

## MINUTES

### 1. CALL TO ORDER

Vice Mayor Aslan called the meeting of the Flagstaff City Council held April 2, 2024, to order at 3:05 p.m.

#### NOTICE OF OPTION TO RECESS INTO EXECUTIVE SESSION

*Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the City Council and to the general public that, at this regular meeting, the City Council may vote to go into executive session, which will not be open to the public, for discussion and consultation with the City's attorneys for legal advice on any item listed on the following agenda, pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(3).*

### 2. Roll Call

*NOTE: One or more Councilmembers may be in attendance through other technological means.*

#### PRESENT:

VICE MAYOR ASLAN  
COUNCILMEMBER HARRIS  
COUNCILMEMBER HOUSE  
COUNCILMEMBER MATTHEWS  
COUNCILMEMBER MCCARTHY  
COUNCILMEMBER SWEET

#### ABSENT:

MAYOR DAGGETT

Others present: City Manager Greg Clifton; City Attorney Sterling Solomon.

### 3. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE, MISSION STATEMENT, AND LAND ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The Council and audience recited the pledge of allegiance, Councilmember Sweet read the Mission Statement of the City of Flagstaff, and Vice Mayor Aslan read the Land Acknowledgement.

#### MISSION STATEMENT

*The mission of the City of Flagstaff is to protect and enhance the quality of life for all.*

#### LAND ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

*The Flagstaff City Council humbly acknowledges the ancestral homelands of this area's Indigenous nations and original stewards. These lands, still inhabited by Native descendants, border mountains sacred to Indigenous peoples. We honor them, their legacies, their traditions, and their continued contributions. We celebrate their past, present, and future generations who will forever know this place as home.*

**4. OPEN CALL TO THE PUBLIC**

*Open Call to the Public enables the public to address the Council about an item that is not on the prepared agenda. Comments relating to items that are on the agenda will be taken at the time that the item is discussed. Open Call to the Public appears on the agenda twice, at the beginning and at the end. The total time allotted for the first Open Call to the Public is 30 minutes; any additional comments will be held until the second Open Call to the Public.*

*If you wish to address the Council in person at today's meeting, please complete a comment card and submit it to the recording clerk as soon as possible. Your name will be called when it is your turn to speak. You may address the Council up to three times throughout the meeting, including comments made during Open Call to the Public and Public Comment. Please limit your remarks to three minutes per item to allow everyone an opportunity to speak. At the discretion of the Chair, ten or more persons present at the meeting and wishing to speak may appoint a representative who may have no more than fifteen minutes to speak.*

Dennis Givens addressed Council and spoke about ageism, biking, community share agriculture, and protecting the environment in a financially responsible way.

**5. PROCLAMATIONS AND RECOGNITIONS****A. Proclamation: Water Awareness Month**

Vice Mayor Aslan read and presented the proclamation.

**B. Proclamation: Water Professionals Appreciation**

The Water Professionals Appreciation proclamation was combined with the item above.

**C. Proclamation: Limb Loss and Limb Difference Awareness Month**

Councilmember Matthews read and presented the proclamation.

**6. COUNCIL LIAISON REPORTS**

Councilmember House reported that she had to miss the last Housing Commission meeting due to illness.

Councilmember Sweet shared that MetroPlan would be meeting that week and Earth Day was coming up on April 20, 2024 at Bushmaster Park. She also shared that the Fremont slow street painting day was scheduled for May 18, 2024 and she encouraged people to attend.

Councilmember McCarthy stated that he would be attending the MetroPlan meeting, the Bicycle Advisory Committee meeting, and the Transportation Commission meeting.

Vice Mayor Aslan shared that he attended the Coconino Plateau Water Advisory Committee meeting.

Councilmember Matthews shared that she also attended the Coconino Plateau Water Advisory Committee meeting. She also reported that she attended the Criminal Justice Coordinating Council (CJCC) meeting, and she distributed cards that provided access to information about a variety of statistics. She voiced appreciation for the work and commitment of the CJCC.

