

**CITY OF FLAGSTAFF HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION  
STAFF REPORT**

**CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS**  
**PZ-24-00183**  
**104 E Route 66**

**DATE:** **10/3/2024**  
**MEETING DATE:** **10/16/2024**  
**REPORT BY:** **Sara Dechter, AICP**

**REQUEST**

This is a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for stone repair, new canopy posts, and repair of the existing canopy at 104 E Route 66 Lumberjack Pizza (APN 101-21-011). The property is in the Downtown Historic Overlay District and the Central Business zoning district. The building was constructed in 1881 and the façade modified in 1916. The date of the installation of the canopy is unknown but is likely more than 50 years old.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

Staff recommends that the Heritage Preservation Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for 104 E Route 66 with the conditions that:

- 1) Stone masonry work conform with the US Secretary of the Interior’s Standards and Guidelines
- 2) Canopy work be approved by the Arizona Department of Transportation and meet the Building Code requirements.

**PROJECT BACKGROUND**

The property is listed in the National Register as a contributing element to the original Railroad Addition National Register District and is within the Downtown Overlay Design Review District. The building does have a historic inventory form. The building had an 1881 original construction date, significant modified historic construction in 1918, and more modern modification in 1955 with the over-the-sidewalk post and roof awning. The building is associated with The New York Store to the west, and the inventory form notes the historic name as Nackard’s New York Market. Photo documentation shows the building as Flagstaff Grocery and Confectionery and it currently houses “Lumber Jack Pizza”. The stone flanking engaged columns/piers are from the 1918 addition that brought the building forward from its 1881 6-foot set back.

The canopy was struck by a drunk driver and the posts were damaged. The proposed canopy alterations replace the wooden posts with metal and include repairs to stone and wood associated with the façade.

**PAST DECISIONS AND OTHER REVIEWS**

There are no relevant past decisions for this property.

**INTENT**

The purpose of the Downtown Overlay is laid out in Section 10-40.50.030 of the Zoning Code. The stated purpose is to “promote the preservation and unique character of all structures within the zone.” Properties within the Downtown Overlay are “subject to the Design Handbook for Downtown Flagstaff.” The Design Handbook for Downtown Flagstaff states: “The Historic Preservation Ordinance is designed to preserve and enhance the historic district. This ordinance requires a Certificate of Appropriateness be granted before any changes are made to the exterior appearance of properties within a designated historic district.”

**STAFF REVIEW:**

**Scope of Work**

The Certificate of Appropriateness is applicable (Flagstaff Zoning Code 10-30.30.060E.) in the case of this property. The impact to the significance and integrity of surrounding historic properties and the compatibility with the approved design guidelines for the zone and nearby adjacent structures are a consideration for this level of review.

**Required Findings for:**

E. Certification of Appropriateness.

1. Applicability. This approval is appropriate if the proposed work alters a cultural resource but does so in such a way that is compatible with the historic or archaeological character of the resource and all major impacts are mitigated such that the work does not diminish, eliminate, or adversely affect the significance or integrity of the resource.

2. Criteria for Approval. When approving a certification of appropriateness, the Heritage Preservation Commission shall find that:

a. The proposed work is consistent with the purpose and intent of this division;

b. The proposed work is compatible with its context:

(1) The appropriate context for a landmark or a historic property is the property itself and, to a much lesser extent, the surrounding properties and neighborhood;

(2) The appropriate context of work in a historic overlay zone is the significant portions of the property itself, the surrounding properties, and the neighborhood;

c. The cultural resources associated with the proposed work have been sufficiently sought, identified, and evaluated;

d. Major impacts on cultural resources are sufficiently mitigated; and

e. The proposed work is consistent with applicable development standards and design guidelines. See also subsection (G) of this section, Development Standards and Guidelines.

G. Development Standards and Guidelines. The following standards and guidelines apply to all approvals granted pursuant to this section:

1. City Code, Title 10, Zoning Code. The Heritage Preservation Commission and the Historic Preservation Officer shall apply the development standards and guidelines provided in Section [10-30.60.050](#), Compatibility, as criteria for determining the appropriateness of a development proposal.

