

MINUTES

1. Call to Order

Mayor Deasy called the Work Session of May 11, 2021, to order at 3:01 p.m.

NOTICE OF OPTION TO RECESS INTO EXECUTIVE SESSION

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the City Council and to the general public that, at this work session, the City Council may vote to go into executive session, which will not be open to the public, for legal advice and discussion with the City's attorneys for legal advice on any item listed on the following agenda, pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(3).

2. Pledge of Allegiance and Mission Statement

The Council and audience recited the pledge of allegiance and Councilmember Salas read the Mission Statement of the City of Flagstaff.

MISSION STATEMENT

The mission of the City of Flagstaff is to protect and enhance the quality of life for all.

3. Roll Call

NOTE: One or more Councilmembers may be in attendance through other technological means.

PRESENT:

ABSENT:

MAYOR DEASY (virtually)
VICE MAYOR DAGGETT (virtually)
COUNCILMEMBER ASLAN (virtually)
COUNCILMEMBER MCCARTHY (virtually)
COUNCILMEMBER SALAS (virtually)
COUNCILMEMBER SHIMONI (virtually)
COUNCILMEMBER SWEET (virtually)

Others present: City Manager Greg Clifton; City Attorney Sterling Solomon.

4. Public Participation

Public Participation enables the public to address the council about items that are not on the prepared agenda. Public Participation appears on the agenda twice, at the beginning and at the end of the work session. You may speak at one or the other, but not both. Anyone wishing to comment at the meeting is asked to fill out a speaker card and submit it to the recording clerk. When the item comes up on the agenda, your name will be called. You may address the Council up to three times throughout the meeting, including comments made during Public Participation. Please limit your remarks to three minutes per item to allow everyone to have an opportunity to speak. At the discretion of the Chair, ten or more persons present at the meeting and wishing to speak may appoint a representative who may have no more than fifteen minutes to speak.

None.

5. Review of Draft Agenda for the May 18, 2021 City Council Meeting

Citizens wishing to speak on agenda items not specifically called out by the City Council may submit a speaker card for their items of interest to the recording clerk.

None.

6. Proclamation: Teacher Appreciation Week

Mayor Deasy read the proclamation.

7. 2021 Wildland Fire Preparedness Briefing

Wildland Fire Manager Paul Oltrogge, National Weather Service Meteorologist Tony Merriman, Coconino National Forest Deputy Fire Staff Jeremy Human, and Grand Canyon National Park Chief of Fire and Aviation Lucas Minton gave a presentation to Council on local preparedness efforts and planning for the upcoming 2021 wildfire season. The PowerPoint presentation covered the following:

- 2021 Wildland Fire Preparedness
- Partners and Presenters
- 2021 Fire Season Outlook
- Drought Monitor
- 90-Day (May-June-July) Outlook
- Monsoon Season CPC Outlook
- Significant Wildland Fire
- Paul Oltrogge Flagstaff Fire Department
- Greater Flagstaff Treated Areas
- Wildland Fires in City Limits
- Flagstaff Fire Department -- Severity Staffing
- Flagstaff Fire Department -- Response
- Community Outreach
- Jeremy Human USFS Coconino National
- Coconino National Forest
- USFS Fire Fuels and Aviation Programs
- CoVid 19 Fire Response "What's changed?"
- 2021 Prescribed Fire
- Wildland Fire Dispatch
- Lucas Minton Grand Canyon Fire and Aviation
- Aviation Resources
- Fire Aircraft Near Flagstaff
- Questions?

APS North East Division Public Affairs Manager Janet Dean addressed Council to speak about APS's work with fire preparedness and mitigation.

Vice Mayor Daggett asked for elaboration on public outreach related to campfires and if there is any education in schools on how to put out fires and what goes out to the general public. Mr. Oltrogge stated that staff has is working with Discover Flagstaff to get the word out and the plan is to create a short video for public outreach.

Mr. Human added that the Coconino National Forest has applied for and been approved for severity funding. They receive the funding four weeks at a time. The funding for the next four weeks will allow them to extend staffing for local resources as well as bring additional resources ahead of high-risk events.

