

## MINUTES

### 1. CALL TO ORDER

Mayor Daggett called the meeting of the Flagstaff City Council held December 19, 2023, to order at 3:02 p.m.

#### NOTICE OF OPTION TO RECESS INTO EXECUTIVE SESSION

*Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the City Council and to the general public that, at this regular meeting, the City Council may vote to go into executive session, which will not be open to the public, for discussion and consultation with the City's attorneys for legal advice on any item listed on the following agenda, pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(3).*

### 2. ROLL CALL

*NOTE: One or more Councilmembers may be in attendance through other technological means.*

PRESENT:

MAYOR DAGGETT  
VICE MAYOR ASLAN  
COUNCILMEMBER HOUSE  
COUNCILMEMBER MATTHEWS  
COUNCILMEMBER MCCARTHY  
COUNCILMEMBER SWEET

ABSENT:

COUNCILMEMBER HARRIS

Others present: City Manager Greg Clifton; City Attorney Sterling Solomon.

### 3. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE, MISSION STATEMENT, AND LAND ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The Council and audience recited the pledge of allegiance, Vice Mayor Aslan read the Mission Statement of the City of Flagstaff, and Councilmember Sweet read the Land Acknowledgement.

#### MISSION STATEMENT

*The mission of the City of Flagstaff is to protect and enhance the quality of life for all.*

#### LAND ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

*The Flagstaff City Council humbly acknowledges the ancestral homelands of this area's Indigenous nations and original stewards. These lands, still inhabited by Native descendants, border mountains sacred to Indigenous peoples. We honor them, their legacies, their traditions, and their continued contributions. We celebrate their past, present, and future generations who will forever know this place as home.*

#### 4. APPROVAL OF MINUTES FROM PREVIOUS MEETINGS

- A. **Consideration and Approval of Minutes:** City Council Regular Meeting of June 7, 2022, Joint City/County Meeting of June 14, 2022, Regular Meeting of June 21, 2022, Work Session of June 28, 2022, Special Meeting of June 29, 2022, Regular Meeting of August 23, 2023, Regular Meeting of September 6, 2022, Regular Meeting of September 20, 2022, Council Retreat of September 29, 2022, Regular Meeting of October 4, 2022, Regular Meeting of October 18, 2022, Regular Meeting of November 1, 2022, Special Meeting (Executive Session) of August 28, 2023, Special Meeting (Executive Session) of September 12, 2023, Special Meeting (Executive Session) of September 19, 2023, Special Meeting (Executive Session) of September 26, 2023, Special Meeting (Executive Session) of October 3, 2023, Special Meeting (Executive Session) of October 10, 2023, Special Meeting (Executive Session) of October 24, 2023, Special Meeting (Executive Session) of November 7, 2023, Special Meeting (Executive Session) of November 14, 2023, and Special Meeting of November 27, 2023.

**Moved by** Councilmember Lori Matthews, **seconded by** Councilmember Khara House to approve the minutes of the City Council Regular Meeting of June 7, 2022, Joint City/County Meeting of June 14, 2022, Regular Meeting of June 21, 2022, Work Session of June 28, 2022, Special Meeting of June 29, 2022, Regular Meeting of August 23, 2023, Regular Meeting of September 6, 2022, Regular Meeting of September 20, 2022, Council Retreat of September 29, 2022, Regular Meeting of October 4, 2022, Regular Meeting of October 18, 2022, Regular Meeting of November 1, 2022, Special Meeting (Executive Session) of August 28, 2023, Special Meeting (Executive Session) of September 12, 2023, Special Meeting (Executive Session) of September 19, 2023, Special Meeting (Executive Session) of September 26, 2023, Special Meeting (Executive Session) of October 3, 2023, Special Meeting (Executive Session) of October 10, 2023, Special Meeting (Executive Session) of October 24, 2023, Special Meeting (Executive Session) of November 7, 2023, Special Meeting (Executive Session) of November 14, 2023, and Special Meeting of November 27, 2023.

**Vote:** 6 - 0 - Unanimously

#### 5. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

*Public Participation enables the public to address the Council about an item that is not on the agenda. Comments relating to items that are on the agenda will be taken at the time that the item is discussed. If you wish to address the Council at tonight's meeting, please complete a comment card and submit it to the recording clerk as soon as possible. Your name will be called when it is your turn to speak. You may address the Council up to three times throughout the meeting, including comments made during Public Participation. Please limit your remarks to three minutes per item to allow everyone an opportunity to speak. At the discretion of the Chair, ten or more persons present at the meeting and wishing to speak may appoint a representative who may have no more than fifteen minutes to speak.*

Nadine Hart addressed Council about challenges with housing and overall cost of living. She requested that families be provided access to city facilities at a discounted rate to assist with access to showering facilities.

