

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON703	Kim	The plan's consistent effort to be inclusive: "housing attainability for all" is not facing the reality of the real equity issues it identifies. We do not need to incentivize housing development for the wealthy!	"Make incentives available to support the creation of housing at a variety of income levels, resulting in both rental and ownership opportunities."	5-17	This guideline was removed as it is covered by HA.5.
ON635	Marilyn	Why should we support incentives for housing for the wealthy? This makes no sense to me and just takes money away from where it is needed. If anything we should have an implementation strategy that discourages gated communities, large lot sizes, second homes, vacation rentals and subdivisions of single family homes only. If we don't do this all of this proposed density will still be unattainable for most of us.	"Make incentives available to support the creation of housing at a variety of income levels, resulting in both rental and ownership opportunities"	5-17	This guideline was removed as it is covered by HA.5.
ON326	Michele James	Add to beginning of this sentence "Work with communities to preserve and sustain diverse traditional food cultures..."	"Preserve and sustain diverse traditional food cultures in food programs and initiatives"	5-17	This guideline was removed. DP.6 was revised to include "traditional food practices."
ON328	Michele James	Remove "without impacting housing goals."	"Reduce barriers in City Code to creating home-based business and expanding entrepreneurship without impacting housing goals."	5-17	This guideline became policy HE.6.
ON526	Sara Sprague	Reduce barriers to entry or urban agriculture	"Reduce barriers in City Code to creating home-based business and expanding entrepreneurship without impacting housing goals."	5-17	This guideline became policy HE.6.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON323	Michele James	Include researching finance options and support for purchasing agricultural lands for new farmers.	"Research methods of leveraging economic development and financial tools to prevent displacement and build greater parity in economic benefits within the Region."	5-17	This guideline was removed. This suggestion is outside of the scope of the Regional Plan.
ON1174	Sandra	The concern with "displacement" ought to be expanded here. Gentrification is a looming issue in neighborhoods that are targeted for densification. What are the strategies that could be in place BEFORE gentrification gets underway?	"Research methods of leveraging economic development and financial tools to prevent displacement and build greater parity in economic benefits within the Region."	5-17	This guideline was removed. The NE and HE goals and policies address gentrification and Ch.5 action items list strategies for to prevent displacement.
ON1075	Zenya Ledermann	or subsidize	"Support the development of food hubs and food resources—such as communal commercial kitchens, food processing facilities, greenhouses, and growing spaces dedicated to producing food"	5-17	This guideline was removed because it was covered by policies DP.6 and HE.5.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON528	Sara Sprague	Stronger language, such as implement, or fund.	"Support the development of food hubs and food resources—such as communal commercial kitchens, food processing facilities, greenhouses, and growing spaces dedicated to producing food"	5-17	This guideline was removed because it was covered by policies DP.6 and HE.5.
ON1109	Emily	Does this include "meat processing" facilities? Ranching is a big component of agriculture in the region and a need, but I don't know a lot of citizens who want it near their home. People complain about the smell of Purina as it is.	"Support the development of food hubs and food resources--such as communal commercial kitchens, food processing facilities, greenhouses, and growing spaces dedicated to producing food."	5-17	This guideline was removed because it was covered by Policy DP.6 and HE.5, which does cover meat processing.
L69	Scott Roberts	One of the most significant challenges facing large-scale housing developments in the City of Flagstaff is the cost of off-site infrastructure improvements. Upsizing roads, water lines, and sewer lines to accommodate growth may, in some instances, actually inhibit growth because the cost is so high that projects become financially untenable. The City needs to explore infrastructure financing strategies (public/private partnerships, bonds, Community Facilities Districts, etc.) that alleviate the financial impact on private development. While we, like most other developers, are always willing to mitigate our impact with respect to traffic, water, and sewer, the cost of larger-scale infrastructure projects like the expansion of the Woody Mountain Road bridge over I-40 cannot be shouldered solely by private parties.	Goal CD Implementation Guidelines	5-17	The implementation guideline category was deleted. The CD policies were revised. See also the revised I goal and policies. Ch.5 and Ch.11 action items include some strategies to implement these goals.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON637	Marilyn	and encourage existing neighborhoods with proposed greater density to form associations.	"Complete neighborhood plans for Pine-Knoll Brannen and Sunnyside"	5-18	This action item was revised to include the JWP area. See updated section in Ch.5 on neighborhood plans.
ON1180	Sandra	Why not make bonding for monies to enable the purchase and development of city-owned property an action item?	"Create ongoing funding sources for affordable housing and associate services in the Region."	5-18	It is a higher priority for the City to develop the many parcels we have already acquired for affordable housing that are not yet developed. The 10-Year Housing Plan did not include acquisition for this reason. The policies as written could support acquisition if that changes in the future. Note that this action item was combined with another high priority action item.
CM84	Commission on Inclusion & Adaptive Living	"Fund...for affordable and <u>accessible</u> housing..."	"Create ongoing funding sources for affordable housing and associated services in the Region."	5-18	Accessibility in housing was covered by revisions to the NE goal and policies. Note that this action item was combined with another high priority action item.
ON1241	Erica Rackley	If the City prioritizes reducing the risk of demolition of existing housing units and retaining existing units, how will neighborhoods reach the target densities listed previously? It seems that keeping existing homes and reaching these high density goals are in conflict, no?	"Explore alternative processes and guidelines for the redevelopment of historic and affordable housing to reduce the risk of demolition and allow for increased retention of existing units."	5-18	There are many ways that a home may be made available for more housing. It can be creating more units within an existing building or acquiring a property that is not habitable or a vacant parcel. It can also include strategies that make it easier for people to add units on property that they are occupying and continue to occupy after new units are created.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON1187	Sandra	Please explain what a "Revitalization District" is.	"Explore other funding mechanisms for affordable housing developments, such as a Revitalization District and a dedicated sales tax."	5-18	This action item was revised and includes a different set of funding mechanisms.
ON1176	Sandra	?? what does this mean and why is it needed?	"Explore the feasibility of a joint City/County housing program to coordinate studies and staffing."	5-18	Collaboration is needed because the County does not have a housing program. Note that this action item was combined with another action item.
ON1186	Sandra	More importantly, ensure that densification goes hand-in-hand with the kind of planning that increases community vitality such as access to spaces that are well-designed and encourage social gathering, access to green space and urban trails, preservation of historical buildings, etc. I think the fear behind the term "affordable housing" has to do with project that have been poorly designed, shoddy, and simply ugly. It is imperative that we link densification & affordability with vitality and beautification.	"Make the economic and opportunity costs of not providing housing more widely known to support the inclusion of affordable housing in neighborhoods that have demonstrated opposition to it."	5-18	Added Best Practices for Creating a Sense of Place to Chapter 3.
ON1239	Erica Rackley	add "to" (barriers to the creation)	"Revise the City of Flagstaff Zoning, Building, Fire, and Engineering codes to reduce barriers the creation of housing and development that supports the Carbon Neutrality Plan and reduced wildfire risk."	5-18	Edit made.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON1183	Sandra	...and ensure that the guidelines for ensuring community character and quality of development are not sacrificed in the process.	"Update the City's affordable housing incentive policy to implement the goals and policies of the Regional Plan..."	5-18	The 10-Year Housing Plan states, "During the update of the Flagstaff Regional Plan, revise the Community Character chapter for goals and policies to include cost-saving methods that reduce the conflict between affordable housing, historic preservation, and urban design. " Adding the suggested language would create a conflict counter to the Council direction related to this action item.
ON529	Sara Sprague	This should be mentioned first	"Update Zoning and other City codes to better support the local production, manufacturing, storage, and distribution of food on public and private land including the protection of agriculturally viable land and the implementation of future urban agriculture production sites"	5-18	This item was not prioritized by the Regional Plan Committee.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
L124	Friends of Flagstaff's Future	<p>Make the City Acquisition of Property for Development a Priority: Because our ability to control private development is limited, it's unlikely that increasing the quantity of housing in and of itself will increase housing availability or affordability. Moreover, there is little in this plan to prevent much of the new development from being investor owned, second homes, and vacation rental properties. The most important complementary strategy available is the City's acquisition of property for municipal housing and open space. We urge you to make this a priority in the plan.</p> <p>Our recommendations:</p> <p>Purchase state land Section 20 so that the city can create a mix of affordable and attainable housing along with commercial, employment and open space uses.</p> <p>Make the securing of funding for property acquisition (of state lands and other appropriate properties on the market) a priority action item.</p>	SES Action Items	5-18	It is a higher priority for the City to develop the many parcels we have already acquired for affordable housing that are not yet developed. He 10-Year Housing Plan did not include acquisition for this reason. The policies as written could support acquisition if that changes in the future.
ON713	Jon K	<p>Land acquisition and development should be listed as a high-priority action item. There needs to be a greater availability of land specifically designated for business development. Why should this be prioritized? Consider the Sunnyside neighborhood as a case study. Due to the lack of planning and dedicated business spaces, manufacturing businesses, auto repair shops, paint shops, and carpentry workshops have been concentrated in one of the highest-density residential neighborhoods in Flagstaff. Many of these businesses release toxins and chemicals into the air, directly impacting the health and well-being of the families who live there.</p> <p>Creating spaces for growth is not only critical for business development, wage growth, and overall city expansion, but also for the health and safety of lower-income residents in areas like Sunnyside. Would Flagstaff allow an upholstery shop or similar industrial business to operate in neighborhoods such as North Hospital, Country Club, University Heights, or Cheshire? The answer is clearly no. Yet in Sunnyside, these businesses continue to operate, releasing pollutants into the air of one of the city's most economically disadvantaged communities.</p> <p>Affordable land for business development needs to be created immediately, and it must be treated as the highest priority. This is not just an economic issue—it's a public health issue that disproportionately affects lower-income residents.</p>	SES Action Items	5-18	It is a higher priority for the City to develop the many parcels we have already acquired for affordable housing that are not yet developed. He 10 year housing plan did not include acquisition for this reason. The policies as written could support acquisition if that changes in the future.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON160	Zak	This travel also has a cost on the city in repair costs to the road, patrols by police, and air pollution.	"...housing price increases--coupled with factors such as the cost of greater travel distance two and from work and shopping, increasing transportation costs, short-term rentals, and second home ownership--affect housing prices in these areas and them less affordable."	5-2	Yes. Ch. 6 discusses reducing vehicle miles traveled for these reasons.