Economic Vitality Director Heidi Hansen elaborated on the public outreach efforts and stated that there will be a four-page insert in the Arizona Daily Sun on how to "Play and Stay Responsibly" and on fire

safety. They also collaborate with the Arizona Department of Tourism and a sticker created with Sustainability to help promote fire safety to locals and tourists. She added that the messages will also be placed in the local paper for ongoing messaging to locals and that there will be some videos made to promote fire safety.

Councilmember Shimoni expressed his gratitude and his support for the video efforts.

8. Forest Biomass Definitions, Amounts, Markets and Emerging Utilization Efforts

Forest Health Supervisor Neil Chapman gave an update to Mayor and Council on forest restoration-based biomass. School of Earth & Sustainability Biomass Utilization Efforts at NAU Associate Professor Erik Nielsen spoke to Mayor and Council regarding the NAU Climate Action Heating Options, the Preliminary NAU Heating Analysis, carbon neutrality, air quality, and opportunities and challenges. Flagstaff Water Group Member Robert Vance spoke about the safe disposal of sewage sludge. Their PowerPoint presentation covered the following:

- 2021 Report on Forest Restoration Biomass Products
- Biomass Discussion
- 140 Years of Fire Suppression Based on Forest Management
- Biomass 101
- Slash and Pulp Wood Pile
- Needles and Branches
- Current Biomass Markets
- Why does it matter?
- Cinder Lake Landfill
- Northern Arizona University
- NAU Climate Action Heating Options
- Preliminary NAU Hearing Analysis
- Carbon Neutral? It's complicated
- Air Quality -- biomass plant v. pile burn
- Opportunities and Challenges
- Flagstaff Water Group
- Flagstaff's Present Sludge Disposal System
- Present Sludge Disposal System Risks
- Increased Scrutiny may be imminent
- A Potential Solution for Flagstaff: Burn Sludge as a low fraction co-fuel with wood
- Thank you

Mayor Deasy asked Dr. Nielsen if there was any possibility to partner with NAU on using bio sludge for biofuel at NAU. Mr. Nielsen stated that they are working with the energy team and that it is a possibility.

Councilmember Aslan expressed his support of bio energy and addressed the criticisms of the discussion and asked for the presenters to expand on how this project is good for Flagstaff and how the energy providers in the area could work with this project. Mr. Chapman stated that he has spoken to the Sierra Club and that if the forest were healthy, this would not be a discussion, but that he does not hear a solution on removing the material from the woods from others. Dr. Nielsen added that the conversation about biomass is complicated, but that he feels this is the right way to go. Mr. Chapman added that the utility partners are good partners but that the utilities need some direction from the legislature. He offered to send some additional information on the political environment. Dr. Nielsen added that utilizing biomass for just energy production is very expensive and the Corporation Commission would need to require it in order to change.

Vice Mayor Daggett asked if there is any danger of pests being spread with these kinds of efforts. Mr. Chapman stated that the current market does not cause any concerns, but if there are exports or crossing state lines, then efforts would be made to mitigate pests.

Council took a ten-minute break from 4:35 p.m. through 4:45 p.m

9. Carbon Dioxide Removal Information and Discussion

Sustainability Director Nicole Antonopoulos introduced Climate and Energy Coordinator Ramon Alatorre who gave a presentation to Mayor and Council to provide baseline information about carbon dioxide removal (CDR). Their presentation covered the following:

- Carbon Dioxide Removal
- What is Carbon Dioxide Removal (CDR)
- Carbon Dioxide Removal
- Biological and Nature-Based CDR
- Geological CDR (and Storage)
- Technological CDR
- Biology + Technology + Geology
- Biology + Technology: Biochar
- Agenda Review
- Why Carbon Dioxide Removal -- Global
- Leadership Required
- Why Carbon Dioxide Removal -- Flagstaff
- Agenda Review
- Examples of Corporate Leadership
- Federal Incentives and Investments
- Example of Foundation Leadership
- Agenda Review
- Example of Local Government CDR
- What's Next
- Thank you

Councilmember Aslan asked how long before that stored carbon could be extracted as fuel and stated he thought it could be measured in geologic scale. He spoke about the 2030 carbon neutrality plan and added that this is a conversation that really should have started at least 20 years ago and that he is happy to see Flagstaff as an early adopter of carbon neutrality. He added that it will take a global effort and that Flagstaff can do their part. He stated that he hopes that the business community will come along.

