

## MINUTES

### 1. Call to Order

Mayor Daggett called the meeting of the Flagstaff City Council held December 12, 2023, to order at 3:04 p.m.

#### NOTICE OF OPTION TO RECESS INTO EXECUTIVE SESSION

*Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the City Council and to the general public that, at this work session, the City Council may vote to go into executive session, which will not be open to the public, for discussion and consultation with the City's attorneys for legal advice on any item listed on the following agenda, pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(3).*

### 2. Roll Call

*NOTE: One or more Councilmembers may be in attendance through other technological means.*

PRESENT:

ABSENT:

MAYOR DAGGETT  
VICE MAYOR ASLAN  
COUNCILMEMBER HARRIS  
COUNCILMEMBER HOUSE  
COUNCILMEMBER MATTHEWS  
COUNCILMEMBER MCCARTHY  
COUNCILMEMBER SWEET

Others present: City Manager Greg Clifton; City Attorney Sterling Solomon.

### 3. Pledge of Allegiance, Mission Statement, and Land Acknowledgement

The Council and audience recited the pledge of allegiance, Councilmember McCarthy read the Mission Statement of the City of Flagstaff, and Councilmember House read the Land Acknowledgement.

#### MISSION STATEMENT

*The mission of the City of Flagstaff is to protect and enhance the quality of life for all.*

#### LAND ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

*The Flagstaff City Council humbly acknowledges the ancestral homelands of this area's Indigenous nations and original stewards. These lands, still inhabited by Native descendants, border mountains sacred to Indigenous peoples. We honor them, their legacies, their traditions, and their continued contributions. We celebrate their past, present, and future generations who will forever know this place as home.*

Mayor Daggett reordered the agenda to take Item 7 before Item 4.

#### 4. Public Participation

*Public Participation enables the public to address the council about items that are not on the prepared agenda. Public Participation appears on the agenda twice, at the beginning and at the end of the work session. You may speak at one or the other, but not both. Anyone wishing to comment at the meeting is asked to fill out a speaker card and submit it to the recording clerk. When the item comes up on the agenda, your name will be called. You may address the Council up to three times throughout the meeting, including comments made during Public Participation. Please limit your remarks to three minutes per item to allow everyone to have an opportunity to speak. At the discretion of the Chair, ten or more persons present at the meeting and wishing to speak may appoint a representative who may have no more than fifteen minutes to speak.*

The following individuals addressed Council in support of leaving the Carbon Neutrality Plan as written:

- Sally Tyrrell
- Travis Bruner
- Stefan Sommer
- Sat Best
- Valarie Bryant
- Olivia Dunn
- Talyne Corlyn
- Mark James
- Megan Quinn
- Ted Martinez
- Jordyn DeMaio
- Gwen Waring
- Cherrie Smith
- Jill Stephenson
- Amy Wolkowinsky
- Bill Dunnett
- D. Troy Levitt
- Malcolm Calder
- Susan Rose
- Pat Ellsworth
- Paul Beier
- Dara Marks Marino
- McKenna Marino
- Lucia and Scarlett Morales
- Aneeka Bippus
- Leah Mundell
- Bert Harker-Road
- Susan Shapiro
- Kevin Hayes
- Peggy Chaikin
- Laura Nicholson
- John Fegyveresi
- Sam Wiley
- Carly Pierson
- Lyla Yango

Written comments in support of the existing Carbon Neutrality Plan were submitted by Annette Nystedt, Melinda Bell, and Kathleen Flaccus.

Malene Comes and Makaius Marks each addressed Council in opposition to the anti-camping ordinance.

Dapper Dre addressed Council and called for a moment of silence for Leanna Skoo, Joanna Wheaton, and all the people who died by motor vehicle violence. He also spoke about pedestrian and bicycle

safety infrastructure.

Dennis Givens addressed Council about plant-based diets and encouraged people to eat more vegetables.

Written comments were received from Sharon Bodine, Joan Dewey, about concerns with homelessness.

A break was held from 5:21 p.m. through 5:42 p.m.

#### 5. Review of Draft Agenda for the December 19, 2023 City Council Meeting

*Citizens wishing to speak on agenda items not specifically called out by the City Council may submit a speaker card for their items of interest to the recording clerk.*

None.

