

MINUTES

1. Call to Order

Mayor Deasy called the Work Session held October 25, 2022, to order at 3:00 p.m.

NOTICE OF OPTION TO RECESS INTO EXECUTIVE SESSION

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the City Council and to the general public that, at this work session, the City Council may vote to go into executive session, which will not be open to the public, for legal advice and discussion with the City's attorneys for legal advice on any item listed on the following agenda, pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(3).

2. Roll Call

NOTE: One or more Councilmembers may be in attendance through other technological means.

PRESENT:

ABSENT:

MAYOR DEASY
VICE MAYOR SWEET
COUNCILMEMBER ASLAN
COUNCILMEMBER HOUSE
COUNCILMEMBER MCCARTHY
COUNCILMEMBER SALAS
COUNCILMEMBER SHIMONI

Others present: City Manager Greg Clifton; City Attorney Sterling Solomon.

Mayor Deasy called a moment of silence to honor employees who have recently passed away.

3. Pledge of Allegiance, Mission Statement, and Land Acknowledgement

The Council and audience recited the pledge of allegiance, Councilmember Salas read the mission statement, and Councilmember Shimoni read the Land Acknowledgement.

MISSION STATEMENT

The mission of the City of Flagstaff is to protect and enhance the quality of life for all.

LAND ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The Flagstaff City Council humbly acknowledges the ancestral homelands of this area's Indigenous nations and original stewards. These lands, still inhabited by Native descendants, border mountains sacred to Indigenous peoples. We honor them, their legacies, their traditions, and their continued contributions. We celebrate their past, present, and future generations who will forever know this place as home.

4. Public Participation

Public Participation enables the public to address the council about items that are not on the prepared agenda. Public Participation appears on the agenda twice, at the beginning and at the end of the work session. You may speak at one or the other, but not both. Anyone wishing to comment at the meeting is asked to fill out a speaker card and submit it to the recording clerk. When the item comes up on the agenda, your name will be called. You may address the Council up to three times throughout the meeting, including comments made during Public Participation. Please limit your remarks to three minutes per item to allow everyone to have an opportunity to speak. At the discretion of the Chair, ten or more persons present at the meeting and wishing to speak may appoint a representative who may have no more than fifteen minutes to speak.

Jim McCarthy addressed Council and spoke about the metrics of a potential noise ordinance and his work measuring sound.

Mark Alexander, Stefan Sommer, Jill Stephenson, Dee Hoagland, and Nate Spangler addressed Council regarding electrification of the City's fleet.

Stephen Puhr addressed Council and offered comments regarding the flooding in Coconino Estates and urged Council to adopt option 2 on the Schultz Creek Culvert.

Paul Haro addressed Council regarding the Veteran's for Peace Armistice Day Proclamation.

Andy Fernandez addressed Council and offered comments regarding recycling, carbon neutrality, and a good neighbor policy regarding holiday displays.

5. Review of Draft Agenda for the November 1, 2022 City Council Meeting

Citizens wishing to speak on agenda items not specifically called out by the City Council may submit a speaker card for their items of interest to the recording clerk.

None.

6. Proclamation: STEM City 10th Anniversary

Mayor Deasy read the proclamation.

7. City Manager Report

City Manager Greg Clifton briefly reviewed his report including highlighting new leadership team members, Human Resources Director Randy Tracey; City Engineer Paul Mood; and Water Services Director Shannon Jones.

Mr. Clifton reviewed the recent Police Department Ceremony for Officer of the Year that honored Officer Pat Condon and the recent Discover Flagstaff Annual Marketing Luncheon.

Mr. Clifton also highlighted the upcoming events for Habitat for Humanity's tiny starter home tour and the upcoming Council retreats dates. Interim Deputy City Manager and Economic Development Director Heidi Hansen gave the Economic Vitality Monthly Report.