Matt Bruton, on behalf of Housing Solutions of Northern Arizona, addressed Council and shared the most recent Housing Attainability Report. The full report could be viewed at [www.housingnaz.org](http://www.housingnaz.org).

#### 6. PROCLAMATIONS AND RECOGNITIONS

##### A. December Work Anniversaries

Deputy City Manager Joanne Keene provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

DECEMBER EMPLOYEE WORK ANNIVERSARIES!  
FIRST YEAR ANNIVERSARIES  
FIVE YEAR ANNIVERSARIES  
TEN YEAR ANNIVERSARIES

TWENTY YEAR ANNIVERSARIES  
TWENTY-FIVE YEAR ANNIVERSARIES

7. **COUNCIL LIAISON REPORTS**

Councilmember Sweet reported that the Beautification and Public Art Commission held a retreat and they would be revealing their new logo in January.

Councilmember House reported that the Housing Commission met earlier that month and introduced their newest commissioner, Kevin Dobbe. They discussed several different programs and initiatives from the Housing Section. The Commission on Diversity Awareness met and received a presentation on a proposed rainbow crosswalk, a presentation on the anti-camping ordinance, and a discussion regarding the future programming of flags.

Vice Mayor Aslan stated that the Tourism Commission did not meet last month as they were going to have their annual retreat in January. He also stated that he attended DBA Executive Director Terry Madeksza's going away party.

Mayor Daggett reported that the Commission on Inclusion and Adaptive Living continued to pursue actions they could help with and how they could push Council and staff toward more enforcement of sidewalks.

8. **APPOINTMENTS**

*Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the City Council and to the general public that the City Council may vote to go into executive session, which will not be open to the public, for the purpose of discussing or considering employment, assignment, appointment, promotion, demotion, dismissal, salaries, disciplining or resignation of a public officer, appointee, or employee of any public body...., pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(1).*

A. **Consideration of Appointments:** Tourism Commission.

**Moved by** Vice Mayor Austin Aslan, **seconded by** Councilmember Khara House to appoint Ellen Jiminez to a term expiring January 2027.

**Vote:** 6 - 0 - Unanimously

**Moved by** Councilmember Khara House, **seconded by** Vice Mayor Austin Aslan to appoint Cody Half-Moon to a term expiring January 2026.

**Vote:** 6 - 0 - Unanimously

**Moved by** Councilmember Miranda Sweet, **seconded by** Councilmember Jim McCarthy to appoint Jamie Thousand to a term expiring January 2025.

**Vote:** 6 - 0 - Unanimously

B. **Consideration of Appointments:** Airport Commission.

Deputy City Clerk Stacy Fobar addressed Council and explained that there was an error regarding the term expiration date that was referenced on the agenda and in the staff report. She requested that the Council reference the correct term expiration of October 2026 when the appointments were made.

**Moved by** Mayor Becky Daggett, **seconded by** Councilmember Miranda Sweet to appoint David Steiner to a term expiring October 2026.

**Vote:** 6 - 0 - Unanimously

**Moved by** Councilmember Khara House, **seconded by** Councilmember Miranda Sweet to appoint Robert Hanovich to a term expiring October 2026.

**Vote:** 6 - 0 - Unanimously

**Moved by** Councilmember Miranda Sweet, **seconded by** Councilmember Jim McCarthy to appoint Kolby White to a term expiring October 2026.

**Vote:** 6 - 0 - Unanimously

**C. Consideration of Appointments:** Indigenous Commission

**Moved by** Councilmember Khara House, **seconded by** Councilmember Lori Matthews to appoint Lauren Kaibetoney to a term expiring December 2026.

**Vote:** 6 - 0 - Unanimously

**Moved by** Councilmember Miranda Sweet, **seconded by** Councilmember Khara House to appoint Linda Curley to an Ex-Officio term for an IPAC member.

**Vote:** 6 - 0 - Unanimously

**Moved by** Mayor Becky Daggett, **seconded by** Councilmember Lori Matthews to appoint Kimberly Hoskie to a term expiring December 2026.

**Vote:** 6 - 0 - Unanimously

**Moved by** Vice Mayor Austin Aslan, **seconded by** Councilmember Jim McCarthy to appoint Marian Marshall to a term expiring December 2026.

**Vote:** 6 - 0 - Unanimously

**D. Consideration of Appointments:** Commission on Diversity Awareness.

**Moved by** Councilmember Miranda Sweet, **seconded by** Councilmember Jim McCarthy to appoint Mandy Martinez Gebler to a term expiring September 2025.

**Vote:** 6 - 0 - Unanimously

**9. CONSENT AGENDA**

*All matters under Consent Agenda are considered by the City Council to be routine. Unless a member of City Council expresses a desire at the meeting to remove an item from the Consent Agenda for discussion, the Consent Agenda will be enacted by one motion approving the recommendations listed on the agenda. Unless otherwise indicated, expenditures approved by Council are budgeted items*

**Moved by** Councilmember Jim McCarthy, **seconded by** Councilmember Lori Matthews to approve the Consent Agenda as presented.

