage in Flagstaff.

Vice Mayor Aslan asked what the impact of postponing the action would be. Police Special Services Supervisor Kristen Decker offered that they hoped to get approval to move forward because the current fleet was down by nine vehicles. They were able to procure those vehicles recently and now they needed to be up-fitted with lights, sirens, and other necessary emergency equipment. They were already in a critical position with not having enough patrol vehicles on the road, so they needed to get the new ones up and running as quickly as possible. It took about ten weeks to equip the vehicles depending on the availability of the vendor's schedule.

Councilmember Harris asked what the options would be if the action was put on hold. Ms. Decker stated that there were no other options to put more vehicles on the road, and they did not have adequate reserves should a vehicle go down.

Councilmember Matthews stated that she understood the urgency but she felt strongly that the decision should be based on equity of the bidding process and she did not know if minimum wage came into play with the pricing from the local bidder.

Moved by Councilmember Lori Matthews to postpone the item until the next meeting to obtain information on the impact of minimum wage.

Motion failed for lack of a second.

Moved by Councilmember Khara House, **seconded by** Councilmember Miranda Sweet to approve the Cooperative Purchase Contract with Pride Outfitters, LLC for the upfit/outfit emergency equipment on four patrol vehicles in an amount not to exceed \$88,000; and authorize the City Manager to execute the necessary documents.

Councilmember House noted that she understood and appreciated the comments and challenges

associated with the contract. She wanted to move forward with the contract with the understanding that a future discussion would follow at a later time.

Vote: 6 - 0 - Unanimously

9. ROUTINE ITEMS

A. Consideration and Approval of Municipal Services Accounts, Miscellaneous Account Receivable, Transaction Privilege Tax, Insufficient Funds and Library Write-offs: Delinquency and Uncollectible Accounts for Fiscal Year 2022-23.

Management Services Director Rick Tadder addressed Council and stated that the matter before them was part of the annual process to write off uncollectible accounts. New that year was the inclusion of several library accounts that had been deemed uncollectible. For municipal accounts receivable, old sales tax accounts, and insufficient fund checks, the total request to writeoff was \$76,462.86 which was a reduction of about \$25,000 from the prior year.

Mr. Tadder expressed gratitude to his team for their hard work to collect what they were able to and working with customers to find creative solutions to continue service.

Mr. Tadder explained that the request included write-offs for library accounts for about \$1.1 million. It was the first time library accounts had been included in the write-off requests, which was why the amount was so high. The date range covered 1987 through 2016. The accounts had been nonactive for seven years and there was no direct fiscal impact due to the age of the accounts. In the future, library accounts would be included in the annual write-off process.

Moved by Vice Mayor Austin Aslan, **seconded by** Councilmember Miranda Sweet to approve the write-off of delinquent and uncollectible Municipal Services accounts, Miscellaneous Account Receivables, Transaction Privilege Tax accounts and Insufficient Funds in the combined amount of \$76,462.86 and Library account balances in the amount of \$1,158,567.03.

Vote: 7 - 0 - Unanimously

10. REGULAR AGENDA

A. Consideration and Approval of Amendment to Contract No. 2019-03: Amend Contract 2019-03 between the City of Flagstaff and Housing Solutions of Northern Arizona for the City of Flagstaff Community and Employer Assisted Housing Programs to accommodate recommended changes to the program guidelines and provide an additional one-year term.

Housing and Grants Administrator Kristine Pavlik provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

COMMUNITY HOMEBUYER ASSISTANCE AND EMPLOYER ASSISTED HOUSING PROGRAMS TODAY
 HOUSING SOLUTIONS OF NORTHERN ARIZONA
 EMPLOYER ASSISTED HOUSING (EAH)
 HISTORY OF EAH
 CURRENT PROGRAM GUIDELINES
 COMMUNITY HOMEBUYER ASSISTANCE (CHAP)
 HISTORY OF CHAP
 CURRENT PROGRAM GUIDELINES
 CHANGING MARKET
 HOME AVAILABILITY AND PRICING
 PROPOSED CHANGES TO EAH
 PROPOSED CHANGES TO CHAP

Devonna McLaughlin, CEO of Housing Solutions of Northern Arizona, stated that the program was designed to help first-time home buyers in the community get access to homeownership. Many took advantage of the program, and many have expressed that if it was not for the program, they would have left Flagstaff. It had been a tremendous program with a proven record of success, and they

were excited that an enhancement was being considered.

