

MINUTES

1. Call to Order

Mayor Daggett called the Special Meeting held May 23, 2023, to order at 3:01 p.m.

NOTICE OF OPTION TO RECESS INTO EXECUTIVE SESSION

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the City Council and to the general public that, at this work session, the City Council may vote to go into executive session, which will not be open to the public, for legal advice and discussion with the City's attorneys for legal advice on any item listed on the following agenda, pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(3).

2. ROLL CALL

Present: Mayor Becky Daggett
Vice Mayor Austin Aslan (virtual)
Councilmember Deborah Harris
Councilmember Khara House
Councilmember Jim McCarthy
Councilmember Lori Matthews
Councilmember Miranda Sweet

Staff Present: City Manager Greg Clifton; City Attorney Sterling Solomon

3. Pledge of Allegiance, Mission Statement, and Land Acknowledgement

The Council and audience recited the pledge of allegiance, Councilmember Matthews read the mission statement and Councilmember McCarthy read the Land Acknowledgement.

MISSION STATEMENT

The mission of the City of Flagstaff is to protect and enhance the quality of life for all.

LAND ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The Flagstaff City Council humbly acknowledges the ancestral homelands of this area's Indigenous nations and original stewards. These lands, still inhabited by Native descendants, border mountains sacred to Indigenous peoples. We honor them, their legacies, their traditions, and their continued contributions. We celebrate their past, present, and future generations who will forever know this place as home.

4. Public Participation

Public Participation enables the public to address the council about items that are not on the prepared agenda. Public Participation appears on the agenda twice, at the beginning and at the end of the work session. You may speak at one or the other, but not both. Anyone wishing to comment at the meeting is asked to fill out a speaker card and submit it to the recording clerk. When the item comes up on the

agenda, your name will be called. You may address the Council up to three times throughout the meeting, including comments made during Public Participation. Please limit your remarks to three minutes per item to allow everyone to have an opportunity to speak. At the discretion of the Chair, ten or more persons present at the meeting and wishing to speak may appoint a representative who may have no more than fifteen minutes to speak.

Michele James addressed Council regarding Northern Arizona Healthcare's rezoning ordinance. She expressed frustration that the first reading proceeded without sufficient information, and urged the Council to fully vet the project and consider consulting outside experts.

Dee Hoagland addressed Council and raised concerns about NAH's new hospital proposal, highlighting the need for systemic changes to combat climate change. She urged the inclusion of LEED Platinum Certification and alternative energy sources in the hospital's design. She also warned that placing the hospital on the town's outskirts could increase traffic and recommended incorporating affordable housing in plans for both the new and existing campuses.

Jill Stephenson addressed Council and stated that while all voices on pickleball were heard, she stressed that the climate crisis is a bigger challenge needing urgent attention. She urged the City to accelerate its transition to electric power and reduce consumption, and called for NAH to lower its carbon emissions to align with the City's goals. She recommended pausing the project until an environmental study is completed.

John McCartney also spoke, stating that NAH should build the hospital to be carbon net zero.

Stefan Sommer addressed Council about the NAH proposal, stressing the need to include carbon and sustainability standards. He recommended adding three key elements to the development agreement: LEED Platinum Certification, public transportation options, and public housing.

Uncle Don Fireland Fanning submitted written comments with concerns about the use of herbicides at Woody Mountain Well Field.

5. **Proclamation: Public Works Week**

Mayor Daggett read and presented the proclamation.

6. **Proclamation: Jewish American Heritage Month**

Councilmember House read and presented the proclamation.

7. **Consideration of Appointments: Board of Adjustment.**

Moved by Councilmember Khara House, **seconded by** Councilmember Deborah Harris to appoint Devin Kelley to a term expiring May 2025.

Vote: 7 - 0 - Unanimously

Moved by Councilmember Lori Matthews, **seconded by** Councilmember Miranda Sweet to appoint Jed Westover to a term expiring May 2025.

