

MINUTES

1. Call to Order

Mayor Daggett called the meeting of the Flagstaff City Council held April 8, 2025, to order at 3:03 p.m.

NOTICE OF OPTION TO RECESS INTO EXECUTIVE SESSION

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the City Council and to the general public that, at this work session, the City Council may vote to go into executive session, which will not be open to the public, for discussion and consultation with the City's attorneys for legal advice on any item listed on the following agenda, pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(3).

2. ROLL CALL

NOTE: One or more Councilmembers may be in attendance through other technological means.

PRESENT:

ABSENT:

MAYOR DAGGETT
VICE MAYOR SWEET
COUNCILMEMBER ASLAN
COUNCILMEMBER GARCIA
COUNCILMEMBER HOUSE
COUNCILMEMBER MATTHEWS
COUNCILMEMBER SPENCE

3. Pledge of Allegiance, Mission Statement, and Land Acknowledgement

The Council and audience recited the pledge of allegiance, Councilmember Matthews read the Mission Statement of the City of Flagstaff, and Councilmember House read the Land Acknowledgement.

MISSION STATEMENT

The mission of the City of Flagstaff is to protect and enhance the quality of life for all.

LAND ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The Flagstaff City Council humbly acknowledges the ancestral homelands of this area's Indigenous nations and original stewards. These lands, still inhabited by Native descendants, border mountains sacred to Indigenous peoples. We honor them, their legacies, their traditions, and their continued contributions. We celebrate their past, present, and future generations who will forever know this place as home.

4. Open Call to the Public

Open Call to the Public enables the public to address the Council about an item that is not on the prepared agenda. Comments relating to items that are on the agenda will be taken at the time that the

item is discussed. Open Call to the Public appears on the agenda twice, at the beginning and at the end. The total time allotted for the first Open Call to the Public is 30 minutes; any additional comments will be held until the second Open Call to the Public.

If you wish to address the Council in person at today's meeting, please complete a comment card and submit it to the recording clerk as soon as possible. Your name will be called when it is your turn to speak. You may address the Council up to three times throughout the meeting, including comments made during Open Call to the Public and Public Comment. Please limit your remarks to three minutes per item to allow everyone an opportunity to speak. At the discretion of the Chair, ten or more persons present at the meeting and wishing to speak may appoint a representative who may have no more than fifteen minutes to speak.

Economic Development Administrator Creag Znetko addressed Council and invited them and the public to attend the Innovate Green event and other related events.

Steve Carter addressed Council with concerns about traffic at Fourth Street and Butler. He was concerned about increased traffic with new development coming into the area. He stated that the city needed to hire more firefighters.

5. Review of Draft Agenda for the April 15, 2025 City Council Meeting

Citizens wishing to speak on agenda items not specifically called out by the City Council may submit a speaker card for their items of interest to the recording clerk.

Councilmember Garcia asked about a potential executive session on agenda Item 10B.

6. City Manager Report

Mr. Clifton briefly reviewed his report and Deputy City Manager Joanne Keene provided a brief recap of the recent Washington D.C. lobbying trip.

Senior Deputy City Manager Shannon Anderson announced the selection of the new Water Services Division Director, Lee Williams.

Police Chief Sean Connolly provided a department update presentation that covered the following:

FLAGSTAFF POLICE DEPARTMENT
OUR MISSION
POLICE DEPARTMENT STRUCTURE
KEY HIGHLIGHTS & ACHIEVEMENTS
CHALLENGES AND AREAS FOR IMPROVEMENT
FINANCIAL OVERVIEW
GOALS AND PRIORITIES FOR THE COMING YEAR
REAFFIRM COMMITMENT

Councilmember Garcia offered comments in gratitude to the Police Department and the forward thinking that they were engaging in.

