

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
CM116	Sustainability Commission	"Suggest restructuring the first two chapters for better flow, background info, existing plans, etc. Possibly: split chapter 1 and chapter 2 into subsections: 1: city/region background, climate background (Provide goals of CNP, how they will be incorporated in this plan) 2: plan/planning background, structure of plan; Move "The Focus of the Regional Plan" section from 1-10 and 1-11 to be the intro/guidance section of chapter 3. [BACKGROUND INFO (region, culture, community, climate)-> STRUCTURE OF PLAN -> FOCUS/PRIORITIES/GOALS/POLICIES] - include/emphasize importance "	Chapter 1 and 2	1-	Chapter 1 was substantially restructured for better flow, with some information moving to Chapters 2-4 and more information added in Ch.1 about housing, climate, growth projections, and scenario planning.
CM165	Sustainability Commission	Define land use as a climate action tool	Chapter 1 or GLU/Energy Chapters	1-	This connection was strengthened in the plan with a new paragraph explaining land use planning in Ch.1, more information on the climate emergency in Ch.1, and more specifics on scenario planning in Ch.1 and 4.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
CM146	Sustainability Commission	<p>We recommend restructuring the first three chapters to better focus on the most important information about the Plan’s purpose, scope, priorities, etc. An alternative format you may consider is outlined here.</p> <p>i. Chapter 1: Introduction</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. The Flagstaff Region. Keep the vision, background/history, and present-day information.</li> <li>2. The Region’s Future Uncertainties and Opportunities (page 1-10). Include Flagstaff’s declaration of a climate emergency and tie the Plan to the goals of the Carbon Neutrality Plan (CNP).</li> </ol> <p>ii. Chapter 2: How the Plan Works.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Move the city/region planning history discussion currently located in Chapter 1 to the beginning of this chapter, including Figure 1-2 Planning History of the Flagstaff Region.</li> <li>2. Extend the timeline in Figure 1-2 through at least 2023, making sure to include the CNP.</li> </ol> <p>ii. Chapter 3: Goals and Policies.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Move “The Focus of the Regional Plan” section from pages 1-10 and 1-11 to the beginning of Chapter 3 to clearly outline the Plan’s Priorities and Objectives.</li> <li>2. Directly tie the Priorities and Objectives into the Goals and Policies defined in this chapter.</li> </ol>	Chapters 1 - 3	1-	Chapter 1 was substantially restructured for better flow, with some information moving to Chapters 2-4 and more information added in Ch.1 about housing, climate, growth projections, and scenario planning. The planning history timeline was removed from the document. Chapter 3 was reorganized and revised with a stronger focus on the priorities.
L141	Unisource	<p>We support the City of Flagstaff’s and Coconino County’s efforts to reduce greenhouse gas emissions and to protect our region’s health and natural beauty. Environmental stewardship is a critical component of our safe and reliable natural gas operations, and it will remain so as we expand our system to serve our region’s increasing energy needs. We believe our community will always need affordable, effective energy options. With respect for efforts to reduce greenhouse gas emissions through electrification, many residents and businesses will remain interested in the reliability and value offered by natural gas service. As such, we recommend that the plan also address the need for more efficient on-site combustion devices through incentives that make more efficient natural gas options more affordable. Our building codes should always accommodate developers who wish to provide both electric and gas service in their projects. In short, our residents and businesses should remain free to choose natural gas service if it suits their needs.</p>	Energy Chapter	10-	Added sentences on natural gas usage, Unisource's Renewable Natural Gas Feasibility Study, and appliance efficiency on pages 10-1 and 10-2.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON1054	Krista Ames-Cook	Is there a reason that Chapter 10 rolls into Chapter 11 instead of ending like the previous chapters?	Energy Chapter	10-	This was because the platform Konveio had a limit to how many chapters could be uploaded separately.
ON1068	David	Please consider a discussion of Community Choice Energy (CCE). This change of the current path by Investor owned utility (APS) of slow-walking on the path to greening our grid requires legislative enabling by the Arizona State Legislature. By including such a discussion the public will better understand this option and thus push for the needed legislation. A study of CCE is available free from the National Renewable Energy Laboratory; again the public can call for this action.	Energy Chapter	10-	This is outside the scope of the Regional Plan
ON1127	Val	Tree planting in areas without them would help as well.	"Energy-efficient building practices and demand management will be needed to ensure that City buildings are well-insulated and require less heating and cooling."	10-2	This is true, but the focus of this paragraph is retrofits and efficient building practices. Fostering these is an important project for the City and County. Urban forestry practices and trade-offs are addressed in Chapter 11.
ON588	Ben Ruddell	Higher energy efficiency standards for new construction cost developers money but yield huge and cost effective long term benefits to residents' energy bills and the environment. Raising these standards further in the Flagstaff area is a good idea. And, once structures go up, you can't easily go back and retrofit them for efficiency. It needs to be in the building codes.	The Cost of Energy Efficiency call out box	10-2	This idea is reflected in multiple policies and Ch.10 action items.
ON698	Valerie Piet	Can we define demand side management and demand response?	"... through efficiencies gained via demand response and energy efficiency." & Figure 10-2	10-3	Demand side management is defined in the caption of Figure 10-2. These terms are further defined in the cited reference.
ON1139	Val	However the Az. Corporate Commission is going to erase all desire to go solar with their constant design to charge solar users higher rates!	Clean Energy Production	10-3	There is an action item to support solar cooperatives that assist residents in obtaining solar for a lower price.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON589	Ben Ruddell	Flagstaff is going to use the power APS sells us at the prices they set, which is in turn a state-level Corporation Commission issue. It is a waste of time and money for Flagstaff to try to produce its own energy. We don't have enough money to do this in a small and poorly funded city. Focus elsewhere- like on improving energy efficiency and transportation options, both of which are under local control.	Clean Energy Production	10-3	The plan does have policies that support energy efficiency and transportation, but includes directives to support renewable energy production as well. This plan not only to the City, but also to the County, where there are more renewable production possibilities, and the plan recognizes that opportunities could arise in future decades.
ON893	Dee Hoagland	Community Choice Energy (CCE) would allow the region to choose where their power comes from. Rather than transmitting power generated in Northern Az from Babbitt Ranch and Chevelon Butte to Phoenix, the region could choose to rely on locally generated clean energy. There is a cost savings associated as well as reduction of carbon emissions.	Clean Energy Production	10-3	This is outside the scope of the Regional Plan.
ON1177	Laura Huenneke	I agree that the price at which APS sells (back to) us renewable energy produced locally is a Corporation Commission matter. But this is a long-term plan and I think it is reasonable to consider the possibility that state policies and regulation might change. (New Mexico, for example, has far more flexible community choice possibilities and is moving rapidly on everything from utility-scale renewables to community scale microgrids to enhance resilience.) In City and County facilities there might very well be economic benefits to increasing local generation of power.	Clean Energy Production, reply to ON589	10-3	Goal E and Policy E.1 reflect this.
ON1130	Val	AMEN!! and can the city help fight the Az. Corporate Commission and their constant desire to put higher rates on building owners with solar! HELP!!	Clean Energy Production, reply to ON893	10-3	There is an action item to support solar cooperatives that assist residents in obtaining solar for a lower price.
ON1248	Erica Rackley	Oh, APS. Demand side management is NOT a source of energy. It can be a source of energy efficiency. Please consider either revising this figure or making this point very obvious.	Figure 10-2	10-3	This data is presented in the way APS presents it in their publications.
ON979	David	It would be helpful to cite the current electricity giga-watt-hours, to put this 24,000 figure into perspective.	"... the APS Integrated Resource Plan forecasts that electrical demand... will increase by nearly 24,000 Giga watt hours statewide by 2040."	10-4	The reference is cited for those interested in getting into the numbers, but the point is simply that electrical demand is projected to increase.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON1151	Val	What does this mean? Political will? The incoming administration does not believe in climate change, we are in a very up hill battle to get anything done on climate policy . Having the city engage in advocacy for transmission lines, uses of clean energy, etc. would help, A LOT!!	"Provide a critical platform for the US to compete and innovate in the global energy economy."	10-4	This phrase refers to a principle of grid modernization, not a description of existing conditions. Advocacy is mentioned in the action items, but is generally outside the scope of this plan.
ON1216	Erin Mahan	Agreed - engagement is the cornerstone of intelligent design. Take for example the 12/19 California Public Utilities Commission decision to require its biggest IOUs to hand over electrical communications standards stewardship to industry-led working groups. Flagstaff needs to hold APS accountable to industry standards, or choose an option like Community Choice Energy (CCE). Local governments would have the authority to source and purchase electricity that their residents and businesses choose, while still relying on existing utilities for distribution of power and infrastructure maintenance.	"Provide a critical platform for the US to compete and innovate in the global energy economy." Reply to ON1151	10-4	This is outside the scope of the Regional Plan.
ON1145	Val	solar is mentioned a great deal. How about geothermal, are we an area that has potential for this energy source. Nuclear is also mentioned. Nuclear energy production is improving and should be investigated for future use.	Clean Energy Production	10-4	There are no policies in the plan that eliminate geothermal and nuclear as potential new energy sources. Nuclear is noted in Figure 10-2.
ON590	Ben Ruddell	Don't plan to allow data centers in Flagstaff's planning and zoning. These are modern strip-mines that soak up land, energy, and water without much benefit to the community (they are racks of computers; few jobs are provided). Not to worry... our poor internet connectivity and high water prices will keep them away. The plan should discourage them.	Data Centers and Chip Manufacturing	10-4	Merely restricting them on land within City and County jurisdiction may not be sufficient to prevent a data center form being established where it could impact our Region's water and electricity. There is not policy that states they should be supported if a proposal is brought forward.
ON1141	Val	Added to the above comment, these data and chip centers should pay higher prices for their own energy, not Flagstaff rate payers!	Data Centers and Chip Manufacturing, reply to ON590	10-4	This would be determined by APS.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON1173	Val	Thank you for addressing this!	"As the City transitions to more energy-efficient and electric homes, prioritizing the homes of low-income residents, who suffer the most from inefficient buildings and high energy prices, is critical."	10-5	No change.
ON1182	Laura Huenneke	I was looking for mention of charging infrastructure, etc. in the transportation chapter. Perhaps insert in that chapter a cross-reference to this section.	Electric Vehicle Charging Infrastructure	10-5	Added cross-reference on page 6-11.
ON1204	Erin Mahan	Has APS begun working with vehicle-to-grid charging infrastructure yet? It would be interesting to talk not only about the infrastructure investment, but the plan for enhancements that support decarbonization.	Electric Vehicle Charging Infrastructure	10-5	Not to our knowledge and outside the scope of the plan.
ON1205	Erin Mahan	There should be more data here about the impact of home building/new homes on the household energy use.	Household Energy Costs and an Equitable Energy Transition	10-5	New homes are generally more energy efficient than existing homes because they have to meet the newest adopted Energy Code. That is why retrofitting is emphasized in the chapter. No information added.
ON894	Sat Best	If there isn't one already, a formal program should be created to help buyers qualify for the higher cost of green homes based on the reduced cost of utilities over the lifetime of the home.	Household Energy Costs and an Equitable Energy Transition	10-5	This is outside the scope of the Regional Plan.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON1206	Erin Mahan	There could also be more discussion about protecting residents from energy costs related to data centers. Look at the recent cost explosion from Portland General Electric - 10% year over year, no more reductions for seniors - how is Flagstaff planning to protect families from data center-related energy expenses?	Household Energy Costs and an Equitable Energy Transition, reply to ON1206	10-5	Merely restricting them on land within City and County jurisdiction may not be sufficient to prevent a data center form being established in the Region. There is not policy that states they should be supported if a proposal is brought forward.