Vote: 7 - 0 - Unanimously

Moved by Councilmember Jim McCarthy, **seconded by** Councilmember Miranda Sweet to appoint James Maloney to a term expiring May 2025.

Vote: 7 - 0 - Unanimously

8. **Consideration and Adoption of Resolution No. 2023-28:** A resolution of the Flagstaff City Council, approving an Intergovernmental Agreement between the City of Flagstaff and the City of Phoenix for recyclable materials processing.

Public Works Director Scott Overton addressed Council regarding the approval of an

Intergovernmental Agreement between the City of Flagstaff and the City of Phoenix for recyclable materials processing.

Councilmember McCarthy asked if the recycling center in Phoenix accepts things that Flagstaff did not and asked if staff will reach out to the community to communicate what can be recycled. Mr. Overton stated that the City of Phoenix does collect different products, but Flagstaff has not changed their collections at this time. He added that there are higher commodity prices for glass and staff would like to continue the practice of separating glass due to shipping costs for at least the next six months.

Councilmember Matthews asked about the continuation of some contamination. She added that it would be prudent of the City to remind people of what can be recycled to contain costs. Mr. Overton stated that it a cyclical education pattern and that staff will work with Sustainability regarding education to continue to cut costs.

Councilmember McCarthy suggested that a target audience could be Short Term Rental owners to ask them to put notices about recycling in their units.

Moved by Councilmember Lori Matthews, **seconded by** Councilmember Jim McCarthy to read Resolution No. 2023-28 by title only.

Vote: 7 - 0 - Unanimously

A RESOLUTION OF THE FLAGSTAFF CITY COUNCIL, APPROVING AN INTERGOVERNMENTAL AGREEMENT BETWEEN THE CITY OF FLAGSTAFF AND THE CITY OF PHOENIX FOR RECYCLABLE MATERIALS PROCESSING

Moved by Councilmember Jim McCarthy, **seconded by** Councilmember Lori Matthews to adopt Resolution No. 2023-28.

Vote: 7 - 0 - Unanimously

9. **Consideration and Approval of Contract:** Emergency Contract for the Purchase of Materials/Services with Joe Dirt Excavating, Inc. for emergency hauling services of commingled recyclables in an amount not to exceed \$200,000.

Moved by Councilmember Jim McCarthy, **seconded by** Councilmember Miranda Sweet to ratify Contract No 2023-130: Emergency Contract for the Purchase of Materials/Services with Joe Dirt Excavating, Inc. for emergency hauling services of commingled recyclables in an amount not to exceed \$200,000 and authorize the City Manager to execute the necessary documents.

Vote: 7 - 0 - Unanimously

10. **Consideration and Adoption of Resolution No. 2023-21:** A resolution approving the filing of condemnation proceedings to acquire easements necessary for the Switzer Canyon Water Transmission Main Project, Phase IV.

Real Estate Manager Bryce Doty asked Council to postpone this item until the June 6, 2023 meeting.

Moved by Councilmember Jim McCarthy, **seconded by** Councilmember Lori Matthews to postpone the item to June 6, 2023.

Vote: 7 - 0 - Unanimously

11. **Future Agenda Item Request (F.A.I.R.):** A Citizens' Petition titled Heavy Industrial Adjacent to Residential

Julian Bowers addressed Council regarding the petition and the nuisance that the current route is causing in several neighborhoods. He added that a dump truck rolled over on the top of Empire. He stated that they are seeing four to five heavy industrial vehicles on their residential streets every hour.

Joelle Worth addressed Council and responded to Traffic Engineering's findings. She requested certain routes be deleted.

Mayor Daggett asked Ms. Worth to speak about the conversation she had with the CEO of Sacred Peaks. Ms. Worth spoke about the difficulties that the staff and patients have turning left and how they turn themselves around in the neighborhood.

Daniel Raper addressed Council and spoke about the history of the property and stated that it was not supposed to be developed. He added that there are a lot of difficulties with the trucks going through the residential streets and believes there is a safety issue. He spoke about the different proposed routes. He asked if the City would be willing to work with Mr. Todd to have a rezone for residential.

