

MINUTES

1. Call to Order

Mayor Daggett called the Special Meeting of the Flagstaff City Council held April 23, 2024, to order at 3:00 p.m.

2. Roll Call

NOTE: One or more Councilmembers may be in attendance through other technological means.

PRESENT:

ABSENT:

MAYOR DAGGETT
VICE MAYOR ASLAN
COUNCILMEMBER HARRIS
COUNCILMEMBER HOUSE
COUNCILMEMBER MATTHEWS
COUNCILMEMBER MCCARTHY
COUNCILMEMBER SWEET

Others present: City Manager Greg Clifton; City Attorney Sterling Solomon

3. Pledge of Allegiance, Mission Statement, and Land Acknowledgement

The Council and audience recited the pledge of allegiance, Councilmember McCarthy read the Mission Statement of the City of Flagstaff, and Councilmember Sweet read the Land Acknowledgement.

MISSION STATEMENT

The mission of the City of Flagstaff is to protect and enhance the quality of life for all.

LAND ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The Flagstaff City Council humbly acknowledges the ancestral homelands of this area's Indigenous nations and original stewards. These lands, still inhabited by Native descendants, border mountains sacred to Indigenous peoples. We honor them, their legacies, their traditions, and their continued contributions. We celebrate their past, present, and future generations who will forever know this place as home.

4. Proclamation: Administrative Professionals Day

Mayor Daggett read and presented the proclamation.

5. Consideration and Approval: Congressionally Directed Spending Requests and Federal Lobbying Trip to DC Materials

Councilmember House noted a potential typo regarding the "wealth gap." Mr. Johnson stated that it was a typo the correction would be made before final publication.

Moved by Councilmember Khara House, **seconded by** Councilmember Jim McCarthy to approve the Federal Lobbying Packet and retroactively approve the Congressionally Directed Spending Requests.

Vote: 7 - 0 - Unanimously

6. Adjournment

The Special Meeting of the Flagstaff City Council held April 23, 2024, was adjourned at 3:17 p.m.

WORK SESSION

1. Call to Order

Mayor Daggett called the Work Session of the Flagstaff City Council held April 23, 2024, to order at 3:17 p.m.

2. Open Call to the Public

Open Call to the Public enables the public to address the Council about an item that is not on the prepared agenda. Comments relating to items that are on the agenda will be taken at the time that the item is discussed. Open Call to the Public appears on the agenda twice, at the beginning and at the end. The total time allotted for the first Open Call to the Public is 30 minutes; any additional comments will be held until the second Open Call to the Public.

If you wish to address the Council in person at today's meeting, please complete a comment card and submit it to the recording clerk as soon as possible. Your name will be called when it is your turn to speak. You may address the Council up to three times throughout the meeting, including comments made during Open Call to the Public and Public Comment. Please limit your remarks to three minutes per item to allow everyone an opportunity to speak. At the discretion of the Chair, ten or more persons present at the meeting and wishing to speak may appoint a representative who may have no more than fifteen minutes to speak.

Dennis Givens addressed Council regarding the need for additional social services in Sunnyside. He also spoke about affordable housing.

Nadine Hart addressed Council spoke about the Housing Opportunity Through Modernization Act (HOTMA) and the need for social media outreach on why landlords should rent to Section 8 Housing residents.

3. City Manager Report

City Manager Greg Clifton called out a letter appended to the report that would be sent to many residents in the Swiss Manor and Shadow Mountain neighborhoods. He stated that the letter addressed the risk of flooding in the neighborhoods. He stated that the purpose of the letter was to remind the residents that there was an increased risk of occasional flooding and to provide precautions and measures that could be taken to protect the properties, and suggestions about flood insurance.

Climate Action Section Director Jenny Niemann reviewed the Sustainability monthly report.

Councilmember House asked about the equity assessment tool referenced in the report. Ms. Niemann stated that equity was one of the primary goals of the Carbon Neutrality Plan. She stated that there had not been a lot of data on how staff was engaging all the different parts of the community, so staff developed an assessment tool. She added that they built the tool off training that staff invested in through the Urban Sustainability Directors Network and an equity foundations training that everyone in the office took. The tool helped staff understand why they were only reaching certain portions of the community, and assisted staff in trying to understand how they could do better. She added that the tool was mostly just information collection at the moment, but staff realized they needed the information to

be able to advance their equity work.

