

## MINUTES

### 1. Call to Order

Mayor Daggett called the meeting of the Flagstaff City Council held November 28, 2023, to order at 3:03 p.m.

#### NOTICE OF OPTION TO RECESS INTO EXECUTIVE SESSION

*Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the City Council and to the general public that, at this work session, the City Council may vote to go into executive session, which will not be open to the public, for discussion and consultation with the City's attorneys for legal advice on any item listed on the following agenda, pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(3).*

### 2. Roll Call

*NOTE: One or more Councilmembers may be in attendance through other technological means.*

PRESENT:

ABSENT:

MAYOR DAGGETT  
VICE MAYOR ASLAN  
COUNCILMEMBER HARRIS  
COUNCILMEMBER HOUSE  
COUNCILMEMBER MATTHEWS  
COUNCILMEMBER MCCARTHY  
COUNCILMEMBER SWEET

Others present: City Manager Greg Clifton; City Attorney Sterling Solomon.

### 3. Pledge of Allegiance, Mission Statement, and Land Acknowledgement

The Council and audience recited the pledge of allegiance, Councilmember Sweet read the Mission Statement of the City of Flagstaff, and Councilmember House read the Land Acknowledgement.

#### MISSION STATEMENT

*The mission of the City of Flagstaff is to protect and enhance the quality of life for all.*

#### LAND ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

*The Flagstaff City Council humbly acknowledges the ancestral homelands of this area's Indigenous nations and original stewards. These lands, still inhabited by Native descendants, border mountains sacred to Indigenous peoples. We honor them, their legacies, their traditions, and their continued contributions. We celebrate their past, present, and future generations who will forever know this place as home.*

Mayor Daggett reordered the agenda to take Item 5 before Item 4.

#### 4. Public Participation

*Public Participation enables the public to address the council about items that are not on the prepared agenda. Public Participation appears on the agenda twice, at the beginning and at the end of the work session. You may speak at one or the other, but not both. Anyone wishing to comment at the meeting is asked to fill out a speaker card and submit it to the recording clerk. When the item comes up on the agenda, your name will be called. You may address the Council up to three times throughout the meeting, including comments made during Public Participation. Please limit your remarks to three minutes per item to allow everyone to have an opportunity to speak. At the discretion of the Chair, ten or more persons present at the meeting and wishing to speak may appoint a representative who may have no more than fifteen minutes to speak.*

William Tyler Head addressed Council and presented a citizen petition that asked that the city support the ICAN cities appeal to abolish nuclear weapons.

The following individuals addressed Council in support of the current Carbon Neutrality Plan:

- John McCartney
- Sat Best
- Roderic Parnell
- Kay Bordwell
- Jill Stephenson
- Mark James
- Michele James
- Talyne Belka
- Robert Breunig
- Phoenix Eskridge-Aldama
- Kim Curtis
- Sandra Lubarsky
- Bryan Bates
- Karyn Riedell
- Jordyn DeMaio
- Liam O'Neill Sarr
- Tim Aydelott
- Merion Sharp.
- Jason Kardosky
- Anthony Underwood
- Alexander Shenkin

The following comments were received:

- The Council should do everything they could to support the goals within the plan and not change the path.
- Do not support the citizen petition from Flagstaff First.
- The advancement of the Flagstaff First petition would redirect funding from climate efforts.
- Fire, flooding, and drought were already addressed within the current plan.
- Flagstaff demonstrated a way toward a carbon neutral future.
- Flagstaff First's proposal would weaken the plan.
- Wildfire, flooding, and drought were impacts from the harmful effects of climate change.
- The beliefs of Flagstaff First represent the minority and are not based in science.
- Do not change the Climate Neutrality Plan as requested by the petition.
- In order to achieve the goals of the Climate Neutrality Plan everything else must take a back seat.
- Unless the root cause of climate change was addressed things would only get worse.
- It was not the time to abandon the goals or change course.
- The Council should continue to lead the way in climate action and carry forward the goals within the plan.
- The petition aims to gut the Carbon Neutrality Plan.
- The Carbon Neutrality Plan focused on well documented strategies for reducing reliance on fossil fuels.

- City, state, and federal agencies were already addressing the issues of wildfire, flooding, and drought in many ways, a change in the Carbon Neutrality Plan was not necessary.
- Natural disasters were a result of climate change which the Carbon Neutrality Plan was outlined to address.
- The argument that Flagstaff's efforts were pointless because the emissions of China were so high was misguided.
- There was broad community support for the development of the Carbon Neutrality Plan.