**7. LIQUOR LICENSE PUBLIC HEARINGS**

*Applications under Liquor License Public Hearings may be considered under one public hearing and may be acted upon by one motion unless otherwise requested by Council.*

- A. **Consideration and Action on Liquor License Application:** Takehiro Yoneuchi, "Hiro's Sushi Bar and Japanese Restaurant," 1312 S. Plaza Way, Series 12 (restaurant), New License.

Vice Mayor Aslan opened the public hearing.

Police Chief Dan Musselman introduced the application and noted no concerns.

There being no public comment, Vice Mayor Aslan closed the public hearing.

**Moved by** Councilmember Lori Matthews, **seconded by** Vice Mayor Austin Aslan to forward the application to the State with a recommendation for approval.

**Vote:** 6 - 0 - Unanimously

8. **CONSENT AGENDA**

*All matters under Consent Agenda are considered by the City Council to be routine. Unless a member of City Council expresses a desire at the meeting to remove an item from the Consent Agenda for discussion, the Consent Agenda will be enacted by one motion approving the recommendations listed on the agenda. Unless otherwise indicated, expenditures approved by Council are budgeted items.*

**Moved by** Councilmember Jim McCarthy, **seconded by** Councilmember Miranda Sweet to approve the Consent Agenda as presented.

**Vote:** 6 - 0 - Unanimously

- A. **Consideration and Approval of Contract:** First Amendment to Cooperative Purchase Contract with FX Tactical for the purchase Police Uniforms and Equipment for the Flagstaff Police Department.
1. Approve the First Amendment to the Cooperative Purchase Contract with FX Tactical for Police Uniforms and Equipment equaling a not to exceed value \$134,917.21; and
  2. Authorize the City Manager to execute the necessary documents.
- B. **Consideration and Approval of Contract:** Approve multiple contracts for the purchase of water meters for the City of Flagstaff Water Services Division in a FY2023-24 budgeted amount not to exceed \$1,012,718.
1. Approve contract(s) with Core and Main Supply, Metron Farnier, Mountain States Pipe and Supply, Zenner USA, and/or Aquaflow Solutions for the purchase of water meters in a FY2023-24 budgeted amount not to exceed \$1,012,718; and
  2. Authorize the City Manager to execute all necessary documents.
- C. **Consideration of Ratification and Approval of Contract:** Ratify the purchase of \$27,341.01 with Ahead, Inc. and enter into a Cooperative Purchase Contract in the amount not to exceed \$528,000.00 for FY24 and FY25, for the purchase of hardware, licensing, installation, and support maintenance.
1. Ratify the purchase with Ahead Inc. for vSAN Licensing for the Flagstaff Police Department in the amount of \$27,341.01;
  2. Approve the Cooperative Purchase Contract with Ahead Inc. in the amount not to exceed \$528,000 for FY24 and FY25 (to include the ratification of \$27,341.01), for the purchase of hardware, licensing, installation, and support maintenance; and
  3. Authorize the City Manager to execute the necessary documents.
- D. **Consideration and Approval of Letter of Support:** Flagstaff Shelter Services' Congressionally Directed Spending Request Letter of Support

Approve Letter of Support.

**9. ROUTINE ITEMS**

- A. Parking District Enforcement Update and Consideration and Adoption of Resolution No. 2024-10 and Ordinance No. 2024-06:** A Resolution of the Flagstaff City Council declaring as a public record that certain document filed with the City Clerk and entitled "*2024 Parking Code Amendments*"; and, an Ordinance of the Flagstaff City Council, amending the Flagstaff City Code, Title 9 Traffic, Chapter 9-01 Traffic Code, by adopting by reference that certain document entitled "*2024 Parking Code Amendments*"; providing for repeal of conflicting ordinances, severability, and establishing an effective date.

**Moved by** Councilmember Jim McCarthy, **seconded by** Councilmember Lori Matthews to adopt Resolution No. 2024-10.

**Vote:** 6 - 0 - Unanimously

**Moved by** Councilmember Jim McCarthy, **seconded by** Vice Mayor Austin Aslan to read Ordinance No. 2024-06 by title only for the final time.

