

MINUTES

1. Call to Order

Mayor Daggett called the Work Session of September 26, 2023, to order at 3:02 p.m.

NOTICE OF OPTION TO RECESS INTO EXECUTIVE SESSION

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the City Council and to the general public that, at this work session, the City Council may vote to go into executive session, which will not be open to the public, for discussion and consultation with the City's attorneys for legal advice on any item listed on the following agenda, pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(3).

2. Roll Call

NOTE: One or more Councilmembers may be in attendance through other technological means.

PRESENT:

MAYOR DAGGETT
VICE MAYOR ASLAN
COUNCILMEMBER HARRIS
COUNCILMEMBER MATTHEWS (virtual)
COUNCILMEMBER MCCARTHY
COUNCILMEMBER SWEET

ABSENT:

COUNCILMEMBER HOUSE

3. Pledge of Allegiance, Mission Statement, and Land Acknowledgement

The Council and audience recited the pledge of allegiance, Councilmember Sweet read the Mission Statement of the City of Flagstaff, and Councilmember Harris read the Land Acknowledgement.

MISSION STATEMENT

The mission of the City of Flagstaff is to protect and enhance the quality of life for all.

LAND ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The Flagstaff City Council humbly acknowledges the ancestral homelands of this area's Indigenous nations and original stewards. These lands, still inhabited by Native descendants, border mountains sacred to Indigenous peoples. We honor them, their legacies, their traditions, and their continued contributions. We celebrate their past, present, and future generations who will forever know this place as home.

4. Public Participation

Public Participation enables the public to address the council about items that are not on the prepared agenda. Public Participation appears on the agenda twice, at the beginning and at the end of the work session. You may speak at one or the other, but not both. Anyone wishing to comment at the meeting is asked to fill out a speaker card and submit it to the recording clerk. When the item comes up on the

agenda, your name will be called. You may address the Council up to three times throughout the meeting, including comments made during Public Participation. Please limit your remarks to three minutes per item to allow everyone to have an opportunity to speak. At the discretion of the Chair, ten or more persons present at the meeting and wishing to speak may appoint a representative who may have no more than fifteen minutes to speak.

Shannon Edmonds addressed Council regarding ADA compliance and the need for cleared sidewalks.

Rachael Simukonda addressed Council regarding ADA compliance and the difficulties she encounters as a disabled citizen. She spoke about the width of the streets, the main entrance of City Hall, and the ability to park in regular parking spots.

Dapper Dre addressed Council regarding the infrastructure needed to address the three carbon neutrality goals and how it is not happening fast enough. He spoke about the designs of the streets and how they do not address the current conditions of people who drive to ensure the safety of pedestrians. He suggested doing a study to find where the largest amount of pedestrian use and developing infrastructure to address their safety.

Adam Shimoni addressed Council regarding the perspective of the bicyclist and how to design to make pedestrian safety a priority.

Andy Fernandez addressed Council regarding crosswalks, the new roundabout, and proposition 480.

5. City Manager Report

City Manager Greg Clifton gave a few highlights from his report including a reminder of the Council retreat on October 12, 2023.

Economic Vitality Director Heidi Hansen gave a few highlights from the Economic Vitality Monthly Report:

- Airport
 - Marketing
 - NAU Partnership
 - Advertorials -- Thank you to Vice Mayor Aslan
 - Installed a fabric installation with brochures for the Coconino Scroll
 - Wrapping Airport Rescue Fire Fighting vehicles
 - Paid Parking System is going well
 - Thunder Over Flagstaff had over 5,000 participants
 - Wiseman Aviation added a lift that can serve all aircraft from a Boeing 737 to a Boeing 777
 - Enplanements rose in August
 - Community Investment
- Beautification in action grants
 - Two utility boxes wrapped
 - Chocolita Mural
 - Library entry update
 - Flower Project
 - Airport Gateway
- ParkFlag
 - Annual Report
 - Red curb repainting
 - Community Updates
 - Southside Neighborhood
 - Numbers up 8% over 2022
- Business Attraction
 - Arizona Liver Health
 - Significant interest from retail, restaurant, and hospitality sectors
 - Incentives -- The Development Reinvestment Incentive
 - AAED

