

MINUTES

1. Call to Order

Mayor Evans called the Work Session of the Flagstaff City Council held November 24, 2020, to order at 3:00 p.m.

NOTICE OF OPTION TO RECESS INTO EXECUTIVE SESSION

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the City Council and to the general public that, at this work session, the City Council may vote to go into executive session, which will not be open to the public, for legal advice and discussion with the City's attorneys for legal advice on any item listed on the following agenda, pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(3).

2. Pledge of Allegiance and Mission Statement

The Council and attendees recited the pledge of allegiance and Councilmember Odegaard read the Mission Statement of the City of Flagstaff.

MISSION STATEMENT

The mission of the City of Flagstaff is to protect and enhance the quality of life for all.

3. Roll Call

NOTE: One or more Councilmembers may be in attendance through other technological means.

PRESENT:

ABSENT:

MAYOR EVANS
VICE MAYOR SHIMONI
COUNCILMEMBER ASLAN
COUNCILMEMBER MCCARTHY
COUNCILMEMBER ODEGAARD
COUNCILMEMBER SALAS
COUNCILMEMBER WHELAN

Others present: City Manager Greg Clifton; City Attorney Sterling Solomon.

4. Public Participation

Public Participation enables the public to address the council about items that are not on the prepared agenda. Public Participation appears on the agenda twice, at the beginning and at the end of the work session. You may speak at one or the other, but not both. Anyone wishing to comment at the meeting is asked to fill out a speaker card and submit it to the recording clerk. When the item comes up on the agenda, your name will be called. You may address the Council up to three times throughout the meeting, including comments made during Public Participation. Please limit your remarks to three minutes per item to allow everyone to have an opportunity to speak. At the discretion of the Chair, ten or

more persons present at the meeting and wishing to speak may appoint a representative who may have no more than fifteen minutes to speak.

Marking and Media Relations Manager at Discover Flagstaff Lori Pappas addressed Mayor and Council regarding the Giving Advent Box program that is being sponsored by Flagstaff Local for the Flagstaff Family Food Center. Promotion of the event will begin Black Friday and run through December 20th.

Michael Horn addressed Mayor and Council regarding COVID-19. He stated that the information he and his group has collected has been suppressed.

5. Review of Draft Agenda for the December 1, 2020 City Council Meeting

Citizens wishing to speak on agenda items not specifically called out by the City Council may submit a speaker card for their items of interest to the recording clerk.

Mayor Evans requested an executive session to receive legal advice regarding the Red Gap Ranch grazing lease.

She motioned to adjourn to executive session with a second by Councilmember Whelan. All were in favor.

Council recessed into Executive Session at 3:08 p.m.

The Work Session resumed at 3:37 p.m.

6. Flagstaff Arts Council Annual Update

Beautification, Arts, and Sciences Manager Eliza Kretzmann introduced the Director of the Flagstaff Arts Council, Jonathan Stone. He presented the annual update to Mayor and Council. Slides included:

- About Flagstaff Arts Council
- Use of BBB Funds FY20
- General Operating Support Grants
- Project Grants
- Thank You Video
- COVID Relief Efforts
- Draft Strategic Plan
 - Stakeholder-Driven Process
 - Guiding Principles
 - Key Differences
 - Anticipated 2021 Outlook

Councilmember Odegaard commented on the resilience of non-profits and asked Mr. Stone to speak about establishing an arts funds. Mr. Stone replied that they have reason to believe that individual giving in Flagstaff to arts and culture lags behind the rest of the state. They are looking at United Arts Funds where they build aggregate fundraising campaigns to see if the money raised could grow and if they can build a culture of giving to the arts. This may add professional staff and defining campaigns in the future that stress giving to the arts annually.

Vice Mayor Shimoni asked Mr. Stone what can be done to lower the barriers for other cultures and the youth to be involved in events that are put on by the Flagstaff Arts Council. Mr. Stone stated that the plan was created by a diverse group and the plan is a framework that can be manipulated for cultural equity. He used the Dark Sky Festival as an example and discussed how to represent diverse groups of individuals in grant-making.

Councilmember Whelan stated that she looks forward to seeing this plan implemented and expressed her gratitude for their work.

Mayor Evans thanked Mr. Stone and the Arts Council for their presentation.