**Vote:** 6 - 0 - Unanimously

**A. Approval of Grant Agreement and Acceptance of Grant Award:** Consideration of a Grant Agreement between the City of Flagstaff and the Arizona Department of Transportation (ADOT) for economic development purposes.

Approve Grant Agreement with the Arizona Department of Transportation (ADOT) and accept the award of an Economic Strengths Projects Grant (ESP) facilitated by the Arizona Commerce Authority (ACA) for \$90,000.00, with a local match of \$10,000.00 (provided by Joy Cone), for improvement of a rail spur on City land.

**B. Consideration and Approval of Contracts: MOONSHOT Master Lease Agreement and MOONSHOT Agreement for Services (as amended and restated)**

Staff recommends approval of the amended and restated MOONSHOT Master Lease Agreement and MOONSHOT Agreement for Services.

**C. Consideration and Approval of Contract: Ratification and Approval of a Cooperative Purchase Contract with JE Fuller Hydrology & Geomorphology, Inc. in the amount of \$257,489.00, in addition to taxes and other charges, to continue the Upper Lake Mary Watershed Monitoring Project.**

1. Ratification and Approval of a Cooperative Purchase Contract with JE Fuller Hydrology & Geomorphology, Inc. in the amount of \$257,489.00, in addition to taxes and other charges, to continue the Upper Lake Mary Watershed Monitoring Project; and
2. Authorize the City Manager to execute the necessary documents.

**D. Consideration and Approval of Contract: Contract for the Purchase of Materials/Services with Babbitt Ford Lincoln, LLC in the amount of \$64,170.40, plus other fees and taxes, for the purchase of one 2023 Hybrid Ford F-150 for the Streets Section.**

1. Approve the Contract for Purchase of Materials/Services with Babbitt Ford Lincoln, LLC in the amount of \$64,170.40, plus other fees and taxes, for the purchase of one 2023 Hybrid Ford F-150 for the Streets Section; and
2. Authorize the City Manager to execute the necessary documents.

**E. Consideration and Approval of Contract: Approve the Cooperative Purchase Contract with Weatherproofing Technologies, Inc. the amount of \$118,266.78 to Repair a section of the City Hall Roof.**

1. Approve the Cooperative Purchase Contract with Weatherproofing Technologies Inc. the amount of \$118,266.78 to Repair a section of the City Hall Roof; and
2. Authorize the City Manager to execute the necessary documents.

**F. Consideration and Approval of Contract: Cooperative Purchase Contract with AZ Wastewater Industries, Inc. in the amount of \$589,799.99, plus other fees and taxes, for one 12 Yard Truck Mounted Sewer Combination Cleaner for the Wastewater Collection Section.**

1. Request approval of a Cooperative Purchase Contract with AZ Wastewater Industries, Inc. in the amount of \$589,799.99, plus other fees and taxes, for one 12 Yard Truck Mounted Sewer Combination Cleaner for the Wastewater Collection Section; and
2. Authorize the City Manager to execute all necessary documents.

**G. Consideration and Approval of Contract: First Amendment to the Cooperative Purchase Contract with MGT of America, LLC to add Cost Allocation Services in the amount of \$46,300 for a total contract award of \$85,490 for Audit and Consulting Services.**

1. Approve the First Amendment to the Cooperative Purchase Contract with MGT of America, LLC to add Cost Allocation Services in the amount of \$46,300 for a total contract award of \$85,490 for Audit and Consulting Services; and
2. Authorize the City Manager to execute the necessary documents.

- H. **Consideration and Approval of Amendment:** Amendment to the Reimbursement Agreement Between Coconino County and the City of Flagstaff for Flagstaff Regional Plan 2045 Project to add funding for the project in this fiscal year and terms of carrying funds to the next fiscal year as needed.

Approve the Amendment to the Reimbursement Agreement Between Coconino County and the City of Flagstaff for Flagstaff Regional Plan 2045 Project

- I. **Consideration and Approval of Contract:** Grazing Lease on Arizona State Land Department Lands within Red Gap Ranch

1. Approve the Grazing Lease with the Arizona State Land Department
2. Authorize the City Manager to execute the necessary documents

- J. **Consideration and Approval of Contract:** Approve the First Amendment to the Cooperative Purchase Contract with GovernmentJobs.com, DBA NEOGOV (NEOGOV), in the amount of \$128,932.80 to add HR New Hire On-Boarding Services.

1. Approve the First Amendment to the Cooperative Purchase Contract with NEOGOV, in the amount of \$128,932.80 to add HR New Hire On-Boarding Services; and
2. Authorize the City Manager to execute the necessary documents.