Councilmember House thanked the team for their work. She indicated that the program was an important investment in the community. The need in the community had changed, and the program needed to meet that need.

Moved by Councilmember Khara House, **seconded by** Councilmember Miranda Sweet to approve the recommended Amendment 2 for the City of Flagstaff Employer Assisted Housing (EAH) and Community Homebuyer Assistance Program (CHAP).

Vote: 7 - 0 - Unanimously

B. Consideration and Adoption of Ordinance No. 2023-24: An ordinance amending hours of use for City Parks and the hours for lighting of sport courts within City Parks.

Ms. Hagin addressed Council and stated that the ordinance stemmed from the conversation with Council in September 2023. At that time, the Council decided that the sport court lighting at Bushmaster Park and Thorpe Park would end at 9:00 p.m. and that all other parks would close at 10:00 p.m. every day of the week. The ordinance was written to reflect the hours of sunrise to 9:00 p.m. for the lighted sports courts, and sunrise to 10:00 p.m. for general park hours.

Audria Smith addressed Council with concerns about the continued noise of pickleball. She believed that an extra hour was not sufficient. She was concerned about increased noise when the new 16 courts were in use. She also indicated that there was confusion about the meaning of sunrise when the noise rules indicated no loud play until 8:00 a.m.

Mayor Daggett indicated that the current lighting was from the late 90's. She asked if the lighting was dark sky compliant. Ms. Hagin stated that the lights had shields and that they were pointed downward to meet dark sky compliance. The new courts would be more dark sky compliant with the upgraded lighting system.

Mayor Daggett asked if there were concerns about enforcement challenges with different hours at different parks. Ms. Hagin indicated no, there were only two parks that were lit and those would be the only two with different hours; the other 24 parts would close at 10:00 p.m.

Councilmember McCarthy stated that people who lived in the area would continue to be unable to use their backyards because of the noise. He felt that it was disrespectful and suggested that no pickleball courts be lit.

Councilmember Sweet asked if there was a plan to replace trees at Bushmaster Park. Ms. Hagin stated that staff were in contract negotiations that would include a one-for-one exchange in trees.

Councilmember Matthews asked about plans to do any sound abatement. Ms. Hagin stated that it would be included in a future discussion about the design of the courts.

Moved by Councilmember Khara House, **seconded by** Vice Mayor Austin Aslan to read Ordinance No. 2023-24 by title only for the first time.

Moved by Councilmember Jim McCarthy, **seconded by** Vice Mayor Austin Aslan to amend the motion to add that pickleball courts do not have lighting but the lighting remains as proposed for all other courts.

Deputy City Attorney Kevin Fincel explained that the ordinance was about lighting in general and discussions or direction regarding the design and lighting of pickleball courts specifically should occur separately. The ordinance pertained specifically to sport court lighting and the hours of operation for that lighting.

Motion to amend withdrawn by Councilmember McCarthy and supported by Vice Mayor Aslan.

Moved by Councilmember Jim McCarthy to amend the motion to add that parks would open at sunrise or 8:00 a.m. whichever was later.

Motion failed for lack of a second.

ORIGINAL MOTION:

Vote: 7 - 0 - Unanimously

AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF FLAGSTAFF, AMENDING CITY CODE TITLE 8, PUBLIC WAYS AND PROPERTY, CHAPTER 11, POLICIES REGARDING USE OF MUNICIPAL PARKS, SECTION 8-11-001-0005, USE BY THE GENERAL PUBLIC/HOURS OF USE; PROVIDING FOR REPEAL OF CONFLICTING ORDINANCES, SEVERABILITY, AUTHORITY FOR CLERICAL CORRECTIONS, AND ESTABLISHING AN EFFECTIVE DATE

- C. **Consideration and Adoption of Ordinance No. 2023-23:** An ordinance of the Flagstaff City Council authorizing the acquisition of real property interests for a fiber network as a betterment to the Rio de Flag Flood Control Project; providing for delegation of authority, repeal of conflicting ordinances, severability, clerical corrections, and establishing an effective date.

