



COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

MEMORANDUM

Date: 2/12/2024

To: Heritage Preservation Commission

From: Mark Reavis, HPO, AICP, NCARB

**Subject: Peris House Proposed Demolition 605 W Riordan Road
Cultural Resource Study, Phase 1 - PZ-23-00239**

REQUEST

This is a second request by the landowner and their consultants, in this case JLL commissioning a Cultural Resource Study on behalf of Chick-fil-A for the review and acceptance of a submitted and revised Phase 1 Cultural Resource Study (CRS) with included mitigation for both direct and indirect effects with the demolition of the Peris House as full compliance provided by the Cultural Resource Study and stated mitigation.

Cultural Resource Professionals: The Study was prepared by Cornerstone Environmental Consultation LLC of Flagstaff, AZ, a qualified Cultural Resource consultant that meets the US Secretary of the Interior Professional Standards.

BACKGROUND & Discussion

This is a proposed demolition of a historic residential home later converted to commercial uses commonly known historically as the Peris Home (Salvador & Florence Peris), a home and persons with significant ties to Riordan Mansion and the Arizona Lumber and Timber Company. The demolition is to include the home, a west addition (semi-attached open side structure (later enclosed) and a back garage/storage building. The site is planned for redevelopment as a parking lot to support a Chick-fil-A restaurant across from the home on Riordan Road & Milton. The new parking lot development requires a cleared site with the removal of all the existing structures for grading and construction of the parking lot and required perimeter landscaping.

As one of a few surviving residential structures associated with the Arizona Lumber and Timber Company and "Mill Town" with a direct association with a well-known and beloved employee of the Riordan's, the HPO concluded that a Phase 1 Cultural Resource Study was required and should include commensurate mitigation for the loss of the home as well as its association with

Riordan State Park, a facility representing Flagstaff's lumber industry. The demolition of the Peris house property will result in the loss of one of the stops on an established walking tour conducted by Riordan State Park and is an indirect impact on the Riordan Mansion a facility of State Historic Significance.

The HPO discussed the condition of the property and the potential for preservation with the property owner (SH Flagstaff Holdings, LLC (Ryan Schubert)), the developer's representatives, and Riordan State Park. Alternatives were discussed that included relocation of the home to Riordan State Park, but no viable option was found. In recent years the primary building has had various tenants. The property owner has indicated that conditions of the property and costs to rehabilitate has made it difficult to retain tenants. The property is currently vacant with no tenant. The owner plans to retain the land parcel and provide a long-term lease to Chick-fil-A.

Photo documentation in the report does document the condition of the property on both the exterior and interiors. Though the exterior retains many aspects of the historic home the interior has no remaining aspects of residential interior walls, ceilings, or floors. In recent years properties surrounding this parcel have redeveloped as commercial and residential to support the nearby University impacting the Riordan Mansion's historic context. Redevelopment in the area has had a continuing progressive effect upon the loss of historic context for the State Park.

The previously submitted Phase 1 Cultural Resource Study reviewed by the Heritage Preservation Commission included recommended mitigation in the form of an interpretive plaque to be installed at the Peris House site. Though the previously submitted Cultural Resource Study provides documentation of the primary house, back addition, and the detached garage structures it only included mitigation for the Peris house (submitted by the consultant on behalf of the developer and applicant Chick-fil-A). 10-30.30.050 Cultural Resources of Flagstaff's Municipal Zoning Code (D) calls out determination of major impacts to Cultural Resources. Impacts to resources are major when they directly or indirectly alter or destroy any of the characteristics that make the resource significant, including when they may diminish the integrity of the resource including its location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling or association. The mitigation proposed did not include indirect effects to Riordan Mansion State Park. For these and other related reasons additional mitigation was proposed by the HPO for consideration by the Heritage Preservation Commission for indirect effects. Previous recommendations included a second plaque matching the Peris House plaque for placement at the entrance to Riordan State Park. Due in part to not providing indirect mitigation and consideration of public testimony the HPC did not accept the Cultural resource Study.

Peris House & Riordan Mansion Mitigation Meeting

A ZOOM meeting was held on December 22, 2023 with Mark Reavis (Historic Preservation Officer for the City of Flagstaff), Josh Edwards (Cornerstone Environmental), Nikki Lober (Park Manager at Riordan Mansion State Historic Park), David Portree (Archivist at Riordan Mansion State Historic Park), and Maggie Nuckols (representing the developer and applicant, Chick-fil-A).

The meeting was to discuss mitigation measures for the Peris House project per the Flagstaff Zoning Code (10-30.30.050) for direct and indirect impacts to Heritage properties.

Demolition of the Peris House will remove a cultural resource that has been part of the community's cultural landscape for over a century. It is the most significant building in the city that is associated with the life of Salvador Peris and is currently a stop on Riordan Mansion State Historic Park interpretive tours. In addition, the Peris House represents Arizona Lumber & Timber Company worker's housing, which has become very rare, and the building's direct relationship with Riordan Mansion elevates the need for appropriate mitigation.