## 10. **ROUTINE ITEMS**

- A. **Consideration and Adoption of Resolution No. 2023-66 and Ordinance No. 2023-31:** A resolution of the Flagstaff City Council declaring as a public record that certain document filed with the City Clerk and entitled "PZ-23-00094 Updates to City Code - Property Care Standards and Abandoned Vehicles" and an ordinance of the City Council of the City of Flagstaff amending the Flagstaff City Code, Title 7, Health and Sanitation and Title 6 Police Regulations by adopting by reference that certain document entitled "PZ-23-00094 Updates to City Code - Property Care Standards and Abandoned Vehicles"

Community Development Director Dan Folke addressed Council and stated that there had been some concern about the reference to trash containers being secured to a property. Staff reevaluated and had included an amendment for the second read and adoption of the ordinance. The new sentence read "containers shall be maintained in good working condition to allow for proper closure to prevent blowing trash and access by animals." They felt it better described the purpose of the requirement.

**Moved by** Councilmember Lori Matthews, **seconded by** Councilmember Jim McCarthy to adopt Resolution No. 2023-66.

**Vote:** 6 - 0 - Unanimously

**Moved by** Councilmember Khara House, **seconded by** Councilmember Lori Matthews to read Ordinance No. 2023-31 by title only for the final time.

**Vote:** 6 - 0 - Unanimously

*AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF FLAGSTAFF, AMENDING THE FLAGSTAFF CITY CODE, TITLE 7, HEALTH AND SANITATION AND TITLE 6, POLICE REGULATIONS BY ADOPTING BY REFERENCE THAT CERTAIN DOCUMENT ENTITLED "PZ-23-00094 UPDATES TO CITY CODE - PROPERTY CARE STANDARDS AND ABANDONED VEHICLES"; PROVIDING FOR PENALTIES, REPEAL OF CONFLICTING ORDINANCES, SEVERABILITY, AND ESTABLISHING AN EFFECTIVE DATE AS AMENDED*

**Moved by Councilmember Jim McCarthy, seconded by Councilmember Miranda Sweet** to adopt Ordinance No. 2023-31.

**Vote:** 6 - 0 - Unanimously

- B. Consideration and Adoption of Ordinance No. 2023-30:** An ordinance amending the Flagstaff City Code, Chapter 1-14, Personnel System by amending the Employee Handbook of Regulations, Section 1-50-010 Holiday Leave; providing for repeal of conflicting ordinances; severability; and establishing an effective date.

**Moved by Councilmember Lori Matthews, seconded by Councilmember Khara House** to read Ordinance No. 2023-30 by title only for the final time.

**Vote:** 6 - 0 - Unanimously

*AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF FLAGSTAFF, AMENDING THE FLAGSTAFF CITY CODE, CHAPTER 1-14, PERSONNEL SYSTEM, BY AMENDING THE EMPLOYEE HANDBOOK OF REGULATIONS, SECTION 1-50-010, HOLIDAY LEAVE; PROVIDING FOR REPEAL OF CONFLICTING ORDINANCES, SEVERABILITY, AUTHORITY FOR CLERICAL CORRECTIONS, AND ESTABLISHING AN EFFECTIVE DATE*

**Moved by Councilmember Miranda Sweet, seconded by Councilmember Khara House** to adopt Ordinance No. 2023-30.

**Vote:** 6 - 0 - Unanimously

- C. Consideration and Approval of Cooperative Contract:** A Cooperative Purchasing Agreement with Invoice Cloud, Inc. to provide an electronic payment acceptance solution in an amount not to exceed \$140,000, annually for five years, utilizing the City of Chandler Cooperative Purchase Contract.

Management Services Director Rick Tadder and Customer Service Manager Jessica Kittleson provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

INVOICE CLOUD CONTRACT PRESENTATION  
INVOICE CLOUD  
INVOICE CLOUD EXPERIENCE  
INVOICE CLOUD DIFFERENTIATORS  
SCREENSHOT OF TEXT TO PAY  
EASE OF USE FOR STAFF TO INITIATE TEXT NOTIFICATION  
INVOICE CLOUD DIGITAL ENGAGEMENT  
DIGITALIZING OUTBOUND COMMUNICATIONS  
ONGOING ENHANCEMENTS  
CREDIT CARD FEES  
CURRENT MODEL  
PROPOSED MODEL  
COMPARISON OF MODELS  
PROJECTED COST  
PROPOSED FEE MODEL  
MUNICIPAL BILLS  
CONVENIENCE MODEL  
PREVIOUS DIRECTION

Councilmember Matthews stated that she was happy to see more convenient ways for people to pay. She stated that she had a cap on her electronic payment in case there was a water line break. She asked if the cap would still be available to customers. Mr. Tadder stated that it would remain.

Councilmember House commented on the terminology that was used. She noted that transaction fee may be better received than a convenience fee, since people do not see the paying of their bill as a

convenience. Mr. Tadder stated that it was a good point and the system was able to personalize as desired.