- Annual Airport Certification
- Airport Emergency Plan Update
- CARES Act projects
- Wisemann Aviation pavement repairs
- New FLG In-Flight issue
- Airport Media Kit
- Enplanements

- Courthouse Art Plaque completion
- Airport Art, Coconino Scroll, ongoing
- Beautification in Action Grants update
- Creative Flagstaff Innovation & Capacity grant update
- Software updates on all kiosks
- Touched up yellow paint in loading zones
- Woodsyn business attraction meeting
- Sustainable Automotive Sales Tax Rebate
- Home Goods opening
- KC Lights in the former Arizona Daily Sun building
- Chooseflagstaff.com website being update
- Business Retention and Expansion Incentive update
- Library updates
- Climate Resilience Project with Sustainability
- Green Living Best Weekend Getaway Award
- Update on Tourism Metrics
- Marketing & Media Relations update
- One film permit was issued in September
- New campaigns

Councilmember Salas addressed gratitude to staff for In and Out Burger coming to Flagstaff and spoke of their accomplishments.

Councilmember Shimoni asked if there are any updates on the Green Book tour project. Ms. Hansen stated that it is completed and available.

Parks and Recreation Director Rebecca Sayers gave the PROSE update.

- Trail Counts
- Accessibility and Buffalo Park trail surface
- Staff Spotlight on Amy Hagin
- Upcoming events at the Recreation Centers
- Picture Canyon funding
- Observatory Mesa Arizona Conservation Corp assistance
- Promotion of Beck Thomas
- Indigenous People's Day
- Technology update

Councilmember Shimoni asked if the City Adult Basketball League is back up and running. Ms. Sayers stated that it is.

8. Thorpe Park Annex Community Engagement Results and Discussion

Assistant Parks and Recreation Director Amy Hagin introduced Andy Rogers from Southwest Decision Resources gave a presentation on the Thorpe Park Annex Community Engagement. Slides Included:

- Introduction
- Meet the Team
- Goals of the Process
- Community Engagement Approach
- Listening and Learning
- Visions/Values
- Potential Programming
- Web-based Outreach and Engagement
- Listening and Learning
- Virtual Information Sessions
- Community Survey #1
- Community Values
- General Interest in Programming Activities
- Conversations & Design

- Design Sessions
- Design Session 1
- Common Elements Across All 3 Concepts
- A. Back to Nature
- B. Family, Fitness, Fun
- C. Something for All
- Design Study Session 2 & Survey 2
- Design Session 2
- Community Survey 2
- Refinement/Approval
- Getting to the Final Concept
- Final Concepts for Review
- Concept 1
- Concept 1b
- Questions

Rose Houk addressed Council and stated that she is not in support of the current designs.

Chris Jocks addressed Council that he was concerned about the number of things packed into the plan.

Robert Breunig addressed Council and stated that he is thrilled about the Indigenous Center in the plan but he would like to see more nature in the plan.

Rev. Janetta Beaumont addressed Council and stated she was in favor of the cultural center.

Elizabeth Bechok addressed Council regarding her concerns about the community garden with water run-off from the potential skate park and dog park relocation and would like to see more space for an orchard.

Darrell Marks addressed Council in support of the Community Cultural Center. He shared statements about the residents of the Kilani Dormitory and shared their concerns about the business of the plan.

Councilmember Shimoni asked Mr. Marks if the students prefer concept 1 to 1b with the housing. Mr. Marks shared that the students felt that it would be too crowded for traditional ceremonies with the housing and the noise levels.

Viki Blackgoat addressed Council regarding the Indigenous Cultural Center and how it needs more space for the cultural center and nature.

Councilmember Shimoni asked Ms. Blackgoat if there is anything that would make the plan feel more balanced to her. She replied that more growing space and more quiet, natural space would be good.

Travis Alexander Pinn addressed Council and stated that he supports the Indigenous Community Cultural Center (ICCC). He is in support of housing for City employees but that the parking for the ICCC needs to be kept.

Joe Washington addressed Council and spoke about the importance of flora and fauna to Native American culture.

Tyler Denham addressed Council and stated his support for design 1b.

A break was held from 5:17 p.m. through 5:38 p.m.

