

PLANNING AND DEVELOPMENT SERVICES REPORT
DIRECT TO ORDINANCE ZONING MAP AMENDMENT

PUBLIC HEARING
PZ-16-00239-02

DATE: February 5, 2018
MEETING DATE: February 14, 2018
REPORT BY: Tiffany Antol, AICP

REQUEST:

Direct to Ordinance Zoning Map Amendment of approximately 18.11 acres at 1801 S Milton Road from the Rural Residential (RR) and Public Facility (PF) zones to the Highway Commercial (HC) zone with the Resource Protection Overlay (RPO) zone. This Zoning Map Amendment request is accompanied by a Preliminary Plat and Conditional Use Permit.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends the Planning and Zoning Commission forward the Direct to Ordinance Zoning Map Amendment request to the City Council with a recommendation for approval subject to conditions of approval.

PRESENT LAND USE:

The subject property is comprised of two existing parcels of land, in addition to a remnant piece of right-of-way after the realignment of University Avenue/Drive. The existing parcels include a 9.58-acre site owned by the City of Flagstaff that has four vacant buildings including a single-family residence, a modular home, barn, and garage. The other parcel is an 8.13-acre site owned by the Arizona Department of Transportation (ADOT), which includes several structures related to the ADOT Motor Vehicles Department and Roadway Maintenance Operations.

PROPOSED LAND USE:

A horizontal and vertical mixed-use development consisting of 48,400 square feet of commercial space with a 340-dwelling unit, 1,221-bed Rooming and Boarding facility.

NEIGHBORHOOD DEVELOPMENT:

North: Burger King and Montessori Schools of Flagstaff Westside Campus; Highway Commercial (HC) Zone
East: Greentree Village Shopping Center; Highway Commercial (HC) Zone
South: Baymont Inn & Suites; Highway Commercial (HC) Zone
West: Woodlands Village Apartments; High Density Residential (HR) Zone

REQUIRED FINDINGS

Staff Review

An application for a Direct to Ordinance Zoning Map Amendment shall be submitted to the Planning Director and shall be reviewed and a recommendation prepared. The Planning Director's recommendation shall be transmitted to the Planning and Zoning Commission in the form of a staff report prior to a scheduled public hearing. The recommendation shall include: an evaluation of the consistency and conformance of the proposed amendment with the goals and policies of the General Plan and any applicable specific plans; the grounds for the recommendation based on the standards and purposes of the zones set forth in Section 10-40.20 (Establishment of Zones) of the Zoning Code (page 40.20-1); and, whether the amendment should be granted, granted with conditions to mitigate anticipated impacts caused by the proposed development, or denied.

Findings for Reviewing Proposed Zoning Map Amendments

Direct to Ordinance Zoning Map Amendments shall be evaluated based on the following findings: the proposed amendment is consistent with and conforms to the goals and policies of the General Plan and any applicable specific plans; the proposed amendment will not be detrimental to the public interest, health, safety, convenience, or welfare of the City of Flagstaff (the "City"), and will add to the public good as described in the General Plan; and, the affected site is physically suitable in terms of design, location, shape, size, operating characteristics, and the provision of public and emergency vehicle access, public services, and utilities to ensure that the requested zone designation and the proposed or anticipated uses and/or development will not endanger, jeopardize, or otherwise constitute a hazard to the property or improvements in the vicinity in which the property is located. If the application is not consistent with the General Plan, and any other applicable specific plan, the applicable plan must be amended in compliance with the procedures established in Chapter 11-10 of the City Code (Title 11: General Plans and Subdivisions) prior to considering the proposed amendment.

Introduction/Background

On May 16, 2000 the voters of Flagstaff passed proposition 403 which established the local transportation tax 2000 to provide funding for a variety of transportation system improvements including the arterial and collector street system, and multi-modal elements. The information pamphlet for this proposition specifically identified the Beulah Boulevard extension and the University Avenue realignment as "missing links" within the overall transportation network. The exhibit for this proposition showed an alignment for these roadways similar to the current proposal. The transportation tax has been collected on a pay-as-you-go-basis with a total of \$7.375 million allocated for these transportation improvements. These funds became 100% available as of July 1st 2017; however, many years of work have been spent on moving this project forward.

In 2005, the City of Flagstaff acquired APN 103-21-002, a 9.58-acre site known as the "Fresquez Parcel" for approximately \$2.7 million. This purchase was the first step in moving this transportation project to fruition and provides the majority of right-of-way necessary to accomplish the Beulah Boulevard extension. In order to accomplish the University Avenue/Drive realignment the ADOT District Offices and Regional Laboratory need to be relocated.

The City and ADOT began to explore options for partnerships in order to relocate the ADOT facilities. In July of 2009, the Arizona P3 (Public-Private-Partnership) Legislation was passed, allowing for partnerships between a public agency (in this case two public agencies) and a private-sector entity to allow greater participation in the delivery of a transportation project. Typically, the public agency assumes all the risks and responsibilities for a transportation project, but under the P3 the private partner takes on some of those risks and responsibilities. The Flagstaff P3 is the first time this initiative has been used to acquire new facilities for ADOT, which will free up land for roadway improvements and redevelopment. A Memorandum of Understanding was executed on March 28, 2012 and set out the parameters for how this P3 project would function. The City and ADOT would combine the remainders of their parcels after right-of-way dedication to be used for redevelopment. The redevelopment parcel would then be traded from ADOT to the developer for relocated ADOT facilities.

