

MINUTES

1. Call to Order

Mayor Evans called the Work Session of the Flagstaff City Council held January 28, 2020, to order at 6:02 p.m.

2. Pledge of Allegiance and Mission Statement

The Council and audience recited the pledge of allegiance and Councilmember Whelan read the Mission Statement of the City of Flagstaff.

MISSION STATEMENT

The mission of the City of Flagstaff is to protect and enhance the quality of life for all.

3. ROLL CALL

NOTE: One or more Councilmembers may be in attendance through other technological means.

PRESENT:

MAYOR EVANS
VICE MAYOR SHIMONI
COUNCILMEMBER ASLAN
COUNCILMEMBER MCCARTHY
COUNCILMEMBER ODEGAARD
COUNCILMEMBER SALAS
COUNCILMEMBER WHELAN

ABSENT:

Others present: City Manager Greg Clifton; City Attorney Sterling Solomon.

4. Public Participation

Public Participation enables the public to address the council about items that are not on the prepared agenda. Public Participation appears on the agenda twice, at the beginning and at the end of the work session. You may speak at one or the other, but not both. Anyone wishing to comment at the meeting is asked to fill out a speaker card and submit it to the recording clerk. When the item comes up on the agenda, your name will be called. You may address the Council up to three times throughout the meeting, including comments made during Public Participation. Please limit your remarks to three minutes per item to allow everyone to have an opportunity to speak. At the discretion of the Chair, ten or more persons present at the meeting and wishing to speak may appoint a representative who may have no more than fifteen minutes to speak.

None.

5. Review of Draft Agenda for the February 4, 2020 City Council Meeting

Citizens wishing to speak on agenda items not specifically called out by the City Council may submit a speaker card for their items of interest to the recording clerk.

None.

6. Martin Luther King Day Proclamation

The Ladies of Truth from NAU, NAU's Office of Inclusive, and the City's Diversity Awareness Commission joined Mayor Evans and the Council at the dais. Mayor Evans read the proclamation and Dr. Bernadine Lewis spoke about Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr. and his impact.

7. Restructuring of Administration Office to include Sustainability Section

City Manager Greg Clifton addressed the potential restructuring and discussed the history of the change. He stated that staff was looking for direction on the topic. He discussed the three scenarios described in the staff report.

Councilmember Whelan asked for the organizational chart to be displayed and Mr. Clifton reviewed the chart with Mayor and Council.

Dara Marks Marino addressed Council and thanked Mr. Clifton for his leadership in advancing the conversation. She stated that she supported moving the Sustainability section into the City Manager's Office.

Joseph Shannon addressed Council on behalf of the Sierra Club. He spoke about the Climate Emergency protest on the lawn of City Hall, and he stated that they were in support of a Sustainability Division.

Councilmember McCarthy reviewed the options. He stated that doing nothing was not an option and that moving the Sustainability Section to one under the City Manager was the way to go. He added that the Section could be changed to a Division in the future.

Councilmember Odegaard stated that he supported the direction outlined by Councilmember McCarthy. He discussed the history of the Section and stated that the budget would be a challenge. He added that he would like to work through it first and then see if Council could do something more elevated in the future.

Vice Mayor Shimoni stated that he supported creating the Section and saw it as a great first step. He said he would like to see the Section as a Division in the future.

Councilmember Whelan asked if the Sustainability Section would have an equal voice with all Section leaders if moved. Mr. Clifton replied that it would.

Councilmember Salas stated that she supported moving the Sustainability Section under the oversight of the City Manager. She asked if there would need to be a new coordinator and staff who would have to work between departments. Mr. Clifton stated there would be new staff.

Councilmember Aslan stated that he was impressed with the leadership of Mr. Clifton and was grateful for it. He stated that creating the Section was a good move and would like to see it more elevated in the future.

Mayor Evans stated that she appreciated that staff was looking at restructuring before the citizen's petition was received. She noted that regardless of whether Sustainability was a Section or Division the organization needed to establish sustainability and the CAAP so they continue their efforts as councils, city managers, and budgets come and go.

City Manager Clifton stated that the restructuring was being done to keep with the current times and acknowledged Public Works Director Andy Bertlesen and Deputy City Manager Shannon Anderson for their work.