#### 6. City Manager Report

Mr. Clifton briefly reviewed his report.

#### 7. Economic Impact of Coconino Community College

Coconino Community College President Dr. Eric Heiser provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

WHAT IS AN ECONOMIC IMPACT ANALYSIS  
WHAT IS AN INVESTMENT ANALYSIS  
ABOUT COCONINO COUNTY  
CCC IN FY 2021-2022  
OVERVIEW OF RESULTS  
ECONOMIC IMPACT ANALYSIS  
STUDENT AND EMPLOYEE IMPACT  
TOTAL IMPACT  
INVESTMENT ANALYSIS  
STUDENT PERSPECTIVE  
TAXPAYER PERSPECTIVE  
SOCIAL PERSPECTIVE

Councilmember Matthews thanked President Heiser for CCC's commitment to the community.

Councilmember McCarthy asked President Heiser about the curriculum at CCC and if there were classes that were non-technical that stressed how to address social and workplace issues. President Heiser stated that classes placed significant emphasis on the work-ready skills that the business community needed. He added that work-ready skills were also included in certificate programs as well as in general education to create well-rounded students.

Vice Mayor Aslan thanked President Heiser and asked him to highlight the partnership between CCC and the city. President Heiser addressed the Lowes grant that came about because of the partnership with the city and Habitat for Humanity to build the walls for the Tiny Homes Project. He also spoke about the alliance with the City, the County, and Mountain Line and addressed the new diesel tech/mechanic program that will be housed at the new Mountain Line service facility.

Councilmember House asked about the shift in community colleges to be more akin to four-year degree programs and CCC had a very strong focus on technical degrees and community focus. President Heiser stated that the community needs were different in Coconino County and that he had never seen a partnership as strong as the partnership between CCC and NAU to meet those needs. He added that the partnership with FUSD was also unique and growing.

Councilmember Sweet thanked President Heiser and stated that she sees the shift in CCC.

Councilmember Harris thanked President Heiser and asked how they were preparing students to work with people who look different. President Heiser stated that the college was a majority-minority institution. He added that the curriculum stressed diversity of thought and that the student population influenced the diversity of thought and experience in addition to the classroom learning.

## 8. Flagstaff Climate Equity Atlas Research

Sustainability Division Climate Vulnerability and Resilience VISTA Gracie Rechkemmer introduced Graduate Students in the Climate Science and Solutions Program Esraa Abdelkader, Tongayi Mwedzi, and Dwayne Canfield who provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

EQUITY IN THE CARBON NEUTRALITY PLAN  
HOW DO OTHER CITIES OPERATIONALIZE EQUITY?  
WHAT IS AN EQUITY ATLAS?  
HOW COULD AN EQUITY ATLAS BE USED IN FLAGSTAFF?  
NAU RESEARCH  
WHERE ARE WE NOW?  
FLAGSTAFF CLIMATE EQUITY ATLAS RESEARCH  
CLIMATE SCIENCE AND SOLUTIONS COHORT 2023  
STORY OF THE THREE LANDS  
WHAT IS AN EQUITY ATLAS?  
CLIMATE EQUITY ATLAS RESEARCH GOALS  
LITERATURE REVIEW  
GIS DATA AND MAPPING PROCESS  
DATA CAUTIONS AND GRADING  
FLOOD PLAINS AND MEDIAN HOUSEHOLD INCOME  
CENSUS BLOCKS WHERE MEDIAN AGE IS OVER 65 OVERLAID ON HOUSING UNIT RISK FROM WILDFIRE  
PROXIMITY TO MOUNTAIN LINE BUS ROUTES  
PROXIMITY TO FLAGSTAFF PARKS AND OPEN SPACES  
FLAGSTAFF CLIMATE EQUITY RESEARCH STORY MAP - ONLINE  
RECOMMENDATIONS  
CONCLUSION  
PROJECT OUTPUTS

Councilmember House thanked the students for their work and stated that she was struck by the transit map. She asked if impact forecasting was a part of the study and if there are any built-in ways to map in equity when the ideas are implemented. Mr. Canfield fielded the question and referred to the need to collect more data once implementations are done.