**Vote:** 6 - 0 - Unanimously

*AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF FLAGSTAFF, AMENDING THE FLAGSTAFF CITY CODE, TITLE 9 TRAFFIC, CHAPTER 9-01 TRAFFIC CODE, BY ADOPTING BY REFERENCE THAT CERTAIN DOCUMENT ENTITLED "2024 PARKING CODE AMENDMENTS"; PROVIDING FOR REPEAL OF CONFLICTING ORDINANCES, SEVERABILITY, AND ESTABLISHING AN EFFECTIVE DATE*

**Moved by** Councilmember Jim McCarthy, **seconded by** Councilmember Deborah Harris to adopt Ordinance No. 2024-06.

**Vote:** 6 - 0 - Unanimously

- B. Consideration and Adoption of Ordinance No. 2024-10:** An ordinance of the City Council of the City of Flagstaff, amending the Flagstaff Zoning Map to rezone approximately 18.24 acres of real property generally located at 6500 E Route 66, from the Rural Residential (RR) zone with a Resource Protection Overlay (RPO) to the Heavy Industrial (HI) zone with a Resource Protection Overlay (RPO), providing for severability, authority for clerical corrections, and establishing an effective date.

Tony Cullum addressed Council and thanked staff for their excellent work. The matter began in 2019, with city departments reviewing it in 2020. The Fire Department identified a lack of water in the old cinder pit/mine area, prompting the developer to install a 6,000--7,000-foot water line with hydrants. Since then, a public meeting in August 2020 went well, all city departments had approved the project, planning and zoning gave unanimous approval, and a recent neighborhood meeting was also successful.

Robert Miller addressed Council and shared that in 2007, he bought the property intending to use it for their trucking company. After discovering a shortage of equipment parking in Flagstaff he had the idea of repurposing the reclaimed portion of the mine into flat land for use by small and local businesses.

Julie and Warren Smith addressed Council and stated that their property was just south of the project, and they fully supported it because of its two freeway access points that divert industrial traffic from Highway 89, proximity to the Wildcat water plant, and suitability for equipment and materials storage. They see it as an ideal and much-needed use of the property.

Brent Eagar addressed Council and stated that he supported the project because of the developer's entrepreneurial experience, care for the land, and the property's suitability for an industrial park. There was a community shortage of such spaces, good access, and a strong location, he believed that the project would benefit the community.

**Moved by** Councilmember Lori Matthews, **seconded by** Councilmember Miranda Sweet to read Ordinance No. 2024-10 by title only for the final time.

**Vote:** 6 - 0 - Unanimously

*AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF FLAGSTAFF, AMENDING THE FLAGSTAFF ZONING MAP TO REZONE APPROXIMATELY 18.24 ACRES OF REAL PROPERTY GENERALLY LOCATED AT 6500 E ROUTE 66, FROM THE RURAL RESIDENTIAL (RR) ZONE WITH A RESOURCE PROTECTION OVERLAY (RPO) TO THE HEAVY INDUSTRIAL (HI) ZONE WITH A RESOURCE PROTECTION OVERLAY (RPO), PROVIDING FOR SEVERABILITY, AUTHORITY FOR CLERICAL CORRECTIONS, AND ESTABLISHING AN EFFECTIVE DATE*

**Moved by** Vice Mayor Austin Aslan, **seconded by** Councilmember Miranda Sweet to adopt Ordinance No. 2024-10.

**Vote:** 6 - 0 - Unanimously

10. **REGULAR AGENDA**

Vice Mayor noted that he would reorder the agenda to take Item 10G before Item 10F.

- A. **Consideration and Adoption of Ordinance No. 2024-09:** An ordinance of the City Council of the City of Flagstaff amending the Flagstaff City Code, Chapter 1-14, Personnel System by amending the Employee Handbook of Regulations, Section 1-70-020 Employee Wellness and 1-50-039 Purchase Day Program; providing for repeal of conflicting ordinances; severability; authority for clerical corrections; and establishing an effective date.

Interim Deputy Human Resources Director Jennifer Caputo addressed Council and stated that the changes were related to employee wellness, and they were removing the specific details within the handbook. They were things that were subject to regular change at any time and removing them from the handbook would allow them to keep information updated.

The second change was related to the purchase day program; the handbook stated that it was open to full time employees, and they would like to offer that benefit to part time employees as well.