8. Citizen Petition - Climate Emergency Resolution

City Attorney Sterling Solomon stated that the item was for receiving direction from Council on the citizen petition only.

The following individuals addressed Council in support of the petition:

- Sara Kubisty
- Emily Melhorn, speaking on behalf of the Oseleta Program
- Lee Haferkamp
- Caleb Eckert, speaking as a member of the Northern Arizona Grower's Association
- Dara Marks Marino
- Stefan Sommer
- Tyler Linner, Co-Founder of Praxis Waste Solutions
- Jenna Ortega
- Stephanie Arcusa
- Janine Kelley
- Eric Nolan, Friends of Flagstaff Future
- Nikki Cooley
- Jesse Rodriguez
- Paul Deasy
- Kelsey Morales
- Amanda Ormond
- Dan Cady
- Anthony Garcia
- Ralph Dodge
- Josephine Kamkoff
- Melinda Ronca-Battista
- Dustin Kuluris
- Andy Bessler
- Alexander Simon
- Joan Garcia
- Emily Kate Copenhaver
- Becky Daggett
- Erik Nielsen
- Miranda Sweet
- Dr. John Fegyveresi
- Dr. David Spence
- Marco Alatorre
- Drew Fockler
- Mayan Cohen, FALA Environmental Coalition

The following comments were received:

- Twenty-six countries have declared a climate emergency
- Flagstaff should be the first city in Arizona to declare a climate emergency to be a leader
- The CAAP is a perfect example of the effort of Flagstaff
- Address the crisis at emergency speed
- Be proactive rather than reactive
- Stricter regulations on private trash haulers were needed
- Find a recycling contract that helped achieve zero waste
- Lobby at the state level for autonomy for single use plastics including plastic bags
- Developments should meet environmental goals
- Elevate goals in CAAP to be climate neutral by 2030
- Making a declaration was important, but it had to mean something
- All city vehicles should be electric;

- All city buildings should be net zero energy
- Net zero buildings should be required in the code
- Greater focus was needed on public transportation and walkability
- Flagstaff could be a model city
- The public needed to see leaders take action

Gabor Kovacs addressed Council in opposition of the petition and stated that there was skepticism of the science, it was too political, and the motives behind the agenda were wrong.

Tom Scheel addressed Council about policy enactment and did not indicate support or opposition of the petition.

The following individuals submitted comment cards in support of declaring a Climate Emergency:

- Jesse Duff-Woodruff
- Hadassah Ziegler
- Collene Barnhart
- Everett England
- Indira Neilson
- Peter Bungart
- Jennifer Ruben
- Audrey Kruse
- Nancy Barron
- Carol Halc
- Sibylle Gruber
- Aspen Cosner
- Eden Fahy
- Barbara Phillips
- Gessica Neilson
- David Booth
- Gabrielle Neilson
- Elizabeth Buckalew
- Collin Weller
- Luis Fernandez
- Jim Gale
- Sean Parson
- Leslie PtakBaker
- Kara Gibson
- Annie Taylor
- Garrison Garcia
- Sarah Andrews
- Mare Schumacher
- Susan Miller
- Briget Loewenstein
- Chetan Kane
- Ella Havenga
- Leah Mundell
- Peggy Chaikin
- Jane Bunson
- Benjamin Heirigs
- Rosa McDonald
- Aneeka Bippus
- Ian Harrison
- Emma Hagen
- Keetra Bippus
- Sharmon Cawood
- Jack Cahill
- Mark Alexander
- Edward Bustya

- Wendy Bratzel
- Kyle Elison
- Bridger Burk
- Gemma Giovale
- Kaylee Elison
- Juniper Holland

A break was held from 8:00 p.m. through 8:12 p.m.

Councilmember McCarthy elaborated on the climate crisis and stated that they were at a turning point and that climate needed to be taken seriously. He added that he supported a resolution declaring a climate emergency.

Councilmember Odegaard thanked the public for participating. He addressed section seven which stated a goal of carbon neutral by 2030 and he stated that he saw that as a goal the Council should strive for.

Councilmember Salas expressed support for advancing the petition and the resolution.

Vice Mayor Shimoni stated that proactive efforts save money. He asked how Council would support the CAAP and that the budget retreat needed to discuss funding it. He stated that he supported the resolution.

