

## MINUTES

### 1. Call to Order

Mayor Daggett called the meeting of the Flagstaff City Council held October 24, 2023, to order at 3:03 p.m.

#### NOTICE OF OPTION TO RECESS INTO EXECUTIVE SESSION

*Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the City Council and to the general public that, at this work session, the City Council may vote to go into executive session, which will not be open to the public, for discussion and consultation with the City's attorneys for legal advice on any item listed on the following agenda, pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(3).*

### 2. ROLL CALL

*NOTE: One or more Councilmembers may be in attendance through other technological means.*

#### PRESENT:

MAYOR DAGGETT  
VICE MAYOR ASLAN  
COUNCILMEMBER HARRIS  
COUNCILMEMBER HOUSE  
COUNCILMEMBER MATTHEWS  
COUNCILMEMBER MCCARTHY (arrived at 3:25 p.m.)  
COUNCILMEMBER SWEET

#### ABSENT:

Others present: City Manager Greg Clifton; City Attorney Sterling Solomon

### 3. Pledge of Allegiance, Mission Statement, and Land Acknowledgment

The Council and audience recited the pledge of allegiance, Vice Mayor Aslan read the Mission Statement of the City of Flagstaff, and Councilmember Sweet read the Land Acknowledgment.

#### MISSION STATEMENT

*The mission of the City of Flagstaff is to protect and enhance the quality of life for all.*

#### LAND ACKNOWLEDGMENT

*The Flagstaff City Council humbly acknowledges the ancestral homelands of this area's Indigenous nations and original stewards. These lands, still inhabited by Native descendants, border mountains sacred to Indigenous peoples. We honor them, their legacies, their traditions, and their continued contributions. We celebrate their past, present, and future generations who will forever know this place as home.*

#### 4. Public Participation

*Public Participation enables the public to address the council about items that are not on the prepared agenda. Public Participation appears on the agenda twice, at the beginning and at the end of the work session. You may speak at one or the other, but not both. Anyone wishing to comment at the meeting is asked to fill out a speaker card and submit it to the recording clerk. When the item comes up on the agenda, your name will be called. You may address the Council up to three times throughout the meeting, including comments made during Public Participation. Please limit your remarks to three minutes per item to allow everyone to have an opportunity to speak. At the discretion of the Chair, ten or more persons present at the meeting and wishing to speak may appoint a representative who may have no more than fifteen minutes to speak.*

Project Manager Jeremy DeGeyter provided an update on the Rio de Flag Flood Control Project and introduced changes in leadership within the Army Corps of Engineers. Paul Underwood, the outgoing Project Manager, has been promoted to Chief Engineer for the LA District. Brandon Colvin will take over as the new Project Manager. Mr. Underwood reflected on his time with the project, noting the recent release of the final technical review sample, a key milestone that enables the advertising and awarding of the Stage One construction contract. Mr. Colvin expressed enthusiasm for joining the project.

Monserrat Rodriguez, a junior at Coconino High School and member of the Coconino Anti-Tobacco Students (CATS) Club, addressed the Council in support of maintaining the licensing component of the T21 ordinance. She emphasized that while the T21 ordinance was passed in 2019, its effectiveness depends on local tobacco retailer licensing. Citing data from communities in California and Minnesota, she highlighted significant reductions in underage tobacco sales and youth smoking rates where strong licensing laws were in place. Ms. Rodriguez stressed that licensing is critical to enforcing the ordinance and preventing youth access to tobacco and e-cigarette products, urging the Council to preserve this provision.

Sydney Henley, a student at Coconino High School and member of the CATS Club, addressed Council in support of retaining the licensing provision in the T21 ordinance. She highlighted that Coconino County has the highest rate of tobacco retailer violations in Arizona--nearly double the state average--even when selling to individuals under 18. Ms. Henley argued that small fines are not an effective deterrent, whereas the potential loss of a license would carry more weight for retailers. She also emphasized that licensing can help address health disparities by enabling the mapping of retailer locations, particularly near schools and in lower-income areas. Addressing concerns about enforcement costs, she pointed out that licensing can be self-sustaining through annual fees. With around 145 retailers in Flagstaff, a \$1,000 annual fee per retailer could generate \$145,000 to fund enforcement. She urged the Council to maintain licensing as a critical tool for protecting youth and promoting public health.