Councilmember McCarthy stated that the handbook was approved by Council and clarified that the request was for staff to be able to make changes to the wellness program without having to come back to Council. Mr. Clifton explained that the changes were clerical in nature, anything substantive to the handbook had to be approved by Council. Vice Mayor Aslan added that the leeway provided for was well within the scope of administrative oversight.

**Moved by** Councilmember Lori Matthews, **seconded by** Councilmember Jim McCarthy to read Ordinance No. 2024-09 by title only for the first time.

**Vote:** 6 - 0 - Unanimously

*AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF FLAGSTAFF, AMENDING THE FLAGSTAFF CITY CODE, CHAPTER 1-14, PERSONNEL SYSTEM, BY AMENDING THE EMPLOYEE HANDBOOK OF REGULATIONS, SECTION 1-70-020 EMPLOYEE WELLNESS AND 1-50-039 PURCHASE DAY PROGRAM; PROVIDING FOR REPEAL OF CONFLICTING ORDINANCES, SEVERABILITY, AUTHORITY FOR CLERICAL CORRECTIONS, AND ESTABLISHING AN EFFECTIVE DATE*

- B. Consideration and Adoption of Ordinance No. 2024-11:** An ordinance of the City Council of the City of Flagstaff amending Flagstaff City Code, Chapter 1-14, Personnel System, Section 1-14-001-0006, Employee Advisory Committee, Subsection 1-14-001-0006.1, Definitions, and the Employee Handbook of Regulations, Section 1-10-070, Employee Advisory Committee; providing for repeal of conflicting ordinances; severability; authority for clerical corrections; and establishing an effective date.

Employee Advisory Committee (EAC) Co-Chairs Jessica Vigorito and Daniel Carrick addressed Council and stated that the EAC aimed to strengthen employee/employer relations by providing a forum for employees to suggest policy, safety, compensation, and benefit changes to the City Manager. It was made up of elected representatives from all city divisions to ensure every area had a voice.

Two changes were proposed to broaden membership eligibility:

1. Include part-time employees, who receive the same benefits and follow the same policies as full-time staff but work 20--39 hours per week.
2. Allow non-managerial HR staff to serve as members. These changes are intended to increase staff participation in the committee.

**Moved by** Councilmember Lori Matthews, **seconded by** Councilmember Deborah Harris to read Ordinance No. 2024-11 by title only for the first time.

**Vote:** 6 - 0 - Unanimously

*AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF FLAGSTAFF, ARIZONA, AMENDING THE FLAGSTAFF CITY CODE, CHAPTER 1-14, PERSONNEL SYSTEM, SECTION 1-14-001-0006, EMPLOYEE ADVISORY COMMITTEE, SUBSECTION 1-14-001-0006.1, DEFINITIONS, AND THE EMPLOYEE HANDBOOK OF REGULATIONS, SECTION 1-10-070, EMPLOYEE ADVISORY COMMITTEE; PROVIDING FOR REPEAL OF CONFLICTING ORDINANCES; SEVERABILITY; AUTHORITY FOR CLERICAL CORRECTIONS; AND ESTABLISHING AN EFFECTIVE DATE*

- C. Consideration and Adoption of Resolution No. 2024-13:** A resolution of the Flagstaff City Council, approving an Intergovernmental Agreement for clinical practicum and or externship/internship education between Coconino Community College district and the city of Flagstaff Fire Department

Deputy Fire Chief Chris Fennell addressed Council and stated that the intergovernmental agreement was related to paramedic training, which shifted from Northern Arizona Healthcare to Coconino Community College as part of an accreditation process. He noted the program's positive impacts, including producing most regional paramedics, serving as a recruitment tool, and giving students exposure to the fire department's personnel and equipment.

**Moved by** Councilmember Deborah Harris, **seconded by** Councilmember Miranda Sweet to read Resolution No. 2024-13 by title only.