- Business Retention and Expansion
 - BR&E Incentive
 - Workforce Development RSOQ
 - Joy Cone Company grant that was written by John Saltonstall to help with the rail spur
- Library
 - Door count up 3.78%
 - Computer use up
 - Ribbon cutting on Friday for the new ADA Main Library Entrance
 - New Library website
 - Game night
 - Youth Services
 - Fixed up Teen Zone
 - Library Card Signup Month
- Tourism & Visitor Center
 - Occupancy and Visitor rate is up
 - 12 print and 55 digital articles
 - Film is taking off
 - Website drive market was strongest seen in months
 - Leaf
 - Trails passports
 - Social media engagement increase
 - Meeting/Events/Conferences
 - Creative Services
 - Leafometer
 - Pledging for the wild
 - Business One Stop Shop
 - Annual Partner Meeting event

Mayor Daggett asked if there has been a discussion about changing marketing if the federal government shuts down. Ms. Hansen referred back to the last government shutdown and spoke about the work that the Visitor Center staff did to help visitors come up with a new itinerary.

6. Review of Draft Agenda for the October 3, 2023 City Council Meeting

Citizens wishing to speak on agenda items not specifically called out by the City Council may submit a speaker card for their items of interest to the recording clerk.

None.

7. Discussion on the Development of the Citywide Comprehensive Cost Recovery Policy

Management Services Director Rick Tadder shared that this item came from the FAIR process and introduced MGT America Project Consultant Alan Parks, Project Director Lisa Norman, and Project Manager Alex Ali. Mr. Parks presented information on the cost recovery policy and timelines for the current policy. Slides included:

- Who We Are
- MGT Objectives and Goals
- Timeline
- Why a Cost Recovery Policy
- Elements of a Cost Recovery Policy
- Establishing Cost Recovery Rate
- Application of the Cost Recovery Policy

8. Carbon Neutrality Plan Biannual Update

Climate Action Section Director Jenny Niemann, Resilience Analyst Genevieve Pearthree, and Climate Engagement Analyst Jenna Ortega gave an update on the efforts over the past eight months to advance the Carbon Neutrality Plan. She distributed a flyer on climate action that was created from feedback from Council. They provided a PowerPoint Presentation that covered the following:

- Today's Discussion
- Our Climate Team
- Foundations of Climate Action
- Flagstaff's Climate Goals
- Reducing Emissions
- Building Resilience
- Prioritizing Equity
- CNP Target Areas
- Neighborhoods
- Energy
- Consumption
- Commitments
- Climate Action Principles
- The ingredients for Carbon Neutrality
- Community Action
- Policy Development
- Community Infrastructure
- Spotlight: Four Corners Carbon Coalition
- Services
- Spotlight: Floodproof Assistance Program
- Spotlight: Energy Rebates
- Spotlight: Solar United Neighbors (SUN)
- Capacity Building
- Spotlight: Youth Climate Summit
- Municipal Operations
- Data Analysis
- Spotlight: EV Procurement
- Spotlight: Fleet Electrification
- Municipal Carbon Neutrality
- Spotlight: Energy Conservation Project
- Zooming Out
- What's Next
- Grant Application Update
- Upcoming Council Presentations
- Important Dates
- The CNP Emissions Reduction Wedge
- Help Build a Stronger Flagstaff

Councilmember McCarthy asked about the carbon dioxide removal in the CNP and asked staff to focus on how they will go about the removal in the future. Ms. Niemann stated that staff will focus on that and that the Four Corners Carbon Coalition really focuses on that.

Vice Mayor Aslan spoke about the citizen petition regarding flooding, fire, and drought that is coming before the Council in October. He asked Ms. Niemann to share their thoughts on the Citizen Petition that will be coming forward. Ms. Niemann spoke about the previous revision of the plan and how that increased the target areas. She added that combating flooding, fire, and drought requires collaboration, and they are currently focused on those collaborations and working with their partners. She stated that staff may need to do a better job at lifting their partnerships. Sustainability Director Nicole Antonopoulos discussed the assessment that was held in 2012 and stated that there is an opportunity to have a joint conversation with Fire, Sustainability, and Council where they can address these issues.

Vice Mayor Aslan asked about the flyer and if it was ready for distribution. Ms. Niemann stated it is

ready for distribution and they have a distribution plan.

