

MINUTES

1. Call to Order

Mayor Daggett called the meeting of the Flagstaff City Council held November 14, 2023, to order at 3:03 p.m.

NOTICE OF OPTION TO RECESS INTO EXECUTIVE SESSION

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the City Council and to the general public that, at this work session, the City Council may vote to go into executive session, which will not be open to the public, for discussion and consultation with the City's attorneys for legal advice on any item listed on the following agenda, pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(3).

2. ROLL CALL

NOTE: One or more Councilmembers may be in attendance through other technological means.

PRESENT:

MAYOR DAGGETT
VICE MAYOR ASLAN
COUNCILMEMBER HARRIS (virtual)
COUNCILMEMBER HOUSE (virtual)
COUNCILMEMBER MATTHEWS
COUNCILMEMBER MCCARTHY (arrived at 3:12 p.m.)

ABSENT:

COUNCILMEMBER SWEET

Others present: City Manager Greg Clifton; City Attorney Sterling Solomon.

3. Pledge of Allegiance, Mission Statement, and Land Acknowledgement

The Council and audience recited the pledge of allegiance, Councilmember Matthews read the Mission Statement of the City of Flagstaff, and Councilmember House read the Land Acknowledgement.

MISSION STATEMENT

The mission of the City of Flagstaff is to protect and enhance the quality of life for all.

LAND ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The Flagstaff City Council humbly acknowledges the ancestral homelands of this area's Indigenous nations and original stewards. These lands, still inhabited by Native descendants, border mountains sacred to Indigenous peoples. We honor them, their legacies, their traditions, and their continued contributions. We celebrate their past, present, and future generations who will forever know this place as home.

4. Public Participation

Public Participation enables the public to address the council about items that are not on the prepared

agenda. Public Participation appears on the agenda twice, at the beginning and at the end of the work session. You may speak at one or the other, but not both. Anyone wishing to comment at the meeting is asked to fill out a speaker card and submit it to the recording clerk. When the item comes up on the agenda, your name will be called. You may address the Council up to three times throughout the meeting, including comments made during Public Participation. Please limit your remarks to three minutes per item to allow everyone to have an opportunity to speak. At the discretion of the Chair, ten or more persons present at the meeting and wishing to speak may appoint a representative who may have no more than fifteen minutes to speak.

Eric Wolverton, Executive Director for Habitat for Humanity of Northern Arizona, addressed Council regarding the celebration Habitat for Humanity will hold in November at the Murdoch Center for the opening of the starter homes. He also addressed the projects that Habitat is working on to address the housing emergency and the needs that the non-profit still faces.

Jill Stephenson addressed Council regarding human-caused climate change. She asked that the Flagstaff Regional Plan includes judging new projects by their climate impact and that all projects should be evaluated to reach climate-neutrality.

Recreation Supervisor Haley Reynolds addressed Council inviting them and the public to Flagstaff's Winter Wonderland and the tree lighting.

5. Review of Draft Agenda for the November 21, 2023 City Council Meeting

None

Citizens wishing to speak on agenda items not specifically called out by the City Council may submit a speaker card for their items of interest to the recording clerk.

6. Flagstaff Shelter Services Update

Flagstaff Shelter Services Executive Director Ross Schafer presented an update on the Flagstaff Shelter Services (FSS) to Council. Slides included:

- Mission
- Who We Serve
- Locations
 - Huntington
 - The Crown
 - The Lantern
- Unsheltered to Permanently Housed
- Our Community

Councilmember House inquired about the unspoken needs of FSS and how the City could best collaborate with FSS and other organizations. Ms. Schafer highlighted several underlying challenges, noting that for every person the Shelter helps secure permanent housing. She suggested that the Council and Housing Commission could support by reviewing all funding sources and exploring innovative ways to apply them toward housing solutions.

Councilmember Matthews acknowledged the complex causes of homelessness and asked about Huntington's capacity, to which Ms. Schafer replied it is 186 beds. Councilmember Matthews also questioned whether the Shelter tracks the origins of individuals served, such as those coming from Northern Arizona or other areas. Ms. Schaffer confirmed that intake data is collected both at the Shelter's front door and through the Homeless Management Information System, which also tracks recidivism. Additionally, the January Point-in-Time count is used, though Ms. Schaffer expressed concerns about its accuracy.

