

## January Meeting Minutes

### SUSTAINABILITY COMMISSION

THURSDAY  
January 25th

HYBRID MEETING  
STAFF CONFERENCE ROOM  
AND MICROSOFT TEAMS  
211 WEST ASPEN AVENUE  
4:30 P.M.

**Vision:** The City of Flagstaff is a culture and community that thrives in response to the Climate Crisis.

**Mission:** To advise Sustainability Division Staff on matters related to climate and sustainability, support community projects through Neighborhood Sustainability Grants, and provide feedback to the City Council on sustainability issues.

Members of the public may join the meeting online, via Microsoft Teams.

1. **Call to Order –**
  - a. Chair Kevin White called the meeting to order at 4:34.
- 2.

### ROLL CALL

*NOTE: One or more Commissioner may be in attendance through other technological means.*

Chair Kevin White - Present

Commissioner Priscilla Boateng - Present

Commissioner Kristen Konkel - Present

Commissioner Mary Ellen Metzger – Not Present

Vice Chair Amy Wolkowinsky - Present

Others present: Tia Hatton (staff), Jennifer Niemann (staff), Kallie Klein (staff), Sam Wiley (staff), Jill Stephenson (public), Robert Breunig (public), Duffie Westheimer (public, presenter), Tom Dresler (public), Vice Mayor – Council Liaison – Austin Aslan, Michele James (public), Dara Marks Marino, Karen Enydey, Kay Bordwell (public, online)

### 3. **Land Acknowledgment**

The Sustainability Commission humbly acknowledges the ancestral homelands of this area's Indigenous nations and original stewards. These lands, still inhabited by Native descendants, border mountains sacred to Indigenous peoples. We honor them, their legacies, their traditions, and their continued contributions. We celebrate their past, present, and future generations who will forever know this place as home.

### 4. **Public Comment**

At this time, any member of the public may address the Commission on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled before the Commission on that day. Due to Open Meeting Laws, the Commission cannot discuss or act on items presented during this portion of the agenda. To address the

Commission on an item that is on the agenda, please use the Teams Chat function: simply type in "public comment" to indicate to the Chair that you would like to comment. The Chair will then recognize you when it is time for public comment, and staff will unmute your microphone if needed.

**No public comment for an item not on the agenda today.**

5. **Approval of Minutes (October and November)**

- October: Commissioner Konkel moves to approve, Vice Chair seconds. All approved. October minutes approved 4-0.
- November: Vice Chair Wolkowinsky moves to approve, Commissioner Konkel seconds. All approved. November minutes approved 4-0.

6. Business

A. Brief Climate Corps + Commission Introductions (5 minutes)

This item was moved to B/second item of business by Chair White. Climate Resilience Corps members Sam Wiley (Climate Resilience Hub Coordinator) and Kallie Klein (Climate Communications & Engagement Coordinator) introduced themselves.

B. Townsite Community Land Trust Presentation (20 minutes)

- a. Duffie Westheimer, TCLT Executive Director
- b. Informational

This item was moved to A/first item on the agenda by Chair White to accommodate public comment for the Flagstaff First petition item. Duffie Westheimer, Townsite Community Land Trust Executive Director, presented for twenty minutes on TCLT mission, work, and sustainability. Please see the provided handout and slides at the end of these minutes.

Commissioner Konkel asked a question regarding requirements for TCLT homes. Commissioner Wolkowinsky asked about how they calculate equity. Presenter responded with the requirements and how they calculate equity. Chair White thanked TCLT.

C. Chair/Interim Chair Election and Commission Update (10 minutes)

- a. Chair Kevin White and Tia Hatton
- b. Vote and Informational

This item was moved to D/fourth on the agenda by Chair White to accommodate public comment. Chair White noted that the Commission does annual elections for the position of Chair.

**Chair White nominated himself. No others were nominated/expressed interest. Commissioner Konkel motioned; seconded by Vice Chair Wolkowinsky. Vote 4-0 unanimously approved.**

D. Flagstaff First Petition to Council and Possible Commission Response (30 minutes)

- a. Vice Chair Amy Wolkowinsky  
Jenny Niemann (Climate Action Section Director)

- b. Informational and Discussion
- c. Public Comment. See end of agenda item.

