

MINUTES

**HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION
WEDNESDAY
JULY 16, 2025**

**COUNCIL CHAMBERS
211 WEST ASPEN AVENUE
4:00 P.M.**

1. Call to Order

- Vice Chair Alycia Hayes called the meeting to order at 4:02 p.m.

NOTICE OF OPTION TO RECESS INTO EXECUTIVE SESSION

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the Heritage Preservation Commission and to the general public that, at this regular meeting, the Heritage Preservation Commission may vote to go into executive session, which will not be open to the public, for legal advice and discussion with the City's attorneys for legal advice on any item listed on the following agenda, pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(3).

2. Roll Call

NOTE: One or more Commission Members may be in attendance telephonically or by other technological means.

PRESENT:

ALYCIA HAYES, VICE CHAIR
ABBEY BUCKHAM
BERNADETTE BURCHAM
AMY HORN
DUFFIE WESTHEIMER

EXCUSED:

EMILY DALE, CHAIR
ABSENT:
JESSE DOMINGUEZ

3. LAND ACKNOWLEDGMENT

- The Land Acknowledgment was read by Commissioner Amy Horn.

The Heritage Preservation Commission humbly acknowledges the ancestral homelands of this area's Indigenous nations and original stewards. These lands, still inhabited by Native descendants, border mountains sacred to Indigenous peoples. We honor them, their legacies, their traditions, and their continued contributions. We celebrate their past, present, and future generations who will forever know this place as home.

4. Public Comment

- Comments given by Charlie Silver, a Flagstaff resident.

At this time, any member of the public may address the Commission on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled before the Commission on that day. Due to Open Meeting Laws, the Commission cannot discuss or act on items presented during this portion of the agenda. To address the Commission on an item that is on the agenda, please wait for the Chair to call for Public Comment at the time the item is heard.

5. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Approval of minutes from the regular meeting on Wednesday May 21, 2025. [Agenda - View Meetings \(All\) \(6152029972\)](#)

Moved by Amy Horn, seconded by Bernadette Burcham to approve the minutes from the regular meeting held on Wednesday, May 21, 2025, with the correction changing "cardboard" to "clapboard" in Section 6.A.

Vote: 5 - 0 - Unanimously

6. PUBLIC HEARING

A. 123 S. Beaver St. Grant Application

PROPERTY INFORMATION:

Address: 123 S. Beaver St.

Assessor's Parcel Number:

Property Owner: Flagstaff Christian Fellowship

Applicant: Jeff Newman, Chairman of the Board of Directors

City Staff: Lauren Clementino, HPO

REQUESTED ACTION:

Approval of a Level 1 Historic Signs and Facades Grant application for window replacement.

REQUESTED ACTION:

Approval of a Level 1 Historic Signs and Facades Grant application for window replacement.

This building is individually listed on the National Register of Historic Places, and is a contributor to the Flagstaff Southside Historic District. Although the preference is to maintain and repair historic windows where possible, the subject windows are becoming increasingly difficult to maintain, repair, and source replacement textured yellow glass panes for as panes are broken (due to vandalism, etc.). The windows also sustain water infiltration due to the very shallow eaves of the building. The applicant has worked to find replacement windows that are as close to the originals as possible using current manufacturing. The proposed replacements would maintain the overall size, shape, and muntin/light pattern and maintain the wood material and brown paint color. Differences include a change in the style of opening from hopper to casement and a change to all clear glass. The vendor confirmed that the hopper opening style is not available and recreating it with a combination of multiple awning and fixed windows would create other visible changes (ex. loss of glass/lights and change in muntin patterns). The textured yellow glass is difficult to source and not available in commercial window replacements. Although all window lights were originally the yellow panes, the majority have already been converted to clear glass based on availability and to increase light into the building. These differences should be considered acceptable given that exact replacement windows would have to be custom made, greatly increasing the cost of the project and limiting the ability to maintain the glass lights.