Councilmember House asked if the tool would be used to determine the accessibility of the different programs. Ms. Niemann stated that staff took a very broad view of equity and the tool would look at everything from demographics of attendees, income levels, how people were learning about the events, the ways people learned, disabilities, and more.

Councilmember Harris asked about the equity group and the makeup of the group. Ms. Niemann stated that the Equity Advisory Climate Group was one of three advisory groups that were launched two years ago. She added that staff did a lot of community engagement to get applications, so the group was a pretty broad base of people from different backgrounds. She added that they asked about lived experience and tried to value lived experience in order to select members of the group. She stated that staff used other outside community members to help appoint, so that staff were not the ones making the selections. She added that the group advised on a wide variety of projects and they met once a month.

IT Director CJ Perry briefly reviewed the IT quarterly report.

Water Services Director Shannon Jones introduced Communication Engagement Specialist Sarah Jablon who reviewed the Water Services quarterly report.

Mayor Daggett asked about maintenance projects and how they were prioritized within the budget. Mr. Jones stated that staff used software to manage the maintenance programs. He added that sometimes staff had to get a little creative to ensure that repairs worked within the budget.

Economic Vitality Director Heidi Hansen reviewed the Economic Vitality monthly report.

Councilmember Harris asked about ArtX and if the City was involved. Community Investment Director Dave McIntire stated that the city was a sponsor of ArtX and Council should have received invitations to a number of events. He added that the city would participate in three events as well and several city projects would be highlighted.

Councilmember Harris asked about the 100th Anniversary of Route 66. Marketing and Media Relations Vice President for Discover Flagstaff Lori Pappas spoke about promoting Flagstaff festivals and stated that there would be a four-page color insert in the Arizona Republic that would cover the festivals and drive traffic for booking hotels. She added that staff was leveraging Phoenix billboards to target travelers during the festival season and that digital ads would target people in Southern California, Phoenix, and Albuquerque.

Councilmember Harris asked specifically about the Route 66 Centennial celebration and if the city had started planning events for it. Ms. Hansen stated that they had been working on the Route 66 celebration for over a year. She added that they had a committee at the city led by Ms. Pappas and Convention and Visitor Bureau Director Trace Ward which was going over what was done in celebration of the 90th anniversary of Route 66 and improving on the ideas. She stated that they were working on partnerships to enhance the celebration and they would focus on marketing and advertising.

Councilmember Harris asked if the City was going to do anything specific with the Green Book. Ms. Hansen stated that she would like to sit down with Councilmembers Harris and House regarding making the Green Book more user-friendly and self-explanatory since they both had asked about it.

Councilmember House asked about potential wraps for the parking kiosks. Mr. McIntire stated that staff had been looking at how wraps could best fit on the kiosks and that there looked like there was enough room to put on a wrap.

4. Discussion and Direction on City Seal/Logo

Communication and Civic Engagement Management Analyst Chris Rhode provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

FAIR ITEM CITY SEAL/LOGO
BACKGROUND
CURRENT CITY LOGO
PATH FORWARD
STAFF RECOMMENDED PROCESS
POSSIBLE COMPOSITION OF WORKING GROUP
LOGISTICS AND PROCESS
VISUAL DESIGN LAB
VISUAL DESIGN LAB EXAMPLES OF DESIGNED BRAND IDEAS
DESIGNING A BRAND IDENTITY
AFTER COMPLETION OF PROJECT
OPTIONS TO IMPLEMENT
POSSIBLE ACTION

Councilmember Harris thanked Mr. Rhode for his presentation, for how he has gone about the project, and for engaging NAU. She asked when the students could start. Mr. Rhode stated that the students could start in the fall semester, but that the city could start a working group in advance.

Councilmember House stated that she was fully in support of the recommendations. She added that the logo discussion was timely when considering the upcoming Route 66 celebration.

Vice Mayor Aslan stated that he was fully supportive of the staff recommendations and added that Mr. Rhode had done a great job on the project so far.

Councilmember Sweet stated that she worked with the VisualDESIGN Lab with Puente de Hozo and she is excited to see them involved.