ADOT issued a Request for Qualifications in March 2012 to solicit a private partner who could relocate the ADOT facilities allowing for the construction of the road improvement project. The selected private sector partner was Vintage Partners, who proposed to relocate the ADOT facilities to the former Harkins Theater on Woodlands Village Boulevard. The P3 project was formalized through a Pre-Development Agreement (PDA) between Vintage, the City, and ADOT in March 2015. This PDA grants Vintage Partners the authority to apply for the required entitlements to pursue redevelopment of the remaining lands. ADOT and the City agreed to cooperate in good faith with Vintage Partners in order to process these entitlements, recognizing that the Flagstaff City Council retains its full discretion to approve or deny the entitlement applications. The PDA also commits a total of \$7.375 million for the extension of Beulah Boulevard and the realignment of University Avenue, which would be completed by Vintage Partners in conjunction with their redevelopment project.

Site Plan Approval

On February 7, 2018, the Inter-Department Staff (IDS) approved a site plan, a copy of which is attached to the Direct to Ordinance Zoning Map Amendment report, for the proposed development subject to successfully obtaining a Direct to Ordinance Zoning Map Amendment, Preliminary Plat and Conditional Use Permit, which is for the establishment of Rooming and Boarding as part of a mixed-use development and the approval of additional building height. Should any of these applications be denied, the site plan as submitted will no longer be approved.

Proposed Rezoning and Development Plan

The applicant, Vintage Partners, is requesting rezoning approval to permit a mixed-use development consisting of 48,400 square feet of commercial development in conjunction with a 340-unit, 1,221-bed Rooming and Boarding Facility, referred to as "Mill Town". The proposed Preliminary Plat affiliated with this request will divide the two existing parcels described above into two lots, two tracts, and the right-of-way required for the extension of Beulah Boulevard and the re-alignment of University Avenue. Lot 1 is the largest parcel at approximately 10.10 acres. This lot is fronted on three sides by Milton Road to the east, University Avenue to the north, and Beulah Boulevard to the west. Lot 2 is approximately 0.63 acres and is located northwest of the Beulah/University/Yale intersection. Tract A located west of Beulah and south of University is approximately 1.80-acres set aside as open space and resource protection area. Tract B is approximately 0.15 acres located between Yale Street and the adjacent charter school to provide for detention and Low Impact Development (LID), and to preserve additional tree resources. All lots and tracts are proposed to be rezoned to the Highway Commercial (HC) zone subject to conditions.

The majority of the development, is located on Lot 1 which consists of 3 commercial pads along the Milton Road frontage, and a five/six story vertical, mixed-use building setback approximately 200 feet from Milton Road but directly adjacent to Beulah Boulevard and University Avenue. The largest retail pad at 12,500 square feet is located in the northeastern corner of the lot at the intersection of Milton Road and University Avenue. This building is intended to be a small grocery store that will serve the larger neighborhood as well as the residents on site. The other two pads are 4,200 square feet each; located on either side of the main entrance from Milton Road. The pad to the south of this entrance is proposed to be a drive-through retail/restaurant. These two pads have the appearance of two-story buildings in terms of height but do not have secondary uses. Surface parking areas are located to the sides of the pads and between the pads and vertical mixed-use building creating an internal "main street". Parking areas are screened from street view either by natural berms or screen walls with landscaping.

The vertical mixed-use building is primarily five-stories except for the portion of the building directly above the ground floor retail, which is six stories. The Rooming and Boarding portion of the building consists of 614,500 square feet of housing plus 320,500 square feet of structured parking. The commercial portion of the buildings consists of 25,000 square feet with 26,200 square feet of garage. The commercial portions of this building have a plate height of 15 feet and a minimum depth of 60 feet as required by code. The total lot coverage for all buildings is 224,500 square feet or 48% of the lot area. The Highway Commercial zone allows a Floor Area Ratio (FAR) of 3.0. In mixed-use buildings, residential is not incorporated into the total FAR calculations. Structured parking is also not included in total FAR calculations. Including all components of this development, commercial, residential and structured parking the FAR falls just under 3.0. The proposed residential gross density for this project is approximately 19 units per acre based on the overall site of 18.11 acres. The proposed residential net density for this project is approximately 34 units per acre based on the size of Lot 1 at 10.10 acres. The mixed-use building wraps around an internal parking structure that is used for both residential and commercial uses. The building then breaks out into a series of wings that wrap around internal courtyards, which provide private open space areas for the residents.

Lot 2 is designated for approximately 2,500 square feet of single-story commercial development. The site is designed to have access from both Yale and University Avenue with parking set behind the building. The proposed building is located at the intersection as is preferred by the Zoning Code. Tract A, located on the western side of Beulah between the mixed-use site and the adjacent apartments, will serve as an open space area for the public with trails and benches. The majority of resources required to be preserved are located on this tract. Tract B provides for detention and LID as well as the preservation of additional resources.