Fire Chief Mark Gaillard, Fire Administration Manager Jessica Vigorito, Deputy Chief Mark Wilson, Battalion Chief Seth Gregar, and Battalion Chief Paul Oltrogge provided a department update presentation that covered the following:

FLAGSTAFF FIRE DEPARTMENT
MISSION AND VALUES
SOCIAL MEDIA AND OUTREACH
ORGANIZATION CHART
YEARS OF SERVICE
HOUSE OF JACKS & GREY SHIRTS

CALL VOLUME
 NEW EQUIPMENT
 SPECIAL OPERATIONS
 DAILY OPERATIONAL IMPACTS
 TRAINING
 CARE
 COMMUNITY RISK ASSESSMENT & PLAN
 WILDFIRE MANAGEMENT
 ACCOMPLISHMENTS
 CURRENT/FUTURE STRATEGIC PLANNING

Councilmember Garcia spoke about concerns with wildfire and challenges with recruitment. He asked if additional resources were needed. Chief Gaillard stated that everyone could benefit from additional resources. Their goal was to use resources responsibly and to the maximum extent possible for the community. They participate in the budget process and rely on the efforts of that team for the decisions they have to make in terms of budget allocations.

Councilmember Matthews asked what the current vacancy of the department was. Chief Gaillard stated that there were three vacancies that they were actively recruiting for. He noted that applications had increased which was great news.

Council expressed appreciation for both the Police and Fire Departments and thanked them for the updates they provided. Many comments focused on the additional focus on the community and a willingness to engage with people.

7. Introduction to Building and Fire Codes

Resilience Analyst Genevieve Pearthree, Building Official Amy Tressler, Assistant Fire Marshall Chris Jack, Wildland Fire Captain Neil Chapman, and Water Services Program Manager Tamara Lawless provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

INTRODUCTION TO BUILDING & FIRE CODES
 WHY ARE WE HERE TODAY?
 PRESENTATION GOALS & AGENDA
 BUILDING SAFETY
 BUILDING CODE
 WHAT IS A MODEL CODE?
 PURPOSE OF MODEL CODES
 LOCAL AMENDMENTS TO BUILDING CODES
 CODE UPDATE & ADOPTION FREQUENCY
 BUILDING CODE UPDATES: WHY THEY MATTER
 ISO (INSURANCE SERVICE OFFICE) RATES
 CITY OF FLAGSTAFF ADOPTED BUILDING CODES
 BUILDING CODES: NEXT STEPS
 FIRE
 FIRE CODES: WHAT ARE THEY?
 WHY ARE FIRE CODES IMPORTANT?
 CITY OF FLAGSTAFF ADOPTED FIRE CODES
 FIRE CODES: NEXT STEPS
 WATER SERVICES
 WATER SERVICES -- LONG TERM GOALS
 WATER CONSERVATION IN THE BUILDING CODES
 CURRENT LOCAL AMENDMENTS TO THE 2018 INTERNATIONAL PLUMBING CODE (IPC)
 POTENTIAL LOCAL AMENDMENTS TO THE 2024 IPC TO EXPLORE

Councilmember Matthews asked about water sense and low flow toilets if there was a risk of not having enough pressure to keep the sewer lines moving. Ms. Lawless explained that it could be a challenge and there may be time when they have to add pressure into systems to make sure flow was appropriate and they may have to consider pressurization and pump stations in the future to better

manage those conditions.

SUSTAINABILITY

CARBON NEUTRALITY PLAN GOALS

RELATED TO BUILDING & FIRE CODES

ENERGY CONSERVATION & RENEWABLE ENERGY IN THE BUILDING CODE

CARBON NEUTRALITY PLAN: STRATEGIC APPROACH

THE CODE GLIDEPATH TO NET ZERO

SOME OPTIONS TO ADVANCE CNP GOALS

BIGGER PICTURE

CODE ANALYSIS PROJECT (LASS+CAP)

BUILDING CODE PROGRESS IN OTHER AZ CITIES

FIRE CODES IN OTHER AZ CITIES

RESILIENT SOUTHWEST BUILDING CODE COLLABORATIVE

WHO IS THE COLLABORATIVE?