**Vote:** 6 - 0 - Unanimously

*A RESOLUTION OF THE FLAGSTAFF CITY COUNCIL, APPROVING AN INTERGOVERNMENTAL AGREEMENT BETWEEN COCONINO COMMUNITY COLLEGE DISTRICT AND THE CITY OF FLAGSTAFF FIRE DEPARTMENT FOR CLINICAL PRACTICUM AND/OR EXTERNSHIP/INTERNSHIP EDUCATION*

**Moved by** Vice Mayor Austin Aslan, **seconded by** Councilmember Miranda Sweet to adopt Resolution No. 2024-13.

**Vote:** 6 - 0 - Unanimously

- D. **Consideration and Adoption of Resolution No. 2024-16:** A resolution of the Flagstaff City Council, approving an Intergovernmental Agreement: Cooperative Fire Rate Agreement (CFRA) with the Arizona Department of Forestry and Fire Management.

Wildland Fire Battalion Chief Paul Oltrogge addressed Council and stated that the agreement would move away from every two years to every five years. The agreement allowed the city to work through the Arizona Department of Forestry and Fire Management to get personnel and equipment ordered for wildland fire suppression and support. It also allowed for any costs incurred on those assignments or mutual aid responses to be fully reimbursed.

**Moved by** Councilmember Jim McCarthy, **seconded by** Councilmember Miranda Sweet to read Resolution No. 2024-16 by title only.

**Vote:** 6 - 0 - Unanimously

*A RESOLUTION OF THE FLAGSTAFF CITY COUNCIL, APPROVING THE 2024 COOPERATIVE FIRE RATE AGREEMENT (CFRA) INTERGOVERNMENTAL AGREEMENT BETWEEN THE ARIZONA DEPARTMENT OF FORESTRY AND FIRE MANAGEMENT AND THE CITY OF FLAGSTAFF*

**Moved by** Councilmember Jim McCarthy, **seconded by** Vice Mayor Austin Aslan to adopt Resolution No. 2024-16.

**Vote:** 6 - 0 - Unanimously

- E. **Consideration and Adoption of Resolution No. 2024-14:** A resolution of the City of Flagstaff City Council, authorizing Amendment No. Two to an Intergovernmental Agreement between the State of Arizona and the City of Flagstaff for the design and construction of a roundabout at the signalized intersection of Fourth Street and Cedar Avenue/Lockett Road.

Engineering Project Manager Alec Latino provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

FOURTH AND LOCKETT ROUNDABOUT IGA AMENDMENT #2  
FOURTH/CEDAR/LOCKETT ROUNDABOUT  
THE PROJECT  
IGA AMENDMENT #2-FOURTH AND LOCKETT ROUNDABOUT  
PROJECT COST SUMMARY  
IGA AMENDMENT #2

Vice Mayor Aslan shared that there had been some anxiety in the community about what could be handled traffic wise with all the various construction projects happening. Mr. Latino shared that the plan was to finish the Linda Vista construction before starting work on Fourth, Lockett, and Cedar, to ensure no overlap between the projects to minimize traffic disruption and keep traffic moving as smoothly as possible.

**Moved by** Councilmember Lori Matthews, **seconded by** Councilmember Miranda Sweet to read Resolution No. 2024-14 by title only.

**Vote:** 6 - 0 - Unanimously

*A RESOLUTION OF THE FLAGSTAFF CITY COUNCIL, APPROVING AMENDMENT NO. TWO TO AN INTERGOVERNMENTAL AGREEMENT BETWEEN THE ARIZONA DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION AND THE CITY OF FLAGSTAFF FOR THE DESIGN AND CONSTRUCTION OF A ROUNDABOUT AT THE SIGNALIZED INTERSECTION OF FOURTH STREET AND CEDAR AVENUE/LOCKETT ROAD*

**Moved by Councilmember Jim McCarthy, seconded by Vice Mayor Austin Aslan to adopt Resolution No. 2024-14.**

**Vote: 6 - 0 - Unanimously**

- F. Consideration and Adoption of Resolution No. 2024-15 and Ordinance No. 2024-13: A Resolution of the City Council of the City of Flagstaff, Coconino County, Arizona declaring as a public record that certain document filed with the City Clerk entitled "2024 Amendments to Flagstaff City Code, Title 13, Engineering Design and Standards and Specifications for New Infrastructure." and an Ordinance of the City Council of the City of Flagstaff, Coconino County, Arizona amending the Flagstaff City Code, Title 13, Engineering Design Standards and Specifications for New Infrastructure.**

Development Engineer David Millis provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