Transportation Improvements

The primary factor driving this Direct to Ordinance Zoning Map Amendment request is the City's goal to realign University Avenue and extend Beulah Boulevard north to the future intersection of Beulah/Yale/University. The realignment of University Avenue will streamline and consolidate traffic flow to and from the Northern Arizona University (NAU) campus across Milton Road. This realignment will also improve the intersection of Milton Road and University Avenue, which is known to have one of the highest accident rates in Flagstaff. The extension of Beulah provides an important link and alternative option for north/south travel other than Milton Road. It is the City's desire that the roadways and all related infrastructure in the right-of-way will set the example of quality transportation improvements. These transportation improvements will increase regional connectivity for this area, improve safety, and facilitate development and activation of under-utilized parcels. The City hired Kimley Horn to prepare the Beulah-University Alignment Study, dated November 2015, to provide alignment alternatives and roadway cross-sections for Beulah Boulevard and University Avenue and prepare a Regional Traffic Impact Analysis to identify the regional transportation impacts caused by the transportation improvements without the added impact of the proposed project. The road alignment selected avoids significant cuts into the existing topography and creates parcels with better street connectivity.

The City is requiring the dedication of the right-of-way for current and future roadway widths, knowing that the immediate roadway needs will be less than the full right-of-way width. To assure that the correct areas are dedicated for right-of-way, the applicant has prepared a 30% design level of plan for the transportation improvements. These plans have helped to refine the expectations of each party as to responsibility for improvement costs. Because this project is part of a larger P3 project, traffic and circulation are addressed in two ways. First, the City is responsible for providing the realignment and extension of the roadways along with the other improvements within the right-of-way. Second, Vintage is responsible for their immediate site access requirements into the proposed development. The Development Agreement affiliated with this project identifies the specific components of the transportation improvements, as well as responsible parties. This staff report will focus on the higher-level improvements for this project. A breakdown of the transportation improvements identifying the responsible party is attached to this report.

The new University Avenue, from Milton Road to the Beulah/Yale intersection, will be constructed as a four-lane roadway with additional right-of-way reserved for a future right turn lane onto southbound Milton Road. Beulah Boulevard will be constructed as a two-lane roadway with the right-of-way provided for the ultimate four-lane roadway. The two outer most lanes will be constructed with a large landscaped median. The median can be converted to additional travel lanes when warranted. A roundabout is to be constructed at the intersection of University Avenue, Beulah Boulevard and Yale Street. The roundabout allows for a full access driveway into the project on University Avenue. New Flagstaff Urban Trail System (FUTS) trails are provided along the west side of the Beulah Boulevard extension and the north side of the University Avenue realignment, leading east to a pedestrian underpass crossing Milton Road. The pedestrian underpass and the associated off-site improvements are not included within the City's transportation improvements and will be the responsibility of the applicant, with a financial contribution from the City of \$250,000. Eight-foot wide sidewalks are provided along the project boundaries on Beulah Boulevard and Milton Road with a six-foot wide sidewalk provided along University Avenue.

The City, Vintage, and Northern Arizona Intergovernmental Public Transportation Authority's (NAIPTA) are working together to support the permanent transit system and future high frequency transit line to be operated on the extension of Beulah Boulevard and the realignment of University Avenue. The proposed transportation improvements have sufficient right-of-way to allow transit-only lanes or transit route prioritization on both Beulah Boulevard and University Avenue. Transit-only lanes work to support high frequency service by prioritizing transit over all other vehicular traffic and allowing transit to utilize the travel lane for stops as pullouts tend to cause delays for transit service. City-wide planning efforts are underway to incorporate high frequency transit into the overall transportation networks. ADOT is leading an effort on the first of these studies, the Milton Road Corridor Study. Transit-only lanes remain an option within the transportation improvements and will continue to be discussed and refined as the project progresses.

General Plan/Flagstaff Regional Plan (FRP 2030)

The Regional Plan's (The "Plan") Future Growth Illustration on Maps 21 and 22 (same map; one is regional scale and one city scale) and the text of the Plan provide supplemental information for the interpretation of goals and policies. In case of any conflict between the Future Growth Illustration and the Plan's goals and policies, the goals and policies will prevail. The Future Growth Illustration has two types of land use designations: "Area Types" describe the place-making context of Urban, Suburban, Rural, or Employment, and "Place Types" such as activity centers, corridors, and neighborhoods provide the framework for the density, intensities, and mix of uses within the area types. The subject property falls within a Neighborhood Suburban Activity Center that is currently being considered for a Regional Plan amendment, in conjunction with the adoption of the High Occupancy Housing Plan, to a Regional Suburban Activity Center.

Neighborhood Suburban Activity Centers are mixed-use centers at intersections of circulation corridors and access roads with access to surrounding neighborhoods providing local goods and services and public spaces accessible to transit and the FUTS. Suburban Activity Centers call for a density range of greater than 6 units per acre for mixed-use projects. The mix of uses within the commercial core should include services, offices, retail, restaurant, residential mixed-use and public spaces. Neighborhood commercial is intended for all commercial retail and service uses that meet consumer demands for frequently needed goods and services, with an emphasis on serving the surrounding residential neighborhoods. These areas are typically anchored by a grocery store, with supporting retail and service establishments. Transportation features of a Suburban Activity Center include easy-to-access parking available via shared lots, shared parking structures, lots and on-street parking with pedestrian paths through and around parking areas. Transit stops should be available. Suburban block sizes may be larger than urban areas but must have highly connected bike and pedestrian infrastructure across the block and not solely around the block edges.

Applicable General Plan Goals and Policies

Staff has identified Regional Plan Goals and Policies that could be applied to support or not support the proposed Direct to Ordinance Zoning Map Amendment. These goals and policies are located in an attachment to this report and within the applicant's narrative. The following is a discussion of how the project meets or conflicts with goals and policies in each chapter.

