



COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

MEMORANDUM

Date: 1/9/2024

To: Heritage Preservation Commission

From: Mark Reavis, HPO, AICP, NCARB

**Subject: Peris House Proposed Demolition 605 W Riordan Road
Cultural Resource Study, Phase 1 - PZ-23-00239**

REQUEST

This is a request by the landowner and their consultants, in this case JLL commissioning a Cultural Resource Study on behalf of Chick-fil-A for the review and acceptance of the submitted Phase 1 Cultural Resource Study (CRS) with included mitigation as full compliance provided by the CRS and stated mitigation.

Cultural Resource Professionals: The Study was prepared by Cornerstone Environmental Consultation LLC of Flagstaff, AZ, a qualified Cultural Resource consultant that meets the US Secretary of the Interior Professional Standards.

BACKGROUND & Discussion

This is a proposed demolition of a historic residential home later converted to commercial uses commonly known historically as the Peris Home (Salvador & Florence Peris), a home and persons with significant ties to Riordan Mansion and the Arizona Lumber and Timber Company. The demolition is to include the home, a west addition (semi-attached open side structure (later enclosed) and a back garage/storage building. The site is planned for redevelopment as a parking lot to support a Chick-fil-A restaurant across from the home on Riordan Road & Milton. The new parking lot development requires a cleared site with the removal of all the existing structures for grading and construction of the parking lot and required permitter landscaping.

As one of a few surviving residential structures associated with the Arizona Lumber and Timber Company and the direct association with a well-known and beloved employee of the Riordan's, the HPO concluded that a Phase 1 Cultural Resource Study was required and should include commensurate mitigation for the loss of the home as well as its association with Riordan State Park, a facility representing Flagstaff's lumber industry.

10-30.30.050.D Cultural Resources of Flagstaff's Municipal Zoning Code describes what constitutes a major impact to Cultural Resources. Impacts to resources are major when they "directly or indirectly alter or destroy any of the characteristics that make the resource significant, including when they may diminish the integrity of the resource including its location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling or association." Direct impacts in this case are demolition of the buildings and context on the property. Indirect impacts from the demolition of the Peris house are the loss of one of the stops on an established walking tour conducted by Riordan State Park and an indirect impact on the Riordan Mansion, a facility of State Historic Significance.

When potential demolition was proposed, the HPO discussed the condition of the property and the potential for preservation with the property owner, the developer's representatives, and Riordan State Park. Alternatives, which were discussed included relocation of the home to Riordan State Park, but no viable option for preservation was found. In recent years, the primary building has had various tenants. The property owner has indicated that conditions of the property and costs to rehabilitate has made it difficult to retain tenants. The property is currently vacant with no tenant. The owner plans to retain the land parcel and provide a long-term lease to Chick-fil-A.

Photo documentation in the report documents the condition of the property on both the exterior and interiors. Though the exterior retains many aspects of the historic home the interior has no remaining aspects of residential interior walls, ceilings, or floors. In recent years properties surrounding this parcel have redeveloped as commercial and residential to support the nearby University impacting the Riordan Mansion's historic context. Redevelopment in the area has had a continuing progressive effect upon the loss of historic context for the State Park.

The submitted Phase 1 Cultural Resource Study includes recommended mitigation to be installed at the Peris House site for the mitigation of direct impacts. The submitted Cultural Resource Study provides sufficient documentation of the primary house, its attached back addition, and the detached garage structure. It also includes mitigation submitted by the consultant on behalf of the developer and applicant. The mitigation proposed does not include indirect effects to Riordan Mansion State Park.

Peris House & Riordan Mansion Mitigation Meeting

A ZOOM meeting was held on December 22, 2023 with Mark Reavis (Historic Preservation Officer for the City of Flagstaff), Josh Edwards (Cornerstone Environmental), Nikki Lober (Park Manager at Riordan Mansion State Historic Park), David Portree (Archivist at Riordan Mansion State Historic Park), and Maggie Nuckols (representing the developer and applicant, Chick-fil-A).

The meeting was to discuss mitigation measures for the Peris House project per the Flagstaff Zoning Code (10-30.30.050) for direct and indirect impacts to Heritage properties.

Demolition of the Peris House will remove a cultural resource that has been part of the community's cultural landscape for over a century. It is the most significant building in the city that is associated with the life of Salvador Peris and is currently a stop on Riordan Mansion State Historic Park interpretive tours. In addition, the Peris House represents Arizona Lumber & Timber Company worker's housing, which has become very rare, and the building's direct relationship with Riordan Mansion elevates the need for appropriate mitigation.

Initial discussions with the Chick-fil-A representative included recommendations for mitigation to the indirect adverse impacts of the demolition of the Peris House including the funding, creation, and installation of two plaques, one at the Peris house site and one at the Riordan Mansion entrance. The plaque at the former site of the Peris House would focus on Salvador Peris and his association with the AL&T. The second plaque would be placed at the pedestrian entrance to Riordan Mansion State Historic Park, in a location chosen by Riordan Mansion State Historic Park personnel who will create the text for the second plaque, organize its production with a plaque manufacturer, and orchestrate its installation. Also discussed was an attempt to repurpose as much building's salvageable material as possible.

The final submission of the Phase 1 Cultural Resource Study (CRS) with mitigation only included the Paris House Plaque. The submitted CRS does not address indirect impacts to Riordan State Park, a facility with State Significance and its history and association with Arizona Lumber & Timber Company's lumber history and the development of Flagstaff.

Recommendation

It is recommended by the HPO that a mitigation plaque meet the following specification "or equal" that can be obtained by various plaque manufactures.

PLAQUE SPECIFICATIONS:

- Approximately 20" x 24" anodized aluminum plaque with frame and backing plate, bracket and post.
- Plaques to have approximately 250 words of text and 2 to 3 historic photos integrated with the text.
- The Peris House plaque will be placed in a highly visible and publicly accessible area oriented toward the sidewalk.

The HPO does not recommend a Phase 2 Cultural Resource Study with the recordation being sufficient. Phase 1 research and recordation with commensurate mitigation as being the most valuable in reducing major impacts to Cultural Resources both direct and indirect impacts. The Heritage Preservation Commission may condition approval of additional mitigation for indirect impacts to related Heritage Resources.