

**MINUTES**

**HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION  
WEDNESDAY  
NOVEMBER 19, 2025**

**COUNCIL CHAMBERS  
211 WEST ASPEN AVENUE  
4:00 P.M.**

**1. Call to Order**

- Chair Dale called the meeting to order at 4:02 P.M.

**NOTICE OF OPTION TO RECESS INTO EXECUTIVE SESSION**

*Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the Heritage Preservation Commission and to the general public that, at this regular meeting, the Heritage Preservation Commission may vote to go into executive session, which will not be open to the public, for legal advice and discussion with the City's attorneys for legal advice on any item listed on the following agenda, pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(3).*

**2. Roll Call**

*NOTE: One or more Commission Members may be in attendance telephonically or by other technological means.*

**PRESENT:**  
EMILY DALE, CHAIR  
ALYCIA HAYES, VICE CHAIR  
JESSE DOMINGUEZ  
DUFFIE WESTHEIMER  
AMY HORN

**EXCUSED:**  
BERNADETTE BURCHAM

**3. LAND ACKNOWLEDGMENT**

- The Land Acknowledgment was read by Vice Chair Hayes.

*The Heritage Preservation Commission humbly acknowledges the ancestral homelands of this area's Indigenous nations and original stewards. These lands, still inhabited by Native descendants, border mountains sacred to Indigenous peoples. We honor them, their legacies, their traditions, and their continued contributions. We celebrate their past, present, and future generations who will forever know this place as home.*

**4. Open Call to the Public**

- Public Comments Provided by:
  - Flagstaff Resident, David Stephens.
  - Newly appointed Commissioner, Alec "Ace" Overmann, introduced himself.

*At this time, any member of the public may address the Commission on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled before the Commission on that day. Due to Open Meeting Laws, the Commission cannot discuss or act on items presented during this portion of the agenda. To address the Commission on an item that is on the agenda, please wait for the Chair to call for Public Comment at the time the item is heard.*

## 5. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

### A. Approval of the minutes from the regular meeting on September 17, 2025.

**Moved by** Jesse Dominguez, **seconded by** Amy Horn to approve the minutes from the regular meeting on September 17, 2025.

**Vote:** 5 - 0 - Unanimously

## 6. PUBLIC HEARING

### A. 402 W. Birch Ave. Certificate of Appropriateness

#### PROPERTY INFORMATION:

**Address:** 402 W. Birch Ave.

**Assessor's Parcel Number:** 103-11-013

**Property Owner:** George and Holly Averbeck, Averbeck Family Trust

**Applicant:** Anne Mead, Architect, Updesign Studio

**City Staff:** Lauren Clementino, HPO

#### REQUESTED ACTION:

Approve a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a new one bedroom, one bathroom Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU) above a new garage at 402 W. Birch Ave. (APN 103-11-013), with access from Sitgreaves St. This new structure would be detached from the existing single-family dwelling structure. This request also includes adding a partially covered front porch and patio to the existing single-family dwelling structure and fencing modifications. This property is in the Townsite Historic Design Review Overlay Zone and is a non-contributing property within the Flagstaff Townsite Historic Residential District.

#### RECOMMENDED ACTION:

Staff recommends that the Heritage Preservation Commission approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed plans for a new detached accessory dwelling unit and garage, adding a partially covered front porch and patio to the existing single-family dwelling structure, and fencing modifications.

- Lauren Clementino, Heritage Preservation Officer, introduced Anne Mead, Architect with Updesign Studio.
- Anne Mead gave a presentation. A discussion followed, during which comments and questions from the Commissioners were addressed by:
  - Lauren Clementino
  - Sara Dechter, Comprehensive and Neighborhood Planning Manager
  - Anne Mead
- Public comment was provided by the property owner, Holly Averbeck.
- Discussion of possible modifications to the drawing;
  - Propose breaking up the front garage door into single eight-foot bays, reflecting the style of historic garages.
  - Explore the option of a slightly smaller second story to reduce visual impact and improve scale.
  - Consider whether the window above the garage could be extended in length for better proportion.
  - Evaluate the feasibility of flipping the floor plan so that the garage faces the alley which may require relocating the gas meter.
  - Discuss the possibility of lowering the roof pitch to reduce overall height or improve compatibility with surrounding structures.
  - Consider changing the Sitgreaves-facing gable to a shed dormer.
  - Reassess the second floor porch design, as it currently overlooks the neighbor's yard,

raising potential privacy concerns.