Environmental Planning & Conservation (Air Quality, Climate Change and Adaptation, Dark Skies, Ecosystem Health, Environmentally Sensitive Lands, Natural Quiet, Soils, and Wildlife)

In accordance with the goals and policies of this section the subject property is to be included within the Resource Protection Overlay (RPO) zone. A Natural Resource Protection Plan has been provided in conjunction with the Site Plan and Preliminary Plat applications that preserves the required slope and forest resources on this site. The other most relevant policies are the ones in relation to dark skies. Outdoor lighting plans were submitted in conjunction with the site plan application and the proposed lighting for the site is in compliance with the Zoning Code. There were no significant natural resources from the Regional Plan Map 7 identified on this site.

Open Space

This application includes a 1.80 acre tract set aside as open space to provide a buffer between adjacent residential projects and the proposed vertical mixed-use building. This open space preserves forest and slope resources for the project and will be open for use by the general public.

Water Resources (Water Sources, Water Demand, Stormwater and Watershed Management, and Water Quality)

As shown on Map 21, the Property is located within the Urban Growth Boundary. A Water and Sewer Impact Analysis and Drainage Analysis was completed for the project. The conclusions and requirements of these analyses are addressed in the Public Systems Impact Analysis section of this report. Both of these analyses adequately address the goals and policies of this chapter.

Community Character (Scenic Resources and Natural Setting, Heritage Preservation, Community Design, and Arts, Sciences and Education)

Milton Road is classified as a Great Street as well as a Gateway Corridor and is the main entrance to Flagstaff from the south. As stated by the Regional Plan “Driving on Milton Road from 1-17 sends drivers towards a masterpiece of environmental beauty framed by hodgepodge development and a very busy arterial street. The unrestricted access and center turn lane makes Milton a dangerous experience for pedestrians and cyclists and it is uninviting to walk or experience. It is the main connector between multi-family residential uses, the university and downtown.” The large mixed-use building is deliberately set back from Milton Road in order to maintain the sweeping vista of the San Francisco Mountains as seen when entering Flagstaff from the south. The view, however, is the only iconic feature of this portion of the Milton corridor. There are no historic neighborhoods, existing single-family residential neighborhoods, or cultural resources deemed significant within the vicinity of this project. The project maintains a high level of architectural design with urban design features that are inviting to the public and encourage alternative modes of transportation. Urban design is key for the success of mixed-use developments. Walkable-scale developments can achieve many community goals, from increased public transit use to economic development opportunities. Concentrated development, however, must be designed and built with respect for Flagstaff’s character. The City has committed to utilize 1% (approximately \$80,000) of the total cost of the transportation improvements to incorporate public art into the right-of-way.

Growth Areas & Land Use (Reinvestment, Greenfield, Urban Area, Suburban Area, Rural Area, Employment Area, Special Planning Area, and Activity Centers)

The preferred land use scenario used for the Regional Plan includes less single-family development and more mixed-use development in the name of sustainability. “Suburban development means more vehicle miles traveled, greater emissions, and greater water demand. More urban-type development results in fewer vehicle miles traveled, fewer emissions and less water demand.” The Plan promotes concentrated development in or near the city core and in Activity Centers. As stated previously, the subject property is located within a Neighborhood Suburban Activity Center. The proposed development includes public spaces, parks, and plazas, with a mixture of residential and commercial uses, and is designed to incorporate alternative modes of transportation. The Mill Town project is considered an infill, redevelopment site. The project provides ample amenities for the public and the residents of the site. The proposed uses of the site do not include substantial employment opportunities as is preferred within an Activity Center. “Existing Activity Centers have great potential for increase activities, densities and mixed-use with focused reinvestment by both the public and private sectors.” Currently, this Activity Center is underutilized with low intensity commercial and few residential developments. The proposed project adds the density, intensity, and mix of uses necessary to activate civic spaces and pedestrian environment.

Transportation (Mobility and Access, Safe and Efficient Multimodal Transportation, Environmental Considerations, Quality Design, Pedestrian Infrastructure, Bicycle Infrastructure, Transit, Automobile, Passenger Rail and Rail Freight, Air Travel, and Public Support for Transportation)

Mill Town, as part of the P3 project, is designed to incorporate citywide transportation improvements for vehicles, pedestrians, bicycles, and transit that increase network connectivity for all modes. This project will result in an alternative north/south connection other than Milton Road, which is a heavily congested corridor. The realignment of University Avenue will increase safety for vehicles and alternative modes of transportation by eliminating a disjointed intersection. The developer’s addition of a pedestrian underpass across Milton Road will enhance pedestrian and bicycle safety at an already heavily used intersection. The project can be efficiently served by local transit with the hope that higher level transit improvements can be added to the transportation improvements. All of these features work in concert to provide new “complete streets” within the City of Flagstaff transportation network. Activity Centers are meant to be pedestrian and transit oriented and this project meets both of those criteria in terms of design and the associated improvements.

Cost of Development

This chapter primarily addresses new development paying its fair share of public facilities, services, and infrastructure. Impact analyses helps to determine the specific proportion as share for each development. A review of the impact analyses for this project and the mitigation required is discussed in the Public Systems Impact Analysis section of this report.