Councilmember McCarthy stated that while our community cannot solve the problem, it can be a part of the solution.

Councilmember Sweet stated that all facets of the community need to be on board with this and asked if the Flagstaff business community have committed to carbon neutrality. Ms. Antonopoulos stated that staff has been working with the Chamber of Commerce and they hope to conduct a survey of Chamber members as well as getting the word out to them. She added that Nestle Purina has commitments to green energy.

10. Proposed amendment to the Zoning Code to modify the existing Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU) and accessory structure requirements (Case No. PZ-21-00066)

Zoning Code Manager Dan Symer gave a presentation to Mayor and Council on updates to the Zoning Code on Accessory Dwelling Unit and Accessory Structure Encroachments Requirements. The PowerPoint presentation covered the following:

- Objectives
- Proposed Zoning Code Text Amendment
 - Purpose
 - Questions for Consideration
- Types of Accessory Dwelling Units
- Proposed Zoning Code Text Amendment
 - Overview of Proposed Amendment
 - Discussion Topic
 - Provisions
 - Restrictive Covenant

- Potential Benefits
- Potential Drawbacks
- Potential Solution
- Questions for Consideration

Tyler Denham addressed Council and stated that he is in support of removing as many barriers against ADUs as possible.

Charlie Silver submitted written comments in opposition to the amendments.

Antoinette Beiser submitted written comments in opposition to allowing primary and accessory dwellings being rented out.

Councilmember McCarthy stated he looks at ADUs through the lens of affordable housing and that there needs to be a restriction on short-term rentals. He asked Mr. Symer to address why staff recommended a minimum of 30 days of rentals. Mr. Symer addressed that anything over 30 days is considered a long-term rental. Councilmember McCarthy commented that he does not see two units on one water meter as a big problem and he added that he is concerned about setbacks, especially with potential ADUs next to each other and with windows facing each other if they are only five feet apart. He also asked Mr. Symer if there is a maximum ratio of land that can be used for structures and if there is a potential of structures taking up 90% of the lot. Mr. Symer spoke about the zoning code of residential zones that have lot coverage requirements and explained that ADUs are not covered, but that there is a restriction on the size of the ADUs. Mr. Symer also addressed Councilmember McCarthy's window suggestion and stated that he would need to check with Fire and Building Officials about that.

Councilmember Shimoni stated that he is excited and that he loves ADUs for affordable housing. He also addressed the line of sight that Councilmember McCarthy brought up and stated that he does not see it as a large issue.

Councilmember Sweet stated that she had a positive experience with owning an ADU and asked how to monitor an ADU to ensure that it is not a vacation rental. Mr. Symer stated that it is easier with the current software the City owns to track short-term rentals. It is a complaint-based system, but STRs are required to get licenses in the City of Flagstaff.

Vice Mayor Daggett stated that she is a supporter of ADUs. She stated that she would allow the owner of the buildings to rent both dwellings, precluding STRs. She added that one meter is a positive thing since an additional meter would run about \$13,000.

City Manager Clifton spoke about the contracted service, Lodging Revs, to provide short-term rental inventory and compliance.

Mayor Deasy asked about the 16-foot height limit and if it prevents dwellings above garages. Mr. Symer stated that the current restriction on garages is 16-feet for the setback. They can go to 24-feet if it is detached or if it is attached, they can go to what the zone allows. Mr. Symer stated that this is less restrictive for the owner. Mayor Deasy stated that he is not concerned about the water meter but he is concerned about the 30-day maximum for short-term rentals. Mr. Symer stated that 30-days is standard and that the tax structure turns with 30-day rentals. Mayor Deasy would not like to restrict windows in regard to setbacks.

