

MINUTES

1. Call to Order

Mayor Daggett called the meeting of the Flagstaff City Council held November 12, 2024, to order at 3:02 p.m.

NOTICE OF OPTION TO RECESS INTO EXECUTIVE SESSION

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the City Council and to the general public that, at this work session, the City Council may vote to go into executive session, which will not be open to the public, for discussion and consultation with the City's attorneys for legal advice on any item listed on the following agenda, pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(3).

2. Roll Call

Present: Becky Daggett, Mayor
Austin Aslan, Vice Mayor
Deborah Harris, Councilmember
Khara House, Councilmember
Lori Matthews, Councilmember
Jim McCarthy, Councilmember
Miranda Sweet, Councilmember

Staff Present: City Manager Greg Clifton; City Attorney Sterling Solomon

3. Pledge of Allegiance, Mission Statement, and Land Acknowledgement

The Council and audience recited the pledge of allegiance, Councilmember McCarthy read the Mission Statement of the City of Flagstaff, and Councilmember Harris read the Land Acknowledgement.

MISSION STATEMENT

The mission of the City of Flagstaff is to protect and enhance the quality of life for all.

LAND ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The Flagstaff City Council humbly acknowledges the ancestral homelands of this area's Indigenous nations and original stewards. These lands, still inhabited by Native descendants, border mountains sacred to Indigenous peoples. We honor them, their legacies, their traditions, and their continued contributions. We celebrate their past, present, and future generations who will forever know this place as home.

4. Open Call to the Public

Open Call to the Public enables the public to address the Council about an item that is not on the prepared agenda. Comments relating to items that are on the agenda will be taken at the time that the item is discussed. Open Call to the Public appears on the agenda twice, at the beginning and at the end. The total time allotted for the first Open Call to the Public is 30 minutes; any additional comments

will be held until the second Open Call to the Public.

If you wish to address the Council in person at today's meeting, please complete a comment card and submit it to the recording clerk as soon as possible. Your name will be called when it is your turn to speak. You may address the Council up to three times throughout the meeting, including comments made during Open Call to the Public and Public Comment. Please limit your remarks to three minutes per item to allow everyone an opportunity to speak. At the discretion of the Chair, ten or more persons present at the meeting and wishing to speak may appoint a representative who may have no more than fifteen minutes to speak.

Craig Bouchard addressed Council regarding a recent newspaper article and thanked Councilmember Matthews for her input. He spoke about concerns related to a dumpster located behind his property and the impact it has on nearby businesses using it.

5. Review of Draft Agenda for the November 19, 2024 City Council Meeting

Citizens wishing to speak on agenda items not specifically called out by the City Council may submit a speaker card for their items of interest to the recording clerk.

None

6. Proclamation: Lung Cancer Awareness Month

Mayor Daggett read and presented the proclamation.

7. City Manager Report

Mr. Clifton briefly reviewed his report.

8. Post-wildfire Flooding Update

Public Works Director Scott Overton, Capital Improvements Engineer Trevor Henry, Stormwater Manager Ed Schenk, Brady Henderson with AZ Climate Corp., Julie Leid with Peak Engineering, and Joe Loverich with JE Fuller provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

POST-WILDFIRE FLOODING UPDATE
OBJECTIVES FOR TONIGHT
OVERALL MAP
WATERSHED CONDITIONS
PRIMARY CHANGE IN WATERSHED
LOOKING FORWARD
2024 MONSOONS
SPRUCE WASH
SUITE OF PROJECTS
SPRUCE WASH SCHEDULE
SPRUCE WASH BUDGET
GRANDVIEW DRIVE RECONSTRUCTION
THE "WEDGE" STORM DRAIN
LINDA VISTA CROSSING
CEDAR AVENUE CROSSING
ARROYO SECO TO DORTHA CHANNEL
ARROYO SECO INLET
KILLIP BASINS INLET
KILLIP BASINS OUTLET
TRAFFIC CONTROL
COMMUNICATIONS

Mayor Daggett shared that a resident had raised concerns about gas line work behind her home and

asked whether the issue had been resolved and steps taken to prevent recurrence.

Ms. Leid confirmed that follow-up conversations had occurred with all involved parties. A key takeaway was the importance of having a licensed plumber on site or on call to respond promptly to any future issues.

SCHULTZ CREEK
SYSTEM OF IMPROVEMENTS
SCHULTZ CREEK LONG TERM MITIGATION
SCHULTZ CREEK MODELING
SHORT-TERM MITIGATIONS -- SCHULTZ CREEK
RE-USING SANDBAGS
NON-FIRE 2024 FLOOD SUMMARY
LEGISLATIVE ACTIONS
FLOOD PREVENTION GRANTS

Councilmember Matthews inquired whether the available grant applies to renters. Ms. Leid confirmed that it does, though a homeowner agreement must be in place. Councilmember Matthews expressed appreciation for the staff's hard work, noting her initial doubts about completing the process in time.

