

MINUTES

1. Call to Order

Mayor Daggett called the meeting of the Flagstaff City Council held January 6, 2024, to order at 3:00 p.m.

NOTICE OF OPTION TO RECESS INTO EXECUTIVE SESSION

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the City Council and to the general public that, at this work session, the City Council may vote to go into executive session, which will not be open to the public, for legal advice and discussion with the City's attorneys for legal advice on any item listed on the following agenda, pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(3).

2. Roll Call

NOTE: One or more Councilmembers may be in attendance telephonically or by other technological means.

PRESENT:

ABSENT:

MAYOR DAGGETT
VICE MAYOR ASLAN
COUNCILMEMBER HARRIS (virtually)
COUNCILMEMBER HOUSE
COUNCILMEMBER MATTHEWS
COUNCILMEMBER MCCARTHY
COUNCILMEMBER SWEET

Others present: Deputy City Manager Joanne Keene; City Attorney Sterling Solomon.

3. Pledge of Allegiance, Mission Statement, and Land Acknowledgement

The Council and audience recited the pledge of allegiance, Councilmember House read the Mission Statement and Councilmember Sweet read the Land Acknowledgement.

MISSION STATEMENT

The mission of the City of Flagstaff is to protect and enhance the quality of life for all.

LAND ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The Flagstaff City Council humbly acknowledges the ancestral homelands of this area's Indigenous nations and original stewards. These lands, still inhabited by Native descendants, border mountains sacred to Indigenous peoples. We honor them, their legacies, their traditions, and their continued contributions. We celebrate their past, present, and future generations who will forever know this place as home.

4. Public Participation

Public Participation enables the public to address the council about items that are not on the prepared agenda. Public Participation appears on the agenda twice, at the beginning and at the end of the work session. You may speak at one or the other, but not both. Anyone wishing to comment at the meeting is asked to fill out a speaker card and submit it to the recording clerk. When the item comes up on the agenda, your name will be called. You may address the Council up to three times throughout the meeting, including comments made during Public Participation. Please limit your remarks to three minutes per item to allow everyone to have an opportunity to speak. At the discretion of the Chair, ten or more persons present at the meeting and wishing to speak may appoint a representative who may have no more than fifteen minutes to speak.

Jill Stephenson, a volunteer with Northern Arizona Climate Change Alliance, addressed Council regarding fleet electrification and the benefits of switching to electric-only vehicles. She shared a few ideas on how best to achieve the goal.

Libby Stortz submitted a written comment opposing the Flagstaff First petition.

5. Review of Draft Agenda for the January 16, 2024 City Council Meeting

Citizens wishing to speak on agenda items not specifically called out by the City Council may submit a speaker card for their items of interest to the recording clerk.

None.

6. Proclamation: Human Trafficking Awareness Month

Mayor Daggett read the proclamation.

7. Commission Update: Open Space Commission

Open Space Commission Chairperson Mike Wilson and Open Space Supervisor Robert Wallace provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

DISCUSSION TOPICS
OPEN SPACE COMMISSION AUTHORITY
OPEN SPACE COMMISSION HISTORY
COMMUNITY GOALS & BENEFITS
IMPORTANT TERMINOLOGY
EXISTING OS REGIONAL PRESERVES
CONNECTORS & REGIONAL PRESERVES
UPHOLDING PBB AND OTHER GOALS
RECENT ACCOMPLISHMENTS
CURRENT COMMISSION PROJECTS
FUTURE COMMISSION PROJECTS
RECOMMENDATIONS FOR CITY COUNCIL
OPEN SPACE COMMISSIONERS

Councilmember House asked if the Open Space Commission's strategic plan is public. Mr. Wallace said it is an internal document but can be shared. She also inquired about how zoning and development changes are considered and how Council can best collaborate with the commission. Mr. Wallace mentioned that the Parks, Recreation, Open Space, and Events (PROSE) Division is working on a master plan with maps of potential open space areas, which will be shared with Council and Community Development.

Vice Mayor Aslan expressed support for creating more open space in southeast Flagstaff and suggested integrating wildlife corridors into the commission's priorities. He asked about plans to

incorporate these corridors. Mr. Wilson said they are being considered in the Observatory Mesa process, and Mr. Wallace added that staff is working to include them in the Regional Plan.

