

## MINUTES

### 1. Call to Order

Mayor Evans called the Work Session of the Flagstaff City Council held November 10, 2020, to order at 3:00 p.m.

#### NOTICE OF OPTION TO RECESS INTO EXECUTIVE SESSION

*Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the City Council and to the general public that, at this work session, the City Council may vote to go into executive session, which will not be open to the public, for legal advice and discussion with the City's attorneys for legal advice on any item listed on the following agenda, pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(3).*

### 2. Pledge of Allegiance and Mission Statement

The Council and attendees recited the pledge of allegiance and Councilmember Salas read the Mission Statement of the City of Flagstaff.

#### MISSION STATEMENT

*The mission of the City of Flagstaff is to protect and enhance the quality of life for all.*

### 3. Roll Call

*NOTE: One or more Councilmembers may be in attendance through other technological means.*

PRESENT:

ABSENT:

MAYOR EVANS  
VICE MAYOR SHIMONI  
COUNCILMEMBER ASLAN  
COUNCILMEMBER MCCARTHY  
COUNCILMEMBER ODEGAARD  
COUNCILMEMBER SALAS  
COUNCILMEMBER WHELAN

Others present: City Manager Greg Clifton; City Attorney Sterling Solomon.

### 4. Public Participation

*Public Participation enables the public to address the council about items that are not on the prepared agenda. Public Participation appears on the agenda twice, at the beginning and at the end of the work session. You may speak at one or the other, but not both. Anyone wishing to comment at the meeting is asked to fill out a speaker card and submit it to the recording clerk. When the item comes up on the agenda, your name will be called. You may address the Council up to three times throughout the meeting, including comments made during Public Participation. Please limit your remarks to three minutes per item to allow everyone to have an opportunity to speak. At the discretion of the Chair, ten or more persons present at the meeting and wishing to speak may appoint a representative who may have*

*no more than fifteen minutes to speak.*

None.

## 5. Review of Draft Agenda for the November 17, 2020 City Council Meeting

*Citizens wishing to speak on agenda items not specifically called out by the City Council may submit a speaker card for their items of interest to the recording clerk.*

None.

## 6. PBB Final Priorities and Objectives

City Assistant Finance Director Heidi Derryberry, Management Analyst Sarah Langley, and Management Services Director Rick Tadder presented the results from the PBB community input survey, the ways the survey results were incorporated into the PBB priorities, and the next steps to Mayor and Council. Their presentation covered the following:

PRIORITY BASED BUDGETING  
COMMUNITY INPUT SURVEY  
PBB SURVEY DISSEMINATION  
PBB SURVEY RESULTS -- DEMOGRAPHICS  
PBB SURVEY RESULTS  
PBB IMPLEMENTATION SCHEDULE  
THANK YOU

Mayor Evans asked about the identification of law enforcement in objective one in Safe and Healthy Community and why it did not state public safety rather than law enforcement. She was concerned that the language was restrictive. Ms. Langley stated that staff will make the change for the approved objective.

Mayor Evans asked for staff to have more conversations on public participation versus public education so staff and the community are clear on expectations of involvement. Staff will reach out to Comprehensive Planning Manager Sara Dechter for her input on the Inclusive and Engaged Community objective.

Councilmember Odegaard noted that bicycle ridership is down in the Flagstaff community at this time and spoke about the impact on the multi-modal transportation objective.

Councilmember Whelan asked about Environmental Stewardship objective number five and what social equity means. Ms. Langley stated that social equity centered around the cost of living balanced with environmental concerns. Councilmember Whelan suggested that the wording might be better as social inequities rather than equity. Ms. Langley stated that staff would incorporate the suggestion.

Councilmember McCarthy pointed out that there are goals that are conflicting in our PBB priorities. Mayor Evans added that she sees those conflicts as well and looks forward to how the conflicts are addressed by staff and budget.

Vice Mayor Shimoni expressed his gratitude to staff and the city embracing growth moving forward.

Councilmember Salas commented on the Sustainable, Innovative Infrastructure objective and keeping the language on the multi-modal transportation in the wording. She also stated that the City needs to think outside the box regarding higher education institutions in the Robust, Resilient Economy goal to include the private sector and other organizations.