7. Lived Black Experience Strategic Plan

City Manager Greg Clifton introduced the Black Lived Experience Community Coalition. Southside Community Association Executive Director Deborah Harris presented the outcomes of six virtual forums and focus groups designed to provide information regarding the Black Lived Experience of Flagstaff residents and a Strategic Plan on forging a path forward to Mayor and Council.

Slides Included:

- Land Acknowledgement
- Introduction
 - Program History
 - Program Purpose
 - Program Partners
- Program Design
- Program Outcomes: What Did We Hear?
- Program Strategies
- Goals
- Strategy Sample
- LBE Community Dialogues
- Conclusions

Councilmember Odegaard expressed his gratitude to the presenters. He asked when the Strategic Plan will come before Council as an action item. City Manager Greg Clifton stated that it is prepared to be queued up for action as soon as the next Council meeting.

Vice Mayor Shimoni also expressed that the plan is excellent. He commented about the "Flagstaff's Forgotten People" and said that they need to be addressed, he commented about city leadership and community buy-in. He stated that he would like to see the plan brought back at the next meeting and there to be regular updates. He also addressed the importance of the Murdoch Center and other black community hubs and suggested adding the Green Book to the in-development Flagstaff Resource Guide.

Ricardo Guthrie spoke in support of the strategic plan.

Vice Mayor Shimoni asked Dr. Guthrie to speak more about structural racism. Dr. Guthrie spoke about the racism in job sites. Most of the jobs that are here are structured for people who have the same belief and cultural backgrounds. Vice Mayor Shimoni also asked Dr. Guthrie to speak about the black lumberjacks and the buffalo soldiers. Guthrie stated that historically we were part of the western expansion. They made a living working as a lumberjack and they could make their own home out of the lumber they created. Louie the Lumberjack, as he is now known, does not take this history into account.

Written comments in support of the Lived Black Experience Strategic Plan were submitted by Chris Gunn and Dr. Tracye Moore.

Councilmember Whelan expressed her gratitude for the work that went into the moment that moved everyone into action. The Coalition is leading the journey and Council is here to support them and not to direct them. Councilmember Whelan stated she would like to see the Strategic Plan come back next week for approval.

Councilmember Salas expressed her gratitude. She stated that she is in support of having the Strategic Plan next week's meeting agenda and that she is in favor of implementing the plan.

Councilmember Aslan stated he is supportive of the plan and expressed his gratitude to the Coalition.

He stated that he hopes that Flagstaff's black community feels like it has an ally in City Council.

Councilmember Odegaard stated that he supports bringing the plan back for formal review next week as did Councilmember McCarthy.

A break was held until 5:05 pm

Economic Vitality Director Heidi Hansen stated that Discover Flagstaff is working on including the Green Book in the Resource Guide that Vice Mayor Shimoni mentioned, and they will continue to update Council on incorporating the Black Lived Experience in the Discover Flagstaff materials.

Mayor Evans thanked the Coalition and thanked the Council for their support.

8. Discussion about property maintenance requirements outside of Title 6 Police Regulations & Title 7 Health and Sanitation

Community Development Director Dan Folke assisted Mayor and Council on a discussion about property maintenance requirements and reviewed past decisions on property maintenance. He discussed the work on property maintenance including discussions with the Neighborhood Liaison, the Indigenous Coordinator, and the Dark Sky Ambassador. He also noted new animal keeping regulations and moving the Code Compliance team under Building Safety.

Jesse Dominguez from the Plaza Vieja Neighborhood Association addressed Mayor and Council and stated that they want something that would address complaints and standardize standards.

Councilmember Whelan asked Mr. Dominguez how neighborhoods and the elderly are affected by items that are safety hazards and that they cannot move. Mr. Dominguez stated that they have a neighborhood association cleanup day that assists with taking items to the dumpsters if needed.

Councilmember Salas asked Mr. Dominguez if he is interested in moving forward with this discussion with other neighborhoods. He stated the League of Neighborhoods is inactive at the moment, but he would be interested in re-instating it. He says that the absentee landlords are usually not interested in joining discussions due to them not seeing the issues on a daily basis like residents do. He also states that communities with HOA's typically regulate well, and do not need these discussions.

Ms. Deborah Harris addressed Mayor and Council and stated that she was a part of the Southside Community Association when they formed the League of Neighborhoods and they started discussing this fifteen years ago. She is supportive of a property maintenance ordinance.