ON1184	Laura Huenneke	Given that EV batteries can serve as emergency power resources if appropriate charging infrastructure is available - consider building such infrastructure into key city and county facilities as part of emergency preparedness.	"Plan for EV charging at strategic locations for vehicles to support the tourism industry."	10-6	This guideline was not carried forward when the Implementation Guideline category was dissolved. Battery storage is mentioned in Policy E.1 and multiple action items.
ON1207	Erin Mahan	Vehicle-to-grid energy conversion technology is also an essential discussion	"Plan for EV charging at strategic locations for vehicles to support the tourism industry." Reply to ON1184	10-6	This guideline was not carried forward when the Implementation Guideline category was dissolved. EV charging and battery storage are mentioned in Policy E.1 and multiple action items.
ON1250	Erica Rackley	Let's make this "construction methods" component highest priority. If the City intends to make the density increases proposed in this plan, there will be thousands of opportunities (one per new housing building built) to reduce emissions per person in Flagstaff, depending on the methods and materials used to build those new buildings.	"Promote cost-effective, energy-efficient technologies, construction methods, and design in all new and retrofit buildings for residential, commercial, and industrial properties."	10-6	This guideline was not carried forward when the Implementation Guideline category was dissolved.
ON1252	Erica Rackley	...and keep the power those projects generate local.	"Promote opportunities for new, utility-scale renewable energy projects in the Region and coordinate them across jurisdictional boundaries."	10-6	This guideline was not carried forward when the Implementation Guideline category was dissolved.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON718	Phil G	<p>Overall until the technology exists on a very large scale to produce fuels like gasoline, diesel and aviation jet fuel from renewable resources, it will not be feasible to legally require any sort of EV transportation and net zero energy buildings. This technology I believe will be economically feasible but only in the more distant future. For the present it is best to only change building codes for instance if the results are economically feasible as a condition for their applicability. This is because society cannot and should not persist without medicines and plastics, both of which rely very heavily on petrochemicals. So as stated above, until petrochemicals can be obtained without any fossil crude oil or coal, the whole project becomes way too problematic and economically prohibitive.</p> <p>Another issue mentioned by others is the reliability of the electrical grid. How to prevent serious outages, brown outs and black outs without alternative sources of energy from natural gas say or nuclear has to be addressed. We should not need to have back up gas powered generators to supply electricity to houses and commercial buildings in the event of a serious long running power outage.</p> <p>Please see white paper I submitted to Ms. Dechter and Ms. Shaw on the energy situation in the country and as affects our area.</p>	"Support the electric utility in grid modernization efforts."	10-6	The plan supports but does not require EV transportation or net zero energy buildings. An action item was added to Ch. 10 on planning for increased electricity demand and more information was added to the chapter about natural gas usage, acknowledging that fuel switching is not always feasible.
ON898	Sat Best	<p>Without a wood burning stove or fireplace that doesn't need a fan to operate, any heating/cooling system is currently vulnerable to power outages. Gas furnaces need electricity to run. Most new energy installations are renewable because it's now the cheapest form of energy, and large new battery arrays are improving reliability. As long as the large electric utilities do their planning well the transition to renewables should go smoothly, and history shows they do their planning quite well.</p>	"Support the electric utility in grid modernization efforts." Reply to ON898	10-6	An action item was added to Ch. 10 on planning for increased electricity demand.
ON230	Shelly Gordon	<p>Add to Goal E: Study the viability and potential benefits of implementing a Community Choice Energy (CCE) program, while a statewide effort is underway to achieve CCE enabling legislation. CCE allows local governments to procure power on behalf of residents, businesses, and municipal accounts from alternative suppliers while still receiving transmission and distribution services from the utility services provider.</p> <p>A study of CCE developed through the National Renewable Energy Lab's Clean Energy to Community Expert Match (C2C) which offers a structured program and resources to local governments aiming to transition to clean energy, at no cost to participants. Through technical expertise from NREL, C2C could facilitate the City of Flagstaff's exploration, understanding and implementation of CCE delivered as a final report.</p>	Goal E	10-6	This is outside the scope of the Regional Plan.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON1211	Erin Mahan	Flagstaff should be more bold and write: "to advocate for City and County decarbonization by 2030 goals,..." - like a previous comment, the City should not accept APS' longer-term goal of 2050. The 2050 goal does not align with what's necessary to protect Flagstaff's ecosystem.	"Engage in utility planning efforts such as the APS Integrated Resource Planning process to advocate for adequate energy efficiency programs and to increase clean and renewable energy sources."	10-7	"Promote decarbonization" was added to this action item.
ON1178	Val	Great work here, Thank you!!	Energy Action Items	10-7	No change.
ON1212	Erin Mahan	To echo at least six previous comments, the NREL Study should be listed here: National Renewable Energy Lab (NREL) Study of the CCE via its Clean Energy to Community Expert Match (C2C) program, which offers a structured program and resources to local governments aiming to transition to clean energy, at no cost to localities. <a href="https://www.energy.gov/eere/clean-energy-communities-program">https://www.energy.gov/eere/clean-energy-communities-program</a>	Energy Chapter Endnotes	10-8	This is outside the scope of the Regional Plan.
CM27	Bicycle Advisory Committee	The BAC suggested adding language about Vision Zero and traffic injuries and fatalities to this section.	IPS Chapter	11-	This is covered in Chapter 6: Transportation.
L13	Mike Klinke	"As we plan for increased housing density and population growth, it is critical to evaluate and ensure adequate resources for our first responders: Police and Firefighters: An increase in population density will likely bring new challenges for public safety. From higher call volumes to the need for specialized training and equipment, our police and fire departments must be equipped to meet these demands without compromising their ability to serve the community effectively. Infrastructure Upgrades: Enhanced fire stations, improved access routes, and sufficient staffing should be built into the budget to match anticipated growth. Planning ahead will allow Flagstaff to avoid reactive measures that could prove more costly and less effective."	IPS Chapter	11-	These resources are mentioned in Ch.11, see page 11-1, 11-11, and action items on 11-19.
ON265	Bruce Edward Fox	in the Region--or elsewhere?	"Every Indigenous Nation knows this place as sacred and life-giving."	1-1	This sentence was deleted.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON456	Sara Sprague	Include "agricultural"	"The area is rich with cultural diversity, natural beauty, and history and offers outstanding economic, educational, recreational, and scientific opportunities"	1-1	No change, "agricultural" is covered by "economic."
ON7	Aubree Flores	Hi, I believe the "p" in MetroPlan should be capitalized.	"The Region is geographically defined by the boundary of Metroplan and unites various..."	1-1	Edit made.
ON1116	Erica Rackley	"The Region is geographically defined by the boundary of Metroplan..." What is the boundary of Metroplan? And what is Metroplan? Can we see a map? Maybe there is already a map that I haven't seen yet.	Introduction section	1-1	This sentence was moved closer to the map and was rewritten for clarity.
ON1120	Erica Rackley	Since you answer my questions in the next section, maybe remove "is geographically defined by the boundary of Metroplan" from this sentence to avoid confusion.	Introduction section, reply to ON1120	1-1	This sentence was moved closer to the map and was rewritten for clarity.
ON493	David	Does the County have a land acknowledgement?	Land acknowledgement	1-1	The County does not have a land acknowledgment at this time.
CM154	Sustainability Commission	Please clarify: The Vision for the Flagstaff Region on page 1-1 is vague. How does this vision relate to the priorities? Are the priorities intended to help achieve the vision? If yes, then explain the connection. It is not clear how the vision and priorities connect.	Vision Statement	1-1	The Regional Plan Committee discussed revising the vision statement and voted to keep as is.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON2	Yiqun Lin	<p>economy, I would like to add two more words of "equitable" and "sustainable" in front of "vibrant".</p> <p>As the draft plan stated on page 15, the primary challenge of Coconino county's economy is the continued rising of income inequality since 2010, where "the City and County have poverty rates of 18.9 percent and 16.9 percent, respectively. Both rates are notably higher than the state and national poverty rates of 13.1 percent and 12.5 percent, respectively." Therefore, adding "equitable" would provide us with a clear vision and actionable target to reduce the gap of "income inequality" for the well-being of all our residents over the next 20 years.</p> <p>In addition, "sustainability" is one of the four pillars of "The City of Flagstaff Economic Development Strategy" plan. Its vision reads: "The City of Flagstaff has a diverse and resilient economy with a united community that promotes sustainable growth, innovation, and opportunity." I believe including "sustainability" in the Regional Plan 2045 vision statement is imperative as our natural resources will not be able to sustain unlimited growth.</p> <p>For the above two reasons, I would like the second phrase to read: "Through these efforts, we aim to foster a resilient community and to develop an equitable, sustainable, and vibrant economy where all residents have the opportunity to thrive."</p> <p>Thank you! Yiqun</p>	Vision statement	1-1	The Regional Plan Committee discussed revising the vision statement and voted to keep as is.
ON455	Sara Sprague	Need for stronger language.	Vision statement	1-1	The Regional Plan Committee discussed revising the vision statement and voted to keep as is.
ON494	David	Where is the vision? What are the goals?	Vision statement	1-1	The goals are in Ch. 3. The Regional Plan Committee discussed revising the vision statement and voted to keep as is.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON670	Sat Best	"preserving our unique character" is a huge challenge given our current zoning laws. Most Flagstaff residents are not aware that almost all commercial property in Flagstaff is CURRENTLY ZONED for 60' height with almost no setback from the sidewalk. There was a great uproar when the Hub (now the Jack) went up on South Milton some years ago, but a building like that can go up on the site of any parking lot or small existing structure anywhere in town without a zone change. The latest example is at the NW corner of Butler and Beaver, a 60' building on the sidewalk with almost no landscaping on the Butler frontage. If this is the future, we will become Brooklyn. We can't change current zoning without compensating owners, so this is a problem we need to face directly with all the focus and creatively we can muster. I think making deals with developers to greatly increase native landscaping could be one answer, and I'll be bringing that up in later sections.	Vision statement	1-1	"Best Practices for Creating a Sense of Place" were added in Ch.3 and a historic preservation action item was added in Ch.7 to strengthen the plan's position on "preserving character."
ON684	Nicole Walker	Flagstaff already serves as a climate refuge for those from the valley who can afford it. We must adequately tax second homes to prepare for the rise in population that will occur as Phoenix sees more days over 100 degrees.	"...as such; the pace and pattern of migration will be a key factor in the Region's growth."	1-10	Tax rates are outside the scope of the Regional Plan.
ON25	Sara Sprague	How are we welcoming and preparing for environmental refugees? How will our infrastructure be built with these considerations in mind?	"As climate change impacts become more severe and residents in the metropolitan Phoenix area experience increase periods of extreme heat..."	1-10	Ch.11 discusses necessary infrastructure upgrades.
ON757	Val Bryant	Therefore it is extremely important for the Climate Plan to be a foremost feature in every part of the plan!	"As climate change impacts become more severe and residents in the metropolitan Phoenix area experience increase periods of extreme heat..."	1-10	A call-out box was added on the Carbon Neutrality Plan and Climate Action was reorganized as a core priority with its associated goals and policies.
ON448	Alexander Shenkin	These two points need to be highlighted in the plan, and here would be a good place to do it:  The City of Flagstaff's goal is to be carbon neutral by 2030  Any new development proposals need to help the City of Flagstaff reach that goal	"Climate change further complicates the Region's future"	1-10	A call-out box was added on the Carbon Neutrality Plan and a footnote was added to the Climate Action Goal for the City to link those two together.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON1196	Nat	Climate change may further increase external investments in Flagstaff housing aimed at part time use for summer heat escape. Flagstaff and the region need to plan to address the current and growing connection between high housing vacancy rates, more housing being built, and little effect on elevated housing prices.	"Climate change further complicates the Region's future."	1-10	Our scenario planning modeling indicated that building a larger share of missing middle and multifamily housing could lead to a 20% reduction in housing costs, factoring in short-term rentals and second homes. More information on the modeling was added to Ch.1. Also see revised section on p. 5-3 for rental vacancy data.