Councilmember House echoed her thanks, praising the team's efforts and the community's patience and collaboration. She expressed enthusiasm for the progress made and what is still to come.

9. Public Works Streets Section 2024 Snow Operations Presentation and Discussion

Public Works Streets Director Sam Beckett, provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

STREETS 2024 SNOW OPERATIONS
PRESENTATION OBJECTIVES
2023-24 SEASON REVIEW
SNOW SHIFTS -- EQUIP AND STAFFING
STREETS SNOWPLOW FLEET
STREETS STAFFING
STREETS WINTER RESPONSIBILITIES
STREETS SNOW RESPONSE POLICY
STREETS -- SNOW PLOWING PRIORITIES
POST EVENT
STREETS STRATEGIC VISION AND GOALS

Councilmember Sweet asked for an update on the separated bike lane project, noting that while improvements were seen last year, the visibility of concrete barriers remains a concern during snow events, especially when candlesticks are missing. Mr. Beckett explained that bike lane snow removal is currently a secondary service. On primary routes such as Butler, snowplows operate continuously, but it still takes around three hours to complete a pass on bike lanes. He noted that complaints were minimal last winter. Councilmember Sweet acknowledged the improvements and expressed appreciation.

Councilmember House asked about staffing levels, having seen snow crew job postings. Mr. Beckett responded that they are not yet fully staffed out of a goal of 24 temporary snow operators, only 12 positions are filled. He emphasized the difficulty in recruiting due to high demand in the construction field and said they are exploring ways to remain competitive.

Councilmember House raised concerns about snow pile removal in cul-de-sacs. Mr. Beckett clarified that these are typically addressed last and only when resources allow. The process requires disassembling trucks to switch functions, which is labor-intensive and hard on equipment. The team balances these operations as best as possible given current resources.

Councilmember Matthews suggested exploring temporary hazard pay to improve recruitment,

especially since CDL drivers are in high demand. She noted it is a tough sell to attract someone to work in hazardous conditions during the night. Public Works Director Scott Overton acknowledged the pressures and shared that compensation is being taken seriously, including recent adjustments through the city's market pay study. He added that while the city offers a snow stipend, they are focused on long-term cultural and structural changes rather than one-time fixes.

Councilmember Harris inquired about driver restrictions for snowplow operators. Mr. Beckett responded that while federal rules require drivers to stop after 16 hours, the city enforces a stricter 14-hour limit for safety. Shifts are designed around 12 hours to ensure proper rest before operating again.

Councilmember Harris also asked how residential areas are prioritized. Mr. Beckett explained that the city uses a quadrant system, assigning trucks to different areas, prioritizing routes for emergency access and school transportation. While ideally there would be five trucks per side of the city, current staffing often results in just three. Arterial roads are the main focus, and routes are designed to minimize left turns for efficiency.

Mayor Daggett mentioned residents reporting their roads never being plowed and asked how the city is addressing that. Mr. Beckett shared that GIS mapping has been implemented to guide operators unfamiliar with certain areas, and GPS tracking helps confirm service coverage. However, service does not always meet expectations. The city is working to improve response and encourages residents to report missed areas through phone or online forms.

Mayor Daggett also emphasized the importance of clearing bike lanes quickly and asked about the city's policy on chemical deicers. Mr. Beckett confirmed that Council made a deliberate decision not to use deicers, considering environmental, operational, and financial impacts. However, ADOT does apply deicers on state routes that run through Flagstaff.

Vice Mayor Aslan reiterated the need for timely bike lane clearing and pointed out safety issues for pedestrians, including snowbanks and lingering cinders. He raised concerns about sidewalk maintenance and questioned how cinders are managed post-season. Mr. Beckett explained that property owners are responsible for clearing adjacent sidewalks. Cinders should be swept into the roadway, where city sweepers can collect them. For city-owned sidewalks, responsibility is shared among multiple departments, and coordination is ongoing to improve response. Mr. Beckett emphasized the importance of community cooperation in maintaining safe conditions. Vice Mayor Aslan acknowledged progress but noted that some problem areas persist.

Keith Becker, a 47-year resident, addressed Council and expressed deep concern over the city's current snow removal operations. He stated that the existing plan endangers lives, particularly for those with medical needs who cannot navigate secondary streets. Citing a personal example, he noted that he often has to drive his neighbor to dialysis due to impassable roads. He alleged that snow operators sometimes intentionally pile five-foot berms, further obstructing access. Many essential workers, including medical professionals, are unable to reach their jobs due to poor plowing on non-primary routes. Mr. Becker urged the Council to revisit the four-inch snow rule and called for snow removal on all streets, not just priority routes. He recommended purchasing five additional snowplows and increasing staffing levels from 88% to 150% to meet the city's growing needs.