Neighborhoods, Housing, and Urban Conservation

NAU students make up approximately 25% of the City's population. The student population's increasing demand for housing impacts the cost and availability of housing in the region, which results in a higher demand for multi-family housing. The Mill Town project provides an additional 1,221-beds of student housing within walking distance of NAU. The project does not, however, provide a mix of housing types on-site or help fill the need for workforce housing. The proposed mixed-use, student housing project does make use of an existing underutilized site as encouraged by the Regional Plan.

Economic Development (Responsive Government, Education and Workforce Training, Business Retention, Expansion and Entrepreneurship, Business Attraction, Tourism, Community Character and Redevelopment and Infill)

The Mill Town development is a prime example of redevelopment of an underutilized property designed to accomplish regional transportation improvements within a designated Activity Center.

Recreation

Development projects are encouraged to integrate active and passive recreation sites into their design. The Mill Town project provides several locations for both types of recreation. Private and public open spaces areas have been incorporated into the project boundaries. Ample civic space is provided to enhance the public and commercial component of this mixed-use development.

Policy Analysis

This list below identifies several key points and community benefits supporting (+) or not supporting (-) the proposed amendment:

- + The property is considered redevelopment, is within the Urban Growth Boundary, and can be efficiently and effectively provided with facilities and services by the City;
- + The project will complete regional transportation system improvements that serve other areas in the City;
- + The project will provide open space amenities and extensions of the FUTS in addition to a pedestrian underpass across Milton Road;
- + Adding high density residential to an Activity Center where the character is currently low intensity commercial;
- + Mill Town is a centrally located project with convenient access to many required resources, including transit;
- The project does not include residential or office uses over the commercial buildings fronting the Milton Road corridor;
- The project does not include employment type uses within this Activity Center; and,
- The project does not provide affordable housing or a mix of housing types.

High Occupancy Housing Specific Plan

The High Occupancy Housing (HOH) Specific Plan was in the process of being prepared during the review of the site plan, preliminary plat, and zoning map amendment cases for this site. The HOH plan is scheduled for adoption just prior to City Council review of these applications. While the HOH plan goals and policies were not directly applied to this application, staff worked with the applicant to integrate as many of the strategies as possible into the proposed development. For example, the applicant has agreed to add recycling chutes in addition to garbage chutes for better waste management as suggested in the HOH plan. The Regional Plan Amendment to change the existing Activity Center from Neighborhood to Regional would make this site a preferred location for high occupancy housing projects.

Zoning – City of Flagstaff Zoning Code

If this Direct to Ordinance Zoning Map Amendment request is approved, approximately 18.11 acres will be rezoned to the

Highway Commercial zone with the Resource Protection Overlay (RPO) zone. Development of the site will be conditioned to the approved site plan. Any substantial change to the approved site plan would require a new rezoning request and further review and approvals by the Planning & Zoning Commission and City Council. The Site Plan provided includes the overall site layout; open space and civic space areas and calculations; parking areas and calculations; landscaping and screening; architectural renderings; colors and material specifications; 3D views of the proposed development; and, exterior lighting details.

Site Planning Standards

In accordance with Section 10-30.60.030 of the Zoning Code (Page 30.60-2), a site analysis was completed in conjunction with the concept plan for this project that considers the topography of the site, solar orientation, existing/native vegetation types, view corridors, climate, subsurface conditions, drainage swales and stream corridor, and the built environment and land use context. The findings of the site analysis were used for the layout of the mixed-use development, open space and civic space areas on site. The largest building on the site is set back approximately 200 feet from the Milton Road corridor in order to maintain the sweeping views of the San Francisco Mountains when entering Flagstaff from the south. The mixed-use building and road layout are designed to work with the existing topography. Open/civic spaces have been provided for public access as well as private open space areas for the residents of the development. These areas also provide buffers from existing multi-family developments to the west of the subject property. The surrounding land use context includes a variety of uses and structures including single-story restaurants and retail stores, multi-story hotels, and multi-story apartments.

Resource Protection

The applicant has provided resource calculations of existing resources found on the property. Based on the preliminary calculations, it appears that the minimum protection threshold requirements can be met. The Zoning Code protection factors for commercial zones are as follows:

- 80%** of steep slopes (25% and over)
- 70%** of moderate slopes (17-24.9%)
- 30%** of forest canopy

The Zoning Code allows a 5% reduction in the required forest preservation rates if civic space is provided. A detailed Natural Resource Protection Plan was included with the Preliminary Plat for this project.

Open Space & Civic Space

Mixed-use developments are required to provide residential uses with common or private open space. Open space areas for the residents have been incorporated into the design of the building in a series of courtyards that provide recreational amenities. Additionally, the project sets out approximately 1.8 acres of public open space in a separate tract. This tract allows for the preservation of mature trees and steeply sloped areas while providing a buffer between residential uses. The site plan identifies a total of 3.39 acres of common open space on the mixed-use site.

Section 10-30.60.060.B.1.b of the Zoning Code (Page 30.60-11) requires developments with 50 or more dwelling units to provide a minimum of five percent of the site as civic space. A total of .5-acres of civic space are required for this project. The site plan identifies a total of 1.73 acres of civic space provided as part of the mixed-use development.

