

March 27, 2025

Lauren Clementino

Senior Planner/Heritage Preservation Officer

Comprehensive and Neighborhood Planning

211 West Aspen Avenue

City of Flagstaff

lclementino@flagstaffaz.gov

Dear Ms. Clementino,

EnviroSystems Management Inc. (ESM) conducted a Cultural Resource Study for Studio LP4 to support the planned subdivision of the existing office building into (2) distinct Business (B-Group) Commercial Occupancies as permitted under Flagstaff Zoning Code and the removal of an abandoned underground diesel fuel tank (*Figure 1*). This letter report complies with Flagstaff Zoning Code 10-30.30.050. The property lies within the Flagstaff North End Historic Residential District (Woodward and Stein 1985). Since the property was not yet 50 years old during the 1985 study, no official National Register of Historic Places (NRHP) nomination occurred. The property currently serves as a commercial business. The proposed subdivision of the existing business occupancy triggers mandatory accessibility upgrades. These upgrades will require minor alteration to existing site elements to provide an accessible path of travel throughout the site which may be visible from the public way. Additionally, the diesel fuel tank poses a safety and environmental hazard, and its removal will prevent future remediation work. The property is located at parcel 101-09-010 (Block 64, Lots 10-12). It previously had the address 22 West Elm Avenue before the main entrance moved to Beaver Street.



Figure 1: Overview map showing the property at 500 N. Beaver within orange square

North End Historic Residential District

The North End Historic Residential District (North End) is significant for its exemplary display of early Flagstaff architectural styles, including Queen Anne, Georgian Revival, Neo-Colonial, Bungalow, and various other revival styles popular in the early 20th century. Historically, the North End reflects the development of Flagstaff by important town figures who contributed prominently to the city's early success. The property at 500 North Beaver represents a later construction within the district, with a building date around 1946. The structure exhibits broad architectural elements consistent with Ranch styles that became more prevalent following WWII. The malpais stonework, in particular, parallels local styles popular in Flagstaff at the time. However, due to significant modifications and alterations to the property and an overall diminishment of integrity, the structure no longer conveys historic associations and does not contribute to the district.

Archival Review

On March 12, 2025, ESM reviewed archival documents and visited the Coconino County Recorder's Office to examine property records, which are also accessible online. According to land deed records, Clyde P. Wing (1899–1967) and his wife, Mildred (née Dickson, 1898–1987), purchased lots 10–12 in Block 64 on August 6, 1947, from Maurice B. Tribby. However, a newspaper article from the Arizona Daily Sun dated December 26, 1946, places the couple at the property in "their lovely new home." The family appears in the 1947 Flagstaff Telephone Directory at 22 West Elm Avenue. The 1948 Sanborn Fire Insurance map confirms that this building was constructed during this period (*Figure 2*). Newspaper articles indicate that Clyde Wing operated Acme Dry Cleaning in Flagstaff. Dr. Harry and his wife, Inis Barnes, purchased the property in 1957 and continued under Inis' ownership from 1978, following her husband's death, until 1980. Telephone records indicate the Barnes family rented the property to various tenants throughout the years.



Figure 2: 1948 Sanborn of Flagstaff

Architectural Context

A field visit was conducted on March 26, 2025, with Architect Lloyd Paul in order to collect detailed information on the architectural elements and modifications made to the property. The property located at 500 North Beaver Street (Formerly 22 West Elm Avenue) was likely constructed sometime in 1946 (see discussion above). Similar to contemporary constructions, the property exhibits a mix of Ranch Style and mid-20th century modernist architectural elements (*Photograph 1*). Ranch Style elements include a single story L-shaped floor plan, orientation to maximize width along Elm Avenue, and a low sloped hip roof framing. The structure utilizes load bearing malpais stone masonry exterior walls in conjunction with a conventionally framed wood rafter roof above. The façade includes unique concrete lentils above all entryways and windows. The original entryway was originally located at the south elevation on West Elm Street.



Photograph 1: South Elevation of Property showing original entryway from West Elm

Modifications

The property has undergone significant modifications, diminishing its integrity. Modern, historically non-conforming replacements have replaced all windows and doors. Vinyl sliding windows now occupy all window openings. The eastern projection at the south elevation features modern horizontal vinyl siding (see Photograph 1), significantly departing from the original malpais stonework. This projection of the structure was originally a garage as indicated by the 1948 Sanborn Fire Insurance Map (Figure2). Extensive alterations on the north elevation include incorporating an outbuilding (not depicted in the 1948 Sanborn Map) or courtyard into the main building with a connecting roof (*Photograph 2*). This open-air northern structure appears to have been modified extensively and currently serves as a covered walkway from the on-site parking area and the building's existing north entrance. A stone hardscape floor/hardscape exists

at this area, covered above by non-original corrugated metal roofing installed over on modern dimensional lumber and modern framing connection hardware. The filling inlet for the previously mentioned underground fuel tank is located adjacent to the westernmost stone wall, with the tank assumed be located below, possibly explaining it's unusual placement. Finally, a severely degraded exterior wall extending from the west elevation of the building to the to the Beaver Street public sidewalk does not appear original, as indicated by the observed joint between the wall and the main structure (*Photograph 3*). It seems the wall once extended westward but was dismantled at some point in the past.