Real Estate Manager Bryce Doty provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

RIO DE FLAG FIBER EASEMENT AUTHORITY TO ACQUIRE
VICINITY MAP
UPPER REACH -- COMPOSITE CHANNEL
CLAY AVENUE WASH PLAN MAPS

Vice Mayor Aslan asked if the action was consistent with the desire for a dig-once policy. Mr. Doty replied that it was included as part of the overall construction project.

Moved by Councilmember Khara House, **seconded by** Councilmember Jim McCarthy to read Ordinance No. 2023-23 by title only for the first time.

Vote: 7 - 0 - Unanimously

AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF FLAGSTAFF, AUTHORIZING THE ACQUISITION OF REAL PROPERTY INTERESTS FOR A FIBER NETWORK AS A BETTERMENT TO THE RIO DE FLAG FLOOD CONTROL PROJECT; PROVIDING FOR DELEGATION OF AUTHORITY, REPEAL OF CONFLICTING ORDINANCES, SEVERABILITY, CLERICAL CORRECTIONS, AND ESTABLISHING AN EFFECTIVE DATE

A break was held from 4:56 p.m. through 5:14 p.m.

11. **DISCUSSION ITEMS**

- A. **Update on the Downtown Vision and Action Plan:** The Vision & Action Plan will identify priorities and initiatives to guide improvements in Downtown Flagstaff over the next five to ten years.

Planning Director Michelle McNulty introduced the consultant team Bret Seigel and Jamie Bostik with PUMA, along with Terry Madeksza, Executive Director for the Flagstaff Downtown Business Alliance (DBA), who provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

FLAGSTAFF DOWNTOWN VISION AND ACTION PLAN
WHERE WE ARE
KEY POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS
COMMUNITY OUTREACH
MARKET OPPORTUNITIES
VISION
ACTION PLAN

CATALYTIC REDEVELOPMENT AND PARKING PROJECTS

- A -- OLD CITY COURTHOUSE
- B -- COCONINO COUNTY PROPERTIES
- C -- BIRCH AVENUE INFILL
- D -- EASTSIDE GATEWAY
- E -- COTTAGE AVENUE INFILL

CATALYTIC PLACEMAKING PROJECTS

- A -- DOWNTOWN CONNECTION CENTER
- E -- STREETSCAPES, GATEWAYS, CONNECTIVITY, & WAYFINDING
- B -- LEROUX FESTIVAL STREET
- C -- HERITAGE SQUARE ACTIVATION
- D -- ALLEY ACTIVATION

MAJOR EDITS TO PLAN FROM 2021

MAJOR EDITS TO PLAN FROM 2023

NEXT STEPS

Councilmember House asked how they would move from the vision to the action. Mr. Seigel explained that there were three different bundles of strategic actions, and it was envisioned that the city and the DBA would shepherd those bundles. Implementation would depend on the relationship with the downtown and public/private partnerships. The intent was for the DBA to be a more active partner with the city in the development of public/private partnerships.

Ms. Madeksza stated that PUMA came in and created the plan and implementation strategy. The plan was vetted by city staff and there had been active participation from many divisions within the city to review, weigh in, and provide feedback. They had also sought feedback from city commissions and community partners such as Creative Flagstaff and Friends of Flagstaff's Future.

Jonathan Stone, Executive Director of Creative Flagstaff, addressed Council in support of the plan and process. He noted that there were a number of opportunities to highlight the arts and he looked forward to being an active participant in the implementation.

Council expressed support and excitement about the plan. They noted that the plan included tangible things that could be implemented and that highlighted the importance of a livable, walkable, and mixed-use downtown.