TANGIBLE OUTCOMES: 2023-2028

Councilmember Matthews expressed concern about the city's net-zero energy goals and their impact on housing affordability. She questioned whether energy-efficient homes were truly net-zero, especially if homeowners were not actually installing and using solar panels. She emphasized the need to measure actual emissions rather than relying on assumptions. She suggested that while utility costs may be lower, the high upfront cost of building energy-efficient homes could affect affordability. She suggested focusing efforts on trying to help more people install and use solar energy, possibly through grants, instead of just requiring solar-ready infrastructure. She wanted to be sure that housing impacts were considered within the context of aggressive climate goals.

Ms. Pearthree acknowledged the concerns about costs and that they were researching how construction costs compared to long-term utility savings. They planned to provide data on how long it took for energy-efficient homes to recoup additional upfront costs. She noted that preliminary modeling from the Pacific Northwest National Laboratory suggested that in Flagstaff's climate zone, the return on investment could be nearly immediate. There would always be value of energy savings even if not every home became fully net-zero, but building homes with the potential for solar installation allowed for those improvements in the future.

NEXT STEPS

DRAFT CODE UPDATE ADOPTION TIMELINE

PARTNERS IN A SUCCESSFUL CODE ADOPTION

Council asked about engagement with the community. Staff indicated that they had been using social media, reaching out to the design community and interest groups, along with open houses to get feedback. They were also working with Economic Vitality to capture the commercial component of the codes.

Councilmember Aslan stated that he was enthusiastic about updating the code and the long term benefits it would have both for current residents and future generations.

Councilmember Spence stated that in 2018 the city and county adopted very similar codes that provided some consistency for the region. He encouraged the city to engage with the county to bring them along with the updates to continue that consistency for builders. Ms. Tressler acknowledged the collaboration in 2018 but noted that the county currently had a vacancy in their Building Official position, and that they had paused on code updates until that position was filled.

8. City of Flagstaff GIS Program and Open Data Portal

GIS IT Manager Rob Speer provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

GIS AT THE CITY OF FLAGSTAFF

WHAT IS GIS?

WHAT DOES GIS DO?

MAPPING AND VISUALIZATION
 DATA MANAGEMENT
 SPATIAL ANALYSIS "CHOOSING THE RIGHT LOCATION"
 COMMUNICATION
 HOW IS GIS USED?
 FINDING THE CLOSEST FACILITY
 KEEPING TRACK OF THINGS
 PLANNING FOR THE FUTURE
 RESPONDING TO EMERGENCIES
 1988
 2006
 2025
 THE DATE, INFORMATION, KNOWLEDGE, WISDOM PYRAMID
 FUTURE DIRECTION OF GIS
 ROUTE OPTIMIZATION & PLANNING
 REAL TIME VEHICLE TRACKING
 DRONE PROGRAM
 LIVE DEMO

Councilmember Garcia asked how the public could get access to the information. Mr. Speer stated that they were working on a strategic plan that included an element of public access. A robust education and training campaign would be needed to roll it out.

Councilmember House suggested putting a video together that included instructions on how to use the tool to access information.

Mayor Daggett shared that she had been using the tool for her final project for the Mayor's Institute on City Design. It had a wealth of information, and she looked forward to more training for everyone.

9. Semi-Annual Carbon Neutrality Plan Progress Report

Climate Section Director Jenny Niemann, Climate Program Manager Danae Presler, and Energy Specialist Jacob Raatz provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

SEMI-ANNUAL CNP PROGRESS REPORT
 AGENDA
 FOUNDATIONS
 CNP GOALS
 CLIMATE ACTION PROVIDES RESOURCES ACROSS THE COMMUNITY
 TIMELINE
 PROGRESS UPDATE
 CNP ACTIONS UPDATE
 BUILDING ENERGY
 PROGRESS: RENEWABLE ENERGY
 ACTIONS: RENEWABLE ENERGY
 HIGHLIGHT: GREEN BUSINESS BOOT CAMP
 PROGRESS: BUILDING ENERGY USE
 ACTIONS: BUILDING ENERGY USE
 HIGHLIGHT: HOME WEATHERIZATION & ENERGY REBATE PROGRAM
 HIGHLIGHT: CITY-WIDE ENERGY & WATER CONSERVATION PROJECT
 TRANSPORTATION
 PROGRESS: ELECTRIC MOBILITY
 ACTIONS: ELECTRIC MOBILITY
 HIGHLIGHT: COF'S GROWING ELECTRIC FLEET
 PROGRESS: ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION
 ACTIONS: ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION
 HIGHLIGHT: COF E-BIKE FLEET
 OPTIMIZING CONSUMPTION
 PROGRESS: WASTE REDUCTION AND FOOD SYSTEMS
 ACTIONS: WASTE REDUCTION