**Moved by** Councilmember Khara House, **seconded by** Councilmember Lori Matthews to approve the Cooperative Purchasing Agreement with Invoice Cloud, Inc. to provide an electronic payment acceptance solution in an amount not to exceed \$140,000, annually for five years, utilizing the City of Chandler Cooperative Purchase Contract and authorize the City Manager to execute the necessary documents.

**Vote:** 6 - 0 - Unanimously

## 11. REGULAR AGENDA

- A. Consideration and Adoption of Resolution No. 2023-67:** A resolution of the Flagstaff City Council, approving the amendment of the Intergovernmental Agreement between Coconino County, the Coconino County Jail District, and the City of Flagstaff for the purpose of formalizing and clarifying the responsibilities of each of the parties with regard to insuring the facility and its contents

Police Chief Dan Musselman addressed Council and stated that the Intergovernmental Agreement would formalize the responsibilities with regard to insuring the joint property at 911 Sawmill Road. The city would carry the coverage and the proportional share of the other agencies would be paid to the city.

**Moved by** Councilmember Khara House, **seconded by** Councilmember Miranda Sweet to read Resolution No. 2023-67 by title only.

**Vote:** 6 - 0 - Unanimously

*A RESOLUTION OF THE FLAGSTAFF CITY COUNCIL, APPROVING AN AMENDMENT TO THE INTERGOVERNMENTAL AGREEMENT BETWEEN COCONINO COUNTY AND THE CITY OF FLAGSTAFF FOR THE PURPOSE OF FORMALIZING AND CLARIFYING THE RESPONSIBILITIES OF EACH OF THE PARTIES WITH REGARD TO INSURING THE FACILITY AND ITS CONTENTS*

**Moved by** Councilmember Miranda Sweet, **seconded by** Councilmember Lori Matthews to adopt Resolution No. 2023-67.

**Vote:** 6 - 0 - Unanimously

- B. Consideration and Approval of a Relocation Benefit Purchase:** Purchase of a ready mix (cement) batch plant for Arizona Materials as a result of being displaced by the Lone Tree Overpass Project

Senior Assistant City Attorney Anja Wendel provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

PURCHASE OF BATCH PLANT  
 RELOCATION BENEFIT FOR DISPLACED BUSINESS -- ARIZONA MATERIALS  
 PURCHASE OF BATCH PLANT  
 BACKGROUND  
 AZM PROPERTY -- RDF & LTO PROJECTS  
 RELOCATION BENEFITS FOR LTO & RDF PROJECTS  
 UNIFORM RELOCATION ACT BENEFITS FOR DISPLACED BUSINESS  
 WHY IS CITY PURCHASING A BATCH PLANT?  
 HOW WAS THE VENDOR SELECTED?  
 PURCHASE CONTRACT  
 NEXT STEPS

Councilmember House asked if there was a current facility at the new address they would take over. Ms. Wendel explained that it was vacant land and they would have to build a new facility.

Councilmember House asked if there would be an impact to the business operations. Ms. Wendel stated that they would be required to obtain CUP and any impact to their operations would be addressed as part of that process.

Vice Mayor Aslan stated that the Rio de Flag project should move forward and he was supportive so long as the business was not negatively impacted and made whole. The important thing was that the project did not get slowed down.

Mayor Daggett stated that the relocations and projects were all part of the process, and it was important for the Rio de Flag project to move forward. She also noted the importance of making the transition as smooth as possible for the affected party.

**Moved by** Councilmember Jim McCarthy, **seconded by** Councilmember Khara House to approve purchase of a Con-E-Co Lo-Pro Model Concrete Plant from Dave Humphreys, Inc., in an amount not to exceed \$2.5 million, and authorize the City Attorney and Procurement Director to approve the final form of contract.

**Vote:** 6 - 0 - Unanimously

- C. **Consideration and Adoption of Ordinance No. 2024-01:** An ordinance of the Flagstaff City Council authorizing the acquisition of real property interests for a Flagstaff Urban Trail System alongside the Rio de Flag Flood Control Project; providing for delegation of authority, repeal of conflicting ordinances, severability, corrections, and establishing an effective date

Transportation Planner Martin Ince addressed Council and explained that the ordinance would authorize property rights for two planned FUTS trails along the Rio de Flag project. Both trails were located south of the tracks, one extended from La Plaza Vieja to Railroad Springs and beyond, and the second followed the Rio from Southside to Country Club. The trails were part of the Regional Plan. Staff had already met with one of the property owners on the trail to the east to address concerns and explore solutions. Mr. Ince explained that the ordinance would not bypass the acquisition process of meeting and negotiating with property owners, it would only provide the authority to obtain those property rights once agreed to with the owners.