Vice Chair Wolkowinsky introduced the reason she brought this item to the agenda and spoke briefly about the petition in front of City Council. She then passed it off to Jenny Niemann, Climate Action Section Director who spoke to the history of the petition, how we got here, and next steps. Director Niemann shared that the petition (included in the hyperlinked 10/17/23 agenda) was submitted in September and heard by Council on October 17<sup>th</sup> (Council video hyperlinked in agenda.) Niemann shared the petition is a FAIR agenda item, or a Future Agenda Item Request. City Council voted to accept the FAIR items request at the October 17<sup>th</sup> meeting to add to a future agenda. It will be heard on Tuesday, February 27<sup>th</sup>.

Chair White asked to clarify whether at the upcoming Council meeting amendments could be voted and passed in the same meeting. Niemann clarified they could vote to amend and direct staff to take the time to amend the CNP.

Vice Chair Wolkowinsky spoke to her support of the Commissioner speaking out in support of the current CNP. Vice Mayor Aslan joined and spoke to prior Commission's speaking to City Council. VM Aslan shared that he did not support the FAIR agenda item.

Staff Tia Hatton noted that day she confirmed with the City Clerk's office that the Commission can submit a recommendation to the Sustainability Director, Nicole Antonopoulos who can submit it to the City Manager's office for decision on how to submit it to Council.

Vice Chair Wolkowinsky moved to create a subcommittee, and Commissioner Konkel seconded. All voted in favor, 4-0. Working group created. It should be noted, according to the Boards & Commission Training, it not listed as a requirement to vote to create an informal working group. Vice Chair Wolkowinsky, Commissioner Konkel, and Commissioner Boateng (the max being three) all joined the work committee and Hatton will help them arrange to meet. The working group will prepare a letter to present and vote on at the next Commission meeting on February 22<sup>nd</sup>.

Public Comment:

Two people spoke in-person, four online, and eight over email all in support of the Carbon Neutrality Plan as it is/in opposition to the Flagstaff First Petition. Email comments are included at the end of the minutes.

- Jill Stephenson
- Dara Marks Marino (virtual)
- Robert Breunig
- Michele James (Virtual)
- Kay Bordwell (Virtual)
- Karen Enyedy (Virtual)

The Commission thanked the public for showing up for public comment on this item.

- E. Neighborhood Sustainability Grant Update, Debrief, and Subcommittee Consideration (45 minutes)

- a. Chair Kevin White and Tia Hatton
- b. Discussion

Hatton updated the Commission that all recipients accepted their awards, including those who were awarded the 6k\$ instead of full funding.

Chair White asked the Commission to debrief this past year's grant experience asking if they had any suggested improvement, things that went well, or other suggestions.

Commissioner Wolkowinsky said as a new commissioner she felt the tools and structure were helpful for equitable evaluation of grants. Commissioner Konkel commented that the office hours were well-attended and went better than holding multiple workshops, and that the new scoring system worked well. The commission noted possible improvements as follows:

- Clarify project partners/references.
- Update/discuss the food objectives with pollinator habitat.
  - Suggested to add a community garden category.
  - To score highest, you must hit all 3.
    - Limitation for pollinator in food – if just pollinator habitat?
    - Possibly could add bonus point to any category that supports pollinator.
- Add an "Other" category? IF so, what would the objectives be?
- Discussion on climate action versus building energy versus resilience object
  - Addition of community organizing (decided it is included in resilience already)

Hatton shared about the Sustainability Office's goal to evaluate all programs through their equity checklist. Chair White requested more information on a future agenda. Commissioner Konkel suggested they save half a future meeting to do the evaluation and then make all future changes at one time. Chair White would like to see a full list of recipients in the past 4-6 years to help evaluate who has received the grant. Hatton offered to prepare it.

## 7. To and From (5 minutes) - All

- Accepting sustainability commission applications. [Apply here.](#)
- [Fix-It Clinic on February 10th.](#) Seeking volunteers who can sew!
- Local youth climate opportunities such as the [Youth Climate Action Challenge](#), hiring high school [Sustainability Officers](#), & Youth Climate Leadership Academy (email [Bella.bowman@flagstaffaz.gov](mailto:Bella.bowman@flagstaffaz.gov))
- Engineering Standards input being sought.
- Vice Chair Wolkowinsky shared that on Thursday, February 1<sup>st</sup> a new nonprofit called Flagstaff Gravity Lab will be launching, it's as a STEM anchor community to bring together community of scientists & grow successful STEM endeavors.
- Commissioner Konkel shared that prior NSG recipient, Threaded Together's previous executive director and her husband who passed way, their celebration of life is on February 11<sup>th</sup>.