Councilmember McCarthy said Flagstaff's open spaces are a major reason he loves living there. He supports wildlife corridors and connectivity, appreciating that these are being included in current plans. He also noted his satisfaction that a Planning and Zoning Commission member is part of the Open Space Commission.

Councilmember Sweet thanked the commission for their work, saying it enhances the community's character.

Mayor Daggett also thanked the commission and expressed her long-time support for open space. She asked about outdoor education opportunities. Mr. Wallace responded that the current Open Space Coordinator, Sarah Holditch, focuses on public education and that the team plans to request funding to extend that position.

8. Discussion on 2024 State and Federal Legislative Priorities

Public Affairs Director Sarah Langley introduced the legislative team, including consultants Bob Holmes with Nexus Consulting and Brian Murray with Cornerstone Public Affairs, and presented an overview of the legislative priorities. Ms. Langley shared the Federal Legislative Priorities and the State Legislative Priorities documents and asked for feedback from the Council.

Councilmember Matthews asked why the phrase "utilize funding" was included in the documents. Ms. Langley explained it was to support grant applications and funding requests, including grants and appropriations.

Councilmember McCarthy suggested updating the Climate Change heading to include "at the community and national scale" so Flagstaff can encourage national leadership.

Councilmember House raised concerns about affordable housing, specifically the impact of Housing Choice Voucher rent determinations that disadvantaged communities like Flagstaff due to large county-wide market rates. She recommended pursuing federal conversations to reconsider how these rent standards are set. Ms. Langley agreed this was important and said staff would revise the language on affordable housing priorities and share it with Council.

Councilmember Harris commented on challenges related to fire and flood insurance, sharing a story about Southside residents in a floodplain needing to buy flood insurance.

Vice Mayor Aslan suggested adding language about wildlife corridors to the Federal priorities and strengthening multi-modality language. He recommended downgrading rural broadband from a federal priority to a state priority to reflect current funding realities.

Councilmember Sweet asked about the Snow Removal Equipment Building at the airport. Grants, Contracts, and Emergency Management Director Stacey Brechler-Knaggs reported the City has received \$4 million in grants, with another \$3 million expected, but still needs \$15 million more to complete the project.

Mayor Daggett emphasized sharing stories about Flagstaff residents' insurance struggles during lobbying. She also asked about broadband advocacy. Mr. Holmes noted that much broadband funding is now passed to states. Mayor Daggett stressed the importance of continuing broadband advocacy for equity and economic development.

Vice Mayor Aslan reiterated that rural broadband funding efforts should focus on State priorities rather than Federal, based on Mr. Holmes' explanation.

Mr. Murray provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

HYPER PARTISAN, RAZOR THIN MAJORITIES FOR REPUBLICANS

KEY DEADLINES FOR THE LEGISLATIVE SESSION
JOINT LEGISLATIVE BUDGET COMMITTEE (JLBC) - KEY POINTS -- BUDGET REALITY
MAJOR THEME OF SESSION: WATER POLICY

Ms. Langley went over the draft State Legislative Priorities.

Mayor Daggett acknowledged Mr. Murray's key role in securing flooding mitigation funding for Hwy 180.

Councilmember House asked about Housing Supply Committee recommendations on affordable housing through zoning or supply support. Mr. Murray noted the Home Builders Association largely opposes these measures until the "hundred-year rule" issue is addressed.

Councilmember House also raised concerns about Highway User Revenue Fund (HURF) allocations, especially with rising electric and hybrid vehicle use. Mr. Murray said bills are looking at shifting from one-time fees to mileage-based taxes. Councilmember House stressed the importance of monitoring multimodal electrification funding.

Councilmember Harris commented that the state waits for emergencies before acting on road funding. Mr. Murray added no state has yet proposed a workable tax system for electric vehicle road use.

Councilmember Matthews asked about LIHTC funding for statewide affordable housing; Mr. Murray will follow up. She also questioned lobbying for an "aggressive" clean energy standard, noting APS's current efforts and concerns about the term "aggressive."

Vice Mayor Aslan suggested including rural broadband in state priorities and emphasized partnerships on Dark Skies for better ADOT attention to nighttime lighting. He also proposed building a stronger relationship with the Arizona Corporation Commission.