Mayor Daggett inquired whether additional personnel or equipment would be requested in the upcoming budget and asked about the effectiveness of current recruitment strategies. Mr. Beckett responded that while Public Works is seeing some success with focused recruitment efforts, they plan to request only a few additional positions due to budget constraints. He emphasized the importance of balancing resources while still progressing toward strategic goals.

Russ Randall addressed Council and emphasized that accessible and inclusive infrastructure is a basic human right, especially for those with physical disabilities who rely on safe transportation to medical appointments. He urged the Council to ensure that snow removal efforts throughout the city are inclusive and compliant with legal accessibility requirements.

Rachael Simukonda addressed Council and shared her personal difficulties accessing medical care during recent snow events due to inadequate plowing of secondary streets. She advocated for a

reassessment of the priority street system, noting that many essential services like schools and clinics are located on secondary roads. Ms. Simukonda also highlighted accessibility issues with the city's online complaint form, stating it is not ADA compliant. She requested improved coordination among divisions and better enforcement for timely sidewalk clearing, as well as ADA training for snow removal staff and temporary hires.

Mayor Daggett asked Mr. Beckett to address concerns regarding the primary vs. secondary street plowing strategy. Mr. Beckett explained that while the goal is to reach all city roads, limited resources necessitate prioritization. Programs like PROSE, Sustainability Snow Heroes, and internal teams assist with berm removal. However, the city is still working to keep pace with growth and connect residents to resources.

Mayor Daggett requested that Public Works' contact information be shared through the city's social media during winter and noted ongoing efforts to revamp the city website with a focus on ADA compliance. Mr. Beckett confirmed he would coordinate with customer service to improve complaint form accessibility.

Councilmember Harris suggested software solutions that can make digital forms fully ADA compliant. She also raised concerns about emergency vehicles accessing unplowed streets. Mr. Beckett responded that departments coordinate response efforts and that fire engines, police, and EMS vehicles are equipped appropriately for such conditions.

Councilmember McCarthy reminded attendees that the city offers a berm removal service for elderly or physically challenged residents.

10. Discussion of Nuisance Noise and Community Commercial Zoning Codes

Senior Deputy City Manager Shannon Anderson, Zoning Code Manager Tiffany Antol, and Assistant City Attorney Marianne Sullivan provided a PowerPoint presentation that covered the following:

NUISANCE NOISE AND COMMUNITY COMMERCIAL ZONE CODES
BACKGROUND
NUISANCE NOISE CITY CODE
COMMUNITY COMMERCIAL ZONE

Councilmember McCarthy referenced a previous city approach that applied different allowable noise levels for residential, commercial, and industrial zones and asked why this model could not be used again. Ms. Antol explained that zoning enforcement is complex and that land use categories are easier for staff to apply than zoning districts. She emphasized the importance of treating all properties fairly and noted that prioritizing one use over another within zones, such as residential over commercial, is not how the zoning code is currently structured.

Councilmember Sweet suggested setting different quiet hours for the downtown area based on the boundaries of the Downtown Business Alliance (DBA), acknowledging that expectations for noise levels differ between downtown and residential neighborhoods like the Southside. Ms. Antol and Ms. Sullivan confirmed that time-based distinctions are not unusual and have been done in other city codes. Councilmember House raised concerns about how the Community Commercial (CC) zone has evolved, particularly in the Southside, from its original vision as a live/work area to one that now heavily includes residential properties. Ms. Antol explained that many lots in the Southside do not meet modern development standards and that there has been limited commercial development in those areas compared to other CC-zoned neighborhoods.

Vice Mayor Aslan expressed concerns about potential claims under Proposition 207, which allows property owners to sue the city if new regulations reduce their property value. City Attorney Solomon confirmed that such claims are often subjective and most frequently arise from zoning code changes. Councilmember Harris emphasized that the core issue is behavior, not just zoning, and stressed the importance of taking action rather than referring residents to courts, especially those with limited resources.

Craig Bouchard addressed Council and argued that citywide ordinance changes are unnecessary, citing only 14 noise complaints according to Flagstaff Police data. He described the issue as a private dispute between himself, his tenant, and a neighbor, and warned that broader action could lead to legal challenges, reduced property values, and lost city revenue. He urged the Council to let the matter be resolved in court, not through citywide policy.

Candace Ryan addressed Council and shared that she filed a noise complaint in October and emphasized that residents are proposing a reasonable compromise--quiet hours starting at 8:00 p.m. on weekdays and 10:00 p.m. on weekends, not a 24/7 restriction. She called for clearer ordinance language requiring officers to assess noise from the property line, not inside homes, and said Southside residents are being subjected to disturbances not tolerated elsewhere.