## 8. Future Agenda Item Requests

- Vote on language for recommendation to Council regarding the Flagstaff First Petition on February 22<sup>nd</sup>
- Equity Checklist overview and possible training
- Equity Checklist review of the Neighborhood Sustainability Grant
  - Creation of working group to make changes to the NSG

## 9. Adjournment

Chair White adjourned the meeting at 6:25pm.



***Promoting historic preservation  
and community investment  
with permanently affordable owner-occupied homes.***

### Flagstaff Townsite Historic Properties CLT (TCLT)

- 🏠 **“The greenest building is the one already built.”** –Carl Elefante, Architect
- 🏠 **“Preservation saves energy by taking advantage of the non-recoverable energy embodied in an existing building and extending the use of it.”** --Advisory Council on Historic Preservation  
“Assessing the Energy Conservation Benefits of Historic Preservation: methods and examples.”
- 🏠 **“...depending upon the type of structure, it takes between ten and eighty years for a new ‘green’ building that is 30% more energy efficient than the existing one to make up for the amount of carbon unleashed through its construction.”** Meeks & Murphy Past & Future City
- 🏠 **“Razing historic buildings results in a triple hit on scarce resources. First, we are throwing away thousands of dollars of embodied energy. Second, we are replacing it with materials vastly more consumptive of energy. What are most historic houses built from? Brick, plaster, concrete, and timber are among the least energy consumptive of materials. What are the major components of new buildings? Plastic, steel, vinyl, and aluminum—among the most energy consumptive of materials. Third, recurring embodied energy savings increase dramatically as a building life stretches over fifty years.”** --Donovan Rypkema

### Why Old Places Matter (inspired by Thompson Mayes):

- Provides continuity for people (past, present, and future).
- Learning about history is educational and inspirational.
- Connects us to past events and people, which can explain how & what created the present.

- Local architecture reflects creativity, ingenuity, engineering, materials availability & aesthetics.
- Informs identity—where you and your community came from and what is unique to your place.
- History provides economic benefits by attracting visitors.
- Historic building scale is often more welcoming and comfortable.
- Historic areas usually grew more slowly and the buildings are more unique and varied.
- Mature landscaping and tall trees bring comfort and beauty.
- Long-term residents have built community.
- Recognizes that existing things and information have value.

**Historic Preservation and Sustainability:**

- Restoration keeps construction materials in use (and out of the landfill).
- A 1,000 square foot home can need 30 trees to build the structure. Restoration saves trees from being harvested and the energy to mill, move, etc.
- Old-growth wood used in historic buildings is denser, stronger, and true to dimension.
- Historic windows were very well made with quality materials. A storm window can make them more energy efficient.
- Maintaining a property improves the whole area and encourages other owners to maintain or improve their properties.
- Historic districts have shown to maintain property values or increase them better than surrounding areas. TCLT keeps high value historic homes affordable for Flagstaff residents.
- In addition to preserving the embodied energy historic buildings can be rewired for modern electric-intensive lifestyles, replumbed, insulated, weatherized and efficient appliances installed.
- How to mediate lead and asbestos found in historic buildings is known. These materials are simple. The long-term safety of complex chemical-laden modern materials is still unknown.
- Historic houses usually have a relationship with the street that allow people to meet and get to know neighbors. (Frequent dog walking helps too!)
- Historic lots with smaller houses have room for green space, gardens, play yard, and fresh air.
- Smaller homes use less material to be constructed and overall use less energy when in use.
- TCLT homes are dispersed throughout historic Flagstaff to benefit many neighborhoods.
- TCLT homes are all different which provides different character, locations, and below market price choices into the future.
- Historic buildings are irreplaceable in today's world.