Pedestrian and Bicycle Circulation Systems

The Mill Town project includes enhanced pedestrian and bicycle facilities to connect with the NAU campus. The most prominent of these is an underpass tunnel on the north leg of Milton Road to completely separate pedestrians and bicyclists from Milton Road traffic. FUTS shared-use pathways are designated along the north side of University Avenue/Drive and the west side of Beulah Boulevard. Therefore the project includes a ten-foot pathway along the north side of University from Beulah Boulevard to the existing NAU pathway that now ends at the east edge of the Target parcel, and a ten-foot pathway on the west side of Beulah Boulevard from University Avenue south to the existing pathway. An eight-foot wide sidewalk along the east side of Beulah Boulevard from University Avenue to Forest Meadows Street is also included. This will

accommodate students walking from Mill Town to south campus via Beulah Boulevard and McConnell Drive. The project also provides a pedestrian connection through the site from the southwestern corner along the adjacent parcel into the commercial core of the mixed-use project. The sidewalk along Milton Road adjacent to Mill Town will also be eight feet wide. Both University Avenue and Beulah Boulevard will include on-street bike lanes within the project area. Due to its proximity to NAU, the Milton Road pedestrian and bicycle underpass, available transit service, and its mixed-use nature, Mill Town is expected to generate only about half the vehicle trips that would be anticipated without all of these features.

Compatibility and Architectural Design Standards

Compatibility does not mean “the same as” but rather it refers to how well a new development is sensitive to the character of existing development. The Zoning Code breaks down compatibility into three categories: Patterns of Development, Scale, and Continuity.

Patterns of Development includes streetscapes, site relationships, signage, and landscape features. The primary streetscape of the subject property is Milton Road. Suburban landscaping and setbacks standards have been applied to this frontage with increased sidewalks widths, pedestrian connectivity, buildings moved closer to the street with accessible civic spaces. The streetscape is enhanced, but remains consistent with the surrounding area.

Scale refers to similar or harmonious proportions, overall height and width, the visual intensity of the development, and the building massing. The proposed mixed-use building is significantly larger than the existing buildings surrounding the site. A Conditional Use Permit is requested to exceed the maximum height of the Highway Commercial (HC) zone for the portion of the building that fronts Milton Road. The building has been setback from Milton Road so that it will not dominate over the existing buildings. The proposed building has both vertical and horizontal articulation in accordance with the Zoning Code to ensure that traditional proportions can be observed. The building form is broken horizontally and vertically to make the building appear smaller or rather made up of several different buildings.

Continuity encompasses patterns of development and scale, but also site development, building forms, texture, materials, details, and colors. The proposed mixed-use building has steeply pitched roofs that provide variation in the building forms. The site plan includes very high quality materials for the building such as stone and timber. The buildings are comprised of materials and colors that are compatible with Flagstaff characteristics.

Landscaping

Landscaping plans are not required in conjunction with a Direct to Ordinance Zoning Map Amendment. The applicant did provide a detailed landscaping plan that meets the requirements of parking lot landscaping, street buffer landscaping, public right-of-way landscaping, open space landscaping, and landscape screening standards found within Section 10-50.60 of the Zoning Code (Page 50.60-1). The landscaping design for this project includes a combination of urban and suburban landscaping to develop specific character areas within the development. A final landscape plan will be reviewed at the time of civil plan submittal.

Outdoor Lighting

The subject property is located within Lighting Zone II and is allowed a total of 50,000 lumens per acre. Lighting allowances were based on the resultant parcels and not the total gross acreage. The applicant has worked to ensure that the site exceeds the City's outdoor lighting standards. A lighting plan was reviewed in conjunction with the site plan and will be reviewed for compliance again at the time of building permit submittal.

Parking

Commercial parking is provided in a surface parking lot along the internal drive within the Mill Town mixed-use project and within the parking garage at the center of the mixed-use building. All of the residential parking is contained within the parking garage. The applicant has provided a parking demand study, a copy of which is attached, to reduce the required amount of parking for the Rooming and Boarding Facility. Section 10-50.80.040.A (Page 50.80-7) of the Zoning Code requires a minimum of one parking space per bedroom, plus one space per owner or manager within a Rooming and Boarding Facility. In this case that would require no less than 1,221 parking spaces with a few spaces for on-site managers in combination with the required

commercial parking spaces. The City of Flagstaff Transportation Engineering Program performed a study of student housing related projects in Flagstaff, a copy of which is attached to this report, that are known to be occupied with large number of students. The study determined that the actual parking need for these types of facilities averaged about 0.77 parking spaces per bed. The site plan has been approved with a parking rate of 0.79 parking spaces per bedroom (a total of 965 spaces for 1,221 beds).

PUBLIC SYSTEMS IMPACT ANALYSIS

Traffic/Right-of-Way Impact

The Mill Town Transportation Impact Analysis (TIA) included 19 existing and proposed intersections and driveways, extending along Milton Road from Forest Meadows Street to Butler Avenue, along Yale Street and Beulah Boulevard from Forest Meadows Street to Plaza Way, and along University Avenue/University Drive from Woodlands Village Boulevard to the Target driveway east of Milton Road. Ten of the intersections/driveways are along City roadways, eight are ADOT locations, and one, the Target driveway, is under NAU's jurisdiction. The TIA was done to meet both the City's and ADOT requirements. The analysis considered opening year, assumed to be 2018, and five years after opening, 2023. Since the Mill Town project includes the City's capital street project, realignment of University Avenue and construction of Beulah Boulevard south of University Avenue, staff also considered a 20-year horizon for the new streets.