Councilmember Whelan shared that there had been discussions about creating solar energy on Red Gap Ranch and farming it with APS and the Hopi Tribe. She added that the contract with Norton for recycling, reuse, and reduce was a constant conversation, along with how the City collects trash. She also stated that there would possibly be a bond for rapid transit and other items important for the climate crisis on the upcoming ballot. She shared that she was in favor of the resolution.

Mayor Evans spoke about the growth in Flagstaff and stated that the city needed to do more than declare an emergency and that they needed to follow through with intent.

The Council was supportive of a climate emergency resolution and advancing the matter to a future agenda for further discussion and possible action.

Moved by Councilmember Jim McCarthy, **seconded by** Councilmember Jamie Whelan to continue the agenda as written.

Vote: 7 - 0 - Unanimously

A break was held from 9:44 p.m. through 9:55 p.m.

9. Community Stewards Annual Update

Volunteer and Event Coordinator Maggie Twomey provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

- History of the Community Stewards Program
- 2019 Highlights
- Education and Outreach
- Community Stewards Assistant
- What's Next
- Thank you to volunteers

Council expressed appreciation for the presentation.

Vice Mayor Shimoni suggested highlighting the partners more by using social media or the website with quotes, pictures, and videos. He stated that the One Day in May was a great effort.

Councilmember Aslan stated that there was a notable difference thanks to the efforts of the program. He appreciated the effort that went into volunteer recruitment and organization.

Councilmember Odegaard stated that he met a family from Phoenix for the annual cleanup at Bushmaster that comes up every year. He also stated that he appreciated the effort to engage with visitors on the weekends.

10. **Priority Based Budgeting Program Scoring and Peer Review Update**

Council discussed the alignment of city programs with the Council's priorities. Councilmember Whelan questioned the discrepancy between the city's goals and the goals on the Priority-Based Budget document. Mr. Clifton explained the new methodology that would be implemented in the city, which took into account all aspects of the City's operations and scored them in a quantitative way.

Management Analyst Sarah Langley provided an update on the progress of Priority Based Budgeting. The discussion highlighted the importance of community input in the goal-setting process and the need for a more comprehensive approach to budgeting.

11. **Potential General Election Consultant Services Scope of Work**

The Council discussed potential ballot measures for the upcoming election, with Mayor Evans and Vice Mayor Aslan expressing reservations about guaranteeing support for any particular measure. Councilmember Whelan advocated for polling first, while Deputy City Manager Shannon Anderson highlighted the importance of conducting opinion research through surveys and focus groups. Mr. Clifton explained the role of a consultant in providing strategic advice and information to inform council decisions.

12. **Discussion:** Fees the city assesses for special events on private property and the possibility of implementing a staggered fee schedule similar to what is done for events on public property

Mayor Evans, Councilmember Salas, Councilmember Odegaard, and Vice Mayor Shimoni were in favor of moving the item forward for discussion.

13. **Discussion:** All aspects of the City Council operations including office space, support staff, budget, and salary and establishing a committee to evaluate these items

Mayor Evans stated that she felt that the City Manager was addressing the item and asked to remove the discussion from Council's agenda. The majority of Council supported removing the item from future discussion.

14. **Public Participation**

None.

15. **Informational Items To/From Mayor, Council, and City Manager; future agenda item requests**

Councilmember Odegaard asked about the upcoming Budget Retreat schedule. Mr. Clifton stated the first day would be scheduled for the full day and the second day should adjourn around 2:30 p.m.

Councilmember Aslan stated that he would like to discuss the possibility of having a city liaison for APS and the Arizona Corporation Commission.

Councilmember McCarthy stated that the Housing Commission met and had not put together anything specific on a bond, but there was a consensus that there should be a bond question.

Mr. Clifton reported that information regarding the Council's visit to Peach Springs would be sent out soon.

Mayor Evans reported that snow play information was available online in Spanish. She added that

Sustainability staff needed to communicate with Economic Vitality staff regarding future plans. She also requested a discussion on SB1160 regarding fire personnel and cancer.

Councilmember Odegaard stated that he would like to have a discussion with the state lobbyists about legislative priorities.

16. Adjournment

The Work Session of the Flagstaff City Council held January 28, 2020, adjourned at 11:06 P.M.

MAYOR

ATTEST:

CITY CLERK