Billy Todd, owner of the property, addressed Council and stated that all trucks follow traffic procedures. It is his approved access but he is open to suggestions.

Michelle Lindquist from the Oakwoods Pine Subdivision addressed Council and stated that she did not realize that their home abutted heavy industrial land.

Councilmember McCarthy noted that there are two key questions to consider: Is there a problem, and what is the solution? He acknowledged that a problem exists and recommended that staff and the Transportation Commission thoroughly review the issue.

Council was in agreement and asked Transportation staff to review the matter and bring it back to Council.

12. Adjournment

Mayor Daggett adjourned the Special Meeting at 4:06 p.m.

WORK SESSION

1. Call to Order

Mayor Daggett called the Work Session to order at 4:06 p.m.

NOTICE OF OPTION TO RECESS INTO EXECUTIVE SESSION

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the City Council and to the general public that, at this work session, the City Council may vote to go into executive session, which will not be open to the public, for legal advice and discussion with the City's attorneys for legal advice on any item listed on the following agenda, pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(3).

2. City Manager Report

City Manager Greg Clifton briefly reviewed his report.

Capital Improvements Engineer Trevor Henry provided an update on the City Engineering report and covered the projects on the Capital Improvements Map along with meetings with the Army Corps of Engineers. He also provided information about grants and construction of the Butler corridor.

Councilmember McCarthy asked if there was design planned for the Butler raised bike lane project. Mr. Henry stated that it will be a part of the bigger corridor on Butler.

Development Engineer David Millis provided an update on development projects.

Community Investment Director David McIntire covered the Economic Vitality Report including recent events, Airport updates, ParkFlag maintenance, and staff highlights.

Parks, Recreation, Open Space, and Events Director Rebecca Sayers reviewed the PROSE April and May Newsletters.

3. **Flagstaff Emergency Operations Plan Development**

Grants, Contracts, and Emergency Management Director Stacey Brechler-Knaggs and Emergency Manager Daniel Kelly introduced Emergency Management Partners Project Manager Ashleigh Makuch and the County Emergency Management staff who provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

INTRODUCTION
WHY DOES FLAGSTAFF NEED AND EOP?
THE PLANNING UNIVERSE
PROJECT OVERVIEW
PROJECT TIMELINE
PLANNING GUIDANCE
PLANNING PROCESS
THE PREPAREDNESS CYCLE
EOP STRUCTURE AND CONTENTS
CITY COORDINATING DIVISIONS
NEXT STEPS

4. **Butler and Beaver Pilot Bike Program Update**

Transportation Engineer Associate David Lemcke, Police Chief Dan Musselman, Multi-Modal Transportation Planner Martin Ince, Transportation Director Jeff Bauman, and Streets Section Director Sam Beckett provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

BACKGROUND
THE PILOT PLAN
FIRST EVALUATION JUNE 2022
JUNE 2022 RECOMMENDATIONS
RESULTS OF JUNE 2022 EVALUATION
TODAY -- SECOND EVALUATION
KEY TAKE-A-WAYS
WINTER SNOW OPERATIONS
SPRING GENERAL MAINTENANCE
POLICE DEPARTMENT INPUT -- POLICE CHIEF DAN MUSSELMAN
FIRE DEPARTMENT INPUT
COSTS
BICYCLE VOLUMES
CRASH DATA
COMMISSION RECOMMENDATIONS
STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS
RAISED BIKE LANES
SAFE STREETS FOR ALL (SS4A)
SS4A GRANT -- STREET CONVERSION
LOOKING FORWARD
SEPARATED/PROTECTED BIKEWAYS
UPCOMING REORGANIZATION

Mr. Beckett reviewed the staff recommendation regarding the removal of theseparated bike lanes on Butler and Beaver Streets. He explained that the current infrastructure presents increasing safety concerns, particularly in winter, and that accident data is trending negatively. The goal is to transition to buffered bike lanes that provide safer, more sustainable infrastructure while still promoting cycling. Mr. Beckett emphasized the importance of creating commuting opportunities that work now and set the stage for future improvements.