ON158	Ira Allen	Or: totaling about HALF the unmet housing need. I understand it's unpopular to acknowledge with some well-heeled stakeholders, but you're burying the lede rather badly in this section.	"As of 2024, there were about 4,007 second homes and 628 short-term rentals (excluding owner-occupied rentals) within the City, totaling about 14 percent of City housing units."	5-2	The point of this section is that the City and County lack authority over these factors. A sentence was added to emphasize this.
ON159	Zak	Non-resident units should be taxed at a higher rate than residential units, or this rate increased to help the city offset these externalities for residents.	"As of 2024, there were about 4,007 second homes and 628 short-term rentals (excluding owner-occupied rentals) within the City, totaling about 14 percent of City housing units."	5-2	This is outside the scope of the Regional Plan.
ON1102	david r	Funny, I did a quick search on Airbnb at the beginning of December for the four days during the first week of December and there were over 1,200 available.	"As of 2024, there were about 4,007 second homes and 628 short-term rentals (excluding owner-occupied rentals)"	5-2	The other 500 are likely the owner-occupied rentals, which we can filter out using Air DNA data.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON628	Marilyn	This political reality speaks to the need for the city and the county to acquire land to create affordable/attainable housing. Why not have that as a goal?	"Because neither the City nor County can require developers to create affordable units, both jurisdictions use voluntary incentives to encourage affordable units in new developments"	5-2	It is a higher priority for the City to develop the many parcels we have already acquired for affordable housing that are not yet developed. The 10-Year Housing Plan did not include acquisition for this reason. The policies as written could support acquisition if that changes in the future. The County does not have a housing program but updates to the County Comprehensive Plan include goals and policies aimed at producing a housing needs assessment and strategies to address the need.
ON161	Dana	The residents should not have to bear the increased demand caused by NAU	"Over the past two decades, NAU enrollment increased faster than its on-campus housing capacity and the university stopped providing family housing, creating a larger demand for off-campus student housing options."	5-2	This is outside the scope of the Regional Plan. This section was revised to add more information about NAU enrollment projections.
ON162	Aaron	This comment and concern are likely to change in the coming decade-plus. Nationwide higher education is forecasting a significant enrollment decline. I would urge the city planners to re-evaluate this statement and where it effectively leads/drives elements in the 2045 plan. https://www.brookings.edu/articles/are-colleges-really-facing-an-enrollment-cliff/	"Over the past two decades, NAU enrollment increased faster than its on-campus housing capacity and the university stopped providing family housing, creating a larger demand for off-campus student housing options."	5-2	This section was revised with input from NAU to state that the enrollment factor is subject to change and there have been increases in on-campus housing capacity.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON1233	Erica Rackley	"stopped providing family housing" I don't know exactly what the plan authors mean by this statement, but consider fact checking. I personally know of one family (one parent was a NAU grad student) who rented a university apartment last year.	"Over the past two decades, NAU enrollment increased faster than its on-campus housing capacity and the university stopped providing family housing, creating a larger demand for off-campus student housing options."	5-2	This was edited to say limited. There used to be a larger area with family housing in the 1990s.
ON561	Ben Ruddell	It looks like these three categories of uses create a similar impact to the ~8000-new-unit 2031 goal. Eliminating these uses would therefore achieve the 2031 goal without building more housing. Food for thought.	"The City's supply of housing has also been affected by (1) an increase in second homes, (2) the conversion of long-term housing to short-term rentals, and (3) the increase in the NAU student population."	5-2	If the City had the authority to better regulate STRs, then that would allow us to meet our housing goals faster but that will be up to the State legislature.
ON562	Ben Ruddell	If we're going to tax and disincent short term uses of housing (soak tourists and wealthy part timers), it won't help affordability much unless that revenue is put into the pockets of the full term residents. Why not write a check to every full time resident for an equal share of that revenue? Direct action, fairly administered.	"These three factors heighten the competition for limited housing options"	5-2	This is outside the scope of the Regional Plan.
ON563	Ben Ruddell	NAU has access to cheap capital, state and federal funding, a long-term planning horizon, and its own land, right in the middle of the walkable city where the infrastructure already is. NAU could add tens of thousands of units if it was serious about densely using its property. A more direct partnership with NAU on housing development could make a disproportionately large and affordable impact on housing in Flagstaff. Subsidized NAU employee housing would solve affordability for what- roughly 10,000 residents- opening thousands of units for other full time residents, while also moving thousands of cars off the roads every rush hour. ASU is building market housing in Tempe... why not NAU in Flagstaff?	"While the communities of Bellemont, Kachina Village, and Mountaineer have been considered more affordable areas to live	5-2	Partnerships with NAU are discussed in the High Occupancy Housing Plan.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON930	Laura Huenneke	insert "make"	"While the communities of Bellemont, Kachina Village... affect housing prices in these areas and them less affordable"	5-2	Edit made.
ON701	Kim	Given this political reality (thank you for putting it up front here) the city should explore other options such as developing a voluntary buy-out program: buy housing on the market, pay the mortgage off in 30 years, and run the program at 0 profit. We have to have better options and there are models. How about the goal of exploring non market models for affordable housing?	Inclusionary Zoning call out box	5-2	A program like this is outside the scope of the Regional Plan. There is a Ch.5 action item on acquiring property for affordable housing.
ON973	David	This map is difficult to interpret. I am color blind, but I think it would be difficult for even a normally sighted person to interpret.	Map 5-1	5-3	This map was separated into two maps for better readability.
IP153	NULL	Greater density in Bellemont is still car + highway dependent because everyone in Bellemont still drives into downtown. 66 by Thompson is non-stop both ways going in + out of town. There's also an apartment complex going in west of Thompson with no commercial. These people also have to drive to get to any services	Map 5-1 Building Density Map	5-3	Mountain Line bus service is being extended to the area west of Thompson due to the new tax that was passed. Bellemont is a further distance and is served by a vanpool option that Mountain Line makes available.
ON164	Zak	Areas like Bellemont need transit options or traffic will simply continue to intensify in numbers and safety issues. Already it is treacherous to cross 66 at Thompson as a pedestrian, or cyclist. Turning left there is also impossible at certain times of day. Traffic calming should be considered as these types of drivers convert from 'regional' to 'city settings.	"New development has occurred most extensively in and in County areas, especially Bellemont."	5-4	This would be up to Mountain Line and the County to fund. New policy TR.2 and a Ch. 6 high priority action item discuss transit in the County.
ON974	David	The plan should address the full range of housing options: camping, RV parks, mobile home parks, manufactured home developments , in addition to the housing types already mentioned in this plan.	"Resolving the undersupply of housing will require the development of new housing units in all neighborhoods and across the Region."	5-4	The MH zone was added to Urban Neighborhood in the Table of Zoning Compatibility (p. 4-13). Camping and RVs are not considered housing and are covered in other ways.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON264	Crystal	I agree with Dana. As a Sunnyside homeowner, there are certainly homes which are unsafe to live in and either need to be renovated or even condemned. Flagstaff is too soft.	"There are no areas of the City that meet the definitions of "slum and blight," which the ASR 9-461.05 states should be examined in the General Plan for cities." Reply to ON163	5-4	Having a single home that is in a bad condition is called a dilapidated home. Slum and blight are definitions for large areas containing many dilapidated buildings. Code enforcement is outside the scope of the plan. There is a Ch.5 action item on this. Economic development is discussed later in the chapter. Air conditioning is discussed further on p. 10-2.
ON163	Dana	Your lack of code enforcement will contribute	"There are no areas of the City that meet the definitions of 'slum and blight,'..."	5-4	
ON564	Ben Ruddell	Whelp, there's your problem. The rest of the causes of the affordability problem are negligible compared with this, and this needs to be a bigger focus in the regional plan. Prices tripled and incomes are flat. This means economic development with much higher paying jobs- like technology- must be part of the solution, or Flagstaff will eventually have no workforce housing (Sedona is already there). But that also sadly means displacement of more existing lower income residents. Are we going to be Scottsdale or Sedona? (we should pick Scottsdale) Fortunately, there are things we could do in this plan to attract more tech industry and jobs. But where is this key solution emphasized in the plan?	Map 5-2 Percentage Change in Median Income Between ACS 5-Year Estimates 2010-2014 and 2018-2022	5-5	
ON166	Zak	This should be a consideration as summers get hotter for longer. Many units don't include AC (mine doesn't) and landlords therefore put the burden of purchasing interior units of tenants.	"For example, they may relocate... which may expose them to health and safety risks, such as vermin, mold, water leaks, and inadequate heating or cooling systems."	5-6	

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON749	Emily	Better insulation and sustainable design features would accomplish the same goal without the increased ghg emissions of air conditioning. For new construction, this should be a code priority. For existing stock, I'm not sure the city could create a code that requires air conditioning for residences already in place.	"For example, they may relocate... which may expose them to health and safety risks, such as vermin, mold, water leaks, and inadequate heating or cooling systems." Reply to ON166	5-6	Weatherization and building energy efficiency are discussed in Ch.10. Ch.10 action items support building efficiency, and it is also covered by revised Policy CA.2.
ON1235	Erica Rackley	Thank you for including these statistics and bringing up these equity issues.	Housing Insecurity and Displacement	5-6	No change suggested.
ON165	Ira Allen	We cannot coherently plan around "housing insecurity" without accounting for the ever-growing ranks of permanent forest dwellers: some by choice, but many not. I've seen ~2500 floated a few times at present. With the heating and drying of our forests, and unavoidable increased immigration, that's multiple megafires waiting to happen. Housing insecurity is a matter of basic safety for all of us--it's time to take it much, much more seriously.	Housing Insecurity and Displacement	5-6	Agreed. That is why housing attainability was made a core priority. However, the surrounding forest lands fall within federal jurisdiction and not within the scope of the plan.
ON1236	Erica Rackley	Excellent to hear this. Thank you.	"The City supports the provision of fair housing for all residents, under the federal Fair Housing Act, and is committed to advancing solutions based in racial equity."	5-7	No change suggested.
ON864	Val	safe and resilient homes (add) that comply with the climate action plans.	"Support efforts for safe, efficient, and resilient homes."	5-8	No change as this is a list of programs and states current conditions, not desired outcomes.
ON503	Sara Sprague	Why are these two placed together? Should be separated	"Agriculture/Mining" (Employment by Sector)	5-9	This organization is based on how NAIC codes are nested at the federal level.