Councilmember McCarthy asked about the reference to condemnation in the ordinance and whether that would require separate approval by Council. Senior Assistant City Attorney Anja Wendel explained that the ordinance used a standard form that authorized acquisition by any means necessary, however the ordinance specifically stated that Council had to take a separate action should condemnation be recommended. Mr. Clifton added that there was diligent effort to acquire properties through amicable negotiations and that was most often the case.

Property owner Mike Clifton addressed Council and expressed concerns about the trail that ran directly behind his property. The concerns focused primarily on access to their business and other businesses who rented space on the property. He recommended a different alignment that would not impact his property that included a bridge over the Rio de Flag. He expressed a desire to continue discussions with the city to find a resolution.

Vice Mayor Aslan asked about the alternate alignment that was proposed. Mr. Ince stated that staff would continue their discussions with the property owner and evaluate the proposal along with other possible alignments as part of the discussion and negotiation process.

Mayor Daggett stated that she would support the first read of the ordinance with the understanding that the critical decisions were later in the process. She would like to understand what options might be available to find solutions for all parties. Councilmember McCarthy added that the ordinance started the negotiation process and there was plenty of time to identify and review options.

Written comment cards in opposition to the ordinance were submitted by the following individuals:

- Mike Clifton
- Justin Clifton

- Norma Jean Clifton

**Moved by** Councilmember Jim McCarthy, **seconded by** Councilmember Miranda Sweet to read Ordinance No. 2024-01 by title only for the first time.

**Vote:** 6 - 0 - Unanimously

*AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF FLAGSTAFF AUTHORIZING THE ACQUISITION OF REAL PROPERTY INTERESTS FOR A FLAGSTAFF URBAN TRAIL SYSTEM ALONGSIDE THE RIO DE FLAG FLOOD CONTROL PROJECT; PROVIDING FOR DELEGATION OF AUTHORITY, REPEAL OF CONFLICTING ORDINANCES, SEVERABILITY, CLERICAL CORRECTIONS, AND ESTABLISHING AN EFFECTIVE DATE*

**D. Consideration and Adoption of Resolution No. 2023-68:** A resolution adopting the City Council 2024 Commemorative Flag Designations

City Clerk Stacy Saltzburg reviewed the submissions for modifications to the commemorative flags for 2024.

Following discussion, the Council set the following designations for 2024:

Month	Commemorative Flag(s)	Dates of Display
January	Human Trafficking Awareness	January 1 -- 31
February	Black History Month	February 1 -- 28
March	Women's History Month Transgender Visibility	March 1 -- 16 March 17 -- 31
April	Earth Day	April 1 -- 30
May	Armed Forces Day	May 1 -- 31
June	LGBTQIA+ Month	June 1 -- 30
July	Tree City USA	July 1 -- 31
August	Purple Heart Day Ukraine Independence Day	August 1 -- 31 August 24
September	United Nations Climate Change Hispanic Heritage Month	September 1 -- 15 September 16 -- 30
October	National Domestic Violence Awareness Month	October 1 -- 31
November	Native American Heritage Month	November 1 -- 30
December	World AIDS Day	December 1 -- 31

**Moved by** Councilmember Lori Matthews, **seconded by** Vice Mayor Austin Aslan to read Resolution No. 2023-68 by title only.

**Vote:** 6 - 0 - Unanimously

*A RESOLUTION OF THE FLAGSTAFF CITY COUNCIL (PURSUANT TO THE CITY COUNCIL*

*POLICY ON THE DISPLAY OF FLAGS) DESIGNATING ALL COMMEMORATIVE FLAGS THAT WILL BE DISPLAYED THROUGHOUT THE YEAR 2024 ON THE TEMPORARY POLE IN FRONT OF CITY HALL*

**Moved by** Councilmember Lori Matthews, **seconded by** Councilmember Khara House to adopt Resolution No. 2023-68

**Vote:** 6 - 0 - Unanimously

## 12. DISCUSSION ITEMS

### A. **Presentation regarding funding allocations for Homeless Shelter and Services Funds**

Housing and Grants Administrator Kristine Pavlik provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

HOMELESS SHELTER AND SERVICES FUNDS ALLOCATION RECOMMENDATIONS  
HOMELESS SHELTER & SERVICES  
SUBMITTED APPLICATIONS  
FUNDING RECOMMENDATIONS

Councilmember McCarthy stated that Flagstaff Shelter Services provided the most bed nights, yet they were recommended for funding at a third of what they requested. He found that interesting and thought they should have scored much higher.

Ms. Pavlik explained that the ranking committee provided feedback that indicated that they felt other organizations offered unique services, such as Homeless Youth Connection, which supported 18 to 21-year-olds, a demographic not necessarily catered to by other agencies like Flagstaff Shelter Services. They emphasized the importance of providing services in addition to emergency shelter, especially to those experiencing homelessness but not necessarily seeking shelter. While bed nights and the number of individuals impacted are considered, the committee also considered community impact and unique programming when scoring the applications.