Councilmember Harris raised concerns about how vehicles respond when emergency vehicles

approach. Chief Musselman explained that during such instances, cars typically wait until the light changes or try to pull into nearby side streets, but there is often no clear space for them to go. Councilmember Harris also asked whether bicyclists had been consulted. Mr. Beckett confirmed that staff has been in regular communication with cyclists and that most feedback supports long-term solutions like raised bike lanes. Councilmember Harris also asked about storm drain relocation with a raised lane system, to which Mr. Bauman responded that the grates would need to be moved, a costly aspect of the project.

Councilmember Matthews expressed hesitation about the high cost of the proposed changes and the difficulty of maintaining safe infrastructure in a snowy climate. She noted that Butler and Beaver are already dangerous for pedestrians and cyclists and questioned the effectiveness of solutions like candlestick barriers. She asked whether rumble strips were considered as an alternative. Mr. Beckett replied that while the idea was explored, other cities reported increased noise complaints from such strips. Councilmember Matthews questioned whether the lanes could be left in place until fall and suggested the need for more effective interim solutions. Mr. Beckett responded that a significant number of barriers have already been removed due to accidents and that the current setup does not meet comfort standards for users. Councilmember Matthews inquired about the cost of the project to date, and Mr. Bauman stated that approximately \$1 million has been spent on setup, with \$50,000 in maintenance the first year and \$100,000 in the second. He also confirmed that protected intersections are included in the budget.

Councilmember Sweet asked who was responsible for writing the grant application, and Mr. Lemcke confirmed it was being handled by the new Transportation Director, with MetroPlan, and Grants, Contracts, and Emergency Management Director Stacey Brechler-Knaggs. Councilmember Sweet also asked if the city would be able to maintain the updated pavement markings. Mr. Beckett responded affirmatively, stating that the markings would be refreshed each fall and spring and were easier to maintain than the current infrastructure. Councilmember Sweet questioned why Butler would be removed while Beaver might be retained, and Mr. Beckett explained that although over 50% of damaged curbs are on Beaver, crash data on Butler is significantly worse. Mr. Lemcke clarified that the current staff recommendation is to remove separated bike lanes from both streets and replace them with buffered lanes.

Councilmember McCarthy described observing a semi-truck with a trailer that crossed over the existing curb, raising questions about lane width. Mr. Bauman responded that future travel lanes will be similar in width but slightly wider, by about 18 inches, with adjustments made to curbs in areas requiring more turning space. Councilmember McCarthy agreed that the extra space would likely prevent the truck from hitting the curb and emphasized the need for functional design.

Councilmember House noted that many of the reported accidents were side-swipes and rear-end collisions and asked whether the physical barriers were contributing to safety risks. Mr. Beckett stated that the barriers are a contributing factor, and Chief Musselman added that they create ditches that narrow the roadway and increase side-swipes, especially in icy conditions. Councilmember House expressed hesitation about removing all infrastructure without guaranteed grant funding and voiced concern about moving backward in terms of cyclist safety.

Mayor Daggett asked how much narrower the current travel lanes are compared to what is being proposed. Mr. Bauman explained that in some areas, vehicle lanes are currently six to nine inches narrower than in the proposed configuration, with all of the reduced space having come from the vehicle lanes. Mayor Daggett also raised concerns about emergency vehicle access, especially during red lights when drivers are unable to yield. Chief Musselman confirmed that this issue occurs both in winter and summer and that traffic congestion, coupled with narrow lanes, often prevents vehicles from moving out of the way. Mayor Daggett inquired about snow removal in a raised lane system, and Mr. Beckett responded that snow storage would likely be handled through the PROSE Division, potentially with smaller plows, although specific plans are not yet developed. Mayor Daggett also questioned the increase in public complaints. Mr. Lemcke reported receiving 19 formal comments, three in favor of the lanes and sixteen opposed, while Mr. Beckett added that staff fielded approximately 400 calls over the winter months related to the issue.