Duffie Westheimer addressed Council with concerns about the lack of park development in Flagstaff. She noted that no new parks have been established since the 1990s, despite the city's population tripling during that time. As a result, existing parks like Bushmaster and Thorpe are overburdened. She urged the Council to require that all new developments include meaningful park spaces in the zoning code. Ms. Westheimer also voiced her support for the students who spoke in favor of maintaining licensing in the T21 ordinance.

Jill K. Stephenson voiced her support for the students who spoke in favor of the T21 ordinance. She highlighted the need for more bike racks near the entrance of the Sunday Farmer's Market, emphasizing the importance of promoting biking and walking as part of the transition away from fossil fuels. She also raised concerns about overflowing trash and recycling bins near Wheeler Park during the market and suggested adding more bins. Regarding the Northern Arizona Healthcare development, she expressed disappointment that the Council did not pause the rezoning decision for further impact study. She urged the Council to evaluate all future developments based on their carbon footprint and to consider the climate impact of every decision made by Council and City staff.

Charlie Silver commented on the structure of public hearings for agenda items, suggesting that

public comments should occur after staff and applicant presentations. He explained that this would allow the public to correct misinformation or offer rebuttals more effectively.

## 5. October Work Anniversaries and Retirement

Deputy City Manager Joanne Keane highlighted those who had work anniversaries in October.

Recreation Manager Tyrone Johnson spoke about Matt Faull's upcoming retirement and congratulated him. Mr. Faull shared some words about his time at the City.

## 6. City Manager Report

City Manager Clifton briefly reviewed his report, he highlighted the Parks, Recreation, Open Space, and Events Employee Recognition Barbeque, and an update on Human Resources Leadership.

Economic Vitality Director Heidi Hansen gave a few highlights from the Economic Vitality Division Report. They included:

- Airport Concessionaire
- Airport Marketing and Advertising
- Paid Parking System
- Wiseman Aviation ladder
- 75th Anniversary Celebration
- Airport Enplanement numbers
- Feline Friend
- Mural at Cosmic Ray Tunnel on the Sheep Crossing Trail
- Airport Medallions
- Flowers in Downtown and transitioning to trees and holiday lights
- Indigenous
- Murdoch/Southside Park Art
- Rio de Flag art
- A License Plate Reader will be put in place
- ParkFlag electric vehicles
- Parking Statistics
- Business Attraction
- Car manufacturer potentially coming to Flagstaff
- Business One Stop Shop
- Website created
- Arizona Association for Economic Development Fall Forum will occur in Flagstaff starting October 25, 2023, till October 27, 2023.
- Business Retention and Expansion Incentive
- PALSMobile Librarian Jessica Archer received the Arizona Library Association Outreach Services Award
- Lauren Clemention is serving as Interim Deputy Library Director for County Services
- The Downtown Library Front Entrance Ribbon Cutting Ceremony was held on September 29, 2023
- Paint Night for Hispanic Heritage Month
- Youth Programs
- Kids Cafe
- Library Card Sign-up Month
- Leafometer
- Film website up
- Trails Passport 8% increase
- Visit USA Austria
- 1 Lead for Conference sent out
- Visitor Center
- Creative Services Team
- Holiday Marketing Prep
- Annual Partnership Meeting

Mayor Daggett shared that she parked at the airport when she flew out to the International Downtown Association Conference, and she had a very easy time navigating the parking lot and finding a space.

Councilmember Harris asked what an exotic car manufacturer is and Ms. Hansen stated that it is probably a luxury type of vehicle.

Councilmember House asked Ms. Hansen about the request for signage for the Green Book tour and if there is an update. Ms. Hansen did not have an update at this time but will have a response soon.

Parks, Recreation, Open Space, and Events Director Rebecca Sayers covered a few highlights from the PROSE Newsletter. They included:

- Buffalo Park Accessibility Trail
- Universal fitness equipment
- Toured the State Parks team as well
- Monthly Trail Counter
- Aquaplex Anniversary Membership Drive
- Night Court at Hal Jensen
- Youth Acting Classes
- Plein Air in Open Spaces as part of the Festival of Science
- Volunteer activity for invasive weed removal
- The Phoenix Suns Court Take Over and Clinic on September 25, 2023
- Winter Wonderland and Holiday Tree Lighting is on December 2, 2023, at 2:00 p.m.