Photograph 2: North Elevation of Property showing modified outbuilding attachment



Photograph 3: West elevation extending wall

Significance

The property at 500 North Beaver Street is located within the Flagstaff North End Residential Historic District. The historic significance of the District can be expressed by residential expansion of Flagstaff reflecting the development of the community and the expression of architecturally significant properties. Importantly, the original nomination for the District did not consider the development of the area following WWII. It could be argued that post war development generally follows the same themes identified in the original nomination of the district. One major consideration, however, is that following WWII the standardization of domestic structures and the overall volume at which they were produced reflects major changes in architecture and neighborhoods across the nation. Certainly, post WWII developments have shown to convey important historic themes identified by some Certified Local Governments such as Phoenix and Tucson. However, the North End Residential Historic District's omission of the post war period complicates assessing any property built during this time.

The properties eligibility recommendation follows the City of Flagstaff zoning code (30.30-13).

- a. First, the property is not eligible as a National Historic Landmark, or for the National Register of Historic Places. The criteria for the NRHP (A,B,C, and D) are identical with the City of Flagstaffs criteria (B,C,D, and E respectively), and assessed in the following.

- b. The property is not associated with events or persons in the architectural, educational, social, political, military, or cultural annals of the City, the State of Arizona, or the United States of America. While Clyde Wing and family contributed to the community by running a drycleaning service and possibly engaged in community events, there is no indication their positions were of outstanding or significant value. Furthermore, any architectural value once conveyed by the house has been lost due to significant modifications and alterations to the structure's façade.
- c. The property does not represent the work of, or for, an important individual.
- d. The property may have embodied a distinctive characteristic of type, period, region, artistic values, or methods of construction, including being the oldest of its type or the best example of its type. However, as will be expressed in the discussion of aspects of integrity, this criterion is no longer conveyed due to significant modification and alterations to the building.
- e. The property is not likely to yield information needed for scientific research, such as important archaeological resources.

Aspects of Integrity

The property retains integrity of location, design, setting, and feeling. However, the property's integrity of materials, workmanship, and subsequent association are diminished due to significant alterations to the façade. While many of the original construction materials are extant, the replacement and addition of materials are not historically accurate to the period in question. Next, the addition of non-conforming siding, windows, and doors as well as significant alterations to the north elevation have diminished the property's workmanship. As a result, the property can no longer convey any significant link between historic events or persons and therefore does not retain integrity of association.

Recommendations

The property at 500 North Beaver Street is recommended not eligible for nomination on the NRHP or contributing to the North Side Residential Historic District, or the Arizona Register of Historic Places (ARHP). Due to significant diminishment in property's integrity, it is recommended the property not be identified as a cultural resource. Therefore, the proposed work will have no adverse effects.

Primary Sources Used

Arizona Memory Project (Online)
Coconino County Records
Us Census Data
Historic Newspapers (*Arizona Daily Sun*)
Index to deeds
Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps 1916 (Revised in 1948)

References Cited

Arizona Daily Star [Flagstaff, Arizona]
1946 Dinner Guests at Clyde Wing Home. January, 15.
<https://www.newspapers.com/image/516683617/?match=1&terms=Clyde%20Wing> . Accessed March 20, 2025.

Arizona Daily Sun [Flagstaff, Arizona]
1967 Heart Attack Fells Ex-Dry Cleaner
<https://www.newspapers.com/image/516036983/?match=1&terms=Clyde%20Wing> . Accessed March 20, 2025.

Arizona State Board of Health
1936 Standard Certificate of Death. State File No. 75.
<https://www.familysearch.org/ark:/61903/3:1:S3HT-6XQH-8PP?view=index&personArk=%2Fark%3A%2F61903%2F1%3A1%3AFLVD-91S&action=view&cc=1534450&lang=en>. Accessed on March 17, 2025.

Coconino County Ownership History Records
2025 <https://www.coconino.az.gov/1019/Ownership-History-Records>

Telephone Directory for Flagstaff, Ash Fork, Grand Canyon, Page, Sedona, Seligman, Williams. The Mountain States Telephone and Telegraph Directory, 1947–1959

Telephone Directory for Flagstaff, Ash Fork, Grand Canyon, Page, Sedona, Seligman, Williams. The Mountain States Telephone, 1960–1969

Telephone Directory for Flagstaff and Sedona. Mountain Bell, 1970–1976

Woodward, Jim and Pat Stein
1985 *Flagstaff Historic Property Survey.* Final Report. Janus Associates, Incorporated, Phoenix, Arizona.