2. Industry Standards and Guidelines.

b. *The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties with Guidelines for Preserving, Rehabilitating, Restoring and Reconstructing Historic Buildings.*

c. *Preservation Briefs* and other similar best practice documents published by the National Park Service.

3. Zone-Specific Development Standards and Guidelines. These standards and guidelines are available from the Planning Section.

“Prior to the granting of any required approvals or permits and prior to the commencement of any work on a landmark property or within a historic overlay zone, the Heritage Preservation Commission or the Historic Preservation Officer shall review all work proposed and approve or conditionally approve the work in the form of a certificate of no effect, certificate of appropriateness, or certificate of economic hardship” (Flagstaff Zoning Code 10-30.30.060 Development of a Landmark Property and Property within a Historic Overlay Zone).

### **Downtown Overlay**

“The Downtown Overlay (DO) zone applies to areas of the City subject to the Design Handbook for Downtown Flagstaff for the development of properties located within the boundaries of the zone. The requirements of the DO zone are intended to promote the preservation and unique character of all structures within the zone” (Flagstaff Zoning Code 10-40.50.030 Overlay Zones).

The Design Handbook for Downtown Flagstaff states “Downtown Flagstaff contains a rich variety of buildings representing a range of architectural styles and building types. Early Victorian era buildings exhibit decorative cornices and window arches while later Moderne and Art Deco buildings emphasize flowing streamlined forms. More formal neoclassical styles add accent to the scene. All are important aspects of the community's heritage and each style's unique features merit preservation.”

### **Downtown Historic Overlay Design Guidelines**

#### Rehabilitation Guidelines for All Existing Buildings

- R1 – Maintain the original size and shape of the storefront opening.
- R2 – Maintain the storefront wall at the sidewalk edge.
- R3 – Maintain recessed entries where they exist.
- R5 – Use door styles that are found on traditional store fronts.
- R7 – Preserve the size and shape of upper story windows.
- R9 – Preserve the original ornament and detail of the façade.
- R10 – Avoid concealing original façade materials.
- R13 – Avoid new additions or alterations that would hinder the ability to interpret the design character of the original building.
  
- H1 - Respect the original design character of the building.
- H3 – Avoid removing or altering any historic material or significant architectural features.
- H4 - Maintain existing significant stylistic elements.
- H6 – Minimize the removal of historic elements.
- H7- Replace only missing portions of original elements where economically and physically feasible.
- H11- Preserve older alterations that have achieved historic significance in themselves.
- H12 – More recent alterations that are not historically significant may be removed.

### **DISCUSSION:**

**Summary of Project Communication**

This property improvement was primarily motivated by the car-damage that took place on one of the posts supporting the sidewalk roof. While the repair work is required, the owner and his contractor looked to improve the general appearance of the building's façade. Changes to the south façade are minimal. The project contractor had an on-site discussion and phone with the previous HPO.

**Basis of Report:**

The proposed storefront rehabilitation submission solves damage to a façade's sidewalk roof component and enhances the general appearance of the façade. This historic façade also had an awning or canopy as seen in the photo below.

The proposed repairs add to but do not alter the original size and shape of opening and the wall at the sidewalk edge. There are no proposed changes to the door style. The change in style to the canopy posts will increase visibility for pedestrians and will make the façade material from the 1916 improvements more visible. There is a minor change in the style to achieve these objectives. The steel corbel and small decorative bands and curves will add some detail that is not inconsistent with other shapes and features on the street. The stone on the façade and much of the canopy will be preserved.



**STAFF CONCLUSION:**

The building is significant and has integrity. The proposed repairs meet the Design Guidelines for Downtown Flagstaff and the findings required by the Zoning Code, and it is appropriate for the Commission to approve a Certificate of Appropriateness based on the findings.

**ATTACHMENTS:**

- 1 HPC-C application
- 2 Plan submittal
- 3 Street photo