Mr. Clifton commented that the pilot project is not demonstrating success and, while not a total failure,

presents enough concerns to justify reconsideration. He emphasized that the barriers are fragmented in many locations and often intersect with driveways, especially on Beaver, creating frequent damage and confusion for both drivers and cyclists. He noted that barriers are less effective in snowy communities and that similar setups in other cities do not face the same challenges. He personally avoids the barriered routes and prefers routes like West Avenue with raised bike lanes. He warned that continuing the current approach could generate public opposition that might hinder future multimodal transportation projects.

Councilmember Harris asked for clarification on what a raised bike lane would look like and whether it would be similar to those near the NAU campus on San Francisco Street. Staff confirmed that this is indeed the proposed design.

Dapper Dre addressed Council and thanked staff for the information and acknowledged the complexity of the decision. He reflected on the difference between reactive and proactive planning, noting that most bike and pedestrian infrastructure is implemented reactively, often after a tragedy. He questioned whether the current barriers are the best use of resources, calling them quick and reactive solutions. In contrast, he sees raised bike lanes as a proactive and effective measure. He cautioned against removing existing infrastructure without a replacement in place, emphasizing the importance of getting it right the first time. He stressed that if pedestrian and cyclist needs are not prioritized from the start, the city will continue to rely on retrofitting. He concluded by stating that funding decisions should reflect the needs of all users, reminding the group that every driver is also a pedestrian.

Susan Hueftle, Chair of the Bicycle Advisory Committee (BAC), addressed Council and stated that the BAC was shocked and disappointed by the staff recommendation to remove the curbs and candlesticks. She acknowledged that change is difficult but emphasized that the project was implemented without proper public education. She argued that infrastructure should not be removed until a viable alternative is in place. She stressed the importance of supporting the large portion of the population who are interested in biking but feel nervous about safety. While barriers may be inconvenient for some drivers, they significantly benefit cyclists. She recommended retaining some form of physical barrier, emphasized the need for reduced speed limits, and noted that encouraging cycling could help address broader community issues.

Adam Shimoni, speaking on behalf of the Flagstaff Biking Organization (FBO), shared his positive experience riding the bike lanes earlier that day, noting they were clear, free of vehicle interference, and felt safe. He described the pilot as successful overall, despite some maintenance challenges. Mr. Shimoni stated that the FBO supports both the project and its continued funding, and he endorsed the recommendations put forth by the BAC. He expressed concern that the Transportation Commission made decisions prior to hearing input from the BAC. Mr. Shimoni emphasized the importance of physical separation in bike infrastructure, particularly for more hesitant riders, and noted that it can help reduce traffic congestion. He downplayed maintenance costs, calling them minimal, especially when compared to the lack of maintenance on other bike infrastructure, such as Fourth Street. He also mentioned that existing data on the issue can be confusing.

Tyler Denham addressed the Council and shared that his experience using the bike lanes has been mostly positive. He acknowledged the maintenance challenges and agreed that a raised sidewalk or bike lane would be the ideal long-term solution. However, he expressed concern about the timing of removing the current infrastructure and urged the Council to delay its removal for as long as possible. Mr. Denham posed two specific questions: (1) What was the nature of the crashes being reported? and (2) At the last commission meeting, there was discussion about installing plastic bollards, why was that option ultimately rejected?

Tyler Denham and Matthew Eckhoff submitted written comments in support of the separated bike lanes.

Mayor Daggett expressed confusion about crash data and questioned the reported increase in single-vehicle crashes and side-swipes. She asked whether the data sets being compared were equal in scope. Mr. Lemcke clarified that most crash data comes from police reports and the ACIS system, noting trends are aligned despite some differences in collection periods. Chief Musselman added that some discrepancies may be due to one data set covering six months versus a full year, but he does

not believe that fully accounts for the increase. Updated ACIS data is expected in July 2022.

Councilmember House appreciated the shift in language from "removal" to "transition" and emphasized the importance of not fully dismantling the pilot project without secured grant funding. She supported moving toward raised bike lanes and suggested interim measures like reduced speed limits or flashing lights, especially in high-risk areas like Sawmill Plaza. She urged a continued focus on pedestrian and cyclist safety.