TITLE 13 2024 AMENDMENTS ENGINEERING DESIGN STANDARDS AND SPECIFICATIONS FOR NEW INFRASTRUCTURE  
CHANGES TO PROPOSED AMENDMENTS SINCE PREVIOUS COUNCIL WORK SESSION  
PREVIOUS COUNCIL DISCUSSION  
ADDITIONAL CHANGES

Councilmember McCarthy noted that Council would revisit the rolled curb discussion in the future and requested adding a discussion on sidewalk width. He noted that older sidewalks are four feet wide, while current code required five feet, which increased concrete use, greenhouse gas emissions, land consumption, runoff, and housing costs. We wanted a thorough review of pros and cons through relevant commissions before the discussion returned to Council.

**Moved by Councilmember Jim McCarthy, seconded by Vice Mayor Austin Aslan to read Resolution No. 2024-15 by title only.**

**Vote: 6 - 0 - Unanimously**

*A RESOLUTION OF THE FLAGSTAFF CITY COUNCIL DECLARING AS A PUBLIC RECORD THAT CERTAIN DOCUMENT FILED WITH THE CITY CLERK AND ENTITLED "2024 AMENDMENTS TO FLAGSTAFF CITY CODE, TITLE 13, ENGINEERING DESIGN STANDARDS AND SPECIFICATIONS FOR NEW INFRASTRUCTURE"*

**Moved by Vice Mayor Austin Aslan, seconded by Councilmember Jim McCarthy to read Ordinance No. 2024-13 by title only for the first time.**

**Vote: 6 - 0 - Unanimously**

*AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF FLAGSTAFF, AMENDING THE FLAGSTAFF CITY CODE, TITLE 13, ENGINEERING DESIGN STANDARDS AND SPECIFICATIONS FOR NEW INFRASTRUCTURE, BY ADOPTING BY REFERENCE THAT CERTAIN DOCUMENT ENTITLED "2024 AMENDMENTS TO FLAGSTAFF CITY CODE, TITLE 13, ENGINEERING DESIGN STANDARDS AND SPECIFICATIONS FOR NEW INFRASTRUCTURE"; PROVIDING FOR REPEAL OF CONFLICTING ORDINANCES, SEVERABILITY, AND ESTABLISHING AN EFFECTIVE DATE*

- G. Consideration and Adoption of Ordinance No. 2024-12: An ordinance of the City Council of the City of Flagstaff, amending the Flagstaff City Code, Title 9 Traffic, Chapter 9-01 Traffic Code, Section 9-01-001-0002 Specific Speed Limits; providing for penalties, repeal of conflicting ordinances, severability, and establishing an effective date.**

City Engineer Paul Mood provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

BUTLER AVENUE SPEED LIMITS  
SUMMARY  
CURRENT VS. PROPOSED POSTED SPEED LIMITS

## ORDINANCE

**Moved by Councilmember Deborah Harris, seconded by Councilmember Jim McCarthy to read Ordinance No. 2024-12 by title only for the first time.**

**Vote: 6 - 0 - Unanimously**

*AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF FLAGSTAFF, AMENDING THE FLAGSTAFF CITY CODE, TITLE 9 TRAFFIC, CHAPTER 9-01 TRAFFIC CODE, SECTION 9-01-001-0002 SPECIFIC SPEED LIMITS; PROVIDING FOR PENALTIES, REPEAL OF CONFLICTING ORDINANCES, SEVERABILITY, AND ESTABLISHING AN EFFECTIVE DATE*

11. DISCUSSION ITEMSA. **Follow up discussion from the March 25, 2024 City Council - Water Commission Joint Meeting**

Councilmember House exited the meeting at 4:20 p.m.