B. Discussion of the Wildland Fire Mitigation and Management Commission Report

Forest Health Supervisor Neil Chapman provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

- WILDLAND FIRE MANAGEMENT
- WILDLAND FIRE MITIGATION AND MANAGEMENT COMMISSION
- DEFINING THE CRISIS
- THE CHANGING FACE OF WILDFIRE
- DEFINING THE CRISIS
- COMMISSION BACKGROUND
- THE COMMISSION (IN BRIEF)
- THE COMMISSION
- WORKGROUP TOPICS
- COMMISSION PROCESS
- REPORT ORGANIZATION
- SUMMARY
- THEMES AND RECOMMENDATIONS
- COMMISSION THEMES
- SELECTED RECOMMENDATIONS
- THEME: SUPPORTING COLLABORATION
- THEME: REACTIVE TO PROACTIVE
- THEME: INVESTING IN RESILIENCE
- THEME: ENABLING BENEFICIAL FIRE SELECTED RECOMMENDATIONS
- THEME: WORKFORCE

SELECTED RECOMMENDATIONS
KEY TAKEAWAYS
NEXT STEPS
AUDIENCE: COMMITTEES OF CONGRESS

Vice Mayor Aslan asked about the relationship between beneficial and catastrophic as it related to carbon output. Mr. Chapman stated that fire was central to the crisis and central to the solution, and it was something that the community needed to determine. Fire was local and everyone had a different impact. Mitigating carbon losses and keeping the carbon stored in big fire-resistant trees was the best thing that could be done for the forest. Even though fire was introduced into the landscape, it was necessary to maintain a healthy, fire-adapted ponderosa pine forest that kept carbon in the trees.

Councilmember Matthews expressed gratitude for the inclusion of tribal cultural burning. She noted that it was critical to focus on fire management and mitigation. California had put so much effort into reducing its carbon emissions, but they were set back years when their forests burned. Flagstaff was at the forefront of how to manage forests and keep carbon emissions at bay.

Fire Chief Mark Gaillard expressed gratitude to Mr. Chapman for his participation on such a historic committee. Mr. Chapman had represented Flagstaff exceptionally well and it was exciting to be a part of history in the making.

Mayor Daggett asked how many Flagstaff Firefighters were trained for wildland fire. Mr. Chapman stated that every single firefighter in the Greater Flagstaff Region went through a Type 2 Wildland Firefighter course.

Laura Kessler addressed Council and stated that fire management was very important to the community. She expressed a need to accelerate forest thinning and make the recommendations of the report a priority for the city.

Mayor Daggett noted that the city had prioritized forest health and asked what additional support would look like. Chief Gaillard stated that it was a very federal process, so the continuation of lobbying efforts and support of the recommendations from the report were critical. There continued to be funding dedicated to Flagstaff and its efforts. The biggest challenge was how to get the private sector to implement thinning projects more effectively.

12. FUTURE AGENDA ITEM REQUESTS

After discussion and upon agreement by three members of the Council, an item will be moved to a regularly-scheduled Council meeting.

A. Future Agenda Item Request (F.A.I.R.): A Citizens' Petition titled Add New Priorities to the Carbon Neutrality Plan

Tom Pearson with Flagstaff First introduced the petition. He stated that over the last decade, Flagstaff had experienced five destructive fires and subsequent flooding. It was essential for safety and security that solutions be identified and prioritized. The addition of wildfire, flooding, and drought to the Carbon Neutrality Plan would make them a top priority.

Councilmember House asked in what ways wildfire, flooding, and drought were addressed in the Carbon Neutrality Plan.

Climate Section Director Jenny Niemann stated that healthy forests and open spaces were target areas within the Carbon Neutrality Plan. Forests and open spaces were a specific focus within the 2018 Climate Action and Adaptation Plan and in 2022, they were combined to focus on a comprehensive approach to address carbon neutrality and resilience. Healthy forests and open spaces became one of the 15 target areas within the revised Carbon Neutrality Plan, alongside considerations such as economic vitality, recreation, water security, and community resilience.