Sustainability Supervisor Steven Thompson gave some updates from the Sustainability Division report. He spoke about the volunteer hours from the community and from City staff and then spoke about the report. Highlights included:

- The Floodproofing Assistance Program
- Energy and Water Conservation Project
- 30 facilities have completed weatherization
- Almost 1000 interior lights have been retrofitted
- E-bike and E-scooter fleet has launched
- Community survey for Accessory Dwelling Units completed
- Community Stewards September Data
- The number of volunteers increased to almost 100 volunteers in September
- E3 Grant was awarded to Community Action Teams of Flagstaff
- Neighborhood Sustainability Grant
- Food Systems was awarded a USDA Grant
- Flagstaff Urban Farm Incubator
- Another drop-off location for residential food scraps which diverted almost 2,000 pounds of food waste
- Flagstaff Family Food Center pilot commercial composting program with Restoration Soils
- Recycling campaign update
- Upcoming Events
- October 24, 2023, at 6:00 p.m. Northern Arizona Solar 1010 Webinar
- October 24, 2023, 10:00 a.m. to 2:00 p.m. Drop Off Day
- Fix-it Clinic coming up next Saturday

Councilmember Harris asked how Sustainability is getting the word out about the Accessory Dwelling Unit survey and the Neighborhood Sustainability Grant opportunities. Mr. Thompson explained the efforts he knows that the division has undertaken. Councilmember Harris asked for staff to consider putting outreach materials into water bills.

Mayor Daggett stated that she joined the Solar United Neighbors during the last round and stated that it was great getting a negative utility bill.

City Engineer Paul Mood spoke about some updates in the Capital Improvement department. He stated that Capital Improvements Engineer Trevor Henry would cover some of the larger projects in more detail and that Development Engineer David Mills would talk about some of the developments

going on around the City as well. Mr. Mood also spoke a bit about the staff in the department and congratulated staff for all their hard work while transitions occurred.

Capital Improvements Engineer Trevor Henry highlighted some of the Capital Improvement Projects. They included:

- Updates on completed projects
- The library entrance
- Coconino Estates Phase One
- Beulah/University Realignment Project

Mayor Daggett asked how someone would sign up for the weekly project updates from the contracted public information firm. Mr. Henry stated that a person can sign up on the Website under the Capital Improvements Section. The project sign at the location has the information on it or the public can call the Capital Improvements department directly.

- John Wesley Powell Specific Plan
- Harold Ranch Road
- Inner Basin Waterline Restoration Project

Mayor Daggett asked if water was completely cut off because of the project in the Inner Basin or if it had been diverted. Mr. Trevor stated that there were several breaks on the line and that the water was not getting to the city reservoirs. Mr. Henry stated that there were several breaks on the line that were fixed, and water was coming down the area, but it was not getting to the City reservoirs. Since then, repairs have been made and the water has begun to flow down and come into the system. However, this past September there was a large rain event which caused some damage, and the contractor is working on making those repairs now.

- Flagstaff Downtown Mile Safety and Connectivity Improvement Project
- Rio de Flag Flood Control Project

Vice Mayor Aslan inquired about scheduling a publicity opportunity for the Rio de Flag project. Mr. Henry responded that the current work represents a very small portion of the overall project and may not be the most suitable time for promotional coverage. Vice Mayor Aslan agreed but requested that the public outreach team keep a future publicity opportunity in mind, once the project reaches a stage where such coverage would be more impactful.

- Lone Tree Overpass Project
- Butler-Fourth Improvements

Mayor Daggett asked how the public input gathered at the recent meeting would be incorporated into the project design. Mr. Henry responded that many of the comments focused on the appearance of the road and surrounding developments. He assured Council that staff will carefully evaluate all feedback and make every effort to address community concerns. He noted that the design is still in progress and that an update will be presented to Council soon. Mayor Daggett also inquired whether the designs would be shared with City commissions. Mr. Trevor confirmed that engaging with commissions is the next step in the public outreach process. He noted that presentations have already been made to the Bicycle Advisory Committee, Pedestrian Advisory Committee, Commission on Inclusion and Adaptive Living, Sustainability Commission, and Transportation Commission. He added that they are scheduled to return to the Commission on Inclusion and Adaptive Living on October 25, 2023.