Councilmember McCarthy stated that the reason this did not get anywhere previously was that it was perceived that this would be like a nanny-state. He stated that he supports moving this forward, but that it cannot be done in a way that provides for a nanny-state.

Councilmember Salas stated that she would like to see the item move forward and would like to involve the League of Neighborhoods and if some of the conversation could occur in a few weeks in conjunction with the League of Neighborhoods update.

Councilmember Odegaard also spoke about the past discussions of overreach of a Property Maintenance Ordinance. He would like to see this item move forward.

Mr. Clifton stated that at least two of the three neighborhoods in the League will be at the update and that staff can add this discussion to that meeting.

Mayor Evans stated this discussion has been ongoing since at least 2008 and there are tools to address this. The neighborhoods are bringing up issues that affect quality of life and health and safety.

The Council was in favor of moving this forward.

9. Discussion and Consideration for future action of an emergency resolution declaring a housing crisis in Flagstaff

Housing Director Sarah Darr provided a presentation to Mayor and Council on a draft Housing Crisis Resolution in response to a Citizen's Petition.

Slides Included:

- Overview
- Housing Crisis Declaration
 - Timeline
- Citizen's Petition
- Draft Housing Crisis Resolution
 - Why declare a housing crisis
- Recent Housing Data
- Recent Importance of Housing and "Home"
- Declaring a Housing Crisis
- What does the Resolution do?
- What's Next?

Tyler Denham and Devonna McLaughlin addressed Mayor and Council in support of the resolution.

Councilmember Aslan added that he has concerns about the confluence of this matter with the Climate Emergency declared that summer. He is concerned about priorities. He stated that he does not believe that the City is in the position to declare another emergency. However, he stated that he believes that the City can tackle both problems.

City Attorney Solomon stated that the Climate Emergency Resolution does contain the word "emergency" and clarified that the Housing Resolution does not have the same designation.

Ms. Darr highlighted the language contained in the resolution. Housing staff did talk to Sustainability staff on how both resolutions could work together.

Councilmember Odegaard stated that he does not see a conflict in the two resolutions.

Councilmember McCarthy proposed an amendment to the draft resolution. He suggested adding a new sentence in Section 2 preceding the plan elements that reads:

"The plan elements will also include ways the City can encourage more housing construction by the private sector, especially for reasonably-priced housing, and more occupancy by local residents."

Vice Mayor Shimoni thanks everyone working hard to get people into housing. He sees this as a crisis/emergency and the status quo is not working. If it continues we will become the next Aspen or Vail and that is not the Flagstaff that is envisioned.

Councilmember Whelan stated that she is interested in hearing specifics on how the two emergencies would push up against each other. She stated that she believes the housing crisis is an emergency.

Councilmember Aslan stated that he would not be in favor of the resolution if it includes Councilmember McCarthy's new language.

Councilmember Salas does not care for the verbiage, but there is obviously a need to address housing. She does not believe declaring a housing crisis is not mutually exclusive with the climate emergency. They are interdependent. She would like to see this move forward.

Councilmember Aslan clarifies that he does not believe that the housing crisis and the climate crisis are mutually exclusive. But he thinks the solutions to these problems carry conflicting issues.

A break was held from 6:57 pm Break through 7:10 pm.

Mayor Evans stated that she is an advocate for affordable housing. Mayor Evans stated there has been 11 plans to address affordable housing. She asked Ms. Darr about the 2,070 families that are on the waiting list for affordable housing and what is the longest time a family has waited on the list. Ms. Darr stated that it has been many years. There is a gentleman that has been waiting for a one-bedroom apartment for about ten years. Mayor Evan feels that the community has become apathetic to the issue of affordable housing. It is an emergency for the 40% who are cost burdened. She defines Sustainability as programs, initiatives, and actions that are aimed at the preservation of a particular resource. Sustainability refers to four areas: social, economic, environment, and human. She feels that environment has been championed in Flagstaff, but we have failed at the human aspect. She agreed with the added verbiage from Councilmember McCarthy.

Vice Mayor Shimoni stated support and that he supports Councilmember McCarthy's edit.

Councilmember Aslan is not supportive due to the overuse of emergency declarations. He does not inherently disagree with the necessities in the resolution.