Water Resources Manager Erin Young and Carol Malesky with Stantec provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

WATER, RECLAIMED WATER, & WASTEWATER COST-OF-SERVICE STUDY -- WATER RATE DESIGN

WATER RATE OPTION 3

OPTION 2 + CLASS COMBINATION = OPTION 3

OPTION COMPARISON -- VOLUME CHARGE (PER 1,000 GALLONS)

WATER COS AVERAGE BILL IMPACTS FOR RATE OPTION 3 REVISED

Council discussion clarified that the displayed water rate charts showed only volume charges, with fixed charges listed separately, and that total bills combined both. Customers with low water usage, about 2,450 gallons/month or less, or those who significantly reduced consumption could avoid bill increases. Rate tiers were designed around essential indoor use of 50 gallons per person per day, allowing average households to stay within Tier 1 and larger households to remain in Tier 2. It was shared that helping seniors, single residents, and families on fixed incomes conserve water to limit impacts was important and there were suggestions for the city to provide practical conservation information for those who preferred self-reliance over requesting financial assistance.

It was asked when the last water rate study had been conducted. Staff stated that the last full cost of service study for water rates was in 2010, with rate adjustments in 2015, excluding reclaimed water, which was addressed in 2016. Those adjustments did not fully fund the CIP. Moving forward with the current proposal would fully fund the CIP for the first time in years and serve as a catch-up adjustment. While recognizing the necessity of the increases, Council emphasized the importance of helping residents, especially those with tight budgets, by providing information on ways to reduce water consumption and lower bills. Even small cost changes could significantly impact some households, so outreach and conservation guidance were encouraged.

WATER -- DISCUSSION OF OPTIONS

COUNCIL DIRECTION ON SINGLE-FAMILY VOLUME RATE

Council discussed choosing between the revised Option 3 and the previous version concerning single-family volume tier water rates. Supporters of the revised option highlighted that it lowered costs for those who conserved water, particularly benefiting people on fixed incomes by rewarding reduced usage. However, some Councilmembers expressed concern that the tier system might unfairly impact families who shared housing out of financial necessity, noting that high water use is not always due to wastefulness but sometimes reflected complex household situations. There was frustration over the need for such a significant rate increase, which was a result of delayed infrastructure investments by past councils.

Council acknowledged the tough reality that maintaining essential services like water required adequate funding, and delayed increases would only push the problem onto future councils. Suggestions were made to develop programs that help residents conserve water and reduce bills, such as rebates and community outreach focused on sustainability, particularly aimed at historically underrepresented neighborhoods.

The Council agreed to continue reviewing the rate options, with more comprehensive discussions planned for mid-April and beyond. There was consensus to support the revised Option 3 because it encouraged conservation and reflected valuable input from the Water Commission.

RECLAIMED WATER RATE AND POLICY DISCUSSION  
WHAT ARE THE UPDATED RATES FOR RECLAIMED?  
CURRENT / PROPOSED  
RECLAIMED WATER COST OF SERVICE ANALYSIS  
PREVIOUS WORK ON RECLAIMED WATER POLICY  
RECLAIMED WATER CONSIDERATIONS AND DISCUSSION

Council discussion showed a general preference for Option 1, with the desire to avoid rushing the decision or making small, piecemeal rate increases without a thorough conversation.

Council was interested in having a more robust discussion about reclaimed water rates within the next six months, rather than immediately or arbitrarily raising rates by a small percentage. Some Councilmembers felt that reclaimed water should cover its own costs, but they wanted a detailed study and thoughtful consideration before implementing changes.

Council emphasized the need for transparency about the projects involved, how they would be funded, including bonds and grants, and the overall impact on water resources and ratepayers. They wanted clear communication to the public about what the rate increases would accomplish, particularly concerning the sustainability of water supplies.

The discussion also included a caution against encouraging excessive use of reclaimed water simply because it may appear cheaper, it was important to preserve reclaimed water for future potable needs or aquifer recharge rather than allowing it to be wasted on high consumption uses like watering lawns.

PUBLIC OUTREACH EVENT  
NEXT STEPS

12. **FUTURE AGENDA ITEM REQUESTS**

*After discussion and upon agreement by three members of the Council, an item will be moved to a regularly-scheduled Council meeting.*

A. **Future Agenda Item Request (F.A.I.R.):** A Citizens' Petition titled Convert all City Vehicle Fleets to Electric

The following individuals addressed Council in support of the petition to convert all city vehicle fleets to electric:

- Jill Stephenson
- Dee Hoagland
- Stefan Sommer
- Jason Kordosky

The following comments were received:

- The Northern Arizona Climate Change Alliance urges rapid transition to electric vehicles (EV) and clean energy to drastically reduce carbon emissions by 2050.