Councilmember Harris raised several questions for future meetings, including concerns about the City's climate goals and affordable housing. Ms. Niemann responded that if the City does not meet its 2030 goal, it will need to adjust its plans, focusing on addressing issues like flooding, fire, and drought, while continuing to build resiliency. She emphasized that future climate models would guide these adjustments. Regarding public transportation, Ms. Niemann was asked about the City's collaboration with NAIPTA to ensure broad access, though the response was not included in the summary. She also addressed the accessibility of public charging stations and funding programs, noting that information on the floodproof funding program had been shared through door-to-door outreach and open houses, with additional community engagement supported by AmeriCorps members. On affordable housing, Ms. Niemann acknowledged the challenge of rising costs and explained that the City is working with the Housing Section to promote sustainable, cost-efficient housing. Efforts include incentivizing density, adding more housing, and launching an ADU (Accessory Dwelling Unit) survey to increase housing supply and offer greater neighborhood access.

Councilmember Sweet stated that she is excited about the ADU discussion.

Mayor Daggett asked about the incentives for those who are flood-impacted. She asked if the money could go towards purchasing flood insurance. Ms. Niemann stated that the money cannot be used to purchase insurance. Ms. Ortega replied that the funding must be used for dry floodproofing.

Mayor Daggett spoke about the ADU pilot project and how they had discussed creating approved ADU plans to share. She asked what is involved in the pilot project. Ms. Pearthree addressed the program and model plans. She added that the group felt they needed a better understanding on what the barriers to building an ADU is, so they are targeting the survey first. Mayor Daggett asked if the survey is available online and Ms. Pearthree stated that it is available on the community forum site.

Public Comment:

- Jill Stephenson addressed Council and stated that the Sustainability Department was on today's agenda and she believes it was mistake that they were not invited to Council meetings regarding the NAH rezoning.
- Dee Hoagland addressed Council and stated that according to the IPCC report, radical changes are required on the systemic level and every available measure must be taken to keep global warming below .5 degrees. She quoted the IPCC and recommended a prompt implementation of the Carbon Neutrality Plan.
- Andy Fernandez addressed Council and spoke about corruption, family communities, greed, and the housing market.
- John Fegyveresi addressed Council and stated he teaches climate science class at NAU. He stated he would like to see a diagram of where the emissions are going up and going down. He would like a better understanding of all the data they presented.

Mayor Daggett asked if that will be in the next update and Ms. Niemann stated that they are planning to break that out. The greenhouse gas analysis is done every two years. Ms. Antonopoulos added that they have tried to establish a really strong foundation for what they need to do and that the needle is moving slowly now due to funding and setting up policies. The needle has not moved a lot yet, because the policies need to be aligned with the goals to launch successfully.

9. City Code Updates for Bushmaster Park Sport Courts with Lighting Controls

Assistant Parks and Recreation Director Amy Hagin led a discussion on sport-courts hour of play.

Slides included:

- Current Hours -- Lighting and Park Hours
- Sunday through Thursday 5 am to 10 pm
- Friday and Saturday 5 am to 12 am
- Unless Permitted for Use otherwise
- Peer Cities Reviewed
- Equity considerations

Mayor Daggett asked if the hours at Thorpe Park are on during the hours that were previously listed, and Ms. Hagin confirmed those are the hours.

Vice Mayor Aslan asked Ms. Hagin what the general consensus was during the Bushmaster Park pickleball discussion. Ms. Hagin stated that there was a lot of back-and-forth discussion because there was already lighting at the locations. The discussion included lighting on the new pickleball courts. Vice Mayor Aslan stated that he is amenable to considering less hours of operation and that it would influence the Dark Sky consideration.

Councilmember McCarthy stated that he agreed with Vice Mayor Aslan. He asked if staff is taking into account that some of these activities are right up to people's yards while other activities are very remote. Ms. Hagin stated that they reviewed what other municipalities are doing, and that a lot of other municipalities are doing this. User groups are stating that they are not playing late into the night, but that there are some misuses of sport court lighting and that is why they are recommending sport court lighting hours and park use times are limited. Councilmember McCarthy stated that he supports a much earlier limit on lighting which would affect how much noise is created. He suggested 8:00 p.m. as an end time.

Mayor Daggett stated that she supports an earlier time as well and wondered if there was data on general park usage between 8:00 p.m. and that 10:00 p.m. Ms. Hagin stated that the staff suggestion is for consistency.

Vice Mayor Aslan stated that he is having a hard time with consistency, and it makes more sense to limit it to a formula with the sunset.