Councilmember McCarthy supported rural broadband as a state priority, recommended removing "aggressive" from clean energy language, and clarified that inclusionary zoning is against state law.

Councilmember Sweet appreciated preserving local control and was comfortable moving rural broadband from federal to state priorities after hearing from Mr. Holmes that funding is state-based.

Mayor Daggett asked about state park funding support, which staff would back. She expressed concern over flat tax impacts and inquired about discussions on raising state income tax. Mr. Murray also noted the governor's interest in reducing ESAs. Mayor Daggett mentioned receiving a letter supporting connectivity funding.

Councilmember Harris recalled concerns from a community broadband meeting about potential funding pullbacks. Mr. Murray clarified the subsidy was federal.

Ms. Langley requested clarity on rural broadband's priority placement. Councilmember McCarthy suggested waiting for public comments before deciding. Councilmember Matthews noted broadband could be removed later if higher priorities emerge. Mr. Holmes saw no issue keeping it on the list.

Tyler Denham addressed Council regarding adding language to the affordable housing section such as "provide incentives and technical assistance to cities to sustainably increase their housing supply."

Tom Pearson addressed Council about fire and flood insurance. He asked why Flagstaff is not a Wildfire Airtanker Base like Prescott and spoke about the rapid response that would provide. He suggested Flagstaff get an air tanker base.

Michele James, Executive Director of Friends of Flagstaff's Future, suggested that the priorities address both Flagstaff's Climate and Housing emergencies. She stated that the priorities need to be more detailed and that the environmental changes must be broken apart in detail. She added that food supply needs to be added to the priorities and that there needs to be additional monies asked for in the affordable housing priority. She also expressed opposition to anti-ESG legislation.

Deputy City Manager Joanne Keene stated that staff will bring more information to Council regarding broadband. She shared that an RIF had been issued previously and she added that it would be helpful to keep the item on both the federal and state legislative priorities.

Councilmember House asked why the language in the document was broad rather than detailed. Ms. Langley explained that being too specific could limit the City's flexibility, and that more detailed lobbying priorities are included in separate federal and state packets prepared before each lobbying trip.

Councilmember McCarthy suggested adding a Wildfire Air Tank for Flagstaff to the priorities. Ms. Langley said she would follow up with the Fire Department on that.

Councilmember Harris emphasized that the priority list is not all-encompassing and should remain focused and narrow.

9. Presentation on Civil Rights and 2023 Municipal Equality Index

Management Analyst Chris Rhode provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

CIVIL RIGHTS ORDINANCE
PRESENTATION OVERVIEW
WHO IT APPLIES TO
WHO IS EXEMPT
PROTECTED CLASSES
COMPLAINT PROCESS

Vice Mayor Aslan asked how often this complaint process is initiated. Mr. Rhode stated that he might get one to two a year, but sometimes more.

MUNICIPAL EQUALITY INDEX
WHAT IS THE MUNICIPAL EQUALITY INDEX?
CONTENTS OF SCORECARD
FLAGSTAFF 2023 SCORECARD
WHERE WE GAINED POINTS

Mayor Daggett asked if the City had jurisdiction to create a ban on conversion therapy for minors. City Attorney Solomon stated he would follow up on that question.

WHERE WE LOSE POINTS
HOUSING NON-DISCRIMINATION LAWS

Councilmember House asked if Flagstaff has a fair housing ordinance. Housing Director Sarah Darr stated that the city does not due to the preemption from the state, but that the city is required to comply with the federal Fair Housing Act.

SINGLE-OCCUPANCY ALL-GENDER FACILITIES

Mayor Daggett asked about clarification on how to get the second point and Mr. Rhode stated that it would take an ordinance to require all-gender bathrooms in all buildings in the City, not just City-owned facilities.

CITY PROVIDES TRANSGENDER-INCLUSIVE HEALTHCARE BENEFITS
NON-DISCRIMINATION ORDINANCE IS ENFORCED BY CODA
YOUTH BULLYING PREVENTION POLICY FOR CITY SERVICES

Councilmember McCarthy stated that he would like to see an anti-bullying policy that is non-explicit.