ON285	Michele James	The uncertainty of climate change impacts in the Region is what makes the future uncertain.	"Climate change further complicates the Region's future."	1-10	This section was rewritten.
ON287	Michele James	Provide details to show the threats of climate change locally to air quality, water quality, and ecosystem health. Again, this should be framed to illustrate the Region's vulnerabilities.	"Climate change further complicates the Region's future."	1-10	A Climate Emergency call out box was added.
ON268	Bruce Edward Fox	this concern has been raised for many years. I suggest changing "can" to "Based on recent history, continued growth will lead to...."	"Continued growth can lead to questions and concerns about potential impacts to the Region's unique character and values..."	1-10	This section was rewritten.
ON665	Peggy Chaikin	I looked over the pages offered through this link and the dates of the resource materials. The dates are not current enough to reflect the growing vulnerability of the Flagstaff population. Studies are at least 10years old. Much has happened: especially rising temperatures and drought, causing tree die-off and lack of moisture in the urban/wildfire interface. Please offer an updated study as it will show greater threats.	"Flagstaff's Vulnerability to Climate Change Assessment suggests that the Region will see more days of poor air quality..."	1-10	Staff is not aware of an updated study. This section was rewritten and no longer links to this assessment.
ON897	Heather	This is why the regional plan must include the City of Flagstaff's goal of reaching carbon neutrality by 2030	"Flagstaff's Vulnerability to Climate Change Assessment suggests that the Region will see more days of poor air quality..."	1-10	See additional explanation of what the plan is not on page 2-1 and the footnote to Goal CA.1a.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON284	Michele James	There needs to be more included in the RP about the vulnerabilities outlined in this referenced Assessment. Strongly suggest the inclusion of a section that outlines these vulnerabilities and addresses trade-offs and compromises required by the Regional communities (as discussed in the Scenario section, but using less planning language). This is part of the justification for why the RP emphasizes density and infill. Without a clear explanation in the first chapter, community members are not going to understand why the RP proposes this.	"Flagstaff's Vulnerability to Climate Change Assessment suggests..."	1-10	A Climate Emergency call out box was added.
ON1092	david r	Why the blind focus on growth instead of quality of life? As a long term resident of Flagstaff, I believe that the quality of life for residents has been declining for more than a decade as the City blindly chases growth. One cannot assume that building more housing will reduce the cost of housing and will therefore address affordable housing. The City needs to address two of the issues that are driving up prices: second homes and short term rentals.	"Incremental increases in density can also support a greater diversity of housing, making it more affordable to live in Flagstaff"	1-10	Our scenario planning modeling indicated that building a larger share of multifamily housing could lead to a 20% reduction in housing costs, factoring in short-term rentals and second homes. More information on the modeling was added to Ch.1.
ON470	Sara Sprague	How will this be regulated if there are no current regulations on rent increases or second-home owners?	"Incremental increases in density can also support a greater diversity of housing, making it more affordable to live in Flagstaff"	1-10	Our scenario planning modeling indicated that building a larger share of multifamily housing could lead to a 20% reduction in housing costs, factoring in short-term rentals and second homes. More information on the modeling was added to Ch.1. The State laws that limit the ability of the City to adopt inclusionary zoning or manage second homes are outside the scope of the plan.
ON267	Bruce Edward Fox	Would be valuable to clarify differences between "infill growth" and "Incremental increases in density"	"Incremental increases in density can also support a greater diversity of housing..."	1-10	This section was rewritten.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON288	Michele James	The last part of this sentence is too optimistic. I suggest just indicating that solutions to address climate change impacts may change over the life of the RP. We cannot count on technology to solve all the impacts.	"It recognizes the need for flexibility as the availability of resources and technical solutions to climate change may change and will hopefully improve over time"	1-10	This section was rewritten.
ON472	Sara Sprague	Not too much time for hoping, yet we need action, especially climate action now.	"It recognizes the need for flexibility as the availability of resources and technical solutions to climate change may change and will hopefully improve over time."	1-10	This section was rewritten.
ON473	Sara Sprague	Too vague	"It recognizes the need for flexibility as the availability of resources and technical solutions to climate change may change and will hopefully improve over time."	1-10	This section was rewritten.
ON666	Peggy Chaikin	Perhaps a better term than solutions would be adaptations to reduce the city's contribution to the heat inducing carbon. Flagstaff is a leader in generating a plan for carbon reduction. Flagstaff has done more than hope for "solutions", it has set out goals that do not rely on technical fixes., but rather the collective will to implement its plan.	"It recognizes the need for flexibility as the availability of resources and technical solutions to climate change may change and will hopefully improve over time."	1-10	This section was rewritten.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON475	Sara Sprague	This makes me wonder how serious all of this in regards to unprecedented climate change and how Flagstaff will be directly impacted, and already is...	"It recognizes the need for flexibility as the availability of resources and technical solutions to climate change may change and will hopefully improve over time." - Reply to ON472	1-10	A Climate Emergency call out box was added with more specifics on climate impacts.
ON1193	Nat	Is not new housing keeping up with Flagstaff's actual permanent population growth but not keeping up with external investors, second homes, vacation rentals, and other vacant homes not for sale? There should be references to actual Flagstaff data that support or not support this statement.	"Population growth could also exacerbate the current state of unaffordable housing if housing supply does not increase proportionately to growth."	1-10	Our scenario planning modeling indicated that building a larger share of multifamily housing could lead to a 20% reduction in housing costs, factoring in short-term rentals and second homes. More information on the modeling was added to Ch.1. Data that shows "keeping up" does not take into account a shortage that has built up over 30 years as described in the 10 year housing plan.
ON289	Michele James	The Regional Plan's goals need to be much larger and focus on healthy community and ecosystem.	"The Regional Plan's goals and policies aim to address the climate crisis by identifying positive structural changes to ..."	1-10	The priorities were revised and ranked, with Climate Action as a core priority and Natural and Cultural Resources as a complementary priority. The goals and policies were reorganized under the priorities to emphasize their connection to the priorities.
ON716	Laura Huenneke	Improving resilience = adaptation, and this term should be used. Nothing in this paragraph speaks to climate change mitigation, though, which is the other crucial way of addressing the climate change crisis. Given that Flagstaff does have a Carbon Neutrality Plan, and given that in most crises the most urgent step is to take action to keep things from getting worse, this paragraph ought to have a sentence about Flagstaff also valuing (and having made a commitment to) the mitigation of climate change by planning to reduce greenhouse gas emissions.	"The Regional Plan's goals and policies aim to address the climate crisis by identifying positive structural changes to ..."	1-10	This section was rewritten and a call-out box was added on the Climate Emergency and Carbon Neutrality Plan.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON721	Emily	I wish this sentence also said something about mitigation of climate change.	"The Regional Plan's goals and policies aim to address the climate crisis by identifying positive structural changes to ..."	1-10	This section was rewritten
ON365	Sat Best	insert "ecosystem conservation"	"The Regional Plan's goals and policies aim to address the climate crisis by identifying positive structural changes to the built environment..."	1-10	This section was rewritten.
ON474	Sara Sprague	What does this mean?	"The Regional Plan's goals and policies aim to address the climate crisis by identifying positive structural changes to the built environment..."	1-10	This section was rewritten.
L152	Equity Climate Advisory Group	Shift of language: "The Regional Plan's goals and policies aim to address the climate crisis by identifying positive structural changes to the built environment, transportation systems, and social infrastructure." Following this under the title "The Focus on the Regional Plan" 3 of the 5 bullets (and expanded explanation of bullets) address climate while it seems the other goals are lacking focus. Bring more focus to the social issues that need improvements.	"The Regional Plan's goals and policies aim to address the climate crisis..."	1-10	This section and the priorities were rewritten. "A healthy economy" is a newly added priority.
ON902	Beck Thomas	Taken incorrectly from 10-year housing plan. Verbiage to match would be "The Phoenix area—one of the country's fastest-growing and largest metro areas..." which is an accurate statement as opposed to what was transcribed to this regional plan.	"The Region's proximity to Phoenix, the nation's largest and fastest-growing metropolitan area from 2010 to 2020..."	1-10	This section was rewritten.
ON269	Bruce Edward Fox	help address.....	throughout planning guided by the goals and policies of this Regional Plan can address the potential consequences of ongoing growth..."	1-10	This section was rewritten.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON32	Tyler	"can capitalize on the opportunities growth provides while addressing the potential consequences"	"Thoughtful planning guided by the goals and policies of this Regional Plan can address the potential consequences of ongoing growth..."	1-10	This section was rewritten.
ON286	Michele James	Start with this at beginning and remove the emphasis on growth. The #1 top goal of the RP should be planning for healthy community as stated in the blue highlighted text! After an explanation of why this is the top goal of the RP, outline the challenges (bullet points) to achieve this goal.	"Underlying the Regional Plan is the basic principle that a healthy natural environment is necessary for a healthy and prosperous human community and economy."	1-10	This section was rewritten and a Climate Emergency call out box now precedes the Growth section.
ON783	Celia Barotz	I feel like this language is awkward. Doesn't a human community include the economy? Is this the vision? If so, perhaps consider saying something like the vision for the Flagstaff region is one that includes a healthy and prosperous human community and a healthy natural environment. (Prosperous captures the economic angle.) There are definitely other ways to say this.	"Underlying the Regional Plan is the basic principle that a healthy natural environment is necessary for a healthy and prosperous human community and economy."	1-10	This section was rewritten.
ON18	Marie Jones	Not a complete sentence—insert “climate change” or “it” before “will increase”	"When combined with other negative impacts, will increase stress..."	1-10	This section was rewritten.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON471	Sara Sprague	How will the community voice be uplifted in the of urbanization? What do each of our communities really want when it comes to housing options?	... "it provides direction to avoid or reduce the negative impacts and optimize the positive affects to the benefit of everyone."	1-10	The plan's focus on housing reflects what staff has heard from numerous community engagement initiatives, summarized in the new Public Participation Summary in the Appendix. The Ch. 5 section on neighborhood planning describes one pathway by which community voices can shape how a neighborhood develops over time.
L178	Equity Climate Advisory Group	<p>"The Regional Plan's goals and policies aim to address the climate crisis by identifying positive structural changes to the built environment, transportation systems, and social infrastructure.."</p> <p>This all seems vague, what does "build environment" mean? What is a positive structure change? Why is food security not included in this concern? The language following this uses words like "hopefully" and "may change." I argue that even with the concerns, we need direct action and strategies, not solely hope.</p>	"The Regional Plan's goals and policies aim to address the climate crisis by identifying positive structural changes to the built environment, transportation systems, and social infrastructure.."	1-10	This section was rewritten. "Built environment" is in the glossary. A new priority was added--"a healthy economy," which covers food security.