Councilmember Harris stated that we need to be considerate of staff that has the job of enforcing. She would much rather set a time.

Councilmember McCarthy addressed being consistent with other cities. He added that he does not think we should follow their lead and suggested 8:00 p.m. again.

Councilmember Sweet stated that the time should be consistent. She added her comfort zone is 9:00 p.m. and 10:00 p.m. may be late for this community.

Mayor Daggett asked if the park lights are programmed individually or from a center location. Ms. Hagin stated that the lights are on a timer. Mayor Daggett expressed that she thinks the lights should be uniform and that the hours should end by 8:00 p.m. or 9:00 p.m. She stated that all Councilmembers feel that the lights should extinguish before 10:00 pm.

Public Comment:

- Laura Shearin addressed Council regarding the installation of pickleball courts and how they are negatively influencing the neighborhood. She asked Council to consider the neighbors in the area, especially people who live without air conditioning. She asked for lights to not be installed so that there will be an end to pickleball play based on the light. She stated that eliminating lighting would cut costs and that could be redirected towards sound mitigation.

- Andy Fernandez addressed Council and stated that lights are not needed.
- Audria Smith addressed Council and stated that the sound of pickleball ruins her enjoyment of her home. She spoke about how pickleball will cause her home value to go down. She added that pickleball should have its own set of rules attached to it. She stated that she would like the lights out for pickleball at 8:00 pm and basketball at 10:00 pm.

Mayor Daggett asked about Ponderosa Park and if it had lights on the courts. Ms. Hagin stated that it does not have lighting. Mayor Daggett asked Ms. Hagin to share her thoughts on the usage of Ponderosa Park versus parks with lighting. Ms. Hagin shared that Ponderosa Park is a neighborhood park versus Bushmaster which is a community park. She spoke about the park being in disarray since the flooding, but that the court is working. She addressed the lightning at the other parks and the nighttime usage.

Vice Mayor Aslan stated that he believes that there should not be lights at Bushmaster Park for pickleball and that he would be fine to not have lights at the other sports courts. He stated that it takes care of the variable schedule and that maybe there should be a monthly schedule for shut off, however he agrees that it should be less complicated. He stated that lights should not be put up on the new pickleball courts. He added that 10:00 p.m. is too late, but 8:00 p.m. may be too early. He stated that he prefers not having lights go on at Bushmaster.

Mayor Daggett asked Ms. Hagin to share her perspective on not having lights or variable times. Ms. Hagin shared some history on lighting the parks and how they used to be off from October 15 to April 15. Ms. Hagin suggested that the decision should be the same for both parks to ensure equity. For a seasonal change, staff can do that and accommodate. They can work with enforcement on that. She mentioned the new Park Ranger position and stated that consistency matters to the community as well.

Councilmember Matthews asked about the lights at Bushmaster Park and if they are on a usage basis. Ms. Hagin stated that the lights are on a timer that can be turned on for one hour, but that the lights cannot be turned on after 10:00 p.m. She stated that she supports the time of lights off at 9:00 p.m.

Councilmember McCarthy spoke about comparing Flagstaff to other cities in Arizona and stated that he likes the idea of not having any lights at Bushmaster. He is comfortable leaving the lighting in at Thorpe Park. He suggested not having any lighting at the sports courts at Bushmaster.

Councilmember Harris stated that she would be concerned about having no lighting and not having an official start time.

Ms. Hagin spoke about the existing lights at Bushmaster. She stated that the removal of those lights would potentially create a migration of pickleball to other community parks. Council all agreed on lights going out at 9:00 p.m. at the latest. Ms. Hagin stated that the pedestrian lighting would stay on. Ms. Hagin asked about park hours direction as well.

Mayor Daggett suggested 9:00 pm for sport courts lighting and 10:00 pm for park closures. Council agreed.

10. Public Participation

None.

11. Informational Items To/From Mayor, Council, and City Manager; future agenda item requests

Councilmember Sweet shared that she will be virtual at next week's meeting.

Mayor Daggett stated that she, Vice Mayor, and Councilmember Sweet will be at the Downtown Association Conference next week and will attend the meeting virtually.

12. Adjournment

The Work Session of the Flagstaff City Council held September 26, 2023, adjourned at 5:44 p.m.

MAYOR

ATTEST:

CITY CLERK