Mr. Tadder addressed the multi-modal transportation language change and why the change was made. Vice Mayor Shimoni stated that he agreed with Mr. Tadder and that the change is needed for clarity. Mayor Evans added that the suggested edit does not reflect the airport or the railway. She added that other forms of transportation should not be left out. Councilmember Salas agreed and

Councilmember McCarthy suggested that the language incorporate something like all modes of transportation rather than multi-modal transportation.

Mayor Evans asked if there is anything that has to do with supporting small businesses in the goals. Ms. Langley stated that they are incorporated in the second goal in objective two.

Deputy City Manager Shane Dille suggested the language of "Provide effective air and roadway traffic management and expand infrastructure for pedestrians, bicyclists and public transit" but stated that it is captured by Mr. Tadder's proposal. His suggestion was to change the language to "Provide effective traffic management for all modes of transportation."

Mayor Evans thanked staff for their efforts on the detailed survey and asked where Core Services fall into the PBB Objectives. Ms. Langley pointed out the goals and objectives that are incorporated in the PBB plan.

## 7. Employee Survey Results

HR Manager and outgoing chair of Team Champions Jennifer Caputo, City Records Coordinator Larisa Feyti, Water Services Management Analyst Lisa Deem, and Customer Service Representative Krista Devlin presented to Mayor and Council the result of the 2019 Employee Survey. They provided a presentation that covered the following:

EMPLOYEE SURVEY 2019 RESULTS  
2019 EMPLOYEE SURVEY  
2019 OVERALL RESULTS  
SOLUTIONS  
CITYWIDE WE ARE ACCOMPLISHING OUR MISSION AND UPHOLDING OUR VALUES  
COMPARED TO OTHERS IN MY LINE OF WORK, I AM PAID FAIRLY  
PAID FAIRLY COMMENTS  
NEXT STEPS  
QUESTIONS

City Manager Greg Clifton thanked the Champions Team for their work. He addressed the budget project that concluded in June and the letter that he completed in July. He pointed out some of the items in the letter such as PBB, the priorities, the City's economic status, and the revenue projections. He pointed out that the organization is smaller now than it was before the great recession. He added that retention is a large concern for the organization because of compensation.

Councilmember Whelan agreed with Mr. Clifton about compensation needing attention. She added that she is pleased that this is a priority for management. She also asked about retirement rates and what the typical rate of retirement is. Ms. Caputo stated that the number of retirements has been going up in recent history. Councilmember Whelan asked if the retirements were up the upper end of the pay scale and noted that the retirements could bring some savings. She added that the raises have not been equitable and across the board. She spoke about cost of living raises and merit raises. Human Resources Director Jeanie Gallagher added that the retirements in 2018 were 35 out of 105 separations and in 2019 were 25 out of 108 separations. She stated that those are very high rates.

Vice Mayor Shimoni added that he would like to see the culture of appreciation grow as well as the compensation.

Mayor Evans thanked Mr. Clifton for his analysis as well as Councilmember Whelan and Vice Mayor Shimoni. She added that the conversation about city employee compensation will need to be ongoing.

Councilmember McCarthy agreed with Mayor Evans and the others. He asked the City Manager to reach out to the new Councilmembers to ensure that they understand the results as well.

Councilmember Odegard added that there are significant challenges for the organization going forward. He expressed his gratitude to the hard-working employees of the City of Flagstaff.

Mayor Evans called a break and the meeting resumed at 4:50 pm.

**8. Housing Presentation to City Council on the impacts of COVID-19 on Flagstaff's most vulnerable community members**

Housing and Grants Administrator Kristine Pavlick, Ross Altenbaugh Flagstaff Shelter Services (FSS), Sandra Flores, Catholic Charities, and Michele Axlund, Coconino County Health and Human Services updated Mayor and Council on the impacts of COVID-19. Their presentation covered the following topics:

IMPACTS OF COVID -- 19 ON FLAGSTAFF'S VULNERABLE POPULATIONS  
FLAGSTAFF SHELTER SERVICES  
CATHOLIC CHARITIES  
FRONT DOOR  
COCONINO COUNTY HEALTH AND HUMAN SERVICES  
QUESTIONS

Councilmember Aslan asked Ms. Altenbaugh how the shelter is positioning themselves for the COVID-19 vaccine. Ms. Altenbaugh stated that they are partnering with North Country, Flagstaff Medical Center, and other health institutions. She stated that it is a priority for the community. Councilmember Aslan stated that it is very important that the community and FSS receives the vaccine as soon as possible.