- Transportation is a major source of greenhouse gases, and shifting away from gasoline-powered vehicles is critical for climate mitigation.
- Electric vehicles offer zero tailpipe emissions, lower fueling costs, and reduced maintenance expenses compared to gas-powered cars.
- Many major cities and counties have set ambitious goals to phase out fossil fuel vehicles and electrify public fleets.
- Flagstaff's current fleet electrification is under 10%, which is insufficient to meet the city's net zero emissions target by 2030.
- Specific targets include increasing electrification to 15% by the end of this year and 30% the next to stay on track for net zero.
- Accelerating fleet electrification also supports community adoption of EVs and expansion of charging infrastructure.
- Clean energy projects like solar and wind contribute positively to the local economy and public health.
- Existing city policies require phased replacement of fleet vehicles with electric models, but implementation needs to be faster and more comprehensive.
- There is a need to include medium and heavy-duty vehicles, such as police cruisers and fire trucks, in the electrification transition.

Vice Mayor Aslan asked for clarification on the current approach to fleet electrification, particularly whether it was better environmentally to fully use existing gas-powered vehicles before replacing them with electric ones. Sustainability Director Nicole Antonopoulos explained that the city followed an EV first policy based on the 2018 Climate Action and Adaptation Plan. When a vehicle reached the end of its service life, the city prioritized replacing it with an electric vehicle if available, or a hybrid as a second option, and only resorted to combustion engines if neither is feasible. The current fleet included 11 electric vehicles with five more on order.

Ms. Antonopoulos also shared that fleet electrification was complex and involved several considerations, including the wide range of vehicle types from sedans to heavy-duty vehicles, as well as the necessary infrastructure to support EVs. An infrastructure assessment funded by Arizona Public Service (APS) was underway to plan for charging needs, which would be presented to the Council in more detail at an upcoming Council meeting. Currently, the city had 26 EV charging ports funded by APS grants and was in the process of installing 16 more through an energy conservation contract. The city was balancing fiscal responsibility, infrastructure readiness, and vehicle replacement schedules in its approach to transitioning the fleet to electric.

Vice Mayor Aslan noted that he would not support moving the petition forward. The city was already actively working on fleet electrification, and he felt that the current process was sufficient.

Councilmember McCarthy agreed and felt that the city was already moving in the right direction.

Councilmember Sweet added that while she agreed with the elements of the petition, she believe that the city was already moving forward with exactly what the petition was asking for. She was not supportive of advancing the matter forward.

There was not requisite support to advance the matter forward to a future agenda.

### 13. OPEN CALL TO THE PUBLIC

None

### 14. INFORMATIONAL ITEMS TO/FROM MAYOR, COUNCIL, AND STAFF, AND FUTURE AGENDA ITEM REQUESTS

Councilmember Matthews requested a FAIR item to discuss the process for selecting the Vice Mayor.

Councilmember McCarthy voiced his support for the conversation about the Vice Mayor selection process. He also shared that he had met with the Airport Director many times about the Thunder

Over Flagstaff event because the event had caused a lot of discomfort for people that were sensitive to noise issues. The event would not be happening this year and he was disappointed because he had hoped they could find a way to do it, so the air tour rides did not fly right over the city. If a solution could not be found, he was glad that the event was cancelled.

Councilmember Sweet shared that Friday was First Friday Art Walk downtown, she also would be reading a proclamation for The Field of Hope dedication in honor of all children who died from abuse or neglect in the prior year.

15. **ADJOURNMENT**

The Regular Meeting of the Flagstaff City Council held April 2, 2024, adjourned at 5:57 p.m.

\_\_\_\_\_  
MAYOR

ATTEST:

\_\_\_\_\_  
CITY CLERK

**CERTIFICATION**

I, STACY SALTZBURG, do hereby certify that I am the City Clerk of the City of Flagstaff, County of Coconino, State of Arizona, and that the above Minutes are a true and correct summary of the Meeting of the Council of the City of Flagstaff held on April 2, 2024. I further certify that the Meeting was duly called and held and that a quorum was present.

DATED this 16th day of December, 2025

\_\_\_\_\_  
CITY CLERK