HIGHLIGHT: RESIDENTIAL FOOD SCRAPS DROP-OFF
 ACTIONS: FOOD SYSTEMS
 HIGHLIGHT: FULL CIRCLE GARDEN WORKSHOPS
 BUILDING RESILIENCE AND IMPROVING EQUITY
 ACTIONS: COMMUNITY EQUITY
 HIGHLIGHT: ENERGY UPGRADES FOR HEALTHY HOMES
 ACTIONS: COMMUNITY RESILIENCE
 HIGHLIGHT: COMMUNITY WORKSHOPS AT RESILIENCE HUBS
 HIGHLIGHT: JOIN US AT EARTH DAY
 ACTIONS: CARBON DIOXIDE REMOVAL
 HIGHLIGHT: INNOVATE GREEN
 UPDATE TO THE CARBON NEUTRALITY PLAN
 CNP UPDATE GOALS
 CNP UPDATE CONTENT
 CNP UPDATE PROCESS

Councilmember Matthews thanked staff for the presentation and expressed appreciation for the multifaceted approach being taken. She was glad to hear that climate adaptation priorities would be revisited given recent catastrophic wildfires; it was vital to do what they could to prevent those types of events. She requested an update on EV station funding that was reportedly being held up at the state level. She also asked for information regarding the current status and expectations for federal grant funding. Ms. Neimann stated each new administration brought different priorities, however the city's current work aligned well with common themes like return on investment, energy independence, and resilience. Staff felt prepared to adapt to new federal grant priorities, but the amount of available funding remained uncertain. Some Inflation Reduction Act funds had yet to be awarded, with several grant applications in progress, the expectations for funding were cautious. The team was expanding their focus to include private foundation and nonprofit grants at national, state, and local levels.

With regard to the EV station funding, Ms. Presler shared that they did not have all the details on the state's funding situation but the first round of funding through the National Electric Vehicle Infrastructure Program, originally set to bring \$76 million for fast chargers to Arizona, was paused. It was unclear if the full \$76 million would be received by the state, but they would provide an update when more information was available.

Councilmember House asked if the EV goals only considered fully electric vehicles or if they included other vehicle types or people who gave up their vehicles completely. Ms. Presler explained that the 1.3% goal was for fully electric vehicles and plug in hybrid vehicles.

The following individuals addressed Council about the Carbon Neutrality Plan:

- Jim Schweikert
- Tom Pearson
- Phil Goldblatt
- BJ Dempsey
- David MacCormack

The following comments were received:

- Economics was the allocation of scarce resources among limited end users.
- Advocate for achievable, principled and fiscally responsible policies and programs that directly benefit and protect citizens and the business community of Flagstaff.
- Choose between two different approaches to addressing climate change: prioritizing forest management and wildfire prevention versus advancing the city's Carbon Neutrality Plan, which included mandates around electrification and restrictions on natural gas.
- There is skepticism about the actual impact Flagstaff can have on global emissions given its relatively small population.
- I question the effectiveness and cost of implementing a \$600 million sustainability plan.
- Concerned that the language around resilience, equity, and policy updates lacked tangible benefits for everyday citizens and could result in costly mandates with limited real-world impact.
- Choose fiscal responsibility and policies that truly serve the needs of the people.