LEADERSHIP'S PRO-EQUALITY LEGISLATIVE OR POLICY EFFORTS

OPENLY LGBTQ+ ELECTED OR APPOINTED LEADER(S) CITY TESTS LIMITS OF RESTRICTIVE STATE LAW

Councilmember House thanked Mr. Rhode for his work. She addressed the points lost regarding the openly LGBTQ+ Elected or Appointed Leaders and how it is not a discriminatory or problematic category. She stated that she is angered by losing points on this category and she would like staff to push back on the category. Councilmember House also addressed the youth program anti-bullying ordinance and stated that she would like Council to consider something along those lines that would include all protected classes. Mr. Solomon suggested language for the policy. Mr. Rhode stated that the anti-bullying policy would be very easy to implement. Council was supportive of staff working on a draft ordinance on youth bullying prevention.

Councilmember McCarthy stated that he agreed with Councilmember House.

Councilmember Harris stated that she was ok with not getting points in the Openly LGBTQ+ Elected or Appointed Leaders category and finds the category problematic.

Mayor Daggett called a break from 5:43 p.m. through 5:54 p.m.

10. **Housing Update and Follow-up Regarding Funding Allocations for the Homeless Shelter and Services Fund**

Housing Director Sarah Darr, Housing Program Manager Adriana Fisher, Assistant Housing Director Justyna Costa, and Housing and Grants Administrator Kristine Pavlik provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

PRESENTATION OVERVIEW

Councilmember Matthews requested detailed information on the funding allocations for homeless shelter and service funds, noting that the previous presentation lacked the data Council had asked for. Ms. Darr responded that more detailed information would be provided verbally, and procurement staff would address the concerns. Deputy City Manager Joanne Keene added that a few more slides had been added to the prior presentation. Ms. Darr also mentioned that Ms. Pavlik would share the methodology and additional details.

HOUSING PLAN UPDATE UPDATED PROGRESS CHART

Mayor Daggett asked how Ms. Fisher is coming up with the affordable units figure. Ms. Fisher explained how they process the figures.

Councilmember House asked if that includes the Aura project. Ms. Fisher stated that they are not yet built.

RECENTLY COMPLETED STRATEGIES RECENTLY COMPLETED STRATEGIES SOON TO BE COMPLETED ONGOING STRATEGIES 24/25 IMPLEMENTATION PLAN HOUSING COMMISSION MEMBERSHIP

Councilmember House expressed discomfort with asking commission applicants if they have been directly impacted by homelessness, suggesting a broader question to ease that discomfort.

Councilmember Matthews recommended updating the question to include an example related to experiencing homelessness.

Mayor Daggett noted that during commission recruitment, extra efforts could be made to reach out to people with homelessness experience and expressed openness to discussing the commission's makeup.

Councilmember Sweet supported these comments.

HOUSING BOND UPDATE

Mayor Daggett asked if there has been any feedback. Ms. Costa stated that the funds are making a difference.

CURRENT FEDERAL/STATE FUNDING

Councilmember Matthews inquired about the remaining \$307,000 from CDBG PY21 funds, and Ms. Darr said she would provide a detailed breakdown.

Councilmember Harris asked about the total remaining CDBG funds and their allowable uses; Ms. Darr explained the difference between program and fiscal years and noted funds support low-to-moderate income housing and public services, with 15% for economic development.

Councilmember Matthews questioned if agencies with unspent prior awards could receive new funds; Ms. Darr confirmed they could, but a new application question requires a spend-down plan. Ms. Costa noted this spending delay issue is not unique to Flagstaff.

Ms. Brechler Knaggs attributed some delays due to ARPA funding complexities and discussed the solicitation process. Purchasing Director Patrick Brown spoke about the grant evaluation process. Ms. Darr emphasized that the process was developed with procurement, grants, and legal teams, including risk assessment, with ultimate responsibility resting with staff.

FUTURE FEDERAL/STATE FUNDING HOMELESS SHELTER & SERVICES FUNDS HSSF PROCUREMENT HOMELESS SHELTER & SERVICES FUNDING RECOMMENDATIONS

Mayor Daggett asked about lowering the administrative fee, and staff expressed comfort with a reduced amount. The discussion focused on what to do with an extra \$56,000 in funding.

Councilmember Matthews felt there was not enough information to make a fair decision without seeing the applications.