Councilmember Aslan inquired about the need to move the dog park and why it occupies so much space in the concept plan. Ms. Hagin explained that the current dog park is in a flood zone and unsafe in winter. The relocated park would also provide additional parking and more trees.

Councilmember House raised concerns about the Indigenous community and asked about Housing

Commission involvement, noting the plan would be reviewed by the commission later that week. Ms. Hagin explained that the placement of housing was based on existing utilities and the site's suitability. Ms. Sayers added that there was no clear consensus but a policy decision was made. Councilmember House emphasized the need for housing in every project.

Councilmember McCarthy expressed general support for the plan but suggested limiting turf and creating a more natural feel. He raised concerns about noise from pickleball courts and proposed removing them to make space for nature. Vice Mayor Sweet echoed his concerns and emphasized the need for nature to balance noise, while Ms. Hagin and Ms. Sayers assured that vegetative buffers were planned.

Councilmember Shimoni supported the plan and suggested including outdoor workout equipment and a bicycle repair station. He proposed moving the dog park to accommodate the pickleball courts, though some trees might be lost. He also expressed support for housing but raised questions about other potential locations. Ms. Sayers noted that housing within Thorpe Park was challenging due to infrastructure limitations.

Mayor Deasy proposed moving pickleball courts to the old dog park to free up space for parking and activities, and emphasized making the east side of the park a natural area. He also suggested considering housing on the east side and the possibility of two-story apartments.

Councilmember Salas supported moving the pickleball courts, adding gardens, and incorporating cost recovery. She also inquired about funding for the Indigenous Circle of Flagstaff.

Councilmember Aslan supported moving the pickleball courts and emphasized natural landscaping. He also suggested two-story apartments for housing and expressed concern about lighting for the observatory.

Councilmember McCarthy supported moving the pickleball courts and considered the impact of traffic, suggesting access via Thorpe Road. Ms. Hagin clarified that state restrictions prevent connecting to Thorpe Road.

Vice Mayor Sweet also supported moving the pickleball courts and increasing workforce housing.

Mayor Deasy pointed out the lack of more natural space in the plan and expressed a desire for more natural elements on the east side.

Ms. Sayers reiterated Council's direction for a more natural environment, removing pickle ball courts, continue looking at City employee housing, and looking at different types of parks and equipment.

9. Annual Revisions to the Carbon Neutrality Plan

Climate Program Manager Jenny Niemann provided a presentation that covered the following:

- Agenda
- Timeline
- Rationale
- Three Types of Revisions
- Incorporation of New Information
 - Partners
 - Investment
 - Housing Plan
- Annual Updates
- 2021 Greenhouse Gas Inventory
- CAAP & CNP Consolidation
- Timeline
- Flagstaff's Climate is Changing
- Resilience requires considering evolving risks
- Plan Comparison

- Current CNP Target Areas
- The new CNP target Areas
- CAAP-CNP Integration
- CNP Revisions

Councilmember Aslan stated he is fully supportive of everything that was presented. He asked about electrifying the City's fleet and stated that his personal sense is to balance the buying an electric fleet while implementing electric vehicles. Ms. Niemann stated that the City has a similar policy where electric vehicles are considered first for smaller vehicles and the City looks at electric first when they have the option. The City is not buying new vehicles to replace currently running vehicles because of the environmental impact. It is fiscally and environmentally sound to do the electrification this way and staff is trying to be strategic on the replacement.

Councilmember Shimoni stated he supports everything in the presentation. He added he received a photo from Streets Director Sam Beckett regarding the electric pick-up truck that the City just acquired.

Andy Fernandez addressed Council and offered comments on the Carbon Neutrality Plan.

Karen Enyedy submitted a written comment in support of regenerative landscaping.

A break was held from 7:03 p.m. through 7:10 p.m.