- I appreciate Sustainability's efforts to help local neighborhoods cope with the aftermath of flooding, for the pine needle cleanups to reduce the fire danger, and for the home insulation projects to improve energy efficiency.
- The presentation focused almost exclusively on carbon neutrality actions aimed at reducing greenhouse gas emissions and little on the other essential components of climate adaptation.
- For Flagstaff, adaptation means defending against wildfires, flooding and drought.
- Despite thirty years of international efforts to reduce carbon emissions, atmospheric Co2 concentrations continued to rise steadily.
- Flagstaff needed a comprehensive standalone adaptation plan for wildfire, flooding, and drought.
- Insurance rates are skyrocketing or being cancelled.
- A standalone adaptation plan would promote coordination between departments and with county, state, and federal agencies.
- A plan could disclose gaps and redundancies in programs and encourage the incorporation of new technologies.
- An adaptation plan would inform the public of what was being done to protect their lives and property.
- We cannot significantly reduce production of fuels like gasoline, diesel, and jet fuel without seriously affecting the production of Petro chemicals from which medicines and plastics are derived.
- It will take a long time for technology and the power companies to catch up, so it makes more sense for Flagstaff to focus on adaptation and set 2050 as a target for carbon neutrality.
- Research has shown that the most serious effects from global warming will not affect us until about 2080, so it was better to align ourselves with most nations that have committed to 2050 as a carbon neutrality goal.
- What is being done and what is being proposed could negatively impact housing and force increase costs for existing and new homeowners.
- The need for electricity grows and the price of electricity is growing.
- Much of this does not deal in reality.
- Carbon dioxide is almost at the lowest it has ever been.
- Before you make decisions on sustainability and climate neutrality please research the issue more deeply.

Councilmember Garcia reflected back to his childhood in Flagstaff and the challenges they had with air quality due to diesel emissions and wood burning smoke emissions from the logging industry. That was not the experience now due to advancing technology and stronger regulations. He asked how the financial amount of the plan was determined.

Ms. Neimann explained that in 2022, the city attempted to estimate the total cost of implementing the carbon neutrality plan due to ongoing questions about feasibility and cost. The estimate included a wide range of efforts, such as electrifying city buildings, subsidizing private retrofits, implementing the Active Transportation Master Plan, and air capture at the landfill. The analysis was conducted by a third party to evaluate the plan strictly from a fiscal perspective, not considering health, social, or environmental benefits. The results showed that while the total cost would be around \$600 million over many years and projects, the projected financial benefits would exceed that at about \$650 million. Based on a variety of national studies, implementing the things within the plan consistently showed a return on investment. Things such as forest treatments, energy efficiency, and fleet electrification, have demonstrated significant cost savings. The investment in climate action was expected to pay off financially. Ms. Antonopoulos added that the analysis also allowed staff to identify priorities for that return on investment and develop a work plan that would provide the largest payback, in the quickest amount of time, with limited funding.

Councilmember Garcia stated that there were tangible benefits to the consumer to move to all electric. He had heard a lot from the community that they would be forced to go all electric. Ms. Neimann clarified that state law did not allow a city to mandate electrification; the intent was to offer it as an option if people wanted to do it. She stated that she did not believe that the city would mandate or require electrification of homes or appliances. Gas utilities were looking at diversifying and there was still a big market for natural gas. It was a conversation utility companies were having nationally.

Councilmember House emphasized the importance of community education in supporting the carbon

neutrality plan and sustainability efforts. She stressed that educating the public about how different city departments, such as sustainability, fire, and emergency services, collaborate was crucial for building understanding and support. Forest health and wildfire mitigation were not in opposition with climate adaptation and the carbon neutrality plan, it was not an either/or situation but a both/and approach. The carbon neutrality plan incorporated both adaptation and resilience, aiming to protect the community from growing wildfire threats and environmental changes. She appreciated the collaboration between city teams and external fire services and recommended that future community outreach and education efforts clearly communicate how those initiatives are interconnected and work together to build a more resilient community.

Vice Mayor Sweet acknowledged the concerns raised and noted that key issues like fiscal responsibility, climate adaptation, housing costs, and thorough research were shared priorities across the organization. She appreciated that the community would have opportunities to provide input as the process moved forward. She encouraged everyone to explore the sustainability pages on the city's website, calling it an impressive and comprehensive resource.