Councilmember Harris asked how long the students have been in their graduate studies. Mr. Mwedzi stated that the cohort consisted of a mixed group, and Councilmember Harris complimented them on their research. Councilmember Harris commented that the city needs to think about where housing was being placed and that it needs to not be placed in historically underrepresented communities. She added that it would be helpful to have specific examples and that she would like to see the work presented in the presentation continued. She addressed the Story Maps and stated that they are very important for people to understand the issues. Councilmember Harris ended by saying that the issues are social justice issues, and that Council needed to not be afraid to talk about them through the process.

Councilmember Matthews also complimented the presentation and the students. She asked about the housing unit risk and expressed concerns about how to communicate resources to people who may not have access to the internet.

Mayor Daggett echoed the sentiments of the rest of Council and spoke about the partnership with NAU and how it is great to use the partnership to inform policy.

**9. Design of pickleball courts at Bushmaster Park.**

Assistant Parks, Recreation, Open Space, and Events Director Amy Hagin provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

DESIGN OF PICKLEBALL COURTS AT BUSHMASTER PARK  
HISTORY AND COUNCIL DIRECTION  
CHANGES TO THE ORIGINAL CONTRACT  
PREVIOUS CONTRACT  
NEW CONTRACT WITH LOGAN SIMPSON DESIGN, INC.  
DUE DILIGENCE ON DESIGN  
CONCEPT DESIGN  
1 FOR 1 TREE REPLACEMENT  
NEXT STEPS  
CURRENT VERSUS POST-CONSTRUCTION MANAGEMENT BY PROSE

Councilmember Harris asked about the dual-striped pickleball courts. She asked what would happen if pickleball players got on the courts. Ms. Hagin stated that the play would not be permitted and that citizens could contact the Parks Department which would ask them to leave.

Councilmember Matthews asked about a noise abatement wall. Ms. Hagin stated that the contract in May did not contain noise abatement so there was no noise abatement included. Without a noise study, there was no standard for noise reduction. Councilmember Matthews stated that she would like to ensure that noise abatement was included in future designs such as trees and bushes. Parks, Recreation, Open Space, and Events Director Rebecca Sayers stated that the trees being added to the area and moving the courts north would add noise abatement.

Councilmember House thanked Ms. Hagin for the attention that had been put into the project.

Councilmember Sweet expressed her gratitude and asked if the new plants would need irrigation. Ms. Hagin stated that irrigation would be needed, but that it could easily be brought to the area with little expense due to its existing proximity.

Councilmember McCarthy asked about noise mitigation and stated that he did not think that the trees were enough and that a noise mitigation wall should be installed.

Councilmember Harris added that there was no way to satisfy everyone when it comes to installing the pickleball courts. She also stated that the maple trees proposed grow very large and they are impressive.

Councilmember McCarthy spoke about the history of a previously proposed pickleball court that was not created near the old Public Works Yard.

**10. Public Works Streets Section Snow Operations Presentation and Discussion**

Public Works Streets Section Director Sam Beckett provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

PRESENTATION OBJECTIVES  
STREETS SNOWPLOW FLEET  
STREETS STAFFING

Mayor Daggett asked about the comparison between last year's vacancy rate and this year's vacancy rate. Mr. Beckett stated that last year the vacancy rate was about 30% and this year the vacancy rate sits at about 50%.

SNOW SHIFTS - EQUIPMENT AND STAFFING  
DAY SHIFT  
NIGHT SHIFT  
GRADER/LOADER SHIFT

STREETS SNOW RESPONSE POLICY  
STREETS - SNOW PLOWING PRIORITIES  
STREETS RESPONSIBILITIES  
DAY TIME SNOW DEVIATIONS  
POST EVENT  
STREETS STRATEGIC VISION AND GOALS

Councilmember Harris asked about the staff vacancy rate and what the problem was in regards to hiring people for the positions. Mr. Beckett stated that there were a number of retirements, pay had been an issue for technicians, and that offers have been declined due to compensation. Mr. Beckett added that discussions were ongoing regarding compensation at the city. Councilmember Harris asked if people who were being hired come from the Flagstaff area and Mr. Beckett replied that there were requirements that employees must live within 30 miles of the city, but that the requirements were being pushed to include people who live further away. City Manager Clifton added that there were similar vacancy rates across the organization, although the Streets Division is a bit higher than the rest of the organization. He added that the minimum wage was cutting into the candidate pool since it was a very physically demanding job. Public Works Director Scott Overton added that there was a reliance previously on private organizations having an "off-season" for their employees to join us as contractors, but that seems to not be the case any longer. He added that there will always be a reliance on temp workers for snow operations.