ON27	Osman Werner	<p>Overall, the committee did a fantastic job drafting the regional plan. However, I have a couple of questions regarding Flagstaff's future goals.</p> <p>How much of the spike in poverty rates in the city and county is due to ramifications from Covid, rather than the community's current state? Have poverty rates started to decrease as the region returns to 'normal?' Or, is there a larger problem (i.e., housing attainability) that needs to be addressed?</p> <p>Additionally, how will food insecurity be resolved? How strong or weak are the region's numbers compared to the rest of the state and nation?</p> <p>Finally, how will these plans target equity and sustainability?</p>	Chapter 1	1-10	The data for median income and unemployment came from the ACS 5-year data sets so any covid-related rebounds would not yet be showing in that data. Housing data does indicate that housing attainability is a larger problem, and the City's Ten-Year Housing Plan is a good source for a deeper dive. The plan discusses food insecurity in Ch.5 and the City is developing a Food Action Plan separate from the Regional Plan. Climate action was made a core priority of the plan and equity was added to the housing priority.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
CM40	Commission on Inclusion & Adaptive Living	within “the Focus of the Plan” the CIAL would recommend the plan to state ”...the regional plan reflects the desire to support inclusivity, accessibility, and sustainability...”. This addition of the word “accessibility” at the start of the plan is an important change in the plan’s focus, a change that informs of the needs of the disability community right at the start of the plan.	Plan priorities	1-10	While accessibility is important, these words were chosen based on community feedback gathered at engagement events.
IP140	NULL	Prioritize social and environmental justice in land use planning to center historically marginalized populations in decision-making	Plan Priorities	1-10	This section was substantially revised. Equity was added to the housing priority. These ideas also come up in policies on Natural and Cultural Resources (3-13), the neighborhood planning section (5-12), and Ch.7 action items (7-12).
IP141	NULL	I agree w/this... Some sort of mention of variety of housing types for a variety of peoples + backgrounds	Plan Priorities	1-10	This section was substantially revised and includes more discussion of housing variety, with addition information in Ch.4.
IP142	NULL	Prioritize disabled access to public areas (level crosswalks, increased sidewalk infrastructure)	Plan Priorities	1-10	This is captured in the revised TS goal and policies and the Ch.6 action items.
IP143	NULL	Supporting denser housing is not a way to lower cost in Flagstaff’s unique position as a place to live but no jobs. It is an investment opportunity from the outside. Maybe in PHX where there are jobs more housing will reduce prices. Flagstaff as long it is beautiful, clean air, dark skies, and views + forest. It will be an investment opportunity .... of the housing cost. Just a thought	Plan Priorities	1-10	Our scenario planning modeling indicated that building a larger share of multifamily housing could lead to a 20% reduction in housing costs, factoring in short-term rentals and second homes. More information on the modeling was added to Ch.1.
IP44	NULL	Is this about gentrification	Plan Priorities	1-10	Yes, displacement is a result of gentrification.
IP45	NULL	Note: Not in priority order	Plan Priorities	1-10	The priorities were sorted into Core Priorities and Complementary Priorities and more information on priority rank was added to Ch.1 and Ch.3.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
IP46	NULL	Define "Climate Pollution" - Is it green house gases?	Plan Priorities	1-10	The priorities were revised and this phrase is no longer used in the plan.
IP47	NULL	Can just say wildfire	Plan Priorities	1-10	This section was substantially revised.
ON1198	Nat	Does 'more housing attainability' mean affordable or does it mean more choices or just more housing units? In all cases if they are external investment homes and often vacant and not available to locals why should it reduce housing costs.	Plan priorities	1-10	This priority was revised as "Housing attainability and equity."
ON1208	Nat	'Collective Community Input', as you know, is not driven by the general population but by the interested and not always informed public. Although not for a lack of Staff effort, I would hesitate to use the term 'the Regions highest priorities' and more 'an indication of areas of importance'.	Plan priorities	1-10	This is already acknowledged with the caveat: "The participants in this process identified the Region's highest priorities as..."
ON476	Sara Sprague	Why is hunger, food insecurity, and community food insecurity not a priority?	Plan priorities	1-10	"A health economy" is a new priority added with the intent of covering food insecurity and expansion of agriculture. A Food Action Plan is being developed separate form the Regional Plan.
ON672	Sat Best	The important question here is whether the supply and demand model is going to help our housing crisis. Supply is what we can build, and I think we're building as fast as we can now. Demand is local, plus 5 million people 2 hours away in the fastest growing county in the country (Maricopa), plus 5 million tourists a year. Building small units that can be snapped up for second homes or vacation rentals does not help local demand. See the housing definitions in the glossary on page G-3, and I suggest we put emphasis on the "affordable housing" solutions (subsidized) and "employee housing" solutions (available in connection with an employer). I know that's not what many want to hear, but that's the price we pay for living in a cool green jewel of a town just a few hours away from the Phoenix heat.	Plan priorities	1-10	Our scenario planning modeling indicated that building a larger share of multifamily housing could lead to a 20% reduction in housing costs, factoring in short-term rentals and second homes. More information on the modeling was added to Ch.1.
ON784	Celia Barotz	After reading this sentence several times, I've come to the conclusion that it doesn't really make sense. I think that creating more housing could actually lead to displacement. If the message is that the community wants to build more attainable housing, then perhaps you could say, "Build more attainable housing throughout the Region to address the housing shortage."	Plan priorities	1-10	The priority language was simplified - the housing priority became "Housing attainability and equity."

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON791	Celia Barotz	As a stylistic matter, I think it's better for the reader if you use numbers or letters in lists rather than symbols because it's hard to refer to something that is part of a long list other than to actually count down the list yourself and say that it is number 2 in the list. I'm not sure of the benefit of just using this symbol throughout the plan, especially in very long lists.	Plan priorities	1-10	These lists were replaced with a priorities graphic. Further discussion of the priorities was moved to Ch.3.
ON792	Celia Barotz	I recognize that they are in the glossary, but I suggest also including the housing definitions early in the plan since the words attainable and affordable are used frequently and are so central to the whole plan.	Plan priorities	1-10	In-text links have been added to housing terms, for easy access to the glossary definitions.
ON20	Celia Barotz	I suggest that the section entitled, The Focus of the Regional Plan, be highlighted and/or separated because this is critical information so it should stand out. I don't think having it start at the bottom of a page makes sense. Maybe you can put it on its own page with graphics and font size that helps the reader understand how important the section is.	Plan Priorities section	1-10	This page was reformatted and a graphic was added to highlight the priorities.
ON21	Celia Barotz	I suggest saying, "Create more attainable housing..." instead of create more housing attainability.	Plan Priorities section - "Create more housing attainability..."	1-10	The priority language was simplified.
ON292	Michele James	Move the discussion of the Focus of the RP to the beginning of the chapter. This is what residents need to read and understand. Modify and expand the Focus to prioritize a healthy community.	The Focus of the Regional Plan	1-10	The section remains at the end, but the chapter was revised to better introduce these priorities, which are discussed again in Ch.3.
L156	Equity Climate Advisory Group	There is a suggestion that an increase of density in housing options and growth will only make it more affordable to live in our region. If not held accountable, or without explicit policies and actions, this could be contradictory, as there are no regulations on capping the cost of rent or housing in our state legislature. How will housing become more affordable? How will this plan be accountable to vested interest in competition with affordability? How will the city ensure that people have secure, safe, and affordable housing when competing with vested interests of private apartment complexes or second home-owners? What actions and accountability will be implemented?	The Region's Future Uncertainties and Opportunities	1-10	Our scenario planning modeling indicated that building a larger share of multifamily housing could lead to a 20% reduction in housing costs, factoring in short-term rentals and second homes. More information on the modeling was added to Ch.1. The City and County do not have control over how many affordable units are available in the Region, but can work with and incentivize developers.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON282	Michele James	Why discuss pop growth first? It is unclear what the future will bring, with population growth, drought, wildfire, etc. It would be good to include bullet points of all the Uncertainties.	The Region's Future Uncertainties and Opportunities	1-10	This section was rewritten and reorganized. The Climate and Housing Emergencies now precede the Growth section.
ON283	Michele James	Migrations of wealthy people is already occurring and is expected to continue. This needs to be stated in the RP.	The Region's Future Uncertainties and Opportunities	1-10	The growth section was rewritten to focus more on the population data and projections.
ON310	Michele James	Invert these uncertainties and make into bullet points. Start with the Goal of a healthy community and healthy ecosystem.	The Region's Future Uncertainties and Opportunities	1-10	This section was rewritten and now begins with the Climate Emergency call-out box.
ON1192	Val	Phew, long sentence. Can it be broken up?	"Infrastructure priorities include replacing aging infrastructure, extending the life of the Cinder Lake Landfill....."	11-1	Edit made.
ON272	Bruce Edward Fox	and reduced wildfire hazard	"...numerous benefits, such as food and water, scenic beauty, recreational opportunities..."	1-11	This section was rewritten.
ON271	Bruce Edward Fox	We already have an attainable housing supply--if you are wealthy. Key here, it seems, is provide a stock of housing that is affordable to folks with widely--and wildly--disparate incomes.	"An attainable housing supply will lower transportation costs and climate pollution"	1-11	Correct, attainable housing is defined as being intended for the general population, is nonsubsidized, and has no eligibility requirements to purchase or rent.
ON270	Bruce Edward Fox	in this context, how is this word defined?	"Expand the Region's preparedness and resilience to hazards..."	1-11	"Preparedness" and "resilience" are entries in the glossary. In-text links have been added.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON1037	Nick Zachary	As decentralized food production becomes more important for every community, consider community agricultural spaces to enhance all the desired outcomes here: less transportation OF food and FOR food, more green spaces, higher quality of life.	"Natural resources support the Region's resilience to climate change and other risks"	1-11	This section was rewritten. Urban agriculture is discussed in Ch.5.
ON273	Bruce Edward Fox	between and among which entities?	"Success requires dedication, collaboration, and a focus on the sustainable, lasting solutions."	1-11	It depends on each goal and project. Chapters 5-11 and particularly the action items in these chapters offer more specifics on collaboration.
ON479	Sara Sprague	Need to include equity and inclusivity!	"Success requires dedication, collaboration, and a focus on the sustainable, lasting solutions."	1-11	Equity was added to the housing priority.
ON669	Peggy Chaikin	I would use the term "long range strategies"	"Success requires dedication, collaboration, and a focus on the sustainable, lasting solutions."	1-11	Edit made.
ON308	Michele James	It means changing how the Region grows, especially within the City.	Next Steps	1-11	No change, this point is made in Ch.3 and Ch.4.
CM117	Sustainability Commission	1. While the language of carbon neutrality seems strong, it would be strengthened with adding the date of 2030. I do not necessarily think that this date is a required achievement, but adding the date helps to 1) align with the Flagstaff Carbon Neutrality Plan, and 2) add a concrete timeline of ideal sustainable action. I would also like to see examples of benchmarks that mark progress. 2. I think net zero should be included on some level. Again, I do not see this as a requirement, but adding strong goals like this makes significant action seem more likely.	Plan priorities	1-11	See additional explanation of what the plan is not on page 2-1. See page 10-7 for actions items related to net zero buildings

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
CM118	Sustainability Commission	Chapter 1 - The Focus of the Regional Plan, p1-10: strengthen (bold text) the third priority "Reduce community-generated climate pollution and protect air quality"	Plan priorities	1-11	Priorities were reworded, simplified, and sorted in to "core" and "complementary" priorities. Climate action became a core priority.
CM119	Sustainability Commission	suggestion 1: "Reduce community-generated climate pollution to net-zero and protect air quality"	Plan priorities	1-11	Priorities were reworded and simplified. Climate action is a core priority.
CM120	Sustainability Commission	suggestion 2: "Achieve carbon neutrality by 2030" (though if the regional planning committee nixed "2030" in the CA goals, I can't imagine they'll accept this language here)	Plan priorities	1-11	A call-out box was added in Ch.1 on the Carbon Neutrality Plan. See additional explanation of what the plan is not on page 2-1.