**Moved by Jesse Dominguez, seconded by Alycia Hayes to approve the front porch and fencing as proposed.**

**Vote: 5 - 0 - Unanimously**

**Moved by Amy Horn, seconded by Alycia Hayes to continue the discussion and decision on the ADU portion of this property to the December meeting. The applicant may provide modified drawings at that time. No staff report is necessary to accompany this item.**

**Vote: 5 - 0 - Unanimously**

**B. 418 S. Leroux St. Phase 2 Cultural Resource Study**

**PROPERTY INFORMATION:**

**Address:** 418 S. Leroux St.

**Assessor's Parcel Number:** 103-15-021

**Property Owner:** Flag Holdings LLC

**Applicant:** David Carpenter

**City Staff:** Lauren Clementino, HPO

**REQUESTED ACTION:**

Approve the Phase 2 Cultural Resource Study and additional LiDAR (Light Detection and Ranging) documentation, and approve the additional mitigation of creating an interactive 3D model map.

**RECOMMENDED ACTION:**

Approve the Phase 2 Cultural Resource Study and additional LiDAR documentation as meeting the required research and documentation required for a Phase 2 Cultural Resource Study and approve the additional mitigation of creating an interactive 3D model map.

The house at 418 S. Leroux St. is a contributor to the Flagstaff Southside Historic District listed on the National Register of Historic Places. The historic-age outbuilding on the parcel has not been previously evaluated. The property owner plans to demolish the existing structures and redevelop the parcel. A Phase 2 Cultural Resource Study is required when major impacts (including demolition) are proposed for a significant resource that has integrity and when no other mitigation measures are proposed that would maintain the significance and integrity of the resource. A Phase 2 Cultural Resource Study includes all of the contents of a Phase 1 Cultural Resource Study plus complete text descriptions, as-built plans, and archival grade photography that fully document all physical aspects of the resource, including its setting.

The submitted Phase 2 Cultural Resource Study includes the required study elements as well as LiDAR scans of the existing structures. The Phase 2 report, as-built plans, and a photo log of the archival photographs are attached to the agenda. Due to the large file sizes and format, the archival photographs and LiDAR scans are not attached to the agenda and are instead available by request from the Heritage Preservation Officer.

As an additional mitigation step, Cornerstone proposes to LiDAR scan the building materials during demolition to document and preserve the structural and architectural details. The resulting interactive 3D model will illustrate construction methods, materials, and historical context, and may be shared with the City of Flagstaff for public access and potential use in documenting other Southside historic structures.

- Lauren Clementino introduced the presenters for Cornerstone Environmental Consulting LLC.
- Sam Hemsley, Conerstone Environmental Consulting Archaeologist and Historian, introduced his team;
  - Samuel E. Mitchell, Staff Archaeologist

- Ash Mlazgar, Staff Archaeologist
- Michael Pitts, Senior Project Manager
- Sam Hemsley and Ash Mlazgar delivered a PowerPoint presentation followed by a discussion regarding potential design modification (see details below).
  - Creation of an interactive 3D model as additional mitigation.
  - The Phase 2 Cultural Resource Study be edited to reflect the corrections noted during the meeting, such as; distinction between Hispanic and Basque, correcting photograph numbers and correcting names to remove PROS.
  - Additional consultation with relevant community organizations, including the Southside Community Association and Flagstaff Nuestras Raices, be conducted.
  - The Heritage Preservation Officer may review and approve the final study and interaction 3D model administratively.
- The Commissioners' comments and questions were answered by Sam Hemsley and Ash Mlazgar.