The City's intersections are expected to operate at acceptable service levels with the development in place, except for westbound to southbound left turns at Forest Meadows and Beulah Boulevard. However, this movement has a poor service level today, and traffic due to the proposed development will have little impact here. In addition, the new Beulah Boulevard connection between University Avenue and Forest Meadows Street will provide an alternate route for some of the traffic now making that westbound left turn. Peak period delay is expected to increase for left turns out of the Target/Green Tree Village Shopping Center driveways on University Drive. Drivers are likely to take less direct alternate routes during the heaviest traffic times.

Although originally planned as a conventional intersection, the new University/Beulah/Yale intersection will be a roundabout. The conventional intersection design did not provide adequate sight distance for drivers turning into Mill Town from University Avenue. The developer indicated left turn access at this driveway is essential for the commercial portion of the development, especially to accommodate large delivery trucks for which a right turn out would be difficult or impossible. The roundabout design not only provides adequate sight distance at the driveway, it also provides ample traffic capacity to accommodate additional growth. The single lane roundabout can handle the traffic anticipated throughout most if not all of the street project's 20-year design life, and will be designed so it can easily be converted to dual lane operation if ever needed. Since small design details can have significant impacts on how well a roundabout works, the City contracted with an independent roundabout expert to review the design, resulting in several tweaks to optimize the roundabout's performance.

Completing the Beulah Boulevard connection between University Avenue and Forest Meadows Street, and realigning University Avenue with University Drive will provide additional route options and is expected to result in some changes to the distribution of traffic in the area. There is a significant amount of traffic moving between Milton Road south of University Drive and Beulah Boulevard south of Forest Meadows Street, and it all has to turn left off of Forest Meadows Street in one direction or the other. The new Beulah Boulevard connection will provide an alternative where left turns can be made easily at the roundabout with no need to use Forest Meadows Street. Also, since Beulah Boulevard will connect to Yale Street at University Avenue, traffic heading to and from destinations between Yale Street and Milton Road can stay on Beulah Boulevard and Yale Street and stay off of Milton Road. The ability for eastbound University Avenue traffic to turn left onto Milton Road at a traffic signal may attract some traffic that now uses Plaza Way, Riordan Road or even Route 66 to get to northbound Milton Road. It will take some time for drivers to try out alternate routes before traffic settles into a steady pattern, but the new street configuration will reduce some of the pressure on Milton Road and on Forest Meadows Streets for local trips, and provide a route that is more accommodating for pedestrians and bicyclists.

The ADOT facilities nearest Mill Town are more sensitive to any additional traffic because they are already heavily loaded. Realigning University Avenue with University Drive and providing dual left turn lanes and an exclusive right turn lane for eastbound will better accommodate the traffic here. Significant reduction in traffic delay can be made if the underpass eliminates the need for at-grade Milton Road pedestrian crossings. The Mill Town access point on Milton Road (Access A) will be across from the existing driveway for the University West Apartments, and is expected to make left turns out of the apartment driveway more difficult during peak times. Restrictions on some movements may be needed in the future should a safety problem develop.

Water and Wastewater Impact

The Mill Town Mixed-Use Public Water and Sewer Impact Analysis was completed March 23, 2017 after the submittal of a concept plan application for the proposed project. The proposed development is located within the City of Flagstaff urban growth boundary and has the ability to be served by City water and sewer utilities. Currently there is no infrastructure in the ground on-site to support this development so all on-site sewer and water systems will have to be designed and built. It is the developer's responsibility to design, acquire adequate right-of-way, and construct all on-site and connecting water infrastructure in accordance with all applicable City, State, and Federal rules and regulations.

Water

All public water infrastructure exists in the right-of-way adjacent to this property. There is an 8" water main extended across the full property frontage within the existing alignment of Milton Road, and an 8" main within University Avenue. New infrastructure will be constructed as part of the transportation improvements. The existing 8" water main that terminates on the north end of Beulah Boulevard will be extended to the north within the Beulah Boulevard extension to the new intersection with University Avenue. The water main will continue north and connect to an existing 8" water main in Yale Street. A new 8" water main will also be constructed within the University Avenue realignment and will connect an existing 8" water main in University Avenue to an existing 8" water main in Milton Road. The new 8" water mains will provide domestic water and fire service to the project. All appropriate looping and second source requirements will be satisfied. The property lies within the City of Flagstaff Zone "B" water pressure system limits, and appears to meet the minimum pressure requirements stated in the City of Flagstaff Engineering Standards.

Wastewater

To provide sewer services to the project, a new 12" sewer main will be constructed within the University Avenue re-alignment as part of the transportation improvements. It will connect an existing 8" sewer main in University Avenue west of Milton Road to an existing 12" sewer main behind Trail Crest Brewing Company on University Drive east of Milton Road.

Stormwater Analysis

The Mill Town project's overarching drainage concept is to provide peak flow stormwater discharge mitigation, total stormwater runoff volume mitigation, and improvement to the water quality of site discharges. Topography of the project site splits the drainage into two watersheds, the Sinclair Wash and Clay Avenue Wash watersheds. Mitigation measures and stormwater quality improvement requirements are applied for each watershed. The Mill Town project has been further separated into on-site development and the transportation improvements. Mitigation measures and stormwater quality improvement requirements are applied to each of the two separate developments to maintain the same overarching drainage concept requirements.