CM155	Sustainability Commission	Clearly identify and describe Plan Priorities. The Plan Priorities on pages 1-10 and 1-11 are the overarching guidelines for the Plan. However, they are buried in the introduction and their relationship to the vision, themes, goals and policies is unclear. As previously stated, we encourage moving the Priorities to Chapter 3 to articulate the relationship between the priorities, objectives, goals, and policies. We strongly recommend including a figure illustrating how the vision, themes, priorities, objectives, goals, and policies relate to and inform one another.	Plan Priorities	1-11	Ch.1 was revised to better introduce the priorities, a priorities graphic was added, and discussion of the priorities was moved to Ch.3. Goals and policies were reorganized under the priorities to better connect the two.
CM156	Sustainability Commission	Include additional important attributes of the Flagstaff community in the Priorities, such as economic vitality, public health, and quality of life, among others. We recommend adding an additional priority such as "Improve economic vibrancy, climate resilience, and community health."	Plan Priorities	1-11	Added "a healthy economy" priority and updated resilience priority to "resilient public services and facilities."
CM157	Sustainability Commission	Clearly state the Plan's objectives and how they relate to or differ from the priorities.	Plan Priorities	1-11	The mention of objectives was removed.
L145	Equity Climate Advisory Group	"An attainable housing supply will lower transportation costs and climate pollution: By taking action to catch up on unmet housing demand, the Region can improve housing affordability, lower costs, and meet its climate action goals." Assuming "attainable" is defined simplest by affordability, which claims that the supply-and-demand model will guarantee greater affordability, when the reality that within the lived experiences of the advisory committee suggests any affordable housing is immediately bought up by investors for Air BnB's or outrageously priced rentals. Questions to consider are: Is there any existing or proposed policy to regulate investors outpricing local residents from living in their own town? Is there any acknowledgment to gentrification of neighborhoods?	Plan Priorities	1-11	Goals HA and NE and associated policies related to gentrification. Gentrification and displacement are discussed in Ch.4 and Ch.5. See also, Ch. 5 action items.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
L154	Equity Climate Advisory Group	“Reduce community-generated climate pollution and protect air quality.” Suggestion to propose policies that are directed at large corporations regarding carbon emissions (whether to incentivize or punish). Current social practice is to default majority blame on individuals as opposed to addressing corporate climate practices. Individuals/consumers are disproportionately blamed for realistic climate impact.	Plan Priorities	1-11	An action item was added in Ch.7 about reducing industrial carbon emissions. The Regional Plan has no impact on large corporations unless they are requesting a discretionary land use decision.
L179	Equity Climate Advisory Group	The priority areas seem to focus a lot on continuing the development of housing that is not centered on community needs in the lens of equity. The first bullet point demonstrates the connection between housing concerns, transportation, and climate pollution, while also tying in jobs. The Community Food Systems Assessment, and the Food Bank’s recent research unveils how the cost of food competes with the cost of living, when these two should not compete against one another. I believe it is imperative to include urban agriculture and conversations about food security, which can be connected more to access to healthy foods, economic development, and affordable housing. Both housing and food systems should have more overlap and correlation, especially in the eyes of a changing climate. Why not bolster our urban agriculture and food system in an equitable lens (along with transportation, housing, jobs) in the face of all these uncertainties? There should be more recognition for the people who are currently growing under these conditions and uplifted as an example about what is possible and provide an avenue for the many folks interested in engaging in this discourse and practice. Within the “next steps” section, equity and inclusion need to be included. I do not see any mention of either at all within this section.	Plan Priorities	1-11	Equity was added to the housing priority. Food insecurity did not emerge as a top priority from the community engagement feedback staff gathered. Ch.5 discusses how the cost of housing and food contribute to a high cost of living.
ON450	Alexander Shen kin	again, not just reduce, but achieve carbon neutrality by 2030.	Plan priorities	1-11	A call-out box was added in Ch.1 on the Carbon Neutrality Plan. See additional explanation of what the plan is not on page 2-1.
ON477	Sara Sprague	Why is the nexus of urban agriculture not mentioned here? There is a direct link between housing price, cost of food, transportation, and climate pollution.	Plan priorities	1-11	This is discussed in Ch. 5.
ON667	Peggy Chaikin	Why not just say, air quality, drought, fire and heat instead of "hazards"? these are easily understood, real threats the whole community can embrace and work on.	Plan Priorities	1-11	The priorities were rewritten and simplified.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON668	Peggy Chaikin	I'd use fire, drought, heat, air quality instead of Climate change in this sentence. The term Climate Change in this context masks the threats that all community members can work on and is redundant if the real threats are listed.	Plan Priorities	1-11	The priorities were rewritten and simplified.
ON682	Nicole Walker	Private equity companies and second-home buyers drive up the cost of housing. Homes without year-round residents should pay a tax to both offset new home building and to disincentivize short-term rentals. Short-term rentals also fracture and destabilize community.	Plan priorities	1-11	Taxation rates are outside the scope of the Regional Plan. Second homes are discussed in Ch.5 and there is an action item on lobbying for greater control of rentals.
ON683	Nicole Walker	Continuing to develop over open spaces leads to habitat loss, extreme water usage, and diminished quality of life. Environmental quality supersedes development needs.	Plan priorities	1-11	The priorities have been revised. "Housing attainability..." is a core priority and "Natural and cultural resources" is a complementary priority. The balance between them is captured in policies and guidelines. See DP.4, OS.2, and page 4-14.
ON723	Emily	I have a planning degree and understand mixed-use very well. From my research, I have come to favor mixed use that has a food service component to be most successful in reducing VMT. Having a bunch of businesses nearby that people don't regularly use doesn't really meet the potential of mixed use.	Plan priorities	1-11	The plan does not limit the types of mixed-use that are supported. "Food-related retail" was added as an example of Neighborhood Commercial on p. 4-28.
ON793	Celia Barotz	Please consider including some information about the benefits of density such as it provides a stronger social fabric, and it encourages neighborliness, conviviality, and can enhance the sense of safety and well being. It can also help alleviate the feeling of social isolation.	Plan priorities	1-11	New sections on Smart Growth (1-9) and Scenario Planning (1-11) speak to this.
ON993	Zenya Ledermann	Local food production and equitable access should be incorporated into these priorities.	Plan priorities	1-11	A new priority was added for "a healthy economy" which includes food insecurity and agriculture.
ON994	Zenya Ledermann	Green spaces should be incorporated into neighborhood planning for improved quality of life. This could be anything from gardens, trees, parks, or sanctuary areas	Plan priorities	1-11	See PROS policies in Ch.3 and guidelines in Ch.4 for centers, parks and open spaces, and neighborhoods.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON1214	Nat	Please reference Flagstaff specific data that supports objectives 1, 2, & 3. Someone must have researched it carefully to base our Regional Plan on these statements. What might be defensible objectives in Phoenix, is probably not for a small college town in an environmentally desirable place. What percentage of our housing units are vacant more than say half the time, what percentage of the detached houses built in the last five years are owned by Flagstaff residents, what are the most desirable living units for Flagstaff residents, what is the dollar goal which would make housing affordable for a Flagstaff resident, is there a relation between student housing an general cost of housing, are their specific ways housing costs can be addresses for teachers, service, and civil employees?	Plan priorities	1-11	This section was rewritten. The scenario planning modeling supports these statements and more information on the modeling was added to Ch.1. Housing data was also added to Ch.4 and Ch.5.
ON717	Laura Huenneke	Nice summary - these five points do a good job of explaining the links among these recommendations and their outcomes.	Plan priorities	1-11	This section was rewritten.
ON290	Michele James	This should read "climate change IMPACTS."	Plan priorities - "Expand the Region's preparedness and resilience to hazards and climate change"	1-11	Priorities have been rewritten and simplified.
ON758	Val Bryant	, sustainability,	Plan priorities - By taking action to catch up on unmet housing demand....	1-11	The priorities were revised to be simpler.
ON759	Val Bryant	add "sustainability"	Plan priorities - By taking action to catch up on unmet housing demand.....	1-11	The priorities were revised to be simpler.
ON786	Celia Barotz	I think this assumption is debatable. There well recognized housing experts who say that just building more housing will not address the need for 'affordable' or subsidized housing. I also wonder why the paragraph says 'improve housing affordability, lower costs...' Isn't saying lower costs the same as saying improve housing affordability?	Plan priorities - By taking action to catch up on unmet housing demand.....	1-11	This section was rewritten. The scenario planning modeling supports this statements and more information on the modeling was added to Ch.1.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON785	Celia Barotz	I suggest deleting this sentence. It doesn't really add much and feels a little repetitive.	Plan priorities - By working together, these priorities can help achieve the Regional Plan's goals if the Region is open to trying new solutions for old problems.	1-11	Edit made. This section was revised.
ON899	Heather	Working together with who?	Plan priorities - By working together, these priorities can help achieve the Regional Plan's goals if the Region is open to trying new solutions for old problems.	1-11	This section was revised.
ON787	Celia Barotz	I'm not sure this is true if at the same time Flagstaff increases density we see huge greenfield low density developments. Can you explain?	Plan priorities - Creating dense neighborhoods provides more housing using less land, reduces sprawl, and protects water quantity and quality.	1-11	This section was revised. See page 1-9 for a new section on smart growth. The plan cannot influence development that occurs under existing entitlements. The Suburban Neighborhood category and approach to density has been revised.
ON789	Celia Barotz	I think it would be helpful to explain somewhere in this section why this is an underlying assumption of the plan since more density doesn't ensure that the community will see more 'affordable' or subsidized housing. Also, maybe rather than saying density is essential... you could say that it is the hope that it will result in more housing that is attainable (but likely not 'affordable'.)	Plan priorities - Denser, mixed-use neighborhood with many housing types are essential to creating availability and reducing housing costs.	1-11	The scenario planning modeling supports this assumption and more information on the modeling was added to Ch.1.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON790	Celia Barotz	I suggest taking out 'work together' and instead say something like, "Here's how these priorities can help achieve the Regional Plan's objectives."	Plan priorities - Here's how these priorities can work together to meet the Regional Plan's objectives.	1-11	This section was revised.
ON673	Sat Best	This is in conflict with the fact that Council recently re-zoned all City parks and open space for multi-family residential.	Plan priorities - It also creates opportunities for health-providing amenities like parks and open space...	1-11	The City made "Employee Housing" a permitted use in the Public Facilities zone. Some parks and open space parcels are in this zone, while others are zoned POS. Many other parcels such as schools and city offices are zoned PF. Other types of residential development in the PF zone have to obtain a conditional use permit which is a public hearing process.
ON995	Zenya Ledermann	Is this only in regards to natural resource management? I would like to see more of an emphasis on how food fits into this section, outside of just mentioning the word.	Plan priorities - Natural resource management practices... numerous benefits, such as food and water...	1-11	This section was rewritten. Food systems are mentioned on p. 1-9 in the discussion of interrelated solutions to the housing and climate emergencies.
ON478	Sara Sprague	How is this defined and by who? Seems like this connotation serves housing interest over others... After attending city council meetings, it is becoming ever more clear that people do not want high-density housing.	Plan priorities - Projects and programs that improve the Region's "resilience" improve affordability and mitigate displacement	1-11	This section was rewritten.
ON996	Zenya Ledermann	There is no mention of affordability within this objective. If we are going to be talking about housing, affordability just be addressed. Furthermore, I see the need for food and agriculture as essential to community resilience and is not mentioned anywhere in these objectives, specifically #5.	Plan priorities - Projects and programs that improve the Region's resilience improve affordability and mitigate displacement	1-11	This section was rewritten.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON722	Emily	adding "for future generations" would make it more clear that protecting also means conserving natural resources.	Plan priorities - Protect the Region's significant natural and cultural resources	1-11	The priorities were revised to be simpler - "Natural and cultural resources."
ON788	Celia Barotz	I suggest deleting undertaking and replacing it with 'building.'	Plan priorities - Taking resilience measures, such as providing resilience hubs, thinning the forest, and undertaking flood control projects...	1-11	This section was revised.