Councilmember McCarthy stated his support but added that he did not want to change just for the sake of change. He stated that he would like to see a no-change option as well when Council votes on the item. He added that he liked the logo examples, but he would like to see a logo that would work well in black and white as well as color. Economic Vitality Director Heidi Hansen stated that the VisualDESIGN Lab stated that the logo they would create would be compatible with black and white and that it would also include a user-guide. Ms. Hansen thanked Ali Applin at NAU for her work and support as well.

5. Proposed Relocation of Arizona Materials to adjacent BNSF Railway Parcel

Real Estate Manager Bryce Doty and Community Development Director Dan Folke provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

- Proposed Purchase of BNSF Railway Land
- Vicinity Map
- Parcel Map
- Arizona Materials Property
- Capital Project Property Needs
- Background
 - Lone Tree Overpass & Rio de Flag Flood Control Projects
 - AZM Relocation Efforts
 - Adjacent BNSF Parcels
 - BNSF Site Adjacent to AZ-Mat
- Relocate AZM to East Parcel?
- Southside Plan -- Considerations

Vice Mayor Aslan asked about the options the public had to organize against the move and how they might succeed. He stated that one of his concerns was that time would be sucked up by a lengthy or protracted back and forth with community groups. Mr. Folke stated that for a Conditional Use Permit, the public would be able to request the application. He added that the Concept Plan would go through Site Plan review, which was an administrative process, and that those comments could be requested through a records request. He then spoke about the required neighborhood meetings that community members would be notified of and that the concerns noted in the meeting would be provided as part of

the Conditional Use Permit application. He added that the application would then go to the Planning and Zoning Commission, where there would be a report of the public meetings, a staff recommendation, and public comment. He said that the public could attend the Planning and Zoning Commission meeting and that the decision could then be referred to Council itself for an appeal within a 10-day window after the Planning and Zoning decision.

Councilmember House stated that the City went through a good process to find a viable location for Arizona Materials and she stated that she was curious as to why the new owners of Arizona Materials did not find the alternative location to be a viable location.

Councilmember McCarthy asked if Arizona Materials would get a larger piece of property than what they were giving up and what the ratio of those areas were. Mr. Doty stated that the plans were conceptual at that point, and that current batch plants operate at closer to four acres. He added that they were currently on two and a half acres. Councilmember McCarthy asked if negotiations would include the possible size difference and staff indicated that it would.

Mayor Daggett asked how many acres the property on Huntington was. Mr. Doty stated that it was sitting at 1.79 acres, so it was tight compared to their existing site.

Land and Development Manager for Kilgore Companies Lee Ware addressed Council and stated that Arizona Materials had been operating and serving the Flagstaff community for around 15 years. He added that in that time they had produced nearly 500,000 cubic yards of concrete, supplying to a number of local projects including Northern Arizona University, a number of commercial projects, and a number of city contracts. He stated that the current location was very convenient for them for numerous reasons and that they currently employed six to eight local employees. He added that maintaining existing haul routes and delivery times was paramount to their operations, and the east parcel site had similar site operations and efficiencies that they feel would work on a number of fronts that make the parcel the most viable option. He provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

- Arizona Materials
- AZM wants to stay in Flagstaff and in the Southside
- Relocated AZM to the East Parcel?
- How this would work
- AZM Site Needs
- Relocate AZM to East Parcel?
- AZM in preliminary planning stages
- AZM's early thoughts on a Site Plan for East Parcel

Mayor Daggett asked if the property was a commercial-only site. Mr. Ware stated that they deliver and do not have customers come to the site.

Mayor Daggett asked about the number of trucks they have during their busy season and Mr. Ware stated that they have a number of trucks and that the count would be part of the application process.

Mayor Daggett asked if there was a traffic light at the location and Mr. Ware stated that they would like to work with the city on access and egress.

Councilmember Harris disclosed that she was the volunteer Executive Director of the Southside Community Association and asked Mr. Ware if they were aware there was a neighborhood plan when they purchased the business. Mr. Ware said that he was not aware of the neighborhood plan at the time of purchase. Councilmember Harris stated that she was concerned that they bought a business in a neighborhood where there was some development, and that she would expect the buyer to have known that there some type of plan in place in a neighborhood.