Mr. Clifton recommended modifying the existing infrastructure by removing problematic sections while keeping others.

Councilmember Harris noted the challenge of encouraging tourism while maintaining street safety. She proposed a two-pronged approach: improving cyclist infrastructure and reducing car congestion, possibly through tourism partnerships that encourage alternative transportation.

Councilmember Sweet shared her personal cycling experience, expressing that she no longer uses the bike lanes due to debris and obstacles. She witnessed a driver hit a curb and candlestick, highlighting concerns with current infrastructure. She supported revisiting the pilot after the grant decision and agreed with the idea of making targeted modifications.

Councilmember House reiterated her concern about removing infrastructure prematurely and highlighted the need for flashing signals and speed reduction in problem areas like Sawmill. She supported reprioritizing goals in favor of bike and pedestrian safety.

Mayor Daggett supported permanently reducing the speed limit on Butler, suggesting it would improve cyclist comfort without significantly impacting traffic. She proposed keeping barriers in place for now and removing them only in specific areas as needed. She suggested staff coordinate with the BAC and Transportation Commission to evaluate which barriers should remain and how to handle snow removal.

Councilmember House agreed with the Mayor's approach.

Councilmember Sweet also supported revisiting the issue after the grant decision, consulting with advisory committees, and exploring speed limit reductions and targeted modifications.

Councilmember Harris agreed and asked for clarification on grant timelines. Mr. Bauman noted that if awarded, construction could begin in late 2024, depending on final design timelines.

Councilmember Aslan supported raised bike lanes and recommended expediting funding and design. He supported maintaining existing bike lanes until fall.

Vice Mayor Aslan expressed uncertainty about where to land in the debate but noted a majority consensus was forming. Initially supportive of retaining the lanes, he acknowledged the need to monitor upcoming issues and supported continued dialogue.

Mayor Daggett supported proceeding with the design but advised managing expectations. Mr. Bauman confirmed current designs are at 50%, with potential to complete early next year and possibly begin construction in late 2024.

Council reached consensus on directing staff to move forward with the design for raised bike lanes, and to work with BAC and Transportation Commission to evaluate interim solutions, including selective barrier removal, speed reduction, and snow removal strategies. Staff is expected to return with recommendations by early September to allow time for winter preparation.

Mr. Clifton asked if there was support for reducing the Butler speed limit from 40 mph to 35 mph. Mayor Daggett, Councilmembers McCarthy, Harris, House, and Sweet expressed support for lowering the speed limit. Some noted that Butler's current operating speed is too high, particularly through residential and mixed-use areas.

Vice Mayor Aslan questioned why Council could not directly change the speed limit and asked for clarification on how speed limits are determined. Mr. Bauman explained that a traffic study, in accordance with state law, would be needed and would influence, but not solely determine, the speed limit. He noted Butler currently has a 35 mph limit from Milton to Lone Tree and 40 mph from Lone Tree to Ponderosa. A study would take several months.

Councilmember Harris also suggested increased enforcement along Butler as a short-term solution. Councilmember McCarthy supported using pedestrian and residential considerations to justify a lower speed.

5. Informational Items To/From Mayor, Council, and City Manager; future agenda item requests

Mayor Daggett shared that the City is receiving \$8.9 million to help pay for the Highway 180 corridor flood mitigation.

6. Public Participation

None

7. Adjournment

The Work Session held May 23, 2023, adjourned at 8:26 p.m.

MAYOR

ATTEST:

CITY CLERK

CERTIFICATION

I, STACY SALTZBURG, do hereby certify that I am the City Clerk of the City of Flagstaff, County of Coconino, State of Arizona, and that the above Minutes are a true and correct summary of the Meeting of the Council of the City of Flagstaff held on May 23, 2023. I further certify that the Meeting was duly called and held and that a quorum was present.

DATED this 16th day of December, 2025

CITY CLERK