ON674	Sat Best	This should be emphasized more. Forest thinning can control most of our flood control issues at a small fraction of the cost of flood mitigation.	Plan priorities - Taking resilience measures, such as providing resilience hubs, thinning the forest... can reduce the likelihood of widespread damage..."	1-11	This section was rewritten. Forest thinning is discussed in Ch.7 and Ch.11.
ON900	Heather	What does this mean?	Plan priorities - These types of neighborhoods... "increase active transportation"	1-11	This section was revised.
ON274	Bruce Edward Fox	resilience hub = ?	Plan priorities section	1-11	This section was rewritten. "Resilience hub" is defined in the glossary and in-text links have been added.
ON291	Michele James	Thinning of forests both within the Region and outside the Region in upstream portions of the watershed is needed.	Plan priorities section	1-11	Thinning is further discussed in Ch.7 and Ch.11.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON33	Celia Barotz	I suggest saying, "Increase the Region's preparedness..." instead of expand the Region's preparedness.	Plan Priorities section - "Expand the Region's preparedness..."	1-11	The priorities were rewritten and simplified.
ON1059	Krista Ames-Cook	The text in this infographic is not legible. I'm on a desktop and cannot read the information. Please improve the quality of the text so it can be read.	Figure 11-4	11-10	This graphic was replaced with a call-out box.
ON1200	Laura Huenneke	adequate WATER flow????	"Ensuring that adequate fire flow is available from hydrants is an important component of fire suppression."	11-11	"Fire flow" is the correct term and is in the glossary.
ON592	Ben Ruddell	These measures are a good start but are insufficient. How will the plan get the rest of the work on floodplain management, protection, wildfire mitigation accomplished?	"In total, the District has invested over \$100 million to reduce the threat to lives, public infrastructure, and private property created by devastating flash flooding resulting from catastrophic wildfires"	11-12	The Regional Plan provides direction, but is not intended to be a strategic plan, budget, or set a work program. See page 2-1 for what the plan is not.
ON868	Paul Beier	The last sentence in this box is incorrect in using the term "essential."  Yes the project will promote growth and flood resilience, but it is not "essential" for City growth and not "essential" for resilience to flooding. Over the last 30 years the City could have devised flood control projects that would have been just as effective at a fraction of the cost of the plan City Council adopted in 2019. I suggest changing this to "The Rio de Flag Flood Control Project will help promote growth in Downtown and Southside and will help make these areas resilient to post-wildfire flooding."	Rio de Flag Flood Control Project call out box	11-15	No change. The RDF Project is "essential" for removing the FEMA floodplain in parts of Downtown and Southside, which impacts both patterns of growth, the ability of homeowners to invest in their property and resilience to flooding in the Southside.
L10	Kathy Flaccus	"I did post a suggestion about the Rio de Flag in the Resource Stewardship section, and I am not sure if I got it in the right place. I think how the City plans for the section of the Rio downstream from the I40 Wetlands will be extremely important in the FUTS, habitat protection, parks, open space, and as water conveyance for flooding. I just wasn't sure where to put all that in the plan - it seemed to fit in many places and I don't want to be redundant"	Rio de Flag Flood Control Project, referencing ON454	11-15	That is not part of the Rio de Flag Flood Control project, but is being addressed in the ongoing JW Powell Specific Plan.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON593	Ben Ruddell	The region's tech economy won't take off until we have serious internet backbone service. Who is going to build it?	Broadband Internet	11-16	There are City and County plans to improve broadband and both work with franchise utilities on their plans.
ON231	Dana	What are concrete objective a measurable plan?	Chapter 2 / Appendix A (but placed on Map 11-4)	11-17	See Appendix A for annual reporting on implementation of the plan.
ON232	Dana	My understanding is that construction waste has significantly contributed to the acceleration of end of life for the landfill. What's the plan?	"In 2019, shifts in the global recycling and waste markets sent the US recycling industry in flux."	11-18	One of the Ch.11 action items speaks to waste reduction in construction. The specific strategies are best addressed in a strategic plan.
ON1217	Val	More and constant public information is ALWAYS necessary here. Sorry to say but educating the public is HARD!	"To extend the life of the landfill even further, efforts to improve waste prevention and diversion in the Region continue."	11-18	This objective is captured in one of the Ch.11 action items.
ON1218	Val	More and constant public education is always needed here. Sorry to say, but education the public is hard.	"To extend the life of the landfill even further, efforts to improve waste prevention and diversion in the Region continue."	11-18	This objective is captured in one of the Ch.11 action items.
ON1202	Laura Huenneke	This chapter has great discussions of risks and these are very good recommendations for appropriate implementation steps. My main suggestion is to include some cross-references to this chapter in some of the earlier chapters (for people like me who read through in order and begin thinking about these risks in earlier topic chapters).	IPS Implementation Guidelines	11-18	Cross-references were added throughout the document.
ON1268	Nancy Branham	We need to do a better job of recycling plastic using as an example of what Tucson has done with City of Tucson's Orange Bin or Hard to Recycle Plastics Program. Also research the ByFusion company that makes building blocks from hard to recycle plastics. Art Babbott has built home here in Flagstaff using this product.	Solid Waste	11-18	This is outside the scope of the Regional Plan. One of the Ch.11 action items speaks to expanding waste reduction strategies.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON1219	Val	GREAT idea!!	"Contact Neighborhood Associations, Homeowners' Associations and neighborhood-based community organizations ....	11-19	This guideline was carried forward as a Ch.11 action item.
L30	ASLD (Rhonda Buss)	Not sure if 51 references ASLD or another State agency, so noting that ASLD does not have an office in Flagstaff if applicable.	Map 11-1	11-2	Edit made. The endnotes section changed as other sections were rewritten. Endnote references appear multiple times, where ever the reference applies. See the References section for a complete list of references.  Links are provided in the References section near the end of the plan.  This is referring to population projections. This section was rewritten.
ON711	Kolby White	This is cited on 10 and 13. should they be referenced once?	Chapter 1 Endnotes	1-12	
ON904	Heather	Provide links to docs	Chapter 1 Endnotes	1-12	
ON903	Heather	Estimates of what?	Chapter 1 Endnotes - "12. These estimates, from the Arizona Department of Commerce, represent a mid-level projection of growth."	1-12	

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON1220	Val	Nice!	"Update preparedness educational materials to ensure that the ongoing renewable energy transition is adequately reflected in instructions for sheltering in place, particularly for all-electric homes and other green building changes."	11-20	No change.
ON591	Ben Ruddell	The plan should consider how all regional public facilities and safety agencies can function to support public safety and resilience during an emergency. What will we do if 5 million people evacuate LA, Phoenix, Las Vegas and 500,000 of them end up here? (half at Ft Tuthill?) What will we do if a forest fire displaces a third of the city's residents on the west side? What if there are power outages that cut off water in all of the region's communities outside Flagstaff, and reduce our supply in Flagstaff? What if the Rio de Flag finally floods and takes out the downtown and university districts? What if there's another pandemic (a much worse pandemic)? What if there is a chemical train derailment downtown? Or- God forbid- a nuclear war or merely a major war that hits close to home? Someday most of these things will likely happen. Flagstaff is the regional hub for Northern Arizona and for a very large county, and therefore has the responsibility to consider and plan for this sort of contingency in a regional plan.	"The City and County work together to develop the Multi-Jurisdictional Hazard Mitigation Plan (MJHMP) every five years and uphold jurisdictional Emergency Operations Plans, which delineate the roles and responsibilities of City and County departments in all emergency management phases."	11-3	These topics are covered in the Multijurisdictional Hazard Mitigation Plan which is introduced on p. 11-3.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON595	Ben Ruddell	Reply to ON591 Also- public safety. What do we plan to do when our few-hundred public safety officers are insufficient to manage a crisis? Do we have a backup plan? Where is the extra manpower going to come from?	"The City and County work together to develop the Multi-Jurisdictional Hazard Mitigation Plan (MJHMP) every five years and uphold jurisdictional Emergency Operations Plans, which delineate the roles and responsibilities of City and County departments in all emergency management phases."	11-3	These topics are covered in the Multijurisdictional Hazard Mitigation Plan which is introduced on p. 11-3.
ON594	Ben Ruddell	The next three pages are a good overview of routine emergency response- something for which the region is well prepared- but they do not address my concerns about catastrophes expressed in the comment above. If the community doesn't plan the capacity to manage a large number of displaced people (for example), we won't be able to handle real catastrophes.	Public Safety and Emergency Services	11-4	These topics are covered in the Multijurisdictional Hazard Mitigation Plan which is introduced on p. 11-3.
ON1055	Krista Ames-Cook	This map should be a high resolution, so it is clearer.	Map 11-2	11-7	Edit made.
ON1197	Laura Huenneke	After the Paradise (CA) fire catastrophe, I read that Flagstaff is rated as one of the highest risk metro areas in the country for limits on evacuation routes. Is this something that Emergency Managers in the Region are working on? Is it a result of capacity limitations on vehicle routes, or some other consideration? In addition to the evacuation zones and the emergency notification efforts (which have been excellent), what might be done to improve this situation?	Emergency Communications and Evacuation Routes	11-8	There are two action items in this chapter that speak to improving evacuation. One is about creating and updating community-level evacuation plans for rural areas and one is about supporting neighborhoods in setting up agreements for secondary access.
W77	Commission on Inclusion & Adaptive Living	Concern about evacuation programs to assist disabled (Sara brought it up that that is addressed in a different type of plan by the County)	Emergency Communications and Evacuation Routes	11-8	These topics are covered in the Multijurisdictional Hazard Mitigation Plan which is introduced on p. 11-3.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON1199	Laura Huenneke	These Resilience Hubs are a great concept and the County should catch up with the City in encouraging their development. Safe air, potential to serve as warming centers in winter and cooling centers in heat waves, provision of emergency power (charging) and emergency communications - so many reasons to pursue these and encourage their development in communities and neighborhoods.	"The City is supporting community-led Resilience Hubs that will serve neighbors daily as gathering spaces and serve as safe locations with healthy air and power during smoke events and other incidents."	11-9	One of the Ch.11 action items speaks to creating and supporting resilience hubs. A similar concept is proposed in the Coconino County Comprehensive Plan.
ON1056	Krista Ames-Cook	This image / graphic is not legible. None of the titles are readable except for the center.	Figure 11-2	11-9	Edit made.
ON306	Crystal	I am on a desktop and this graphic is blurry and almost unreadable.	Figure 11-2	11-9	Edit made.
ON1209	Val	It is also somewhat fuzzy in the print version.	Figure 11-2, reply to ON1056	11-9	Edit made.
ON294	Michele James	This map needs to be edited to improve understanding as many reviewers I've spoken with who are not familiar with the boundaries of the "Region" find it confusing. Suggestions: the RP Region (shaded light grey) should be surrounded by a bolder border and the surrounding County lands should be removed along with the outer green border. The light colored line with the larger grey boundary indicates the boundaries of the City of Flagstaff; clarify this in the legend so as not to confuse this with the Urban Growth Boundary. In the smaller inset map of the entire County, include the boundaries of the RP "Region" itself.	Map 1-1	1-2	This map was updated to be simpler and clearer.
ON11	Kim Austin	earlier you mentioned using MetroPlan boundaries for the region, but here you mention FMPO.	"The Flagstaff Region (Information Map 1-1) uses the Flagstaff Metropolitan Planning Organization's (FMPO) boundaries..."	1-3	Edited to MetroPlan.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON301	Michele James	Include definitions of "entitlements," "dedications," and abandonments."	"The left side of the pyramid demonstrates the more flexible approach... when making decisions that do not directly involve entitlements, dedications, or abandonments."	1-3	A link to the glossary definition of entitlements was added. Dedications and abandonments were not added as they do not have a standard legal definition.