- Fourth-Lockett Roundabout
- Switzer Canyon Transmission Main
- Spruce Wash Flood Mitigation Suite of Projects

Development Engineer David Millis took over the presentation. He highlighted:

- There is one subdivision plan and 11 site plan projects under civil plan review.
- There are nine subdivisions and 17 site plans that are either under construction or awaiting permits.

- Staff is in the editing phase of the initial round of updates in the engineering standards.

Councilmember Harris requested a description of what a pedestrian underpass under Milton would look like. Mr. Henry described the underpass and clarified that it would be built under the street. He referenced another pedestrian crossing on Butler that is similar to what they will be building.

Vice Mayor Aslan asked if beautification considerations have been made at this stage and Mr. Henry stated that they have been working with Arts & Beautification on design concepts.

**7. Discussion of the Rental Incentive Bond Program and framework for the expenditure of \$5,000,000 in general obligation bond funds for incentivizing the creation of affordable rental units.**

Housing Director Sarah Darr and Housing Planning Manager Jennifer Mikelson provided a PowerPoint presentation to Council on the Rental Incentive Bond Program. Slides included:

- Purpose of Presentation
- Prop 422
- Context for Program Creation
- Guiding Principles
- Role of the Housing Commission
- Program Creation and Administration
- Working Group
- Rental Incentive Bond Program -- Working Group Priorities
- Program Description
- Project Eligibility
- Eligible Uses
- Eligible Applicants
- Affordability Period
- Submittal Requirements
- Award Process
- Ranking Committee
- Evaluation Criteria
- Loan Terms and Compliance
- Suggestions for Consideration
- When will bond funds be paid out?
- Upfront at loan approval?
- At a trigger point, such as ½ at building permit and ½ at certificate of occupancy

Councilmember Matthews emphasized that the housing crisis is the top concern for residents and stressed the importance of designing the funding program correctly. She asked whether the working group had consulted LIHTC (Low-Income Housing Tax Credit) developers or other affordable housing experts. Ms. Mikelson said no direct outreach was made, but LIHTC timelines were considered. Ms. Darr added that while the working group had not engaged developers, staff had.

Councilmember Matthews asked for clarification on the 10% affordability requirement and whether funds would go to mixed-income or solely market-rate developments. Ms. Mikelson responded that staff is refining scoring to balance community benefits from both types. Councilmember Matthews raised concerns about the program's timeline, the complexity of the Council approval process, and using loans instead of grants. Ms. Darr explained that a loan model was recommended to create a revolving fund. Councilmember Matthews remained uneasy about loan administration, especially if used for land acquisition, citing risks and misalignment with the program's goal to support development, not purchase.

Councilmember House echoed concerns about delays and bureaucracy. Ms. Darr noted staff had already begun drafting the NOFA and aimed for quick reviews. Councilmember House supported conditional awards tied to benchmarks, balancing flexibility with risk management.

Councilmember McCarthy acknowledged staff efforts and asked how repayment would be enforced. Ms. Mikelson said legal tools, including promissory notes, would be used, with outside counsel drafting

contracts. Councilmember McCarthy questioned the eligibility of 100% affordable developments based on the ballot language and suggested a requirement for at least 10% market-rate units. He supported conditional, upfront funding.

Mr. Solomon advised that any detailed discussion of the ballot language should occur in executive session. Councilmember McCarthy agreed, emphasizing the need to honor what was promised publicly.

Councilmember Harris praised staff and asked who would oversee awards. Ms. Mikelson confirmed that Housing and Grants and Contracts staff would manage the process. Councilmember Harris highlighted the need to prevent conflicts of interest in application reviews and asked about long-term loan enforcement. Ms. Darr said obligations would transfer with property sales and that this had worked in other tax credit cases.

Councilmember Matthews questioned the timeline's compatibility with developers joining mid-process and reiterated opposition to funding acquisitions. Mr. Solomon noted that Council did not need to revise the language if there was no consensus.