Councilmember Matthews asked about funding for The Crown and The Lantern, Ms. Schafer explained that The Crown's funding currently limits it to transitional housing for five years, after which the property

may be used more flexibly. Regarding security at The Lantern, she assured that once renovated and staffed by trained professionals, security will be a key focus. On length of stay, Ms. Schafer noted there is no general limit except the two-year restriction tied to The Crown's funding.

Councilmember McCarthy thanked Ms. Schafer for her dedication, echoing Council's appreciation for the Shelter's work. Vice Mayor Aslan also expressed gratitude and requested clarification on "low-barrier access." Ms. Schafer defined it as minimal restrictions for entry, such as not barring individuals due to intoxication, with very few exceptions.

Councilmember Harris thanked Ms. Schafer and asked about ownership of The Crown after the five-year funding period. Ms. Schafer clarified that while the funding requires serving people as outlined in their grant for five years, FSS cannot sell the building afterward. However, the property may then be used for longer-term or permanent housing without restrictions.

Mayor Daggett asked about transportation options for individuals seeking Shelter assistance. Ms. Schafer shared that FSS partners with Care First to provide taxi services during winter evenings and maintains a non-emergency line for those in need. When questioned about data gathering, Ms. Schafer confirmed FSS's commitment to funder-required reporting and participation in national databases.

Mayor Daggett inquired about the continuum of care in Coconino County and how it functions as a safety net. Ms. Schafer explained that funding and data are managed through this continuum, which also includes an advisory group with nearly 80 members. The crisis system and housing services are integrated within the continuum to help ensure that vulnerable individuals receive necessary support and do not fall through the cracks.

Councilmember Harris exited the meeting at 4:03 p.m.

7. Update on the Land Availability and Suitability Study and Code Analysis Project

Planning Director Michelle McNulty introduced the core project team and the consultant team. Project Manager Reed Stapleton and Jamin Kimmell from Cascadia Partners presented an update on the Land Availability and Sustainability Study (LASS) and the Code Analysis Project (CAP) Slides included:

- Agenda
- Project Purpose
- Land Availability and Suitability Study Overview
- Map
- High-Level Process

Mayor Daggett asked if redevelopment is on sites that have enough vacant land. Mr. Stapleton stated that she was correct.

- Land Use Categories
- Vacant and Underutilized Sites
- Secondary Screening
- City and Stakeholder Input
- Comment Map and Advisory Committee Input
- Final Inventory -- Study Area
- Final Inventory -- City Limits Only
- Final Inventory by Parcel Size
- Unbuildable Areas Within Study Area
- Preliminary Opportunity Site List
- LASS Next Steps

Vice Mayor Aslan asked about excluding the 100-year flooding threshold from the square footage analysis. Mr. Stapleton stated that they drew the line at a regulatory obstacle and if the development could receive a permit for that property. He added that there are sites in the first site index that will be taken off of the flood map when the Rio de Flag project is completed.

- Code Analysis Project
- Agenda
- Project Purpose and Goals
- Development codes are a key tool for achieving housing and climate goals.
- A holistic analysis is needed to diagnose the problems with the code as a tool.
- Approach and Methodology
- Distilling Plans into Clear Policy Framework
- Scope of the Code Analysis
- Three Phases of the Code Analysis
- Approach to the Code Diagnostic
- What is a Prototype Model
- Project Case Studies

Councilmember Matthews asked Mr. Kimmel about the prototype model. Mr. Kimmel stated that the measure that was changed was the minimum lot area and not the unit size.

Councilmember Matthews asked about the change in the parking per unit in the example and spoke about other developments in Flagstaff that had unintended consequences when parking was reduced. She wanted the consultants to consider the concern when they are working on the project. Mr. Kimmel agreed with the concerns and that they will work on the challenges in tandem with the other priorities.

- Displacement Vulnerability Mapping
- Developer Focus Groups: Key Takeaways
- Discussion
- Questions for Council
- What goals or issues do you want to make sure we keep in focus as we evaluate the code?
- What information or data do you need to make decisions about the code in the future?
- What aspects of the code or the development process have been unclear to you that we can clarify or provide deeper insight into?

Councilmember Matthews reminded staff and consultants that the winter parking ordinance must be upheld throughout the process and not overlooked.

Councilmember McCarthy pointed out that parking is just one example of unintended consequences. He emphasized that the community is not very walkable and that some neighborhoods already face parking shortages. He stressed the importance of applying judgment rather than relying solely on rigid standards.