ON295	Michele James	Agree with Erin Young's comment to include the Water Resources Plan in this list as many don't even know it exists and it provides much of the detail that will influence water management within the city.	Planning Pyramid	1-3	No change. These are meant to be examples, not an exhaustive list.
ON298	Michele James	We suggest simplifying the language in this illustration as it contains a lot of planning terms and is difficult for the general public to understand. In places where such language is necessary, provide pop-up definitions for terms such as "entitlements," etc. If this Pyramid is primarily for use by staff, move it to an appendix and/or ADD another visual diagram that more simply explains the planning process. A linear diagram is recommended. This would allow more clarity	Planning Pyramid	1-3	No change to the graphic. Added link to glossary definition of entitlements. Added a call-out box - "What is land use planning?"
ON266	Bruce Edward Fox	and Open Spaces?	Planning pyramid graphic	1-3	No change. These are meant to be examples, not an exhaustive list.
ON8	Christine	Suggest the term "focus" areas rather than "target" areas.	Planning pyramid graphic	1-3	No change to planning pyramid.
W1		Under Regional Plan in the base of the pyramid, add Implementation Guidelines to the left side and Goals and Policies to the right side	The Planning Pyramid	1-3	No change to planning pyramid.
ON1122	Erica Rackley	year?	Planning history timeline	1-4	Deleting timeline for space and clarity.
ON1123	Erica Rackley	Nope, sorry, my fault. Would love to be able to delete this comment.	Planning history timeline	1-4	Deleting timeline for space and clarity.
ON13	Michele James	Extend the timeline to include the Carbon Neutrality Plan and the 10-year Housing Plan.	Planning history timeline	1-4	Deleting timeline for space and clarity.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON490	David	This chart is hard to read. Why is this relevant?	Planning history timeline	1-4	Deleting timeline for space and clarity.
ON895	Heather	This chart is extremely difficult to read.	Planning history timeline	1-4	Deleting timeline for space and clarity.
ON394	Natalie Jacobs	Add - the Carbon Neutrality Plan was adopted in 2021 setting a goal of carbon neutrality by 2030. (The CNP should be part of this timeline considering the importance of the goals connectedness to the City's growth and community's resilience.)	Planning history timeline	1-5	Deleting timeline for space and clarity.
ON896	Heather	This chart doesn't appear to fit the page.	Planning history timeline	1-5	Deleting timeline for space and clarity.
ON309	Michele James	Change to "a collaborative vision for the character and quality of life."	"a collaborative community vision"	1-6	No change to this specific phrase, but revised this box and moved to Ch.2.
ON277	Sat Best	and implementation items	"a collection of goals and policies to achieve that vision."	1-6	The implementation guideline category was dissolved, so they are not included here. This chart was revised and moved to Ch.2.
ON941	Heather	Indigenous	"A quarter of the County's current population is Native American."	1-6	No change, consulted with the Indigenous Commission.
ON305	Michele James	Include how much of the Region's population is Native American.	"A quarter of the County's current population is Native American." (but placed in error on 4-10)	1-6	Demographic data is not available for the Region because the Region doesn't follow Census tract or block lines.
ON303	Michele James	Remove start of sentence "It is also important to note that"	"It is also important to note that each Nation has its own creation and emergence story about how they came to be in this area, and some are not compatible with Western viewpoints"	1-6	Edit made.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON304	Michele James	Why is this relevant? "and some are not compatible with western viewpoints." Remove.	"It is also important to note that each Nation has its own creation and emergence story about how they came to be in this area, and some are not compatible with Western viewpoints"	1-6	Edit made, consulted with the Indigenous Commission.
ON307	Michele James	This last sentence is condescending, old fashioned language. Move upward to previous paragraph and just state that the Region's heritage is reflected in our place names.	"Many local place names, such as Navajo Road, Sinagua Middle School, and Coconino High School, reflect indigenous heritage."	1-6	Edited "western viewpoints" sentence, but did not change next two sentences other than moving them up into the same paragraph. Consulted with the Indigenous Commission.
ON714	Laura Huenneke	"of"	"The 19th century development of railroads, timer extraction, milling, and ranching led to the establishment Flagstaff."	1-6	Edit made.
ON940	Heather	Why are the Nations referenced on page 1 not referenced here?	The Region's Shared History	1-6	The "Shared History" section was revised and moved closer to the "Community in a Sacred Landscape" section on page 1.
ON280	Sat Best	and now Navajo trust land at the former Horseman's Lodge Steakhouse site.	"...and County (1.1 percent City and County-owned land includes facilities, roads, streets..."	1-7	Added Navajo Nation and Hopi Tribe Trust Land to the description, new table, and map of land ownership.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON671	Sat Best	and open space	"...and County (1.1 percent City and County-owned land includes facilities, roads, streets..."	1-7	Edit made.
ON16	Jenny	What's the population growth estimates from 2020-2024? Colloquially we felt the influx of folks moving here during the pandemic, and the housing market reflected this. My family personally moved to Flagstaff this year for the lifestyle after living in CO, CA and New Zealand.	"As of 2020, more than 97,000 people live in the Region, and 76,960 of those residents live in the City."	1-7	At the time that data was being prepared for this plan and it's population projections and modeling, the 2020 Census was the most standard and reliable data point to use.
ON276	Michele James	Last sentence of this paragraph: This indicates implicit growth and development which is not the full range of what could take place on State land. These could also not be developed. This should be said differently: Remove "encourage and supported" and state "The RP can influence what happens on the 12.6 and 5.9%."	"These are areas of the Region where private development can be encouraged and supported by the Regional Plan's goals and policies."	1-7	Edit made.
ON700	Kim	This formulation advocates for private development which has been inadequate at responding to the community's most important housing needs. We need more options. Don't push them out of the picture. For example, the city could float a bond to buy state trust land and build workforce housing on it. Given how cramped the options are for actually getting attainable housing for middle to lower income residents, we need all options on the table.	"These are the areas of the Region where private development can be encouraged and supported by the Regional Plan's goals and policies."	1-7	Ch.5 action items speak to identifying and securing funding for affordable housing. It is a higher priority for the City to develop the many parcels we have already acquired for affordable housing that are not yet developed. The 10 Year Housing Plan did not include acquisition but no policies preclude it. The policies as written could support acquisition if that changes in the future.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON756	Val Bryant	<p>These videos are quite informative. Thank you especially for the "Climate Change and Energy" videos. We need more of this planning info. and verbiage mentioned throughout the plan, esp. in the Transportation, buildings/housing and land development areas.</p> <p>The county seems to be more involved than the city, although the city is within the county.</p>	Regional Snapshots call out box	1-7	We are glad to hear that you found them informative.
L85	Karen Enyedy	<p>"The remaining 81.5 percent of the Region is public land that is not required to conform to the Regional Plan. It is owned by the federal government for conservation, natural resource management, or military operations (78.3 percent); state agencies, such as the Arizona Board of Regents, and <u>Navajo Nation (13.8 acres)</u>, the Arizona Department of Game and Fish (0.3 percent); the City (1.8 percent); and County (1.1 percent). City and County-owned land includes facilities, roads, streets, alleys, sidewalks, drainage, stormwater collection, parks, the FUTS, and public access to the Coconino National Forest. Although federal and state government agencies might refer to the Regional Plan for guidance and coordination, only the City and County are mandated to follow the plan's direction."</p>	The Region's Vibrant Present	1-7	Added Navajo Nation and Hopi Tribe Trust Land to the description, new table, and map of land ownership.
ON275	Michele James	<p>Include the acres of land within the Region, not only the percentages. This allows a better understanding. Also include acres that are considered "greenfield."</p>	The Region's Vibrant Present	1-7	Added acreage stats. Greenfield acreage was not added as it is not an ownership category. The LASS goes into detail on land available for development.
ON715	Laura Huenneke	<p>This discussion of ownership reflects no tribal land holdings, and of course no reservation land lies within this boundary. But tribes do hold some of the "private" land (as fee simple ownership, correct?). Given how much respect is paid in the plan to the cultural legacy and importance of native nations, perhaps you might add a sentence or two about the fact that at least a little of the private land in the region is held under tribal ownership.</p>	The Region's Vibrant Present	1-7	Added Navajo Nation and Hopi Tribe Trust Land to the description, new table, and map of land ownership.
ON1240	Nat	<p>If this map defines the term REGION, then it should be incorporated into the Map Title.</p>	Map 1-2	1-8	The map earlier in the chapter (Map 1-1) is meant to define the Region. That map was revised to be clearer. This map focuses on Land Ownership.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON278	Michele James	This paragraph seems to emphasize the fourth and fifth generation of white settlers, when there is so much more to the history and diversity in the Region. We suggest modifying the start of this paragraph to state "The Region is a diverse community made up of many Hispanic and Anglo, and Indigenous peoples. Although fourth and fifth generations exist, the majority are families and people who migrated..."	"The Region is a diverse community made up of fourth and fifth-generation families and people who migrated to the community later for jobs, recreation, and educational opportunities."	1-9	Revised sentence, included ethnic groups.
ON1242	Nat	insert 'as shown on the map'	"The Region is a diverse community..."	1-9	This section was revised and became an infographic.
ON345	Bruce	The word "significant" is used frequently in this plan in a variety of contexts. However, the word does not appear to be defined or explained anywhere. Thus, it could be interpreted very differently by different individuals. Given the frequency and importance of this word, I believe a definition/explanation is worthwhile	"The Region's beautiful landscapes, character... making the tourism industry a significant contributor to the Regional economy."	1-9	"Significant natural resources" is defined in the glossary. Otherwise, significant is not defined because it is used in multiple contexts. In this case, this sentence was deleted as the section was replaced with an infographic.
ON279	Michele James	It's more accurate to say "high cost of housing" rather than "rising cost of housing."	"The Region's economic challenges include income inequality, displacement pressure, food insecurity, and the rising cost of housing."	1-9	This section was replaced with an infographic.
ON17	Sara Sprague	How is this weighted? I think the economic disparities should not be taken lightly, as there is a whole history contingent on this which too often gets ignored. How is the city going to address the ramifications of intentional, systematic implications amongst BIPOC communities which have continuously created immense harm?	Median income table, Black or African American alone \$24,477	1-9	See endnote on p. 1-13 for more on race and ethnicity data. See HA and NE goals and policies, TS.1, and HE.2 as example policies relating to equity. Equity is also discussed most other chapters, especially ch.5, and most chapters have at least one action item related to equity.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON457	Sara Sprague	Is there a copy of this regional plan in Spanish?	Plan overall	1-9	An executive summary is available on the website in Spanish.
ON720	Emily	Decreasing Vehicle Miles Traveled (VMT) is something I hope to see further in this draft, along with creating infrastructure that encourages walking, biking, and taking transit. It sends mixed signals when you are connecting a lack of a vehicle with poverty. Don't we want people to feel good about being carless?	Table 1-3: Percent of Households Without a Vehicle...	1-9	Table was removed.
ON281	Michele James	<p>Add economic challenge of second homes (with numbers) and STRs (with numbers). Include a table with these numbers--repeat here even if already in another chapter.</p> <p>This section should include a more dynamic depiction of the increasing income inequality and needs to include a chart that illustrates the growth of wealth inequality data as well.</p> <p>This section and tables should provide more appropriate tables that include information about the major issues being faced by the community.</p> <p>Second homes a major issue and this needs to be discussed as a current challenge as well as a future one, as the community will continue to build more homes that will serve as second homes.</p>	The Region's Vibrant Present	1-9	Income inequality is an issue addressed in the Regional Snapshots. Added housing emergency call out box in Ch.1. We want to avoid repeating data as much as possible. Added housing data to Ch.4 and Ch.5.