Councilmember House thanked Mr. Beckett's team for the creative thought they put into the program. She asked about the challenges of the parking enforcement and the parking restrictions. Mr. Beckett stated that the parking ordinance helped staff since they can ask for cars to be moved. They do not have that ability during the daytime. Moving forward, they will not attempt to go down any route that is too narrow due to parked cars during the day. They are working on public education with Public Affairs. Police Chief Dan Musselman added that the Police Department handed out warnings for the first two weeks of the ordinance period and that they are now in the citation period. During a snowstorm, they will try to contact the owner of the car to have it moved, but they will tow the car if they cannot contact the owners.

Mayor Daggett asked if parking aides or someone from ParkFlag could help out the Police Department with parking citations. Chief Musselman stated that ParkFlag was used for daytime operations downtown, but that the Police Department uses their police aides for more assistance in the evenings during snow events.

Councilmember Matthews stated that she was worried about the 50% vacancy rate. She asked what plans there were to communicate with the public about the struggle with staffing issues. Mr. Beckett stated that the Streets Department hosted their first stakeholders meeting the prior week where they ran through the presentation. Mr. Beckett stated that the expectations from the Snow Operations Manual would be distributed by the Public Affairs team.

Councilmember Sweet stated that she did a few ride-alongs last year. She asked how the Streets Department would address the bike lanes. Mr. Beckett stated that the department has not heard a lot from the public regarding the bike lanes regarding the transitions that they had implemented. He added that they would not be able to service the curbed areas, but that he would present more information at a future meeting in January 2024. He added that the transition phase had seemed to go well. Councilmember Sweet added that it would be good to get that information out to the biking community now.

Councilmember McCarthy asked about the predictions of the snow season in comparison to the prior year. Mr. Beckett stated that staff was hopeful to see a balanced snow year, but that the National Weather Service stated that there would be more precipitation and it would be cold. Councilmember McCarthy also asked about getting cinders off of the bicycle and pedestrian lanes and removal of snow off the FUTS trails. Mr. Beckett stated that the cinders were best removed by the big street sweepers, but that the curbed bike lanes made that difficult. He added that the main arterials and hills get serviced first. It does take a long time to get to the bicycle arterials.

Mayor Daggett stated her appreciation and asked about plows pushing snow back onto the sidewalks

and if there was any effort to ensure that the snow would not be pushed onto the sidewalks. Mr. Beckett stated that they train plow drivers to leave space, especially in the corners, and that they understand where the curbs are. They try to avoid the impacts as best as they can and to get into the communities faster.

Keith Becker addressed Council regarding sidewalks. He stated that 75% to 90% sidewalks were useless after a winter storm and 95% were useless for wheelchair users. He stated that there is a need for enforcement of the sidewalk care. He added that there is a need for education of the public and education for the plow drivers. He stated that the berms on corners limits mobility for disabled sidewalk users.

**11. Water, Wastewater, Reclaimed Water Rate Study Presentation 1 of 2 on Capacity Fees and Misc. Fees Presentation from Stantec**

Water Resources Manager Erin Young and Carol Malesky from Stantec provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

AGENDA  
SCOPE OVERVIEW  
CAPACITY AND MISCELLANEOUS FEES: OVERVIEW  
LEGAL GUIDANCE  
CAPACITY FEE APPROACH OVERVIEW  
CAPACITY FEE APPROACHES  
CURRENT CAPACITY FEES  
CAPACITY FEE OPTIONS  
CAPACITY FEE COMPARISON

Mayor Daggett stated that she has been asked why the capacity fees were so high. She stated that she understood that the city was only charging what it takes to deliver the service. Ms. Malesky stated that the cost is only for the infrastructure over ten years and does not cover maintenance or improvements. The infrastructure fee was set in 2016. Mayor Daggett stated that every ten years, the city then needed to estimate the increase in cost so that they do not charge future developments for the past costs. Ms. Malesky confirmed that.