Councilmember Sweet asked if scoring criteria would return to Council. Ms. Darr said no, it falls under procurement. Councilmember Sweet expressed concerns about tracking loans, but Ms. Darr explained systems were already in place and manageable.

Councilmember McCarthy noted developers had approached the City due to funding gaps, and over 10 affordable projects were waiting to launch. Councilmember McCarthy reiterated his stance that at least 10% of any project should be market-rate, aligning with the pamphlet language.

Vice Mayor Aslan supported loans and upfront funding but expressed concern about limiting the process to a single RFP-style round. Ms. Mikelson responded that the process was designed to stay open to ready developers. Assistant Housing Director Justyna Costa added that funds were expected to go quickly and rounds would continue until all were allocated.

Mayor Daggett asked about funding limits and supported loans, flexibility, and the current language. Councilmember House confirmed that applicants must justify requested amounts. Councilmember Matthews preferred a rolling application process over fixed cycles. Ms. Darr said procurement would need to approve that but anticipated large asks likely to exhaust the \$5 million early.

Council agreed to move forward with current language and consider excluding acquisition. Staff confirmed that applicants must have site control. Conditional awards could be made contingent on finalizing property purchases, secured in escrow. Councilmember Matthews opposed this, arguing acquisition funding strays from the program's purpose.

Councilmember House supported site control as an eligibility criterion and backed referencing market-rate integration in the program description. Ms. Darr proposed adding scoring incentives for mixed-income projects rather than altering eligibility.

Councilmember Harris asked for clarification on what types of developments would qualify. Ms. Mikelson said staff was listening for Council priorities but aimed to remain flexible. Mr. Solomon confirmed there was not a four-member majority to revise the language. Councilmember Matthews reiterated her support for referencing affordable housing in market-rate developments.

Council briefly debated disbursing funds upfront or in phases. Ms. Darr acknowledged the risk of default but noted the program's goal was to fund projects other sources would not. The majority of Council supported upfront funding with safeguards.

Mayor Daggett called a break from 6:46 p.m. through 7:05 p.m.

8. **Case No PZ-22-00223:** Proposed amendment to the Zoning Code to modify the existing Planned Residential Development requirements.

**Case No. PZ-23-00135:** Proposed amendment to the Zoning Code to modify the standards for Neighborhood & Regional Meeting Facilities.

**Case No. PZ-23-00136:** Proposed amendment to the Zoning Code to add single-family, duplex, and multiple-family dwellings as permitted uses in Public Facility (PF) Zone.

**Case No. PZ-23-00137:** Proposed amendment to the Zoning Code to change the minimum parcel size in the MH zone from 5 acres to 4,000 square feet as well as add minimum lot width and depth standards.

Zoning Code Manager Tiffany Antol presented an overview of the proposed amendments. Slides included:

- City's Proposed Zoning Code Text Amendment
- Meeting Facilities -- Neighborhood & Regional

Councilmember Harris asked whether the updated definition of meeting facilities in neighborhoods would apply only to new construction or also allow existing spaces, like an apartment building, to be converted into a neighborhood meeting facility. Ms. Antol clarified that the change pertains to land use, and in residential zones, existing uses--such as an apartment complex--would be limited by current land use regulations and the definition of a meeting facility.

- Residential Uses in the Public Facility (PF) Zone

Mayor Daggett inquired about organizations building employee housing on their own properties. Ms. Antol responded that FUSD is exploring residential development on one of its sites, and the proposed amendments would help expedite such projects. The update allows for multi-family, duplex, and single-family housing and follows high development standards. She added that the amendments still need to go before the Parks & Recreation Commission, with ample time for further review.

Councilmember Harris asked if the green areas on the map represent City-owned parcels and whether they are spread across the City. Ms. Antol confirmed both and clarified that the zoning would remain the same, but the land use designation would change.

Mayor Daggett also referenced a written comment from Charlie Silver about using city-owned land designated as parkland. Ms. Antol clarified that the amendments are not intended to convert park or park-designated land to housing use.