ON502	Sara Sprague	What about social services?	"Other Services" (Employment by Sector)	5-9	This organization is based on how NAIC codes are nested at the federal level.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON936	Laura Huenneke	What is the difference between numbers in normal font and those in italics? Should be a key to this in the table title/caption.	Table 5-2	5-9	Edit made - just a format error.
ON751	Emily	The Census Bureau creates these categories. The data was grabbed from the ACS.	Table 5-2, reply to ON317	5-9	Yes, this is how the data appears in the ACS. This organization is based on how NAIC codes are nested at the federal level.
ON750	Emily	ACS stands for American Community Survey. This is the National Census Bureau who creates these categories and provides these statistics. Some of the other groupings below are questionable, but it's a federal service to regions throughout the country.	Table 5-2, reply to ON503	5-9	Yes, this is how the data appears in the ACS. This organization is based on how NAIC codes are nested at the federal level.
ON1043	Zenya Ledermann	Thanks for the clarification! That being said, is it possible to separate these? I feel it is a disservice to the sectors to have them combined	Table 5-2, reply to ON503 and ON750	5-9	Unfortunately, the data cannot be disaggregated easily.
ON317	Michele James	Where does food processing fit? Does Manufacturing include food? Why combine agriculture with mining? They are very different. This category (agriculture/mining) appears to focus on raising stock (cattle, sheep) and not growing food.	Table 5-2: Workforce Employment by Sector. Source: ACS 5-Year Estimate 2017-2022 (S2403)	5-9	This organization is based on how NAIC codes are nested at the federal level. This would require more investigation to determine, but yes, food processing may be captured by other categories such as manufacturing and retail trade.
ON234c	Diane	In the long run, public transportation will have to be extended both north and south of the city where people are buying homes. Otherwise use of personal vehicles will continue to be a major stumbling block to clean energy goals.	Chapter 6	6-	Planning for the transit system is completed separately through a process conducted by Mountain Line and is based on the density and population of an area and the service found there.
CM11	Bicycle Advisory Committee	BAC members appreciate the emphasis on connectivity and ensuring that new and existing bikeways and trails form a holistic system which enables bicyclists to easily, comfortably, and safely travel through the region.	Transportation chapter	6-	No changes suggested.
CM14	Bicycle Advisory Committee	Members of the BAC appreciate that the Regional Plan connects developing and upgrading multimodal transit infrastructure to the City's climate goals, particularly the Climate Action and Adaptation Plan and the Carbon Neutrality Plan.	Transportation Chapter	6-	No changes suggested.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
CM30	Bicycle Advisory Committee	As an overall comment, the BAC noted that it may be useful to refer to and mention micromobility users more consistently throughout this chapter, as they are key users of both bicycle and pedestrian infrastructure and may be using micromobility devices to connect to transit.	Transportation Chapter	6-	Additional mentions were added where appropriate. Glossary links were added.
ON981	David	In either the Transportation or the Energy chapters there should be a discussion of hydrogen as a fuel for vehicles and as an energy source. Before 2045 gets here hydrogen will be green (versus grey or black currently) in its production and fuel cell generators and vehicles will be prevalent. Flagstaff should be a leader due to the I40 and I17 traffic.	Transportation Chapter	6-	This is outside the scope of the Regional Plan. Airplane electrification was added to Policy CA.3.
W61	Commission on Inclusion & Adaptive Living	Transportation and accessibility are often said to be met in standards but are not in reality. There are many issues that hurt those with limited ability to navigate travel ways.	Transportation Chapter	6-	Agreed. Several suggested comments and edits were made to improve the chapter's discussion of and action items for accessibility.
ON1267	Nat	My main point here is that the FUTS is talked about in this chapter as a major transportation system at the level of bikeways. It should not be considered that way. Per this plan's definition, FUTS is recreationally focused while serving as transportation to nearby schools and shopping. Snow and muddy conditions can inhibit its functionality unlike bikeways. It functions as a primarily environmentally focused connection between parks, activity centers, schools, neighborhood trails etc. It was not envisioned as a major mechanical, motorized transportation element although it can serve as such for some. FUTS should be more featured in Chapter 8 than this chapter.	Transportation Chapter	6-	In order to create a more straightforward, implementable plan, staff took the approach of segregating topics to be only mentioned once in one chapter, wherever possible. Because the FUTS is an integral part of the City's approach to active transportation, it is discussed in Ch. 6. There are action items about maintaining the FUTS to allow for use in winter. Leisure use of the FUTS is also recognized in the plan, see OS.1 for example.
ON420	Sam Meier	Lack of connectivity affects other transit modes, as well. I would like to see this language include other road users, since the focus is supposed to be on multimodal!	"A lack of connectivity limits distribution and circulation options for drivers and creates inconsistent patterns on the connecting roads."	6-1	True, this is addressed in the other sections of the chapter.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON947	Laura Huenneke	insert "for"	"The GHG emissions from the transportation system in the City accounts 30 percent of total GHG emissions."	6-1	Edit made.
ON175	David	extra word, it should be "These irregular roadways funnel into limited-"	"These irregular roadways funnel into to limited..."	6-1	Edit made.
ON951	Laura Huenneke	add something about connecting to air service in and out of the Region?	"These networks support driving, transit, passenger and freight rail, walking, biking, and micromobility for the Region's residents and visitors."	6-1	"Air travel" was added.
CM31	Bicycle Advisory Committee	Section 6-1 mentions using an undesignated shoulder as a bike lane. A member asked if there is a defined minimum acceptable width for that use. In general, members were not sure if there were existing standards for many of the types of infrastructure mentioned throughout this section.	"Undesignated shoulders are the term used by the Arizona Department of Transportation (ADOT) to describe an area on the road pavement that is striped separately for bicyclists and other non vehicle road users."	6-1	This is too detailed for the Regional Plan.
ON452	Alexander Shenkin	I see no acknowledgement of the serious issue of noise here. Noise from freeways is a serious issue in Flagstaff, and detracts from its natural beauty. It also negatively affects local communities and biodiversity. In my own community of Ponderosa Trails, there is a constant hum of freeway traffic, punctuated by jake brakes. This must be addressed in the regional plan, or it will worsen further with growth.	CHAPTER PRINCIPLES AND CURRENT CONDITIONS - TRANSPORTATION	6-1	The City and County lack the authority to manage road noise unless we would like to start building sound barriers which would restrict views and connectivity.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON1103	david r	Unfortunately, as we can see in the design of the Lone Tree Overpass, surface transportation design starts with the interests of vehicles. The interests of pedestrians and cyclists are only addressed afterwards as some sort of ineffective add-on, which does not meet the needs of pedestrians or cyclists. If you want a serious diverse transportation system, you will need to stop privileging the automobile.	Flagstaff Regional Transportation Network	6-1	The Regional Plan does not propose privileging the automobile. Revised policy TS.1 states "Prioritize the safety and accessibility of vulnerable road users as the primary consideration in planning for streets and transportation systems."
CM85	Commission on Inclusion & Adaptive Living	<u>"Roads and Streets...ADD>>Many of our region's roads lack sidewalks and many of our sidewalks lack curb cuts and /or truncated domes. Nearly all our region's crosswalks lack accessible pedestrian signal devices."</u>	Roads and Streets	6-1	No change, crossings are discussed in the Active Transportation section, and safety and accessibility is discussed in the Safety and Convenience for the Most Vulnerable section and the Safety section. The Ch. 6 action items also cover these suggestions and have been revised to emphasize accessibility.
ON204	Zak	This should be brought up more often. Car use is not benign. We lose citizens car-centered development.	"Thirty-two percent of deaths of children aged one to 17 years were due to motor vehicle crashes."	6-10	Yes.
ON203	Zak	Improvements to safety should be focused on reducing car speeds and increasing edge friction and not making it harder for cars and bikes to move through the city.	Safety	6-10	Speed limits are outside of the scope of the Regional Plan. On the next page, some examples of other safety interventions are noted.
ON987	Laura Huenneke	I appreciate this focus on safety and the desire to reduce/eliminate fatalities and injuries due to crashes. I have another safety concern that is missing here (perhaps it is in a later chapter??) - the fact that Flagstaff is ranked very high on risks related to limited evacuation capacity in the case of an emergency (e.g. a fast-moving fire as in Paradise, CA). What is the situation with respect to evacuation capacity? Does this require some thought about improving physical infrastructure?	Safety	6-10	Yes, it is in a later chapter. See p. 11-8 and the Ch. 11 action items.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON955	Laura Huenneke	principal, not principle	"At the heart of all these frameworks is a willingness to place safety as the principle consideration in road system investments and design work."	6-11	Edit made.
CM90	Commission on Inclusion & Adaptive Living	"high visibility, fully accessible pedestrian crossings, accessible pedestrian signal devices, ..."	"Street level interventions and redesigns, such as roundabouts, high visibility pedestrian crossings, and traffic calming measures, are increasingly common and more projects like them are needed to make a difference in the safety of the Region."	6-11	Added "accessible pedestrian signal devices." Preceding this sentence, added "Accessible universal design is essential in addressing the the needs of these most vulnerable of road users."
ON424	Sam Meier	If these are the vulnerable community members mentioned above, this definition should be offered earlier in the chapter, or it should be made clear that "vulnerable community members" will be defined in this section.	"The most vulnerable roadway users, ..., are people outside of vehicles, older adults, people with disabilities, people of color, and people walking in lower income areas."	6-11	In this section, the term refers to the findings of a Smart Growth America Study, which is cited with an endnote. "Vulnerable road users" is not always used in connection with the study.
ON206	Kim Austin	Add younger children?? As they may have more difficulty navigating roadways and crossings, similar to older adults	"The most vulnerable roadway users.... are people outside of vehicles, older adults, people with disabilities, people of color, and people walking in lower income areas."	6-11	In this section, the term refers to the findings of a Smart Growth America Study, which is cited with an endnote.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON205	Ira Allen	How do you envision anything approximating sound climate goals being met when the majority of developable land is checkerboard infill served by freeways and you have no vision of actual mass transit?	Environmental and Climate Impacts	6-11	See the Transportation Findings from Scenario Planning for more information.
ON910	Val	What specifically does this system entail? Can a link be made?	Safe System Approach and Road to Zero call out box	6-11	There are entire manuals that can be referenced but that is too much detail for the Regional Plan.
ON208	Zak	This fee should be higher	"In 2017, the City adopted a comprehensive parking program for the Downtown and surrounding areas including a paid parking district, residential and employee parking, and management of municipally owned surface lots."	6-12	This is outside the scope of the Regional Plan.