Vice Mayor Aslan expressed his disagreement with the current parking standards, advocating for the removal of minimum parking requirements--particularly for high-density projects in appropriate areas. He also highlighted the importance of tree retention to maintain community character and suggested that high-density objective areas might warrant different designations.

Councilmember House asked Mr. Kimmel's perspective on the parallel between concerns about reducing parking in new developments and the developer listening sessions, which indicated that current parking minimums often result in over-parked developments. Councilmember House noted that this seemed to suggest a positive impact from lowering parking requirements. Mr. Kimmel responded that developers are not bound by minimum parking requirements and may add more spaces if needed. He emphasized that the discussion is still conceptual, focused on identifying potential development sites and envisioning outcomes.

Mayor Daggett acknowledged Council's openness to alternative approaches that meet city goals. She questioned whether the conversation was focused more on medium-density rather than high-density developments, as the latter typically exceeds what the City generally considers. She also highlighted the importance of transit needs in relation to parking changes.

Councilmember McCarthy emphasized the importance of thorough analysis, noting it aligns with concerns he has raised since joining the Council.

Vice Mayor Aslan inquired about the city's commitment to carbon neutrality, building standards, and associated upfront costs. He reaffirmed Council's strong support for achieving carbon neutrality by 2030.

Councilmember McCarthy shared a personal example, explaining that additional home installations he made helped prevent his air conditioning unit from stalling, illustrating how upfront investments can yield significant long-term savings.

Mayor Daggett addressed the issue of incentives, noting that the current housing incentive fund is not effectively benefiting developers. She expressed interest in exploring what types of incentives would be more useful and appealing to them.

Councilmember Matthews observed that most developers seek to maximize returns and have requested reduced standards from the City. She emphasized widespread support for building efficiency while also being mindful of equity concerns for renters, particularly regarding electric versus gas efficiency. Mr. Kimmel added that DB Architects, a project partner, will specifically focus on building codes to help navigate these complex issues.

Ms. McNulty thanked Council for their valuable feedback, assuring that the comments will be incorporated into the ongoing analysis. She noted that staff is reviewing affordable housing incentives as part of the project scope and expects to return to Council with updates in February or March.

Mayor Daggett called a break from 5:17 p.m. through 5:34 p.m.

8. Post-wildfire Flooding Update

Public Works Director Scott Overton, Water Services Operator for Stormwater Chase Stoneberger, JD Fuller Engineer Joe Loverich, Capital Improvements Manager Eli Reisner, and Julie Leid from Peak Engineering provided a PowerPoint presentation to update on the post-wildfire flooding. Slides included:

- Schultz Creek/Pipeline West
- Infrastructure Improvements
- On-forest measures
- On-forest Sediment Reduction
- Schultz Creek Basins
- Elden Lookout Road
- Schultz Creek Channel Stabilization
- Highway 180 Culvert Improvements
- Frances Short Pond
- Modeling/Mapping Update
- Temporary Mitigations
- Spruce Wash/Museum
- Suite of projects
- Grandview Drive Reconstruction
- The Wedge Detention Basin
- Linda Vista Drive Crossing
- Cedar Avenue to Linda Vista Drive
- Cedar Avenue Crossing
- Arroyo Seco Drive to Dortha Avenue
- Arroyo Seco Drive Inlet
- Killip Basins Inlet
- Killip Basins Outlet
- Milestones
- Construction
- Grandview Utilities Construction
- Park Way Basins Phase II Construction
- Modeling

- Draft Modeling Results -- 2" Storm

Councilmember Matthews asked what the 2" flood event equated to. Mr. Loverich stated that it equated a 25-year flood event.

- Mitigations
- Short-term mitigations

Mayor Daggett inquired whether the longer-term plan was specific to Grandview. Mr. Stoneberger clarified that it is intended for the Spruce Wash residents. When asked about the timeline, Mr. Overton explained that the long-term mitigation efforts are progressing well but emphasized that the system will only function effectively once the entire project is complete, as each component depends on the others. The goal is to have all projects finished by the 2025 monsoon season.

Councilmember McCarthy asked about the Wedge Detention Basin and what occurs when it reaches capacity. Julie Leid from Peak Engineering responded that excess water is directed into a storm drain on Cedar Street, which then feeds into Spruce Wash at a controlled, slower rate. She also described a gate system with an actuator used to regulate the flow into the Wedge.