Executive Director of Real Land and Development for Kilgore Companies Stuart Lamb stated that they purchased a big business that was a non-conforming use in a zone that was a conditional use. He added that what they presented would be considered a permitted use with conditions and that they purchased the old property fully understanding that the entitled rights were under a non-conforming status.

Councilmember Matthews pointed out that the Southside Plan was adopted with the understanding that the materials plant would disappear. Mr. Lamb stated that they heard a lot in other communities that the community would like to see the materials plants and mining operations go away, but that they also need the plants and the jobs in the community. He asked how Council would feel if someone wanted to take away their business. He added that they have exhausted the process to find another location and that they respect the neighborhood planning, but they recognize that there is land use law and procedures that were in place. He stated that is what they purchased.

Mayor Daggett asked if four acres was what they needed, and Mr. Lamb stated that it was and that it would get them through the Conditional Use Process and allow them to have a little bit of a buffer from the adjoining property.

Mr. Doty resumed the presentation.

- Seeking Public Input & Council Direction
- Option 1 - Support efforts to help AZM relocate to East Parcel (so long as it obtains a conditional use permit)
- Option 2 - Continue efforts to relocate AZM elsewhere
- Option 3 - Seek a court order of immediate possession for use of AZM's property
- Options -- Primary Considerations

Rick Lopez addressed Council and stated that the Southside Plan contained a lot of community input and that it was created as an aspirational guide. He stated that he did not want to see the plan changed for one business and stated that it undermines the neighborhood plan and the regional plan.

David Hayward addressed Council and stated that he owns a piece of property in the area, and he was involved in the Southside Plan. He stated that there was an understanding when making the plan that the industrial uses of the area would go away. He asked Council to send the idea back to the drawing board.

Written comments were received from David Hayward, Annie Taylor, and Mike Tulloss opposing the relocation of the concrete batch plant.

Senior Assistant Attorney Anja Wendel stated that a trade had to be of substantial or equal value. She also addressed the ongoing condemnation case that staff was trying to resolve and reaching an agreement with Arizona Materials would help staff resolve that more quickly.

Vice Mayor Aslan spoke about the Rio de Flag project and not wanting to delay it. He asked how the Rio de Flag project would be influenced by the project. Capital Improvements Project Manager Christine Cameron stated that there was a lot of work to do with BNSF Railway on property acquisition and rail relocation. She stated that she did not know the immediacy of the decision at that point since the US Army Corps was still going through their final design process. She added that she did not believe the Rio de Flag project would be in jeopardy if a decision were not made and that they are still scheduled to break ground in 2025. Vice Mayor Aslan asked for confirmation if Arizona Materials needed to relocate before the Rio de Flag project was constructed. Ms. Cameron stated that the relocation of the cement plant must be done before the Rio de Flag project.

Vice Mayor Aslan spoke about the continued misuse of the Rio de Flag channel that abuts the Arizona Materials Property and asked Mr. Lamb to speak about how they would feel about having the CUP ensure that there would be no misuse of the channels. Mr. Lamb stated that there is a large difference between large owners and small owners. He stated that the plants are relatively quiet and clean. He added that they are conscious of environmental concerns and work shoulder to shoulder with the community in that effort.

Vice Mayor Aslan stated that he was leaning towards a combination of option two, to continue efforts to relocate Arizona Materials elsewhere, and option three, to seek a court order of immediate possession for use of the Arizona Materials property. He added that the relocation was not consistent with the Southside Plan and he would like to see Arizona Materials succeed in another area in town.

Councilmember Harris stated that she agreed with Vice Mayor Aslan. She added that she found it problematic that the company did not bother to look into any plans that were available for that neighborhood or for the city.

Councilmember McCarthy stated that he was supportive of option one, to support efforts to help Arizona Materials relocate to the east parcel so long as they obtain a Conditional Use Permit.

Councilmember House stated that she leaned towards option two to try to relocate the business elsewhere. She added that the city had done more than what was required in seeking to avoid option three.

Councilmember Sweet stated that she supported option two and finding a new location. She added that she does not want to see option three happen.

Councilmember Matthews stated that she was leaning towards option two, but added that the search could not go on for much longer and that it needed an end date.