ON209	Zak	This funding should not go to 'additional public parking' it should go to supporting alternative transportation options. If the fee was higher for parking private parking (which is already present) may go from closed (it all says 'private property, no trespassing') to taking advantage of the additional revenue source. With such a low fee these properties would simply be taking on un-paid liability if they allowed public parking during their off hours. We shouldn't be tearing down buildings downtown in order to put in more surface parking that doesn't support the tax base or needs of this community.	"In 2017, the City adopted a comprehensive parking program for the Downtown and surrounding areas including a paid parking district, residential and employee parking, and management of municipally owned surface lots." Reply to ON208	6-12	This is outside the scope of the Regional Plan.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON211	Zak	Make more streets seasonally or permanently car-free, like Aspen between Beaver and Verde	Streetscapes and Parking	6-12	This suggestion is too specific for the Regional Plan. This is a concept that has been address in neighborhood plans in urban areas.
L177	Equity Climate Advisory Group	Two thoughts on the winter ordinance: 1) Reevaluation of what street safety we do NOT attend to because of the brush-off statement “but what if it snows?” needs to be considered in the age of climate change. The parking ordinance made sense for practice and enforcement when it actually started snowing on Halloween and continued through April. We now barely have significant storms till January and then they end in March. When pedestrians ask for raised crosswalks, bike lanes, speed bumps, or bollards and hear the response, “but what if it snows?” That excuse is no longer going to hold value on why we can not implement safer street infrastructure and traffic calming. 2) With the housing crisis, many residences have multiple people living in the home with multiple vehicles and not enough off-street parking. People don’t have the extra money to pay for these parking tickets. If there was an implementation of the “odd/even” system this would alleviate that burden for residents.	Winter Parking call out box	6-12	
L211	Equity Climate Advisory Group	Speaking of equity in relation to the winter parking ordinance section: The odd/even is a great idea. With the housing crisis, there are so many residences that have multiple people living in the home with multiple vehicles and not enough off street parking. People don’t have the extra money to pay for these parking tickets. If there was an implementation of the “odd/even” system this would alleviate that burden for residents.	Winter parking call out box	6-12	Odd/even is one of multiple options that can be considered to implement the related action item.
ON1044	Krista Ames-Cook	The County Winter Parking Ordinance is different than the Flagstaff City Winter Parking Ordinance. This is confusing and they should be aligned. It would be better if the County Ordinance matched the city guidelines so that parking is only not allowed overnight.	Winter Parking call out box	6-12	The call-out box language was edited to clarify that it is referring only to the City's ordinance. The County's ordinance is written for a larger and different geography that includes snow play on roads, and a change to the County ordinance is not recommended by this plan.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON213	Aaron	The winter parking ordinance may be fairly restrictive in writing - although in over 30 years, I have never witnessed it being enforced on anyone. For example, 2 years ago emergency vehicles (fire truck & ambulance) could not access our neighborhood due to 'permanently over-winter parked' vehicles along with the ensuing snow berms created around the vehicles edging into the middle of the road. Only small vehicles could squeeze through the street for many weeks until the snow berms melted on their own. Reports were provided to the city by several residents following the EMS debacle and nothing was done about it. Seems like a waste of energy to have an ordinance on the books that is widely ignored or disregarded altogether.	Winter Parking call out box	6-12	Enforcement is outside the scope of the Regional Plan. We interpret this comment as not in support of keeping the winter parking ordinance.
ON300	Crystal	The even/odd system is a great idea. There are so many areas where cars do not have the parking to meet the needs of the particular residence, and this would keep civilian aide PD units from spending countless hours on Winter Parking overtime work and save money in the long run.	Winter parking call out box	6-12	Odd/even is one of multiple options that can be considered to implement the related action item.
ON975	KB	Agree with others in that it's not restrictive if it's not enforced and it isn't. This is also why I can't agree with the reversal of parking space requirements in dense neighborhoods. In heavy snow winters, the streets in Flag townsite are a disaster of permanent parks "car-burbs" on both sides of narrow streets. Some blocks turn into dicey opportunistic one-ways.....meaning go quick and hope there's no oncoming traffic til you get to the next intersection - the street is too narrow to pass an oncoming car. The worst stretches are surrounding apartment buildings with not enough off-street parking. Throw in some un-shoveled sidewalks and the pedestrians get to join the fray too.	Winter Parking call out box	6-12	The legislature is requiring reductions in the amount of onsite parking that can be required in neighborhoods. Therefore addressing the need for on-street parking and what changes may be needed is a necessary response as other local decision-making is being preempted.
ON299	Crystal	Aaron, going to the City to report the issue isn't the route to take if this is an ongoing issue. Call the police department who is in charge of enforcing the ordinances to pass out warnings and tickets. I in fact just got a warning on my vehicle last week. So I have to disagree that it is not being addressed..	Winter parking call out box, reply to ON213	6-12	Enforcement is outside the scope of the Regional Plan.
CM91	Commission on Inclusion & Adaptive Living	"Implementing staff should... convert vehicle lanes into <u>accessible sidewalks, bicycle...</u> "	"Evaluate opportunities to convert vehicle lanes into bicycle infrastructure, micromobility zones, and transit infrastructure."	6-13	This guideline was removed, covered by TS.2.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON915	Val	<p>And have a plan to make them more travel worthy during snowy times.</p> <p>The picture in pg. 6-13 gave a thought to having these bicycle rack areas covered, protecting bikes from summer sun and winter snow improving the condition of bikes for the riders.</p>	"Improve the walkability of Urban Neighborhoods and Urban and Suburban Centers through infrastructure improvements, design improvements focused on multimodal objectives, and improved connectivity with surrounding areas."	6-13	This guideline was removed, covered by the revised Walkable Mixed Use Community Priority.
CM92	Commission on Inclusion & Adaptive Living	"Implementing staff should...quality, <u>fully accessible</u> ..."	"Provide and design around quality infrastructure for vulnerable road users first."	6-13	This guideline was removed, covered by TS.1.
CM93	Commission on Inclusion & Adaptive Living	update engineering standards...with greater connectivity, <u>greater accessibility</u> ..."	"Update subdivision and engineering standards for residential plats and mixed-use developments with greater connectivity, more grids, and road connections to provide greater transportation choices."	6-13	This guideline was removed, covered by MT.2a, MT.2b, and MT.5, as well as Ch.4 guidelines for all categories.
ON214	Zak	<p>Also pedestrian/ biker cut throughs, there are several on the west side of town subdivisions: S Thompson Loop - W Daydream Dr and S Rocking horse Ln - S Highland Mesa Dr (more I haven't found yet). These can make active transport trips shorter and easier than driving. They also provide the 'surprises' that make living in a city fun. These paths should be considered part of a holistic look at city development.</p>	"Update subdivision and engineering standards for residential plats and mixed-use developments with greater connectivity, more grids, and road connections to provide greater transportation choices."	6-13	This guideline was removed, covered by MT.2a, MT.2b, and MT.5, as well as Ch.4 guidelines for all categories.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON578	Ben Ruddell	See my other comment on “should” statements in this plan, which can be very problematic.	Goal TS Implementation Guidelines, referencing ON573 and ON574	6-13	The category of implementation guidelines was reorganized and deleted.
CM35	Bicycle Advisory Committee	Pages 6-13 and 6-14 spoke to engineering standards for roads and calming, but there is no mention of standards for bike infrastructure. These bicycle infrastructure standards should be developed. If the Regional Plan is not the appropriate document for this, perhaps the Regional Plan can support the development of standards in another policy document such as the ATMP or in the city’s code.	Transportation Implementation Guidelines	6-13	Note that the implementation guideline category was deleted and many of these guidelines were removed or reincorporated elsewhere. There is an action item on improving network connectivity for all modes and an action item on the City's forthcoming transportation master plan, which is as specific as the Regional Plan gets on this topic.
CM36	Bicycle Advisory Committee	the BAC discussed the need for public education and outreach in order to promote safety. One major topic of discussion was the creation and implementation of signage (e.g. bikes can use full lane signs, shared road signs, etc.). The Big Shift is a new concept for a lot of people and people will need education to understand how to use multimodal roadways.	Transportation Implementation Guidelines	6-13	Education is a programmatic consideration that is outside the scope of the Regional Plan. There is an action item on updating traffic rules and devices and an action item on signs and wayfinding.
ON216	Zak	Love this, more traffic calming, chicanes, raised pedestrian crossings	"Consider road diets and new micromobility opportunities in areas appropriate for multimodal and Complete Streets retrofits."	6-14	This guideline was removed and is covered by policies TS.3a and TS.3b.
ON218	Kim Austin	Temporary demonstration projects?	"Consider road diets and new micromobility opportunities in areas appropriate for multimodal and Complete Streets retrofits."	6-14	This guideline was removed and is covered by policies TS.3a and TS.3b.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON425	Sam Meier	And bike or micromobility device parking.	"Design streets with continuous pedestrian and bicycle infrastructure that is wide enough to provide safe, accessible use and opportunities for shelter and seating."	6-14	This guideline was removed. Policy MT.8 on bike parking was added.
ON1263	Nancy Branham	I have always thought that with Beaver and SF being one way streets in downtown that Leroux should be made pedestrian, bike only for at least 5 blocks north of Rte 66.	"Encourage physically separated bicycle and pedestrian infrastructure in the design of transportation projects based on traffic volume and context."	6-14	This suggestion is too specific for the Regional Plan. This is a concept that has been address in neighborhood plans in urban areas. Note that this guideline was removed.
ON219	Zak	It seems like this has happened at S Woody Ln. Theres a large apartment complex going in (fully support apartments) but they don't have any nearby services, its not mixed use (seemingly), forcing them to drive to get groceries etc. I just read in the Mountain Line plan there might be an extension, but its still a ways to go by bus for daily services, and people are likely to just get in a personal vehicle at that point.	"If a new development is outside current routing, coordinate with Mountain Line early in the development process to discuss solutions."	6-14	Bus line 8 was extended toward the Timber Sky development. The extension just started operating recently.
ON1244	Erica Rackley	How will the City keep FUTS trails free of snow?	"Maintain streets, pedestrian paths, bikeways, crossings, and FUTS trails in good condition and free of snow, debris, and obstructions so they are safe and functional for all users, regardless of transportation mode."	6-14	This is too detailed and programmatic for the Regional Plan. Note that this guideline became an action item.