Vice Mayor Shimoni stated his appreciation and asked what some of Ms. Altenbaugh's concerns are with moving into the winter. Ms. Altenbaugh stated that there are new concerns with overflow services not being practical and more hotel accommodations will need to be offered. There will also be staffing concerns.

Councilmember Whelan asked Ms. Altenbaugh about what Council can do to help and what the community can do to support FSS. Ms. Altenbaugh stated that the biggest support would be to come out to the shelter and learn about it through volunteer opportunities and to connect with the community. She also stated advocacy from elected officials would be beneficial as well.

Mayor Evans thanked everyone for their partnerships.

**9. Presentation and Recommendations:**

Housing and Grants Administrator Kristine Pavlick, Ross Altenbaugh Flagstaff Shelter Services (FSS), and Michele Axlund, Coconino County Health and Human Services lead the presentation regarding the additional CDBG funds. Her presentation covered the following:

COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT BLOCK GRANT FUNDS FOR SUPPORTING COMMUNITY  
RESPONSE TO COVID-19  
TODAY  
CDBG OVERVIEW  
COUNCIL DIRECTION & STAFF RESPONSIBILITIES  
CONDUCTING RISK ASSESSMENT  
THE CARES ACT AND CDBG-CV  
COUNCIL DIRECTION IN APRIL 2020  
COMMUNITY RESPONSE TO COVID-19 CDBG-CV FUNDS  
FUNDS AVAILABLE FOR ALLOCATION  
CDBG-CV RECOMMENDATIONS  
CDBG 2021-2022 ENTITLEMENT  
NEXT STEPS

Councilmember Whelan inquired about the \$200,000 that Coconino County Health and Human Services provides for FSS's Hoteling program, questioning why it does not go directly to the facility. Ms. Pavlick explained that the County covers the facility's costs, while FSS manages the costs for other sites. Ms. Axlund added that the County handles cleaning and room expenses and noted that

FEMA/DEMA reimbursement might not continue. She also shared that \$500,000 had been reimbursed out of \$2 million spent for Hotel Aspen, with the County still responsible for 25% of costs.

Councilmember Whelan also asked about collaboration in fund allocation, and Ms. Pavlik explained that for the first round, there was collaboration, but for this round, she checked with agencies individually to avoid overlap. The County explained that stays last 14 days or until medical care is no longer needed, with FSS not forcing people out based on symptoms. Councilmember Whelan expressed concern about the \$200,000 being excessive for the County, while FSS runs the program and serves many more people, though Ms. Axlund reiterated high cleaning costs. Councilmember Salas shares the same concern that Councilmember Whelan has.

Councilmember Odegaard suggested Flagstaff Family Food Center also be considered for funding. Vice Mayor Shimoni expressed concerns about future funding, particularly when state support ends, and asked for input from partnering organizations. They agreed with the current fund allocations and shared details on additional programs being funded.

Mayor Evans added appreciation for the partners and their work. She broke down the cost per person and stated that FSS is around \$100-\$120 while the county is about \$800 per person with most of that cost being allocated toward cleaning the rooms. She stated that public funding should be covering that, and the state has funding available that needs to be utilized. She would like to see staff assist with the county in voicing to the state, so they find success in their own grant funding. Mayor Evans also wanted to ensure the long-term housing goals are kept in mind. She would like to see the \$200,000 allocated toward the county to be split with the first three services as described: \$100,000 additional to FSS, and the remaining \$100,000 split between the two different Catholic Charities program, this would eliminate funding toward the county from this grant.

Majority of Council agrees with the proposal but would like to see staff recommend the new allocations between the three services. Staff will bring information to the next meeting.

**10. Discuss strategies that would recognize the true cost of carbon associated with transportation in Flagstaff and looking at options to offset that true cost in some fashion.**

Sustainability Director Nicole Antonopoulos led the discussion and reviewed the staff summary including information about greenhouse gas emissions and the carbon cost calculator.

Council took a break from 6:47 p.m. through 7:00 p.m.

Councilmember Whelan asked for clarification on the numbers and percentages presented and the remaining portion not accounted for. Ms. Antonopoulos stated that it is divided up by the greenhouse gas sector, waste sector, water and wastewater, and fugitive emissions to make up the full portfolio of emissions.

Councilmember McCarthy asked how emissions are allocated, especially when it comes to airplanes and accounting emissions from the source or destination. Ms. Antonopoulos stated that they are not source based. For airplanes, they consider refueling station as where the emissions are counted toward.