Councilmember Matthews stated that the petition requested the elevated focus of those areas to be a top priority. She asked what that would change in terms of focus and effort toward the city's goals. Ms. Niemann stated that the Carbon Neutrality Plan was large and covered a lot of things. It had three main goals: reducing emissions, community resilience, and building community equity. Within the goals, there were four main organizing actions: neighborhoods, energy sources, consumption, and commitment to the community.

Councilmember Harris asked if there had been conversations with staff on the request. Mr. Pearson stated that they had met with staff, and it was his impression that they were supportive of the points they made and did not object to the addition of wildfire, flooding, and drought to the priorities for budgeting purposes and raising awareness.

Vice Mayor Aslan stated that he was not supportive of advancing the petition to a future meeting. Flagstaff had led nationally in forest health and management for many years. He did not believe that the elements of wildfire, flooding, or drought were missing from the priorities of the city. He felt that the addition of the requested elements to the Carbon Neutrality Plan was redundant because Flagstaff was already prioritizing those efforts.

Councilmember McCarthy stated that Flagstaff was already doing what was requested. He would support moving the matter forward for a discussion about how they might be able to integrate the specific elements into the Carbon Neutrality Plan.

Councilmember House expressed concern about the representation of how the priorities were currently focused in the plan. She felt that the requested additions were already present in the plan.

Mayor Daggett asked about the timeline to keep the Carbon Neutrality Plan fresh and addressing current realities. Ms. Niemann explained that the Carbon Neutrality Plan was envisioned as an evolving plan. The plan was not designed to lay out yearly plans. It was designed to identify broad plans that included flexibility to adapt to changes in the field.

Mayor Daggett asked the process to change the language to more explicitly state wildfire, flooding, and drought as priorities. Ms. Niemann explained that there were three goals within the plan but there were no priority ranking within them. They would have to revise the plan to create priorities.

Laura Kessler addressed Council in support of the petition. She stated that to dismiss something so important was an insult to flood-impacted victims. She requested that the priorities be considered as part of the goals that received so much funding and suggested that they could be added as a fourth goal. She felt that it was short-sighted to not prioritize immediate safety.

Councilmember Harris stated that Sustainability was agreeable to some extent with what was being requested. She asked Ms. Niemann to clarify that. Ms. Niemann stated that it was a policy decision of the Council. The staff were not weighing in on whether it should be added or not. It would be up to Council to decide on whether to include the elements in the plan.

Councilmember Matthews left the meeting at 7:15 p.m.

Councilmember Harris indicated that there were still conversations to be had because Flagstaff First did not see their needs being met with the current plan. She supported a broader conversation and requested that the Wildland Fire group be involved.

Councilmember Sweet stated that she supported further conversation on the matter.

There was requisite Council support to advance the item to a future agenda for discussion.

13. **PUBLIC PARTICIPATION**

None

14. INFORMATIONAL ITEMS TO/FROM MAYOR, COUNCIL, AND STAFF, AND FUTURE AGENDA ITEM REQUESTS

Councilmember Sweet reported that she would be traveling to Tempe to do her first Ironman. She thanked everyone who had supported her during her training.

Mayor Daggett stated that she and Councilmember Harris attended a great Arizona town hall on equity. She also visited the Police Department Dispatch Center for a tour and to discuss their operations. She also noted that Vice President Harris had come into Flagstaff that morning, and she expressed thanks to those who took part in the project to extend the runway at the airport because it allowed Airforce 2 to land in Flagstaff.

15. ADJOURNMENT

The Regular Meeting of the Flagstaff City Council held October 17, 2023, adjourned at 7:30 p.m.

MAYOR

ATTEST:

CITY CLERK

CERTIFICATION

I, STACY SALTZBURG, do hereby certify that I am the City Clerk of the City of Flagstaff, County of Coconino, State of Arizona, and that the above Minutes are a true and correct summary of the Meeting of the Council of the City of Flagstaff held on October 17, 2023. I further certify that the Meeting was duly called and held and that a quorum was present.

DATED this 19th day of March, 2024

CITY CLERK