CM37	Bicycle Advisory Committee	BAC members noted that a repeated barrier for a complete bikeways system is the cost of developing bicycle infrastructure for new development. The committee discussed whether the Plan does or can include having developers pay impact fees to help pay for that infrastructure to connect to City's multimodal infrastructure.	Goal MT Implementation Guidelines	6-14	There is an action item to evaluate the potential for this.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
CM94	Commission on Inclusion & Adaptive Living	ADD>>"Enforce city ordinances that require residents and businesses to keep sidewalks clear of snow, debris and other obstructions so they are safe and functional for all users."	Goal MT Implementation Guidelines	6-14	Enforcement is outside the scope of the Regional Plan
ON220	Ira Allen	Sorry, where is there anything here about light rail? I can't find it.	Goal MT Implementation Guidelines	6-14	Flagstaff does not have the density to support light rail. It's currently fiscally infeasible.
ON917	Val	Would this be a good place to mention getting large delivery trucks out of the streets down town?	Goal TR Implementation Guidelines	6-14	The concept of curb management discussed in MT.6 (formerly ST.2) includes addressing delivery drop off locations on streets.
ON222	Zak	Upvote	"Consider trading parking for fire department access to allow for greater infill development and public safety on streets with limited right-of-way."	6-15	This implementation guideline was removed. Parking policies were added in Ch.3.
W50		5th bullet: incorporate universal design	"Encourage sidewalk cafes and parklets in Urban and Suburban Centers to support businesses and public space activation."	6-15	This guideline was removed, covered by MT.7. Accessibility was incorporated into a different Ch. 6 action item on Code and Standards updates.
ON224	Zak	More parklets in the urban setting!	"Encourage sidewalk cafes and parklets in Urban and Suburban Centers"	6-15	This guideline was removed, covered by MT.7.
ON918	Val	Love this!!	"Improve multimodal access and transit service to and from the airport, including transit, bicycle infrastructure and storage, and parking services."	6-15	This guideline was removed, covered by A.1.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON916	Val	including making these places NO IDLE ZONES.	"Incorporate into the Transportation Master Plan protocols for managing drop-off and pick-up areas for taxis, rideshares, tour buses, and autonomous vehicles in Centers."	6-15	The concept of curb management discussed in MT.6 (formerly ST.2) includes addressing delivery drop off locations on streets. This topic can be explored further in the upcoming City transportation master plan.
ON221	Zak	Upvote	"Where alternate routes for vehicle and bus traffic are available, encourage temporary street events to promote economic vitality, multimodal objectives, and community building."	6-15	This guideline was removed.
ON958	Laura Huenneke	The chapter doesn't really discuss the fact that visitors arrive in the Region in other ways than via Pulliam (and private vehicles on interstate and other highways). Might attention be paid to maintaining/building connection with bus lines and regional shuttle services, using steps similar to the ones listed here for Goal A?	Goal A Implementation Guidelines	6-15	MT.6 (formerly FR.1) is on connectivity between passenger rail and other modes. The Amtrak station is also a pick up/drop off location for bus service.
W51		not reflected in the goal or policy	Goal PK - Implementing Dept. Staff should	6-15	Three of these guidelines became parking policies.
ON891	Dee Hoagland	Encourage larger businesses to provide electric vehicle charging stations.	Goal PK Implementation Guidelines	6-15	This is covered by CA.3 (formerly CA.6).
CM96	Commission on Inclusion & Adaptive Living	"Implementing staff should...ADD>> Incorporate the principles of universal design ensuring ADA compliance in street design and pedestrian and bicycle infrastructure."	Goal ST Implementation Guidelines	6-15	The implementation guideline category was deleted. A Best Practice on universal design was added in Ch.3.
L34	ASLD (Rhonda Buss)	Please ensure that ASLD is included in the draft review of this document as it may relate to STL.	"Complete a Streets Master Plan for the City of Flagstaff..."	6-16	Per meeting on 1/13/25, Engineering will follow up on this separate process with ASLD via quarterly meetings.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
CM97	Commission on Inclusion & Adaptive Living	“Plan...Great Street design standards, <u>the principles of Universal Design</u> ,...”	"Complete a Streets Master Plan for the City of Flagstaff that incorporates... Great street design standards, and FHWA Safe System approaches."	6-16	This action item was simplified.
CM99	Commission on Inclusion & Adaptive Living	“Fund...create new <u>accessible pedestrian crossings with accessible pedestrian signal devices</u> ...”	"Continue to fill in sidewalk gaps and create new pedestrian and bike crossings in the existing City infrastructure with funding from the transportation sales tax (Proposition 419)"	6-16	Accessibility was added to the action item on updating code and standards.
ON302	Crystal	Great idea. Speaking of equity in relation to the winter parking ordinance section: The odd/even is a great idea. With the housing crisis, there are so many residences that have multiple people living in the home with multiple vehicles and not enough off street parking. People don't have the extra money to pay for these parking tickets. If there was an implementation of the “odd/even” system this would alleviate that burden for residents.	"Evaluate alternative methods of snow removal to allow for year-round, on-street parking, and multi-modal travel (City only)."	6-16	Odd/even is one of multiple options that can be considered to implement the related action item.
ON427	Sam Meier	I would like to see a high priority action item which includes gathering data on current infrastructure use for bicyclists and pedestrians. A common issue in conversations with City staff is that the City does not have data on, for instance, the most highly trafficked streets or routes in terms of bicyclists, pedestrians, and micromobility users, which makes it hard to argue for or implement improvements for those users along those popular routes. This seems like it could be a high priority action item as data collection is not as costly as, for instance, grade-separated railroad crossings. However, having robust data on non-vehicle road users is critical to the goals outlined in the Regional Plan, particularly in terms of increasing accessibility to multimodal transportation alternatives.	"Evaluate alternative methods of snow removal to allow for year-round, on-street parking, and multi-modal travel (City only)."	6-16	This is outside the scope of the Regional Plan, but could be addressed by the transportation master plan.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
CM98	Commission on Inclusion & Adaptive Living	“Code...Update engineering standards to improve network connectivity and accessibility to all...”	"Update City Subdivision Code and Engineering Standards to improve network connectivity for and to all travel modes..."	6-16	Edit made.
W63	Commission on Inclusion & Adaptive Living	sidewalk safety and compliance with ADA should be an action item	Action Items	6-16	This is already required.
W64	Commission on Inclusion & Adaptive Living	need for accessible pedestrian signals that chirp to be installed whenever old ones are replaced and a proactive program to replace them like SLEDS did for lighting	Action Items	6-16	This is too detailed for the Regional Plan.
ON1104	david r	Neither are really pedestrian or bike friendly. Also, crossing Old 66 and Milton is a bear. Either more crosswalks or some pedestrian/bike bridges. Be awesome to have one crossing Old 66 and the tracks at Beaver, going from city parking lot to city parking lot.	"These include the railroad overpass at Lone Tree Road and connecting JW Powell Boulevard to Fourth Street."	6-2	There is a planned FUTS that would go under 66 and Railroad just west of City Hall and connect to the Downtown Connection Center (Phoenix/Beaver area).
L210	Equity Climate Advisory Group	There was a commenter that noted on the new Lone Tree overpass and JW Powell extension that this will induce traffic and ultimately we need public transit and non car focused transportation. I agree with Zak that the ultimate answer is a more robust public transit system. But for folks like me who work overnight shifts and have to cross south over the tracks to get to and from work, I am personally excited to cut my drive time by simply being able to bypass the train (and ultimately reduce emissions). This seemingly minor fix of the overpass on Lone Tree or JW Powell extension won't be as effective for everyone but for some it will make a big difference in their commute. In the summer months when there is light out, I even look forward to having a safer bike route because now my route would mean Ponderosa to Butler which does not feel safe. Additionally, Fire Station 2 which is the busiest station in the city at times experiences delayed services due to the train crossing. That is a problem that cannot be solved by public transit and requires better roadway access.	"These include the railroad overpass at Lone Tree Road and the connecting JW Powell Boulevard to Fourth Street."	6-2	No change suggested.
ON180	Zak	Upvote	"This is a fundamental change in how the transportation system is designed and how people move around the community."	6-2	No change suggested.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON179	Zak	Upvote	"What has been learned from these decades of decision making is that expanding roadways typically induces more driving..."	6-2	No change suggested.
ON421	Sam Meier	I would say that busier, larger roads "are" more uncomfortable, not "may be." This language seems unnecessarily soft.	"Wider, busier roads may become uncomfortable for some non-vehicular users, discouraging the use of alternative modes of transportation"	6-2	Edit made.
CM32	Bicycle Advisory Committee	Narrower roads assist with traffic calming, as discussed in 6-2.	Roads and Streets	6-2	No change suggested.
ON177	Zak	Congestion cant be fixed. Any action taken in this direction will only lead to induced demand. The answer is public transit and on-car focused transportation.	Roads and Streets	6-2	The road network does have identified bottlenecks due to its irregular pattern and crossings of the railway and I-40, as described on p. 6-1. The section on TDM in this chapter expands on the point raised by this comment.
ON178	Zak	*The answer is public transit and non-car focused transportation.	Roads and Streets, reply to ON177	6-2	No change suggested.
ON296	Crystal	I agree with Zak that the ultimate answer is a more robust public transit system. But for folks like me who work overnight shifts and have to cross south over the tracks to get to and from work, I am personally very excited to cut my drive time by simply being able to bypass the train. This little fix of the overpass on Lone Tree won't be as effective for everyone but for some it will. Additionally, Fire Station 2 which is the busiest station in the city at times experiences delayed services due to the train. That is a problem that cannot be solved by public transit and requires better roadway access.	Roads and Streets, reply to ON177 and ON178	6-2	No change suggested.
ON297	Crystal	Lastly, in relation to a non car focused commute, in the summer months when there is light out, I look forward to having a safer bike route because currently my commute would be from Ponderosa to Butler which does not feel safe.	Roads and Streets, reply to ON296, ON177, ON178	6-2	We are glad to hear that this project will improve your options for bike commuting.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON1137	Laura Huenneke	There is very little in this chapter addressing visitors and their (current or potential) use of and impact on recreational facilities. Given the magnitude and importance of visitation/tourism (and of part-time residents), this might be important to consider more explicitly. What funding mechanisms are possible when non-residents comprise large proportions of users? What sort of educational outreach might be appropriate to help visitors understand what they are seeing, and what their own impacts might be and how those could be mitigated?	Transportation Chapter	6-2	Funding and education are programmatic topics and outside the scope of the Regional Plan.