The grant application meets the criteria for a Level 1 grant award per the grant guidelines. Sufficient grant funds for FY2026 remain to award this grant.

- Lauren Clementino, Heritage Preservation Officer, presented and answered the commissioners' questions.

Moved by Bernadette Burcham, seconded by Amy Horn to approve the Level 1 grant application for window replacement at 123 S Beaver.

Vote: 5 - 0 - Unanimously

B. 19 W. Birch Ave. Phase I Cultural Resource Study**PROPERTY INFORMATION:**

Address: 19 W. Birch Ave.
Assessor's Parcel Number: 100-19-004-A
Property Owner: Capri Flagstaff LLC
Applicant: Jim O'Connell
City Staff: Lauren Clementino HPO

REQUESTED ACTION:

Approval of the 19 W. Birch Ave. Phase I Cultural Resource Study and selection of measures to mitigate the proposed major impact of demolition of the property.

RECOMMENDED ACTION:

Approval of the 19 W. Birch Ave. Phase I Cultural Resource Study with selection of mitigation. Cornerstone Environmental Consulting, LLC, was contracted by Capri Flagstaff LCC to conduct a Phase I Cultural Resource Study. This building has not been previously studied. It is located within the Downtown Historic Overlay Zone, but outside of the Railroad Addition Historic District. The owner proposes to demolish the existing building and associated infrastructure on the parcel to construct a hotel. At this time, the site plan for the hotel has not yet been submitted for development review. The demolition and new hotel proposal will be subject to a Certificate of Appropriateness and scheduled for public hearing with the Heritage Preservation Commission during the development review process.

- Public comment given by Flagstaff resident, Anthony Garcia. Vice Chair Hayes asked for clarification on the address and the facade. Anthony Garcia responded and gave clarification.
- Lauren Clementino introduced the case and Cornerstone Environmental and provided clarification on the discussion topics and the focus of this agenda item. Commissioners asked questions for clarification on the process and findings. These questions were answered by Lauren Clementino and Sara Dechter, Comprehensive and Neighborhood Planning Manager.
- PowerPoint presentation given by Jack Treichler, Caitlin Stewart and Samuel Hemsley with Cornerstone Environmental.
- A discussion was held and questions answered by Lauren Clementino, Sara Dechter, Jack Treichler, Caitlin Stewart, Samuel Hemsley and the applicant, Jim O'Connell. The main discussion topics are as follows:
 - Commissioner Westheimer noted grammatical corrections, requested that photos be taken at a different time of day to provide a clearer view of the building, and asked that Pat Madden be added as a source. She also stated that, because the building is eligible, it meets the City of Flagstaff's Criteria A. These concerns were acknowledged and addressed by Caitlin Stewart and Samuel Hemsley, who also clarified that a building needs to already be determined to be eligible for the National Register to qualify for City of Flagstaff Criteria A.
 - Clarification was given on the exterior integrity findings because of exterior changes to the fire tower and bay doors.
 - Curation of the report in a public repository, such as the Flagstaff City Library and/or Cline Library.
 - Bill Collins with SHPO commented that, with the revised report, he does not feel he would be contradicting any of the findings made in the Phase I Cultural Resource Study.
 - Rose Toehe, Indigenous Affairs Administrator, spoke and offered to have the Indigenous Commission review the proposed interpretive mitigation related to Native American history and provide input.
 - A discussion was held regarding a Phase 2 Cultural Resource Study. The commissioners' questions and concerns were addressed by Lauren Clementino, Sara Dechter, Jack Treichler, Caitlin Stewart, Samuel Hemsley and applicant Jim O'Connell.
 - A discussion was held regarding Malpais stone salvaging and

mitigation. The commissioners' questions and concerns were addressed by Lauren Clementino, Sara Dechter, Jack Treichler, Caitlin Stewart, Samuel Hemsley and applicant Jim O'Connell.

- Additional public comments were given by David Zimmerman, a Flagstaff resident.