Development of the Mill Town site will meet the mitigation and water quality requirements through the use of subsurface water storage systems consisting of both a detention and a retention storage capacity. Water quality improvements consisting of sediment capture components will be incorporated into the subsurface storage systems. Essentially, impervious surface areas of the site, will have runoff routed to landscaping areas and subsurface collection systems. The subsurface

collection systems will collect surface flows not able to be stored within landscape areas and these flows will be routed through filters to capture sediment and other debris before entering the larger containment systems. Roof areas will connect to roof drains that discharge directly to the subsurface system. Discharge from the containment systems will be through low flow outlets designed to slow discharge of the retained volume for a 24 hour to 36 hour drain time.

Development of the City transportation improvements will include routing of impervious roadway surfaces to subsurface drainage systems that split the roadway project between the two watersheds. The proposed roadway surfaces within the Clay Avenue Wash watershed area of the project are located in areas with substantial existing impervious. Roadway in this area is designed to be a reduction in total impervious area, therefore, mitigation parameters for this portion of the roadway will be accomplished by the reduction in impervious area. Discharges from this area will flow by the subsurface conveyance system to the existing detention facility behind Target building. Existing discharges from this area of the site ultimately flow to the same location via a combination of subsurface and above ground conveyance. The proposed roadway surfaces within the Sinclair Wash watershed area of the project are in an area with little existing impervious surfaces and therefore are to be routed to mitigation and filtration facilities. The proposed subsurface conveyance system for this portion of roadway will discharge to an existing drainage channel and detention facility located on the west side of the development. A proposed expansion of the existing detention facility will incorporate an 'LID extended detention' facility in the lower portion of the basin which will essentially serve as volume mitigation and water quality feature through a soil filtration system with metered discharge designed to slow discharge of the retained volume for a 24 hour to 36 hour drain time.

DEVELOPMENT AGREEMENT

A draft development agreement has been prepared and continues to be negotiated throughout the review of this project. The primary purpose of this agreement is to set out roles and responsibilities in regards to the transportation improvements. The agreement separates the pedestrian underpass from the transportation improvements, defines budget limits for the improvements, and includes provisions for transit lanes and bus stops. A copy of the draft will be provided to the Commission at the February 28, 2018 hearing.

CITIZEN PARTICIPATION

Public hearings before the Planning and Zoning Commission and City Council are conducted in conjunction with requests for Direct to Ordinance Zoning Map Amendments. In accordance with State Statute, notice of the public hearing was provided by placing an ad in the Daily Sun, posting notices on the property, and mailing a notice to all property owners within 900 feet of the site excluding rights-of-way.

The applicant held two neighborhood meetings in regards to this case on June 15, 2017 and June 26, 2017 at the ADOT training facility, located at 1901 S Milton Road. Thirty-eight (38) individuals attended the first meeting and thirty-three (33) individuals attended the second meeting. A Citizen Participation Report, attached, was prepared in response to the comments and concerns presented. The meetings included introductory presentations from the applicant, a question and answer session, and a break-out session where attendees had the opportunity to ask questions of the development team and view project boards. Comments on the project included concerns on the road designs, scale/bulk/mass of the proposed building, focus on student housing rather than community housing needs, proposed uses, and affordability.

Four letters from the public have been received as of the writing of the report. Two of these letters are included in the Citizen Participation Report. The additional letters are attached to this staff report.

RECOMMENDATION:

Two public hearings are required for Direct to Ordinance Zoning Map Amendments that involve the development with more than 300-dwelling units. At the February 14, 2018 Planning & Zoning Commission meeting, staff recommends opening the public

hearing, taking public comment, and continuing the hearing until February 28, 2018. For the February 28, 2018 Planning & Zoning Commission meeting, staff recommends approval of PZ-16-00239-02 with the following conditions:

1. The subject property must be developed in accordance with the approved site plan and conditions of approval dated February 6, 2018. Modifications (other than minor modifications) to the approved site plan will require an amendment to this Direct to Ordinance Zoning Map Amendment request.
2. All other requirements of the Zoning Code and other City codes, ordinances and regulations, shall be met by the proposed development.
3. A materials management plan shall be prepared for the Mill Town project to be submitted in conjunction with building permits to enhance optimum waste management options including recycling. The mixed-use vertical building shall include chutes for both general waste and recycling materials.
4. Applicant must install, at their expense, the pedestrian underpass across Milton Road, with financial contributions from the City of Flagstaff as stated in the Development Agreement. Improvements must be designed to ADOT standards and installed in conjunction with the transportation improvements and prior to the occupancy of the mixed-use building.
5. All terms, conditions, and restrictions detailed within the “Mill Town Development Agreement” must be fully satisfied.
6. If the applicant fails to obtain final plat approval for Mill Town, or obtain an extension of zoning within five (5) years of the effective date of the rezoning ordinance, the City Council may take action to revert the zoning back to the former classification of Rural Residential (RR) and Public Facility (PF), per Section 10-20.50.060 of the Zoning Code.

Attachments:

- Application
- Legal Notice
- Zoning District Legal Descriptions
- Project Narrative
- Approved Site Plan
- FRP 2030 Applicable Goals and Policies
- FRP 2030 Map 21 Enlargement of subject property
- Mill Town TIA Executive Summary
- Parking Demand Study
- Citizen Participation Plan/Report
- Letters received by staff