**Moved by Amy Horn, seconded by Alycia Hayes** to approve the Phase 2 Cultural Resource Study and the additional LiDAR documentation as meeting the research and documentation requirements for a Phase 2 Cultural Resource Study. I also move to approve the proposed additional mitigation measure of creating an interactive 3D model. Furthermore, we request that the final report be edited to reflect the corrections that have been made, and that additional consultation with relevant community organizations be documented. The Heritage Preservation Officer may review these updates independently, and they do not need to be brought back to this Commission.

**Vote: 5 - 0 - Unanimously**

## **7. GENERAL BUSINESS**

### **A. Training on Current Planning Development Applications**

**STAFF RECOMMENDED ACTION:**  
Discussion only.

- Alexandra Pucciarelli, Current Planning Manager, gave a PowerPoint presentation on Current Planning Development Applications. Comments and questions from the Commissioners' were addressed by Alexandra Pucciarelli and Sara Dechter.

### **B. Historic Signs and Facades Grant Tracking - November 2025 Update**

**STAFF RECOMMENDED ACTION:**  
Discussion only.

- Lauren Clementino provided an update and answered the Commissioners' questions.

## 8. REPORTS

### A. APPROVALS

#### 1. 204 W. Birch Ave. Certificate of No Effect

PROPERTY INFO:

**Permit Number(s):** PZ-25-00187, OTC-25-02762

**Address:** 204 W. Birch Ave.

**Type of Approval:** Certificate of No Effect

**Approval Date:** September 15, 2025

- Lauren Cementino provided an update.

#### 2. 205 S. Park St. Phase I Cultural Resource Study Resubmittal

PROPERTY INFO:

**Permit Number(s):** PZ-25-00111

**Address:** 205 S. Park St.

**Type of Approval:** Phase I Cultural Resource Study

**Approval Date:** September 29, 2025

- Lauren Cementino provided an update.

#### 3. Starlight Trail Letter Report Cultural Resource Study

PROPERTY INFO:

**Permit Number(s):** PZ-25-00202

**Address:** SE Corner of Woody Mountain Rd. and Interstate 40

**Type of Approval:** Letter Report Cultural Resource Study

**Approval Date:** October 8, 2025

- Lauren Cementino provided an update.

#### 4. 5950 E. Walnut Canyon Road Letter Report Cultural Resource Study

PROPERTY INFO:

**Permit Number(s):** PZ-25-00221

**Address:** 5950 E. Walnut Canyon Road

**Type of Approval:** Letter Report Cultural Resource Study

**Approval Date:** October 21, 2025

- Lauren Clementino provided an update and answered the Commissioners' questions.

#### 5. 523 W. Aspen Ave. Certificate of No Effect

PROPERTY INFO:

**Permit Number(s):** PZ-25-00229

**Address:** 523 W. Aspen Ave.

**Type of Approval:** Certificate of No Effect

**Approval Date:** November 12, 2025

- Lauren Cementino provided an update.

## 9. MISCELLANEOUS ITEMS TO/FROM COMMISSION MEMBERS

- Commission appointments: Lauren Clementino announced the appointment of two new Commissioners -- Alec (Ace) Overmann and Jeanne Stevens. Additionally, Vice Chair Hayes has been reappointed. Commissioner Horn's term is ending and this is her final meeting.
- Elections: Chair and Vice Chair elections will happen during the December meeting.
- Historic Preservation Fund Sign-on letter (attached): Lauren Clementino mentioned that the request to sign the letter came from Arizona Preservation Foundation and the letter has been sent to the City Clerk's office to add to a future City Council agenda.
- Flagstaff historic theme project public comment follow-up: Lauren Clementino provided staff follow-up and suggestions to the public comment made by Charlie Silver on behalf of John Westerlund during the September meeting.
- Two Spot Logging Train discussion update: Lauren Clementino provided an update on the discussion at the October Beautification and Public Art Commission meeting.
- Sara Dechter inquired about organizing the Commission's holiday gathering.
- Commissioner Westheimer mentioned that the National Preservation Partners Network is discussing cities requiring plans for replacement building be submitted before demolition is authorized. The Commission discussed this possibility in Flagstaff and Sara Dechter and Lauren Clementino answered questions.
- Chair Dale inquired about imposing a maximum length on public hearing item presentations.

## 10. ADJOURNMENT

- The meeting was adjourned at 7:49 pm.