Initial discussions with the Chick-fil-A representative included recommendations for mitigation to the indirect adverse impacts of the demolition of the Peris House including the funding, creation, and installation of two plaques, one at the Peris house site and one at the Riordan Mansion entrance. The plaque at the former site of the Peris House would focus on Salvador Peris and his association with the AL&T. The second plaque would be placed at the pedestrian entrance to Riordan Mansion State Historic Park, in a location chosen by Riordan Mansion State Historic Park personnel who will create the text for the second plaque, organize its production with a plaque manufacturer, and orchestrate its installation. Also discussed was an attempt to repurpose as much building's salvageable material as possible.

Heritage Preservation Commission Meeting

The Heritage Preservation Commission held a public hearing on January 17th, 2024, in regard to the application. The Commission found and determined that, based on the information provided in the staff memo dated 1/9/2024 and at the public hearing, the facts exist as required by Section 10-30.30 of the Zoning Code of the City of Flagstaff, specific to 10-30.30.050 Cultural Resources. After Josh Edwards of Cornerstones make a presentation, public comment was received by Nikki Lober Riordan Manson State Park (see HPC video and approved minutes). HPO Reavis highlighted areas of the 1/9/2024 memo and noted direct and indirect effects related to mitigation. There was additional public comment that took place and questioning between the public, HPO and Heritage Preservation Commission members. The consensus was a delay in acceptance of the Study with an additional plaque requested at Riordan State Park to be coordinated with the Peris House plaque along with corrections and some additions to the Cultural Resource Study.

Motion: Commissioner Horn **moved** to delay the consideration of this proposal, pending edits to the report (Cultural Resource Study) as captured in the minutes (more imagery of the house, maps, and working with descendants on further and accurate information), and the inclusion of a second mitigation plaque at Riordan Mansion, with both plaques to be developed in consultation with Riordan Mansion and ideally to include a QR code with supplemental information until the next meeting.

Commissioner Burcham **seconded** the motion.

Vote: 6 – 0 – Unanimously

Based upon the aforementioned findings, the Commission denied the acceptance of the Phase 1 Historic Resource Study, Peris House by a unanimous vote for the use and location described above subject to corrections and additions to the document and additional mitigation. Consideration of acceptance can be made at the next regular Heritage Preservation Meeting on February 21st 2024 or subsequent meetings.

February 12 Meeting with Chick-fil-A lawyers

A Microsoft “Teams” meeting was held on February 12th with 3 lawyers of Gammage & Burnham Law Firm representing Chick-fil-A, Josh Edwards the retained consultant and Michelle McNulty Planning director and HPO Reavis. The meeting was to discuss, clarify and confirm the intent of the HPC motion and the HPOs understanding of mitigation for indirect effects to Riordan State Park. Josh Edwards covered the corrections for the document that included corrected dates, and an interview with the Grandson of Salvador Peris and additional mapped figures for the Study regarding Mill Town Housing. Chick-fil-A representatives expressed that indirect mitigation be clearly defined and that their responsibilities met but detached from further obligations. As previously recommended by the HPO it was recommended that the applicant pay for the cost of an interpretive plaque at Riordan State Park. To clarify the applicant’s responsibilities, it was understood that a \$3,000 donation to the Parks “friends” group (**Riordan Action Network**, which is a division of the Northern Arizona Pioneers' Historical Society) would cover the cost of the physical production of the plaque, bracket, and post, but does not include the cost for the writing of the text or installation. A level of shared information by the consultant will assist Riordan State Park in text writing for consistency between plaques. HPO recommended that Chick-fil-A be acknowledged on each plaque.

Indirect Effect Mitigation

The revised submission of the Phase 1 Cultural Resource Study (CRS) with mitigation includes the Paris House Plaque and donated funding for a plaque at Riordan State Park. The submitted CRS does address indirect impacts to Riordan State Park, a facility with State Significance and its history and association with Arizona Lumber & Timber Company’s lumber history and the development of Flagstaff.

Recommendation

It is recommended by the HPO that mitigation plaques meet the following specification “or equal” that can be obtained by various plaque manufactures.

PLAQUE SPECIFICATIONS:

- Approximately 20” x 24” anodized aluminum plaque with frame and backing plate, bracket, and post.
- Plaques to have approximately 250 words of text and 2 to 3 historic photos integrated with the text.
- The Peris House plaque will be placed in a highly visible and publicly accessible area oriented toward the sidewalk.

The HPO does recommend acceptance of the submitted Phase 1 research and recordation and the included commensurate mitigation as adequate in reducing major impacts to Cultural Resources, both direct and indirect impacts. The Heritage Preservation Commission may condition approval of recommendations by the HPO for impacts to related Heritage Resources.