Written comments in support of the current Carbon Neutrality Plan were submitted by the following individuals:

- Jacqueline Thomas
- Eric Souders
- Karen Enyedy
- Melinda Bell
- Kathy Flaccus
- Esther Ellsworth Bowers
- Anthony Underwood
- Sara Gibson
- Katherine Allen
- Elaine Dillingham
- Dr. Keith White
- Libby Stortz
- Rivko Knox
- Erica Rackley
- Dr. Lauren Breihan
- Stephanie Hammond
- Andrew Reiter
- Marie Jones
- Susan Shapiro
- Bob Tures
- Heidi Shoen
- Lindsey Falkenburg
- Gisela Ray
- Justin Shagena

5. **Recognition:** Housing Month Sticker Contest Winner

Housing Program Manager Adriana Fisher spoke about the Housing Month sticker contest and announced Arlo Fredicks as the contest winner. Arlo was presented a recognition and key to the city from the Mayor and Council.

6. **Review of Draft Agenda for the December 5, 2023 City Council Meeting**

None

7. **City Manager Report**

Mr. Clifton briefly reviewed his report, Economic Vitality Director Heidi Hansen reviewed the Economic Vitality monthly report, and Parks, Recreation, Open Space, and Events Director Rebecca Sayers reviewed the PROSE monthly report.

8. **ECoNA - An Economic Development Roadmap for Northern Arizona**

President and CEO of ECoNA Gail Jackson introduced Daniel Court, Principal and Senior Economist with Elliott D. Pollack & Company, and Dr. Ioanna Morfessis, President and Chief Strategist with IO.INC. who provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

ECoNA ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT STRATEGIC PLAN

FORGING THE FUTURE: AN ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT ROADMAP FOR NORTHERN ARIZONA  
FIVE-YEAR ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT STRATEGIC PLAN  
OUR TEAM  
APPROACH  
A SNAPSHOT OF THE REGION'S CURRENT ECONOMICS  
POPULATION CHANGE 2010-2022  
2021-2040 POPULATION FORECAST  
HOUSEHOLD INCOME  
COCONINO COUNTY EMPLOYMENT BY INDUSTRY -- 2020  
EMPLOYMENT BY INDUSTRY  
COMPETITIVENESS ANALYSIS  
EDUCATIONAL ATTAINMENT CITY COMPARISON  
EDUCATIONAL ATTAINMENT REGIONAL COMPARISON  
COLLEGE & GRADUATE SCHOOL ENROLLMENT CITY COMPARISON  
COLLEGE & GRADUATE SCHOOL ENROLLMENT REGIONAL COMPARISON  
POPULATION PROJECTIONS  
COMMERCIAL REAL ESTATE FACTORS  
LATEST CRIME RATES PER 1,000 RESIDENTS CITY COMPARISON  
SUMMARY OF ECONOMIC CONDITIONS  
IDENTIFYING THE TARGETED SECTORS  
LABOR SHED ANALYSIS  
HOUSING ANALYSIS  
AVERAGE SALES PRICE SINGLE FAMILY HOMES ECONA REGION  
ECONA REGION APARTMENT INVENTORY & TRENDS  
RENTER-OCCUPIED HOUSEHOLDS PAYING MORE THAN 30% OF INCOME TOWARDS  
HOUSING COSTS  
ECONA REGION FIVE-YEAR AFFORDABLE HOUSING DEMAND  
SWOT ANALYSIS  
TOP 12 STRENGTHS  
TOP 12 WEAKNESSES  
TOP 12 OPPORTUNITIES  
TOP 12 THREATS  
GROWTH OPPORTUNITIES  
GOALS & OBJECTIVES  
6 MAIN GOALS  
IMPLEMENTATION TIMETABLE EXAMPLE

Councilmember Matthews stated that Northern Arizona could be faced with an economic crisis and asked if the action items presented could help lessen the impact. Mr. Court stated that Flagstaff represented a large impact on Northern Arizona and was responsible for some of the perception of anti-growth and anti-business. There was a lot of work to be done and the action items were a possible strategy to combat that perception. Dr. Morfessis added that Flagstaff was surrounded by magnificent scenery, natural assets, great employers, educational facilities, and a great quality of place and life but it was going to experience economic decline if some of the existing factors were not addressed.

Councilmember Matthews asked how the overturn of the Northern Arizona Healthcare (NAH) project would impact the outcomes of the report. Mr. Court stated that feedback from stakeholders was for more healthcare services and NAH would have fulfilled that need. When a city was unable to approve and develop quality of live services it put things at risk. Dr. Morfessis added that Flagstaff was communicating that they did not want growth. It called to question why have a medical school at NAU if graduates would go elsewhere when their schooling was complete. Not having the highest level of acute care in a hospital that attracted quality medical personnel would be problematic.