Councilmember House noted that one of the challenges that she had while reviewing the recommendation was not being fully aware of the process of how projects were scored and what the ranking was considering. It would be helpful to be able to see the criteria before making the decision. She also stated that she was struggling with the idea of fully funding the top three and then splitting the remainder in a way that does not necessarily match up to the number of people served. She felt that if none of them would be fully funded, then the remaining funds should be split equally.

Ms. Pavlik stated that there was a very quick turnaround associated with the evaluation process because the funds needed to be allocated and spent before the end of the fiscal year. Council could direct staff to allocate different amounts if desired.

Councilmember Matthews stated that she would like to see the rankings and applications.

Councilmember Sweet also noted that she was struggling with the recommendations and how things were ranked.

Vice Mayor Aslan stated that the rankings were generally the same with nothing significant between them. It did not make sense that Flagstaff Shelter Services received less than their request when they were the biggest provider in the community. He supported full funding to Flagstaff Shelter Services. He also expressed a desire to see the evaluation rubric and application materials.

Assistant Housing Director Justyna Costa offered that staff could return with a presentation on the rankings before the contracts were presented to Council for approval.

**B. Discussion of Fee for Public Use of City-Owned Electric Vehicle Charging Stations**

Climate Analyst Denae Presler provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

DISCUSSION OF FEE FOR PUBLIC USE OF CITY-OWNED ELECTRIC VEHICLE CHARGING STATIONS  
TODAY'S TOPICS  
OVERVIEW OF CITY-OWNED PUBLIC CHARGERS  
BENEFITS OF PROVIDING PUBLIC CHARGING  
INITIAL OPERATIONAL COST OF PROVIDING PUBLIC CHARGING  
FLEXIBILITY IN SETTING FEES  
FEE SCENARIOS  
FEE SCENARIOS: STATUS QUO  
FEE SCENARIOS: COST RECOVERY  
FEE SCENARIOS: COST RECOVERY + ENCOURAGE BEHAVIOR  
FEE SCENARIOS  
LEVELS OF COST RECOVERY  
NEXT STEPS  
SEEKING COUNCIL DIRECTION  
COST RECOVERY...

Councilmember Matthews asked about the life expectancy for charging stations. Ms. Presler stated that the average lifespan was ten years, but they had been shown to last longer.

Councilmember Mathews asked about the Green Power Partnership Program. Sustainability Director Nicole Antonopoulos stated that the program allowed the city to purchase clean energy credits to ensure that the clean energy systems were kept in functioning order. It was a surcharge to indicate the use of clean energy.

Mayor Daggett asked if the app alerted drivers when they were nearing a full charge. Ms. Presler stated that the driver would receive a notification when their vehicle was nearly full and then slow the charging for safety purposes.

Councilmember McCarthy stated that he supported Option C. He proposed a soft opening with a phased approach to get to full cost recovery.

Vice Mayor Aslan also supported Option C. He stated that incentivizing vehicle movement out of the charging stations when charging was complete would be an important consideration.

Councilmember House also preferred Option C. She suggested a fee structure that would discourage long term use like what was seen at the airport.

Councilmember Sweet and Mayor Daggett both expressed support for Option C.

A majority of Council supported Option A for cost recovery.

A break was held from 6:07 p.m. through 6:17 p.m.

**C. Moving the Needle on City Climate and Housing Goals**

Sustainability Director Nicole Antonopoulos, Community Development Director Dan Folke, Engineering Director Paul Mood, Planning Director Michelle McNulty, Assistant Housing Director Justyna Costa, and Sustainability Analyst Genevieve Pearthree provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

MOVING THE NEEDLE  
DISCUSSION  
BACKGROUND INFORMATION

THE CARBON NEUTRALITY PLAN  
 THE 10-YEAR HOUSING PLAN  
 THE CHALLENGE  
 THE SOLUTION  
 ASSESSING CURRENT CONDITIONS  
 THE APPROACH  
 LOOKING AHEAD  
 HIGH LEVEL REVIEW OF PLANNED EFFORTS  
 HIGHLIGHTS FOR HOUSING WORK PROGRAM  
 HIGHLIGHTS FOR BUILDING CODE UPDATE  
 HIGHLIGHT FOR CLIMATE ACTION  
 HIGHLIGHTS FOR ENGINEERING STANDARDS UPDATE

Councilmember Matthews asked if there was a projection of how many EV charging stations would be needed over the next five to ten years. Ms. Pearthree stated that the current building code had the requirement that all new construction be EV ready. The idea was that if there was demand the property owner could install as they felt necessary.

HIGHLIGHTS OF PLANNING UPDATES  
 REGIONAL PLAN/LASS+CAP TOUCHPOINTS

Council thanked staff for the report and the integration of the two declared emergencies.