11. Update/Discussion on the City of Flagstaff Downtown Library ADA Entrance Project

Project Manager Jeremy DeGeyter gave a presentation to Mayor and Council on the updates to the Flagstaff Downtown Library ADA Entrance project. The PowerPoint presentation covered the following:

- Project Background and History
- Final Concepts
- Alternatives Under Consideration

- Next Steps
- Preliminary Art Concept

Charlie Silver submitted written comments in support of Concept 2 with Memorial Tree.

Mayor Deasy expressed his support for Concept 2, particularly for preserving the memorial tree and placing it over the parking area, without the need for stairs.

Councilmember Aslan also supported Concept 2, valuing the memorial tree's placement and the plaza, and expressed his appreciation for the design approach.

Councilmember Shimoni supported Concept 2 and Universal Design, emphasizing the importance of preserving the memorial tree.

Councilmember McCarthy agreed with Concept 2 but suggested adding stairs over the switchback, ensuring they don't lead into the plaza. He also advocated for saving both the memorial and Ash trees.

Mr. DeGeyter clarified that the location of the memorial tree in Concept 2 could vary and that stairs would have a handrail or wall to prevent cut-throughs.

Councilmember Sweet loved the front porch concept and supported Concept 2, with the memorial tree staying in place.

Vice Mayor Daggett liked Concept 2 and the trees over parking but was not fond of the stairs, seeking clarification on the parking design.

Councilmember Aslan proposed adding an interpretive timeline on the ramps, showcasing the site's history, including Flagstaff and the Buffalo Soldiers.

Mayor Deasy clarified that if the memorial tree was moved, it would need to be replaced.

Councilmember Sweet expressed a desire to keep the Ash tree.

Councilmember Shimoni supported Concept 2 without stairs and liked the timeline idea on the ramps.

Councilmember McCarthy emphasized landscaping over stairs and thanked everyone for considering that option.

Beautification Project Administrator Jana Weldon presented the preliminary art concept, highlighting Maria Salenger's recommendation.

Vice Mayor Daggett asked about sculptures interfering with railings, and Ms. Weldon clarified they would be offset to avoid blocking the railing.

Councilmember McCarthy liked the art concept but suggested incorporating other tribal languages, such as Hopi, and ensuring safety for the visually impaired. He proposed attaching the artwork to posts in the landscaping instead of handrails.

City Manager Clifton inquired about safety concerns with the sculptures, and Ms. Weldon confirmed safety was being addressed with the artist.

Vice Mayor Daggett and Mayor Deasy both expressed their support for the art concept.

Councilmember McCarthy reiterated his preference for attaching the artwork to posts instead of handrails.

Councilmember Shimoni loved the design and supported representing additional tribes in the artwork.

Councilmember Sweet praised the design and thanked everyone involved, expressing her support for

attaching the art to posts rather than handrails.

Economic Vitality Director Hansen addressed the artwork on the sidewalk by Aspen or moving it to a higher handrail. Ms. Weldon stated that it could not be done because of a safety issue since it is not over landscaping.

12. Public Participation

None.

13. Informational Items To/From Mayor, Council, and City Manager; future agenda item requests

Councilmember Salas stated that there is a joint meeting on the Museum Fire Flood Control District coming up. She wanted to know how the City is participating in the meeting. Public Affairs Director Jessica Drum replied that the meeting is a targeted neighborhood meeting similar to the meetings held in 2019 and will address the remaining flood risk in the area. The meeting will contain presentations on flood mitigation efforts from the County and the City. There will not be presentations by elected officials except a brief introduction by Mayor Deasy. There will also be a series of "on the street" meetings with the County.

Councilmember McCarthy spoke about MetroPlan and added that the Executive Director Jeff Meilbeck is moving to Colorado and he will work remotely for the next year.

Councilmember Aslan stated that he liked the library public art concept. He also spoke about meeting with Senator Mark Kelly about the Museum Fire and Forest Health.

Vice Mayor Daggett addressed vaccinations and spoke about the vaccination sites. She encouraged residents to get their vaccine.

Mayor Deasy also encouraged people to get vaccinated. He also spoke about the meeting with Senator Kelly.

14. Adjournment

The Work Session of the Flagstaff City Council held May 11, 2021, adjourned at 7:34 p.m.

MAYOR

ATTEST:

CITY CLERK