**Community Land Trust model of homeownership:**

- TCLT restores historic structures to keep them in use – continuing to meet community needs -- forever.
- TCLT hires local contractors and buys supplies locally to fuel the Flagstaff economy.
- TCLT retains ownership of the land and sells the house to eligible and financially qualified Flagstaff residents creating a “shared equity” relationship.
- Shared equity and the affordability subsidy to lower the price results in buyers not needing to purchase private mortgage insurance, saving buyers thousands of dollars.

- Owner-occupied properties approved by the State Historic Preservation Office can qualify for a significant tax reduction on the house.
  - TCLT & buyer sign a 99-year renewable & inheritable ground lease at time of purchase. This legal document identifies the rights and responsibilities of both parties including, for example, the resale formula for setting the future sale price.
  - TCLT requires 30-year fixed rate mortgages.
  - Homeownership provides for more consistent bills and security of occupancy.
  - TCLT provides stewardship throughout ownership to assist homeowners as needed to be successful.
  - TCLT stewardship protects the community investment in the property and the affordability from one owner to the next. *Permanent* affordability managed by a nonprofit or municipality is by far the best community investment.
  - TCLT encourages ongoing home maintenance so sellers can take away as much equity as possible.
  - TCLT requires full-time owner-occupancy which helps to stabilize the neighborhood.
  - TCLT's fixed-rate resale formula encourages long-term residency which builds community.
  - TCLT homeownership provides residents with the opportunity to be part of something larger than themselves by caretaking Flagstaff history and leaving the affordability for future homeowners.
  - TCLT is a membership organization that creates community around preserving Flagstaff history and providing for our residents (teachers, government employees, etc.).
  - TCLT is an AZ nonprofit, federal tax-exempt organization. All funding goes to the charitable mission.
  - TCLT's tripartite Board of Directors is designed to represent the wider community so no voice is dominant (lower to moderate income representatives, historic property owners/neighbors, professional advocates)
-

# Historic Preservation is Sustainability

...and more...

Duffie Westheimer

*Flagstaff Townsite Historic Properties Community Land Trust  
(Townsite CLT/TCLT)*

*25 January 2024 Sustainability Commission presentation*



Prior to 1894.

Present



If you have seen this house, did you know it's history?



1<sup>st</sup> N. Arizona weather station, and home of *US Senator H. Ashurst*.



Restored childhood home of Senator Henry Ashurst, born in 1874.

## What is historic preservation and why is it valuable?

“Historic preservation is a conversation with our past about our future. ....Through historic preservation, we look at history in different ways, ask different questions of the past, and learn new things about our history and ourselves.

....Our nation's history has many facets, and historic preservation helps tell these stories. Sometimes historic preservation involves celebrating events, people, places, and ideas that we are proud of; other times it involves recognizing moments in our history that can be painful or uncomfortable to remember.” --National Park Service website

“There may have been a time when preservation was about saving an old building here and there, but those days are gone. Preservation is the business of saving communities and the values they embody.”

--Richard Moe, past President of the National Trust for Historic Preservation

### Average House and Household Size in the U.S.



2020 Population Connection  
Source: US Census Bureau, National Association of Home Builders, Old Sturbridge Village

## Arguments we hear against preserving historic Flagstaff vs *reality*

- Land available for growth is limited (a common Flagstaff concern) — ***historic areas are a very small portion of the overall municipality.***
  - Need infill and density to accommodate the growth—***historic areas are already densely developed. In these neighborhoods “infill” means redevelopment.***
  - Houses are small—***small is more affordable and leaves valuable green space on the lot for health, growing plants, & water infiltration.***
  - Houses are old—***houses built with quality materials can be restored, upgraded to modern building codes, and made energy efficient.***
  - Restoration and preservation are expensive—***not so when it lasts 100 years or longer.***
- 
- Historic buildings allows us to have a deeper understanding of a place and earlier residents.
  - Old buildings show us what materials were available in the past and the aesthetics of that time. New construction often tries to imitate what is authentic, and is rarely successful.
  - Historic construction materials were strong and fewer complex chemicals and processes were used to make them.
  - A significant amount of embodied energy is built into each structure. Restoration produces 50%- 75% less carbon than new construction, plus much less waste.
  - Where buildings are in proportion with those adjacent there is often more neighbor to neighbor contact which builds community.
  - *Landfills have no need for useable buildings!*

## Townsite CLT Mission:

Promoting historic preservation  
and community investment  
with permanently affordable owner-occupied homes.

