

SPECIAL MEETING

1. Call to Order

Vice Mayor Shimoni called the Special Meeting of the Flagstaff City Council held February 11, 2020, to order at 4:31 p.m.

2. Pledge of Allegiance and Mission Statement

The Council and audience recited the pledge of allegiance and City Manager Clifton read the Mission Statement of the City of Flagstaff.

MISSION STATEMENT

The mission of the City of Flagstaff is to protect and enhance the quality of life for all.

3. Roll Call

NOTE: One or more Councilmembers may be in attendance through other technological means.

PRESENT:

VICE MAYOR SHIMONI
COUNCILMEMBER ASLAN
COUNCILMEMBER MCCARTHY
COUNCILMEMBER ODEGAARD
COUNCILMEMBER SALAS
COUNCILMEMBER WHELAN

ABSENT:

MAYOR EVANS

Others present: City Manager Greg Clifton; City Attorney Sterling Solomon.

4. Presentation of City Manager Awards

City Manager Greg Clifton addressed the audience and presented the City Manager Awards. He acknowledged Deputy City Managers Shane Dille and Shannon Anderson for their assistance and thanked the staff for their nominations. He also thanked the family and friends of staff who were in attendance for their support. He spoke about what the City Manager awards entailed, the awards' name changes, and presented the 2019 City Manager Awards.

The following employees were recognized:

Oak Award Communication:

- Amy Plamer
- Victoria St. Clair
- Jenny Niemann

Oak Award Quality:

- Jeremiah Adams

Oak Award Accountability:

- Doug Slover

Oak Award Leadership:

- Becky Cardiff

Oak Award Teamwork:

- Patrick O'Connor
- Sharon Gonzales
- Kim Burns
- Sabrina James
- Jeny Lyn
- Jessica Huleatt
- Danielle Tiedeman
- Rachel Johnson
- Celeste Coupe
- Nanci Thomas
- Rhiannon Thomas
- Krista Devlin
- Matthew Scheide
- Scott Klotz
- Manuel Sierra
- William Katlin
- Wildine Rodriguez

Aspen Award Communication:

- Kevin Wiles
- Aspen Award Quality:
- Ralph Schmid

Aspen Award Accountability:

- Matt Kakert
- Beth Verstraete
- Bill Ragan
- Paul Santana
- Brandon Ross
- Geneva Dawson
- Stacy Saltzburg

Aspen Award Leadership:

- Jeff Bauman

Aspen Award Teamwork:

- Sharon Whitmore
- Kristin Decker
- Angie Eberhardt
- Mike Oliver
- Adam Williams

Ponderosa Award:

- Katie Brandis

RECESS

The Special Meeting of the City Council recessed at 4:58 p.m.

6:00 P.M. MEETING**1. Call to Order**

Vice Mayor Shimoni reconvened the Special Meeting of the Flagstaff City Council held February 11, 2020, at 6:00 p.m.

NOTICE OF OPTION TO RECESS INTO EXECUTIVE SESSION

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the City Council and to the general public that, at this work session, the City Council may vote to go into executive session, which will not be open to the public, for legal advice and discussion with the City's attorneys for legal advice on any item listed on the following agenda, pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(3).

2. Pledge of Allegiance and Mission Statement

The Council and audience recited the pledge of allegiance and City Manager Clifton read the Mission Statement of the City of Flagstaff.

MISSION STATEMENT

The mission of the City of Flagstaff is to protect and enhance the quality of life for all.

3. Roll Call

NOTE: One or more Councilmembers may be in attendance through other technological means.

PRESENT:

MAYOR EVANS
VICE MAYOR SHIMONI
COUNCILMEMBER ASLAN
COUNCILMEMBER MCCARTHY
COUNCILMEMBER ODEGAARD
COUNCILMEMBER SALAS
COUNCILMEMBER WHELAN

ABSENT:

Others present: City Manager Greg Clifton; City Attorney Sterling Solomon.

4. Public Participation

Public Participation enables the public to address the council about items that are not on the prepared agenda. Public Participation appears on the agenda twice, at the beginning and at the end of the work session. You may speak at one or the other, but not both. Anyone wishing to comment at the meeting is asked to fill out a speaker card and submit it to the recording clerk. When the item comes up on the agenda, your name will be called. You may address the Council up to three times throughout the meeting, including comments made during Public Participation. Please limit your remarks to three minutes per item to allow everyone to have an opportunity to speak. At the discretion of the Chair, ten or more persons present at the meeting and wishing to speak may appoint a representative who may have no more than fifteen minutes to speak.

City Manager Clifton introduced Senior Executive Assistant Shawn Johnson.

Arizona Ghia addressed Council about the Up with People program.

Planning Director Tiffany Antol addressed Council about the open house regarding the Zoning Code text amendment and the upcoming one-on-one times staff that would be available.

Jessica Mendoza, President of the NAU Associated Student Association, addressed Council regarding the rights of students to vote in local elections.

Kai Beattie addressed Council and urged them to take a stand against HB2681.

Noah Davidson addressed Council regarding student voting and voter suppression.