- Manufactured Home (MH) Zone Lot Standards
- Mobile Haven Subdivision
- Planned Residential Development
- Example
- City's Proposed Zoning Code Text A
- Overview of Proposed Amendment details

Councilmember Matthews asked for clarification on how the zoning code handles single-family development in the Medium- and High-Density Residential (MR and HR) zones. Ms. Antol explained that such projects are considered Planned Residential Developments (PRDs), which refer to a table that specifies allowed building types. The Planning Director then selects the appropriate transect zone--typically T4 for MR/HR or T3 for lower-density zones--and applies N2 Development Standards, which are calibrated for new, urban-style development. She noted that applying these standards to existing areas is difficult and often better handled through a public subdivision process rather than administratively.

Councilmember House asked how to ensure parkland would not be affected. Ms. Antol said specific footnotes could be added to restrict residential use on certain sites, but doing so would reduce flexibility. She cited the old Public Works Yard as an example of land protected by ordinance and mentioned that existing parks already have safeguards. Additional designations could be added if needed.

Councilmember Harris confirmed that staff is not proposing to convert parkland into residential use. Ms. Antol reiterated that they are not and noted that city-owned lands vary in designation, all of which can be reviewed through the Real Estate GIS Story Map.

Vice Mayor Aslan thanked staff but expressed opposition to amendment PZ-23-00136, saying retroactively changing designations is unnecessary and overly complicated.

Mayor Daggett asked about the timeline for Council review. Ms. Antol said that amendments related to PRD, Manufactured Home zoning, and Meeting Facilities are scheduled for public hearing at the Planning and Zoning Commission on November 8, 2023, followed by a Council hearing on November 21 and a second read on December 5. Amendment PZ-23-00136 would come later, likely a month or two afterward.

Written comments were submitted from Charlie Silver and Rose Houk with concerns about the proposed changes.

**9. Review proposed Building & Property Care Standards and amendments to the Littering and Abandoned Vehicle City Code chapters.**

Community Development Director Dan Folke provided a PowerPoint presentation to Council on the Building and Property Care Standards. Slides included:

- Presentation Outline
- Project Team
- What is a Property Maintenance Ordinance
- Considerations
- 2022 Survey Results -- Issues
- Survey Results -- Primary Concerns
- Selected Approach
- Division 7-06 Building and Property Care Standards
- 7-06-001-0004 Definitions
- 7-06-001-0005 Property Care Standards
- 7-06-001-0005 Property Care Standards
- 7-06-001-0006 Exemptions
- Title 6 Police Regulations: Chapter 6-06 Littering
- Chapter 6-07 Abandoned Vehicles
- Chapter 6-04 Nuisances
- Upcoming Dates & Next Steps

Mr. Folke asked Council for input on the timeline for building repairs and stated that staff would return later in November, with finalized language regarding how long a building can remain boarded up.

Councilmember Matthews suggested extending the repair period from 30 to 90 days and recommended input from the Commission on Inclusion and Adaptive Living.

Councilmembers Sweet, Councilmember House, and Vice Mayor Aslan also supported the 90-day timeframe, with Vice Mayor Aslan and Councilmember McCarthy supporting staff-initiated nuisance complaints.

Councilmember McCarthy preferred a 60-day period but was comfortable with 90 days.

Councilmember Harris thanked staff, and Mayor Daggett expressed support for the Council's consensus.

**10. Public Participation**

Nadine Hart spoke about her hunt for housing using her Section 8 housing voucher and the cost of housing.

**11. Informational Items To/From Mayor, Council, and City Manager; future agenda item requests**

Councilmember Matthews asked if a discussion on Section 8 vouchers was scheduled as a FAIR item on the working calendar and Mayor Daggett confirmed that it was an upcoming discussion. Councilmember Matthews added that she and Councilmember Sweet attended the Flagstaff Chamber of Commerce Fundraiser Event.

Councilmember Sweet thanked people for their support during her triathlon training.

Mayor Daggett stated that next Tuesday was Halloween and encouraged the Councilmembers to wear costumes. She added that she would hold office hours on Thursday evening and to send her an email for more information if the public would like to attend. She also spoke about the Charter amendment presentation that would be held tomorrow at 5:30 p.m. at City Hall and a presentation Monday evening at 5:30 p.m. on the Schultz Creek Pipeline West.

**12. Adjournment**

The Special Work Session of the Flagstaff City Council held October 24, 2023, adjourned at 8:18 p.m.

\_\_\_\_\_  
MAYOR

ATTEST:

\_\_\_\_\_  
CITY CLERK