### 13. FUTURE AGENDA ITEM REQUESTS

*After discussion and upon agreement by three members of the Council, an item will be moved to a regularly-scheduled Council meeting.*

#### A. Future Agenda Item Request (F.A.I.R.): A Citizens' Petition titled ICAN Cities Appeal: A global call for the City of Flagstaff to support the UN Treaty on the Prohibition of Nuclear Weapons

Ms. Saltzburg addressed Council and stated that in August of 2022 the prior Council received a very similar citizen petition seeking a resolution in support of the Back from the Brink Campaign which also called for the elimination of nuclear weapons. The Council at that time did not advance the citizen petition.

William Head addressed Council in support of the petition. He stated that nuclear weapons threaten communities and that 73 other cities had signed onto the international campaign.

Councilmember Matthews stated that she did not support the advancement of the petition because the ban of nuclear weapons could leave the United States vulnerable to other nations.

Vice Mayor Aslan stated that he supported the petition. It showed solidarity to a cause and he would like to understand more of what it entailed.

Councilmember House agreed and supported the advancement of the petition.

Mayor Daggett agreed that it was a noble effort however she was concerned about the many other things that were on staff's plate. She supported the advancement of the petition so long as it did not take staff time.

Mr. Clifton asked that staff time not be spent on the matter, if there was a document available the Chief of Staff or Council could identify it. Mr. Solomon added that there would need to be legal review and an Executive Session prior to the matter being placed on an agenda for action.

There was requisite Council support to advance the item to a future agenda for discussion.

**B. Future Agenda Item Request (F.A.I.R.): A Citizens' Petition titled Add Fluoride to City Drinking Water**

Ms. Saltzburg addressed Council and provided a brief history on the topic of fluoride. It had been a topic that had been wrestled with by the city for decades with significant public input. In 1954 the Council placed a question on the ballot regarding fluoride which was not passed. The matter came up again in the late 1960's where Council, on two different occasions, voted to not put fluoride in the water. In 1974 the Council passed an ordinance to add fluoride to the water and that ordinance was later repealed by the Council in 1978. Finally, in April 2001 the Council passed an ordinance to add fluoride to the city water system. As a result, a referendum was started and was successful in placing the ordinance on the November 2001 ballot. The ordinance was not approved by voters.

Kyle Nitschke addressed Council in support of advancing the petition. He spoke about the benefits of fluoride for kids. Coconino County had the highest level of tooth decay in children.

Vice Mayor Aslan stated that he was surprised to learn that there was not fluoride in the city's drinking water. The issue was a public health concern, and it was something that the city had the ability to provide. He supported the advancement of the petition to a future agenda for discussion.

Councilmember Matthews noted that there were many people against the addition of fluoride in the water. There had been concerns about the negative health issues related to fluoride. She did not support advancing the petition.

Mayor Daggett stated that if fluoride was something that public health officials were desiring, she would prefer to have a recommendation from the Coconino County Health Department before advancing the matter further.

There was not requisite Council support to advance the item to a future agenda for discussion.

**14. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION**

Dennis Givens addressed Council about parking. He was concerned about students parking in parts of the Southside neighborhood and the challenges that created with buses and emergency vehicles.

**15. INFORMATIONAL ITEMS TO/FROM MAYOR, COUNCIL, AND STAFF, AND FUTURE AGENDA ITEM REQUESTS**

Councilmember Sweet requested a FAIR item to discuss commission member eligibility when receiving city funding. She also stated that she would be attending the Longest Night Memorial to honor those who passed in 2023 while experiencing homelessness. She wished everyone Happy Holidays and a Happy New Year.

Councilmember House also noted that she would be attending the Longest Night Memorial. She requested a FAIR to consider establishing a reporting structure or engagement strategy for board and commission updates to Council.

Mayor Daggett reported that Flagstaff had been awarded \$9.6 million from the Bipartisan Infrastructure Bill which would help complete the bike and ped facilities on Butler up to Sawmill. She thanked Senators Sinema and Kelly for their help in obtaining the funding. She noted that Flagstaff had received \$58 million to date from the Bipartisan Infrastructure Bill and were advancing exciting infrastructure projects because of it.

Mr. Solomon offered congratulations to the Council on completing their first year of their new terms.

16. **ADJOURNMENT**

The Regular Meeting of the Flagstaff City Council held December 19, 2023, adjourned at 7:32 p.m.

\_\_\_\_\_  
MAYOR

ATTEST:

\_\_\_\_\_  
CITY CLERK

**CERTIFICATION**

I, STACY SALTZBURG, do hereby certify that I am the City Clerk of the City of Flagstaff, County of Coconino, State of Arizona, and that the above Minutes are a true and correct summary of the Meeting of the Council of the City of Flagstaff held on December 19, 2023. I further certify that the Meeting was duly called and held and that a quorum was present.

DATED this 1st day of October, 2024

\_\_\_\_\_  
CITY CLERK