LIST OF MISCELLANEOUS FEES UNDER REVIEW  
MISCELLANEOUS FEE PROCESS  
COST-OF-SERVICE ANALYSIS: OVERVIEW  
CITY OF FLAGSTAFF WATER AND SEWER RATES  
HOW MANY CUSTOMERS WE HAVE - WATER SYSTEM  
FY 2023 INSIDE-CITY WATER CONSUMPTION AND CURRENT RATES  
SEWER RATES  
HOW MANY CUSTOMERS WE HAVE - WASTEWATER SYSTEM  
FY 2023 WASTEWATER CONSUMPTION AND CURRENT RATES  
RECLAIMED WATER  
HOW MANY CUSTOMERS WE HAVE - RECLAIMED WATER  
FY 2023 RECLAIMED WATER CONSUMPTION AND CURRENT RATES  
HISTORICAL NUMBER OF RESIDENTIAL WATER BILLS PER 1,000 GALLONS

Mayor Daggett asked what some categories were of outside city water users. Ms. Young stated that there were some HOAs that the city sold water to and that it was not super common.

COST-OF-SERVICE ANALYSIS: OVERVIEW  
COST ALLOCATION FACTORS  
ALLOCATE WATER SYSTEM COSTS TO FUNCTIONS  
ALLOCATE WASTEWATER SYSTEM COSTS TO FUNCTIONS  
TREATMENT PROCESS FLOW - WILDCAT HILL  
NEXT STEPS

Mayor Daggett asked where the public could weigh in on the different options. Ms. Young stated that the public could attend Water Commission and City Council meetings, call staff, and go to [www.cleanwater.com](http://www.cleanwater.com). Ms. Young added that there would be additional public meetings in the future. Mayor Daggett asked if the final decision would be made in January or if that would be just suggestions. Ms. Young stated that options would be presented in January and final decisions would be made in May or June.

Councilmember McCarthy addressed how the fee structure was investigated previously and spoke about the volatility of the fee when it is based on a variable rate.

Councilmember Harris asked Ms. Young to explain the Sustainability fee and the Wildland Resources Protection fee. Management Services Director Rick Tadder stated that the Wildland Resources Protection Fee went to forest thinning and infrastructure for forest protection. He added that the Sustainability fee goes towards the Sustainability function. He indicated that the municipal bill was not just a water bill and that trash service, taxes, and fees were also included. The consumption and the fees are a way to gather revenues to collect fees and is a mechanism that ties into your water bill. City Attorney Solomon added that these fees are not related to water.

## 12. Public Participation

William Tyler Head addressed Council about nuclear weapons. He stated the International Campaign to Abolish Nuclear Weapons (ICAN) Cities Appeal and added that a citizen's petition regarding the appeal would be on a future agenda. He stated that he would attend the meeting on December 19, 2023, to speak on the agenda item.

## 13. Informational Items To/From Mayor, Council, and City Manager; future agenda item requests

Councilmember McCarthy shared that he attended the Transportation Commission meeting, and they had a presentation from Engineering on the speed limit on Butler. They also spoke about the engineering standards which will come to Council for formal approval. He added that he is no longer able to serve as a chair for MetroPlan and Councilmember Sweet is now the Vice Chair.

Councilmember Harris stated that the Newtown Remembrance at the Murdoch Center would be later that week.

Councilmember Matthews shared that she enjoyed serving the senior community at the Joe C. Montoya Senior Center.

Mayor Daggett shared that she had a meeting with staff regarding the snow heroes' program. She also shared a reminder about the Toys for Tots boxes, and pointed out one is at City Hall.

## 14. Adjournment

The Work Session of the Flagstaff City Council held December 12, 2023, adjourned at 9:15 p.m.

---

MAYOR

ATTEST:

---

CITY CLERK