10. Stormwater Rate Adjustment Discussion

Water Services Manager Edward Schenk and Sanjay Gaur with Resource Economics provided a presentation that covered the following:

- Overview
- Stormwater Rate & Program History
- Utility Structure -- Flagstaff is complex
- Current Rates/Proposed Rates
- National Stormwater Survey
- Reasons for the Purpose of Rate Adjustment
 - Stormwater Capital Proposal -- Seven-year horizon
 - Capital Improvement Projects
- Rate Basis -- ERU
- Proposed Policy Recommendations
- Development of Financial Plan
- Projected Expenditures
- Status Quo: Projected Cash Position

Councilmember Aslan asked why the grants taper off and Mr. Gaur replied because there is no guaranteed grant revenue after 2024, although that will change as staff seeks more grant funding.

- Summary of Status Quo
- Proposed Rates
- S1: Voter Approval of GO Bond
- S2: GO Bond Not Approved
- Stormwater Service Charge
 - Year 1 Proposal/Impacts
- National Stormwater Survey
- Rate Implementation Timeline
- Stormwater Rate Community Outreach
- Questions

Joe Galli addressed Council representing the Greater Flagstaff Chamber of Commerce Board of Directors and stated that they oppose the rate increase.

Councilmember Shimoni asked Mr. Galli about the value of the proposed funding approach. Mr. Galli acknowledged the need for fire-related flood mitigation and mentioned that there is significant federal

funding available for only four states. The Chamber is willing to assist the City in applying for these funds. Councilmember Shimoni also referenced a County/City meeting where it was stated that \$140 million would be needed for flood mitigation.

Councilmember Salas asked Mr. Galli for recommendations on securing additional funding for flood mitigation, especially in areas like Route 180. Mr. Galli expressed concern over the economy and noted that Congressman O'Halleran has reached out to assist with federal funding applications. He also mentioned that while the Chamber is open to discussing a revised fee schedule, the current proposal is unacceptable to the business community.

Mayor Deasy expressed to Mr. Galli that the flood mitigation projects are necessary. Mr. Galli agreed but emphasized the need for alternative funding solutions, as \$300 million in federal funding is insufficient. Mayor Deasy suggested redirecting sales tax dollars earmarked for transportation projects to help fund these efforts. Mr. Galli was open to discussing this option but did not commit to supporting it.

Vice Mayor Sweet acknowledged the rising costs for small businesses but emphasized that the projects must proceed. Mr. Galli reiterated the Chamber's willingness to collaborate with the City but rejected the current fee proposal, noting support for a similar fee in 2019 to secure matching federal funds.

Mr. Schenk, addressing the funding issue, warned that without the rate adjustment, the City would have to scale back services. He explained that federal and state funding, while helpful, would not cover all the necessary capital improvements. Councilmember Aslan emphasized the need for local funding due to the uncertainty of federal support.

Councilmember McCarthy expressed trust in staff to secure state and federal funding and supported the rate increase and increasing the maximum ERU's for homes.

Councilmember House asked for details on upcoming community forums, with several virtual and hybrid sessions scheduled. Councilmember Shimoni asked if there was flexibility in the timeline for rate adjustments. Mr. Schenk said it could be pushed back, but it would require a higher rate to meet debt obligations.

Mr. Clifton supported moving forward with the rate adjustment, emphasizing its urgency while also suggesting more time to explore funding options. Councilmember Salas expressed interest in exploring state funding, given recent changes in state leadership.

Mayor Deasy stressed the importance of getting the word out to the public about these funding challenges and solutions.

11. Public Participation

Andy Fernandez submitted a written comment with concerns about the judicial system.

12. Informational Items To/From Mayor, Council, and City Manager; future agenda item requests

Councilmember Salas stated that the Anniversary of Coconino County Children and Youth was coming up. She also stated there was an upcoming event for the Flagstaff Family Food Center and that the Rio de Flag meeting this with Army Corp was for later that week.

Councilmember Shimoni stated that he was meeting with Northern Arizona Healthcare leadership and Habitat for Humanity at the new site.

Mayor Deasy stated he was meeting with Mountain Line to go over a proposal for different projects in the future. He stated he was also meeting with NASA and the Artemis program.

13. Adjournment

The October 25, 2022 City Council Work Session was adjourned at 8:43 p.m.

MAYOR

ATTEST:

CITY CLERK