Mayor Evans asked if the overall sector of transportation is being discussed or one section of the sector. Ms. Antonopoulos stated that she is addressing the transportation sector overall. Mayor Evans asked if the economic impact includes comparing what flying one airplane vs 20 people driving is and what the value of cost is to that. Ms. Antonopoulos stated they are not currently comparing the number of flyers versus the number of drivers and comparing the impact of the transportation methods. She stated they will bring more information in the following months back to Council on how to address cutting emissions.

Vice Mayor Shimoni requested remote learning and work be factored into the studies as staff moves forward.

Councilmember Aslan stated he wanted to reiterate the purpose of the conversation was to find efforts to reduce carbon use and finding funding for these types of projects. He stated he would like city

buildings to be more sustainable as well and ensuring we look at the whole report and picture of addressing the climate emergency.

Mayor Evans would like to remind Council and staff that we also need to remember the people most impacted and how changing any policies could potentially drive people out as well.

Ms. Antonopoulos stated the intention is to find what is best for Flagstaff and to have the plan be a living document that is adaptable as the climate crisis changes and more information comes out over time.

**11. Discussion regarding the City's Bed, Board, and Beverage (BBB) appropriation.**

Management Service Director Rick Tadder led the discussion. He reviewed the history of the BBB tax. He reviewed how it was originally adopted by the Flagstaff voters in 1988. The BBB tax is a 2% local transaction privilege tax (TPT) levy on the gross revenue generated from hotels, motels, campgrounds, bars, and restaurants, and is in addition to all other state and local transaction privilege taxes. The BBB tax was originally approved for a 10-year period in 1988, and revenues were allocated to fund Tourism, Beautification, Economic Development, and Administration.

Councilmember Whelan spoke about how this is a voter decision and discussed the background of the allocations of the BBB tax. She also explained what she hoped to accomplish by bringing this item forward.

Councilmember McCarthy stated he is openminded about some of the percentages changing, but he feels the discussion is premature. He stated that it would be contrary to the trust of the voters to change the allocations at this time.

Vice Mayor Shimoni stated that he supports this item to move forward. He also asked if there is room to integrate this into the PBB progress.

City Manager Clifton stated that it is a good idea to add this to the PBB progress to assist figuring out the allocations. He also added that this could be added to the discussion queue to prepare for the next vote.

Vice Mayor Shimoni asked when this would be reviewed. Mr. Tadder stated that it is up for renewal at the November 2024 election.

Councilmember Whelan reiterated this would be a ballot measure for 2024 and provided additional numbers from the budget book that the BBB tax assisted with.

Mayor Evans states the BBB tax is something she has been tracking during her time with Council and she encourages the next and new incoming Council to use this tax for promoting Tourism. She states the industries that had a major influence in the tax are disgruntled that they are not being recognized or honored. She stated conversations moving forward should be with these groups to see what they would like for the community and ensuring the allocations are still appropriate.

Vice Mayor Shimoni and Councilmember McCarthy support Mayor Evans comments and the need for more conversations.

**12. Public Participation**

None.

**13. Informational Items To/From Mayor, Council, and City Manager; future agenda item requests**

Councilmember McCarthy expressed his appreciation to outgoing councilmembers and he is looking forward to working with the new councilmembers. He thanked the City Manager for his leadership.

Councilmember Whelan reported that she attended Community Census Team follow-up. She reported that our County/City did a great job all things considered and held same response rates as 2010.

Councilmember Salas thanked all military veterans. She shared that she had the opportunity to present at an inaugural Toastmasters International meeting via zoom for Filipinos all over the world.

Vice Mayor Shimoni acknowledged Elections Director and County Recorder Patty Hansen and her team. He felt the election was run smoothly and safely.

Mayor Evans expressed a Happy Veteran's Day toe veryone. She acknowledged County Recorder and the voters.

Councilmember Odegaard thanked Councilmember McCarthy for his service. He stated he recently attended RTAC meeting (Rural Transportation and Advocacy Council). He mentioned he will be coming off MetroPlan and RTAC so there will be openings for new Councilmembers.

#### 14. Adjournment

The Work Session of the Flagstaff City Council held November 10, 2020, adjourned at 8:10 p.m.

---

MAYOR

ATTEST:

---

CITY CLERK