Kyle Nitschke spoke about HB2681 and his experiences with voting in Flagstaff. He requested the Council to write a letter to Representative Thorpe opposing the bill.

Written comments in opposition to HB2681 were submitted by the following individuals:

- Matalynn Slaton
- Madison Kier
- Avalon Wendel
- Melissa Berry
- Gregory Anderson

5. **Consideration and Adoption of Resolution No. 2020-04:** A resolution of the City Council of the City of Flagstaff, Arizona, amending the Comprehensive Parking Management Program Pay-to-Park and Permit Parking Fees, and establishing an effective date.

Community Investment Director David McIntire provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

UPDATE
PARKFLAG ORGANIZATION
MANAGED AREA MAP
RESIDENTIAL PERMIT PARKING PROGRAM
AMBASSADORSHIP
PARKING ENFORCEMENT OFFICERS' ROLES
PARKFLAG ENFORCEMENT
PARKFLAG FINANCIALS
PARKING ENTERPRISE FUND
REVENUE VS. OPERATING EXPENSES -- FY19
PROGRAM ACCOMPLISHMENTS

Councilmember Whelan requested a copy of a balance sheet for ParkFlag.

Vice Mayor Shimoni asked about the citation fee structure. Mr. McIntire explained that the first citation was a warning, the next violation would follow the parking fines set by the state of \$48, \$83, \$115, and \$150 for each subsequent ticket.

Councilmember Whelan asked how many of the kiosks were ADA compatible. Mr. McIntire stated that all 102 kiosks were ADA compliant and the kiosk at the Leroux lot was shorter and more accessible for people with wheelchairs. Councilmember Whelan requested consideration for all kiosks to be universally designed for all people to use.

Councilmember Salas asked about the data extracted from the kiosks, specifically if billing zip codes could be used to see where people were from. Mr. McIntire stated that they did not keep credit card data.

Vice Mayor Shimoni asked if there was an option to change the language on the kiosk to which Mr. McIntire responded that the user could change the language to multiple different languages.

Councilmember Whelan stated that she wanted more community feedback on the changes and felt that a community forum should be held to ensure that people feel heard.

POTENTIAL PROGRAM ADJUSTMENTS
COST REDUCTIONS
ALL OPTIONS
PARKFLAG OTHER CONSIDERATIONS
FUTURE PARKFLAG CHANGES
NEW INVENTORY

The following individuals addressed Council about the parking changes:

- Miranda Sweet
- John VanLandingham
- Terry Madeksza, Executive Director of the Downtown Business Alliance
- Ki Won Choi
- Karan Pate
- Holly Gramm
- Pamela S. Green (Sam)
- Shane Knight
- David Stephens
- Hugh Fogel
- Dan Fogel
- Mark Lamberson
- Steve Finch, CEO of the Flagstaff, Lodging, Restaurant, and Tourism Association
- George Averbeck

The following comments were received:

- Businesses needed to adapt and get creative.
- There needs to be more to bring locals downtown.
- The parking hours should be adjusted and consistent hours were preferred.
- Pay to park discourages locals from coming downtown, perhaps an incentive of some sort could help.
- Parking has been a downtown issue for decades.
- Locals did not want to come downtown because there was no parking.
- Some tweaks may need to be made based on data and logic.
- The parking supply needs to be worked on.
- There has been a call for a downtown parking garage but no budget to deliver.
- Consider a different rate for employee permits.
- Businesses in the downtown are suffering financially because the locals do not want to pay to park.
- There should not be paid parking in downtown.
- Support Option 3.
- New businesses will not come to the downtown area and existing businesses will not expand.
- Go back to the way things were.
- Please make parking free on Sunday.
- Better signage is needed at the kiosks.
- Provide options for locals with a local discount.
- Paid parking hours should be reduced to 9:00 to 5:00 only with Sundays free.
- Parking is not free and funding was needed for long term solutions.
- The program is too complex.
- The focus should be on parking enforcement not paying to park.
- ParkFlag is working but there is a perception problem and there needs to be better marketing to address that.
- Support Option 2.

The following individuals submitted written comments concerning parking:

- Wm. Michael Wilson
- Michael Frankel
- Kathleen Leatherwood

A break was held from 8:24 p.m. through 8:30 p.m.

Vice Mayor Shimoni asked about the expenses. Mr. McIntire stated that ParkFlag was paying loans back to the General Fund which should be paid off in 2026 with the revenue generated. He stated that ParkFlag was responsible for staffing, advertising, and the overhead related to offices, equipment, software, and credit card fees. The loan repayment was about 20% of operating expenses.

Councilmember Whelan expressed support for the reduction of the employee fee as well as a further evaluation of the hours.

Vice Mayor Shimoni indicated that he was satisfied with the hours but would like to see a local program that would leave the main revenue stream come from tourists.

Councilmember Aslan stated that he was not in favor of a large parking structure downtown unless it could be converted to another use in the future. He expressed support for the 5a adjustment.

Councilmember Odegaard stated that he prefers Option 2 since it was bolder, he encouraged keeping eyes on the prize for a parking structure and to do what was needed to get that sooner rather than later.

Councilmember Salas indicated support for 5a and stated that she trusts staff to work out the rest.