Townsite CLT is a private, AZ nonprofit tax-exempt membership organization.

## Key Features of a Community Land Trust

- ⊞ Nonprofit, tax-exempt organization
- ⊞ Addresses community needs
- ⊞ Dual ownership called “shared equity”
- ⊞ Land leased from nonprofit via legally binding ground lease
- ⊞ Perpetual affordability, one owner to the next
- ⊞ Ongoing stewardship for CLT & homeowner to be successful
- ⊞ CLT homeowners, neighbors, professional advocates on board of directors
- ⊞ Flexible model can do housing, commercial, gardens, etc., as needed
- **Townsite CLT addresses two community needs: keeping historic structures in use and affordable housing for our residents.**



Townsite CLT's first finished project: "4 Square."




4 Square project frame houses prior to rehabilitation and restoration. Flagstaff has had no property maintenance ordinance, but may soon.



Before...



4 Square project stone houses prior to restoration.  
 Note the decorative use of obsidian in concrete sills and lintels. Also the 1900s kitchen.



Character is much easier kept than  
recovered.

**From:** [Jason Kordosky](#)  
**To:** [Tia M. Hatton](#)  
**Subject:** Public Comment: Agenda Item 6(d), Sustainability Commission  
**Date:** Thursday, January 25, 2024 11:33:26 AM

---

You don't often get email from [jason.nazcca@gmail.com](mailto:jason.nazcca@gmail.com). [Learn why this is important](#)

Hi Tia,

This public comment is for agenda item 6(d) on today's (1/25/24) Flagstaff Sustainability Commission Meeting.

Good afternoon Sustainability Commissioners,

My name is Jason Kordosky and I am the Regional Field Organizer for the Northern Arizona Climate Change Alliance. Since 2017, NAZCCA has educated and empowered residents of Northern Arizona to take action locally to slow climate change. I encourage you to not approve Flagstaff First's petition to the City Council because doing so would undermine our City's Carbon Neutrality Plan. We need to stay on the goal toward a carbon-neutral and climate-friendly future. Funding adaptation measures for Wildfire, Flooding, and Drought within the Carbon Neutrality Plan will steer us away from the goal and intention of the Carbon Neutrality Plan.

Thank you,  
Jason Kordosky

---

**Jason Kordosky**  
Regional Field & Digital Organizer  
[Northern Arizona Climate Change Alliance](#)  
(928) 600-4016  
pronouns: he/they



**From:** [Kathy Fraser](#)  
**To:** [Tia M. Hatton](#)  
**Subject:** Carbon neutrality plan  
**Date:** Thursday, January 25, 2024 12:57:54 PM

---

[You don't often get email from kajf1220@hotmail.com. Learn why this is important at <https://aka.ms/LearnAboutSenderIdentification> ]

Commission Members,

I am emailing to express my strong support for the current, unamended Carbon Neutrality Plan which has been adopted by the City Council with much input from concerned organizations such as NAZCCA and Friends of Flagstaff Future and climate aware citizens. The attempt to change and water down this plan by Flagstaff First, an organization which denies the current climate crisis is disturbing and frightening. The overwhelming support shown recently at Council meetings for then current plan and the underwhelming support of the proposed changes to the plan should illustrate to the Commission that the majority of Flagstaff citizens do want the plan changed.

Thank you,  
Kathy Fraser

Sent from my iPad

**From:** [Gökçen Çiflik Chamberlin](#)  
**To:** [Tia M. Hatton](#)  
**Subject:** Carbon Neutrality Plan for Climate Change  
**Date:** Thursday, January 25, 2024 1:10:47 PM

---

You don't often get email from gokcen.ciflk@gmail.com. [Learn why this is important](#)

Hi Tia,

My name Gokcen and I work in NAU as a Career Development Coordinator. I stand with 14,000+ members of the community in support of the Carbon Neutrality Plan in its current form. I have long term concerns about climate change, and I see the need for all cities and constituents to reduce their carbon footprints.