Councilmember Salas and Councilmember Whelan noted their support.

The Resolution will come back to Council next week and an executive session will be added to the calendar.

10. Re-Entry Plan Update and Possible Direction from Council

Deputy City Manager Shannon Anderson, Indigenous Coordinator Rose Toehe, and Economic Vitality Director Heidi Hansen presented the most recent data and the safety protocols. They shared a Re-Entry Plan recommendation for consideration by Mayor and Council.

The slides of the presentation included:

- The Data
 - CCHHS: COVID-19 Weekly Cases
 - CCHHS: COVID-19 Daily Cases
 - CCHHS: Hospital Admissions
 - CCHHS: COVID-19 Related Deaths
 - CCHHS: Community Transmission
 - ADHS Dashboard
 - NAH: Hospital Census
 - Indigenous Nations Data
- Encouraging Safety Protocols
 - Small Act -- Big Deal and Proper wearing of a face covering
 - Digital Billboards
 - Banners
- Re-Entry Plan Recommendations
 - City's Monitoring Criteria
 - Re-Entry Plan Recommendations
- Council Discussion
- Indigenous Nations Update
 - Navajo Nation
 - Hopi Tribe

Steve Finch, President and CEO of the Northern Arizona Lodging, Tourism, & Restaurant Association, expressed concerns about rising COVID-19 cases while supporting mask enforcement and opposing further business restrictions. Mayor Evans clarified that the Re-entry Plan does not involve businesses, and Ms. Anderson noted that state regulations limit cities and towns from imposing stricter measures than the Governor's orders.

Written comments in support of keeping Jay Lively open were submitted by Steve Palmer and Bradley

Mihalik.

Vice Mayor Shimoni requested a moment of silence for COVID-19 victims and advocated for keeping the Jay Lively Ice Rink open, despite considering a rollback to Phase II of the Re-entry Plan. City Manager Clifton and Recreation Manager Jon Wilson reported that the rink's COVID-19 protocols were effective, with limited interactions and minimal public participation.

Councilmember Salas sought clarity on how similar amenities were handled by the County, while Councilmember Aslan expressed satisfaction with the City's mask compliance and supported keeping the rink open. Mr. Clifton recommended moving back to Phase II while maintaining regional consistency. Councilmember Odegaard and others also favored keeping the rink open, citing successful protocols.

Councilmember Whelan supported the staff's recommendation but stressed the importance of keeping the rink open to prevent people from traveling to Phoenix. She also inquired about expanding wifi access for students and others in need. Library Director Jared Tolman confirmed that efforts were underway to extend wifi coverage outside public buildings.

Councilmember Salas supported a return to Phase II with conditions, including keeping the rink open and receiving updates on special event permits. Mayor Evans agreed with the City Manager's recommendation and inquired about reopening public restrooms, to which Ms. Hansen explained the challenges due to freezing conditions.

City Manager Clifton concluded by thanking the Mayor and Council, noting that this would be a regular agenda item.

11. Public Participation

None.

12. Informational Items To/From Mayor, Council, and City Manager; future agenda item requests

Councilmember Whelan attended the ADOT Community Forum and emphasized the importance of the Milton Corridor's Bus Rapid Transit system, highlighting the need for signal accommodations to support transit.

Councilmember Salas thanked those who donated to the Flagstaff Family Food Center (FFFC), raising over \$35,000 for the food drive.

Vice Mayor Shimoni expressed gratitude for the FFFC efforts, mentioned the Giving Advent Box program, and acknowledged the Arizona Board of Regents' cancer-free status. He also thanked Bill Ring and an NAU student group for their contributions.

Councilmember Odegaard shared a story about a customer who donated to FFFC after watching Council videos.

City Manager Clifton encouraged viewing the latest GCTV content, and shared that he forwarded an email regarding the shelter from Ross Altenbaugh. He wished everyone a happy Thanksgiving.

Mayor Evans thanked Johnny Mack, owner of Hotel Du Beau, for allowing filming there. She mentioned a video on the Green Book, set to be released by December 10, 2020 and an upcoming W.C. Riles dialogue on December 9, 2020.

13. Adjournment

The Work Session of the Flagstaff City Council held November 24, 2020, adjourned at 8:52 p.m.

ATTEST:

MAYOR

CITY CLERK