CM86	Commission on Inclusion & Adaptive Living	"Active Transportation...roadways uncomfortable, <u>inaccessible</u> , or..."	"Active transportation users find numerous roadways in the Region uncomfortable or even dangerous to cross because the corridors are wide..."	6-3	Edit made.
ON186	Zak	Upvote. I feel this any time I need to cross Milton, bike along Milton, or go anywhere near Milton. Same with 66.	"Active transportation users find numerous roadways in the Region uncomfortable or even dangerous to cross..."	6-3	No change suggested.
ON906	Val	Add "complies with the Carbon Neutrality Plan".	"Is comprehensive and cohesive, so anyone can travel conveniently and easily by bicycle to destinations and neighborhoods throughout the community."	6-3	The layered network is proposed in the Active Transportation Master Plan, which is entirely separate from the Carbon Neutrality Plan, though they have some common goals.
ON185	Zak	Love traffic calming devices. Something to consider on streets like Butler, separated one way traffic induces speeding because of the lack of 'edge friction.' One of the sides of the current traffic pattern could be devoted to both directions (north?) and the other side could be dedicated to busses/ walkers/ cyclists (south?).	"Narrower roads provide additional space for features, such as bike lanes, street tree coverage, or traffic calming devices that lead to a more comfortable..."	6-3	This is too specific for the Regional Plan but could be addressed in the forthcoming transportation master plan.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON181	Sam Meier	I would suggest adding something about micromobility devices here (e.g. scooters, e scooters, skateboards, etc.) as another option apart from bicycles and pedestrians.	"Other approaches include... improving streets so they are more comfortable for all pedestrians, cyclists, and transit users."	6-3	Edit made.
ON950	Laura Huenneke	insert "and safer"	"Other approaches include... improving streets so they are more comfortable for all pedestrians, cyclists, and transit users."	6-3	Edit made.
ON188	Ira Allen	Do you see that working well with five+ million tourists a year, nearly all driving personal vehicles, most with no investment whatsoever in local culture? Sounds to me like massive ongoing worsening of traffic, driven also by the fact that there's nothing here that envisions bringing mass transit to the areas with greatest room for affordable housing infill. (Buses ain't it.)	"Potential options for appropriately designating areas for narrow streets include specifying lane width in lane design standards or even implementing a context classification system for road design based on area needs."	6-3	This is a consideration for the transportation master plan, as to where this could be safely implemented. Flagstaff does not have the density to support light rail. It is fiscally infeasible.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON189	Zak	I agree with this to an extent. If visitors understand the easiest option will be for them to leave their car at the hotel and walk/bike/ public transit from there it could alleviate this concern. Ideally people took public transit from Phoenix (or the Flagstaff airport) and onward to the Grand Canyon, but until that day friction of the personal vehicle after its initial arrive may be the best action.	"Potential options for appropriately designating areas for narrow streets include specifying lane width in lane design standards or even implementing a context classification system for road design based on area needs." Reply to ON188	6-3	No change suggested.
ON901	Val	Creative thinking is needed to get tourists from their hotels to points of interest...horse drawn carriages maybe, streets that are pedestrian only??	"Potential options for appropriately designating areas for narrow streets include specifying lane width in lane design standards or even implementing a context classification system for road design based on area needs." Reply to ON189 and ON188	6-3	This is outside the scope of the Regional Plan. Pedestrian-only streets is an idea that has been addressed in neighborhood plans in urban areas.
ON905	Val	How can Flagstaff/Snowbowl get Skiers from HOTELS..not just the current high school parking lot?	"Potential options for appropriately designating areas for narrow streets include specifying lane width in lane design standards or even implementing a context classification system for road design based on area needs." Reply to ON189 and ON188	6-3	Outside the scope of the plan. Mountain Line would be the decision-maker on this.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON182	Zak	<p>This one is so important, these grade separated crossings can also function as traffic calming devices. As cars get taller (dumb) it is harder for drivers to see bikers, pedestrians, or pets. Raising them up to driver level is important.</p> <p>Mid crossing devices would be useful in so many of the roads I walk on a daily basis where there may not even be a sidewalk on the far side, much less a pedestrian crossing at an intersection (looking at you North side of W University)</p>	"Providing enhanced and grade-separated crossings is another key element to provide safe, comfortable access across roads of the FUTS, bikeways, and other trails and paths within the active transportation network."	6-3	No change suggested.
ON183	Zak	Upvote	"The ATMP targets increasing active transportation from 27 to 54 percent of all trips, and from 17 to 34 percent of trips commuting to and from work, by 2042"	6-3	No change suggested.
ON187	Zak	Upvote! People who don't own cars are also citizens and residents and they deserve the right to travel freely just like vehicle owners.	"Walking and biking are critical modes of transportation for the significant portion of our community that cannot drive or does not have access to a vehicle."	6-3	No change suggested.
CM33	Bicycle Advisory Committee	The BAC discussed confusion regarding Great Streets in 6-3; again, the committee finds this concept to be vague, particularly in relationship to other concepts, such as primary, secondary, and tertiary bikeways. Is a primary bikeway a Great Street? Do all Great Streets function as primary bikeways?	Active Transportation	6-3	These are two unrelated concepts. There may be bikeways on Great Streets or not and bikeways may occur on other streets without this designation.
CM34	Bicycle Advisory Committee	The BAC discussed that enhanced and grade-separated crossings (6-3) are good for safety, but that such crossings also need to be convenient in terms of timing and frequency. For example, pedestrians are more likely to jaywalk if the signals at crossings are too infrequent. The BAC suggests adding this language.	Active Transportation	6-3	This is too much detail for the regional plan and covered very well in the ATMP.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON1041	Krista Ames-Cook	How is a move toward Active Transportation viable in a region that has snow and ice for weeks and months at a time? What options are available during inclement and extreme weather?	Active Transportation	6-3	Two action items on snow operations and maintenance of active transportation infrastructure were added (former implementation guidelines).
ON576	Ben Ruddell	We won't succeed at making cycling a primary method for Flagstaff's commuting unless we check a few boxes. Some of these won't do; you need to do them all. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Continuous pathways that aren't interrupted - physically separated from both pedestrian and motor traffic, including grade-separated crossings. - Plowed and maintained ice-free in winter. - Without too many stops; every block is too many; every half mile or more is more reasonable. - Pathways from major residential neighborhoods to university and downtown. - Bike parking (this one is easy and mostly already accomplished). 	Active Transportation	6-3	These are encouraged by MT, TS, and PK policies, as well as guidelines in Ch.4 and action items in Ch.6.
ON184	Sam Meier	I don't know if you spelled out ATMP in this section, so you may wish to do so in order to connect these documents again, or if people are reading the sections out of order.	Roads and Streets	6-3	We only spell it out the first time it shows up in the document and there is a index of abbreviations that can be referenced.
ON190	Zak	This would be especially important for center stationed bus rapid transit like what is seen in Albuquerque, NM: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=qyOHoYqsj4k	"Pedestrian crossings are an essential element of a robust transit system especially when they provide a safe connection to and from transit stops and final destinations."	6-4	No change suggested.
CM87	Commission on Inclusion & Adaptive Living	"Fully accessible pedestrian crossings with accessible pedestrian signal devices..."	"Pedestrian crossings are an essential element of a robust transit system..."	6-4	No change, the definition of pedestrian includes wheelchair users.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON193	Sam Meier	65 to match other numbers	"Sixty-five percent of transit riders say Mountain Line is their only source of transportation..."	6-4	This was spelled out because it is the start of the sentence.
ON192	Sam Meier	A question I get frequently is where people using micromobility devices can and should go in terms of roadways, bike lanes, and sidewalks. It might be helpful to briefly mention where these devices can legally be used.	"To support further adoption of micromobility devices, it is important to provide safe and comfortable routes for micromobility users and consider these devices alongside bicycles and pedestrians when planning for shared streets."	6-4	This is determined by the State legislature and may change over time and was therefore purposefully left out of the plan. There is an action item on updating traffic rules and devices for the safe operation of micromobility vehicles.
ON191	Sam Meier	Is there anything in here about leading pedestrian intervals at crossings?	"Typical treatments include median refuge islands, advanced yield lines, curb extensions, landscape features, pedestrian activated beacons, advanced warning signage, and pedestrian-scaled lighting."	6-4	This is too detailed for the Regional Plan.
ON577	Ben Ruddell	The mountain line is pretty good. It does however need more and more frequent express busses during commuting hours to attract more middle class ridership.	Transit	6-4	This is covered by Goal TR. See also the Mountain Line Five Year Transit Plan.
ON970	KB	I have a love/hate relationship with the bus. I frequently ride it to and from work instead of contribute to traffic. But if my morning work schedule includes must-attend events, I gotta drive. The bus just isn't reliable enough. I've been juked too many times.	Transit	6-4	Goal TR supports increasing frequency and service.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON195	Zak	Is this tied to reduced parking minimums or similar that allow greater density development? What are the implications of the Permanent Transit Network?	"It provides opportunities for transfers and to create a transit supportive land use pattern."	6-6	Yes. Transit accessibility is also called out in Chapter 4 guidelines. More information on the Permanent Transit Network is available in the Mountain Line Five Year Transit Plan.
ON952	Laura Huenneke	can comment explicitly that this limits options for both residents and visitors, making them almost exclusively dependent on private vehicles for connecting to air flights.	"There is currently no public transit serving the airport."	6-6	Mountain Line intends to serve the airport with transit in the future. They would be the agency leading this effort.
ON196	Ira Allen	You HAVE to know this will not increase efficiency; it'll increase throughput, leaving traffic impacts unchanged *at best*.	"To increase safety and efficiency, BNSF is working in coordination with the Rio de Flag Flood Control Project and the Downtown Mile Project to complete a third rail next to the two existing rails."	6-6	"Safety and efficiency" refers to rail operations here, not impacts to traffic or those crossing the tracks.
ON911	Val	What is the impact of delivery systems like Amazon. etc.?	Airport, Rail, and Freight	6-6	This information is not particularly connected to land use.
CM88	Commission on Inclusion & Adaptive Living	<u>ADD >>In cooperation with the Americans with Disabilities Act and the Federal Transit Authority, Mountain Line Paratransit provides an "ADA Guaranteed Ride Area". This is an origin to destination, demand-responsive paratransit service that mirrors Mountain Line fixed-route service in terms of service times and areas."</u>	Transit	6-6	Edit made.