Moved by Councilmember Jim McCarthy, **seconded by** Councilmember Charlie Odegaard to read Resolution No. 2020-04 by title only with option 5a.

Vote: 7 - 0 - Unanimously

A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF FLAGSTAFF, ARIZONA, AMENDING THE COMPREHENSIVE PARKING MANAGEMENT PROGRAM PAY-TO-PARK AND PERMIT PARKING FEES, AND ESTABLISHING AN EFFECTIVE DATE

Moved by Councilmember Charlie Odegaard, **seconded by** Councilmember Jamie Whelan to adopt Resolution No. 2020-04 with option 5a.

Vote: 7 - 0 - Unanimously

6. Adjournment

The Special Meeting of the Flagstaff City Council held February 11, 2020, adjourned at 9:21.

WORK SESSION

1. Call to Order

Vice Mayor Shimoni called the Work Session of the Flagstaff City Council held February 11, 2020, to order at 9:21 p.m.

NOTICE OF OPTION TO RECESS INTO EXECUTIVE SESSION

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the City Council and to the general public that, at this work session, the City Council may vote to go into executive session, which will not be open to the public, for legal advice and discussion with the City's attorneys for legal advice on any item listed on the following agenda, pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(3).

2. Review of Draft Agenda for the February 18, 2020 City Council Meeting

Citizens wishing to speak on agenda items not specifically called out by the City Council may submit a speaker card for their items of interest to the recording clerk.

None

3. State & Federal Legislative Update

Management Analyst Sarah Langley and Deputy City Manager Shane Dille provided a Federal legislative update that included Rio de Flag.

Councilmember McCarthy asked about what additional funding would be needed for the project. Mr. Dille explained that the fee put in place last summer would fulfill the city's financial obligation.

Management Analyst Jack Fitchett and State Lobbyist Todd Madeksza provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

STATE LEGISLATIVE UPDATE
THE SESSION SO FAR...DAY 30
STATE BUDGET
CURRENTLY OPPOSED TO
CURRENTLY IN SUPPORT OF
AWAITING COUNCIL DIRECTION

Council discussed concerns with SB 1160 & SB 1161 (Cancer Presumption) and its focus on a specific group of individuals receiving benefits while others do not. Mr. Solomon stated that Council would be having an executive session on the bills.

MINIMUM WAGE ASSESSMENT

Vice Mayor Shimoni asked about Representative Blackman's HB2070 regarding pre-arrest diversion. Mr. Fitchett stated that he did not have information on that specific bill and he and Mr. Madeszka will do some research and provide an update to Council.

Moved by Councilmember Jamie Whelan, **seconded by** Councilmember Charlie Odegaard to continue the meeting in accordance with the City Council Rules of Procedure.

Vote: 4 - 2

NAY: Councilmember Austin Aslan
Councilmember Regina Salas

4. Winter Storm Event and Public Works Snow Operations

Streets Section Director Scott Overton and Parks Manager Amy Hagin provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

SNOW OPERATIONS -- OVERVIEW
URBAN SNOW OPERATIONS
STREETS AND PARKS STATISTICS
COMMUNITY STATISTICS AND MAPS
SNOW OPERATIONS
THANKSGIVING EVENT
SNOW OPERATIONS -- STREETS OVERVIEW
SNOW OPERATIONS -- PARKS OVERVIEW
SNOW POLICY -- PARKS
SNOW POLICY -- STREETS
BEST PRACTICES AND OPERATIONS
URBAN SNOW CHALLENGES

FUTURE OF SNOW OPERATIONS

Councilmember McCarthy asked about a gates trial program to reduce the amount of berms left in residential areas. Mr. Overton stated that there had been mixed results across the country with the use of gates in more heavily populated areas.

Councilmember Whelan asked if Parks removed snow from city buildings. Ms. Hagin explained that Parks with the support of Facilities when possible, removed snow from city facilities. They also apply a deicer in walkways and stairs.

5. **REMOVAL of Future Agenda Item Request (F.A.I.R.):** A request by Councilmember Odegaard to remove as a F.A.I.R. item a discussion about the Land Trust Model.

Councilmember Odegaard requested to remove his FAIR item. Council indicated their support for removing the item.

6. Public Participation

None.

7. Informational Items To/From Mayor, Council, and City Manager; future agenda item requests

Councilmember McCarthy stated that the Housing Commission was progressing on the a possible bond measure for housing.

City Manager Clifton provided information about the upcoming ADOT dedication.

Vice Mayor Shimoni requested a FAIR item to discuss levels of service when it comes to the City's firefighters.

8. Adjournment

The Work Session of the Flagstaff City Council held February 11, 2020, adjourned at 10:33 p.m.

MAYOR

ATTEST:

CITY CLERK

CERTIFICATION

I, STACY SALTZBURG, do hereby certify that I am the City Clerk of the City of Flagstaff, County of Coconino, State of Arizona, and that the above Minutes are a true and correct summary of the Meeting of the Council of the City of Flagstaff held on February 11, 2020. I further certify that the Meeting was duly called and held and that a quorum was present.

DATED this 18th day of March, 2025

CITY CLERK