CM153	Sustainability Commission	Emphasize what the Plan is, and is not; what is in its scope, and what is not, and place this narrative in a prominent location in the document. We suggest Chapter 2: How the Plan Works.	Chapter 2	2-	A table explaining scope and additional text was moved from Ch.1 to Ch.2.
CM152	Sustainability Commission	Explicitly state how the Plan will impact Flagstaff's growth and development patterns, including how city code will be impacted by this Plan.	Chapter 2 and GLU Chapter	2-	More detail was added to the beginning sections of Ch.2, including "How the Regional Plan is Implemented"

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON351	Bruce	Or modified to meet the plan goals....	"Major new improvements that are not reflected in the Regional Plan, and which could dramatically depart from its recommendations, should be preceded by a plan amendment."	2-1	Edit made.
ON498	Sara Sprague	Listing private developers first seems like there are already vested interest in who has more decision-making power...	"Private developers, City and County staff, community partners and elected officials will be faced with innumerable decisions of how to move forward..."	2-1	Reordered and changed to "property owners."
ON34	Alexandria	This needs to be stated at the beginning, in some of the very first pages, so people understand that what they are reading can, will, and should change as needs come up going forward, and refer to chapter 2 for more info about changes.	"This is a living document and to serve the community it will need to be amended with some regularity."	2-1	This section was emphasized with a heading and additional explanation. The table of contents was also revised to include more detail and states that Ch.2 contains information on how the plan is amended.
CM121	Sustainability Commission	1. I would like to see something in the capital improvement plans that address advancements in carbon neutrality...investment in renewable energy infrastructure, energy-efficient retrofits, and expanded multimodal transportation systems.	Capital Improvement Plans (CIPs)	2-1	This is addressed through the Climate Action, Energy, and Multimodal Transportation goals and policies in Ch.3.
ON806	Celia Barotz	Can a neighborhood plan also be called a specific plan or area plan?	Specific and Area Plans	2-1	More detail was added on p. 2-2 with a cross reference added to p. 2-5, where specific and area plans are further explained.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
L71	Scott Roberts	Page 2-1: City and County Codes: The code adjustments explored throughout the Regional Plan update will ultimately require a Zoning Code text amendment. Staff should explore methods to expedite the text amendment process to implement these changes as soon as possible to provide developers the flexibility to create and deliver new housing stock to the City of Flagstaff.	Updates to City and County Codes	2-1	This is addressed by Ch.5 High Priority Action Items.
ON1232	Nat	Having a housing focused theme for updating City and County codes to me is short sighted especially as it is based on very debatable assumptions in the case of Flagstaff specifically. The theme should be less focused on one goal and more comprehensive that is included under the term Quality of Life.	Updates to City and County Codes	2-1	The housing emergency declared by the Council is an important influence on land use considerations in the document. The Scenario Planning analysis which was conducted over the last 3 years and the Land Availability and Suitability Study and Code Diagnostic all support the findings of the Housing Plan and refine how future land use decision-making can move us towards affordability.
ON35	Celia Barotz	I suggest saying, "Staff reports for the city council and city commissions on land use, property, capital improvements, and development issues should identify..." instead of "When preparing reports for..."	Staff Reports	2-2	Edit made.
ON367	Sat Best	Senior City and County managers have told me that the implementation items in the various chapters will also be presented in staff reports. Goals, policies and implementation items should be brought together in one place.	Staff Reports	2-2	Implementation guidelines have been eliminated unless they are specifically tied to land uses in Chapter 4. Of the other implementation guidelines, some became policies or action items.
ON760	Val Bryant	Developers MUST adhere to City and County climate action plans, as well as being specific on tree removal/addition and using proper landscaping for the area.	Action Items section	2-3	The Regional Plan cannot require anything because it is not code. For the Climate plan to be mandated it must have it's provisions adopted into code. This is supported by the Regional Plan priorities but requires further action from City Council and the Board of Supervisors.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON352	Bruce	Plans and plan IMPLEMENTATION are very different entities. Therefore, I recommend that this item be broken into two parts: Plan Preparation and Plan Implementation	Action Items section - "Plan: Creation of plans and plan implementation efforts across various disciplines"	2-3	Changed to "...plans and planning related efforts..."
L24	Sat Best	"Remove the text in bold line from the section of the proposed Plan copied below so that implementation items can be part of the P&Z/Council negotiating process for all development." : "Implementation Guidelines are assumptions and corresponding principles that guide how the goals and policies are interpreted and applied. <b>They may require further steps to be incorporated into Zoning and Building Codes before they can be applied to discretionary development applications. Voluntary conformance with these guidelines is recommended and incentivized but is not required for private development.(Bold added)</b> Implementation Guidelines are organized under each goal in Chapters 5 through 11. Each goal has a hyperlink to the related implementation guidelines in Chapter 3 Goals and Policies."	Implementation Guidelines	2-3	Implementation guidelines have been eliminated unless they are specifically tied to land uses in Chapter 4. Of the other implementation guidelines, some became policies or action items.
ON370	Sat Best	It seems that many goals and policies in the 2030 Plan have become implementation items. If they are "not required" for Council and P&Z approval in zone change and Conditional Use Permit cases the new Plan will be much weaker. I contacted the City Planning Director and the County Planning Manager last spring to ask about this and they assured me that the implementation items would be presented with the goals and policies for approval. This needs to be clarified and changed if necessary.	Implementation Guidelines	2-3	Implementation guidelines have been eliminated unless they are specifically tied to land uses in Chapter 4. Of the other implementation guidelines, some became policies or action items.
W5		Change 3rd sentence to "Voluntary conformance with these guidelines is encouraged when appropriate but..."	Implementation Guidelines	2-3	Implementation guidelines have been deleted.
L22	Sat Best	"The routine rezoning and Conditional Use Permit process can do a great deal to move forward on implementation items. Cases frequently come before P&Z and Council for land parcels that have many of the assets listed as implementation items. It's possible to make good progress on implementation items during the process of balancing the interests of the applicant with the values of the community to allow more intensive use of a land parcel"	Implementation Guidelines	2-3	Implementation guidelines have been eliminated unless they are specifically tied to land uses in Chapter 4. Of the other implementation guidelines, some became policies or action items.
L72	Scott Roberts	Page 2-3 Implementation Guidelines: The City should consider creating an expedited process to assist developers and homebuilders in quickly increasing the stock of attainable housing. A "road map" with specific steps, timelines, etc. would be helpful.	Implementation Guidelines	2-3	The first Ch.5 High Priority Action Item addresses this. Creating an expedited process requires more staff and wouldn't be applicable to rezoning cases.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON1238	Nat	The implementation steps are logical, but I repeat that I am concerned the plan is too single focused despite the nominal six Regional Plan Themes of Chapter 3	Implementation Section	2-3	The themes have been deleted. There are 6 priorities, which have been revised and reorganized into "core priorities" and "complementary priorities."
CM122	Sustainability Commission	2. I would also like to see a little more about the reporting of progress from implementation...it talks about public engagement, but a big part of this is for the public to be informed...how will the city keep the public informed about how the implementation of pieces of the plan are contributing to CNP goals.	Monitoring	2-3	See Appendix A. Annual reports will be made to elected officials. These reports will also be available online.
W2		Change "zoning code" to "zoning map and text"	Policy Section	2-3	Changed to zoning map amendments.
W3		Add staff direction	Policy Section	2-3	This section was revised.
W4		Should areas or parcels be used? Used interchangeably throughout section	Policy Section	2-3	This section was revised.
ON810	Celia Barotz	I would suggest saying, "that falls into"	"If a specific plan proposes a change to the Regional Plan related to a major amendment category..."	2-4	Edit made.
ON675	Sat Best	This is a major step back from the Regional Plan 2030, which had Goal E&C.2. "Achieve carbon neutrality for the Flagstaff community by 2030" and other elements of the Carbon Neutrality Plan. I think many in the City will agree that this is not acceptable. In general it seems that Strategic Plans should be used to make findings of conformance with the Regional Plan. The Plan is a policy document that reflects the values of the citizens of Flagstaff. Not every element in the Plan will be realized in every case, and we have the Planning and Zoning Commission and City Council to balance the values and make decisions.	"The City and County may have other policy documents and strategic plans such as the [CNP]..."	2-4	We are unable to follow this suggestion due to state law and the choice of the City to prioritize the flexibility of the Carbon Neutrality Plan.
ON354	Bruce	seems as though "in response to" is out of place. Perhaps better places just after "updated,..."	"The Regional Plan... can be updated, revised, and improved over time to emerging issues in response, new ideas, and changing conditions."	2-4	Sentence revised.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON355	Bruce	move "...in response to..." here	"The Regional Plan... can be updated, revised, and improved over time to emerging issues in response, new ideas, and changing conditions."	2-4	Sentence revised.
ON356	Bruce	Please ignore immediately prior comment. My bad	"The Regional Plan... can be updated, revised, and improved over time to emerging issues in response, new ideas, and changing conditions."	2-4	Sentence revised.
ON353	Bruce	among not between	County Area Plans - "When there are conflicts between these documents..."	2-4	No change, this edit was missed.
ON332	Michele James	Include the Parks Management Plan in this list. Can be considered only if represented in City/County codes.	Other Strategic Plans	2-4	Edit made.
ON888	Dee Hoagland	I would think the city's carbon neutrality plan would be of high importance to this plan. Why can't it be considered: housing development, open space, code analysis, zoning, alternative energy and many more ways to reduce carbon emissions should be prioritized.	Other Strategic Plans - "...but cannot be used in making findings of conformance with the Regional Plan."	2-4	The Carbon Neutrality Plan is not a specific plan and cannot be listed in this section. Specific Plans have to go through additional steps to be adopted and are more difficult to amend. The CNP was created to be adaptable and includes information outside the scope of a specific plan.
L130	Friends of Flagstaff's Future	Clarify the relationship between neighborhood plans and the regional plan (see page 2-4 of the draft) and how differences will be resolved.	Specific Plans	2-4	Clarification was added.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON400	Valerie Piet	Specifically reference the city's carbon neutrality 2030 plan here. This is a guiding principle	Specific Plans	2-4	The Carbon Neutrality Plan is not a specific plan and cannot be listed in this section.
ON807	Celia Barotz	Have the existing neighborhood plans in the City of Flagstaff been adopted by ordinance?	Specific Plans	2-4	This information can be found on the City website. Examples were added but not an exhaustive list.
ON809	Celia Barotz	Have the existing neighborhood plans in the COF been adopted by resolution or ordinance?	Specific Plans	2-4	This information can be found on the City website and examples were added but not an exhaustive list.
ON499	Sara Sprague	Why are there not more opportunities for the public to engage with this process?	Specific Plans - "Private property owners may also request the city adopt a specific plan that creates a master plan for their property and allows for limited variations from development standards."	2-4	The public can engage within the public participation process but does not have standing to initiate a specific plan. When a neighborhood wants a specific plan prepared they must petition Council or the Planning Director to initiate it on their behalf.
ON808	Celia Barotz	I'm finding this paragraph and the following one confusing. I understand that they highlights a distinction between a SP adopted by resolution vs a SP adopted by ordinance but I'm not clear what that means for conflicts between the RP and the SP. Can you explain?	Specific Plans - When a specific plan is adopted by resolution, any conflicting direction between the Regional Plan and a specific plan created before the Regional Plan's adoption...	2-4	Clarifying language was added.
ON36	Celia Barotz	I suggest changing identify to identifies.	"In Arizona, each jurisdiction identify changes or modifications..."	2-5	Edit made.