Mayor Daggett stated that Arizona Materials was a valued business in Flagstaff. She added that she supported option two and supported a temporary use of the land to the east so that the Rio de Flag project and the overpass project would not be delayed.

Relocation and Eminent Domain Consultant Mike Sullivan gave a historical context to the property. He stated that they had been working on relocating the business since 2020, however, they had to be located in a heavy industrial zone and there was none available in the City of Flagstaff. He stated that there were issues with the land size and reminded Council that the old site was a non-conforming use and did not conform with current zoning code requirements. He added that the new site must be bigger to comply with the code requirements. He also addressed the Southside Plan and stated that the property was condemned based on a 2010 Lone Tree Project study. The Southside Plan was not in place at the time the property was condemned. He addressed the Huntington property and stated that it ended up being too small for the use when considering zoning code requirements.

Council provided direction to continue with option two and return to Council with an update at a later time.

A break was held from 6:08 p.m. through 6:32 p.m.

6. **Bed, Board, and Booze (BBB) Tax Renewal & Related Code Change Discussion**

Economic Vitality Director Heidi Hansen, Parks, Recreation, Open Spaces, and Events Director Rebecca Sayers, Convention and Visitor Bureau Director Trace Ward, and Community Investment Director Dave McIntire provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

- Bed, Board, and Booze (BBB) Tax Renewal and Related Code Changes
- BBB Worksession Agenda
- What is the BBB?
- What services receive BBB Funding?
- BBB Code Change and Renewal Timeline
- Elements on BBB Information Messaging
- BBB information advertising examples
- BBBrenewalflagstaff.com
- Questions on BBB information presented

Mayor Daggett asked to replace the term "general fund" with the term "bottom line" and Vice Mayor Aslan suggested using Councilmembers for radio ads.

Councilmember Harris asked what was considered a short-term rental. Mr. Ward offered that short-term rentals were shared economies or vacation rentals, such as Airbnb or other services. Councilmember Harris asked how the city determined that rentals were available, and Mr. Ward stated that the city had a registry and a program that browsed the internet to identify rentals.

- BBB Code Change Recommendations
- Parks and Recreation
 - Recommended/draft code updates for Parks and Recreation Commission
 - Recommended/draft code updates for Open Spaces Commission
 - Recommended/draft code updates to the Hospitality Industry Tax Revenues section
- Tourism & Visitor Services
 - Recommended/draft: Tourism Commission
- Recommended/draft: Economic Development
- Beautification & Arts and Sciences Commission\
- Questions

7. Initial Discussion of the Draft Economic Development Strategic Plan

Community Investment Director David McIntire introduced President Laura O'Brien and Director of Ecosystem Development Adam Peabody from Stiletto: Make A Point (Stiletto), the City's Economic Development Strategic Plan consultant who provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

- Introduction
- Stiletto: Make a Point
- Six Components of Economic Development
- Building an Economic Development Ecosystem
- Stiletto Impact Cascade
- What's the Point?
- The Economic Development Strategy 2024-29
- The Strategy
- A collaborative, evidence-based strategy
- Community Participation in the Planning Process
- Community Aspirations
- Mission
- Vision
- Priority Sectors
- Pillars for Impact
- Strategy At a Glance
- Pillars
- Pillar One: Focus & Positioning
- Pillar Two: Branding & Awareness

Vice Mayor Aslan asked for the definition of "unique value proposition." Ms. O'Brien stated that the unique value proposition is what differentiated Flagstaff from others.

- Pillar Three: Sustainable Economic Development
- Pillar Four: Community Ecosystem Development
- The Sectors
- Strategic Sector Focus
- Five sector focuses
 - Astronomy
 - Food Processing
 - Forestry Products
 - Biomedical/Health Care
 - Manufacturing
- Priority Sectors in the Future
- Discussion

Councilmember Matthews asked about the housing restrictions regarding the workforce. Mr. McIntire stated that a workforce data analysis was happening congruently so that the workforce development strategy by Keane Consulting and the economic development strategy would be aligned.