Mayor Daggett shared her experience of gradually upgrading an older home for energy efficiency by adding insulation, replacing windows, and installing solar panels. The improvements increased comfort and significantly lowered her electric bills. She praised the city's work on waste reduction and efforts to extend the landfill's lifespan. She emphasized the cross-departmental nature of sustainability efforts to implement initiatives that provided multiple benefits and reinforced the importance of ongoing work to reduce waste and improve long-term environmental outcomes.

10. Adjournment

The Work Session of the Flagstaff City Council held April 8, 2025, adjourned at 6:52 p.m.

SPECIAL MEETING

1. Call to Order

Mayor Daggett called the Special Meeting of the Flagstaff City Council held April 8, 2025, to order at 6:00 p.m.

NOTICE OF OPTION TO RECESS INTO EXECUTIVE SESSION

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the City Council and to the general public that, at this special meeting, the City Council may vote to go into executive session, which will not be open to the public, for discussion and consultation with the City's attorneys for legal advice on any item listed on the following agenda, pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(3).

2. **Consideration and Approval of Settlement:** The matter of *Jeanie Middleton v. City of Flagstaff*, case No. CV2022-00568, currently pending in Coconino County Superior Court.

Deputy City Attorney Kevin Fincel addressed Council and stated that the action was to approve the settlement of the case which was discussed with the City Council in executive session on April 8, 2025.

Moved by Councilmember Anthony Garcia, **seconded** by Councilmember Lori Matthews to approve settlement of the Jeanie Middleton v. City of Flagstaff lawsuit pursuant to the terms discussed in executive session and authorize and direct the City Manager and/or City Attorney to execute all documents and take other actions as are necessary to finalize the settlement.

Vote: 7 - 0 - Unanimously

3. Open Call to the Public

None

4. Informational Items To/From Mayor, Council, and City Manager; future agenda item requests

Councilmember Garcia shared that he would be attending a springtime kickoff at Bushmaster Park that weekend.

Vice Mayor Sweet reminded the public about the Innovate Green competition that weekend.

Councilmember Housed shared that she would be participating in two events later in the week; the first was the Lancaster Leadership Women's Summit Power of Storytelling panel. The second was the Northern Arizona Book Festival to host a Thin Air magazine alumni panel to speak about the connection between writing skills and how that is built into a person's professional life. She would also be attending the Teen Challenge banquet to celebrate their 60th anniversary. She acknowledged Mayor Daggett, Vice Mayor Sweet, Deputy City Manager Joanne Keene, and Senior Project Manager Christine Cameron for advocating for Flagstaff in Washington D.C. for all the projects and programs that will make the community better in the future.

Councilmember Spence shared that he would be doing a pitch at the Innovate Green event and encouraged the public to attend.

Councilmember Aslan shared that the Tri-University Regent's Cup was being hosted by NAU that weekend at the High Country Conference Center. It would include an Oxford debate and storytelling competition. He was asked to be one of the judges and was looking forward to participating.

Mayor Daggett shared that she would also be judging the event, and she was looking forward to hearing the students debate and show their skills. She noted that the Commission on Inclusion and Adaptive Living would be holding an awards ceremony at City Hall that week. She also announced that she would not be in attendance at the next meeting because she would be participating in her last class for the Mayor's Institute to give her final presentation.

5. Adjournment

The Work Session of the Flagstaff City Council held April 8, 2025, adjourned at 7:01 p.m.

MAYOR

ATTEST:

CITY CLERK

CERTIFICATION

I, STACY SALTZBURG, do hereby certify that I am the City Clerk of the City of Flagstaff, County of Coconino, State of Arizona, and that the above Minutes are a true and correct summary of the Meeting of the Council of the City of Flagstaff held on April 8, 2025. I further certify that the Meeting was duly called and held and that a quorum was present.

DATED this 26th day of August, 2025

CITY CLERK