Moved by Amy Horn, seconded by Bernadette Burcham move to accept the Phase I Cultural Resource Study for 19 W. Birch Ave. with the grammatical corrections noted by Commissioner Westheimer to be approved by the HPO; with the Phase II Cultural Resource Study to focus on architectural documentation to include archival grade photography, as-built drawings, and elevation drawings to be reviewed by this Commission; with interpretive mitigation for the NRHP Criteria A to be developed in conjunction with the Native American (Indigenous) Commission and to reviewed by this Commission; with Malpais rocks incorporated into the building, preferably on the exterior, preferably salvaged, to be reviewed during the Certificate of Appropriateness review; and to archive both Cultural Resource Studies, Phases I and II, in a place where they will be publicly accessible, preferably City of Flagstaff library and/or website.

Vote: 5 - 0 - Unanimously

7. GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Potential Collaboration with NAU Students on Public Humanities Project Discussion only.

- A discussion was held, during which commissioners' questions and comments were addressed by Taylor Thompson, Sara Dechter, and Lauren Clementino.
- Vice Chair Alycia Hayes and Commissioner Amy Horn expressed interest in supporting NAU students with their projects.
- It was agreed that Sara Dechter would serve as the initial point of contact for Taylor Thompson and would determine the most appropriate person to forward the request to.

B. Historic Signs and Facades Grant Tracking - July 2025 Update Discussion only.

- Lauren Clementino presented the updated spreadsheets, photos of completed inspections and responded to the commissioners' questions.

8. REPORTS

A. APPROVALS

1. 3300 E. Route 66 (Los Tapatios) Mitigation
Permit Number(s): PZ-25-00071, CC-25-01329
Address: 3300 E. Route 66

- Lauren Clementino provided a presentation and update on the mitigations and addressed the commissioners' questions.

B. CONSULTATIONS

1. Killip School Regional Detention Basins Inlet Section 106 Consultation
N/A

- Lauren Clementino presented and provided updates.

2. Downtown Mile Section 106 Consultation
N/A

- Lauren Clementino presented, provided updates and answered the commissioners' questions.

3. Puente De Hozho Elementary School Monopine Tower Section 106 Consultation
N/A

- Lauren Clementino presented and provided updates.

9. MISCELLANEOUS ITEMS TO/FROM COMMISSION MEMBERS

- Vice Chair Alycia Hayes asked about gentasizing the process, so the commission would have a better understanding of how the process works. Sara Dechter and Lauren Clementino responded.
- Lauren Clementino shared that the owners of the Orpheum plan to sell the property and have approached the City to consider purchasing it. The City Manager's Office, along with other departments, has been discussing the matter for some time. It was discussed in the June 24, 2025 City Council meeting.
- Arizona Secretary of State, Adrian Fontes, requested to visit the May Hicks Curtis House. He stopped by last week, and Lauren Clementino shared photos from his visit. Commissioner Westheimer also gave him a tour of Townsite Community Land Trust properties.
- Lauren Clementino provided an additional update on the May Hicks Curtis House.
- Lauren Clementino forwarded an invitation from Rose Toehe for the Indigenous Code Talkers Celebration and responded to commissioners' questions about the event.
- Commissioner Duffie Westheimer asked for an update on the El Pueblo Hotel. Lauren Clementino responded that there is not an update at this time.
- Sara Dechter gave a Regional Plan Update and the meeting schedule as follows:
 - August 27, 2025, will be the Citizen Review session.
 - September 10, 2025, will be the first of two Public Hearings.
 - September 24, 2025, will be the second Public Hearing.
 - October 9, 2025, City Council meeting on the Regional Plan.

10. ADJOURNMENT

- The meeting was adjourned at 8:21 p.m.

Signature Line
_____ CHAIRPERSON

In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need assistance to participate in this meeting, please contact staff at 928-213-2611 (or 774-5281 TDD).

Notification at least 48 hours in advance will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements.