Kind regards,  
Gokcen

**From:** [Richard Holtzin](#)  
**To:** [Tia M. Hatton](#)  
**Subject:** Carbon Neutrality Plan  
**Date:** Thursday, January 25, 2024 2:40:02 PM

---

You don't often get email from richardholtzin@aol.com. [Learn why this is important](#)

Tia, please pass to the City Council they are all 'rong on this matter and we need to discuss this issue more intelligently and not with usual bias of most of the City Council members. If someone wants to argue this point with me, fine...contact me at this email address. I happen to know a lot about this subject matter, including being a published author of some forty-seven books, and some of which focus on climate change and the woes therein.

Gracias.

Dr. Rich  
Flagstaff

Richard Kerry Holtzin, Ph.D.  
Professor Emeritus, Educator, and Guide

Website: <https://www.richholtzin.com>  
writing/publishing under the nom de plume: RK ALLEMAN

**From:** [Kathleen Armstrong](#)  
**To:** [Tia M. Hatton](#)  
**Subject:** Flagstaff's Carbon Neutrality Plan  
**Date:** Thursday, January 25, 2024 3:21:13 PM

---

You don't often get email from armstrong.k57@yahoo.com. [Learn why this is important](#)

Sustainability Commission Members;

Thank you for the opportunity to address you on this important issue of keeping intact the original City's Carbon Neutrality Plan (by 2030).

My name is Kathleen Armstrong-- a longtime Library worker, recently retired Flagstaff City worker. I urge you to leave intact the City's original Carbon Neutrality Plan. It was created in a grassroots effort by concerned citizens-- including our current Mayor.

Flagstaff First-- a group whose name seems intentionally made to confuse with Flagstaff Community First-- is a climate denier, dark money group that continues pushing to alter this important document. How many times must we vocalize this?

I hope you will do your due diligence and investigate this group, so that they stop wasting your valuable time-- (and our time). This issue is too important.

Our climate is warming rapidly. Last year, (2023) was the hottest ever recorded-- worldwide.

The original CNP was created by a diverse group of citizens, including NAU professors, field biologists, climate educators, and

many other knowledgeable committed people. Please keep our CNP by 2030 as it was in its original form.

Thank you very much.

Sent from Yahoo Mail. [Get the app](#)

**From:** [Lauren Lefty](#)  
**To:** [Tia M. Hatton](#)  
**Subject:** Public Comment Re: Carbon Neutrality Plan  
**Date:** Thursday, January 25, 2024 4:59:59 PM

---

You don't often get email from lauren.lefty@gmail.com. [Learn why this is important](#)

Hello,

My name is Lauren Lefty and I am a resident of Flagstaff. I stand with 14,000+ members of the community in support of the Carbon Neutrality Plan in its current form. I have long-term concerns about climate change and I see the need for all cities, including ours, to reduce their carbon footprint.

Respectfully,  
Lauren Lefty

**From:** Karen Enyedy <karenenyedy7@gmail.com>  
**Subject:** **Comment for 4:30 Sustainability Commission meeting**  
**Date:** January 25, 2024 at 4:30:30 PM MST  
**To:** "Tia M. Hatton" <tia.hatton@flagstaffaz.gov>

Hi Tia,c

Here's my comment for tonight's meeting:

I have considered Flagstaff First's petition, the categories and specific infrastructures in their list of "unfunded projects," and their strategy for use of City funds. My position and support however, still strongly favor the City of Flagstaff's Carbon Neutrality Plan.

Karen Enyedy  
811 W Cherry Ave. #2  
Flagstaff, AZ 86001

**From:** [Pat Ellsworth](#)  
**To:** [Tia M. Hatton](#)  
**Subject:** public comment on Flagstaff First petition  
**Date:** Thursday, January 25, 2024 5:19:14 PM  
**Attachments:** [image.png](#)

---

[You don't often get email from flagsanta@gmail.com. Learn why this is important at <https://aka.ms/LearnAboutSenderIdentification> ]

Dear Tia Hatton:

I planned to attend the Thursday, January 25, 2023 Sustainability Commission meeting online but I cannot get in although I followed all the prompts and received a single use code. I intended to make an oral public comment opposing the Flagstaff First petition.

Instead, I am sending my comments in this email.  
Please open the attachment titled..... image.png (82K)  
Please forward my comments to the Sustainability Commission members.

Thank you, Tia. I appreciate all your efforts.

-Pat  
Patricia Ellsworth  
Flagstaff, AZ 8005  
928-226-0799  
\*\*\*\*\*