Councilmember House stated that she was encouraged by the pillar focus. She added that it was a

little challenging to decouple the conversations about housing affordability from the conversation. Ms. O'Brien stated that housing was a big issue and that they would give it some thought and work with Keane to see what they could layer into the economic development piece. Mr. McIntire added that staff was looking at code changes and other elements to make housing easier to build and to assist commercial processes as well.

Mayor Daggett commented on the HELIOS Foundation trip where they looked at data on schools and economic development. She added that they saw the projections for Coconino County during that trip that showed a lot of growth in hospitality but nothing in healthcare. She asked Ms. O'Brien if they were going to tie that into the report to avoid that possibility. Ms. O'Brien stated that they would work with Keane to dive into that information and include it in the report.

Vice Mayor Aslan spoke about the possibility of the film industry as a pillar. Ms. O'Brien stated that tourism was not a part of their scope and film would fall under what they call creative industry and that they will look at that.

- Next Steps
 - Finalize the Recommendations and Framework
 - Finalize the Report
 - Report Review and Council Presentation May 21, 2024

Councilmember Harris commented that the focus must stay on housing because without housing the economy cannot grow and jobs could not be filled. She also spoke about early childhood education and that it must also be a part of the conversation.

8. Emergency Management Briefing - Public Safety Power Shutoffs (PSPS)

Grants, Contracts, and Emergency Management Director Stacey Brechler-Knaggs introduced Janet Dean from Arizona Public Safety (APS) who introduced Wade Ward, Joe Weathersby, Logan Trackman and Ryan Wiesner. The provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

- Arizona Public Service (APS) Wildfire Mitigation Update
- Introductions
- Objectives
- Multi-faceted strategy to protect against wildfires -- Wade Ward
- Vegetation management
- Enhanced inspections
- Improved monitoring
- Grid hardening
- Risk modeling
- Coordination with other agencies and counties
- Public Safety Power Shutoffs (PSPS)
- Circuit locations -- Overview
- Circuit locations -- Coconino
- Communication regarding PSPS
- Steps to prepare for PSPS
- Help prepare for PSPS

Councilmember Sweet asked if customers could sign up for how they want to be contacted. Ms. Dean responded yes and that their focus was on making sure their customers were prepared and allowed them to determine how they would like to be contacted.

Mayor Daggett asked if APS would like Flagstaff residents to sign up as well even though they would not be affected by the PSPS. Ms. Dean responded yes, the communication tools were helpful for all situations involving APS.

Ms. Brechler-Knaggs, Emergency Manager Daniel Kelly, Water Production Manager Brian Huntzinger, Water Services Program Manager Tamera Lawless, Fire Chief Mark Gaillard, and Public Affairs Director Sarah Langley provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

- City Response to PSPS
- Emergency Management (EM)
- Water Services
- Tools & Strategies available
- Available water sources during a PSPS event
- Anticipated capacity
- Water conservation strategies
- Strategy I
- Strategy II
- Strategy III
- Fire
- Public Messaging

Council thanked APS and staff for the update.

9. Open Call to the Public

None.

10. Informational Items To/From Mayor, Council, and City Manager; future agenda item requests

Councilmember McCarthy shared that he attended Earth Day and that it was very good. He also stated that he met with Sustainability staff.

Mayor Daggett shared that she was invited by the Arizona Community Foundation to attend a dinner with the CEO of the Aspen Institute in Phoenix. She shared that the new strategic plan of the Institute contained three elements: housing, education, and environment. Mayor Daggett also shared that she sat on the Arizona Commission of the Arts Executive Director interviews and that she met with the Animal Welfare of Northern Arizona and discussed the creation of a low-cost spay and neuter center. She shared that there would be a joint adoption event at Wags and Whiskers on May 19, 2024.

11. Adjournment

The Work Session of the Flagstaff City Council held April 23, 2024, adjourned at 8:49 p.m.

MAYOR

ATTEST:

CITY CLERK

CERTIFICATION

I, STACY SALTZBURG, do hereby certify that I am the City Clerk of the City of Flagstaff, County of Coconino, State of Arizona, and that the above Minutes are a true and correct summary of the Meeting of the Council of the City of Flagstaff held on April 23, 2024. I further certify that the Meeting was duly called and held and that a quorum was present.

DATED this 1st day of October, 2024

CITY CLERK