ON907	Val	confusing wording	"If funding for transportation cannot keep up, the Region could face in a poor fiscal situation."	6-7	Revised.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON423	Sam Meier	I think a definition for "most vulnerable community members" would be helpful here. I'm reading that this means pedestrians, cyclists, and micromobility users, but "vulnerable" could mean many different things.	"Support safety and convenience for the most vulnerable community members"	6-7	Changed to "vulnerable road users" to match the language in the rest of the chapter. This is defined in the context of a study on p. 6-11 but does not have a singular definition in the plan.
ON198	Zak	This should be highlighted as much as possible and permitting/ review fees for infill should reflect the SAVINGS and INCREASED EFFICIENCY of that development and rural/ opens space should reflect the opposite.	"The larger and more spread out the transportation system gets, the more costly maintaining it becomes."	6-7	This suggestion is outside the scope of the Regional Plan.
ON1042	Krista Ames-Cook	Why are the same photos being used multiple times in this document? Seems like there should be plenty of images available of Flagstaff so that duplicates are not needed. Also, license plate numbers should be blurred when possible.	Photo on 6-7	6-7	This photo was updated in Ch.6 and replaced with a different one in Ch.3.
ON200	Sam Meier	Assistive devices are not addressed until this section of the plan (if I interpret 'roll' to be about wheelchairs or other similar devices). It seems like an oversight not to mention folks who use assistive devices up top as a group of vulnerable road users.	"One of the commonly heard themes during the scenario planning process was the need for the Region to improve infrastructure for those who walk, ride, roll, and use transit."	6-8	People using assistive devices are under the category of pedestrians according to the State statute. A definition was added to the glossary.
CM89	Commission on Inclusion & Adaptive Living	"Safety and convenience...improve infrastructure and <u>infrastructure accessibility</u> for..."	"One of the most commonly heard themes... was the need for the Region to improve infrastructure for those who walk, ride, roll, and use transit."	6-8	This is covered by "improve infrastructure... for people who walk, ride, roll..."
ON199	Ira Allen	This is all just fantasy-based. Start planning light rail or the equivalent already. Come on!	"Reducing Reliance on the Automobile"	6-8	Flagstaff does not have the density to support light rail. It's currently fiscally infeasible.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON201	David	Not sure how what "regional in commuting" is? Could be reworded, is this trying to say people commuting in from the surrounding area?	"The location of these investments allows increased but still limited funding to be spent more efficiently and to create lower household transportation costs and decrease regional in commuting by supporting affordable housing."	6-8	Edit made.
ON954	Laura Huenneke	Not sure where in this chapter this concept might best fit...A very interesting model to look at is Holland Michigan, which like Flagstaff seeks to preserve an attractive, vibrant central core for locals and visitors alike in a potentially harsh winter climate. They have invested in heated sidewalks in core areas of their downtown, which keep pedestrians and active transportation users safe and buzzing along all winter no matter the conditions. I would imagine this greatly reduces rates of injuries due to falls and improves access for commercial purposes. (I didn't see much or any discussion in this chapter about winter conditions limiting the use and safety of pedestrian, bicycle, or similar modes of transportation.) Of course this is a very expensive tactic to pursue (I would guess), but in a long-term plan I wonder if it merits mention as a potential for future investment.	Reducing Reliance on the Automobile	6-8	Heated sidewalks have been installed on a smaller scale in certain locations in Flagstaff. Filling sidewalk gaps would be a higher priority, see Ch. 6 action items.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON202	Zak	This could also be accomplished through overturning parking minimums, especially in the highest density zones. When we build at car scale its hard to go back to human scale. Build at human scale in the first place and you don't have a need to get in a car.	"The City and other businesses or institutions have many yet-to-be implemented options to manage travel demand further, ranging from code changes that would incentivize demand management to encouraging carpooling at Flagstaff's kindergarten-through-12th-grade schools."	6-9	The Regional Plan Committee discussed removing parking minimums as an action item but did not feel it is appropriate in all parts of the community and is not applicable in the County.
ON579	Ben Ruddell	Almost everything in this chapter of the plan depends on preventing catastrophic forest fires. It is the pass/fail policy issue for Flagstaff's environment. What are we going to do to solve that problem?	"All the resources discussed in this chapter have been influenced by people in the Region and influence the Region's communities by affecting how individuals live, work, and play, and how neighborhoods function."	7-1	Added sentence to introductory section on wildfire risk.
ON597	Bruce Edward Fox	Resources are DEFINED by humans not just influenced. This is importantant because as times change, "resources" change as humans re-define and revalue the natural world.	"All the resources discussed in this chapter have been influenced by people in the Region and influence the Region's communities by affecting how individuals live, work, and play, and how neighborhoods function."	7-1	Changed to "resources... are interdependent with the people in the Region."

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON414	Sat Best	add "native plant communities"	"For centuries, the Region's landscape has sustained Indigenous cultures, wildlife, dark skies, forestry, agriculture, and natural beauty."	7-1	This sentence was moved to p. 3-12. The next sentence now includes vegetation types.
ON599	Bruce Edward Fox	ALSO wildlife habitat and native flora	"Key land use topics in environmental planning are forestry, livestock grazing, agriculture and farming, energy development, mineral extraction, scenery and recreation management, and urban development."	7-1	Added clarifying language.
ON598	Bruce Edward Fox	This false dichotomy does not serve us well. Only when we realize that human systems are one of the many systems in our natural world can we really move ahead. If not, we will keep trying to "manage" rather than be part of the environment	"Maintaining the balance between natural and human systems and providing for conservation and production of resources that support human development is a key part of environmental planning"	7-1	The purpose of these two paragraphs is to explain the terms environmental planning and stewardship. Lands within the Region are subject to both frameworks regardless of our preferences.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON855	Erika Nowak	<p>should this be protection of resources? I assume the city is not generally in the business of "production" of resources.</p> <p>If production was intended, then protection of resources should also be added to this paragraph. By definition, "environmental planning" assumes some protection of (environmental) resources.</p>	"Maintaining the balance between natural and human systems, and providing for conservation and production of resources that support human development is a key part of environmental planning."	7-1	Conservation is the predominant framework for environmental stewardship in the Region. Protection is a standard that applies only to limited public lands.
L86	Karen Enyedy	<p>The paragraph above does not mention tribal governments and/or Navajo Nation and tribal governments. I believe this is because the Regional Plan has no authority over these entities but I'm mentioning nonetheless in case I'm wrong and it does have some authority.</p>	"Stewardship of the natural and cultural environment is the shared responsibility of every person who lives, works, or visits the Region, including federal and state agencies, the City, County, private organizations, and their non-profit partners."	7-1	Edit made.
L87	Karen Enyedy	<p>"Key land use topics in environmental planning are forestry, livestock grazing, agriculture and farming, energy development, mineral extraction, <u>open space management</u>, scenery and recreation management, and urban development. These topics are discussed in greater detail in Chapter 4, Growth and Land Use, and Chapter 8, Parks, Recreation, and Open Space."</p>	Environmental Planning	7-1	Open space management is part of recreation management.
ON922	Val	<p>Add City and County Carbon Neutrality /Climate Action and Adaptability Plan. Even though these plans are addressed later they should be mentioned specifically.</p>	Environmental Stewardship - A Place like No Other	7-1	This paragraph does not summarize the Carbon Neutrality Plan. See Endnote 1.
ON923	Val	<p>add Carbon Neutrality Plan/Climate action and Adaption Plan. These plans are discussed a bit later, however they should be stated plainly.</p>	Environmental Stewardship - A Place like No Other	7-1	This paragraph does not summarize the Carbon Neutrality Plan. See Endnote 1.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON453	Alexander Shenkin	An often overlooked part of our environment is the audible environment. As Flagstaff has grown, noise - particularly from freeways - has become a serious issue. Noise from freeways detracts from Flagstaff's natural beauty. It also negatively affects local communities and biodiversity. This must be addressed in the regional plan, or it will worsen further with growth. Solutions could include noise walls along particularly troublesome stretches of freeway.	RSR Chapter	7-1	Air traffic and rail noise are outside the scope of the Regional Plan.
ON580	Ben Ruddell	AS's comment is important. The sound pollution within a mile of the interstate and railroad is severe. Route 66 is also a problem. And, unlike our neighbors in Phoenix and Tucson, it appears we have not been given equal priority by ADOT or the state legislature for funding mitigation measures like sound walls. This must be addressed in the plan. More than half of the city lives within less than a mile of an unmitigated transportation noise hazard. This leaves aside the lesser (for now) issue of the intermittent hospital helicopters and airport traffic.	RSR Chapter, referencing ON453	7-1	Air traffic and rail noise are outside the scope of the Regional Plan.
CM8	Open Spaces Commission	"Resource Guidelines should be expanded: For example, why aren't the large stands of Ponderosa Pines, Prairie dog colonies, escarpments, etc. not mapped? We believe that these should be included in our natural resources and wildlife. The significant natural resources map should be comprehensive."	"Additional Guidelines for Significant Natural Resources"	7-10	Page 7-8 explains the rationale for having mapped and unmapped resources. The map in the current plan was not a useful tool in assisting property owners with natural resource decision-making. For instance if an area was not shown on the map as a prairie dog colony, then some people thought they don't have to worry about it, i.e. "But it's not on the map so it's not significant?" In the case of Ponderosa pines the Resource Protection Plan for properties is a finer level tool to encourage their preservation and mapping them at a larger spatial scale could create conflicting data.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
L21	Sat Best	"I'm very excited to see the implementation section that includes the preservation of wildlife corridors, seeps/springs, rock outcroppings and prairie dog colonies. (Thank you staff and Committee!) This is something that I and others have worked on for years. The text with each element seems to be in preparation for inclusion in the Zoning Code, and that would be a great step forward."	"Additional Guidelines for Significant Natural Resources"	7-10	Note that the guidelines were moved to Ch.3 as Best Practices for the Conservation of Significant Natural Resources (p. 3-14).
ON935	Val	Include link.	"For local technical information, consult the Arizona Earthquake Information Center."	7-10	Edit made.
ON649	Bruce Edward Fox	Important to go beyond knowledge and to incorporate this knowledge into the planning process	"For public projects, consult with and be aware of how cultural practices and the needs of Hispanic, African American, and Indigenous people could be affected in both natural and cultural resources."	7-10	This guideline was removed. It is covered by CR.2 and Ch.7 action items.