Councilmember McCarthy noted that Ms. Ryan had researched zoning and neighborhood conditions before moving in, acknowledging that while commercial uses are allowed, that should not override residents' right to a livable environment.

Blake Whitten addressed Council and urged them to adopt the resident proposal, calling it a fair compromise. He warned that failure to act could lead to legal action and stated the proposed quiet hours aim to protect families' well-being. He also suggested a four-strike system for suspending business licenses over repeated violations.

Dawn Tucker addressed Council and supported the resident proposal, citing health concerns and stress from ongoing disturbances. She emphasized that this is not an isolated issue.

Sean Golightly addressed Council and echoed support for the resident-submitted ordinance, noting it would have little impact on live music while addressing a long-neglected problem. He stressed that residents have waited years for action and that it is time for a resolution. Mr. Golightly also submitted written comments in support of the resident submitted ordinance.

Councilmember McCarthy noted that multiple families have moved due to ongoing disturbances and highlighted the ineffectiveness of the current requirement for police to enter homes to verify noise violations. He supported quiet hours of 8:00 p.m. and 10:00 p.m.

Councilmember Matthews cautioned that those hours could harm businesses and lead to unintended consequences, including Prop 207 claims. She supported the staff's proposed hours of 12:00 a.m. and 1:00 a.m. and emphasized the need for a long-term, realistic solution that balances residential and commercial needs.

Councilmember House supported a compromise between 8:00 p.m. and midnight, noting that the HC-zoned neighborhood already observes quiet hours of 10:00 p.m. to 7:00 a.m. She questioned why similar standards could not apply elsewhere.

Councilmember Harris strongly supported the 8:00 p.m. and 10:00 p.m. quiet hours, stressing the health and safety concerns and noting the community's exhaustion with inaction. She urged the Council to have the courage to say no to problem businesses.

Vice Mayor Aslan warned against overregulating based on a single dispute, arguing that overly restrictive noise rules could damage downtown vibrancy and bring legal risk. He supported 9:00 p.m. and midnight hours and warned that citywide application of the ordinance would be problematic.

Councilmember Sweet was open to a carve-out for downtown, using the DBA's taxing district as a boundary, while Mayor Daggett asked for clarification on whether similar delineations could apply to Southside.

Further discussion confirmed general agreement that police should assess noise from the doorstep or just outside a residence, rather than inside. Ms. Sullivan noted that current police procedures vary depending on the nature of the complaint. A majority of Councilmembers supported measuring noise from the doorstep.

Council discussed penalty options, with Mayor Daggett and Councilmembers McCarthy, Harris, and House supporting Option A, which includes a \$1,000 fine for a fourth violation, while Vice Mayor Aslan, and Councilmembers Matthews, and Sweet supported Option B, a less severe structure. There was also discussion about the phrase "sustained noise," with Councilmember McCarthy recommending it be clearly defined, such as noise lasting more than 10 minutes. Mr. Solomon acknowledged the term's ambiguity but maintained it is the best available phrasing.

Councilmember McCarthy stressed that the ordinance's intention is not to shut down bars, but to ensure that noise does not infringe on residents' rights. He supported the 8:00 p.m. and 10:00 p.m. proposal, arguing that it offers balance. He acknowledged that such early hours might be too restrictive and expressed interest in gauging business owners' input.

Councilmember House reiterated support for 10:00 p.m. and midnight as a reasonable compromise.

Councilmember Sweet agreed, noting that future construction in downtown could incorporate soundproofing, and emphasized the importance of transparency with incoming businesses.

The Council agreed to a potential carve-out for the downtown area from north of Route 66 to Cherry Avenue and from Humphreys Street to WC Riles, with the ordinance applying differently outside that boundary. Final options, including weekday/weekend hours, enforcement location, and penalties, will return for Council action.

11. Open Call to the Public

None

12. Informational Items To/From Mayor, Council, and City Manager; future agenda item requests

Mayor Daggett stated that the Arizona Department of Veterans' Services recently held a ribbon-cutting ceremony for a new veteran's home, which includes 80 beds and currently houses five veterans. She described it as a great event. She also noted that Lowell Observatory will be holding a grand opening for its new Discovery Center.

Councilmember McCarthy referenced a letter from Jean Myers that Council received regarding the City's consideration of an ordinance to preserve prairie dog colonies. He requested a Future Agenda Item Request to revisit the issue. Mr. Clifton confirmed that the item is already on the list and will be coming forward soon.

13. Adjournment

The meeting of the Flagstaff City Council held November 12, 2024, adjourned at 7:04 p.m.

MAYOR

ATTEST:

CITY CLERK