Councilmember Harris encouraged doing the hard work but said a decision was not needed immediately. Staff requested a decision soon to meet grant deadlines, suggesting the \$56,000 be split among the three lowest-scoring programs.

Concerns about fairness were raised, as some programs were fully funded while others were not. Staff noted reallocating funds without Council input would not be fair. Mr. Solomon recommended an Executive Session to discuss legal questions on January 16, 2024. Several Councilmembers supported this and expressed a need for more information before making final decisions.

Mayor Daggett was okay with splitting the \$56,000 among the bottom three programs. Vice Mayor Aslan favored increasing funding to Flagstaff Shelter Services. Some Councilmembers wanted more time and information. It was noted agencies would only learn of funding recommendations through public documents.

CDBG 2024 ANNUAL ACTION PLAN TIMELINE COMMUNITY INPUT MEETING COMING ATTRACTIONS POINT IN TIME COUNT -- PIT COUNT

Mayor Daggett pointed out that the dates of the PIT count are nationally chosen, and Ms. Pavlik confirmed that it was.

OTHER THINGS ON THE HORIZON

Mayor Daggett asked about affordable rental units leaving the program, and staff confirmed they are working to preserve those units.

Councilmember Matthews requested to see how applicants calculate the number of people served, especially compared to the PIT count. Ms. Darr said a question was added to the CDBG application asking agencies to explain their counts.

Councilmember Harris inquired about how the PIT count is conducted, and Ms. Darr explained that volunteers survey the community to count unsheltered individuals.

11. Snow Hero Pilot Program Overview

Volunteer and Event Coordinator Steven Thompson provided a PowerPoint Presentation that covered the following:

PURPOSE
BACKGROUND RESEARCH
RESEARCH ON SUCCESSFUL PROGRAMS
CEDAR RAPIDS-SNOW BUDDIES
DENVER-SNOW ANGELS
LINCOLN-SNOW ANGELS PROGRAM
TOLEDO -- SNOW ANGELS SHOVELING PROGRAM
COLLABORATION
APPROACH
THREE PHASES
PHASE I -- PILOT YEAR
RESIDENT
SNOW HERO
TARGETED OUTREACH
COURTESY BERM VS. SNOW HERO
BROADER OUTREACH
OPPORTUNITIES

Vice Mayor Aslan asked why the name changed from Snow Angels to Snow Hero and asked who is liable if a volunteer does not show up or breaks something. Mr. Thompson stated that the name was changed because he wanted to really highlight the hero aspect of the volunteer and neighbor. He also stated that if there is an issue with a volunteer not being able to help, the volunteer would reach out to other community members or to Mr. Thompson to see if a replacement can be found. Mr. Thompson also stated that there will be a liability waiver so that people understand that the City is not liable since the Snow Heroes are not city volunteers, but neighbors giving their help.

Councilmember Harris stated the time period for the clearing sidewalks is 24-hours and she had concerns about the 48-hours time period.

Councilmember Matthews stated that she loves the program. She asked if there was any activity in the program based on the snow event over the weekend and Mr. Thompson stated that staff was still in the process of matching heroes.

Mayor Daggett stated that the difference between snow berms removal and this program was that snow berm removal is in the public right of way. Mayor Daggett also addressed that the Commission on Inclusion and Adaptive Living wanted to ensure that the Sustainability Division is working with NAU on the program. Mr. Thompson stated that he had already reached out to them.

12. Public Participation

None

13. Informational Items To/From Mayor, Council, and City Manager; future agenda item requests

Councilmember Aslan stated that he may be more active during meetings in the new year.

Councilmember House asked for consideration of writing a letter to the Human Rights Commission regarding the Openly LGBTQ+ Elected or Appointed Leaders metric on the question being intrusive and to make a statement on the dynamics of the metric.

Mayor Daggett stated that she would be attending the US Mayors Conference next week and she would try attend Council virtually. She notes that Supervisor Horstman held a meeting with eight animal rescue groups, where they were encouraged to brainstorm radical ideas to support the groups. They plan to recruit volunteers as part of their efforts.

14. Adjournment

The Work Session of the Flagstaff City Council held January 9, 2024, adjourned at 8:01 p.m.

MAYOR

ATTEST:

CITY CLERK