ON821	Sat Best	Add conditions to development projects so that native plant communities and the topsoil that supports them are protected and retained wherever possible.	"Maintain native plant communities and soil conditions in utility and other rights of way such as road shoulders, drainage areas, FUTS segments, passive parks, and open space."	7-10	This guideline was revised to include "when locating roads, trails, or buildings." However, this guideline cannot be required, only encouraged. It was moved to Ch.3 as part of the Best Practices for the Conservation of Significant Natural Resources.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON873	Erika Nowak	I'd suggest adding: maintain native plant communities and soil conditions and actively remove non-native plants in..."	"Maintain native plant communities and soil conditions in utility and other rights of way such as road shoulders, drainage areas, FUTS segments, passive parks, and open space."	7-10	This guideline was revised and moved to Ch.3 as part of the Best Practices for the Conservation of Significant Natural Resources. Native and invasive plants are also addressed through Policy RS.8.
ON933	Val	Removal, or notation of where non natives are located (for proper removal) can be accomplished by all Flag. residents as well as visitors. Just needs education done through various associations and agencies.	"Maintain native plant communities and soil conditions in utility and other rights of way such as road shoulders, drainage areas, FUTS segments, passive parks, and open space." Reply to ON873	7-10	See the Ch.7 high priority action item on invasive plant programs. Note that this guideline was revised and moved to Ch.3 as a Best Practice for the Conservation of Significant Natural Resources.
ON613	Bruce Edward Fox	or may not?	"Significant natural resources may contribute to"	7-10	Not all significant natural resources contribute to everything listed in the sentence.
ON934	Val	Or change the wording to "Must".	"Significant natural resources may contribute to" Reply to ON613	7-10	Not all significant natural resources contribute to everything listed in the sentence.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON615	Bruce Edward Fox	How?	"Some significant natural resources lack reliable spatial data and are not mapped but should be considered alongside mapped resources."	7-10	This sentence was revised to "should be included in updates to resource survey requirements and considered in discretionary rezoning cases on applicable properties to the extent that can be done so legally." A few sentences down, the text includes that site-specific data should be collected and verified by the appropriate resource professionals.
ON875	Erika Nowak	the "significant natural resources and conditions maps" link does not work, thus it is not possible to carefully evaluate this critical piece of the regional plan for wildlife and critical resource/habitat protection.	"The Significant Natural Resources and Conditions maps (Information Map 7-2 and 7-3) provides information to consider when evaluating property for development or when drafting development proposals."	7-10	This link directed to the maps on page 7-13 and 7-14, but they unfortunately did not function on the Konveio commenting platform, only if the full PDF was downloaded. The internal links are functional in the updated draft. An online interactive map is now available on the project website.
ON876	Erika Nowak	"evaluate"	"The Significant Natural Resources and Conditions maps (Information Map 7-2 and 7-3) provides information to consider when evaluating property for development or when drafting development proposals." Reply to ON875	7-10	No change suggested.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON614	Bruce Edward Fox	Why?	"These high-value areas for conservation should be aligned with the locations of parks and open space, or civic space in development plans"	7-10	Aligning conservation objectives with parks and open space objectives can be an efficient use of land and can create a stronger argument for not developing a parcel or section of property when the objectives are combined. The type of resource and design of park/open space is an important consideration here.
ON612	Bruce Edward Fox	this is somewhat circular reasoning.	"'Significant natural resources' refers to natural resources and features that are important to the ecosystem because of their ecological role, scientific or habitat value, and/or uniqueness."	7-10	This definition was agreed upon by the natural resource professionals who were involved in writing this section. The next sentence expands on the definition.
L170	Equity Climate Advisory Group	To further support policy RS.7, update implementation to include: Develop specific replicable frameworks for consulting and incorporating Indigenous knowledge including Indigenous-led ecological monitoring; establish partnerships with Tribal leadership and incorporate two-way exchanges of knowledge; Recognize Tribal sovereignty and support co-management/co-stewardship initiatives; Create pathways to support Tribal rights and data sovereignty when engaging Indigenous knowledge.	Goal RS Implementation Guidelines	7-10	The implementation guidelines were deleted but an action item was added on collaboration with Indigenous leaders for natural and cultural resource projects.
L212	Equity Climate Advisory Group	"Implementation guidelines for participatory processes: Guideline: collaborate with community organization and leaders to ensure inclusive and equitable participation in decision-making processes"	Goal RS implementation guidelines	7-10	The implementation guidelines were deleted but four action items were added (two of them were former guidelines) related to this suggestion.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON961	Emily Renn	City owned properties and public properties could also be added here	"Include wildlife corridors in open space conservation priorities."	7-11	It was specifically left out because we do not have the legal authority to restrict development on such a wide area of land without dollars to purchase it. Note that this guideline was moved to the Best Practices for the Conservation of Natural Resources in Ch.3.
ON616	Bruce Edward Fox	Does staff really preserve natural topography?	"Preserve natural topography in open spaces, especially where there are rare plants and unique geology."	7-11	Yes. For decades. Note that this guideline was moved to the Best Practices for the Conservation of Natural Resources in Ch.3.
L26	ASLD (Rhonda Buss)	Some floodplain areas may be determined to be buildable (after further study) and STL is allowed one dwelling unit per acre per ARS 9-461.06. N. and ARS 11-804.E. Are density transfers allowed by right for buildable STL parcels?	"Prevent construction in the 100-year floodplain and conserve natural features through zoning and development review."	7-11	ASLD will follow up with review to ensure that there are no parcel specific issues that they were considering in writing this comment.
ON953	Emily Renn	There was a map of Gunnison's prairie dog colonies included in the previous Regional Plan. That map layer needs to be updated.	Gunnison's Prairie Dog Colonies	7-11	Page 7-8 explains the rational for having mapped and unmapped resources. The map in the current plan was not a useful tool in assisting property owners with natural resource decision-making. For instance if an area was not shown on the map as a prairie dog colony, then some people thought they didn't have to worry about it, i.e. "But it's not on the map so it's not significant?"

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON859	Paul Beier	<p>Add 2 more bullets here:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Obtain or develop a comprehensive map of riparian areas. • Manage surface flow and use reclaimed water to maintain and enhance riparian areas. 	Riparian Areas, including Springs, Seeps, Wetlands, and Alluvial Soils	7-11	This comment prompted a follow up conversation on the feasibility of bullet #1 and it was determined that this data was not yet available but could be added to the map at a later date. An action item was added for improving available data for resource conservation. The second bullet is addressed in Ch. 9 and the WQ policies in Ch.3.
ON878	Erika Nowak	Avoid developing land in or near springs. Consult with NAU, MNA, state, federal, or tribal hydrologists to determine a suitable buffer zone needed to protect the structure and function of seeps and springs.	Riparian Areas, including Springs, Seeps, Wetlands, and Alluvial Soils	7-11	The first two bullets were moved to the Best Practices for Conservation of Significant Natural Resources in Ch.3 and the third bullet was revised and moved to Ch.4 as a guideline for all land use categories. The introduction to significant natural resources includes the directive to consult with the appropriate resource professionals.
ON877	Erika Nowak	rocky outcrops provide critical hibernation and aestivation sites for small mammals, reptiles, and amphibians.	Steep Slopes and Rocky Outcroppings	7-11	Animal communities being supported by outcroppings is included in the third sentence.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON879	Erika Nowak	these data may not take into account important small-scale wildlife migration corridors, e.g. rocky outcrops where animals hibernate are often not the same habitats the animals need to hunt/forage during the active season. Small species often migrate to and from these outcrops, and these small-scale migratory paths should also be considered when parcels are developed.	Wildlife Corridors	7-11	It is true that the Wildlife Linkages/Corridors overlay is intended to capture movement patterns of large wildlife at larger scales. It would be very difficult to capture all the potential movements of smaller animals. Conserving important habitats across many species (such as springs, floodplains and rock outcrops) is probably the most practical approach and is captured in this section.
ON880	Erika Nowak	Local connections between remaining grassland fragments could also provide important migration corridors for small species, including birds, mammals, reptiles, and amphibians. These kinds of local, small-scale corridors are unlikely to show up on the AZGFD linkages maps.	Wildlife Corridors	7-11	It is true that the Wildlife Linkages/Corridors overlay is intended to capture movement patterns of large wildlife at larger scales. It would be very difficult to capture all the potential movements of smaller animals. Conserving important habitats across many species (such as springs, floodplains and rock outcrops) is probably the most practical approach and is captured in this section.
ON883	Erika Nowak	add: Consult with local experts, including those from AZGFD, Northern Arizona University and other state, federal, and tribal agencies, to determine wildlife species of concern and locations of important local wildlife corridors.	Wildlife Corridors	7-11	Page 7-8 includes the directive to verify data with appropriate resource professionals.

Comment ID	User name	Comment	Comment Location	Page	Response
ON959	Emily Renn	Beyond just mitigating the impacts of human development on wildlife corridors, we should be prioritizing the protection of wildlife corridors and altering designs with that in mind.	Wildlife Corridors	7-11	That is covered by the policies to the extent that we can legally. The need to have money for acquisition is critical to successful wildlife corridor preservation and cannot be completed effectively through regulations.
ON939	Val	Thank you for adding this!!	Wildlife Corridors Implementation Guidelines	7-11	Note that these guidelines were moved to the Best Practices for the Conservation of Significant Natural Resources in Ch.3 and the guidelines for all land use categories in Ch.4.
ON824	Brenda Smith	Recommend changing this number to 50 for consistency. Where smaller numbers of prairie dogs occur, in many cases they can be moved using reverse dispersal.	"Encourage colony relocation with assistance from the AZGFD when there are prairie dog colonies of 40 or more individuals..."	7-12	This guideline was simplified and the colony size was removed. The guideline was moved Ch.3 as a Best Practice for the Conservation of Significant Natural Resources.
ON914	Brenda Smith	Adopt humane translocations using scientifically validated practices by wildlife professionals	"Encourage colony relocation with assistance from the AZGFD..."	7-12	The revised version of this guideline includes AZGFD and the significant natural resources introduction section includes the directive to consult the appropriate resource professionals. The guideline was moved Ch.3 as a Best Practice for the Conservation of Significant Natural Resources.
ON960	Emily Renn	Thank you for including this important section on prairie dogs in the regional plan. I suggest using the word "translocation" instead of "relocation" because we are moving a group of prairie dogs a long distance (usually 20+ miles or more) to reestablish the colony in a wildland area. Relocation typically refers to one or a few animals being moved a short distance (within their home range).	"Encourage colony relocation with assistance from the AZGFD..."	7-12	Edit made.