9. Discussion of Draft Advertising Policies for Flagstaff Pulliam Airport and City Recreation Facilities

Deputy City Attorney Kevin Fincel provided a PowerPoint presentation for the Flagstaff Pulliam Airport and the City Recreation facilities.

- Agenda for Tonight's Discussion
- Background Clarification
- Clarification

Councilmember McCarthy asked whether the content previously advertised by Timberline Firearms differed from the current version. Mr. Fincel explained that in 2019, the airport did not have the capability to display video advertisements, so the same creative content was presented in a static format instead. He also noted that the current ad was reviewed by new staff, who determined that it did not meet the airport's advertising standards.

- Happenings Since September 12
- Legal Overview
- Legal Overview -- Speech on Public Policy
- Legal Overview -- Forum Analysis
- Legal Overview -- Forums and Rules
- Changes to Draft Policy Since Last Meeting

Mr. Fincel opened the draft advertising policies to review the proposed changes with Council, specifically highlighting the options related to firearms in "Item G."

Councilmember Matthews expressed concern about how interpretations of what is considered offensive can vary. She stated her preference to opt out of airport advertising altogether, as it is not a significant revenue source.

City Manager Clifton supported that position, stating the need to close the advertising forum at the airport and at some recreation facilities. He emphasized that advertising does not generate substantial revenue and that the potential cost of litigation outweighs any financial benefit.

Mayor Daggett agreed with both Councilmember Matthews and Mr. Clifton. She noted that Discover Flagstaff already does an excellent job promoting the City, making an open forum for advertising unnecessary.

Councilmember McCarthy asked whether the City could continue displaying Discover Flagstaff promotions in these forums. Mr. Clifton confirmed that was his recommendation. Mr. Fincel clarified

that the proposal would close the forum to all paid advertising. Economic Vitality Director Heidi Hansen explained that although Discover Flagstaff promotions may feature businesses, those businesses do not pay for placement--such advertising is funded through BBB tax revenues.

Councilmember Matthews asked how Ms. Hansen's explanation would factor into the policy. Mr. Fincel replied that the question touches on legal considerations and that the core decision for Council is whether or not to allow paid advertising.

Councilmember McCarthy asked if giving direction to close the forum would conclude the discussion. Mr. Fincel confirmed that it would, and that staff would then proceed with drafting policies specifically for Discover Flagstaff's non-paid advertising.

Vice Mayor Aslan expressed his support for closing the forum and noted that if the policy were retained, Section 4 would be unnecessary.

Councilmember House voiced discomfort with closing the forum without first understanding the full implications for Discover Flagstaff.

Mayor Daggett asked Mr. Fincel whether staff would return to Council if any issues arose that conflicted with Council's direction. Mr. Fincel responded that such matters could likely be handled administratively.

Councilmember McCarthy sought confirmation that the draft policies would become moot if the public advertising forum were closed. Mr. Fincel affirmed that they would.

Mayor Daggett thanked Mr. Fincel and staff for their work on the draft policies and for providing thoughtful legal guidance.

10. Public Participation

None

11. Informational Items To/From Mayor, Council, and City Manager; future agenda item requests

Councilmember House shared that she recently attended the Canal Convergence and Art Councils events. She requested a FAIR Discussion regarding reexamining the charter for the Housing Commission and adding a member of the community who is directly impacted by homelessness or who has lived experience.

Councilmember McCarthy reported that he attended the Pedestrian Advisory Committee meeting, where discussions included the use and implementation of roundabouts.

Vice Mayor Aslan noted that Council had a meaningful visit with the Hopi Tribal Council the previous day.

Mayor Daggett shared that she spent Wednesday participating in the ECoNA meeting. She encouraged the public to view ECoNA's strategic plan webinars, available at econa-az.com. She also highlighted the Arizona Sister Cities Conference, which will be held in Flagstaff later that week, and expressed gratitude to everyone who participated in the Stuff the Bus event. She acknowledged a generous \$25,000 matching gift from Desert Financial Credit Union to the Flagstaff Family Food Center. Mayor Daggett stated she attended a meeting with the Hopi Tribe Council, Councilmembers Aslan, Councilmember Matthews, City Manager Clifton and Indigenous Coordinator Rose Toehe were also in attendance. She added that the City looks forward to an upcoming meeting with the Navajo Nation.

12. Adjournment

The Work Session of the Flagstaff City Council held November 14, 2023, adjourned at 7:01 p.m.

ATTEST:

MAYOR

CITY CLERK