Councilmember House asked if there were recommended strategies and action steps to achieve the goals within the report. Mr. Court stated that there were actionable objectives and timelines to meet the goals.

Councilmember House asked if existing plans such as the 10-Year Housing Plan, the Regional Plan, and the Carbon Neutrality Plan were considered as part of the development of the economic

development strategy. Dr. Morfessis stated that a variety of plans influenced how they approached the economic development strategy. Economic development and growth were not incompatible with the carbon neutrality goals that had been adopted. The report recognized that there had to be balance with all plans which influenced the recommendations. Mr. Court added that the plan was regional and what may not work for Flagstaff, could be good opportunities for Winslow or Camp Verde. As each city looked at the plan they should consider their specific community and their own strengths and weaknesses.

Councilmember Sweet asked how the small business community was engaged in the development of the plan and what their top concerns were. Dr. Morfessis stated that small business owners were interviewed and those located in Flagstaff were most concerned about the cost of doing business, including the rising minimum wage, and the escalating cost of housing. There were also sentiments that Flagstaff was not business friendly.

The following individuals addressed Council regarding the ECoNA report:

- Josh Maher, Chair of ECoNA
- Alexis Knapp-Poly
- William Tyler Head

The following comments were received:

- The report presented real concern.
- The plan articulated the importance of diversifying the regional economy and the critical nature that housing availability played in the vitality of the region.
- Organizations were challenged to attract and retain talent due to the cost of living.
- Bold action was needed from members of the Council to address the concerns.
- There was a constant narrative around the general need for workforce development.
- Training the workforce did not mean much if people could not afford to live here.
- There were exciting opportunities to increase economic vitality but the lack of workforce housing needed to be addressed before anything else could be resolved.
- Keep in mind the people who desperately want to stay and work in Flagstaff and contribute to the growing economy.
- An assessment of second homes and short term rentals should be done.
- More emphasis should be placed on building up, especially in downtown to provide more housing.
- The reality of young people being able to stay in Flagstaff was disappearing.

A written comment was submitted by Ann Heitland that encouraged partnership with NAH to find a way to proceed.

Councilmember Harris requested that the information presented be released to the public. Flagstaff was not going to stay the way it was, and it had changed drastically in the last 30 years. People were digging their heels in and fighting against any growth and development and that was hurting businesses and the people who want to live and work in Flagstaff.

Councilmember House stated that the decisions made today would impact the future of Flagstaff for years and generations down the line. She did not expect that there would be so much focus on what happened with the hospital but there would never be agreement on the outcome. The question became what would happen as a result and how to ensure good healthcare for Northern Arizona and how to partner that with the need for housing and sustainability. There was a need for healing in the community and there was much work to be done to expand equity both economically and socially. That work would require bold action.

Councilmember McCarthy stated that 25% of the housing in Flagstaff was owned by people who did not live there, and he would like to see a higher tax rate for second homes. Workers would come to Flagstaff if they could afford to do so and addressing the housing issues must be top priority.

Councilmember Matthews stated that there had been so much discussion about how to lower the cost for developers to come into Flagstaff but very little had been done about it. It was time to stop talking and start doing. She had heard complaints about how long it took to get through the development

process and that conversations should be elevated if they were to get serious about housing. Addressing some of the issues with timing and cost could help create competition and more opportunities to get housing into Flagstaff. She also recognized the perception that could come from the outcome of the NAH development and was hopeful that the community could work together moving forward.

Mayor Daggett thanked ECoNA for the work that went into preparing the plan. She stated that when economic development and economic growth were discussed, there was a divide that happened around the word growth. To her, growth was about innovation and helping entrepreneurs put ideas into action. That type of economic development enhanced Flagstaff and put great ideas into action.

Ms. Jackson thanked Council for the time to present. She stated that ECoNA was diligent in vetting each project that expressed interest in Northern Arizona. They consider things such as the use of natural resources, how the project complimented the values of the desired location. They were not recruiting big, massive companies to come to the region. ECoNA recently participated in a strategic retreat that identified the three things they would focus on; housing, attitude and education about economic development, and regional collaboration and policy. They appreciated the support and investment of all the partners in the plan and they would report out on the progress they were making toward the three priorities.

## 9. Public Participation

None

## 10. Informational Items To/From Mayor, Council, and City Manager; future agenda item requests

Councilmember Sweet reported that First Friday Artwalk was that week and she encouraged people to come downtown and support local businesses.

Mayor Daggett stated that it was Giving Tuesday and encouraged others to support their favorite non-profit.

## 11. Adjournment

The Special Meeting of the Flagstaff City Council held November 27, 2023, adjourned at 4:08 p.m.

---

MAYOR

ATTEST:

---

CITY CLERK